

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 77 | Number 1

Article 5

10-1-2002

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 77, 1 (2002). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol77/iss1/5>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact disc@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

Scots in the North American West, 1790–1917. By Ferenc Morton Szasz. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2000. xvi + 272 pp. Halftones, maps, tables, notes, bibliography, index. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8061-3253-1.)

It has been more than thirty years since W. Turrentine Jackson published his *The Enterprising Scot: Investors in the American West After 1873*. Ferenc Szasz's book, *Scots in the North American West, 1790–1917*, widens the scope of the inquiry in an admirable piece of writing and research. The volume treats the interaction between the Scots and the North American West (including Canada) from the 1790s to World War I. During that period British involvement with the West was extensive, especially concerning mining, the range-cattle industry, and sheep raising.

A kind of dramatic pageantry accompanied these economic pursuits. Some Scots became almost legendary. Andy Little in Idaho and Montana mixed-blood Raphael Cristy contributed to the emergence of a western mythology that captivated the homeland Scots. Best known of all were nineteenth-century eccentric Sir William Drummond Stewart and, still later, naturalist John Muir, considered to be the father of the United States National Park system.

The Scot migration even featured an Indian dimension. Szasz's third chapter ("Scotland and the American Indians") deals with what he terms the Scoto-Indians. As late as 1964 the principal chief of Oklahoma's Creek Nation boasted the surname McIntosh. At a national reunion he proudly dressed in full Plains Indian regalia and was accompanied by the sound of bagpipes.

Unlike Szasz, too few historians have paid attention to the solidifying record of foreigners on the prairies and mountains of the West. The Scottish experience helps to vindicate Frederick Jackson Turner's vision of an emancipative American West. Szasz, however, might have compared the Scot record with that of other foreigners. The role of such visitors and settlers deserves at least some of the attention usually lavished upon vigilantes, gunslingers, and

other villains. The dime-novel approach of popularist writers too often continues the myth of a nineteenth-century West devoid of immigrants. Yet, former peasants and aristocrats alike became the shopkeepers, journalists, and bankers of a society in formation.

The Scotch-Irish diaspora was among the largest of all migrations to North America. Both the Brits and Scots also experienced far less discrimination against them than swarthier immigrants. Some Scots arrived with greater capital to invest than most foreigners, but whatever their origins, all had a massive impact upon the development of the American West.

One purpose of studying history professionally is to escape from commonly accepted assumptions by carefully examining the past. Ferenc Szasz, in a superbly documented and stylistic book, has captured the essence of the Scot experience abroad in quite unique ways. He can be proud of his achievement.

Andrew Rolle

The Huntington Library

Fort Robinson and the American West, 1874–1899. By Thomas R. Buecker. (Lincoln: Nebraska State Historical Society, 1999. xxvii + 265 pp. Halftones, maps, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. \$40.00 cloth, ISBN 0-933307-26-8.)

Fort Robinson, located in northeast Nebraska and now a state historical site, played a crucial role in frontier history. Simply put, this book is about Fort Robinson's first twenty-five years: the men who served there; the women who made homes there; the government officials who visited there; the traders and Indian agents who conducted business there; and the Indian peoples (particularly the Lakota and Cheyenne) who traded, treated, fought, and sometimes died there. Thomas Buecker's achievement is notable in that he manages to show Fort Robinson's history not strictly as a series of military encounters but also as a process of human drama. He includes details on the day-to-day running of the fort, the interactions between the groups, the differences in personalities that led to both clashes and deep friendships, and the significant historical events that transpired in or near the post. Buecker uses official military and government documents, and liberally supplements those sources with personal letters and diary entries from the common soldiers, their wives and sweethearts, and visitors. These additional records help the author put into perspective the reasons for stationing soldiers in that isolated but beautiful location. Buecker also makes clear that although there were hard work and

dangerous encounters, there were simple pleasures as well. The entire work is not only impressively documented, but interesting and readable.

Buecker traces the transition of Camp Robinson to a fully garrisoned permanent fort with a significant role in the Sioux Wars of 1874–1876. Fort Robinson was where the Oglala leader, Crazy Horse, was sworn in as a sergeant of military scouts and where he would later surrender, be imprisoned, and meet his untimely and controversial death. From Fort Robinson the Cheyenne, refusing to return to Indian Territory, fled north. When Buecker describes the Indian outbreak of January 1879, he does so with balanced empathy. The account of what he terms the “bloodiest chapter of the fort’s history” is straightforward yet certainly not dry (p. 148).

The 1880s witnessed an expanded role for the fort. As other posts such as Camp Sheridan were abandoned and their troops posted to Fort Robinson, new building projects contributed to its permanency. Of note were the new barracks for the first of the Black cavalry regiments (the “buffalo soldiers”), a frame stable for their mounts, and a new guardhouse. The latter was deemed a necessity because the original was “so infested with vermin” that it was a “punishment for a man to go on guard” (p. 150). Indicative of the type of detail found throughout the book is an account of the buffalo soldiers’ thirty-hour, 102-mile ride in the aftermath of the massacre at Wounded Knee Creek (p. 178). The last chapter, although entitled “Buffalo Soldiers,” does not deal exclusively with the Black soldiers, but covers more of the daily routine and tragic incidents inherent in fort life during this time period.

Although this volume is the first of a projected two-volume work, it can easily stand alone. Indeed, each chapter in itself is quite profitable and Buecker has pulled them together to make his study a fascinating and valuable work that will not disappoint frontier historians and will delight even the casual reader.

Nancy S. Gillis

Wayne State College

Gateway & Geronimo. By Louis Kraft. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2000. xi + 290 pp. Halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. \$49.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8263-2129-1, \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-8263-2130-5.)

Gateway & Geronimo details the events leading to the surrender of Geronimo and his small band of Chiricahua Apaches in what was arguably the last true Indian war in U.S. history. Highlighted throughout the work is

the role of 1st Lt. Charles B. Gatewood, Sixth U.S. Cavalry, in bringing about Geronimo's surrender following a long period of army campaigning fraught with logistical problems and underlying political and diplomatic implications. Historian Louis Kraft has produced the definitive treatment of the actions of the Indians and the army—and particularly of Gatewood—culminating in Geronimo's submission to Brig. Gen. Nelson A. Miles at Skeleton Canyon, New Mexico, on 3 September 1886.

The Apaches had long impeded White settlement in the Southwest, and troublesome incidents with them occurred as far back as the end of the war with Mexico. In the 1870s and 1880s, Brig. Gen. George Crook fielded commands of Apache scouts, promoting schisms among the targeted peoples to break their resistance. Gatewood headed a unit of Apache scouts and later proved a capable reservation administrator, but he distained Crook's political maneuvering and the general's declination to support him or reassign him. In 1885 Geronimo and a small group fled the San Carlos Reservation and entered Mexico; U.S. troops pursued in accordance with existing reciprocity agreements. And when Commanding General Philip H. Sheridan ultimately accepted Crook's resignation over policy differences, the experienced Gatewood was summoned by Miles and directed to go after Geronimo and negotiate his surrender.

As Kraft deftly relates, the ensuing mission was immensely personal and meaningful for Gatewood. Yet despite his strong sense of duty, he suffered bad health, and the support of associate officers critical to Gatewood's success was rancorous and marginal at best. That he induced Geronimo to surrender reflected Gatewood's mettle, commitment, and honor. Unfortunately, Miles and others denied Gatewood his accomplishment, and the general, as he had in other dealings with Indians, lied in finalizing the surrender. In the end, all of the Apaches were shipped east as prisoners of war to alien climates in Florida and Alabama. Many died during this period with the government finally transferring the survivors to Fort Sill, Oklahoma. Despite having done his duty, Gatewood was subsequently ostracized in the profession, victimized by the politics of the Crook-Miles tenures in Arizona. He never won promotion; his health and career declined simultaneously following the events in Arizona, New Mexico, and Mexico, in 1896 Gatewood died a broken man. Geronimo, his friend, also betrayed by the army, lived at Fort Sill until 1909.

Kraft succeeds in recounting the Gatewood-Geronimo drama with clarity and objectivity, conveying a warranted sense of pathos to the protagonists. While the narrative generally reads well, the frequent use of one- and two-

sentence paragraphs occasionally distracts attention from the narrative flow. Nonetheless, the parallel story of these two individuals fated for historic purpose makes *Gatewood & Geronimo* an important contribution to our knowledge of the frontier military experience in the American Southwest.

Jerome A. Greene

National Park Service, Denver

Border Conflict: Villistas, Carrancistas, and the Punitive Expedition, 1915–1920. By Joseph A. Stout Jr. (Fort Worth: Texas Christian University Press, 1999. xiv + 198 pp. Halftones, map, notes, bibliography, index. \$24.95 cloth, ISBN 0-87565-200-X.)

Joseph A. Stout Jr. takes on the well-covered subject of General John J. Pershing's Punitive Expedition into Mexico in response to Francisco "Pancho" Villa's famous attack on Columbus, New Mexico. Stout, through his extensive use of Mexican sources, sheds valuable new light on the Mexican government's response to Pershing's invasion. The author's main argument, based on Mexican military correspondence, is that Venustiano Carranza, Mexico's president, was more concerned with eradicating Villa and his followers than he was with the presence of U.S. troops on Mexican soil. Nonetheless, as a result of the strong nationalist and anti-American rhetoric and propaganda used by Carranza, Woodrow Wilson and U.S. policy makers acted on the belief that Mexican troops might actually be protecting Villa from Pershing and his men. Carranza, however, realized that Villa posed a greater threat to his political survival than did the presence of U.S. troops in Mexico. To solidify the political power of his Constitutionalist faction, Carranza combined an anti-American rhetoric, his own search-and-destroy mission against Villa while carefully avoiding U.S. troops, and a propaganda campaign waged in the United States and aimed at improving his image. Carranza's hope was to force U.S. troops into leaving Mexico by eliminating Pancho Villa, the main reason for their presence. Ironically, the political impasse between the U.S. and Mexican governments brought on by the Pershing Punitive Expedition forced Carranza to appoint his main political rival, General Alvaro Obregón, as secretary of war and chief negotiator. Obregón's appointment eventually led to Carranza's ouster from power in 1920.

Stout does an excellent job of uncovering the logic behind the Mexican government's response to the Pershing Punitive Expedition. However, he

fails to provide a full account of the varied ways in which the Mexican populace responded to the invasion. Stout's recreation of the Punitive Expedition is based on the *New York Times*, several narratives, an autobiography, and U.S. military correspondence. Stout then uses Mexican military correspondence to recreate the Mexican government's response to the expedition, but he fails to take into account the historical and anthropological works of Friedrich Katz and Daniel Nugent that explore the response of the Mexican populace. Stout's claim that no Mexicans would assist U.S. troops in discovering Villa's whereabouts is based on correspondence written by U.S. officers who failed to hunt down Villa. Most Mexicans certainly were not tripping over themselves to help U.S. troops find Villa. Nonetheless, Katz and Nugent have detailed the events surrounding the aid that some Mexican residents—especially those of Namiquipa, Chihuahua—gave to U.S. troops. These residents were responding to the pillaging of their villages and the impressment of their men by Villistas. Assisting U.S. troops was seen as a means of defending themselves against further depravations. Also, in a time of rampant inflation and worthless paper money, many Mexicans were also wooed by the U.S. military's policy of buying supplies from natives with silver dollars. Stout's account of the Pershing Punitive Expedition would have been richer had he included these insights.

Border Conflict is a wonderfully written reinterpretation of the Punitive Expedition and will be a joy to read for professional historians and casual readers alike. Despite some minor flaws, this book is highly recommended.

Andrae M. Marak

Lakeland College, Milwaukee

Tangled Destinies: Latin America and the United States. By Don M. Coerver and Linda B. Hall. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1999. xii + 289 pp. Halftones, maps, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. \$39.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8263-2118-6, \$21.95 paper, ISBN 0-8263-2117-8.)

Ten years of the post-Cold War era have invited new attempts at interpreting relations between Latin American countries and a growing variety of historical players in the United States during the last two hundred years. Linda Hall and Don Coerver offer a fresh, scholarly synthesis and an interpretation of these complex relations for the period between 1820 and 2000.

The book offers graduates and scholars a highly sophisticated narrational tapestry that accommodates the widest possible interrelated issues: international financial structures, diplomacy, drug wars, politics of debt, and the issue of multicultural ethnicity as it relates to the Latino communities in the United States. The resulting multitude of policy dilemmas are presented to undergraduate students in a clear, convincing, and accessible manner. The authors strike a remarkable balance between description and exploration.

Hall and Coerver use the tool of chronology to offer the reader an entry into the material. The first quarter of the book looks at the nineteenth century. The next two quarters are devoted to an analysis of the twentieth century. The last quarter focuses on issues of ethnic integration and international crime networks that peddle extreme stimulants in disregard of national boundaries. It also explores the question how the modern democratic state should react to this challenge. In addition a supplementary bibliography allows professors to give students instant helpful citations during office hours.

This text is richer than most survey texts, for it includes sources that go against the established preferred political explanations. Delightfully, it repeatedly breaks out of the silly historical isolationism of the U.S.–Latin American paradigm and looks at the hemisphere from a world perspective. Students will find nonstereotypical descriptions of U.S. and Latin American policy makers and their decision making, or lack thereof. Interestingly, the book also transcends petty ideological faultlines of inward looking academic culture where the evidence suggests the need to go beyond dualistic reasoning. This book might be an ideal survey text for years to come.

Friedrich E. Schuler

Portland State University

A Finger in the Wound: Body Politics in Quincentennial Guatemala. By Diane M. Nelson. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1999. xix + 427 pp. Halftones, maps, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. \$55.00 cloth, ISBN 0-520-21284-3, \$22.00 paper, ISBN 0-520-21285-1.)

Diane Nelson has written a complex, well-documented, and thoroughly researched book about contemporary Guatemalan politics, state formation, national identity, and the Maya resurgence in Guatemala. For the past thirty years, Guatemala has endured the longest civil war in Central America, a

conflict that formally ended only with the signing of the Chapultepec Peace Accords in December 1996. Left in the debris of the war is a fractured nation trying to rebuild itself and reconstitute its national identity. Central among the issues of national reconstruction and identity reformation is the participation of the Maya, who constitute a majority in this heavily indigenous nation. Long exploited by the Ladino ruling elites and marginalized within the Guatemalan political system, the Maya have begun to reassert themselves culturally and politically. The Maya movement is perhaps the single most dramatic example of the contemporary reemergence of indigenous peoples in the Americas.

The title of the book refers to the conceptualization that Guatemalans use to depict Maya activism—as a finger in the wounds of the damaged body politic of their nation. Using a mode of analysis termed “fluidarity” (developed originally by Mark Driscoll), defined as “a practice of necessarily partial knowledge” (p. 42), Nelson uses metaphors referring to the human body in layered, nuanced ways to describe the complex and ever-shifting milieu of Guatemalan politics and national-identity formation. Her use of the fluidarity concept is an important intellectual contribution. Because of its ability to capture complexity in motion, fluidarity can be useful for examining cultural discourse and political relations among ethnic groups. Fluidarity rejects the idea that identities are solid or rigidly fixed. Instead, from this perspective, identities are formed through a process of articulation.

The book successfully illuminates the tangle of Maya-Ladino cultural and political relations, largely because of Nelson’s ability to pull together a wide range of relevant literature and her rapport with seemingly all sectors of Guatemalan society. Nelson’s book represents the best of postmodern scholarship, offering an accessible and readable account with a minimum of jargon, faltering only in an unnecessarily complicated chapter on international law and treaties.

Scholars of interethnic relations in the Americas will be able to mine this book’s insights for years to come. Nelson’s work will stand as a thorough, thoughtful, and finely honed analysis that illuminates indigenous activism and indigenous-Ladino relations within the context of national identity reformation in the newly peaceful and democratizing nations of Central America.

Kathleen R. Martin

Florida International University

Zarzuela: Spanish Operetta, American Stage. By Janet L. Sturman. (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2000. x + 243 pp. Halftones, tables, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 0-252-02596-2.)

Sturman's study of zarzuela takes the reader on a journey from the Iberian Peninsula where the Spanish musical-theatrical form was conceived in the mid-1600s, to the Americas where zarzuela has been appropriated and transformed by Cubans, Argentinians, Puerto Ricans, and other Spanish-speaking peoples living in the United States.

The book devotes one chapter to the history of zarzuela in Spain but then moves to the New World for a thorough treatment of zarzuela as a musical and cultural phenomenon representing the creole experience. In the next four chapters the book traces the zarzuela as an itinerant form of entertainment brought to Latin America by Spanish troupes and then as a locally produced show. Sturman documents the development of zarzuela and its related forms in Cuba because the island nation contributed greatly to the production and reception of zarzuela in the United States, especially in what Sturman calls "The Golden Years" of zarzuela during the 1920s–1930s.

Sturman's skills as an ethnomusicologist shine brightest in the final four chapters that address two of the Big Apple's most distinguished zarzuela companies of the late twentieth century: Repertorio Español and Thalia Spanish Theatre. Here, the reader learns of the different artistic and musical styles of the two companies as shaped by their dynamic directors. These chapters also recognize the efforts of the directors to build a solid infrastructure of clientele and funding sources in order to keep zarzuela alive as a legitimate form of entertainment for the diverse Spanish-speaking communities of New York. Sturman's portrait of the audiences from those communities and their reasons for attending zarzuela performances constitute a fascinating study of cultural and ethnic identity. Sturman proposes that the zarzuela, as performed by the two companies she investigates, not only preserves traditions but also enables the Hispanic population to attain desirable interactions with the greater New York population. As she states in her conclusion, "zarzuela productions do much more than project identity. They actually create a composite identity that does not exist outside the confines of the zarzuela show" (p. 158).

Sturman addresses the Southwest twice in her book, first in her history of the zarzuela in the United States and second as part of her study on the networking of zarzuela directors. She further pays tribute to the International Festival de la Zarzuela held in El Paso, Texas, for many years and the energetic work of Mary Montañó and ¡Viva Zarzuela! of Albuquerque, New Mexico.

Sturman's writing invites the reader to participate in her examination of both the historical roots and the cultural consequences of the importation of zarzuela to the New World in chapters that are carefully knitted together. The only element missing from this engaging and thoughtful history of Spanish lyric theater is a compact disc with examples of the vibrant songs that have made the zarzuela a beloved attraction of its audiences for centuries.

Margo Milleret

University of New Mexico

La Música de los Viejitos: Hispano Folk Music of the Rio Grande del Norte. By Jack Loeffler, Katherine Loeffler, and Enrique R. Lamadrid. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1999. xi + 223 pp. 40 halftones, song texts, bibliography, index. \$49.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8263-2168-2, \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-8263-1884-3.)

La Música de los Viejitos offers a concise history and description of Hispano folk music found in New Mexico. Often overlooked, New Mexico like other former territories once claimed by Spain and Mexico is rich in both cultural and musical practices. The art forms and other cultural expressions found in the state are often unique, defined by the particular history of the region. The authors of this book have produced a much-needed text that provides the historical context for the folk music from the New Mexico region, and offers the song texts, musical transcriptions, photographs and descriptions of accompanying dance forms.

The book is organized around the major genres that make up most of the region's Hispano folk music. The authors address historically, contextually, and musically The Romances, Relaciones, Inditas, Corridos, and Canciones music for ceremonial and religious events, and music for dances, theatre, and other more enigmatic forms such as the Matachines. They also thoughtfully provide an index of terminology that is helpful for readers not familiar with these genres. The book also contains a wonderful series of photographs of the Hispano folk musicians, who provided much of the information in the book. The authors thoughtfully present the material and credit their information to the folk musicians whom they interviewed. They also do a beautiful job of providing abundant information without getting bogged down in musical terminology and technical information, making the book accessible to both musical and non-musical readers.

La Música de los Viejitos will be useful to individuals interested in folk music in the region as well as individuals studying cultural history, ethnomusicology, and anthropology. The book provides a wealth of information and beckons the reader to learn more about the rich musical traditions found in the Río Grande region.

Maria Williams

University of New Mexico

The Suppression of Salt of the Earth: How Hollywood, Big Labor, and Politicians Blacklisted a Movie in Cold War America. By James J. Lorence. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1999. xv + 279 pp. 40 halftones, maps, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. \$45.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8263-2027-9, \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-8263-2028-7.)

In his clearly organized and well written *The Suppression of Salt of the Earth*, author James J. Lorence traces the suppression during the Cold War era of perhaps the most important—in social terms—feature film in the history of U.S. independent cinema. *Salt of the Earth*, produced in the early 1950s, was not merely a semidocumentary account of a miners' strike in New Mexico; it was also an engaging, realist narrative featuring down-to-earth working-class characters attempting to improve their socioeconomic situation. Long before the sixties, this film proudly boasted a triple commitment: feminist, pro-Mexican American, and pro-labor.

Lorence begins by sketching the sociopolitical and historical context of the Cold War period. Specific topics examined include the rise of anticommunism in Hollywood and in the bureaucratized labor movement, the struggle of the Mexican American Left for worker dignity, postwar corporatism, and Chicana activism. The author recounts the 1950 strike by Local 890 of the International Union of Mine, Mill, and Smelter Workers against Empire Zinc in Bayard, New Mexico. The origins of the *Salt of the Earth* project are scrutinized, as is the opposition to the film by powerful individuals such as movie mogul Howard Hughes and congressman Donald L. Jackson, and organizations such as the International Alliance of Theatrical Stage Employees. Lorence then examines the subsequent suit brought by the filmmakers, who alleged conspiracy and boycott in restraint of trade. Finally, the author considers the historical legacies of this unusual movie-making project, which had brought together blacklisted Hollywood figures, determined union activists, and rank-and-file unionists and their spouses.

To trace the suppression of the film, Lorence draws widely on previously published material (e.g., director Herbert Biberman's *Salt of the Earth: The Story of a Film*), public and private archives, and interviews he and others conducted. The result is felicitous in that Lorence's book offers a thoroughly contextualized, far-ranging, well-argued, and precisely documented account that supersedes previous ones. *The Suppression of Salt of the Earth* is a model for the scholarly case study: it explores with thoroughness and objectivity an important instance of the suppression of thought and expression in U.S. cultural history. Furthermore, the University of New Mexico Press has solidly supported its author by providing the necessary scholarly apparatus: extensive endnotes, appendixes, an easy-to-use index, and a clearly organized bibliography.

Dennis West

University of Idaho

All Our Relations: Native Struggles for Land and Life. By Winona LaDuke. (Cambridge, Mass.: South End Press; Minneapolis: Honor the Earth, 1999. vii + 241 pp. Halftones, maps, notes, index. \$40.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8960-8600-3, \$16.00 paper, ISBN 0-8960-8599-6.)

I first saw Winona LaDuke at an environmental journalist's conference. She was on a panel consisting almost entirely of old White guys, some of them prominent newspapermen whose names I had grown up respecting. By comparison with LaDuke, their approach seemed extraordinarily shallow. LaDuke was approximately my age, a Harvard graduate, a woman, and an impassioned speaker. Her multidisciplinary perspective reflected the Native American dictum to think about how one's decisions would affect the seventh generation after us.

The idea that biological and cultural diversity are being lost simultaneously, and that both losses are related is central to LaDuke's thinking. She states this clearly on the first page of her book: "There is a direct relationship between the loss of cultural diversity and the loss of biodiversity. Wherever Indigenous peoples remain, there is also a corresponding enclave of biodiversity" (p. 1).

In this statement lie the strength and weakness of LaDuke's book, which profiles a number of Native American environmental activists and their causes. Certainly, the relationship between Native Americans and the environment is

far less abusive than the history of European settlement in North America. However, increasing evidence suggests that the Asians who crossed the Bering Land Bridge wiped out many of the large animal species that roamed the North American continent at the time. These species included giant sloths, camels, enormous bears twice the size of a modern-day grizzly, saber-toothed cats, and a species of small horses. Accounts by early western explorers like Meriwether Lewis and William Clark indicate that Native Americans were as limited by the preindustrial nature of their lives as by their admirable co-evolution with the natural landscape.

Shades of gray like this are rare in *All Our Relations*. Didacticism permeates the book, although alleviated by flashes of unpretentious humanity. The most engaging moments come when LaDuke acknowledges her own role as the bridge between two worlds. When she visits a traditional Seminole community, she writes: "We talked, and two or three young Seminole women looked over my shoulder as I furiously typed on my portable computer. . . . They all seemed to nod approvingly at my white man's technology put to use. It may not be their path, but they can work with it" (p. 40).

Certainly LaDuke's cause is a good one. At its best, her book provides a window to a world inaccessible to many of us. *All Our Relations* is a good primer for activists looking for information on Native American and cutting-edge biodiversity issues covered infrequently and often poorly by the media. However, I wish that an editor had worked with this important thinker to craft a book—one that could earn a wider audience—with a consistent tone, a more balanced argument, and much more of the humor and humanity that the reader only glimpses here.

Susan Zakin

Tucson, Arizona

A Portal to Paradise: 11,537 Years, More or Less, on the Northeast Slope of the Chiricahua Mountains: Being a Fairly Accurate and Occasionally Anecdotal History of That Part of Cochise County, Arizona, and the Country Immediately Adjacent, Replete With Tales of Glory and Greed, Heroism and Depravity, and Plain Hard Work. By Alden Hayes. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1999. xxx + 359 pp. 48 halftones, maps, bibliographic essay. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8165-1785-1, \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-8165-2144-1.)

The Archaeological Society of New Mexico honored Alden Hayes with its annual volume of collected papers ten years after his 1975 retirement as a

National Park Service archeologist. He had a distinguished career in directing surveys and excavations at Mesa Verde National Park, at Gran Quivira National Monument, and finally with the National Park Service's Chaco Center.

In retirement, Hayes wrote *A Portal to Paradise*, which concerns the people who lived in, passed through, or had some connection with the northeastern slope of the Chiricahua Mountains in southeastern Arizona and eastward to Rodeo, New Mexico. He ranched in this area before entering the Park Service and returned to it upon his retirement. He says in the preface that this is a story, not a treatise, and while it is not meant to be a piece of scholarship, it is not fiction either. *A Portal to Paradise* is Hayes's own personal account of the country and the people to whom he felt closest.

The story moves chronologically, with the first five chapters summarizing what is known about the local prehistory, the Apache occupation, along with Spanish explorations and campaigning, such early American travelers as the Forty-Niners and John Russell Bartlett, the surveys and stage lines of the later 1850s, and the Civil War era. For these time periods, the author draws upon standard written sources.

The last eight chapters are very different. These have titles such as "Galeyville," "Cowboys and Indians," "Geronimo's Time," "The End of the Frontier," "Portal," and "The Nesters," that carry the reader up to 1941. For these accounts the author relies on oral history, manuscript sources, and lesser-known writings such as the *Chiricahua Bullshead*. These chapters are local history, and much of the content is anecdotal. A great many individuals, most of whom will be unfamiliar to persons outside southeastern Arizona, find mention in these pages. The many personalities soon become blurred although some are mentioned in more than one chapter. Unfortunately there is no index to help the reader keep track of the names.

The title, *A Portal to Paradise*, plays upon the names of two early-twentieth-century communities at the eastern base of the mountains. The photographs, many from family holdings, are excellent. A bibliographic essay notes the written sources used and many of the oral ones. Actual errors are few: the 1875 dates on p. 90 should read 1874; Lieutenant Maus was Crawford's second in command (p. 161); and the namesake of Luna, New Mexico, was Solomon Luna (p. 190). Descendents of early settlers and current residents of the Chiricahuas will value this book, and outlaw-lawman historians should find useful leads in the first part of chapter 7. The emphasis upon personalities and family histories place *A Portal to Paradise* alongside local histories such as *Do You Remember Luna? One Hundred Years of Pioneer*

History, 1883–1993 (1983), *Fence Lake, New Mexico Area: Families and History* (1987), and James Sullivan's history of Monticello and Sierra County, New Mexico entitled *A New Mexican Family: Tafoya-Sullivan and the Origins of Sierra County* (1994).

John P. Wilson
Las Cruces, New Mexico

The Politics of Fieldwork: Research in an American Concentration Camp. By Lane Ryo Hirabayashi. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1999. xii + 219 pp. Halftones, appendix, bibliography, index. \$35.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8165-1864-5, \$17.95 paper, ISBN 0-8165-2146-8.)

On 19 February 1942, following the Japanese attack on Pearl Harbor, President Roosevelt signed Executive Order 9066, giving the U.S. Army the authority to establish zones from which U.S. citizens and aliens might be removed. On 16 March, Western Defense Commander, Lieutenant DeWitt initiated plans for the removal and detention of all people of Japanese ancestry living along the Pacific coast and portions of Arizona. The following day President Roosevelt established the War Relocation Authority (WRA) to supervise their removal and detention. By June, 110,000 persons of Japanese ancestry, two-thirds of whom were American citizens, had been removed from their homes and transferred to American concentration camps administered by the WRA.

The Politics of Fieldwork: Research in an American Concentration Camp is an account of the experiences of Dr. Tamie Tsuchiyama who, as an anthropology doctoral student, was hired to conduct ethnographic fieldwork in a World War II American concentration camp. While various aspects of their experiences have been studied, Hirabayashi's book focuses on the little known experiences of ethnic Japanese assistants who conducted ethnographic fieldwork in these camps.

Hirabayashi reconstructed the experience of Tamie Tsuchiyama, a Nisei from Hawai'i. In 1942 Tsuchiyama accepted a staff research position under Dorothy Thomas, director of the University of California's Japanese American Evacuation and Resettlement Study (JERS), and became the primary JERS fieldworker in the Santa Anita "assembly center." By August Tsuchiyama moved to Poston, a camp that was located south of Parker, Arizona, on land of the Mojave and Chemehuevi Indians, where she worked until July 1944.

Through an inventory of Tsuchiyama's personal letters, field notes, reports, and other archival sources, Hirabayashi has reconstructed her field experience and, in the process, sheds light on the pressures and ethical, political, and practical constraints ethnic Japanese field assistants experienced. Hirabayashi argues that Tsuchiyama, who "was used as a 'data collector' by Thomas" (p. 117), represented a historical trend "in which Europeans or Euro-Americans have utilized field assistants who were people of color" (p. 164). Academic hierarchy exacerbates this trend "when those who are in the position to develop and publish ethnographies are the European or Euro-American scholars, not the field assistants of color" (p. 164). He correctly points out, however, that Tsuchiyama voluntarily chose the role of principal fieldworker for JERS in Poston. Although Hirabayashi quotes his primary sources too abundantly and includes subordinate material that obstructs his thesis, the book, in its entirety, presents excellent primary data, sheds light on an understudied topic, and provides an important thesis that is also a lesson in ethics for Euroamerican social scientists. The book will be invaluable for scholars interested in World War II concentration camps, particularly in the Southwest.

Orit Tamir, Ph.D.

Department of Behavioral Sciences

New Mexico Highlands University

Book Notes

Argentine Caudillo: Juan Manuel de Rosas. By John Lynch. Latin American Silhouettes Series. (Wilmington, Del.: Scholarly Resources, 2001. xi + 185 pp. Map, tables, notes, bibliography, index. \$55.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8420-2897-8, \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-8420-2898-6.)

Alternative Leadership Strategies in the Prehispanic Southwest. Edited by Barbara J. Mills. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2000. x + 299 pp. Half-tones, maps, charts, tables, graphs, notes, bibliography, index. \$40.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8165-2028-3.)

The American West: The Invention of a Myth. By David Murdoch. (Cardiff, Wales: Welsh Academic Press, 1996; reprint, Reno: University of Nevada Press, 2001. xii + 136 pp. Bibliography, index. \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-87417-369-8.)

The American West: The Reader. Edited by Walter Nugent and Martin Ridge. (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1999. xvi + 335 pp. Half-tones, map, tables, notes, index. \$39.95 cloth, ISBN 0-253-33530-2, \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-253-21290-1.)

Cárdenas Compromised: The Failure of Reform in Postrevolutionary Yucatán. By Ben Fallaw. (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 2001. x + 222 pp. Map, notes, bibliography, index. \$54.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8223-2758-9, \$18.95 paper, ISBN 0-8223-2767-8.)

Chicano/Latino Homoerotic Identities. Edited by David Williams Foster. Latin America Studies Series. (New York: Garland Publishing, 1999. xi + 367 pp. Half-tones, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. \$70.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8153-3228-9.)

Chicano Renaissance: Contemporary Cultural Trends. Edited by David R. Maciel, Isidro D. Ortiz, and María Herrera-Sobek. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2000. xxxiii + 330 pp. Half-tones, line drawing, notes, bibliography, index. \$45.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8165-2020-8, \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-8165-2021-6.)

Culture Wars in Brazil: The First Vargas Regime, 1930–1945. By Daryle Williams. (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 2001. xxii + 346 pp. Color plates, halftones, tables, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. \$59.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8223-2708-2, \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-8223-2719-8.)

Documents of United States Indian Policy. 3rd ed. Edited by Francis Paul Prucha. (1975; reprint, Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2000. xii + 396 pp. Bibliography, index. \$50.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8032-3728-6, \$25.00 paper, ISBN 0-8032-8762-3.)

Girl of the Manzanos. By Barbara Spencer Foster. First Fiction Series. (Santa Fe: Sun Stone Press, 2001. 176 pp. \$22.95 cloth, ISBN 0-86534-313-6.)

The Gold Rush Diary of Ramón Gil Navarro. By Ramón Gil Navarro. Edited and translated by María del Carmen Ferreyra and David S. Reher. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2000. xx + 305 pp. Halftones, maps, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. \$45.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8032-3343-4.)

Guilt by Association: Essays on Japanese Settlement, Internment, and Relocation in the Rocky Mountain West. Edited by Mike Mackey. (Powell, Wyo.: Western History Publications, 2001. 289 pp. Halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. \$18.95 paper, ISBN 0-9661556-4-5.)

Heaven's Window: A Journey Through Northern New Mexico. By Michael Wallis, photographs by Jack Parsons. (Portland, Ore.: Graphic Arts Center Publishing Co., 2001. 120 pp. 92 color plates. \$27.00 cloth, ISBN 1-55868-547-2.)

Indigenous Struggle at the Heart of Brazil: State Policy, Frontier Expansion, and the Xavante Indians, 1937–1988. By Seth Garfield. (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 2001. xii + 316 pp. Halftones, maps, tables, notes, bibliography, index. \$59.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8223-2661-2, \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-8223-2665-5.)

Integral Outsiders: The American Colony in Mexico City, 1876–1911. By William Schell Jr. Latin American Silhouettes Series. (Wilmington, Del.: Scholarly Resources, 2001. xix + 274 pp. Halftones, notes, bibliography, index. \$55.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8420-2838-2.)

Kiowa, Apache, and Comanche Military Societies: Enduring Veterans, 1800 to the Present. By William C. Meadows. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1999. xx + 495 pp. Halftones, tables, notes, bibliography, index. \$65.00 cloth, ISBN 0-292-75212-1.)

The Mexican American Orquesta: Music, Culture, and the Dialectic of Conflict. By Manuel Peña. (Austin: The University of Texas, 1999. xii + 350 pp. Halftones, musical scores, notes, selected discography, bibliography, index. \$45.00 cloth, ISBN 0-292-76568-X, \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-292-76587-8.)

Mr. Polk's Army: The American Military Experience in the Mexican War. By Richard Bruce Winders. Texas A&M University Military History Series, no. 51. (1997; reprint, College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 2001. xvi + 284 pp. Halftones, tables, notes, bibliography, index. \$17.95 paper, ISBN 1-58544-162-7.)

The Northern Navajo Frontier 1860–1900: Expansion Through Adversity. By Robert S. McPherson. (1988; reprint, Logan: Utah State University, 2001. viii + 133 pp. Halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-87421-424-6.)

A Parisian in Brazil: The Travel Account of a Frenchwoman in Nineteenth-Century Rio de Janeiro. By Adèle Toussaint-Samson, translated by Emma Toussaint, edited and introduced by June E. Hahner. Latin American Silhouettes Series. (Wilmington, Del.: Scholarly Resources, 2001. xxvii + 121 pp. Halftones, notes, appendix. \$50.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8420-2854-4, \$17.95 paper, ISBN 0-8420-2855-2.)

Romance Philology: Documenting the Colonial Experience, with Special regard to Spanish in the American Southwest, vol. 53, issues 1–2. Edited by Jerry Craddock and Barbara De Marco. (Turnhout, Belgium: Brepols Publishers, Fall 1999–Spring 2000. \$25.00 paper, NO ISBN ASSIGNED.)

Sacagawea's Son: The Life of Jean Baptiste Charbonneau. By Marion Tinling. (Missoula, Mont.: Mountain Press Publishing Company, 2001. vii + 125 pp. Halftones, map, bibliography, index. \$10.00 paper, ISBN 0-87842-432-6.)

The Tale Of Healer Miguel Perdomo Neira: Medicine, Ideologies, and Power in the Nineteenth-Century Andes. By David Sowell. Latin American Silhouettes Series. (Wilmington, Del.: Scholarly Resources, 2001. xix + 171 pp. Notes, bibliography, index. \$55.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8420-2826-9, \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-8420-2827-7.)

The Tribute of Blood: Army, Honor, Race, and Nation in Brazil, 1864–1945. By Peter M. Beattie. Latin American Otherwise Series. (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 2001. xxiv + 390 pp. Halftones, map, tables, appendixes, notes, index. \$54.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8223-2733-3, \$18.95 paper, ISBN 0-8223-2743-0.)

Vagrants and Citizens: Politics and the Masses in Mexico City from Colony to Republic. By Richard Warren. Latin American Silhouettes Series. (Wilmington, Del.: Scholarly Resources. ix + 202 pp. Halftones, tables, notes, bibliography, index. \$60.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8420-2964-8.)

Valley, Plains and Sky an Environmental History of the Middle Pecos: Volume I of Along the East Bank of the Pecos: A Tale of Four Fort Sumners and Beyond. By Dan Scurlock and H. R. Parsons. (Fort Sumner, N.Mex.: Friends of Fort Sumner's Heritage, 2001. iii + 108 pp. Halftones, maps, tables, bibliography. \$ GRATIS, paper, NO ISBN ASSIGNED.)

At War with Mexico: A Fictional Mosaic. By Bruce Cutler. Literature of the American West Series, vol. 6. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2001. x + 209 pp. \$24.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8061-3264-7.)

Weaving the Dance: Navajo Yeibichai Textiles (1910-1950). By Rebecca M. Valette and Jean-Paul Valette. (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2001. 72 pp. 51 color plates, halftones, map, bibliography. \$19.95 paper, ISBN 0-9633710-2-9.)

Where Pavement Ends: Five Native American Plays. By William S. Yellow Robe Jr. American Indian Literature and Critical Studies Series, vol. 37. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2000. xvi + 169 pp. \$24.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8061-3265-5.)

Wild West Shows. By Paul Reddin. (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1999. xvi + 312 pp. 20 halftones, notes, bibliography, index. \$49.95 cloth, ISBN 0-252-02464-8, \$21.95 paper, ISBN 0-252-06787-8.)

William Z. Foster and the Tragedy of American Radicalism. By James R. Barrett. The Working Class in American History Series. (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2000. xiii + 352 pp. Halftones, notes, index. \$34.95 cloth, ISBN 0252-02046-4.)