New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 67 | Number 1 Article 7

1-1-1992

# Book Reviews

# Book Reviews

*Conquest of the Sierra: Spaniards and Indians in Colonial Oaxaca.* By John K. Chance. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1989. xvii + 233 pp. Maps, tables, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. $34.50.)

Although the isolated Villa Alta district of northeastern Oaxaca was in some respects peripheral to Spanish interests, John Chance underscores the great variety of regional differences to be found in colonial New Spain and the importance of ethnohistory in understanding the complexities of Mexican history. Indeed, the diversity of institutions and approaches evident in the history of the Sierra Zapoteca illustrates the need for similar comprehensive archival research into the internal political, social, and economic development over time of other Mexican regions and districts. The Sierra Zapoteca presented the sixteenth-century Spanish conquerors with a confusing ethnic mix of Zapotecs, Chinantecs, and Mixes who resisted the invasions and the proselytization of Dominican friars. Although common themes may be found for the sixteenth to the eighteenth centuries on which to draw comparisons with other Mexican regions, the history of Villa Alta did not fit into any broad stereotypes. Geography prevented the introduction of haciendas, mining played a relatively minor role, and Spanish settlers remained a distinct minority dependent upon the indigenous population for their livelihood. The Indians retained possession of their lands, and even at the end of the Colonial period, none of these communities was Spanish-speaking. Their culture, while blended by centuries of contact with Spanish civilization, retained much from the past.

Despite the isolation of Villa Alta, the Spanish *alcaldes mayores*, and later subdelegates who governed the district, monopolized trade in high quality cochineal dyestuff and cotton cloth to make this administrative office one of the most lucrative income generators of New Spain. Even with population decline caused by conquest, epidemic diseases, and the congregation of villages, the *repartimiento de efectos* harnessed the Indians into a system of forced production and consumption. Often foreign to the region and interested primarily in personal profits, these officials experienced grave difficulties in comprehending the complexities of Indian society. They reinforced the Indian nobility that in some instances totaled a third or even half of the village populations, leaving limited numbers to undertake community tasks. As a result disputes between the elite and common elements led to appeals to higher jurisdictions and occasionally to rebellions. Although Dominican spiritual con-

trol ended in the early eighteenth century with the secularization of the *doctrinas*, Chance characterizes the rule of the clergy as controlled violence.

As the author is fully aware, the real challenge for the ethnohistorian is to find ways to study Indian society through the Spanish documentation. If the Spanish officials did not understand the Indians, their written documents may be questioned, and there is always a danger of drawing conclusions from one-dimensional evidence. To his credit, Chance made an exhaustive effort to tap a variety of archival materials and to ask the right questions. His excellent study will leave readers to wonder about any remaining generalizations concerning the Mexican Colonial period.

Christon I. Archer
*University of Calgary*

*Mapping Texas and the Gulf Coast: The Contributions of Saint-Denis, Oliván, and Le Maire*. By Jack Jackson, Robert S. Weddle, and Winston DeVille (College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 1990. xi + 92 pp. Maps, notes, bibliography, index. $29.50.)

The Texas Coast, scene of French incursions and Spanish reactions, was a hard area to map. Tidal estuaries made maritime approach difficult while land expeditions were hampered by numerous parallel streams, the final outlets of which were not very evident.

The three men treated in this book are contrasts in personality and background. Louis Juchereau de Saint-Denis was a Canadian-born Indian trader and frontier officer; Juan de Oliván Rebolledo was a career bureaucrat based in the viceregal capital of Mexico City where he was an *oidor* of the administrative court; and Father François La Maire was a secular priest involved in parish duties in French Louisiana. None could have been expected to make significant contributions to regional cartography. Saint-Denis was an exemplary frontiersman, but his geographical knowledge was based on actual travel along the coast and was given mostly orally. Oliván had an armchair interest in Texas geography, with his rudimentary maps containing vestiges of earlier imaginary geography. Although he was later named governor of Texas, he never set foot in the area. La Maire, a mediocre priest, was a good, careful cartographer. His maps were well executed, based on firsthand experience. The authors point out that priest's considerable contribution to the more famous "mother map" of the Gulf Coast by Guillaume Delisle. They also show that though France and Spain were natural rivals and perennial enemies, the Texas and Gulf Coast brought about cartographic cooperation leading to better mutual knowledge.

Concerning Texas it is clear that by 1717 most Texas rivers except the Brazos had already received their permanent names, even though their courses and outlets were imprecise.

The book, though extremely brief, is well presented with seventeen reproductions of pertinent maps. A much clearer version of Oliván's map of December 1717 could have been obtained from the Spanish Servicio Cartográfico Militar, which holds an 1806 copy of the earlier, fainter map. The authors

also leave unclarified the matter of whether Oliván wrote two reports (*Informes*), one on December 18, 1717, as indicated on the maps, and another on December 24 as they assume.

Donald C. Cutter
*Albuquerque, New Mexico*

*Maya Resistance to Spanish Rule: Time and History on a Colonial Frontier.* By Grant D. Jones. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1989. xvii + 365 pp. Maps, tables, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. $39.50 cloth.)

This study is a history of relations between Mayas and Spaniards in the sparsely populated and little-known southeastern frontier of Yucatan, from the time of conquest until the Spanish occupation of the island town of Tah Itza in the Peten in 1697. The territory covered consists of three Maya provinces in what is now the northern half of Belize, the northeastern quarter of the Peten, and southeastern portions of Quintana Roo, all of which were encompassed by the colonial province of Bacalar. Based on extensive research in the Archivo General de Indias in Seville, the narrative deals mainly with previously known events, but contributes a wealth of detail and an interpretive framework that greatly enhance our understanding of them.

As the title suggests, the emphasis is on Maya resistance and the failure of the Spanish church and state to impose their collective will on the region, which served as a haven for refugees from the more heavily colonized towns of the north. After initial chapters on the conquest, the Spanish *villa* of Salamanca de Bacalar, and Maya political economy, the heart of the book analyzes a series of anti-Spanish activities orchestrated by Maya religious-political leaders. Especially important were resistance movements at the Maya town of Tipu in 1638, which ultimately led to the collapse of Spanish control for the next several decades. Even the 1697 "conquest" of Tah Itza was only a hollow Spanish victory, for most inhabitants fled into the forest before the troops arrived.

Jones shows that, despite its failures, Spanish colonial policy in this region never changed. Every punishment of the recalcitrant Maya only strengthened their will to resist. The argument that the timing of resistance movements was governed by the katun cycles of the Maya calendar is, however, still open to debate. Jones makes much of a rough correlation between events at Tipu and the katun cycle of 7,200 days, yet his detailed account suggests that internal Maya politics (and perhaps Spanish tactics as well) was just as important in determining the flow of history.

While puzzles remain, this finely crafted book is a major contribution to Yucatecan ethnohistory. Essential reading for those who seek to understand the southeastern frontier, it will serve as a definitive reference for years to come.

John K. Chance
*Arizona State University*

*San Gabriel del Yungue: As Seen by an Archaeologist.* By Florence Hawley Ellis. (Santa Fe: Sunstone Press, 1989. 96 pp. Illustrations, map, charts, bibliography, index. $10.95 paper.)

It is fortunate that Florence Hawley Ellis and the Museum of Anthropology at Ghost Ranch have produced this monograph now. The National Park Service is preparing a study of possible alternatives to commemorate Spanish colonization in New Mexico, and the council of San Juan Pueblo has expressed an interest in the study. Since they will evaluate suggested Park Service alternatives with a view toward including San Juan and San Gabriel in possible presentations of the Pueblo Indians' view of Spanish colonization, Ellis' discussion of her discoveries at San Gabriel could not have been more opportune.

The book is a short, entertaining introduction to Ellis' work at San Gabriel and is the second in a series on the excavations. The first was *When Cultures Meet: Remembering San Gabriel del Yungue Oweenge* (Santa Fe: Sunstone Press, 1987). There, Ellis presented a summary of her fieldwork at San Gabriel, but the present monograph discusses the excavations and their results in more detail, at a popular level rather than as a formal report. Perhaps future volumes will offer a full technical presentation of the results of the project.

The principal topic of discussion in *San Gabriel del Yungue* is the area of the church, the probable convento, and adjacent Spanish-rebuilt rooms. The first section gives a brief but detailed discussion of the principal historical references to Spanish occupation of the site. The second section summarizes archaeological work on the site and its slow recognition as the location of San Gabriel. The third and fourth sections briefly state the results of excavating the west mound and a portion of the east mound north of the *convento* area. The second half of the book is devoted to a moderately detailed discussion of what was found in the area of the "Spanish Apartments," convento, and church. This information is unique and very welcome. The volume ends with a short but effective bibliography and index.

Unfortunately, the popular orientation of the narrative leaves a number of questions unanswered. For example, it is impossible to tell how much of the pueblo Ellis excavated. The narrative suggests that most of the structures were uncovered, but a comparison of the aerial photograph on pages 32–33 with today's site indicates otherwise. Ellis' excavations appear to have uncovered only a portion of the several mounds making up the pueblo. Perhaps three-quarters of the east mound, forming an inverted L-shape, remains untouched on Herman Agoyo's property. The western mound presently is capped by a much expanded version of Nick Salazar's house. Ellis excavated no more than the northern third of the mound; the middle third has been largely destroyed by the excavation of a garage space beneath the house, but the southern third may still preserve undisturbed structures. Although Ellis indicates that she considered a possible south mound to have disappeared, the shape of the ground suggests that such a mound may survive along the south side of the central plaza, south of the present entrance road and just west of where Ellis found the walls of the church. No testing was conducted in the area of this possible south mound. Questions about the extent of Ellis' work could have been avoided with a set of plans of the pueblo and the rooms she excavated.

Perhaps because of the concentration on the "Spanish Apartments" area, however, the book includes no such aids. Only plans of the southeastern rooms are included, and one of these is so small as to be almost useless. This lack of usable plans makes it very difficult to follow the discussions; in fact, in a footnote in the discussion of the rooms of the western mound, Ellis herself remarks, "Following our discussion of the history of rooms and occupations by the three cultural groups involved does require reference to our maps." One hopes this oversight will be corrected in the next volume.

This little monograph is of great importance to those interested in the methods and remains of Spanish colonization and should not be overlooked. Its shortcomings undoubtedly will be made up for in the next publication in the series.

James E. Ivey
*National Park Service*
*Santa Fe*

*California in 1792: A Spanish Naval Visit.* By Donald C. Cutter. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1990. xv + 176 pp. Illustrations, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $24.95.)

Donald Cutter, author of *Malaspina in California* and authority on Spanish explorations on the Northwest and California coasts, now brings to light the visit of the two schooners *Sutil* and *Mexicana* to California in 1792. Commanded by Captains Cayetano Valdés and Dionisio Alcalá Galeano, these vessels completed their primary mission to circumnavigate and chart Vancouver Island as a follow-up to the earlier Malaspina voyage. From late August to late November 1792, they and their crew of thirty-nine called at Monterey and ran the coastline southward from Nootka Sound en route to San Blas, Nayarit.

The author divides this work into two parts. The first section of ninety-nine pages is Cutter's introduction and chapters describing California in the early 1790s, the personnel of the expedition and those encountered during the vessels' "secondary stop," and the homeward voyage after getting under way from Monterey. Part two is the first translation of a manuscript found at the Museo Naval in Madrid, Spain. Classified as "Vargas Ponce" and MS 1060, it was probably written by artist José Cardero, who accompanied the expedition.

Historians and anthropologists will be especially interested in this book, largely because of its fresh topic and primary source nature. The author of the manuscript, now translated and annotated by Cutter, advances observations on the port, fauna, and presidio of Monterey, as well as the mission of San Carlos de Borromeo. Of special interest are the comments concerning the presidio; the Franciscans and their work at Misión Carmelo, especially Father Fermín Francisco de Lasuén; and the descriptions of the Runsien (Rumsen) and Esselen (Eslen) Indians residing at the mission. In addition to descriptions of dwellings, education, and customs of these little-known and soon thereafter extinct tribal groups, there is also an excellent columnar dictionary of their languages with equivalent terms in Spanish and English. This table, the catechism from Mission San Carlos, and Father Lasuén's mission status report

with full translation into English are of great value as references for historians, anthropologists, linguists, and those interested in the real work of the Catholic Church in California.

Supplemented by footnotes, twenty-three illustrations (eighteen of which are maps or drawings by or ascribed to José Cardero), and a classified bibliography, this work is Volume 71 in the *American Exploration and Travel Series.* There are no observations concerning Spanish civil communities or settlers simply because the visitors did not encounter them. Nevertheless, this work is of great value to a wide variety of scholars if read objectively, both as a primary source on Spanish California and for Cutter's expertise and craft in placing the manuscript in the perspective of its time and place.

Oakah L. Jones
*Purdue University*

*Manuel Alvarez, 1794–1856: A Southwestern Biography.* By Thomas E. Chávez. (Niwot: University Press of Colorado, 1990. 243 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $24.95.)

This book is a revised version of the author's 1980 University of New Mexico dissertation. He uses a vast number of primary materials, mostly manuscripts in numerous archives, to delineate the long life of a man fortuitously situated in the geography and history of his time. Manuel Alvarez had a knack for being there when anything happened, be it the Mexican Revolution of 1821, the Chimayó Rebellion of 1837, the U.S. takeover and Taos Rebellion of 1846–47, or the French Revolution of 1848.

Born in a small village of the Kingdom of León, Alvarez acquired and maintained a good education by wide reading. He moved to New Spain in 1818 on the eve of its independence. Possibly because he was a peninsular, he was expelled in 1823, so he traveled to Santa Fe by way of Cuba, New York, and St. Louis. Expelled again in 1829, he turned trapper, helped discover the spectacular Yellowstone geysers, and returned to New Mexico a few years later.

This time around, he was savvy enough to work both—or maybe all three—sides of the citizenship street. Spain was still very much his native land; he was enough of a Mexican citizen to receive a land grant near Ocaté; he was the United States consul in Santa Fe. Although never accredited by Mexico City, Santa Fe, or Washington, he functioned effectively, mostly because of his common sense. But during the Texas invasion of 1841, when he needed great courage to protect U.S. interests from the fear, anger, and triumph of the moment, he came through beautifully.

We follow the author and his subject as they thread their way expertly through the minefields of politics from 1848 to 1856, a hazy period of shifting coalitions and personal opportunism. For several weeks after an election that turned out to be invalid, Alvarez appeared to be the lieutenant-governor of a new state government, and he exercised power as acting governor in Henry Connelly's sustained absenced, doing at least as well as many later governors of New Mexico who shall remain nameless here and forever after. One secret

of Alvarez' ability to get things done was his endless array of business contacts that turned into friendships because he was a candid and pleasant person whom everybody liked and trusted. Chávez makes more sense of this antebellum era than any other author I have read.

On the other hand, the index leaves very much to be desired, and there are some truly ugly typos (check the spine). More important by far, the publisher ought to have provided much stronger and surer editorial guidance for a dissertation rewrite since it is nearly impossible for the original author, unaided, to re-vision the subject clearly enough to revise it into a book.

But when all is said and done, *Manuel Alvarez: A Southwestern Biography* is exactly the sort of book about New Mexico we need: a complete study of one person, one place, one brief period, or one limited topic, decidedly deeper than it is broad and firmly set in the context of past scholarship. Chávez gives his reader an absorbing guided tour of the exotic landscape of New Mexico from 1820 to 1850, when the expansionist Jacksonianism of the bumptious United States collided with the new *caudillismo* of liberated Mexico. Through this world of shifting opportunities and shifty opportunists moves a fascinating man of great practical intelligence, intellectual attainments of the more ornamental sort, and a great personal dignity: "a worthy, honest man," Manuel Alvarez. You'll like him.

Thomas J. Steele, S.J.
*Regis University*

*The "Californios" versus Jedediah Smith 1826–1827: A New Cache of Documents.* By David J. Weber. (Spokane: Arthur H. Clark, 1990. 82 pp. Map, appendixes, index. $35.00.)

On August 16, 1826, Jedediah Smith led a small group of trappers westward from Cache Valley on a three-year odyssey of discovery and exploration through the Great Basin and the Sierra Nevada, to California, Oregon, and back by way of the Northern Rockies. Much of Smith's party perished in two devastating defeats inflicted by Mojave and Umpqua Indians. Smith also provoked the suspicion of Mexican officials in California. In Oregon, his expedition might have ended, without the prudently dispensed benevolence of an equally skeptical Hudson's Bay Company.

David Weber's *The "Californios" versus Jedediah Smith* provides seven previously unknown documents from the Mexican Archives that clarify Smith's motives for traveling to California and the response of Mexican officials to his presence there. These documents include Weber's transcription of four letters written by Jedediah Smith and his clerk, Harrison Rogers, to California Governor José María Echeandia, former California Governor Captain Luis Antonio Arguello, and Joel Poinsett, United States Minister to Mexico. Weber also furnishes transcriptions and translations of three letters written by Arguello and Echeandia to one another and to Rogers and Smith. Weber shows that Smith grazed the truth with Echeandia by pleading his inability to comply with the governor's instructions to leave California by the end of 1826. For two years thereafter, Smith's party taxed official Mexican patience by scouring the San

Joaquin Valley for beaver, horses, and signs of the elusive Rio Buenaventura. Frustration with Smith is evident in the letters of Luis Arguello, who harbored concern about American intrusions on the northern frontier, the attendant unauthorized exploitation of Mexican resources, and the unsettling American presence among California's Indians. Weber argues that Smith hardly could have acted in ignorance of these concerns.

The editor has surrounded these documents with fully developed historical, bibliographical, and editorial background essays and textual footnotes. This volume also includes a detailed map of Smith's southwestern travels and a thorough index. In short, this is old school, erudite historical editing in the tradition of Thwaites, Morgan, and Jackson—a phenomenon rarely seen among contemporary productions of the three large western presses.

This volume continues David Weber's reexamination of nineteenth-century Borderlands history from the Mexican point of view. In that light, *The "Californios" versus Jedediah Smith* is a useful supplement to Dale Morgan's *Jedediah Smith* and the Smith diaries edited and published by George Brooks and Maurice Sullivan.

Tim Wehrkamp
*National Archives and Records Administration*

*Soldiers of Misfortune: The Somervell and Mier Expeditions.* By Sam W. Haynes. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1990. xii + 268 pp. Illustrations, map, notes, bibliography, index. $24.95.)

In *Soldiers of Misfortune,* Waddy Thompson, United States minister to Mexico, writes an aged Andrew Jackson that Antonio López de Santa Anna was "a man of talents and many noble qualities" who could not be judged "with reference to the state of things in our own happy country." This appraisal of the often demonized Mexican dictator is in stark contrast to much of the heretofore scholarship on the Mier Expedition. Sam W. Haynes implies that the Texans who died at the Hacienda del Salado in the famous "black bean" episode in 1843 probably got what they deserved and concludes that General Pedro de Ampudia would have been well within his authority to execute even more of the escapees.

A number of the Texans who fled into the arid and waterless northern Mexican mountains only to drink the blood from their stolen horses and mules and consume their own urine had only recently been released from confinement as a result of the equally disastrous and ill-conceived Santa Fe Expedition. All veterans of this previous expedition were in violation of the terms of their paroles.

Besides the ruthless and unforgiving Colonel Antonio Canales and the equally merciless General Nicolas Bravo, most of the Mexican leaders who emerge in *Soldiers of Misfortune* are presented as far from the villains we have read about in previous works on the Mier Expedition. General Francisco Mejia, for example, rather than execute the Salado escapees, resigned from the army.

With the exception of Ewen Cameron, the tall, red-headed Scotsman who was singled out for execution, and José Antonio Navarro, signatory of the

Texas Declaration of Independence, the Texas prisoners were treated as well as was possible and probably better than they had reason to expect. In fact the Mier prisoners fared far better than Santa Anna had after San Jacinto when the general had attempted suicide. General Ampudia went as far as to enroll fourteen-year-old John Christopher Columbus Hill, the youngest of the Mier prisoners, as Juan Cristoph Colón Gil de Ampudia in a Matamoros school. Santa Anna even offered to adopt the boy, who later became a mining engineer in Mexico.

Haynes is at his best when describing the political battle between the always pragmatic Sam Houston and the pompous Thomas Jefferson Green. The different escapes of the Texans from the lice-infested and typhus-plagued fortress of Perote will also keep the reader's attention. Haynes' keen analysis of the diplomacy that culminated in the release of the Mier prisoners is also exemplary.

Although the mist-shrouded Cofre de Perote is certainly not "granite-crowned" (p. 136), such minor *errata* are rare. *Soldiers of Misfortune* is a well-written, meticulously researched, enlightening piece of scholarship with objective new insights. Simply put, *Soldiers of Misfortune* is the most absorbing book yet written on the often-romanticized, yet tragically fated, Somervell and Mier expeditions. Haynes is articulate, detailed, and accurate. He has written a scintillating book that reads like a novel.

Jerry Thompson
*Laredo State University*

*Soldaderas in the Mexican Military: Myth and History.* By Elizabeth Salas. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1990. xiii + 163 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. $25.00 cloth, $11.95 paper.)

Elizabeth Salas writes to refute the widely shared myth that the *soldadera* was simply a camp follower, with all its negative connotations, by arguing that these Mexican women have historically played *active* roles in Mexico's many military affairs. Salas uses military data, anthropological studies, as well as valuable oral histories to establish the historical role of the soldaderas. She also seeks to delve more deeply into the soldadera image through exploring the public consciousness of the myth by reviewing its treatment in Mexican literature, corridos, recent art, and films. Moreover, she considers specifically the function of the soldaderas in Chicano culture and art. By way of organization, Salas devotes a chapter to exposing the origins of the soldadera in Meso-American and Spanish armies. She then adds a chapter that considers the role of the soldadera as an active participant in the service of numerous armies engaged in military operations throughout Mexico's history. Sensing that the Mexican revolutions might have contributed mightily to the perpetuation of the "Adelita" (self-abnegating camp follower) myth, Salas devotes three chapters to the activities of the soldadera during this decade-long affray. She concludes with two chapters dedicated to the role of the arts and popular culture in forging the soldadera legacy.

This monograph, essentially Salas' doctoral dissertation, defines the role

of the fighting soldier broadly to include quartermaster and commissary functions to make her case for the soldadera as warrior. Although this interpretation challenges to a modest degree the camp-follower-as-prostitute image, her extensive reliance upon anecdotal evidence to establish the role of the soldadera as active combatant, a "Juana Gallo" (fearless, outspoken, female soldier), makes such claims less than convincing. The evidence is disparate and the generalizations a bit hasty. Therefore, the perpetuation of the unfavorable soldadera image in literature and the arts should not prove entirely surprising, for it remains less than obvious that such an impression is largely contrary to the historical experience. But this work, nonetheless, provides a valuable look at gender and image-making in Mexican culture. As a compilation of information on the role and status of women in wartime Mexico, moreover, Salas' book makes a significant contribution to women's studies.

William E. Gibbs
*New Mexico Military Institute*

*Padre Martinez: New Perspectives from Taos.* (Taos, New Mexico: Millicent Rogers Museum, 1988. 151 pp. Maps, notes. $9.95 paper.)

Anyone who doubts the power of fiction to influence readers' opinions would do well to read this book, for its avowed purpose is to repair the damage done to the reputation of Padre Antonio José Martinez by writer Willa Cather, *"Esa mujer!,"* as one of the padre's relatives contemptuously called her. In *Death Comes for the Archbishop* (1927) Cather villifies Martinez' character, distorts his physical characteristics, and generally misrepresents his stature and his times—all the while using the padre's real name and presenting enough history to make the account seem credible. The result, as editor E. A. Mares explains, is that the many Americans who use Cather's novel as an introduction to the culture and history of the Southwest are exposed to "serious misinformation" with "widespread currency" (p. 9).

*Padre Martinez* consists of the editor's introduction and five essays. The three historical studies are by people well known for their work on Padre Martinez, whereas the two literary studies are by people not as well known for their work on Cather. As Mares notes in his introduction, although differences of opinion exist among the contributors, they generally ascribe to the same defensive view from different perspectives. Mares relates the padre's biography and places Martinez in historical context, emphasizing, among other things, his liberalism and his ecumenical attitude and actions; Bette Weidman demonstrates that *Archbishop* can be read, ironically, as "a novel of acceptance and reconciliation" (p. 48), though in the process she offers some strained comparisons of *Archbishop* with *The Merchant of Venice, Huckleberry Finn,* and *Uncle Tom's Cabin;* Thomas J. Steele, S.J., with slightly amused detachment, presents a fascinating collection of Jesuit commentaries on Martinez, material that readers would be hard pressed to find on their own; Patricia Smith, in probably the best essay, argues convincingly that Cather wrote *Archbishop* according to a Homeric formula, producing "an American reworking of the *Odyssey*" (p. 118); and Ray John de Aragon offers a rambling account of church

history as it relates to the padre (sometimes quite remotely) and illustrates the regard in which his people held him.

Although important and useful, this book contains problems that will lessen its effectiveness and its value. It needed heavier editing, not only in correcting dates, punctuation, and forms of documentation, but also in the elimination of repetition and the addition of cross-referencing among the essays.

Another problem is a lack of balance. Sometimes, especially in the Aragon and Weidman essays, the tone is overly defensive and statements erroneous or ill-advised. Aragon, for instance, mistakenly asserts that Cather won the Pulitzer Prize for *Archbishop*, and Weidman makes the astonishing suggestion that future editions of the novel should bear a warning label that Cather's point of view is only one of many. Not discussed are Cather's praise for the early Spanish missionaries, her fictional Bishop Latour who is more sensitive to local culture than was the real-life Bishop Lamy, or the other historical errors in *Archbishop* that do not involve Martinez. (Happily Cather scholars have responded quite favorably to the concerns this book raises.)

The most serious problem, however, is bibliographical. Fifteen years ago Ralph Vigil published in this journal a detailed discussion of Cather's misrepresentation of Martinez, yet his essay escapes the notice of all five contributors. Likewise, references to Cather scholarship are minimal. A thorough bibliographical essay would have been a useful addition, to illustrate the widespread acceptance of Cather's portrait of Martinez and to direct readers to other pertinent historical studies omitted here.

These problems notwithstanding, this book is essential reading for anyone interested in Padre Martinez or Willa Cather, not because the volume completes the record but because it makes a valiant effort to correct it. As Mares himself says, "The last word [on Padre Martinez] has certainly not been written" (p. 14).

David Harrell
*University of New Mexico*

*Straight from the Heart: Portraits of Traditional Hispanic Musicians.* By Jack Parsons and Jim Sagel. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1990. xv + 93 pp. Illustrations. $19.95 paper.)

No New Mexico author, in recent times, has contributed more than Jim Sagel to the enhancement and preservation of traditional Hispanic culture in New Mexico. In *Straight from the Heart: Portraits of Traditional Hispanic Musicians*, Sagel has teamed up with photographer Jack Parsons to capture an important and often overlooked aspect of New Mexican culture—*los músicos del pueblo* (the musicians of the people).

Sagel, who is sensitive to historical geography as well, focuses his narrative on Nuevo Mexico and Viejo Colorado, ignoring the arbitrary state boundary that separates a common people. "Nowhere," he writes, "has the landscape played a more crucial role in determining history and shaping the culture of a people."

Here, in their natural environment, is where photographer Jack Parsons

captured "los músicos." The authors write: "In the places where they live and work, in the places that define them, pausing for a photograph in front of owner-built lumber mills in the heart of the sierra, beside Ford Fairlanes parked in the projects, on couches under velvet paintings of the Last Supper, flanked by family photos of graduating daughters and sad-eyed sons in military uniforms."

"Hard work and self-reliance are at the core of this culture," Sagel laments. But no matter how resourceful an individual might be, it took a strong sense of community to survive and *la comunidad de fe* developed in the souls of the people. And with this sense of community came respect and a passion for life. "Passion has always been at the heart of Hispanic tradition," Sagel explains. And no one understands this feeling better than the musicians.

"Todo esta cambiado," the musicians will tell you, and they are correct. "Everything has changed—everything, that is, except for their own spirit, that rare and beautiful stubbornness that keeps them clinging to the old ways and singing the old songs." But it is their destiny, los musicos believe, to preserve the heritage of their people.

All aspects of the culture are covered. The songs speak of the villains of history such as Thomas Catron and his pack of *"abogados ladrones,"* of "el Oso Esmokey" and his cattle guards and barbed wire, and of the Army Corps of Engineers who dammed the water for golf courses in Albuquerque. But they also sing of love and romance, of good times and bad times, of people and places, and *memorias de antes.* Many músicos specialize in the old-time fandangos that are popular at weddings and anniversaries where the dancing lasts until dawn. Others have composed corridos that contain contemporary themes such as the state prison riot and the Tierra Amarilla Courthouse raid.

In all, more than fifty musicians are represented in this remarkable book. They include well-known names such as Roberto Mondragón, Lorenzo and Roberto Martínez, Carmen Araiza, Cipriano Vigil, Max and Antonia Apodaca, and Archie and Maria Garduño. Others, who are less known but equally talented, include Ventura Rael, Enrique Jara, Clarence Sena, Tony Sánchez, Margaret Saavedra, and Edulia Romero. Many of the lyrics from their songs are included in the text.

Like many aspects of traditional Hispanic culture, the musical heritage of this land is in danger of being lost. Every time a family hires a rock band to play for a wedding or an anniversary, another page closes on a rich book of tradition. That is its vulnerability and its value. And because tradition can easily vanish, one hopes that the music will instead survive.

Michael Miller
*Center for Southwest Research*
*University of New Mexico*

*A History of Hispanic Theater in the United States: Origins to 1940.* By Nicolás Kanellos. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1990. xvi + 240 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. $38.00 cloth, $15.95 paper.)

This book traces professional Spanish-language theater in the United States before World War II, especially as manifested in Los Angeles, San Antonio,

Tampa, and New York. Chapters analyze each city's theatrical culture, especially between 1890 and 1930, treating the repertories and fates of major theater houses and such special topics as Los Angeles' successful local playwrights, San Antonio's fostering of circus and *carpa* (tent theater), and Tampa's abortive Hispanic project launched by the Depression-era Federal Theatre Project.

During the past decade, Nicolás Kanellos has been the most productive scholar of Hispanic American theater as editor, publisher, curator, and author of essays (*Mexican American Theater: Legacy and Reality*). The present volume incorporates and expands his earlier research into a subject that, as he says, is "an underground or forgotten tradition, a forgotten part of our national history and culture."

The book's strength lies in Kanellos' mining of archives and newspaper files. Onto his pages tumble a mass of names, titles, places, and dates, sometimes twenty and thirty play titles per paragraph, as Kanellos details the theaters' daily and weekly operations. Playwrights, clowns, classical actresses, theater owners, company managers—all crowd forward asking for our understanding and recognition. At its best, as in parts of the chapter on Los Angeles, the book shows urban Hispanic theater as a teeming, busy hive of trendlets and burning issues and popular performers.

The book's limitations are serious. Kanellos treats much of his material hastily and higgledy-piggledy. He does not describe his theaters visually or tell where they were located. He devotes only a few paragraphs to the cultural lives of the cities he studies. He provides almost no literary perspective, summarizing or analyzing a handful of plays and remaining virtually silent on the Mexican, Cuban, or Spanish traditions imported to North American soil. Partly because of his scant resources and partly by temperament, he hardly ever evokes the reality or aesthetic of the theatrical moment during those thousands of nights on which professional entertainers made contact with a public.

Finally Kanellos' title is a curse, for his scope is distinctly limited in time, place, and style. For example, readers interested in New Mexico will note that Kanellos devotes a page and a half to New Mexico and that he consciously ignores folk, liturgical, and amateur theaters, which have dominated Hispanic American and New Mexico culture since Oñate's 1598 expedition, when the first plays of any kind were written and performed on North American soil.

But for reasons that Kanellos states eloquently, a book with this title and subject is badly needed. When it is written, his volume will be seen to have contributed mightily to it.

David Richard Jones
*University of New Mexico*

*The Lost Gold Mine of Juan Mondragón: A Legend from New Mexico Performed by Melaquías Romero.* Edited by Charles L. Briggs and Julián Josué Vigil. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1990. xxiv + 270 pp. Illustrations, maps, table, appendixes, notes, index. $45.00.)

In the shadow of the craggy Truchas Peaks of northern New Mexico, a humble shepherd named Juan Mondragón stumbles upon a concealed mine

shaft into which one of his animals has fallen. Although he discovers a fabulous deposit of gold, his true wealth remains his goodness and virtue. In one telling episode, he vainly tries to give a sack of nuggets to his heartless foreman who is unable to recognize either the gold or the significance of the gift. In the summer of 1890, the shepherd tragically dies before he can reveal the exact location of his mine. If it could only be found again, it could provide a living for us all.

Whenever Melaquías Romero recounts the story of the lost mine of Juan Mondragón, instead of simply reciting a fixed text or manipulating an omniscient narrator, this loquacious elder of the village of Córdova, New Mexico, invokes the heteroglossia that surrounds him. He orchestrates a diverse compendium of testimonial voices, chronologies, and extended genealogies in a narrative counterpoint whose structure unfolds as it is told each time, in dialogic relation to the active listener. Linguist Charles L. Briggs dedicates this generous volume to the prodigious task of fully contextualizing a two-and-a-half-hour performance of what he considers to be Romero's *magnum opus*.

With the help of Julián Josué Vigil, a meticulous but easy to follow transcription and translation style is devised that tracks intonation, breath, gesture, and expression—every semantic and rhetorical nuance in the construction of one of the most engaging and complex genres of folk narrative.

Wavering between chronicle and parable, treasure tales dramatize the search for wealth while they illuminate the values of the teller. Briggs clearly demonstrates how "Treasure tales can similarly articulate basic cultural values, conveying a moral and philosophical vision of the world and one's relationship to it" (p. vii). In the popular imagination, gold is never merely gold, but an ambiguous signifier of both the ideal and the venal. In the oral tradition, treasure tales take their place somewhere between historical legend and accounts of the miraculous.

Unable to base credibility on religious faith as in a miracle story, the teller of a treasure tale carefully cultivates belief with the most powerful rhetorical devices of his speech community. Here Romero masterfully traces the reported speech of eyewitnesses across an entire century, further verifying his sources through the genealogical relationships among the participants and persuasively establishing both the authenticity of content and the authority of the teller.

The techniques of ethnopoetic analysis that Briggs is the first to apply to Spanish-language folklore were first developed to restore Native American texts to their full rhetorical power after collectors stripped and abstracted them from their original contexts and their own historicity. With this work Briggs calls again for theoretical studies of a rich popular tradition that has been well collected in New Mexico, but rarely analyzed in depth. He argues convincingly that Melaquías Romero "goes beyond *describing* what has happened; his performance rather explores the power of narrative as a means of *constructing* social reality" (p. 168). This book is a true feast for linguist, folklorist, ethnohistorian, and treasure hunter alike.

Enrique R. Lamadrid
*University of New Mexico*

*The Mythical Pueblo Rights Doctrine: Water Administration in Hispanic New Mexico.* By Daniel Tyler. (El Paso: University of Texas at El Paso, 1990. 57 pp. Illustrations, notes. $12.00.)

The West, explained Walter Prescott Webb, is a dry place. Aridity has shaped western history, and nowhere in the region is water more scarce or more important than in the Southwest, where courts seem to be choked with water cases. Historical circumstances complicate the litigation of southwestern water rights because Spanish and Mexican law and custom furnished precedents for American courts to consider.

Professor Daniel Tyler tells us that the legal situation is in some cases needlessly complex because courts have misinterpreted Hispanic water law by postulating a doctrine of pueblo rights, which in this case refers to Hispanic towns rather than exclusively to Pueblo Indians. The pueblo rights doctrine, as Professor Iris Engstrand explains in her introduction, evolved in nineteenth-century litigation based on a faulty understanding of Spanish law and inadequate historical research. Courts held that pueblos founded on the basis of colonization grants have a prior and paramount right to water in adjacent nonnavigable streams. Tyler explains in his compact, ably researched book that the historical record in New Mexico does not reveal such a right under Spanish or Mexican law. Moreover, he reconstructs the administrative and juridical practices that did exist. The administration of water in New Mexico was a local matter. Generally, officials endeavored to maintain and distribute equitably an adequate and clean supply of water, settle disputes, and encourage settlement. The town's water was freely available to all who needed it as long as their use did not prejudice other residents. Naturally, each town had a water right, but the evidence does not indicate that it was viewed as paramount to that of other users.

Obviously, this is a book for specialists: students of Spanish colonial administration, water historians, and public historians who provide expert witness testimony will be most interested in it. After reading it, historians should be reluctant to assert blandly that cities like Los Angeles and Albuquerque have preeminent rights to the waters of their region based on Spanish colonial precedents. It will be interesting to see if courts take judicial notice of Tyler's research. It will be still more interesting to see how those courts will handle long-established water rights that have been based in part on what Tyler calls the mythical pueblo rights doctrine.

Albert L. Hurtado
*Arizona State University*

*The Preservation of the Village: New Mexico's Hispanics and the New Deal.* By Suzanne Forrest. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1989. xvii + 253 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $35.00 cloth, $17.50 paper.)

The belief that northern New Mexico's villagers did not suffer during the Depression because they were subsistence farmers has persisted until the present. In truth the villages were social units that had ceased to be self-sufficient

at least since the turn of the present century. By the 1930s they represented a pre-industrial society taking its first steps into the world of wage labor and mechanization, and subsequently the Depression hit the villages as hard or harder than it hit other areas. In this well-researched and well-written book the author traces New Deal attempts to cope with this catastrophe.

In the early chapters the author relates the history of the area, chronicling the events that led to the conditions of the Depression era. Of particular importance were the 1920s that set the stage for the philosophy of the New Deal's social engineering. During this period a movement in the United States venerated "primitive" societies as those that had not been seduced by industrial age values. New Mexico's villages fit into this category, so romantics, such as Mary Austin and Frank Applegate, came into New Mexico thinking that the villages could be returned to their original state of subsistence units. The well-meaning and good faith efforts by these people are chronicled here. However, with the onslaught of the Depression, reality came home; "Arcadia" was not what it was assumed to be—the villagers were poor and in need of drastic economic help.

Next, numerous New Deal programs (so many that it is difficult to keep them and their functions straight) are discussed. These programs set about initiating experimental schools and rural health programs, reviving native crafts, and even attempting to buy back land grants for use by the communities for grazing and farming. The insurmountable problems faced in the implementation of these programs are adequately detailed. For example, agents of change, coming from other parts of the country, misunderstood the culture with which they were working. Also, some programs were unrealistic and never had a chance for success. In turn, the villagers were never given control of these programs and were suspicious of signing any document for fear that they would lose their lands as their ancestors had.

In the final chapter the author gives the balance sheet of the New Deal efforts. On the plus side they brought needed amenities to the villages, such as better roads, electricity, and water systems. However, for the individual villager, the New Deal programs, especially the "make work" ones such as the WPA, only averted starvation.

The author gives a sensitive but dispassionate account. She avoids the minefields of sentimentality and the patronizing of New Mexico's villagers. Yet errors in mismatched footnotes and incorrect map references are evident. These do not detract from the quality of the book, however. Still, it is unfortunate that this work was unavailable before the recent War on Poverty began. It might have helped to avert some mistakes made during the New Deal.

Adrian Bustamante
*Santa Fe Community College*

*Mexican Labor and World War II: Braceros in the Pacific Northwest, 1942–1947.* By Erasmo Gamboa. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1990. xiv + 178 pp. Illustrations, map, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $25.00.)

Erasmo Gamboa's *Mexican Labor and World War II: Braceros in the Pacific Northwest, 1942–1947* describes the use of Mexican nationals to provide agri-

cultural labor in Washington, Oregon, and Idaho during and shortly after World War II. The short study—131 pages of text—examines the acute shortage of farm workers in the Northwest in 1942, the development of the bracero program, life among the braceros, the greed of the farmers who drove the program, and the end of the bracero program in the Northwest in 1947.

The shortage of workers in the United States and unemployment in Mexico led to the creation of the Bracero Program in 1942. A year later more than 45,000 Mexican citizens were working in the Northwest. The critical positions in the management of the bracero program were those of the local County Extension Agent and a committee of local farmers. The closest official representing the braceros in the Northwest was the Mexican Consul in Salt Lake City. Local employers quickly learned that they could set wages low and the braceros had little means of protest. Food was often poor quality, on the job safety was abysmal, medical care was inadequate, and liability for accidents was mercurial. Moreover, businesses in many communities, especially in Idaho, barred Mexican workers. Changes in regulations effectively ended the program in the Northwest in 1947. The story Gamboa tells is a grim one that contradicts the rosy picture of the program that U.S. government and employers painted and the democratic vision for which the nation was at war.

The principal sources for Gamboa's study are records in the National Archives, papers of national leaders concerned with Chicano issues, and local newspaper accounts of the bracero program. Gamboa lists no primary sources from the Mexican government nor from the organizations such as the Farm Bureau whose members employed braceros. He notes thirteen interviews with Mexicans or Mexican Americans in his bibliography, but rarely cites them. The braceros' voices are most notably absent in the chapter on bracero social life. Instead, we learn about their social life from the reports of U.S. officials to Washington, D.C. Still, Gamboa makes the tantalizing observation that many braceros voluntarily returned to the Northwest as immigrants after World War II. Had Gamboa explored why these braceros went back to a region where people had treated them so shabbily, he would have tied the bracero program more closely to the larger Mexican-American experience in the Northwest.

Gamboa deserves our applause for exploring an unknown chapter in northwestern history, and we await more of the history of the Chicano community in the region. Without minimizing Gamboa's research and accomplishments here, we should expect a more aggressive effort to utilize the collective memories of the participants as historians look further into this development.

Merwin R. Swanson
*Idaho State University*

*Of Earth and Timbers Made: New Mexico Architecture.* By Bainbridge Bunting. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1990. vii + 85 pp. Illustrations. $17.50 paper.)

Since the first publication of this classic work in 1974, awareness and appreciation of New Mexico's vernacular architecture have grown considerably: a statewide inventory of historic buildings has been undertaken; crumbling

adobe churches are now being stabilized through a well-organized volunteer effort; and other writers have continued to explore the architectural themes laid out in this volume. *Of Earth and Timbers Made* must be credited with generating at least a portion of this heightened interest in New Mexican architecture and the impulse to preserve it.

The book works on a variety of levels. One could have a very satisfying experience looking only at Arthur Lazar's evocative photographs. Each segment of Bainbridge Bunting's text (divided into short essays accompanying each visual image) is concise and self-contained; the reader can browse through them selectively or can follow the narrative thread running throughout. Photographs and text illuminate each other, but each could stand alone. Together they manage to present rather sophisticated architectural concepts in a disarmingly simple and understandable way.

Style was not the object in New Mexico's early architecture, which was created out of the need for shelter and survival in a sometimes hostile environment by builders with limited resources. Still, the influence of multiple cultures over the centuries resulted in a product functional and aesthetically pleasing. Native Americans developed the prototypical New Mexico dwelling with earth walls and flat wooden roof. Spanish colonists contributed the technology to create sun-dried adobe bricks; their metal tools allowed greater use of timber in construction. Through the influence of Yankee settlers, pitched roofs and Greek Revival ornamentation began to appear on Territorial adobe buildings. The resulting synthesis, explored in *Of Earth and Timbers Made*, is uniquely New Mexican.

Throughout the volume, architectural expression is found in everything from grand ranch houses to simple grave markers in Lazar's photographs, which capture also the fragility of their subjects. Unfortunately the ravages of time and weather have undoubtedly continued to take their toll on some of the structures pictured here. As Bunting noted in his introduction to the book, "the history of the early New Mexican dwelling, if it is ever written, will have to be illustrated with photographs taken by an earlier generation."

Susan Berry
*Silver City Museum*

*Mexican and Central American Population and U.S. Immigration Policy.* Edited by Frank D. Bean, Jurgen Schmandt, and Sidney Weintraub. (Austin: University of Texas Press/Center for Mexican American Studies, 1989. 211 pp. Maps, charts, tables, appendix, notes, bibliography. $20.95 cloth, $10.95 paper.)

Since the early 1960s the quantity and character of immigrants to the United States have changed significantly. Newcomers from Mexico and Central American countries increasingly have become more numerous and visible in the immigrant stream. Concrete and controversial modifications of U.S. immigration legislation have also occurred, especially in the 1980s. Accompanying these changes has been growing awareness of the relationship between U.S. immigration policy and U.S. domestic and international population policy. This anthology addresses key issues inherent in these developments.

The book consists of seven chapters, the first six of which are papers presented at a symposium on Mexican and Central American population issues in October 1987. The seventh is a report and policy recommendations the participants in the symposium compiled. The chapters were written by experts drawn from a variety of disciplines and institutions.

The first four chapters document and analyze demographic conditions, trends, and prospects in specific countries or a region. Chapter 5 examines the major components of the Immigration Reform and Control Act of 1986 its implementation, and its implications for the Southwest. Chapter 6 examines the economic, cultural, and political implications of Mexican demographic developments for the United States, relevant Mexican and U.S. policy options, and their possible impact on Mexican economic development.

As in any multi-author compilation, chapters vary in scope and quality. Nevertheless, the anthology is informative, insightful, and timely. The chapters incorporate substantial demographic data not conveniently available in one source. The data are skillfully and productively analyzed by the authors. The first four chapters, in particular, offer valuable correctives to common misconceptions or claims regarding the demographic conditions and postures of specific countries and/or countertendencies that may impede understanding of the issues raised by the demographic and policy changes of the past three decades. For example, the analysis of Mexico's demographic situation by Alba in Chapter 1 challenges the perception of Mexican governmental indifference to rapid population growth by systematically delineating the Mexican government's population policy efforts. The analysis of the demography of the Spanish-origin population in the American Southwest by Bean and his colleagues offers a vigorous challenge to the persistent claim about the role of immigration in the growth of the Mexican-origin population in the United States. The analysis of the Central American demographic situation by Díaz-Briquets in Chapter 2 offsets the tendency to homogenize the region, revealing the rich diversity of conditions and trends in the countries constituting Central America. Chapter 7 offers policy recommendations that are clear, thoughtful, and seemingly feasible. These recommendations merit serious consideration by policy-makers and others concerned with populations and immigration policy in this decade.

Still, the anthology would have been well served by a more extensive introductory chapter where the editors identified the themes, substance, and significance of remaining chapters. A discussion of the symposium participants' perspectives on the policy recommendations as well as commentaries on the recommendations by other experts on immigration and population policy also would have enhanced the utility of the anthology. The absence of these elements, however, does not detract from the value of an anthology that should, as its editors hope, help to "better inform views on immigration policy and help to make the facts relevant to debates about the role of immigration policy as an instrument of U.S. population policy more widely known."

Isidro Ortiz
*San Diego State University*

*United We Win: The Rise and Fall of La Raza Unida Party.* By Ignacio M. García. (Tucson: Mexican American Studies & Research Center/University of Arizona, 1989. xvi + 284 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. $18.50 paper.)

Researched and written by award-winning journalist Ignacio M. García, *United We Win* is an objective account of the rise and decline of a political third party founded in 1970 in Texas by Mexican American activists. Utilizing a multitude of sources, both primary and secondary, García, once an avid participant in the movement, meticulously reconstructs the historical evolution of a political dream to rectify social abuses heaped upon citizens of combined Hispanic-indigenous descent by English-dominant authorities in various levels of public responsibility. Stemming largely from the aspirations and demands of young, militant students involved in the Mexican American Youth Organization, La Raza Unida emerged as a determined, carefully orchestrated drive in Crystal City to seize control through the electoral process of city hall and the public schools.

Synonymous with La Raza Unida were the ambitions of José Ángel Gutiérrez, then a political science graduate student who had written a treatise postulating the doctrine of oppressed, unrepresented, and exploited ethnic minorities inevitably rising in unison to take charge of their political destiny. Ultimately victorious in Crystal City, despite legal maneuvering in the courts initiated by attorneys representing panic-stricken incumbents, the separatist Raza Unida disassociated itself from the platforms of the Democratic and Republican parties. Frequently oscillating between the ideological rhetoric of Mario Compean and partisan pragmatism of Gutiérrez, the new third party rapidly moved from local to regional and state competition. The height of La Raza Unida's bid for power centered in the 1972 campaign, with Ramsey Muñiz, as candidate for governor, and Alma Canales running for lieutenant governor. Loosely assembled behind these standard bearers were candidates for U.S. senator, state treasurer, railroad commissioner, and land commissioner, followed by a platoon of aspirants for legislative and county offices.

Although failing in that formidable struggle, and again in 1974 (except for a few local successes), zealous partisans opted to export their ideology as a "Crusade" to other states. Unfortunately for Gutiérrez and his loyalists, mainly because their militant rhetoric blocked effective communication, they never convinced wider audiences that their message of La Raza Unida signified cultural cohesion rather than hostile reverse discrimination. Among other factors, La Raza Unida failed to expand its base of support beyond its sphere of origin because the movement lacked the cement to hold together diverse coalitions for an extended period of time. In essence, the movement scared far more voters than it attracted.

For interested observers of this phenomenon in Texas politics, including this reviewer, *United We Win* reads like a compact digest of events of recent memory. Partisan though García may have been in the depth of that struggle a generation ago, he now ascends a more lofty plateau as investigative reporter and gifted chronicler. The literary gem here is the concluding chapter, where the author assesses the strengths and weaknesses of La Raza Unida as a force in American politics.

Clearly, Ignacio M. García has written a sympathetic history of the movement, critically describing conditions of the sixties and seventies and clarifying the outstanding issues and personalities in the Mexican American community of the Southwest. Whether *United We Win* becomes a classic study of what was assuredly one of the most important militant ethnic organizations in recent United States history remains for the next generation of scholars to determine. In the meantime, García's passionate and insightful contribution cannot be overlooked as a source of factual information and analysis.

Félix D. Almaráz, Jr.
*University of Texas at San Antonio*

*Standoff at the Border: A Failure of Microdiplomacy.* By Thomas J. Price. (El Paso: Texas Western Press, 1989. 74 pp. Maps, charts, tables, notes. $10.00 cloth, $5.00 paper.)

International street car service between El Paso and Cuidad Juárez ended on July 31, 1973, when disgruntled toll collectors seized an El Paso city lines car, Number PCC 1516, as it crossed into Mexico. This symbolic act, part of a labor-management dispute, ended almost ninety years of trolley transportation between the two border cities.

This short book is a study of subsequent unsuccessful negotiations between El Paso and Juárez to restore this municipal transport service, a process that the author terms "microdiplomacy." He surveys the history of public transportation between the two cities, reviews the roles of the respective municipalities in forming informal agreements to further common needs of urban government on both sides of the river, and considers the complex local, state, and national issues that often become involved in local border issues.

Essentially a work of political science rather than an historical analysis, the book offers numerous reasons why the participants in these discussions failed in their efforts. Some explanations are obvious: street car technology had become obsolete; local governments along the border found it difficult to engage international issues; and competition from other forms of transport reduced the validity of the street car. The study's most valuable discussion, however, is its analysis of the socioeconomic changes in the Paseo del Norte basin that eventually rendered trolley transport an anachronism. The growth of suburban shopping centers on both sides of the border, the advent of "liquor-by-the-drink" in Texas, the construction of a modern bridge, and new industries in both nations altered the need for public transport.

Based largely on newspaper accounts and public documents, this study offers a complete analysis of an interesting case study in the unique problems faced by municipalities along the border when considerations of local government have international implications.

Light Townsend Cummins
*Austin College*

*In Search of Columbus: The Sources for the First Voyage.* By David Henige. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1991. xiii + 359 pp. Maps, tables, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. $24.95.)

David Henige has produced a thought-provoking historiography about Christopher Columbus' landing site on his voyage of discovery. Scholars agree that the island on which Columbus landed was one he named San Salvador, also known by its indigenous place name, Guanahaní. The question is, where is it? Among the several island candidates are Watlings Island, Samana Cay, Grand Turk, Eleuthera, Cat Island, and Mayaguana. The book is divided into two parts. Part I is an analysis of the documentation. In his attempt to unravel the history of the discovery, Henige focuses on sixteenth-century printed sources, principally the version of Columbus' journals, referred to as the *"diario,"* copied by the Dominican friar Bartolomé de las Casas, and *The life of the admiral Christopher Columbus by his son Ferdinand.* Part II examines the writings of historians and linguistic experts on the subject of Guanahaní.

While historians have consulted, analyzed, and written about Columbus' so-called diario, they recognize that it is an unsatisfactory source. The dissatisfaction with the diario stems from the fact that the original copy kept by Columbus no longer exists. Sometime in the sixteenth century it was copied and/or edited by Las Casas, who seems to have had other purposes in mind. Although much is known about the voyage, discrepencies abound to confuse experts on the interpretation of the location of Guanahaní.

Henige's methodology involves the process of elimination in regard to interpretations of the diario entry concerning the discovery site. Aside from Las Casas' instrusive influence in the diario, its analysis is hampered by the many transcribed and translated versions that are at variance with one another. Henige attempts to analyze the main paleographical and translation issues regarding certain words, but his success is limited because his analysis is inconclusive in regard to resolving the issue of the location of Guanahaní. Anyone who has worked with elusive documentation can appreciate Henige's efforts. Although his endeavor is better rewarded in his treatment of the historiography of Guanahaní, Henige does not direct the reader to a conclusion. His critique of the various writers about Guanahaní is, on the other hand, a major contribution for future researchers.

The strength of the work is the resulting scholarly and meticulous synthesis of what has been written by historians about Guanahaní. As such, it brings together the main arguments heretofore made by scholars on the subject. Two useful appendixes are included for the reader to review along with the test. They are entries from the diario for the crucial period October 11/12 to 15, 1492, and a brief sixteenth-century account of Gonzalo Fernando Oviedo y Valdes' "Historia" regarding the closing hours before land was sighted by the expedition. A useful bibliography of specialized works is also included.

This book does have minor weaknesses. They lie in the redundancy of some of the arguments repeated in the two parts of the book. Although Henige's knowledge of his subject is outstanding, one must wonder why more corroborating documentation from the *Pleitos de Colón* were not consulted in Part I of this work. Henige may have missed an opportunity to have analyzed

other testimony by Columbus' men about the discovery. For example, in them is a brief account by the son of Martín Alonso Pinzón about his father's role in the discovery of Guanahaní and other islands in the days following the landing. Notwithstanding, the book is highly recommended as a scholarly reference for serious students of the Age of Discovery. Quincentennial aficionados should not expect the work to decide the location of Guanahaní.

Joseph P. Sánchez
*Spanish Colonial Research Center*

*Taos: A Pictorial History.* By John Sherman. (Santa Fe: Gannon Distributing Co., 1990. x + 164 pp. Illustrations, bibliography, index. $19.95 paper.)

John Sherman is no stranger to New Mexico. He lived for a while in Santa Fe and is known for several publications on New Mexican topics. He was honored for a similar publication, *Santa Fe: A Pictorial History.* He was also editor of *El Palacio,* the magazine of the Museum of New Mexico. So he comes with some considerable background to do a book on Taos as a companion to the Santa Fe publication.

Interest in historic photographs and photographers has become more popular and more respectable in recent times. The continuing discovery of long lost photographic collections, and the acknowledged importance of photographs in historic research, has meant an increasing number of publications of this kind. This reviewer has some experience in such publications and welcomes them as adding to our understanding of the past.

This particular work I find very interesting. It presents many photographs that the author must have searched long and hard to find, in addition to getting permission to publish. But therein are also some problems. The scope of this book is from "Before 1540" to the "1990's and Beyond." In either case, before or after, the question is where are the photographs? It may seem a somewhat picky point to belabor the invention of photography and the "future," but it is very difficult to put this work in the context of centuries of history and provide photographs to the work. The chronological approach is fine, and maybe essential, but which comes first? In this case it is an attempt to do both and that approach does not always work.

Do not get me wrong. There are a lot of very interesting historic photographs in this book. I think they are fascinating and, again, Sherman has done a wonderful job in locating them. Additional information only makes the offering more important and interesting. I have become aware of the importance of identifying the photographer in increasing the value of the work.

There is another problem with this type of work. The photographs themselves are worth publication—especially if captions explain time, place, person or persons, and photographer, if possible. The captions in this work require reading all by themselves. They are so full of information that it took me two readings—first the captions, and then the text. I am not sure how I would have approached the project either, so this is not to be taken necessarily as criticism. I read the book twice!

Every reviewer seems to be under some kind of unwritten law that de-

mands criticism of some sort. Therefore, as a small factual matter I am sure that most railroad passengers to Taos debarked from the Denver & Rio Grande Railway at Taos Junction for the buggy or automobile ride to town. The Junction was closer and, in the earlier days, there was the bridge over the Rio at Pilar. Other readers may note some questions of interpretations, but I leave that to them. In a book of this type and size, one cannot satisfy everyone—especially the "professional" historians.

I like the book. It is not an in-depth history of Taos. It was not meant to be. Sherman has presented a very nice, readable book with dozens of excellent photographs.

Spencer Wilson
*New Mexico Tech*

# Book Notes

*The "Diario" of Christopher Columbus's First Voyage to America 1492–1493.* Edited by Oliver Dunn and James E. Kelley, Jr. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1991. xii + 491 pp. Illustration, notes, bibliography, index. $24.95 paper.)

*Spanish Government in New Mexico.* By Marc Simmons. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1990. xvii + 238 pp. Illustrations, maps, charts, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. $16.95 paper.)

*The Presidio: Bastion of the Spanish Borderlands.* By Max L. Moorhead. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1991. xvi + 288 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $14.95 paper.)

*Spanish Borderlands Sourcebooks: The Spanish Missions of New Mexico (II: After 1680).* Edited by John L. Kessell and Rick Hendricks. General Series edited by David Hurst Thomas. (New York: Garland Publishing, 1991. xvii + 504 pp. Illustrations, maps, tables, notes, bibliographies. $75.00.)

*New Mexico Village Arts.* By Roland F. Dickey. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1990. xii + 266 pp. Illustrations, bibliography, index. $24.95 paper.)

*The Saint Francis Murals of Santa Fe: The Commission and the Artists.* By

Carl Sheppard. (Santa Fe: Sunstone Press, 1989. 96 pp. Illustrations, bibliography, index. $9.95 paper.)

*Endangered Cultures.* By Miguel León-Portilla. (Dallas: Southern Methodist University Press, 1990. x + 265 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography. $9.95 paper.)

*The Pottery of Acatlán: A Changing Mexican Tradition.* By Louana M. Lackey. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1991. xi + 164 pp. Illustrations, maps, appendix, bibliography, index. $18.95 paper.)

*Mexican Game Trails: Americans Afield in Old Mexico, 1866–1940.* Edited by Neil B. Carmony and David E. Brown. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1991. vii + 270 pp. Illustrations, map, bibliography, index. $24.95.)

*Where the Strange Roads Go Down.* By Mary del Villar and Fred del Villar. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1991. xvii + 244 pp. Illustrations, map. $14.95 paper.) A walk across rural Mexico.

*Understanding the Central American Crisis: Sources of Conflict, U.S. Policy, and Options for Peace.* Edited by Kenneth M. Coleman and George C. Herring. (Wilmington, Delaware: Scholarly Resources, 1991. xix + 240 pp. Map, tables, notes, index. $40.00 cloth, $13.95 paper.)

*Thin Men Of Haddam.* By C. W. Smith. (Fort Worth: Texas Christian University Press, 1990. xii + 336 pp. Illustrations. $15.95 paper.) A southwestern novel.

*A Catalog of Maya Hieroglyphs.* By J. Eric S. Thompson. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1991. xiv + 458 pp. Illustrations, tables, note, bibliography. $19.95 paper.)

*Vision and Revision in Maya Studies.* Edited by Flora S. Clancy and Peter D. Harrison. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1990. x + 224 pp. Illustrations, maps, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $40.00.)

*A Zuni Atlas.* By T. J. Ferguson and E. Richard Hart. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1990. xiii + 154 pp. Illustrations, maps, appendixes, bibliography, index. $17.95 paper.)

*Ácoma: Pueblo in the Sky.* By Ward Alan Minge. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1991. xviii + 245 pp. Illustrations, map, tables, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. $22.50 paper.) Revised edition.

*Cochiti: A New Mexico Pueblo, Past and Present.* By Charles H. Lange. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1990. xxix + 618 pp.

Illustrations, map, charts, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. $22.50 paper.)

*The Pueblo Indian Revolt of 1696 and the Franciscan Missions in New Mexico: Letters of the Missionaries and Related Documents.* Edited by J. Manuel Espinosa. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1991. xviii + 313 pp. Illustrations, map, notes, bibliography, index. $15.95 paper.)

*Indian Heroes and Great Chieftains.* By Charles A. Eastman (Ohiyesa). (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1991. 241 pp. Illustrations. $8.95 paper.)

*Images of Penance, Images of Mercy: Southwestern "Santos" in the Late Nineteenth Century.* By William Wroth. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1991. xvii + 196 pp. Illustrations, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. $65.00 cloth, $24.95 paper.)

*Wounded Knee 1973: A Personal Account.* By Stanley David Lyman. Edited by Floyd A. O'Neil, June K. Lyman, and Susan McKay. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1991. xxxix + 180 pp. Illustrations, maps, index. $30.00.)

*Navajo Sandpainting: From Religious Act to Commercial Art.* By Nancy J. Parezo. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1991. xxii + 251 pp. Illustrations, maps, tables, appendixes, bibliography, index. $19.95 paper.)

*The Basket Weavers of Arizona.* By Bert Robinson. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1991. xvi + 164 pp. Illustrations, map, notes, index. $24.95 paper.)

*Other Council Fires Were Here Before Ours: A Classic Native American Creation Story as Retold by a Seneca Elder and Her Granddaughter.* By Jamie Sams and Twylah Nitsch. (San Francisco: HarperCollins Publishers, 1991. xii + 147 pp. Illustrations. $12.95 paper.)

*Encyclopedia of Frontier Biography.* 3 vols. By Dan L. Thrapp. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1991. xvi + 1698 pp. Index. $60.00 paper.)

*The Winnebago Tribe.* By Paul Radin. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1990. xvi + 511 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, index. $15.95 paper.)