

1-1-2005

Wet Water Law: New Mexico Style

G. Emlen Hall

University of New Mexico - School of Law

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/law_facultyscholarship



Part of the [Law Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

G. Emlen Hall, *Wet Water Law: New Mexico Style*, 1 & 2 Wet Water Law New Mexico Style (2005).
Available at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/law_facultyscholarship/254

This Learning Object is brought to you for free and open access by the School of Law at UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Scholarship by an authorized administrator of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.



**SCHOOL
OF LAW**

**SMALL SCHOOL.
BIG VALUE.**

Wet Water Law New Mexico Style

Second Edition
Volume I



By G. Emlen Hall

Professor of Law
Editor-in-Chief Natural Resources Journal

University of New Mexico School of Law
Spring 2005

CHAPTER 1 THE NATURE OF A NEW MEXICO PRIOR APPROPRIATION WATER RIGHT

SECTION A. BASIC DEFINITIONS 1

1.	G. EMLÉN HALL, WATER – NEW MEXICO’S DELICATE BALANCE	1
2.	G. EMLÉN HALL, ON WATER WORKS.....	6
3.	THE SPANISH DEFINITION	14
4.	THE STATE CONSTITUTIONAL DEFINITION.....	14
5.	THE STATUTORY DEFINITION	15
6.	THE ECONOMIC DEFINITION	16
7.	THE JUDICIAL DEFINITION	25
a.	<i>State v. Miranda</i>	25
b.	<i>State v. Morros</i>	27
c.	<i>Concerning the Application for Water Rights of the Town of Breckenridge in Summit County</i>	33
8.	THE CURRENT NEW MEXICO POLITICAL CRISIS OF DEFINITION	42
a.	<i>Tim DeYoung, New Approach Same Result: New Mexico’s Instream Flow Protection Act of 1989</i>	42
b.	<i>Attorney General Opinion 98-01</i>	54
c.	<i>State Engineers Opinion on Instream Flow</i>	63
_____	NOTES	70
9.	PROBLEM: HONEY BOY MEETS HIS MAKER	70

SECTION B. OTHER FUNDAMENTAL CHARACTERISTICS..... 72

1.	APPURTENANCY.....	72
a.	<i>New Mexico Statutes Annotated § 72-5-23</i>	72
b.	<i>Murphy v. Kerr</i>	72
c.	<i>Twin Forks Ranch, Inc. v. Brooks</i>	90
2.	NON-RIPARIAN	96
a.	<i>New Mexico Statutes Annotated § 72-1-5</i>	96
b.	<i>Kaiser Steel Corporation v. W. S. Ranch Company</i>	96
3.	CONTINUOUS BENEFICIAL USE	106
	<i>State of New Mexico ex rel. Erickson, v. McLean</i>	106
4.	STATUTORY PROVISIONS CONCERNING FORFEITURE AND ABANDONMENT	111
a.	<i>New Mexico Statutes Annotated 72-5-28</i>	111
b.	<i>State of New Mexico ex rel. Reynolds, v. South Springs Co.</i>	113

CHAPTER 2 THE ATTRIBUTES OF NEW MEXICO WATER RIGHTS

SECTION A. ELEMENTS 120

1.	STATUTES	120
a.	<i>New Mexico Statutes Annotated § 72-4-19</i>	120
b.	<i>New Mexico Statutes Annotated § 72-12-3</i>	120
c.	<i>New Mexico Statutes Annotated § 72-5-13</i>	122

SECTION B. QUANTITY	123
1. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED §§ 72-5-18, 19 & 73-1-27	123
2. USDA CONSERVATION RESEARCH REPORT 29 MAY 1982	124
3. CONSUMPTIVE WATER USE IN ARTIFICIAL SNOWMAKING	144
4. STATE OF NEW MEXICO, EX REL. S. E. REYNOLDS, V. LEWIS	152
5. STATE OF NEW MEXICO, EX. REL. REYNOLDS, V. NICCUM	160
6. PROBLEM - SPREADING BENEFICIAL USES	162

SECTION C. PRIORITY.....	163
---------------------------------	------------

1. WORLEY V. UNITED STATES BORAX AND CHEMICAL CORP.	163
2. NEW MEXICO PRODUCTS CO. V. NEW MEXICO POWER CO.	165
3. STATE OF NEW MEXICO V. PECOS VALLEY ARTESIAN CONSERVANCY DISTRICT	177
4. LA MADERA COMMUNITY DITCH ASSOCIATION V. SANDIA PEAK SKI CO.....	179

CHAPTER 3 SURFACE WATER AND GROUNDWATER IN NEW MEXICO

SECTION A. SURFACE WATER.....	186
---	------------

1. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-5-1	186
2. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-5-7	187
3. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-5-29	187
4. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-5-32	187

SECTION B. GROUND WATER.....	189
-------------------------------------	------------

1. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-1-1	189
2. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-1-3	189
3. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-12-1	189
4. DEFINITIONS OF SELECTED GROUND-WATER TERMS- REVISIONS AND CONCEPTUAL REFINEMENTS	190
5. YEO V. TWEEDY	204
6. MATHERS V. TEXACO INC.....	215
6. MIMBRES BASIN ADMINISTRATIVE CRITERIA AUGUST 4, 1982	220
7. MIDDLE RIO GRANDE ADMINISTRATIVE AREA GUIDELINES FOR REVIEW OF WATER RIGHT APPLICATIONS	225

SECTION C FROM SURFACE WATER TO GROUNDWATER.....	236
--	------------

1. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-12-24	236
2. TEMPLETON V. PECOS VALLEY ARTESIAN CONSERVANCY DISTRICT	236
3. BRANTLEY V. CARLSBAD IRRIGATION DISTRICT	243

SECTION D FROM GROUND WATER TO SURFACE WATER.....	247
---	------------

1. IN THE MATTER OF THE APPLICATION OF THE CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE	247
2. CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE V. REYNOLDS	257
3. IN THE MATTER OF THE APPLICATION OF THE CITY OF RIO RANCHO.....	268
4. CELINA A. JONES, THE ADMINISTRATION OF THE MIDDLE RIO GRANDE BASIN 1956-2002	288

CHAPTER 4 THE STATE ENGINEER: AN ADMINISTERED SYSTEM

SECTION A. JURISDICTION 315

1. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-2-1 315
2. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-2-9 316
3. STATE OF NEW MEXICO EX REL. , REYNOLDS, V. MENENHALL 316
4. STATE OF NEW MEXICO, EX REL., REYNOLDS V. RIO RANCHO ESTATES INC. 322
5. PROBLEM IN DECLARED BASIN RIGHTS..... 327
6. GROUNDWATER BASINS DECLARED IN NEW MEXICO DECLARED BY THE STATE
ENGINEER AS OF JULY 19, 2004..... 328

SECTION B. SUPERVISORY CONTROL AND SANCTIONS 329

1. HONEY BOY HAVEN, INC. V. ROYBAL..... 329
2. STATE OF NEW MEXICO, EX REL., REYNOLDS V. FANNING 331

SECTION C. THE STATE ENGINEER AND THE COURTS 334

1. CONSTITUTION OF THE STATE OF NEW MEXICO 334
2. IN RE CARLSBAD IRRIGATION DISTRICT 334
3. ANGEL FIRE CORP. V. C.S. CATTLE..... 338
4. ANTHONY WATER AND SANITATION DISTRICT V. TURNEY 340

CHAPTER 5 STATUTORY ADJUDICATIONS

SECTION A. THE HYDROGRAPHIC SURVEY 346

1. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-4-13 346
2. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-4-15 347
3. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-4-16 347
4. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-4-13 347
5. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-4-13 348
6. HYDROGRAPHIC SURVEYS AND THE GIS 349

SECTION B. ADJUDICATION SUITS: THE SCOPE 357

1. ELEPHANT BUTTE IRRIGATION DISTRICT V. REGENTS OF NEW MEXICO STATE
UNIVERSITY 357

SECTION C. ADJUDICATION SUITS: PROCEDURE.....364

1. NEW MEXICO, *EX REL.*, REYNOLDS V. ALLMAN..... 364
2. NEW MEXICO, *EX REL.*, STATE ENGINEER V. CRIDER..... 368
3. NEW MEXICO, *EX REL.*, REYNOLDS V. LEWIS..... 373
4. NEW MEXICO, *EX REL.*, STATE ENGINEER V. PARKER TOWNSEND RANCH. CO. .. 380
5. RIO PUEBLO DE TAOS AND RIO HONDO CONSOLIDATED ADJUDICATIONS..... 383
6. NEW MEXICO, *EX REL.*, STATE ENGINEER V. EBID..... 387

CHAPTER 6 NEW APPROPRIATIONS, TRANSFERS AND SALES OF A NEW MEXICO WATER RIGHT

SECTION A. SURFACE WATER: DETRIMENT..... 399

1. PEG ROGERS, WATER RIGHTS TRANSFERS: A PRACTICAL GUIDE TO WATER
REALLOCATION IN NEW MEXICO 399
2. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ON SURFACE WATER CHANGES IN POINT OF DIVERSION
412
3. W.S. RANCH CO. V. KAISER STEEL CORP. 415
4. PROBLEM IN CHANGE OF POINT OF DIVERSION. 419

SECTION B. SURFACE WATER: PUBLIC WELFARE 420

1. IN RE SLEEPER: REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE STATE ENGINEER 420
2. IN RE SLEEPER: DISTRICT COURT, APRIL 16, 1985. 423
3. ENSENADA LAND & WATER ASSOCIATION V. SLEEPER AND REYNOLDS, STATE
ENGINEER 429
4. PUBLIC WELFARE CONSIDERATIONS IN OTHER WESTERN STATES, ALASKA
STATUTES 435

SECTION C. GROUND WATER: IMPAIRMENT 435

1. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-12-1 TO 1.3(2004)..... 435
2. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-12-3(2004)..... 436
3. HEINE V. REYNOLDS 438
4. CITY OF ROSWELL V. BERRY 441
5. CITY OF ROSWELL V. S.E. REYNOLD, STATE ENGINEER..... 446
6. DOUGLAS L. GRANT, REASONABLE GROUNDWATER PUMPING LEVELS UNDER THE
APPROPRIATION DOCTRINE: THE LAW UNDERLYING ECONOMIC GOALS 452

CHAPTER 7 EMERGING ISSUES

SECTION A. MUNICIPAL RIGHTS IN NEW MEXICO WATER HISTORY ... 484

1. DAN TYLER, INTRODUCTION TO "THE MYTH OF THE PUEBLO RIGHTS DOCTRINE IN
HISPANIC NEW MEXICO..... 484
2. G. EMLIN HALL, TULAROSA AND THE DISMANTLING OF NEW MEXICO
COMMUNITY DITCHES 486
3. CARTWRIGHT, V. PUBLIC SERVICE CO. OF NEW MEXICO 506
4. MUNICIPAL WATER RIGHTS AND THE STATE CONSTITUTION. 552

CHAPTER 8 WATER PLANNING IN NEW MEXICO

1. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-1-9 554
2. LAWS 1987, CHAPTER 182, SECTIONS 1-3..... 554

CHAPTER 9 CONSTRAINTS ON THE STATE LAW OF PRIOR APPROPRIATION

SECTION A. FEDERAL WATER RIGHTS IN THE STATE SYSTEM 557

1. FEDERAL RESERVED AND NON-RESERVED WATER RIGHTS 557
 - a. *United States v. Rio Grande Dam and Irrigation* 557
 - b. *California Oregon v. Beaver Portland Cement* 569
 - c. *Arizona v. California et.al.* 571
 - d. *Cappaert v. United States* 626
 - e. *United States v. New Mexico* 636
 - f. *Sierra Club v. Lyng* 655
2. FEDERAL REGULATORY WATER RIGHTS 671
 - a. *Charles T. Dumars, Endangered Species that Eat Prior Appropriation: Integrating the Endangered Species Act into State Water Law* 671
 - c. *Rio Grande Silvery Minnow, et al. v. John W. Keys, III Commissioner Bureau of Reclamation* 716
 - d. *Letty Belin, Water Management in the Middle Rio Grande* 766

SECTION B. NATIVE AMERICAN WATER RIGHTS 771

1. NATIVE AMERICAN RESERVED WATER RIGHTS 771
 - a. *Winters v. United States* 771
 - b. *State of New Mexico v. Lewis v. United States of America, Mescalero Apache Tribe* 776
 - c. *In Re the General Adjudication of All Rights to Use Water in the Gila River System and Source* 797
2. PUEBLO INDIAN WATER RIGHTS 811
 - a. *State of New Mexico v. Aamodt (1976)* 811
 - b. *State of New Mexico v. Aamodt (1985)* 827
 - c. *State of New Mexico v. Aamodt (1987)* 846

SECTION C. INTERSTATE WATER RIGHTS 851

1. EQUITABLE APPORTIONMENT 851
 - a. *Colorado v. New Mexico I* 851
 - b. *Colorado v. New Mexico II* 863
 - c. *Aññ Macon McCrossen, Is There a Future for Proposed Water Uses in Equitable Apportionment Suits?* 880
2. INTERSTATE COMPACTS 899
 - a. *Hinderlider v. La Plata River and Cherry Creek Irrigation Co.* 899
 - b. *The Pecos River Compact* 909
 - c. *Texas v. New Mexico Breitenstein Report* 916
 - d. *Texas v. New Mexico 1983* 941
 - e. *Rio Grande Compact* 957

Wet Water Law New Mexico Style

Second Edition
Volume II



By G. Emlen Hall

Professor of Law
Editor-in-Chief Natural Resources Journal

University of New Mexico School of Law
Spring 2005

CHAPTER 7 EMERGING LOCAL ISSUES

SECTION A. MUNICIPAL RIGHTS IN NEW MEXICO WATER HISTORY

1. DAN TYLER, INTRODUCTION TO “THE MYTH OF THE PUEBLO RIGHTS DOCTRINE IN HISPANIC NEW MEXICO 484
2. CARTWRIGHT, V. PUBLIC SERVICE CO. OF NEW MEXICO 486
3. CITY OF LAS VEGAS V. THE HONORABLE LAFEL E. OMAN 534
4. STATE, EX REL., MARTINEZ V. CITY OF LAS VEGAS 545
5. MUNICIPAL WATER RIGHTS AND THE STATE CONSTITUTION. 570

SECTION B. WATER PLANNING IN NEW MEXICO

1. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-1-9..... 571
2. LAWS 1987, CHAPTER 182, SECTIONS 1-3 572
3. 2003 NEW MEXICO STATE WATER PLAN EXECUTIVE SUMMARY..... 574

CHAPTER 8 FEDERAL CONSTRAINTS ON THE STATE SYSTEM

SECTION A. FEDERAL RESERVED AND NON-RESERVED WATER RIGHTS

1. UNITED STATES V. RIO GRANDE DAM AND IRRIGATION..... 581
2. CALIFORNIA OREGON V. BEAVER PORTLAND CEMENT 592
3. ARIZONA V. CALIFORNIA ET.AL. 595
4. CAPPART V. UNITED STATES..... 650
5. UNITED STATES V. NEW MEXICO 660
6. SIERRA CLUB V. LYNNG..... 679

SECTION B. FEDERAL REGULATORY WATER RIGHTS

1. CHARLES T. DUMARS, ENDANGERED SPECIES THAT EAT PRIOR APPROPRIATION: INTEGRATING THE ENDANGERED SPECIES ACT INTO STATE WATER LAW 696
2. RIO GRANDE SILVERY MINNOW, ET AL. V. JOHN W. KEYS, III COMMISSIONER BUREAU OF RECLAMATION 740
3. LETTY BELIN, WATER MANAGEMENT IN THE MIDDLE RIO GRANDE..... 790

CHAPTER 9 NATIVE AMERICAN CONSTRAINTS ON THE STATE SYSTEM

SECTION A. NATIVE AMERICAN RESERVED WATER RIGHTS

1. WINTERS V. UNITED STATES 796
2. STATE OF NEW MEXICO V. LEWIS V. UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, MESCALERO APACHE TRIBE..... 803
3. IN RE THE GENERAL ADJUDICATION OF ALL RIGHTS TO USE WATER IN THE GILA RIVER SYSTEM AND SOURCE 826

SECTION B. PUEBLO INDIAN WATER RIGHTS

1. STATE OF NEW MEXICO V. AAMODT (1976) 843
2. STATE OF NEW MEXICO V. AAMODT (1985)..... 862
3. STATE OF NEW MEXICO V. AAMODT (1987) 883

CHAPTER 10 INTERSTATE WATER RIGHTS

SECTION A. EQUITABLE APPORTIONMENT

1. COLORADO V. NEW MEXICO I	890
2. COLORADO V. NEW MEXICO II	902
3. ANN MACON MCCROSSEN, IS THERE A FUTURE FOR PROPOSED WATER USES IN EQUITABLE APPORTIONMENT SUITS?	917

SECTION B. INTERSTATE COMPACTS

1. HINDERLIDER V. LA PLATA RIVER AND CHERRY CREEK IRRIGATION CO.....	935
2. THE PECOS RIVER COMPACT	944
A. TEXAS V. NEW MEXICO, REPORT OF SPECIAL MASTER ON OBLIGATION OF NEW MEXICO TO TEXAS UNDER THE PECOS RIVER COMPACT.....	951
B. TEXAS V. NEW MEXICO 1983.....	977
C. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-1-2.....	991
D. SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT	993
E. NEW MEXICO INTERSTATE STREAM COMMISSION, HYDROLOGIC EVALUATION 2003	1014
F. FINAL DECREE 2004.....	1033
3. RIO GRANDE COMPACT	1044