New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 71 | Number 1 Article 5

1-1-1996

Book Reviews

BOOK REVIEWS

Camp Floyd and the Mormons: The Utah War. By Donald R. Moorman and Gene A. Sessions. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1992. xvi + 332 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, index. $29.95.)

Camp Floyd and the Mormons studies how the federal military occupation of Utah Territory between 1857 and 1861 modified the Mormon kingdom in the Great Salt Lake Valley. The narrative ranges over a wide array of topics: causes of the occupation, the occupation itself, territorial government by non–Mormons, the spread of vice and violence, life at Camp Floyd, the conduct of the federal courts, the Mountain Meadows Massacre, exploration of the Great Basin, federal Indian policy, and the economy. Brigham Young, Alfred Cumming, Albert S. Johnston, John C. Cradlebaugh, and other colorful characters come alive in the book. *Camp Floyd and the Mormons*, a contribution to the Utah Centennial Series, is a lively account of this little–understood confrontation between the Church of Latter Day Saints and the United States government.

Responding to reports of a Mormon rebellion in Utah Territory, President William P. Buchanan deployed the United States Army to the Great Salt Lake Valley. He ordered the expedition commander, Colonel Albert S. Johnston, to occupy the valley and help federal authorities restore law and order. After a bloodless, humiliating campaign against the Mormons, the regular army built Camp Floyd in Cedar Valley during the summer of 1858. This Great Basin military post became the center of Gentile, or non–Mormon resistance to prophet Brigham Young and his Mormon followers, who dominated Utah.

The occupation destroyed any Mormon hope for blessed isolation. Young and his followers hoped to build a Mormon theocracy that would serve their church and God. Following the army to Utah, however, thousands of Gentile teamsters, prostitutes, gamblers, and adventurers, whose way of life was an affront to the Saints, tore at the edges of Mormon hegemony. In the streets and saloons of Salt Lake City and Fairfield, Gentile and Mormon toughs frequently skirmished with flailing fisticuffs and smoking guns over provocations great and small.

New federal appointees tried to break Mormon political domination. Their acknowledged leader was Colonel Albert S. Johnston, commander of the Department of Utah. His command, and exercise in anti–Mormonism, threw its weight behind the territorial judiciary, which tried to prosecute Mormon leaders. Giving Mormon prophet Brigham Young fits, one–eyed Justice John C. Cradlebaugh vigorously investigated the Mountain Meadows Massacre and other mysterious murders, scarring "the territory for a generation" (p. 107). Among the Gentiles, however,

an anti–army clique formed around Governor Alfred C. Cumming. Jealous of Johnston's power, the vain governor was "too willing to accept Mormon claims against the army" (p. 120). The Johnston–Cumming rift, exploited by Young and the Mormon leadership, undermined the effective government of Utah Territory.

The major consequence of the occupation was to incorporate Utah Territory into the national system. Aided by territorial authorities and Mormon negligence, Gentile merchants took over and molded the Utah economy to their own benefit, wreaking havoc on Mormon agriculture and home industries. The influx of federal money injected unprecedented prosperity into Utah Territory but also revised wages and prices upward and pushed Mormon indebtedness to higher levels. From this time forward, the Utah economy would wax and wane with the booms and busts of the national and regional economy.

Camp Floyd and the Mormons complements Norman Furniss's classic *The Mormon Conflict, 1850–1859*, enlarging especially on the local effects of the federal occupation. These two monographs, supplemented by several important articles by William MacKinnon, will give scholars a thorough understanding of the Mormon War. Nonetheless, the Moorman–Sessions volume will stand as the most complete history of the Mormon War.

Larry Durwood Ball
Albuquerque, New Mexico

Caroline Lockhart: Her Life and Legacy. By Necah Stewart Furman. (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1994. xxii + 221 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. $35.00 cloth, $18.95 paper.)

In her outstanding literary biography of Caroline Lockhart, Necah Stewart Furman balances biography and criticism as the subtitle aptly indicates. Repeatedly, Furman describes Lockhart as a tough–minded but talented woman "out of time, out of place" (p. 8).

Born in Kansas, Lockhart's journalistic experiences began on the East Coast in Boston and Philadelphia, where she gained a reputation for receiving assignments generally given to male reporters, including an interview with William "Buffalo Bill" Cody. At a time when it was still unusual for a middle–class woman to work outside the home, Lockhart not only joined a profession considered unladylike, but she also relished the exploits associated with it. In addition, Lockhart was openly sexually active for her time, even though such actions hindered her periodic desire for married respectability.

On the other hand, Lockhart personifies many aspects of the contemporary West, including its complexity and paradoxical nature. Her diaries, of which Furman makes extensive and discerning use, reveal Lockhart's inner struggles and bitter disappointments that she hid behind a bravado of independence and humor. Moreover, these intimate sources of Lockhart's life were Furman's richest repository of information, as they are for many "new western" and women's historians.

In addition, although Lockhart sided with those who yearned "to arrest time" (p. xv) in the romantic era of the "Wild West," she was not above using the contemporary tool of tourism to gain this end. Besides being one of the original boosters of Cody's annual frontier event, she promoted the beneficial aspects of dude ranching. In fact, like others, Lockhart not only contributed to the myth of the West but lived it, assuming the role of a rancher in her later life.

Lockhart's literary heritage contributed profoundly to the modern image of the West, while differing significantly from her contemporaries. Unlike Mary Austin's and Willa Cather's works, the cowboy West and its frontier past permeated almost everything Lockhart wrote after 1904. Notwithstanding favorable comparisons to Zane Grey and Owen Wister, her work contrasted greatly with that of her male colleagues. Besides interjecting rough doses of reality into her works, Lockhart also introduced strong female characters into the bunkhouse, previously an exclusively male domain.

Though Furman could have placed more emphasis on Lockhart's parallels with the contemporary West, her mixture of life story and literary criticism holds the reader's interest. The author can legitimately claim literary biography as another area of expertise.

Stefanie Beninato
Santa Fe, New Mexico

Contemporary New Mexico, 1940–1990. Edited by Richard W. Etulain. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1994. xi + 210 pp. Illustrations, bibliographies, index. $19.95 paper.)

In describing this volume, based upon a series of papers delivered at a 1992 conference on New Mexico's history since 1940, editor Richard Etulain characterizes its twofold purpose as "to supply a brief overview of New Mexico during the last half–century and to suggest how dozens of important subjects of this fifty–year period remain to be studied" (p. x). The subsequent half–dozen essays generally achieve Etulain's objectives in competent fashion.

As anyone familiar with current scholarship about the American West would expect, most of the essays devote considerable attention to questions of race, ethnicity, gender, family life, and environmental affairs, although more traditional subjects such as economic and political development receive substantial treatment as well. On occasion, the reader finds a useful merging between topics addressed by different authors such as Rosalie Otero's examination of the role of ethnic identity in New Mexican cultural life and Ferenc Szasz's analysis of New Mexican cultural evolution since World War II or Virginia Scharff's piece on modern New Mexican families and Michael Welsh's description of post–war economic change or Welsh's essay and political scientist F. Chris García's explanation of the "politics of cultural accommodation" since 1940. Even the six "keys" to understanding New Mexico that Gerald Nash identifies in his lead–off essay appear, in somewhat different garb, in most of these essays. This linkage among essays reinforces the reader's understanding of the increasingly complex social, cultural, and political life of New Mexico in the post–war period.

Among the individual articles, those of Szasz and Scharff stand out among their peers as the most imaginative and (particularly in Scharff's case) the most engaging in their descriptions of modern New Mexico's cultures and the accelerating changes in the lives of its families. Szasz's argument in favor of an interpretation that stresses the rise of certain "new" cultures that may overshadow the traditonal "three cultures" of the state possesses interesting implications beyond New Mexico's boundries. In a more traditional vein, Nash and Welsh have produced especially detailed and well–informed summaries of the general course of New Mexican history since 1940 and economic developments in that same period, respectively. Lastly, both Otero and García have tackled the pervasive influence of ethnicity upon post–war New Mexico in the respective arenas of the arts and politics.

In a few instances, further revision would have strengthened certain essays. Although Scharff's pungent essay, with its adeptly–chosen anecdotes and sharply-written prose, entertains and provokes, more discussion of developments in social welfare policies would have clarified the roots of the contemporary social conditions that she dissects with such vigor. Conversely, biographical vignettes about the men and women who benefited from the relentlessly "personal" dimension of New Mexican politics would have enlivened García's rather abstract analysis of the patterns and structures of political power.

Such qualms, however, do not erode the significance of *Contemporary New Mexico*. Taken as a whole, these essays advance our understanding of the seminal impact of World War II upon the Far West as seen through the evolving circumstances of New Mexico. Let us hope that similar works may emerge in other western states as we continue to ponder this region's place in the history of post–war America.

Peter J. Blodgett
Huntington Library

The Devil in the New World: The Impact ot Diabolism in New Spain. By Fernando Cervantes. (New Haven, Connecticut: Yale University Press, 1994. x + 182 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. $22.50.)

In this fascinating study, Cervantes, by blending social and intellectual history, explores the influence of diabolism in New Spain from the sixteenth through the mid–eighteenth centuries. The book opens with an explanation of how native Mesoamericans reshaped and syncretically incorporated into their own cultures the alien European concepts of God and the devil taught by Spanish friars.

Unlike European Christians, the indigenous peoples of New Spain believed in many deities, all of whom combined elements of good and evil. Such was necessary, they felt, for the maintenance of terrestrial harmony; in other words, to keep a balance between creativity and destruction. The notion of a totally good God or a completely evil devil was incomprehensible to the Mesoamerican mindset, as was the concept of monotheism. Thus, Cervantes suggest that the early Spanish success in converting native peoples was actually the result of the Indian inclination to welcome a new, powerful diety into a pantheon of gods, rather than

a willingness to accept the Christian claims of the existence of only one God. Unable to comprehend the Indian concept of divinity, Franciscan missionaries were both puzzled and scandalized when they discovered so many Mesoamericans "regressing" into paganism by clandestinely sacrificing to their old deities.

Cervantes next turns to an examination of diabolism from the perspective of the educated European elite. After a brief overview through the thirteenth century of Christian beliefs concerning the devil, the author states that anti–Thomist tendencies in fourteenth–century Franciscan nominalism, which separated the concept of the natural from the supernatural (nature from grace), eventually led to new ideas about diabolism. These nominalist concepts, in turn, convinced frustrated Franciscan friars in New Spain that Indians who relapsed into paganism were actually devil worshippers.

Using archival evidence, Cervantes goes on to demonstrate that by the late sixteenth century, the Friars Minor of New Spain had become so convinced of the powers of the devil that they were not only claiming demonic possession of Indians, but even that some women were being involuntarily impregnated by Satan. Some friars became so obsessed with diabolical power that they convinced themselves that God was actually using the devil to do his will, to torture and possess people, thereby testing their faith. Thus, Satan actually became a pitiful actor in God's plan of salvation. God, in turn, was indirectly redefined as an omnipotent, capricious, sadistic tyrant, a depiction certainly unacceptable to traditional orthodoxy. Consequently, early modern notions of diabolical power, influenced by nominalism as well as by the conflict between Christianity and Mesoamerican religious belief, became so extreme that it was inevitable that they would collapse under their own weight.

This finally happened in the first half of the eighteenth century, when church officials and inquisitors were no longer willing to take Franciscan claims of diabolical horrors seriously. By the late 1700s, church writers like the Jesuit, Francisco Javier Clavigero, without denying Satanism, were treating the history of Mexico (New Spain) from a naturalistic viewpoint, rejecting diabolical intervention. Indian religion was now explained in naturalistic terms, which emphasized its cultural differences from European Christianity. This secular approach of these writers actually played down diabolism in order to retain a credible image of the devil in the new Age of Reason.

Cervantes's book is a valuable contribution to our understanding of early modern history. Both colonial Latin Americanists and medieval European historians should find it interesting. Nevertheless, it is arduous reading and Cervantes would have widened his readership had he translated Latin quotations such as that on pages 140–41 and taken the time to better familiarize his non–medievalist readers with basic introductory information on the lesser–known medieval political theorists he cites.

Edward T. Brett
La Roche College

Confronting Change, Challenging Tradition; Women in Latin American History. Edited by Gertrude M. Yeager. (Wilmington, Delaware: Scholarly Resources, 1994. 242 pp. Notes, $40.00 cloth, $14.95 paper.)

With this addition of the Jaguar Books series on Latin America History, Gertrude Yeager has compiled an excellent array of articles on Latin American women's history that would greatly contribute to any Latin American history course. The work includes articles on literary criticism, culture, law, labor, suffrage, and revolution. The contributors include Evelyn Stevens, Daphne Patai, Sylvia Arrom, and Donna Guy, to name but a few. Yeager also added documentary evidence in the forms of "Law No. 1263: The Revolution Protects Motherhood," Republic of Cuba; "A Typology of Poor Women," Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean; along with an interview of Indiana Acevedo, a Nicaraguan housewife and Christian–based community activist.

The greatest significance of Yeager's work lies in its historiographical importance. Essays by Mercedes Cabello de Carbonera and Teresa González de Fanning reveal the consciousness of Latin American women with regard to double standards in the conception of beauty and education. The essay by Lillian Estelle Fisher, first published in the *Hispanic American Historical Review* in 1942, discusses how the limits of post–Mexican Revolution liberal reform affected women. The articles by more contemporary historians exhibit the growth and diversity of Latin American women's history. In the second section, entitled "Reconstructing the Past," the contributors examine the history of women in Argentina, Chile, Columbia, Mexico, and Peru through various thematic lenses.

Yeager's work would serve any student of Latin America, yet there exists one shortcoming. Yeager did not include any historical essays by contemporary women's historians, writers, or cultural ciritics from Latin America. The incorporation of such works would have contributed to the study while introducing Latin American history students to Latin American scholars.

Elaine Carey
University of New Mexico

Neither Wolf Nor Dog: American Indians, Environment, and Agrarian Change. By David Rich Lewis. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994. xiii + 240 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, index. $29.95.)

David Rich Lewis has written an extraordinarily perceptive analysis of attempts of the United States government to force agriculture upon three nineteenth–century Native American tribes. The volume has seven chapters. The first examines agriculture, civilization, and American Indian policy. Following chapters contain paired examinations of Northern Ute, Hupa, and Papago peoples prior to and following government attempts to force Euro–American agriculture on communities.

Lewis's thoughtful summary of the policy of forced agriculture is especially useful for readers seeking to understand the labyrinth of United States–Indian relations during the past 150 years. As the author indicates, small farmers were idealized to the point of obsession in Anglo American society. Consequently, politicians, the press, religious leaders, and social reformers advocated small farms for American Indians.

The author examines Nuciu (Northern Utes) from a fresh perspective. Their experiences with the United States government has usually been examined from political, military, or ethnological viewpoints. This work adds a new dimension to their tale. Paired chapters on Natinook–wa (Hupa) and Tohono O'odham (Papago) examine important but lesser–known Indian peoples of California and Arizona. In each case, pressure to adapt to United States governmental expectations regarding agricultural forms had severe consequences. Lewis traces his subject communities from traditional through mid–twentieth–century circumstances.

His conclusion finds that structural problems hindered implementation of Euro–American styles of agriculture on western reservations. These included difficulties caused by a lack of consistency in critical areas such as those providing direction and resources. Lewis argues that government officials failed to understand and compensate for physical realities of western reservations, especially political ramifications of water scarcity.

Another problem was the government's failure to understand the various tribal interactions with mainstream American economics, both nationally and regionally. This created shifting economic fields where reservation isolation prevented capital development and produced increasingly marginalized communities. Failure of officials to consider culture and subsistence patterns resulted in misguided attempts to impose Euro–American cultural preferences in agriculture on Indians. Devaluing herding and other native preferences resulted in upsetting production patterns. Lewis also describes ways in which communites exercised choices in dealing with imposed programs. They adopted or modified those proposals that seemed most attractive to their circumstances.

Lewis's book is well–researched, documented, and nicely–written. It will be useful to students and scholars in a variety of disciplines surrounding western American history and Native American studies. I highly recommend the book.

D. C. Cole
Moorhead State University

They Called It Prairie Light: The Story of Chilocco Indian School. By K. Tsianina Lomawaima. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1994. xviii + 205 pp. Illustrations, maps, tables, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. $25.00.).

Recent decades have witnessed a flood of publications on American Indian schooling. Professor K. Tsianina Lomawaima's study joins works such as Robert A. Trennert, *The Phoenix Indian School*, and Sally Hyer, *One House, One Voice, One Heart: Native American Education At Santa Fe Indian School.* Increasingly, these accounts depend on former students' voices, and Lomawaima's volume accentuates this pattern. "I tell a story that belongs to the narrators" (p. xvi), she writes, and herein lies the strength of her book. The narrative is told largely through the words of more than fifty alumni, whose recollections retain a power that no synthesis can recapture.

When Chilocco's last class graduated in 1980, the northeastern Oklahoma school missed its centennial by four years. Like other federal schools opened during the1880s and 1890s, Chilocco emerged on the heels of Carlisle Indian School's success, but Chilocco was unique as the premier agricultural institution. *They Called*

It Prairie Light does not purport to be a general history of the school, since Lomawaima's interest in Chilocco is rooted in her father's experiences there in the 1920s and 1930s, where he engaged in what he called "an awful lot of scraps" (p. 156). These two decades remain the focus of the study.

Critical of historians who have "bent an ear to listen to Indian voices," but cannot discern a "pattern in the message" (p. xii), anthropologist Lomawaima attempts to provide this pattern through her interviews. She contends that student responses were influenced by age upon entering, their family backgrounds, and the historical moment of the school itself. Her most persuasive argument emerges in her assessment of female students, which might encourage inclusion of gender as another category of analysis. Lomawaima's contention that federal policymakers envisioned women as "matrons of allotment households...supporting their husbands in the difficult transition...to farmer" (pp. 86–87) recalls Eleazar Wheelock's eighteenth–century dream of enrolling Indian women in his Connecticut Indian school to assist Indian men "in the Business of their Mission."

Although Lomawaima emphasizes student solidarity, she also acknowledges strong differences, which sometimes reflected tribal roots. In this respect, her account reminds us of the wide variations among boarding schools. Although many of Chilocco's students were Cherokee, Choctaw, or Creek, these tribes did not dominate Chilocco's environment as did the Pueblos at Santa Fe Indian School. Chilocco's dividing line was more often one of full bloods versus mixed bloods.

The strongest message in Lomawaima's book lies in the vibrant memories of former students recalling their responses to a regime seeking to control both spirit and mind. Although she, too, has struggled to craft a conceptual framework for these responses, she has taken initial steps for others to follow.

Margaret Connell Szasz
University of New Mexico

The Court Martial of Lieutenant Henry Flipper. By Charles M. Robinson III. (El Paso: Texas Western Press, 1994. xvi + 130 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, $12.50 paper.)

In September 1881, at the frontier outpost of Fort Davis, Texas, Second Lieutenant Henry Ossain Flipper was brought before a court–martial and charged with embezzlement and acts unbecoming an officer. Flipper was dismissed from the service as a result. Courts–martial were not uncommon during this era and this one would have been relegated to insignificance had not Flipper been the only black officer in the United States Army. The issue that ensued from this trial, as is often the case in those involving great potential for prejudice, is a question of fairness. Charles Robinson clarifies some of the controversy, arguing that despite what many would assume, a black man did receive a fair court–martial in the overwhelmingly white world of military officers. Though acquitted of embezzlement due to lack of evidence, it was clear Flipper had violated the code of conduct for officers.

In reviewing the court–martial, Robinson concludes the Flipper was indeed treated fairly. Robinson raises the question of the punishment, however, finding that Flipper's dismissal was a penalty far out of proportion with his crime. For

imposing such an unjust punishment, the army, as an institution, allowed prejudicial attitudes to influence the level of punishment. Robinson supports this theory by highlighting how white officers found guilty of more serious crimes received less severe sentences. Relying heavily on the court records, Robinson successfully carries the reader through the court–martial, effectively dissecting the proceedings.

What works less well is placing the Flipper trial in the context of the period. In 1882, Jim Crowism and white sumpremacy were on the rise and blacks were often victims. A brief discussion of the social milieu of the frontier could have revealed much. While Robinson may not explore new material or interpretations, his dependence primarily upon court documents for his conclusions is a new methodology that serves as confirmation for previous works on the Flipper court–martial.

Captain Thomas F. Cornell
United States Military Academy

The Red Captain: The Life of Hugo O'Conor, Commandant Inspector of New Spain. By Mark Santiago. (Tucson: Arizona Historical Society, 1994. vii + 127 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $15.95 paper.)

In this useful monograph, Mark Santiago gathers together considerable information, some familiar and some hitherto unknown, concerning one of the eighteenth–century Borderland's most prominent figures, Hugo O'Conor. Santiago even avoids the frequent characterization that the Irish–born Spanish career officer was called the red captain by the Texas Indians because he was a redhead, leaving the probability that by Native American standards, O'Conor's ruddy complexion set him apart in a society where physical characteristics were often used to describe both friends and enemies.

Focus of the O'Conor biography concentrates first on his overseas experience beginning in Cuba in 1763, then on his career in Mexico City and Texas. The story peaks with O'Conor's appointment as Commandant Inspector of the Provincias Internas of northern New Spain. Attention is given to his rise in rank, the result of having connections in high places, particularly cousin Alejandro O'Reilly and their mutual friend Viceroy Antonio María Bucareli.

O'Conor was commissioned to implement new plans for a strong northern presidial line and for Indian control on both sides of that frontier. To this end, he devised a strategic plan for subduing various Apache and other Indian groups, a plan that was only partially successful. Lack of complete success resulted in part from insufficient manpower, limited cooperation from some of his subordinates, and faulty logistics.

Santiago argues that O'Conor's foreign birth was a great personal disadvantage that lost for him the rewards that he otherwise ought to have received for his efforts. A man who died at age forty–four as a brigadier general and a governor of Yucatan, however, could not have suffered from excessive prejudice.

Despite the book's merits, some all–too–evident weaknesses appear. Spanish spelling and accentuation leave much to be desired. Footnotes that cite three or more sources for the same statement, as if this gave it greater weight, more likely show

that although history does not repeat itself, historians do. An evidence of carelessness in footnoting is misspelling one basic source thirty–five times, a defect showing consistency but not care, as Rubio Mañé's name repeatedly becomes Rubio Manje.

Donald C. Cutter
Albuquerque, New Mexico

Tejanos and Texas Under the Mexican Flag, 1821–1836. By Andrés Tijerina. (College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 1994. xi + 172 pp. Illustrations, maps, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $29.50 cloth, $14.95 paper.)

The fifteen years that an independent Mexico governed Texas (1821–1836) have often been portrayed in terms of Anglo American colonization and Mexico City's increasingly tyrannical rule. In telling the stories of the Austin colony, the Alamo, and San Jacinto, the story of the other Texas settlers has been largely neglected. Although some scholarly work on the subject has appeared in the last quarter–century, nothing approaching a well–rounded survey of Tejano (Mexican Texan) history in this period has appeared. In this respect, Andrés Tijerina's book is a big step in the right direction.

The general subject of *Tejanos and Texas Under the Mexican Flag* is the identification of Tejano contributions to Texas during this crucial period of the state's history. According to Tijerina, Tejanos built on or modified Spanish colonial institutions to suit local needs and, in turn, transferred important elements of this frontier culture to arriving Anglo Americans; for instance, Texas land law, ranching culture, and nineteenth–century military organization. Moreover, because of their concern with the region's economic development, the Tejano elite fostered the development of Texas as a cotton–producing region.

Instead of developing close ties with the immigrants from the United States, however, Tejanos found themselves increasingly alienated: "As the 1840s progressed, Tejanos were either driven out, or their movement was restricted...Anglos flooded in and took the ranches, the livestock, and indeed the livelihood of the old Tejanos around Béxar, Goliad, and Nacogdoches" (p. 138). Tijerina ends on a positive note, however, asserting that although the number of Tejanos decreased in relation to the booming Anglo American population, their culture was adopted and disseminated by the newcomers throughout the American West.

This message—that American society in important ways and from an early date was indeed multicultural—would stand on more solid ground if the book did not contain some conspicuous problems. Tijerina does not take into account, for example, that Anglo–American settlers brought legal and political institutions with them from the Unites States that were similar to those that Mexicans adopted following independence from Spain. Tijerina does not consider that Mexicans might have been influenced by models of Anglo American institutions. Curiously, although the title implies a history through 1836, the author does not analyze Tejano participation in the revolt and war of independence. To a lesser degree, there are also a number of mistranslations and erroneous dates in the text. Lastly, the notes and bibliography indicate that Tijerina did not employ some of the recent literature in the field.

Tejanos and Texas Under the Mexican Flag is an important book that deserves serious attention despite its shortcomings. It makes the Texas Mexican population actors and not merely passive bystanders or victims of the social, political, and economic forces that eventually swept Texas into the Anglo American fold.

Jesús F. de la Teja
Southwest Texas State University

Indians and the American West in the Twentieth Century. By Donald L. Parman. (Bloomington: University of Indiana Press, 1994. xviii + 235 pp. Illustrations, map, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth, $12.95 paper.)

The twentieth century is finally receiving the attention of historians of the West and a recent offering by Donald Parman, *Indians and the American West in the Twentieth Century*, is an exceedingly useful survey of Indian activities during this period. Parman begins with the impact of the Dawes Act, which allotted many reservations and continues through the century until 1990, with the emergence of CERA in Montana, a right–wing group organized to attack Indian rights. Although sketchy in some places, Parman's book contains an amazing number of obscure facts about the various episodes of this century, and this attention to detail makes the book worthwhile reading.

In a volume packed with data, however, it is strange to see several important references omitted entirely. There is nothing, for example, dealing with the Newlands Act and subsequent Leavitt Act which had major implications for irrigation on Indian lands. The Committee of One Hundred, a prestigious investigation of the conditions of Indians during the 1920s, is not mentioned and this omission is curious since both the Senate Investigation of the Conditions of Indians and the three reports of the Brookings Institute certainly originated in the failure of the Committee of One Hundred's report to President Coolidge. The *Winters* case is mentioned, but not its companion *Winans*, which provided the basis for protecting Indian fishing rights during this century.

Most puzzling is Parman's seeming inability to understand the roots and sequence of the termination policy. The 1928 Klamath effort to withdraw from supervision by the Bureau of Indian Affairs is not discussed; failure of this effort embittered Wade Jackson, and in 1947 when Senator Watkins visited Klamath, Jackson made the withdrawal of the BIA a high priority. Several years later, the Hoover Commission, which again is not mentioned, recommended that Indians be turned over to the states, prompting Dillon Myer to begin the termination policy on his own initiative. How can Parman have missed these activities altogether?

Self–determination probably begins in 1916 when a bill to give Indians the right to select their own superintendents was offered in Congress. Thereafter, we find sporadic efforts by both Congress and the Indians to expand self–government. Not only are these efforts not mentioned, the Self–Determination Act of 1975 is barely cited, leaving the reader to conclude that it was a good idea that never was given legislative substance. Instead, far too much time is devoted to anti–Indian organizations that occasionally existed in the 1980s to prevent Indians from exercising fishing rights. Again, Impact Aid—PL 874 and PL 815—are not mentioned and these statutes provided immense opportunites for Indians in education.

This book, consequently, is curious. It has a great many facts that cannot be found elsewhere, but it lacks mention or discussion of some truly important developments in this century. It is a good book to read, but it must be supplemented with other books that cover some of its more woeful inadequacies.

Vine Deloria, Jr.
University of Colorado, Boulder

Colony and Empire: The Capitalist Transformation of the American West. By William Robbins. (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1994. xvi + 255 pp. Notes, index. $29.95.)

This is an ambitious book from one of the West's most prolific historians, in that Robbins seeks nothing less than a model to explain the causation of change (and power) in the West as a place. Though Robbins focuses on theWest as a place (emphasis on the northern West), he avoids the epistemological trap of place versus process via finding his theme in capitalism and "its revolutionary consequences."

Quickly he ticks off several sub–themes: "In essence, history written 'from the bottom up' is limited when it ignores larger constellations of power" (p. 8); the capitalist transformation of the West took place with dramatic swiftness; and the phenomenon of urbanism served as a conduit for the flow of capital from the East and from Europe. The federal government fostered this capitalistic transfigurement through military protection, subsidized transportation and mineral extraction, and emancipation of the free–wheeling capitalist from carrying the burden of social costs (in effect, Robbins has adopted the free rider approach). Finally, the economy of the West was hobbled by a dependence on an erratic transportation system, remoteness from markets, and an immature metropolitan development. Many of these factors placed the West in an untenable economic position vis–a–vis eastern and European modernization.

While Robbins finds the colonial concept of limited usefulness—"A more inclusive understanding of western America rests in the ability to grasp the full meaning of capitalism...." (p. 7)—he is unable to escape the atmosphere of colonialism, which he finds pervades the West up to 1945. With this interpretive mein, Robbins examines these theses in eight chapter essays—the Mexico–United States borderlands, the American–Canadian West, the West as an arena for investment, the individual entrepreneurial West as exemplified by the regional capitalist, Samuel T. Hauser (who, as Robbins notes, John Hakola removed from historical fog in his 1961 dissertation and Hauser's inventory notes), the colonial extractive nature of the northern West (which he finds generic to other extractive sub–regions of the West), a comparative view of South and West, and the interaction between metropolis and hinterland.

So where does this multifaceted examination of the American West leave the author and the reader? In a roundup paragraph, Robbins concludes that "To grasp the essence of the transformation of the American West during the last century and a half, therefore, one must look to the mainstays of material relations in the region..." (p. 189). Robbins shuns the Turnerian exceptionalism of the West, though this reviewer is more comfortable with Earl Pomeroy's succinct observation years ago that "This historian of the West has no obligation to demonstrate the uniqueness

of his region." Or, as another historian of the West put it a decade ago, "The West, then, remains, not the West of the past, but the West of the nation and the world." One applauds Robbins for his willingness (avoiding the Humpty–Dumpty syndrome) to subscribe to the thesis that a synthesis of the West will only be revealed with a comprehensive understanding of the parts before we try to model the whole. Allan Bogue has perceptively argued for this approach to western history, as has Donald Pisani more recently in his magisterial study of water in the West.

The summons to national identification is fraught with disharmony, however, as the "New West" historians have most recently illustrated. Historically, Americans have perceived centralization (especially by the bureaucracy) as tyrannical, and decentralization as the preservation of individual freedom. Today's West, along with the nation, wrestles with this economic and political tug–of–war.

In his opening remarks, Robbins warns his readers that this book is "largely derivative," a confession (if it is indeed that) that should not discomfit him as it has not embarrassed thousands of other authors. The more vexing question for those who peruse these pages is whether the author has taken us to the next interpretive level—a stratum to which so many aspire, so few attain, and so many feign discovery—with shouts of "eureka!" My suspicion is that regardless of future verdicts, *Colony and Empire* will be acknowledged (and perhaps unacknowledged) in footnote after footnote.

Gene M. Gressley
Laramie, Wyoming

Tata: A Voice from the Río Puerco. Edited by Nasario García. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1994. xxxii + 207 pp. Illustrations, map. $39.95 cloth, $19.95 paper.)

Nasario García's *Tata: A Voice from the Río Puerco* is a voice very much worth hearing. The main voice that emanates from these pages is the voice of the fathers, of *Los Viejitos*, and in particular the author's own father, Nasario P. García, born in 1912 in Rincón de Cochino in the Río Puerco Valley of northern New Mexico.

The book, however, is actually more a duet than a solo, and as much a balance of explanation and recitation as it is of exclusive aria. *Música de los padres y hijos del Norte* is perhaps a more apt accounting of the music heard here, songs and melodies wherein the son's voice of familial and regional love and respect is heard in counterpoint throughout, contributing to an even larger sense of community chorus.

The arrangement and orchestration is chronological and follows the life and times of the elder García by means of various anecdotes and tales, balanced with a series of introductory essays that head each chapter and spotlight the key phases of a father's, and inevitably, a son's mutually–influenced lives. As such, *Tata* (term of endearment for a father or grandfather) is a kind of community autobiography that transcends the individual, the local, and the parochial and the only ostensibly insignificant lives of a New Mexican family done in the sometimes soft, at other times raucous voicings and variations of interview, oral history, and story.

Much of the texture, timbre, and subject of the senior García's voice is transmitted through the idiomatic Spanish of the lives and landscapes found for three centuries in the shadow of the mythic two thousand–foot basaltic monolith known

as Cabezón Peak, and along the byways of such melodically sounding villages as Ojo del Padre, La Posta, Casa Salazar, and San Luis. Through the bilingual presentation of each narrative and anecdote, and by means of the accompanying glossaries of Río Puerco regional idioms, an authenticity at once archaic and transcendent flows through the book like the very geological and geographical river imminence of the at once flowing and sandy Río Puerco.

Here, in *Tata: A Voice from the Río Puerco*, Nasario P. García offers the reader a concert of much simple beauty and blood–kinship. It is a performance that does honor to the nobility of the Río Puerco's own seminal and splendid river muses as they inspire and shape the lives of a father, a son, and a very special part of a wonderously vibrant and culturally diverse New Mexico, a *tierra del alma* to all those who claim and champion its history and heritage.

Robert F. Gish
California Polytechnic State University

Bad Hand: A Biography of General Ranald S. Mackenzie. By Charles M. Robinson III. (Austin, Texas: State House Press, 1993. xviii + 392 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth, $17.95 paper.)

In a review of Michael Pierce's *The Most Promising Young Officer, A Life of Ranald Slidell Mackenzie* in the Fall 1994 *Nebraska History*, I noted the ironic simultaneous appearance of *two* Mackenzie biographies when, in the full century following his death, there had not been a first. I thought Pierce's effort was solid, though a bit lean. Robinson's *Bad Hand*, conversely, is heftier and for several reasons, the better book.

Ranald Mackenzie graduated from West Point in 1862 and saw ample Civil War service. His growing reputation blossomed on the Indian frontier where, in 1873, he led a daring if dangerous raid into Mexico chasing marauding Kickapoos and Lipan Apaches. He also commanded decisive attacks on Comanches, Southern Cheyennes, and Kiowas at Palo Duro Canyon, Texas, during the 1875 Red River War, and on Northern Cheyennes at the Red Fork of the Powder River, Wyoming, during the 1876 Great Sioux War. These and other battlefield successes were critical to the outcomes of their associated campaigns and solidified Mackenzie's reputation as one of the army's premier Indian fighters.

But as Charles Robinson observes as he closes this biography, these successes and the continual physical hardships of arduous field service were also Mackenzie's undoing. In 1884 at age forty–three, three months after having been committed to the Bloomingdale Asylum in New York City and seventeen months after earning his brigadier's stars, Mackenzie was declared insane.

Most latter–day historians, including Pierce, attribute Mackenzie's affliction to a syphilitic infection. Robinson develops the case that Mackenzie's insanity was more likely derived from post–traumatic stress disorder and dementia. The former, unheard of before the Vietnam War, is a progressive condition of estrangement, irritability, and sporadic and unpredicatable explosions of aggressive behavior, symptoms fully characterizing Mackenzie during his frontier years. This disorder typically derives from the wounds, stresses, and fatigue of unrelenting field service and combat, and again, this characterizes Mackenzie's life. Dementia, on the other hand,

could be caused by a venereal infection but so, too, could it derive from serious head injuries of the very sort Mackenzie suffered twice in his life. Robinson's arguments and conclusion are convincing. Either way, insanity was a tragic and ignoble end for an officer riding the crest of greatness.

Author Robinson commenced this biography hoping to humanize Mackenzie, and he succeeds. Though no body of personal papers survives, the author drew upon a wholesome array of general sources, including Mackenzie's official military files. Robinson's insights into Mackenzie's peer relationships are particularly interesting, and his depictions of Mackenzie's physical world are typically sound, though in one instance exceedingly overdrawn. Robinson apparently did not travel into Great Sioux War country, and thoroughly misrepresents the geography of the Dull Knife battle and Powder River campaign. That instance notwithstanding, Robinson fashions a convincing portrait of a hard–driven soldier leading a self–imposed austere life who suffered a pathetic end. This is the biography of Ranald Mackenzie to read and quote.

Paul L. Hedren
National Park Service

Primeras [Doctrinas] del Nuevo Mundo: Estudio histórico–teológico de las obras de fray Juan de Zumárraga (1548). By Fernando Gil. (Buenos Aires: Publicaciones de la Facultad de Teología de la Universidad Católica Argentina, 1993. ix + 750 pp. Appendixes, illustrations, bibliography, index, erratum).

La obra del padre Fernendo Gil es parte de la celebración de los quinientos años de presencia europea en América. Su trabajo parte de la asunción que este medio milenio de evangelización de los habitantes de este continente que tiene como uno de sus elementos fundacionales la obra de difusión de la fe cristiana de fray Juan de Zumárraga (n. 1468?; m. 1548), primer obispo de México. Gil no concede otra alternativa a esta conmemoración que la de la irradiación de la luz que significó para los americanos la palabra divina traída por los españoles. Al mismo tiempo, proclama la reafirmación de la fe entre los "conquistadores" al entrar en contacto con millones de seres hasta entonces alejados de "la religión." Por ello, el autor desecha por principio la noción de una leyenda negra y otra dorada en el proceso de dominio de las Américas: los promotores de las formas de organización temporal y espiritual provenían de una misma tradición cultural de la cual no pueden separarse cuando tratan de fijar en la sociedad dominada sus proyectos. Los lazos que unían a la Iglesia con el Estado eran más que una formalidad, significaban la inseparabilidad de ambos programas.

La primera sección de este estudio está conformada por una erudita presentación de Zumárraga como hombre producto de una sociedad católica en expansión. Basado en los primeros biógrafos del fraile vizcaíno, Gil lo enmarca dentro de la tradición teológica dominante en la Península Ibérica de la primera mitad del siglo XVI. En este sentido, Zumárraga fue producto de una corriente de pensamiento que trató de adaptarse a las condiciones planteadas por el descubrimiento de tierras y hombres hasta entonces no imaginados. Las reuniones de la jerarquía católica en la Nueva España mientras Zumárraga encabezaba la diócesis mexicana confirman la necesidad que tenían los evangelizadores de adaptar ese cúmulo de presupuestos teológicos a

la realidad de la naciente sociedad. En dichas Juntas, se ponían a discusión las formas de establecer el cristianismo entre los pueblos que entraban en us proceso de adaptación a una forma organizativa impuesta por los dirigentes de la conquista militar. Suavizar los métodos temporales de dominio significaba dejar espacio para la asimilación de la fe católica.

La última mitad del libro también es un ejemplo de la dedicación erudita del autor para entender la obra del primer obispo de México. Desde los puntos de vista teológico y pastoral, Fernando Gil presenta y examina las obras producidas en México durante la administración episcopal de Zumárraga. Una condición determinante para difundir el catolicismo en tierras novohispanas era la instalación de una imprenta a fin de evitar larga espera en tanto se mandaban publicar los instrumentos de pastoral hasta la metrópoli. Decisivo fue el papel del obispo para convencer a las autoridades hispanas de esta necesidad en el Nuevo Mundo. Fue de esta manera que la primera imprenta en América (ca. 1539) estuvo dedicada al tiraje de las primeras doctrinas, cartillas, catecismos, confesionarios, diccionarios, vocabularios y "artes de la lengua," todos utilizados como herramientas para la indoctrinación de los indios.

En cuanto a las obras del obispo Zumárraga, Gil realiza un estudio teológico, y de manera cronológica, de tres de ellas: la *Doctrina Breve* (1543–1544), la *Doctrina Cristiana* (1545–1546), incluyendo su *Suplemento* y la *Regla Cristiana Breve* (1547). Su estudio abarca desde las consideraciones teológicas, hasta las formas en que el autor utilizó para hacer de sus instrumentos una fuente efectiva del conocimiento de la fe.

En síntesis, las *Primeras [Doctrinas] del Nuevo Mundo* resulta una útil combinación del análisis histórico de la obra total de fray Juan de Zumárraga como obispo de México y un examen teológico de sus principales publicaciones utilizadas como materiales de la enseñanza de la fe católica.

Ricardo León–García
Universidad Autónoma de Ciudad Juárez

The Urban West: Managing Growth and Decline. By James B. Weatherby and Stephanie L. Witt. (Westport, Connecticut: Praeger, 1994. xii + 154 pp. Charts, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $49.95.)

This book is a study of the legal and economic limitations imposed on cities and their attempts to deliver adequate programs and services despite constraints during a decade (1978–1988) of rapid growth in the urban West. The authors (social scientists) touch upon thirty–four regional cities with populations of 100,000–200,000. They focus on a core group of ten cities including Tempe, Arizona; Modesto, California; Pueblo, Colorado; Boise, Idaho; Reno, Nevada; Salem and Eugene, Oregon; Salt Lake City, Utah; and Tacoma and Spokane, Washington.

Chapters contain valuable information and analysis about the impact state and federal governments, economic systems, and citizens' groups have had on the cities' growth and development. Limitations imposed by state and federal legislation, economic reality, or citizen initiatives have created problems for city officials in man-

aging issues such as infrastructure decline and growth mania. Declining federal aid, more state mandates, economic uncertainty, property tax revolts, and other negative influences encouraged many cities to engage in aggressive economic development policies, including public–private partnerships.

Especially informative are the various case studies the authors provide. The growth/quality of life pendulum in Boise, and the response of citizens to rampant growth in Modesto help explain why growth and growth management problems have been two of the most important issues in local government in recent years. Confronting the costs of infrastructures in Salem and planning for growth in Tempe are two case studies that illustrate that there is much a community can do for itself. The problem of rapid growth and limited local discretion exists, however, and it is clear in the Eugene and Reno case studies. Aggressive economic strategies and organizations are emphasized in the authors' case studies of Pueblo, Spokane, and Tacoma. Finally, Salt Lake City serves as an example of a city confronted with the task of managing both growth and decline.

Growth is probable, but it should be managed and challenged at every turn so that cities improve their present conditions and realize their positive visions of the future. Considering the obstacles, note the authors, the goals are formidable but not impossible. This book is an important contribution and should be read by those interested in the present and future history of the modern American urban West.

Bradford Luckingham
Arizona State University

Soul in the Stone: Cemetery Art From America's Heartland. By John Gary Brown. (Lawrence: University of Kansas Press, 1994. viii + 246 pp. Illustrations, bibliography. $39.95.)

In *Soul in the Stone*, John Gary Brown, a professional photographer, sets out to illustrate "the partnership between human expression and the institution known as the cemetery." Brown searched burial grounds in ten states in the central United States, photographing examples of cemetery art that reveal "artistic excellence or interesting concepts." The opening section of the book describes some of the cemeteries he visited and discusses topics such as motifs, symbolism, and epitaphs. Photographs of cemetery art, organized thematically into chapters on religious iconography, secular images, children, ethnic influences, a life well–lived, umbrella organizations, and ashes to ashes, make up most of the book (200 of its 250 pages).

Cultural geographers, anthropologists, art historians, historians of religion—all have found grist for their scholarly mills among the crosses and tombstones of American cemeteries. Brown's photographic quest, however, carried no such academic burden. Instead, he has presented a well–chosen and well–photographed collection of "extraordinary and entertaining examples of cemetery art."

Many of the tombstones are extraordinary indeed. Some reveal considerable artistic skill in the presentation of traditional themes and subject matter—lambs, trees, crosses, and angels. More individualistic tombstones convey in creative and original fashion a sense of the lives of those being commemorated. A granite sample

case, a life–sized statue of a golfer complete with a bag of golf clubs, a full–sized rolltop desk, the engine of a 1924 Chevy—such memorials resonate with a celebration of lives lived. Brown's photographs graphically evoke the diverse ways in which cemetery art can reflect both cultural values and individual lives.

The technical quality of the photographs is excellent as is their reproduction in this handsome book. Brown has created a fitting tribute to the artistic treasures in the cemeteries of heartland America.

Lynn Musslewhite
Cameron University

The Jumanos: Hunters and Traders of the South Plains. By Nancy Parrott Hickerson. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1994. xxviii + 270 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $40.00 cloth, $17.95 paper.)

The Jumanos Indians have made frequent appearances in Borderlands records, yet have remained elusive to contemporary historians and anthropologists. In her current work, Nancy Hickerson, associate professor of anthropology at Texas Tech University, attempts to flesh out the role and the identity of the Jumanos.

The first Europeans to encounter the Jumanos were apparently Alvar Nuñez Cabeza de Vaca and company, the survivors of the shipwrecked Panfilo de Narváez expedition. Over the next two hundred years, the Jumanos became important to both the Spanish and the French, as traders, guides, allies, and political leaders. The influence of the Jumanos waned quickly after 1700.

The territory of the Jumanos covered much of the Southwest and the southern plains, and the name may have been applied to people living in fertile river valleys and arid lands. The author believes that originally, the term was applied to Tanoan–speaking Indians who inhabited the southern plains, and later applied in a more narrow sense to these Indians who played a traditional role as traders.

Trading connections made the Jumanos useful as contacts and cultural brokers between first, Spanish colonists and later, French interlopers. It was the Jumanos, referred to as Teyas by Casteñada, who pointed out to Francisco Coronado the way to Quivira, thanks to their ability to communicate with the Tanoan–speaking guides of Coronado. During successive decades, the Jumanos played an important role in Spanish–native contacts in New Mexico and later in Texas.

In New Mexico, several Jumano villages apparently existed in the Salinas and Tompiro regions, and, like the Pueblos, were subject to missionary efforts. The Spanish relied on the Jumanos as intermediaries in their efforts to convert the Caddoans of Texas, and it was the Jumanos who inflamed Father Benavides's desires to establish a mission among the nomadic Indians by their story of the Lady in Blue.

Beginning in the middle of the seventeenth century, the Jumanos became the targets of increasing Apache attacks. The Pueblo Revolt and the appearance of the French on the southern plains further strained Spanish–Pueblo relations. With the inability of the Spanish government to give the Jumanos aid against their old enemies, the Apaches, and increasing presence of French traders among the Caddoans, the Jumanos were displaced as middlemen of Indian traders.

By the early eighteenth century, the New Mexican as well as the plains Jumanos began to abandon their Spanish connections, probably due to the death of Juan Sabeata, the most prominent Jumano leader. The tribe was slowly absorbed into the plains Apache and Caddoan/Wichita cultures.

The Jumanos serves as a useful addition to the literature of early Borderlands anthropology and history. The sources for the study are entirely documentary, and students of New Mexico history will find them, as well as many of the episodes and characters, familiar. This should not detract from placing the Jumanos in their proper important role as traders and culture brokers along the Spanish colonial frontier.

Hana Samek Norton
Albuquerque, New Mexico

Pueblos, Villages, Forts & Trails: A Guide to New Mexico's Past. By David Grant Noble. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1994. ix + 346 pp. Illustrations, maps, bibliography, index. $39.95 cloth, $19.95 paper.)

David Grant Noble's new book, *Pueblos, Villages, Forts & Trails*, subtitled *A Guide to New Mexico's Past*, is, strictly speaking, neither a guide book nor a history book., although it obviously contains elements of both. This ambiguity is evident in the book's organization. Each of its sections, "The Anasazi–Pueblo Past, " "New Mexican Towns," "Warfare in New Mexico," "Historical Trails," and "Other Historic Places" lists its sites not geographically or chronologically but alphabetically. This, however, is not a criticism but an observation.

In guiding the reader to a greater appreciation of New Mexico's diverse and extraordinary past, Noble introduces the first three sections with concise overviews that give a sense of the broad sweep of the state's history and even its pre–history. Here, as elsewhere throughout the book, cross–references suggest places where one might go to actually follow the footsteps of those who helped create that past.

The text is clear and generally accurate (although El Morro and Zuni are west, not east, of Acoma), both historically and geographically. The black–and–white photographs, many of them taken by Noble himself, are beautifully reproduced and add much to the text, as do many other illustrations and maps. The author's "travel tips" (what else there is to see in the vicinity) and "how to get there" information, obviously oriented to helping travelers find the place rather than telling about it, are clearly presented. Noble has also included one or two references following each entry that range from the classic to the contemporary. Unfortunately, he does not include any fictional works, which in some cases might also have been of interest.

While this book is not one for the first–time visitor or the casual passerby, it will be much appreciated by those who want to know "more than meets the eye" as they begin to explore New Mexico's wonderfully diverse cultural heritage.

Dorothy Parker
Eastern New Mexico University

Misiones Jesuitas en la Tarahumara: (Siglo XVIII). By Ricardo León García. (Cuidad Juárez, Mexico: Universidad Autonoma de Ciudad Juárez, 1992. 177 pp. Maps, tables, appendix, notes, bibliography.)

León's treatise on the eighteenth-century Tarahumara provides a no-nonsense historical summary of this persistent Indian group in northern Mexico. The organization of the book is classic inasmuch as the author describes the region's geography and environment, one of the most rugged in North America. His general description is followed by a specific commentary on the climate and distribution of plants, animals, and people in the 1700s. He sets the scene for historical interaction with a succinct but thorough presentation of the Tarahumara people, their customs, and tribal practices.

A section follows on the Society of Jesus with reference to their special evangelical spirit built on the directives of St. Ignatius. Although he correctly denotes northern New Spain during the times of Spanish invasion and Indian reaction as a war zone, León is fair in not vilifying either Spaniard or Indian but attempts to present the worldviews that were at variance. Spain had its policies, the Jesuits had their religious goals, and the Indians were confronted with the problem of accepting these cultural changes or not.

Concluding his generic statements about the missionaries and the Tarahumara, León opens a specific case study on the mission of La Purísima Concepción de Papigochi. It illustrates his thesis about the Indian response of violence to Spanish efforts to incorporate the rancherías into mission pueblos. The missions were highly productive and hence became competitors with the secular haciendas and squabbles arose between religious and laity over Indian labor—a story repeated in all mission sectors.

The last section is on life at a Tarahumara mission. In many ways, this is a mini-application of the methodology employed in the preceding chapters, looking at generalities and finally at specifics at Papigochi. León's conclusions are not earth-shattering, but they are generally fair. His constant referral to primary documents is both useful and illuminating, and his grasp of the Tarahumara in mid-eighteenth century is quite well-balanced. This is a fine example of solid regional history that will find its way into the repertoire of what is known about the rare Rarámuri.

Charles W. Polzer, S. J.
Arizona State Museum

Minorities in Phoenix: A Profile of Mexican American, Chinese American, and African American Communities, 1860–1992. By Bradford Luckingham. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1994. xiv + 258 pp. Maps, tables, notes, index. $35.00.)

Through his own work and that of his students, Bradford Luckingham has been largely responsible for securing Phoenix a prominent place on the historical map of the American West. In *The Urban Southwest* (1984) and *Phoenix* (1989) he examined the nation's ninth-largest city in escalating detail from its founding to the present. Now, drawing heavily on his previous research, he fleshes out his earlier treatments of three of the city's minorities: blacks, Mexican Americans, and Chinese Americans. But although *Minorities in Phoenix* will help make Phoenix residents more aware of their city's sorry history of discrimination against such a large part of its population, serious conceptual and organizational deficiencies undermine the book's broader usefulness.

Luckingham begins with a standard overview of the history of the three groups in the United States in general, and the West in particular, in which the book's primary theme clearly emerges. "Coming from every direction to Anglo-dominated early Phoenix, minority group members sought equity and opportunity. Over the years progress was made, but problems persisted. And problems remain" (p. 11). According to Luckingham, little about the western experience was unique; the treatment of these groups differed more in degree than in kind from that of their counterparts elsewhere. The heart of the book consists of three sections, each devoted to a different group and divided into the same three chronological and chronicle-like chapters, though with the Chinese section noticeably shorter: Community Development to 1930; Depression, War, and Peace, 1930–1960; Progress and Problems, 1960–1992. In a conclusion entitled "The Phoenix Experience," Luckingham distills his most significant factual information, again group by group, and with no additional analysis.

Luckingham deserves praise for noting that his ethnic groups helped shape their own destinies and that minority development was not simply the result of "white racism," although few of his sources are minority-generated. He also documents the divisions within each group, but tends to concentrate on the less successful among blacks and Mexicans and the more successful among the Chinese Americans. He thus misses an opportunity to fill an historical void by explaining how so many blacks and Mexicans managed to work themselves into the ranks of the middle class and why so many Asians failed to keep up with the more upwardly mobile members of America's newest "model minority."

But there are more serious problems as well. For example, Luckingham fails to explain why he chose these particular groups while omitting Native Americans who, for example, outnumber the city's Chinese population. More troubling is Luckingham's organizational structure which leads to needless repetition and minimizes opportunities for cross-group comparisons, although there is passing reference to potentially illuminating intergroup rivalries. It also serves to homogenize the experiences of the three groups by ignoring their different chronological watersheds and obscures aspects of the western or Phoenix experience that were truly unique. In short, although Luckingham did additional research and provides numerous details and capsule biographies not found in his first two books, western and urban historians familiar with that earlier work will encounter the same conclusions about the treatment of these groups, and those interested in ethnicity will find no conceptual breakthroughs.

Howard N. Rabinowitz
University of New Mexico

En Divina Luz: The Penitente Moradas of New Mexico. By Michael Wallis and Craig Varjabedian. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1994. xvii + 130 pp. Illustrations, bibliography. $39.95.)

In *En Divina Luz: The Penitente Moradas of New Mexico*, both author Michael Wallis and photographer Craig Varjabedian set out to capture the deep and intense relationship between penitentes, their moradas, and the earth from which they are given life. The penitente worship, practices, and rituals are connected by a mystical cord. The book then takes the analysis further through visual exhibition. The stunning photography demonstrates the beauty, remoteness, and isolation of these sacred houses of worship and ritual.

To Hispano New Mexicans, the moradas are as sacred as kivas are to the Pueblo peoples of this region. Both kiva and morada have been mistrusted and misunderstood through the various cycles of conquest that have attended New Mexico. Early nineteenth–century writers mistakenly described penitentes as belonging to a religious order rather than a male confraternity of devout laymen whose religious rituals sustained Catholicism and enriched it in lieu of the scarcity of priests in many remote Hispanic communities. Much was sensationalized by these early voyeurs who photographed a few mock crucifixions and then generalized their rituals and secrecy. A penitente lore evolved both among Anglos and Hispanos alike regarding their rituals and personal behaviors. During difficult times, moradas were forced underground, frowned upon by religious authorities as a result of this sensationalized view. There were other reasons, however, that caused a penitente to prefer anonimity. This is at the heart of being a penitente, and the issue this book critically misses.

Central to being a penitente is a deep sense of devotion, commitment, personal penance, and humility. As my friend Horacio Valdez, *santero* and penitente used to say, "every hermano must avoid *escandalo*, too much publicity. He must show through his example how to be humble." While credit must be given to both author and photographer for not revealing the locations of the photographed moradas, there is an overwhelming sense, to this reviewer, that the sense of humility and privacy so important to the hermanos has been trespassed upon. Granted, permission was acquired for photographing each structure, but I cannot help but feel a great sense of loss when I review each image. There is also the issue that no attempt seems to have been made to express the desires of other hermanos who would have preferred this book not be published at all. Hopefully, this book will help preserve abandoned moradas, but the other side of the blade is that it might just aid the curious and those of dubious desires to trespass upon the sacred.

Orlando Romero
Palace of the Governors

Old Spanish Trail, Santa Fé to Los Angeles: With Extracts from Contemporary Records and Including Diaries of Antonio Armijo and Orville Pratt. By LeRoy R. Hafen and Ann W. Hafen. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1993. ix + 375 pp. Illustrations, map, notes, appendix, index. $12.95 paper.)

Originally published in 1954, this book, now a classic history of the Old Spanish Trail, focuses on the Anglo American experience in the forging of various routes through New Mexico to the Great Basin and California. Inasmuch as the Hispanic trade with Utes between 1678 and 1850 are treated lightly, the narrative bears the earmarks of ethnocentrically–written history characteristic of the first half of the twentieth century in North America. The story line, however, weaves a fascinating account about a series of Indian trails that entered history's limelight with eighteenth–century Spanish efforts from New Mexico to establish a route to Alta California through Utah that culminated in the Anglo American westward movement. The uniqueness of the Hafens' work lies in the fact that it is the only book that covers the entire history of the many routes that came to be known as the Old Spanish Trail.

Given that the Hafens' book is the only scholarly work on the subject, it has withstood the test of time. Its scholarship, although dated (even in this second edition), is nevertheless a starting point for new research. Its thoroughness in narrating the Anglo American efforts on the Old Spanish Trail borders on a definitiveness that challenges the introduction of new material on the subject. Even so, additional materials will only reinforce or complement the Hafens' work, but the story line should remain the same. In other publications by the Hafens—some of them related to the Old Spanish Trail—the prolific authors left few stones unturned regarding their encyclopedic knowledge of mountain men and trappers.

This paperback edition contains an introduction by David J. Weber who aptly states the significance of both the Old Spanish Trail and the scholarly work rendered by the Hafens. Weber's comments point to one disturbing note that reflects a misunderstanding about what the Old Spanish Trail and its variant routes represent in their historical contexts. Weber states that "[A]lthough Spaniards did not blaze this trail or, indeed, travel directly between Santa Fe and Los Angeles, individual Spaniards did traverse parts of the lengthy route" (p. 11). The Old Spanish Trail had two salient themes in its historical denouement: The development of routes, some of which were actually blazed by Hispanics through western Colorado to Utah Lake and the Great Basin, and the development of routes that eventually connected New Mexico and California.

The knowledge explorers gained from California and New Mexico contributed to Antonio Armijo's route blazed in 1829 from Santa Fe to California. Armijo was accompanied by New Mexican guides who had been to the Great Basin and the Colorado River for trade as recently as the year prior to his expedition. The Great Basin trade from New Mexico, though largely illegal because Spanish militarists had prohibited New Mexicans from going to the Yuta country, was the object of many Hispanic expeditions that went there between 1711 and 1852. When the route to California was established following the Armijo expedition, Hispanics, along with Anglo Americans, used it to immigrate to Los Angeles. Thus, even though the Old Spanish Trail from New Mexico to California shares a history with New Mexican efforts to engage in the Great Basin trade, both concepts were born during the Spanish colonial period. In all probability, on the other hand, the route from Utah Lake to New Mexico was conceived by Utes who desired trade with the pueblos of

the Rio Grande and later with Hispanic settlements near there. In spite of this slight criticism, this work is recommended as a standard model for studies on prehistoric and historic trails such as the Old Spanish Trail and its variant routes that have contributed to our national story.

Joseph P. Sánchez
Spanish Colonial Research Center

Rock Art in New Mexico. By Polly Schaafsma. (Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, 1992. viii + 175 pp. Illustrations, maps, bibliography, index. $29.95 paper.)

A large part of New Mexico's allure is its past. The people who have come and gone over the centuries have left a record of their lives in the material remnants that constitute the archaeological record. And one of the most intriguing subjects of archaeological inquiry is rock art.

Since Polly Schaafsma's original 1972 publication of *Rock Art in New Mexico*, "an unprecedented interest in rock paintings and petroglyphs...has led to a virtual explosion of research and documentation in New Mexico" (p. 1). As a result, the Museum of New Mexico Press reissued *Rock Art* in 1992. In this latest rendition, Schaafsma has extensively rewritten much of the text and incorporated some of the latest research. She has also updated her bibliography and added sites, such as a section in chapter three that deals with Albuquerque's West Mesa.

Organized into five chapters, *Rock Art*'s first four take us from northwestern to southern New Mexico, back to the Upper Rio Grande, and finally to the eastern part of the state. All chapters contain dozens of black–and–white photographs and detailed descriptions of each region's iconographic patterns. One of the most effective aspects of her analysis is the attention she gives to the distinctions and similarities between distant and more recent past. For example, chapter one describes pre–1300 A.D. Anasazi rock art and later Navajo contributions; chapter two takes the reader from prehistoric styles such as Mogollon red to historic techniques used by Apache groups; and chapter five focuses exclusively on Hispanic rock inscriptions. Schaafsma's last four pages discuss a few archaeological hoaxes and call for further investigations in spite of the difficulties inherent in accurately dating and definitively interpreting rock art.

Overall, Shaafsma has outdone herself with her text revisions and amended bibliography. Should there be a third edition, though, perhaps she could include a short section of color plates. A warning for those who lack an archaeological background: this is not a tour guide. The language includes technical terms and descriptions geared toward graduate students and above. It is a good book for a field school, but not a weekend excursion. Nevertheless, this edition of *Rock Art in New Mexico* is a solid, detailed, and scholarly analysis of an exciting archaeological subfield.

Evelyn A. Schlatter
University of New Mexico

Coal Town: The Life and Times of Dawson, New Mexico. By Toby Smith. (Santa Fe, New Mexico: Ancient City Press, 1993. 133 pp. Illustrations, maps, bibliography. $27.95 cloth, $15.95 paper.)

Journalist and western writer Toby Smith has found another worthy, regional topic: Dawson, New Mexico. As the first general study about this former coal mining community, *Coal Town: The Lift and Times of Dawson, New Mexico* provides a brief but comprehensive account of its rich past. The author hopes to put Dawson, a ghost town today, back on the state map.

Located in northeastern New Mexico and own by the Phelps Dodge Corporation, Dawson was once the largest coal–producing camp in the Southwest. It grew from an idyllic cattle ranch to a bustling town of thirty square miles and 6,000 residents. During its existence between 1899 and 1950, Dawson yielded over 33 million tons of coal for the nation's industry and served as an economic center for the region. Of 200 such contemporary company towns in the American West, Dawson was also the most culturally diverse community. With different ethnic and cultural backgrounds, people from America, Latin America, Europe and Asia labored and lived together harmoniously. Such a pleasant atmosphere of race relations turned Dawson into a model company town in the twentieth–-century West.

Focusing on social and cultural activities, *Coal Town* has done a fine job in recapturing the daily life of people in Dawson. Each of the nine chapters deal with a specific topic, from education to sports. Smith's adroit use of primary resources, including more than 100 interviews, supplies his work with not only the necessary facts but enlightening anecdotes. A journalistic writing style makes the story especially appealing. In addition, over fifty historic photos complement the narrative by offering distinctive visual images.

As a fair piece of local, popular history, *Coal Town* aims at general readers instead of trained scholars. A scrupulous historian wishes to know more about the role of Dawson in a larger historical context. An analysis of census data and other statistics is also crucial for such a community study. Yet, this book should receive attention from mining and labor historians who want to further explore the subject.

Liping Zhu
Albuquerque, New Mexico

BACK ISSUE SALE
New Mexico Historical Review

Published quarterly in January, April, July, and October, *NMHR* is offering all in-stock back issues at $6.00 each (regularly $7.00 each), plus postage if mailed. Comprehensive indexes are $6.00 each instead of $7.50. One-bound volumes (all four issues are in one bound volume) are $20.00. Annual subscriptions are $26.00 for individuals, and $36.00 for institutions.

Year	Volume	Issues Available	Year	Volume	Issues Available	Year	Volume	Issues Available
1926	1+	#1*,2*,3*,4*	1952	27	#1,2,3,4	1977	52	#2,3,4
1927	2+	#1*,2*,3*,4*	1953	28	#1,3,4	1978	53	#2*
1928	3	#1*	1954	29	#1	1979	54	#1*,3,4
1929	4	#1*	1955	30	#3*	1980	55	#2,3*,4
1930	5	#4*	1956	31	#2*,3*	1981	56	#1*,3,4
1931	6+	#1*,2*,3*,4*	1957	32	#1,2*,4	1982	57	#2,3,4
1932	7	#3*	1958	33	#1,2,3,4	1983	58	#1,2,3,4
1933	8	#3*,4*	1959	34	#1,2,3,4	1984	59	#1,2,3,4
1934	9	#2*	1960	35	#3,4	1985	60	#1,2,3,4
1935	10	#1*,2*	1961	36	#3,4	1986	61	#1,2,3,4
1936	11	#1*,3,4	1962	37	#1,2,3,4	1987	62	#1,2,3,4
1937	12	#1,2,3,4	1963	38	#1,2,4	1988	63	#1,2,3,4
1938	13	#1,2,3,4	1964	39	#1,2,3	1989	64	#1,2,3,4
1939	14	#1,2,3,4	1965	40	#1,2,4	1990	65	#1,2,3,4
1940	15	#1,2,3,4	1966	41	#2,3,4	1991	66	#1,2,3,4
1941	16	#2*,3*,4*	1967	42	#1,2,4	1992	67	#1,2,3,4
1942	17	#1*,3*	1968	43	#2,3	1993	68	#1,2,3,4
1943	18	#1*	1969	44	#3,4	1994	69	#1,2,3,4
1944	19	#4*	1970	45	#1,4	1995	70	#1,2,3,4
1946	21+	#1*,2*,3*,4*	1971	46	#12,,3,4	1926–40		Index #1
1947	22+	#1*,2*,3*,4*	1972	47	#1,3,4	1941–56		Index #2
1948	23+	#1*,2*,3*,4*	1973	48	#1,2,3,4	1956–70		Index #3
1949	24	#2	1974	49	#1,3,4	1971–85		Index #4
1950	25	#4	1975	50	#1,2,3,4			
1951	26	#1,3	1976	51	#1,2,3,4			

Limited time only. Availability subject to change. * indicates reprint edition + indicates one-bound volume

To order, call or write: *New Mexico Historical Review*
1013 Mesa Vista Hall
University of New Mexico
Albuquerque, NM 87131–1186
(505) 277–5839

BOOK NOTES

Al Sieber: Chief of Scouts. By Dan L. Thrapp. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1995. xii + 432 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. $17.95 paper.) Reprint of 1964 edition.

Kit Carson Days, 1809–1868, 2 Volumes. By Edwin L. Sabin. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1995. xiv + 996 pp. Illustrations, notes, appendixes, bibliography, index. $32.00 paper.) Reprint of 1935 edition.

Covered Wagon Women: Diaries and Letters from the Western Trails, 1840–1849. Edited by Kenneth L. Holmes. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1995. 280 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, index. $12.00 paper.) Reprint of 1983 edition.

Comanche Vocabulary: Trilingual Edition. Edited by Daniel J. Gelo. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1995. xxvii + 76 pp. Illustrations, bibliography. $25.00 cloth, $10.95 paper.)

A Bibliographical Guide to the Study of Western American Literature. Edited by Richard W. Etulain and N. Jill Howard. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1995. xii + 471 pp. Illustration, index. $39.95.) Expanded and updated version of 1982 edition.

Fallen Guidon: The Saga of Confederate General Jo Shelby's March to Mexico. By Edwin Adams David. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1995. xi + 173 pp. Illustrations, maps, bibliography. $27.50 cloth, $14.95 paper.) Reprint of 1962 edition.

Majestic Journey: Coronado's Inland Empire. By Stewart L. Udall. (Santa Fe: Musuem of New Mexico Press, 1995. x + 166 pp. Illustrations, maps, tables, index. $19.95 paper.) Reprint of 1987 edition.

Phoenix: The History of a Southwestern Metropolis. By Bradford Luckingham. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1995. xi + 316 pp. Illustrations, maps, charts, tables, notes, index. $12.95 paper.) Reprint of 1989 edition.

Generations and Other True Stories. By Bryan Wooley. (El Paso: Texas Western Press, 1995. 295 pp. $25.00.)

The Island of California: A History of the Myth. By Dora Beale Polk. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1995. 400 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $15.00 paper.) Reprint of 1991 edition.

The Gift of the Sacred Pipe. By Vera Louise Drysdale. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1995. xii + 106 pp. Illustrations, index. $29.95 paper.)

Bravos of the West. By John Myers Myers. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1995. 467 pp. Maps, appendixes, bibliography. $15.00 paper.) Reprint of 1962 edition.

Celsa's World: Conversations with a Mexican Peasant Woman. By Thomas C. Tirado. (Tempe: Center for Latin American Studies, Arizona State University, 1991. 121 pp. Notes. $11.00 paper.)

William Tecumseh Sherman and the Settlement of the West. By Robert G. Athearn. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1995. xix + 371 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $17.95 paper.)

Along Ancient Trails: The Mallet Expedition of 1739. By Donald J. Blakeslee. (Niwot: University of Colorado Press, 1995. xviii + 291 pp. Illustrations, maps, appendixes, bibliography. $39.95.)

Explorations in American History, Occasional Papers no. 8. Edited by Sandra Varney MacMahon and Louis Tanner. (Albuquerque: Center for the American West, Department of History, University of New Mexico. 1995. 227 pp. Notes. $10.00 paper.)

A Guide to the Carl Albert Center: Congressional Archives. By Judy Day, Danny Goble, Todd Kosmerick, and Janice Mathews. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1995. 113 pp. Illustrations, index. $5.00 paper.)

Dunes and Dreams: A History of White Sands National Monument. By Michael Welsh. (Santa Fe, New Mexico: Intermountain Cultural Resource Center, 1995. 213 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index.)