New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 64 | Number 2 Article 8

4-1-1989

Book Reviews

Book Reviews

No Separate Refuge: Culture, Class, and Gender on an Anglo-Hispanic Frontier in the American Southwest, 1880–1940. By Sarah Deutsch. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987. vi + 356 pp. Maps, notes, bibliography, index. $34.50.)

Sarah Deutsch describes the evolution of Hispanic society in northern New Mexico and Colorado from 1880 to 1940, the changing roles of Hispanic women, and how the Anglo-dominated economy forced change on Hispanic culture. She has used an impressive array of archival sources, printed material, oral history collections, and her own interviews of men and women who lived through the times she describes.

As late as 1880, Hispanic Americans in northern New Mexico lived in many small villages raising modest gardens and herding sheep to gain a living much as they had since Spanish colonial times. As Hispanic people lost their land and grazing privileges, men began to trek north looking for seasonal work that took them away from their villages for months at a time. Meanwhile, women remained the core of village society. They contributed their labor to the subsistence economy, augmented the men's wages, and were the locus of Hispanic community in the Southwest. Mutualism, Catholic values, folk traditions, and family remained as central stabilizing influences even as the larger society exerted powerful centrifugal forces.

With the village as their social center, Hispanic people were able to maintain a measure of cultural autonomy and economic control over their lives, but the situation did not remain unchallenged for long. Anglo Protestant women missionaries came to the villages to spread their version of Christianity and to "Americanize" New Mexican women—to indoctrinate them with middle-class Anglo values. Anglo proselytizers also brought improved hygiene and

medical care, but they had little effect otherwise as long as villages remained economically viable. Industrial capitalism, however, would force greater changes on Hispanic communities as women and families moved to Colorado to live near the coal mines and beet fields where their menfolk worked and where few women could continue to fill the economic roles that had been viable in village society. As a result, women began to work in the wage economy as field hands and domestic servants.

Increased reliance on wages made Hispanic workers more dependent on the Anglo economy, but wages did not insure an adequate living. Working conditions were poor or worse. Consequently, Hispanic and Anglo laborers alike joined labor unions and led strikes against unfair employers. One strike resulted in the infamous Ludlow massacre in 1914 when the Colorado National Guard opened fire on a strikers' tent city. Hispanic women and children were among the victims. In the beet fields conditions were no better. Field hands did not make enough money to support their families, so child labor remained a staple of the Colorado economy until the 1930s. Not surprisingly, Hispanics also were active in farm labor unions.

There were subtle attacks on Hispanic society as well. Mine owners built company towns that supplanted the traditional *plazas*. Colorado's company towns had the usual features associated with such operations—a company store, goods on credit, high rent. The Colorado Fuel and Iron company had a sociological department that meant to encourage patriotism and inculcate Anglo-American values.

Conditions for Hispanic workers worsened during the Great Depression. Relief measures helped some, but federal administrators seemed more interested in maintaining the economic structure that supported the beet industry than improving the lot of Hispanics. New Deal functionaries, meanwhile, tried to sponsor a revival of Hispanic arts and crafts in the mistaken hope that curio sales would be a substitute for decent wages. All along the line, Anglos tried to recast Hispanic women in an Anglo, middle-class mold. In the end, Deutsch asserts, the once independent Hispanic community became an internal colony at the disposal of Anglo farmers, industrialists, and bureaucrats.

Deutsch has made an important contribution to the history of the West, Chicanos, and the family. Firmly grounded in social science and Chicano history, her book demonstrates just how subtle and complex were the ways in which Anglo Americans conquered the American West—a process that is not done yet.

Albert L. Hurtado
Arizona State University

On Their Own: Widows and Widowhood in the American Southwest 1848–1939. Edited by Arlene Scadron. (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1988. xx + 324 pp. Maps, charts, tables, notes, index. $29.95.)

While the study of widowhood in the past is in its early stages, that experience in the Southwest is completely unexplored. This collection of interdisciplinary essays thus adds significantly to our knowledge of the subject.

It is strengthened by the varied methodologies employed, the diverse range of sources consulted, and a comparative approach that contrasts the nation with the region, rural areas with urban, and differences among class, age, racial, and cultural groups. Beginning in 1848 with the United States' acquisition of the Southwest, and ending in 1939 with amendment of the Social Security Act to expand coverage of elderly wives, widows, and dependent children, the chapters focus on Arizona, Colorado, New Mexico, and Utah during a period of significant change, but one in which "the modern welfare state was in its infancy" (p. ix).

The most consistent conclusions in all the essays are not surprising: that economic status is the single most important determinant in the experience of widowhood; that the degree of autonomy prior to widowhood is inversely related to social and economic penalties on the widow; and that widowhood mirrors the functions and meaning of marriage in the social group. This volume makes it clear that although one can describe common variables, there is no such thing as a "typical widow," and that notions of the "grieving or merry widow" are stereotypes, while nostalgic views of some past golden age of widowhood are equally unrealistic. Some authors indeed challenge as romantic the assumption that kin and extended family provide support and security for widows and other dependents because these are "informal support systems . . . highly discretionary, [while] federally mandated assistance has often taken on the status of a right, enforceable by the courts" (p. 306).

The strongest essays in the collection are those which illustrate general patterns with personal/individual examples. Among these are the chapter on Hopi family structure by Alice Schlegel, Martha Loustaunau's examination of Hispanic widows in New Mexico's Mesilla Valley, the detailed analysis of the experience of widows in Denver, 1880–1912 by Joyce Goodfriend, and Deborah Baldwin's case study of the fairly select group of Arizona Pioneer Society widows.

This study is an important beginning but understandably incomplete. The sexual dimensions of widowhood are barely touched upon, and the connections among social symbols and images, and individual responses and identity remain vague. Racial and cultural distinctions are still unclear, and, above all, widows must be compared to other single women in the society.

Jane Slaughter
University of New Mexico

Emily: The Diary of a Hard-Worked Woman. By Emily French. Edited by Janet Lecompte. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1987. viii + 166 pp. Notes, index. $18.95 cloth, $7.95 paper.)

Among the pleasures of history is the way in which previously neglected or devalued sources assume heightened importance as scholarly research reshapes old questions and weaves new patterns. Such is the case with *Emily: The Diary of a Hard-Worked Woman,* authored by a nineteenth-century western divorcee and edited by Janet Lecompte. Several aspects of this slim volume

serve to make it a more notable publication than its compact appearance might suggest.

First, the contents chronicle the events for one year in the life of a frontier woman. Since in recent years published memoirs and diaries of western women are a rather common addition to frontier historiography, the announcement that another is available might not seem too startling. However, Emily French certainly did not fit into the usual mold of those pioneer women who usually recorded their western experiences. French, divorced after thirty-two years of marriage, rather unexpectedly faced the loss of her home, shattered family relationships, and skimpy economic prospects. In a larger sense, this is the tale of American women, frontier and otherwise, who, late in life, find themselves suddenly cut off from the economic support of their husbands through divorce or widowhood. All too often their lives parallel the struggles of Emily French. French's efforts to secure work, her uneasy hold on unattractive jobs, and an increasing poverty—all intensified by her ill health in a bitter environment—provide new insights into the impact of divorce on nineteenth-century women.

Second, the diary entries cover several subjects of interest to scholars. Religious matters, women's work, parenting, medical care, domestic violence, and, of course, the relentless extremes of the weather are all topics that French addressed. The weak spelling and brief notations aside, this is a diary for careful reading; the yield is a wealth of western information.

Third, the detailed research that surrounds and fleshes out the diary points to the innovative and quality work that characterizes recent trends in women's history in the West. *Emily: The Diary of a Hard-Worked Woman* is an example of what an imaginative, careful researcher can do with a topic that is seemingly too fragmented to be worthy of publication. Lecompte's meticulous and fascinating additions make the volume as complete as appears to have been possible. Under the skillful hand of the editor, this diary has been transformed from a historical relic into a valuable source.

Despite its brevity, Emily French's diary adds to the history of women in the American West in ways its weary, over-worked author would never have expected.

Anne M. Butler
Gallaudet University

My Life on the Frontier 1864–1882. By Miguel Antonio Otero. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1987. lxxix + 293 pp. Illustrations, index. $12.95 paper.)

The years have been kind to the prose and imagination of Miguel Otero. His boyhood memoir, reprinted here, is as fresh and lively as when first published in 1935. The events it recounts, now over a century old, retain a charming immediacy. The volume also remains an important document for the serious student of the American West and Southwest.

Even if Otero had not achieved prominence, becoming governor of New Mexico Territory and later marshal of the Panama Canal, this autobiography

would deserve attention. It can be read as a straightforward account of a boy growing to manhood in various railroad construction and trade centers of western Kansas, eastern Colorado and northeastern New Mexico in the two decades after the Civil War. But in various respects it is unique. Although Otero wrote it late in life, he pictures those frontier days through childhood eyes. Hunting expeditions with a Russian grand duke; meetings with Phil Sheridan, George Custer, and Buffalo Bill; supper with "Uncle Dick" Wooten—all are told with the guileless grace of a child, though admittedly tinged with a touch of an old man's nostalgia and romanticism. Additionally, Otero's father was an influential and powerful Hispanic landowner and businessman, while his mother came from an established South Carolinian family. His definition of his own ethnicity, plus his accounts of the ethnic complexities of that place and time, make a fascinating study for contemporary readers. Beyond this, Otero simply seems to have known everyone there was to know.

Cynthia Secor-Welsh provides a perceptive introductory essay to the autobiography, placing it in the political, economic, and social context of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. She particularly considers Otero's later career, depicting him as a typical businessman and "boss-reformer" of the Gilded Age and progressive era in the West. Extensive notes and bibliographic references will greatly aid those who wish to pursue Otero or his frontier times further. The essay contains a number of photographs of Otero, his family, friends and acquaintances, appropriately emphasizing his early years.

The University of New Mexico Press is to be commended for making this important artifact of New Mexico history readily available once again. It was a fitting present with which to commemorate the Diamond Jubilee of the State of New Mexico.

Michael Olsen
New Mexico Highlands University

Conservation Politics: The Senate Career of Clinton P. Anderson. By Richard Allan Baker. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1985. xii + 340 pp. Illustrations, map, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth, $14.95 paper.)

Clinton Anderson was one of New Mexico's most prominent politicians in the twentieth century but as yet has not found the biographer he deserves. Unfortunately, his fate is not singular because many of the state's political leaders during the last one hundred years, from Albert Fall to Clyde Tingley, or Bronson Cutting to Dennis Chavez, have not received full-scale treatment, although historians are now examining aspects of their careers. As a result, New Mexico's history has been seriously distorted. While scholars have lovingly followed virtually every footstep of explorers and padres from the seventeenth to the nineteenth centuries, whether prominent or obscure, they have largely ignored significant activities of the state's political leaders in later years. Of such stuff are historical myths and romances made. One hundred years of New Mexico history lie largely unrecorded. Thus, this volume by Richard Baker

is a welcome addition because it contributes to filling this awful and shameful gap.

Utilizing the Anderson Papers in the Library of Congress, Baker has concentrated on Anderson's important role in shaping national conservation legislation during the Eisenhower era. Regrettably, he has not consulted the relevant but vital papers of Anderson's close colleagues, especially Carl Hayden and Pat McCarran, among others. After a brief survey of Anderson's career in New Mexico politics Baker focuses on his growing stature in the United States Senate over which Lyndon Johnson had such extraordinary influence. Anderson was an effective advocate of river basin development and was responsible for the inclusion of New Mexico projects on the Upper Colorado River. Baker also traces the process whereby Anderson became a national advocate of conservation legislation affecting wilderness areas and shorelines. In an era of burgeoning tourism the New Mexican also framed significant laws affecting outdoor recreation and national parks. He also provided visible leadership for the protection of the West's most precious resource—water. The Navajo–San Juan projects were part of his handiwork as well as national clean water laws.

In a simple and straightforward style Baker competently narrates these aspects of Anderson's career. The book reflects its origins as a doctoral dissertation at the University of Maryland. It has a very narrow research base, tends to be rather uncritical, and is not very sophisticated. Somewhere someone along the line should have prevailed upon the author to provide some appraisal of Anderson's career in conservation, or an evaluation of his accomplishments and failures within the broader context of New Mexico and national politics. But half a loaf is better than none. The book is a worthwhile addition to the still bare shelf on twentieth-century New Mexico politics, and it virtually provides an invitation to some potential biographer to step forward and write a much needed book.

Gerald D. Nash
University of New Mexico

Papers Concerning Robertson's Colony in Texas: Introductory Volume, Robert Leftwich's Mexico Diary and Letterbook, 1822–1824. Edited by Malcolm D. McLean. (Arlington: University of Texas at Arlington Press, 1986. 611 pp. Illustrations, notes, appendix, bibliography, index. $35.00.)

Editors who initiate monumental tasks of compiling a massive amount of documentation with a view toward eventual publication belong to a rare fraternity of scholars. Often requiring years from start to finish, the volumes they produce become heavy tomes of encyclopedic value. Malcolm Dallas McLean is such an editor. For nearly a half-century this meticulous scholar has expended talent and energy toward the goal of sharing with the public a documentary account of the contributions of family ancestors to the Anglo American colonization of Mexican Texas. In the chronology of McLean's publication record, this beautiful volume, *Robert Leftwich's Mexico Diary and Letterbook,* although labelled introductory, is actually the thirteenth in the series and covers

the writer's experiences in search of authorization to settle American immigrants in a foreign land.

Shortly after Mexico gained its independence from Spain, an enterprising Kentuckian, Robert Leftwich, became affiliated with a colonizing project, organized in Nashville, Tennessee, popularly known as the Texas Association. As company agent Leftwich arrived in Mexico City in the spring of 1822 to commence negotiations for a colonizing grant. Owing to vicissitudes of fledgling national politics, the Mexican government delayed enactment of a comprehensive colonization law until 1824 by which it delegated responsibility to state officials. Leftwich, therefore, journeyed northward to Saltillo, capital of the dual-state of Coahuila y Texas, to continue lobbying efforts. Ultimately successful, Leftwich secured permission to settle eight hundred families in the upper watershed of the Brazos and Colorado rivers. Following Leftwich's death late in 1825, the administration of the sizeable land grant underwent a litany of name changes until it became synonymous with that of a successor leader, Sterling Clack Robertson.

With the publication of *Robert Leftwich's Mexico Diary and Letterbook*, editor McLean finally provided a solid foundation for the preceding twelve volumes. The result may be comparable, as McLean conceded, to a carpenter constructing an imposing edifice from the roof downward, meanwhile hoping to find the resources to buy an adequate town lot on which to lay a foundation. Leftwich's *Diary* is replete with descriptive commentaries about persons, places, and politics. Of particular interest are the letters to friends and acquaintances with whom Leftwich shared intimate views on a variety of subjects not the least of which were proper procedures for conducting business with foreigners.

Of ancillary value to the contents of Leftwich's *Diary and Letterbook* is McLean's inclusion of a biographical essay of Edward Disney Farmer (1849–1924), a philanthropist who generously endowed a corpus of international fellowships to promote the growth of friendship and good will between the State of Texas and the Republic of Mexico. In recognition of more than three hundred Farmer Fellowships awarded between 1929 and the publication deadline, signifying an ongoing fulfillment of a humanitarian goal, the editor dedicated the current volume to the benefactor's memory. Of parallel interest to Farmer's cameo is McLean's narrative of his own circuitous route in pursuit of the original Leftwich diary and letterbook, from its rediscovery by a Fort Worth genealogist in the Tennessee State Library and Archives to its final accession and conservation in the Robertson Colony Collection in the library of the University of Texas at Arlington.

McLean and associates have produced an exceptionally attractive and informative edition, bound in red with elegant gold lettering, to complement the earlier blue volumes of *Papers Concerning Robertson's Colony in Texas*. One would hope that *aficionados* of the borderlands will not be discouraged from acquiring the volume because of its steep price tag.

Felix D. Almaraz, Jr.
University of Texas at San Antonio

A Narrative of the Life of David Crockett. By David Crockett. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1987. lvii + 211 pp. Illustrations, notes. $6.95 paper.)

The Tall Tales of Davy Crockett: The Second Nashville Series of Crockett Almanacs, 1839–1841. Edited by Michael A. Lofaro. (Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1987. Illustrations, tables, index. $24.95 cloth, $12.95 paper.)

Colonel David Crockett's two-hundredth birthday celebration combined with the Texas Sesquicentennial to produce a score of reprints and collections commemorating the legendary Tennessee Congressman and martyr for Texas independence. But in perusing this substantial literature, readers should heed the advice of folklorists to take care to separate the historical *David* Crockett from his folkloric and literary alter-ego *Davy* Crockett. Two excellent new reprints of *A Narrative of the Life of David Crockett* and *The Tall Tales of Davy Crockett* document both of these characters, respectively.

Paul Andrew Hutton's thorough, annotated introduction places *A Narrative of the Life of David Crockett* in its historical and literary context. Originally published in 1834 as Whig Congressman Crockett's official campaign biography, the *Narrative* aimed to counter an earlier fanciful and "fictitious" ghostwritten account. The *Narrative* was also ghostwritten, but Crockett evidently played an important role in composing this amusing, readable, and generally accurate autobiography.

Writing in the local vernacular, Crockett tells the fascinating story of his youth in Tennessee, his courtships and two marriages, his disastrous flatboat experience, his hunting adventures (he claims to have killed 105 bears in one year!), and his exploits in the Creek Indian War. But Crockett's political jokes and jabs at his arch-rival Andrew Jackson prove equally entertaining. The *Narrative* was, after all, a campaign autobiography. Defeated by the Jacksonians in 1835, Crockett told his constituents that they could all "go to hell" and he would "go to Texas" (p. xxix). His subsequent 1836 martyr's death at the Alamo combined with the fascinating life related in the *Narrative* to provide fertile ground for the mythmakers who followed.

Although the folkloric and literary "Davy" Crockett was born a few years prior to 1836, he became a veritable media star in the newspaper and journal literature of the post-Alamo years. Michael A. Lofaro's facsimile edition of *The Tall Tales of Davy Crockett: The Second Nashville Series of Crockett Almanacs, 1839–1841,* fills a vital missing link in the story of this mythical "Lion of the West." Yet the hero who emerges in the pages of these heretofore out-of-print *Nashville Almanacs* (they were actually written and published in Boston) is a far different character than the author of the *Narrative.* Interestingly, he is different from even Richard M. Dorson's and Walt Disney's later sanitized heroic versions of the "King of the Wild Frontier."

The Davy Crockett of the *Nashville Almanacs* is no Fess Parker. Modern readers are struck by the crude, sexist, racist, and jingoistic tone of these "terrificashus" yarns (p. 2). While his shooting match with Mike Fink (p. 11) and his bear "wrasslin'" (pp. 9–10) prove amusing, Davy seems also to have acquired several bad habits. In one story he forces a squatter to eat "every atom" of a fresh cow pie (pp. 11–12), while in another he kills an Indian ("red

nigger" in *Almanac* parlance) who has asked Davy to kiss his exposed "posterum" (p. 6)! This mythic Crockett brags that he can "make love like a mad bull, and swallow a nigger whole without choking if you butter his head and pin his ears back" (p. xxix). Obviously, the *Nashville Almanacs* tell us a good deal more about Jacksonian Americans' tastes in "literature" than they do about the historical Colonel David Crockett.

Michael Lofaro has written a solid introduction to these *Nashville Almanacs*, and the woodcut reproductions are stunning. Both of these books are handsome, readable, and welcome additions to Crockettiana. Either would serve as an exciting reading assignment for students in American history courses.

Michael Allen
Deep Springs College

The Presidency of James K. Polk. By Paul H. Bergeron. (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1987. xv + 310 pp. Notes, bibliography, index. $25.00.)

James K. Polk, perhaps more than any other chief executive, forces historians to question how we should define presidential success. Polk came to Washington in 1845 with a clear agenda, and in four years he accomplished every item on it: the Independent Treasury; a lower tariff; settlement of the Oregon boundary; and acquisition of California and New Mexico. Polk did everything he set out to do. In the course of it, he literally worked himself to the edge of death, outraged a large portion of the citizenry, split the Democratic party, and reopened the explosive sectional controversy over slavery. Polk racked up an impressive series of achievements that took the country a long step down the road to disunion and civil war.

How should we judge such a record? Paul Bergeron's volume in the Kansas *American Presidency* series returns a favorable verdict. Bergeron rates Polk "a highly effective president," emphasizing his diplomatic acumen, his skill in Cabinet management, and his restrained response to criticism of the Mexican War. On the other hand Bergeron acknowledges the suspicious and conspiratorial bent of Polk's mind, his narrowmindedness and occasional deviousness. He especially faults Polk for exerting weak leadership on the question of slavery in the newly conquered territories, and in general for underestimating the sensitivity of the slavery issue.

Despite these reservations, Bergeron presents Polk very much as Polk would have liked to be seen. Bergeron does not ask the hard questions. Praising Polk's fulfillment of "Manifest Destiny," he acknowledges but never comes to terms with the historical literature questioning the existence of a popular mandate for expansion. If Americans "rejoiced in the bold expansionism of the Polk administration," why did they vote Whig in wartime congressional elections? The judgment that sectional disruption was "largely unanticipated" in the 1840s strains credulity. (When Bergeron hails the "new literary productivity fostered by the experiences of the war," one thinks of Thoreau's essay on civil disobedience.) The progress of Polk's armies, the squabbles among his generals, the behavior of envoy Nicholas Trist all appear here through Polk's own narrow and often distorted perspective.

Bergeron fails to transcend Polk's view of his presidency because he leans too heavily on Polk's diary as a source. Whole sections of the book draw straight from the diary; the consequence is not only limited vision but a singular lack of proportion. We learn more of ceremonial Indian visits to the White House than of Polk's Indian policy. The comings and goings of Polk's nephews and nieces receive more space than the conquest of California. Incredibly, there is no word of the famous Stockton-Kearny-Frémont dispute, despite its grave consequences for Polk's administration. It appears that Bergeron simply forgot to finish this part of his narrative.

In a synthetic work like this one, designed for a general audience and hardly claiming to say anything new, style counts for much. Bergeron's prose is competent; his index is excellent; the proofreading and book design are exemplary. Aside from references to a non-existent Department of Justice, the text is generally free of error. But it would have been much more interesting if Bergeron had probed more deeply.

Daniel Feller
University of New Mexico

Religion and Society in the American West: Historical Essays. Edited by Carl Guarneri and David Alvarez. (Lanham, Maryland: University Press of America, 1987. xvi + 491 pp. Illustrations, notes, index. $36.50 cloth, $23.75 paper.)

This volume consists of twenty essays, most of which were first given as papers at a 1984 conference hosted by Saint Mary's College of California. The title emphasizes the theme of religion and society "in the American West," but "on the American West Coast" would be a bit more accurate. Fourteen articles treat the Pacific Coast states, with California commanding the lion's share of the analysis.

Books of essays are notoriously difficult to review, and this one is no exception. The articles range widely: the California Black churches' thrust for civil rights; the Mormon Female Relief Society; Freemasonry; Judaism as a "Civic Religion"; California Catholic parochial education; Seattle evangelist Mark Matthews; the Aurora Colony in Oregon; etc. All the essays are worth reading, however, and those by Eldon Ernst on American religious history "from a Pacific Coast perspective," Salvatore Mondello on Baptist Railroad Churches, and Lawrence Foster on Mormon polygamy are especially well drawn.

New Mexico readers will welcome the two pieces by Frances Campbell and Mark Banker. Campbell discusses the impact of Gilded Age Catholic parochial schooling on New Mexico Territory. Because the schools were staffed by nuns and priests, they met minimal resistance when they introduced "mainstream" literature, science, and technology into the region. Campbell maintains that Archbishop Lamy's far-reaching parochial school system played a vital role in "assimilating" New Mexican Hispanics and Indians into the larger, Anglo-European culture.

Banker's essay details the career of José Ynes Perea, the first Hispanic to be ordained a Presbyterian minister in the United States. As "missionary to

his own people," Perea often found himself caught between two worlds, neither of which accepted him fully. Banker's thoughtful analysis should be the starting point for further study of the state's small, but significant, Hispanic Protestant community.

The fragmented nature of these essays reflects the fragmented nature of contemporary scholarship on the theme of "religion in the West." There is need for a new synthesis to integrate these disparate currents into a more coherent whole. Until that appears, however, this collection of essays is the best place to begin. It is a welcome addition to the history of culture in the American West.

Ferenc M. Szasz
University of New Mexico

New Views of Mormon History: A Collection of Essays in Honor of Leonard J. Arrington. Edited by Davis Bitton and Maureen Ursenbach Beecher. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1987. xvii + 480 pp. Tables, chart, notes, bibliography, index. $19.95.)

This collection of eighteen essays in honor of Leonard J. Arrington indicates how significant he has been to the writing of Mormon history, how the scholarship in the field of Mormon history has matured, and how much diversity exists among Mormon historians. The essays are grouped in four sections: (1) Early Mormonism, Aspects of History and Theology; (2) The Church and People, in Utah and Abroad; (3) Mormon-Gentile Relations; and (4) Mormonism in the Larger Perspective. Most of the studies are narrow in scope, for example, Dean L. May on "Brigham Young and the Bishops: The United Order in the City" and Ronald Walker on "'Going to Meeting' in Salt Lake City's Thirteenth Ward, 1849–1881, A Microanalysis."

Quite different, however, are essays by D. Michael Quinn, "Socio-religious Radicalism of the Mormon Church: A Parallel to the Anabaptists," and Paul M. Edwards', "Time in Mormon History." Quinn's essay displays not only a juxtaposition of ideas but also of experience, especially the repression faced by dissenters in an otherwise homogeneous society. Edwards confronts a hierarchy of ideas relating to the understanding of the concept of time and what it means to Mormon history. Grasping the importance of Edwards' explanation of the Mormon idea of God disclosed why Mormonism was so profoundly unacceptable to Protestant Christians, who saw it unfold as a unique religious experience with an entirely different perception of God and time.

To single out the works of these authors is to do an injustice to the excellent essays by Richard Bushman, Dean C. Jessee, Thomas G. Alexander, David Whittaker, William G. Hartley, Gordon Irving, R. Lanier Britsch, Carol Cornwall Madsen, Jill Mulvay Derr, Richard Jensen, Eugene E. Campbell, Richard D. Poll, James Allen, and Jan Shipps, a non-Mormon whose recent study of Mormonism as a distinctive religious tradition has been so well received both within and without the Mormon community. For anyone unfamiliar with Mormon historical writing, James Allen's analysis of recent Mormon historiography

is a convenient place to begin. David J. Whittaker has also provided a bibliography of Arrington's published work. Davis Bitton's introduction is a brief and gracious sketch of Arrington that leaves the reader with the hope that someone will write a longer biography of the farmer turned economist turned church historian and biographer of Brigham Young. This is an interesting intellectual odyssey.

In reading these essays and thinking about Arrington and other post-World War II Mormon historians, one is struck by the complexity of the problem they faced in making their writing credible to the secular historical community. They could, of course, have chosen to remain safely in isolation. In making the decision to explain Mormon history to the outside world they have had to confront their own past in entirely new ways. They have done enviable work in establishing themselves, and their field of study as well, within the mainstream of the historical profession. Their work warrants careful and critical reading. The time has come to say, as Jan Shipps has proven, that Mormon history is too important to be left to the Mormons.

Martin Ridge
Huntington Library

Early Mormonism and the Magic World View. By D. Michael Quinn. (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1987. xxii + 313 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. $14.95.)

In recent years Mormon historians and a class of youngish well-educated Latter-day Saints who travel with them have shown an almost fevered interest in the origins and inner person of Joseph Smith, the church's founding prophet. Among other manifestations of this have been outpourings of articles and books about the Mormon prophet and a tendency for the latest point of interpretation or the most recent documentary "find" to occupy center stage at various Mormon history conferences. Often, more prosaic themes went by the board as the prophet cult fed on itself. It may even be said that this phenomenon contributed to the Mark Hoffman forgeries (some of which played directly upon Joseph Smith and magic) and Hoffman's infamous murders as he tried to avoid exposure.

Early Mormonism and the Magic World View perpetuates the preoccupation with the prophet's psyche and continues the tendency to strain the borders of legitimate history that has been so apparent in the recent fascination with Smith. But at the same time it seeks to bring the tools of historical analysis to the study of magic and occultism in early Mormon history. While it is ingenious, suggestive, and in certain respects a pathbreaking study, *Magic* is less successful in other ways.

D. Michael Quinn's introduction states his position as a believing Mormon. It also declares his conviction that magic and the occult were of extreme importance in the "world view" and lives of Smith and other common people of his era. Many made little distinction between religion and magic, although they left much clearer documentary evidence of religion's role. Quinn draws from an abundance of secondary material and employs both "friendly" and

"unfriendly" primary sources. He also uses parallel developments as a methodological and interpretive tool.

In two stage-setting chapters, he discusses the religio-magical heritage of early America and the involvement of early Mormons in water witching, stone peeping, and treasure digging. Then follows a discussion of ritual magic, astrology, talismans, magic parchments and occult mentors. Smith is central, but these chapters range from bible times to recent studies in a barrage of information. Chapter five deals with the role of magic in Smith's early visions and the "coming forth" of the *Book of Mormon*. Chapters six and seven concern the magic world view in Mormon scriptures and the decline of magic after 1830.

Quinn reaches a point of particular interest in chapter five's discussion of the *Book of Mormon*'s forthcoming. While what some Mormon scholars have called "faithful history" is at stake throughout the book, it is particularly an issue in this chapter as Quinn works "friendly" and "unfriendly" sources into an analysis of events with supernatural implications. The point of importance here is the degree to which Smith's interaction with the other-worldly is carried from the realm of testimony, allegation, or polemic into the realm of history. Not only does this chapter reflect Quinn's integrity, but in it the entire book is seen as a courageous attempt to grapple with elements of the human experience that transcend the natural in terms that can be understood naturally.

The burden of proof strains much of the book. Quinn's effort to transpose impulses, fears, habits, superstitions, rituals, talismans, and dimly perceived world views into an articulated argument often sags. The mass of data is sometimes overwhelming and on other occasions is redundant as Quinn uses related sources to deal with narrowly differentiated points. Even more disturbing is his dependence on parallelism. While it seems fair to argue that the occult was more important in the early 1800s than it is now, many of Quinn's parallels leave one thinking Smith *could* have been influenced but not really convinced that he was. His use of "would have been" or "would be" is almost constant. Occasionally he acknowledges that his case is circumstantial or inferential. While this may have cleared Quinn's conscience, it did not change the inferential to something more substantial.

If *Early Mormonism and the Magic World View* moves the history of Mormon beginnings to sounder ground, it will be more because of what chapter five suggests about the application of "faithful history" than for the general persuasiveness of the book's methods and arguments. For all its effort, it does not entirely escape the recent trendiness in Mormon studies.

Charles S. Peterson
Utah State University

Mormon Polygamy: A History. By Richard S. Van Wagoner. (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1986. vi + 307 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. $19.95.)

Several years after rendering his *Reynolds v. United States* opinion, placing Mormon plural marriage beyond the protection of the First Amendment, Chief

Justice Morrison Waite described his decision as a "sermon on the religion of polygamy." The Mormon marriage system naturally evoked homily and emotion. To many nineteenth-century Americans polygamy was a "scarlet whore," one of the "twin relics of barbarism." They read tales and heard lectures of polygamy's supposed excess, made the question a hot political issue, and capped a thirty-year crusade to expunge it with stiff measures that were among the nation's most lamentable invasions of civil liberty.

Given the topic's obvious legal, political, not to mention human and sexual interest, it is a bit surprising that Richard Van Wagoner is the first to attempt a chronological survey of the Mormons' celebrated "peculiar institution." He begins with Joseph Smith's introduction of the system in the 1830s and 1840s, tells of its subsequent "flowering" in the intermountain West, describes the Mormon Church's wrenching abandonment of the "principle" at the end of the century, and concludes with a glimpse of present-day practice, where orthodox Mormons, now turned 180 degrees *volte-face* from their progenitors, embarrassedly ignore or censure the polygamous activity of a scattered bunch of true-believers, the Mormon "Fundamentalists."

Van Wagoner has been industrious. He has mastered a mountain of secondary literature and added some fresh primary research of his own. This he ably presents in a detached, matter-of-fact manner, much as a pathologist might do in performing an autopsy. But when he is done, there is a sense of incompleteness.

Much of the problem has to do with the current state of Mormon historiography, where historians are hard at work, probing, questioning, and testing—sometimes in the manner of exposé. They want hard-nosed, unvarnished, and not necessarily "establishment" truth. However admirable these qualities, they can lead to excess. Van Wagoner's evidence seems repeatedly weighted to the revisionist, with the statements of Mormon dissenters taken at face value and given unqualified sway. Too, his portraits often seem flat and without empathy. The reader will search vainly for a suggestion of Smith's religious dimension. But what is most lacking in the manuscript is a sense of wholeness and meaning. There is no thesis to provide discipline and focus. Promising topics like the relationship of religiosity and sexuality, so often revealed in the rise of new religion, are left unexplored. Equally, while legal and constitutional questions are discussed, treatment seldom exceeds much more than narrative detailing.

Van Wagoner is to be commended for his army of "fact," but illumination comes as data is ordered, balanced, and given interpretation.

Ronald W. Walker
Brigham Young University

Mormon Polygamous Families, Life in the Principle. By Jessie L. Embry. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1987. 194 pp. Notes, bibliography, index. $19.95.)

As long as scholars study Western American and Mormon history, they will continue to confront one of Mormonism's unusual characteristics, polygamy. Since so many laws were passed and so much time was spent defending

the practice, it has always created scholarly interest. Obviously, the splinter factions who still adhere to the principle create tremendous popular excitement.

Jessie Embry has tried a completely different approach than most scholars to that topic. Utilizing the vast collection of oral histories of polygamous children at Brigham Young University, Embry has attempted to view polygamy through the spectacles of the offspring. The Charles Redd Center at Brigham Young University collected the histories between 1976 and 1982, and Embry added these interviews to those of Kimball Young and James Holett, who conducted a series of projects during the 1930s.

From this rich reservoir of primary sources, Embry concludes that Mormon polygamous families were not much different than monogamous families, or even from non-Mormon western frontier families. She argues that stereotypes of oppressed plural wives or even emancipated women are not necessarily true because co-wives did the menial domestic labor. Embry concludes that the polygamy experience was diverse and that individual families responded in different ways.

The diversity causes the author tremendous difficulty that is reflected in her "Table of Contents." There are numerous topics and subtopics that require inquiry, so the volume is divided into a multitude of subheadings that attempt to cover all points. The result is an enticing introduction to polygamy, yet many questions and concerns are unanswered. In reality, each of the well-articulated subtopics deserves a more lengthy treatment.

Perhaps the greatest difficulty Embry faces is the source of her sample. Those who were interviewed had to be elderly at the time of the interview, and they were located, in part, through church sources. Consequently, they had not only lived the principle but experienced it in a twentieth-century post-manifesto mode. The Manifesto of 1890 supposedly outlawed plural marriages, but obviously most people interviewed in the 1970s were post-manifesto babies. This does not negate the significance of Embry's compilation or analysis, but it leaves out a large number of polygamous offspring who viewed the principle with some anger and became disaffected.

The author's demographic analysis makes a considerable contribution when added to other recent studies by Richard Van Wagoner and Michael Quinn. The numerous tables not only document variety, but they raise more difficult questions. It is reality that most polygamous wives were between fifteen and twenty years old regardless of the age of the husband. It cannot be denied that there were numerous plural marriages sanctioned after the Manifesto. Although Embry handles her sources well and the book is a major contribution, she convinces the reader that her conclusions are based on a small sample. Another study may point out both different results and individual impact. This attractive, well-edited volume is an excellent synopsis of how some people say they functioned during polygamy. However, it is certainly not the final scholarly word.

F. Ross Peterson
Utah State University

Tucson: A Short History. By Southwest Mission Research Center. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1986. 152 pp. Illustrations, maps. $12.95 paper.)

Tucson opens with the story of a historical hoax, the Lead Cross Caper, and a curious assessment, both cautionary and celebratory, of the archetypal Tucsonan as a "seeker," a drifter "with expectations beyond reality," a chaser of "chimeras" who stumbles onto the essential Tucson "mystique," an identity as a desert city. However much these attributes typify Tucson the city, they characterize *Tucson* the book.

The book consists of seven chapters of interpretive essays on the Tucson experience; an eighth chapter supplements these with a photo essay. The "crafters" of the book, we are assured, are "all Tucsonan." Inevitably, the essays are uneven, and their ensemble is episodic, often repetitive, but all attempt to capture in an evocative style critical aspects of Tucson history. The essential Tucson that emerges is a desert city, a place of multicultural co-existence, a site with a long, tough history; a survivor. Perhaps, too, a chimera.

This is a book for those who already like Tucson, who want to ensure that vital elements of its past continue to inform its future. *Tucson* ignores the twentieth century, except as a source of disruption through anticipated "huge surges of development." The "short history" is a bit too short. It fails to place Tucson within the contemporary geography of the region, a reasonable expectation. But it is a lacuna that may console devotees of an urban center which, when the book's chronology ends, was the leading city of Arizona, but which has not slipped in population and influence to third.

Tucson concludes with a panorama of the natural environs of the city as seen through the eyes of Juanita, a Tohono O'odham. The Tucson future, it argues, lies in its past. For a city of transients, the book thus serves as a kind of immigrant's guide to that usable past, and the book's revelations, a species of salvage archaeology for cultural history. The apparent limitations of Tucson are assets. Even the Tucson chimera is a part of its vital past.

For anyone who welcomes an informed, if selective narrative history, *Tucson: A Short History* is fun reading and good looking. Like its archetypal resident, it is a seeker—and like its city, a survivor.

Stephen J. Pyne
Arizona State University, West Campus

Invisible Houston: The Black Experience in Boom and Bust. By Robert D. Bullard. (College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 1987. xiv + 160 pp. Illustrations, maps, tables, notes, index. $28.50 cloth, $11.50 paper.)

Robert Bullard is a black urban sociologist at Texas Southern University who seeks to "awaken the South's largest black community to realize its economic and political potential and to take a more active role in the future growth and development" of Houston (13). In the process, he seeks to alert white readers as well to the fact that the benefits of impressive Sunbelt urbanization have not been equally distributed among all races and classes. There remains, even in booming Houston, an "interrelationship between institutional racism,

poverty, illiteracy, unemployment, residential segregation and crime and their impact on the lives of black community residents" (xiii).

Given his didactic intent it is not surprising that Bullard is highly selective in his choice of subjects and interpretation of evidence. His greatest contribution is in providing extensive statistical data on Houston's blacks, especially for housing, the subject of more than half of the book's very brief and poorly written ten chapters. Even here there are limits to the book's usefulness due to Bullard's concentration on the 1970s and 1980s. Thus the book lacks most what a historian might have provided, that is, a sense of development over time. This is not important to Bullard for his theme is that there has been little change for Houston blacks. Yet much of his own evidence suggests otherwise, making the absence of a sustained discussion of past conditions especially crippling. The comparative dimension is also inadequately handled with regard to conditions elsewhere. Tables indicating that Houston blacks are better off than those in most other southern cities are quickly passed over as in Bullard's own admission that "Houston's black community is the most affluent black community . . . in the South" (81).

Bullard's fascination with the lack of progress and the prevalence of institutional racism is partly due to a distorted definition of the black community as "a highly diversified set of interrelated structures and aggregates of people who are held together by forces of white oppression and racism" (4). White oppression and racism, of course, exist throughout the United States and certainly in Houston, but ethnic communities are held together by more than the hostility of others. Yet we hear little of the positive aspects of Houston's black experience. Bullard mentions but either downplays or misses the significance of declining (though still troubling) residential segregation, increased governmental employment, greater suburban migration, notable educational gains, more political participation and officeholders, the absence of a major riot during the 1960s, and so on. There is obviously far more to be done to improve conditions for blacks and other minorities, and that point needs to be made. But a more balanced account is needed to place Houston's black experience in a more meaningful context—both in terms of the past and of contemporary urban America.

Howard N. Rabinowitz
University of New Mexico

An Oklahoma Tragedy: The Shooting of the Mexican Students, 1931. By Abraham Hoffman. (El Paso: Texas Western Press, 1987. xi + 75 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, $10.00 cloth, $5.00 paper.)

On June 7, 1931, three Mexican students attending colleges in Kansas and Missouri set out by automobile to spend the summer at home in Mexico. That evening, as they were stopped at roadside in Ardmore, Oklahoma, they were approached by a couple of Carter County deputy sheriffs. In a matter of minutes, two of the students lay dead, shot by one of the officers who had just driven up.

The story of this incident and its political consequences is told by Abraham

Hoffman in *An Oklahoma Tragedy: The Shooting of the Mexican Students, 1931*. It turned out that one of the students killed was a nephew of Pascual Ortiz Rubio, who happened to be Mexico's president at the time, and the other was from a wealthy Mexican family. The circumstances of their deaths generated tension between the United States and Mexico. As widespread protest over the killings arose in Mexico, the United States faced demands for gestures of remorse and appeasement to a foreign government.

In lean but clear prose, the affair is presented chronologically beginning with the morning the students departed from St. Benedict's College in Kansas. The central figures, including Oklahoma's controversial governor, Bill Murray, are introduced as they originally came into the case. The chapters take us through the scene of killings, the first publicized fears from afar that the officer's actions were racially motivated, the pre-trial hearing, the first trial and acquittal, the subsequent storms of publicity and protest, the second acquittal, and the indemnity the United States finally paid to each of the families of the youths a year and a half after the slayings. The final chapter speculates on some questions in the case that the author says will probably never be satisfactorily settled.

By interfering in the prosecution and immediately suggesting murder, Governor Murray played a key role whipping up bias against the deputies. But Hoffman finds no evidence to support the charge. The tragedy, based on his investigation, is that the shooting resulted from a case of mutual mistaken identity. Fearing a roadway highjacking, which apparently happened quite frequently in those days, the students had pistols handy on the trip. The deputies, meanwhile, already sensitive as a result of recent killings of Oklahoma patrolmen, were on the lookout for a band that had just committed a robbery. The students were apparently compelled to draw guns as they were accosted because in conformity with Carter County regulations at the time, the officers were not required to wear identifying uniforms. Spotting the guns in the hands of the students, the deputy opened up at close range.

Hoffman laments that while the not-guilty verdicts would appear to have been justified, the truth of unfortunate circumstance in the killings had no bearing on the level of national and international relations, with Governor Murray, other American leaders, much of the American press, and all of Mexico charging without evidence that the prosecution was controlled by the Ku Klux Klan. In the jockeying that takes place between states, Hoffman concludes, what really happens in the course of the lives of ordinary people appears to count for little.

The historical contribution of *An Oklahoma Tragedy* is basic and important. Hoffman's examination of the shooting is careful and convincing. One apparent area of neglect, however, concerns Oklahoma's context of race relations. It may have been true that Murray's accusation of Ku Klux Klan involvement in the trials was completely false and self-serving. Still, as the author points out based on his own prior research, the Mexican view of society in the United States, and in this case, was affected by the United States's capricious repatriation program that rounded up Mexicans and Mexican Americans randomly in public places to deport them. By the same token, was there not a particular

circumstance of race and politics in Oklahoma that served as a real backdrop for the governor's charge, outrageous as it may have been in this particular?

Phillip B. Gonzales
University of New Mexico

The Devil's Butcher Shop: The New Mexico Prison Uprising. By Roger Morris. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1983. 268 pp. Illustration, notes, index. $10.95 paper.)

Penology for Profit: A History of the Texas Prison System 1867–1912. By Donald R. Walker. (College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 1988. xiii + 216 pp. Illustrations, notes, tables, bibliography, index. $24.50.)

Rarely does the average citizen have a chance to catch a glimpse of life behind prison bars. With the publication of *The Devil's Butcher Shop*, which examines the 1980 riot in the New Mexico Penitentiary, and *Penology for Profit*, which analyzes the Texas system, however, readers will have an opportunity not only to view this sordid element of society but also witness humanity at its worst. While both these monographs address conditions in prisons and the political apparatus that controls all aspects of incarceration, two very diverse stories emerge. In the end, though, both authors fault state government for abuses of power and failure to ensure minimal and safe custodial care.

Although these books concentrate on different systems and time periods, results and conclusions are the same. Poor management, inadequate training for the staff, no real desire to improve the situation, and inappropriate direction from the state all led to repressive conditions within both institutions. Yet the question remains why one exploded in a violent riot while the other reformed an inherently corrupt and destructive system.

In response to this issue, Roger Morris argues that the state of New Mexico deserves more blame for the riot than the inmates themselves. Indeed, Morris does not hesitate to charge the state government where he says nepotism, malfeasance, and decay in the penitentiary stretched from the judicial system through the executive branch with stopovers in the legislature.

While not denying the existence of these forces, it is difficult to accept Morris' argument completely. Are we to believe the participants in the riot are innocents? Did circumstances beyond their control force convicted murderers, rapists, burglars, drug dealers, and other deviants to engage in a rampage that cost thirty-three lives and millions of dollars damage? The strongest counter to Morris' position of state responsibility emerges in his vivid description of the riot with gory details of lethal, subhuman acts committed solely by the inmates while the state, represented by the governor, police, and prison officials attempted to halt the destruction.

Yet when Morris concentrates on the riot and blames politics as the cause, he chooses to ignore the larger issues. Herein lies the final failure of *Devil's Butcher Shop:* the author ignores comparisons of the New Mexico system with others across the United States. Had Morris broached this topic, he would have found many similarities in penological practices and conditions. In his

conclusion, Morris emphasizes that nothing has changed since the riot because the process of incarceration remains extreme for both guards and inmates. Yet can all this be attributed to the tragic absence of political enlightenment or intelligent leadership? As Morris correctly notes, there is no public policy. But is New Mexico unique?

The answer is no if you read Donald R. Walker closely. Here we find problems that confronted Texas in the 1880s reappearing one hundred years later in New Mexico. Although the fact is overlooked in both books, such problems exist in most state systems. While *Penology for Profit* also faults management as a cause for discord in the institution, the author contends that public concern and national interest in reform eventually prompted changes.

As a focus, Walker concentrates on the leasing of convicts by the state for public and private ventures. In a strikingly cogent argument, Walker reveals that few Texans questioned the idea of employed inmates, few viewed work as a rehabilitative tool, and finally, few concerned themselves with the cruel treatment inmates received. Instead, the conflict centered on whether convict labor would be under the control of the state or private enterprises. Eventually, though, reform did occur in Texas and the hiring out of prisoners ceased. To that end, Walker reveals a debate that existed on two levels: no one wanted prison to be a place of comfort, but many people also realized that because conditions were so horrendous, leasing of convicts had to stop.

Yet for all the negative publicity Texas received in newspaper reports exposing the system, economic realities rather than conscience brought change in the state penal system. As Walker emphasizes, the discovery and extraction of oil in 1901 earned Texas disposable funds for public institutions. In the end, this income allowed Texas to engage in more reforms.

Yet money, whether more or less, does not seem to be the solution to problems in either case. For one point common to both narratives is the lack of public interest in prisons except when riots occur or when newspapers expose horrid conditions. Thus, if the purpose of these books is to inform they have achieved success. Still, one is more inclined to accept the documented approach with *Penology for Profit* for a more complete view of the problems that have confronted prisons historically instead of the sensationalism, innuendos, and accusations of the *Devil's Butcher Shop*.

Judith R. Johnson
Wichita State University

Distant Justice: Policing the Alaska Frontier. By William R. Hunt. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1987. xii + 375 pp. Illustrations, map, notes, bibliography, index. $24.95.)

William R. Hunt chronicles the judicial history of Alaska from the perspective of the personnel that manned this far outpost of the American frontier and those who challenged law and order. Formally organized as a territory in 1884, Alaska's law enforcement and adjudication system endured the hardships of communication and transportation as well as the anti-social behavior of its

sometimes violent population. By statehood in 1959, the transportation revolution of commercial air service and the entrepreneurial bush pilot had eliminated most of the frontier hardships of time and space. Looking back at the judiciary's record in the territorial period, Hunt evaluates its performance positively. Despite examples of corrupt or ineffective men on the bench, Alaska's judiciary was "superior in strength, honesty, and efficiency." So, too, were the U.S. marshals who enforced the law in this frozen and beautiful land and adapted "to the peculiar problems of the frontier."

In his encyclopedic narrative, Hunt artfully introduces us to the notable villains and notorious criminals of Alaska history—Soapy Smith, Ed Krause, Alexander McKenzie, Ed "Frozen Foot" Johnson, Judge Arthur H. Noyse, Fred Hardy, William Demsey, and William T. "Slim" Birch. Charles "The Blue Parka Bandit" Henderson darts across the pages escaping from one jail and another. Alaska also had its colorful characters like Nellie "Black Bear" Bates who beat the law with her wiles and Vuko Perovich who beat the hangman, made a convoluted journey through the legal system, and passed on seventy-two years later as the proprietor of the Golden Rule Barber Shop.

Alaska also had its heroes of the law like Judge James Wickersham who cleared crowded court dockets with Herculean ability and Luke May, "America's Sherlock Holmes," who used science to ferret out the guilty. Other ladies of the night like Black Bear are joined in this book by the less fortunate like Margaret "French Marguerite" Lavor, who had her head bashed in one dark Anchorage night. Alaska also had mysterious characters like Tom "Blueberry Kid" Johnson, Robert Franklin "The Bird Man of Alcatraz" Stroud, the Klutak, the "notorious Indian outlaw" whom Hunt puts in the perspective of times. The characters that graced Alaska's historical stage made the cast extraordinarily rich.

For the reader who enjoys the particular in frontier history, this book will certainly be required reading.

Gordon Morris Bakken
California State University, Fullerton

The Lovelace Medical Center: Pioneer in American Health Care. By Jake W. Spidle, Jr. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1987. xii + 217 pp. Illustrations, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $27.50.)

In a fitting effort to celebrate the sixty-fifth anniversary of the founding of Lovelace Clinic, Jake W. Spidle, Jr., has written a fine history of that institution. Recognized as a leading medical foundation and clinic in the Southwest and the nation, this facility literally grew up with the city of Albuquerque and expanded its scope and services to match the development of the city and its institutions. Thus, in many ways, the story of Lovelace Clinic mirrors the recent history of its host city.

Doctors William Randolph Lovelace and Edgar T. Lassetter founded the clinic in 1922. Both young doctors had come to New Mexico as a last resort to cure tuberculosis. They found the high desert climate suitable for their health and decided to stay. Eventually they met in Albuquerque, pooled their medical

expertise, and established their medical offices based on the group-practice model of the Mayo Clinic in Minnesota. The early practice was devoted to treating the common ills of the local community, although the group practice method was a new concept in the Southwest.

In all likelihood, the Lovelace Clinic would have remained as a very good group practice clinic, but it came into national prominence when Dr. William Randolph Lovelace II, the founder's nephew, joined the staff in 1946. The younger Dr. Lovelace brought a charismatic vigor to the staff that transformed the institution. Fresh from his work at the Mayo Clinic and his military experience in aviation medicine, Dr. Randy Lovelace brought new ideas and interests to the clinic. He capitalized on the post-World War II growth of nearby Sandia Laboratory and Kirtland Air Force Base and concentrated the clinic's efforts on research and development in aviation, space, and bioenvironmental medicine.

Randy Lovelace met an untimely death in 1965, which, for a time, removed the cutting edge from the expansion of the clinic and foundation. Since this brief lull, however, Lovelace Clinic has continued to expand and even anticipate such modern trends in medicine as health maintenance organizations (HMOs). Yet, the recent so-called crisis in the nation's health care system also affected the institution and forced it to merge with the Hospital Corporation of America in 1985.

Spidle's book chronicles the history of Lovelace Clinic from the arrival of its founders in New Mexico through its merger with its new corporate partner in 1985. Readers looking for a critical medical history will be disappointed, for the focus records rather than analyzes the clinic's events and accomplishments. For example, the reader is told that Dr. Ulrich C. Luft joined the foundation staff after building a brilliant record as a young physician-scientist in Germany (pp. 109–10). Dr. Luft specialized in high-altitude respiratory physiology and brought his skill to the clinic in 1953. Since this renowned scientist worked at the foundation for nearly thirty years, one would like to know more about what he accomplished and how his work compared with other leaders in the field. The author does not provide this kind of interpretation. Nor does he offer a comparative analysis of Lovelace Clinic with other similar practices, such as the Mayo Clinic.

On the other hand, those who wish simply to learn about this fine organization will find the volume informative and enjoyable. The author skillfully weaves the development of the institution with the lives of its founders. As a result, the reader senses the energy that Randy Lovelace brought to the clinic when he joined the staff, as well as the tragedy that befell the organization with his death. In short, readers looking for a fascinating historical account of Lovelace Clinic will find this volume useful.

Robert K. Sutton
Arizona State University

Cherokee Renascence in the New Republic. By William G. McLoughlin. (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986. xxii + 472 pp. Illustrations, maps, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $29.50.)

When it began publishing a newspaper in 1828, the Cherokee Nation chose *Phoenix* as the paper's name and used a picture of the mythical bird as its masthead. In this new treatment of Cherokee history during the years between 1789 and 1833, William G. McLoughlin clearly delineates the political, economic, and religious revitalization that made the phoenix a particularly appropriate symbol. In the process, McLoughlin presents an authoritative story of two cultures that were slightly, but tragically, out of step.

This study is a chronological narrative detailing the attempts of the Cherokee people to rise out of the disorder that followed the American Revolution. Abandoned by their defeated British allies, the Cherokees were left divided and dispirited to face the victorious Americans who, through the Treaty of Hopewell, made the Cherokees a dependent nation. Seriously factionalized and unable either to defend themselves from invasive non-Indians or depend upon the fledgling United States government for protection, the Cherokees experienced a period of cultural disorientation that left them with four choices: psychological escape through chronic intoxication; geographical retreat to the western frontier; removal to remote regions of the Great Smoky Mountains; or, finally, syncretization of native with white culture in an attempt to survive with minimal sacrifice and maximum dignity. While some Cherokees adopted each of these courses, McLoughlin concentrates on the fourth alternative and the mixed-blood political elite that engineered a phoenix-like cultural rebirth, from its faltering beginnings through its successful period of unification to its final defeat at the hands of Andrew Jackson.

Useful, significant, and poignant though this narrative is, it is merely a vehicle to illustrate a much larger point concerning the nature of Cherokee and white—or, indeed, of Indian and white—relations during this period. In sketching the history of Cherokee revitalization, the author makes it clear that the mixed-blood leadership was intent upon recasting native culture in a form that would incorporate Enlightenment notions so as to synchronize their society with that of the Jeffersonian America that had created their precarious situation. In this, leaders like James Vann, Elias Boudinot, and John Ridge were very successful, making themselves—and leading their people to be—literate (in either English, Sequoyan, or both), cultured, virtuous, and reasonable. What the Cherokees failed to notice, however, was that the culture they chose to emulate had gone increasingly out of style among white Americans. While Jefferson's followers maintained an Enlightenment tradition in the presidency, the American people were undergoing a revitalization of a sort themselves, abandoning rationalism for the romantic nationalism that would emerge full-blown in the political ascendancy of Jackson. Prepared for the Jeffersonian promise of equal participation in a rational American experiment, reformed Cherokee society and its leaders collided headlong with passionate Jacksonian racialism and Manifest Destiny, leading to the tragedy of removal and the breakdown of the new cultural synthesis. This is, thus, "a study of the rise of

romantic nationalism in America, told in terms of the struggle of the Cherokee people to accept the promise of equal citizenship in the new nation" (xv) and in so being, is an insightful and significant contribution to the fields of both Cherokee history and Indian/white studies.

Christopher L. Miller
Pan American University

The Blackfoot Confederacy 1880–1920: A Comparative Study of Canadian and U.S. Indian Policy. By Hana Samek. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1987. xi + 230 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $27.50.)

In the mid-nineteenth century the four tribes of the Blackfoot Confederacy occupied a huge area about twice the size of New England east of the Rocky Mountains in present-day Montana and Alberta. Sharing a common language and customs, they comprised the most powerful and aggressive Indian alliance on the northwestern plains. In 1855 they negotiated their first treaty with the United States. But twenty-two years later the three smaller tribes, who lived primarily north of the international line, signed Treaty No. 7 with Canada in which they acknowledged their allegiance to the British crown. Two years later the buffalo, which had been their staff of life, was exterminated in their Canadian homeland. During the early 1880s the buffalo were killed off in Montana as well, leaving the Blackfoot tribes on both sides of the border destitute—dependent upon government rations for their survival.

This study seeks to assess the relative success of the Canadian and U.S. governments in their efforts to restore their Blackfoot Indian charges to a condition of economic independence over a period of roughly four decades after the buffalo disappeared from their homeland (1880–1920). Since this has been an ongoing endeavor of both governments for more than a century we may quibble over whether the year 1920 is particularly meaningful in such a comparative study. But surely during the early part of that forty-year period officials on both sides of the line believed that this change could be brought about in even less time. George Bird Grinnell, who knew these Indians rather well, told the Montana Blackfoot (or Blackfeet as they came to be known) in council in 1895, "If you are helped for ten years . . . you will not then want any more help. You will learn to walk alone like the white man; the only difference will be the color of the skin."

In the course of her study Hana Samek has not only read the books and articles touching on Blackfoot relations with both nations, but she has consulted manuscript records dealing with Indian policy in both the U.S. and Canada. She has learned a great deal about Blackfoot-white relations from the white administrators' point of view. I think she might have gained some additional, and possibly unexpected, insights into the Indians reactions to government policies had she devoted some time to talking to elderly Blackfoot Indians about the subject. After all, the 1920s were well within the memories of a number of Blackfoot Indians.

The author considers the general history of Indian policy development in both countries, as well as how those policies were applied to the Blackfoot

tribes in particular. She identifies some of the factors that caused a number of authorities on both sides of the line to express the opinion that Canada did a better job of Indian administration than did the United States. As early as 1876 Canada adopted an Indian Act which spelled out that nation's policy, and then held to it. Meanwhile, U.S. policy was subject to the action of Congress and changed frequently as a result of conflicting pressures upon that body, including those of organized groups of easterners who professed to be friends of the Indians and who were eager to see the formerly nomadic tribes of the West converted to Christianized farmers living much like rural whites. On the other hand Canadian citizens seemed to be content to let the Department of Indian Affairs handle such matters in an inexpensive way.

Samek carefully compares the different ways the two countries handled matters of land policy, evangelization, education, law and order, and welfare on their respective Blackfoot reservations. Even though she found that in some respects one country's policies appeared to be somewhat more effective than the other's, she concluded that in the final analysis both countries failed in their aim of making their Blackfoot charges economically self-sufficient. Like other recent students of the comparative effectiveness of Canadian and U.S. Indian policies she attributes much of their failure to the paternalism that flourished on both sides of the border, and to the fact that the Indians were consulted very little if at all in determining and administering these policies. I would certainly agree.

However, she also believes that better results could have been obtained had more money been spent. Surely. But we should know that even the most dedicated Indian administrators had difficulties obtaining money from a Congress beset by many urgent requests for appropriations. I recall that during World War II Congress told Commissioner John Collier that he must reduce the expenditures of his Indian Bureau. The commissioner then asked each reservation to submit a plan for the systematic reduction of expenses over a ten-year period. Coordinating the *Ten Year Program for the Blackfeet Reservation* became one of my unexpected responsibilities as Curator of the Museum of the Plains Indian on the Blackfeet Reservation. The reservation Social Worker and I first surveyed the population trend on that reservation—which showed that the tribal population was growing at a rate more than twice that of the nation as a whole. We concluded that there was *no way* expenditures in the future could be reduced without seriously curtailing such essential services as health and education, which comprised the lion's share of the reservation's budget.

John C. Ewers
Smithsonian Institution

Western Apache Material Culture: The Goodwin and Guenther Collections. Edited by Alan Ferg. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1987. x + 205 pp. Illustrations, maps, tables, appendixes, bibliography. $19.95 paper.)

Western Apache Material Culture resulted from the relationship between the Western Apache people and three outsiders: pioneering scholar of the Apaches,

Grenville Goodwin (1907–1940); the Lutheran missionary Pastor Edwin E. Guenther (1885–1961); and Guenther's wife Minnie Guenther (1890–1982). Beginning their work in 1910, the Guenthers remained with the Apaches for the rest of their lives. Indeed, Pastor Guenther was formally adopted into the White Mountain Apache tribe, the only Anglo ever so honored.

Goodwin devoted a decade between 1929 and 1939 to the study of the Western Apaches. In fact, it was Goodwin who coined the term "Western Apache" to include the Southern Tonto, Northern Tonto, White Mountain, Cibecue, and San Carlos Apaches. Goodwin determined that these five groups have much more in common culturally and linguistically with each other than they did with other Southern Athapaskan groups.

Goodwin and the Guenthers were active collectors of Apache objects and artifacts. They focused, however, on different aspects of Western Apache material culture, giving their collections a remarkable depth and breadth. The Guenthers gathered contemporary material, often acquiring items "that were newly made at the time they were acquired" (p. 5). Eventually their collection covered a seventy-five year time span:

> Some of the artifacts the Guenthers collected during decades of this century, however, were of types no longer made, used, or in some cases even remembered by the Apache by the time of Minnie Guenther's death in 1982. Thus, the decline of a number of older crafts as well as the evolution of new ones during much of the twentieth century is reflected in the collection.

Goodwin concentrated on objects no longer in use at the time of his fieldwork in the 1930s. Much traditional Western Apache culture remained intact until the end of the nineteenth century, and Goodwin was able to find elderly Apaches who still possessed or knew how to make objects related to the pre-reservation era. Goodwin systematically documented "artifacts no longer in use at the time of his fieldwork and those that were rapidly becoming obsolete" (p. 2). His careful documentation of his collection is a significant part of Goodwin's legacy.

Western Apache Material Culture provides a fine overview of these two collections that represent "Western Apache material culture in a diachronic and complete manner" (p. 8). Essays by Morris Opler, William B. Kessel, Alan Ferg, and Jan Bell further place the accomplishments of Goodwin and the Guenthers in context, and Ferg and Kessel annotate specific pieces in the two collections. This will become the standard volume on the material culture of the Western Apache. The color photographs of the objects are stunning, and I wished there had been more of them. The publisher should have considered issuing a durable hardbound edition because the book will see constant use by scholars of the Apaches.

Joseph C. Porter
Joslyn Art Museum, Omaha

Apache Women Warriors. By Kimberly Moore Buchanan. (El Paso: Texas Western Press, 1986. 56 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $10.00 cloth, $5.00 paper.)

Apache Women Warriors is a monograph uninitiated readers will find interesting. Those knowledgeable about events and people in Apacheria, however, will find it frustrating. The author collected the most readily available materials on Apaches and selected out pertinent information relating to the activities of women in some of the conflicts of the late nineteenth century.

Of the monograph's fifty-two pages, about a fifth is introductory material tracing the outline of Apache culture and history with emphasis on the Chiricahuas. A final short chapter deals with Indian women as warriors in other tribes. References are made to Kutenai, Blackfoot, Ojibwa, Cheyenne, and Cherokee examples. Notes and a three-page bibliography take up another eight pages.

Only half of the monograph, some twenty-six pages, deals with the activities of women as warriors in Apache society. Therein lies the frustration. Drawing on a variety of sources, including Eve Ball's valuable works and experiences, the author attempts to explain the role of women in relationship to war, raid, spiritual power, and family among Apache people.

Kimberly Moore Buchanan also gives the reader very brief biographies of significant nineteenth-century women warriors and shamans such as Ishton, wife and fighting comrade of Juh, the Nednai chief, and Lozen, the war shaman sister of Victorio, the Mimbres war leader. Others mentioned include Gouyen, Dahteste, and the female relatives of James Kaywaykla and Jason Betzinez, gleaned from the men's published accounts of the Apache wars.

The monograph is flawed by its brevity. The subject deserves more thorough research and a longer treatment. As it is, the work will be useful to those only slightly informed on the topic. Others will go directly to the materials from which *Apache Women Warriors* is distilled.

D. C. Cole
Colgate University

Lipan Apaches in Texas. By Thomas F. Schilz. (El Paso: Texas Western Press, 1987. 70 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes. $5.00 paper.)

The author, who has previously published articles and a book dealing with the Texas frontier, again demonstrates his interest in the region with this short monograph. In it he endeavors to trace the history of the Lipan Apaches from the first mention of them in the literature to their military defeat and dispersion in the second half of the nineteenth century.

Early in his study Thomas Schilz presents what is meant to be a summary of Lipan culture. He refers to a class of deities he calls Thunder Beings who, he declares, were the gods of immediate importance to the Lipan. Actually, thunder was only one of many natural forces to which the Lipan looked for spiritual help. Schilz also describes a female deity named White Painted Woman who, he claims, assisted the Lipan in various ways. The Mescalero and Chiricahua worship White Painted Woman, but the name of the comparable female

deity of the Lipan is Changing Woman. Schilz's assertion that Spanish names were adopted by the Lipan because their list of Apache names became exhausted is strange and amusing. A Lipan Apache was named after some physical trait or peculiarity of speech or action, and so there were endless variations from which to choose. Schilz explains similarities between major Lipan and Mescalero religious practices as a result of Lipan borrowings from the Mescalero. In fact, the beliefs in question are a common Southern Athapaskan heritage of both tribes. Schilz does not footnote the portion of his monograph that deals with Lipan culture, so it is impossible to tell the sources of his singular ideas on that subject.

When he moves from attempts to characterize Lipan culture to an account of the successive wars of the Lipan with the Spaniards, Mexicans, and Americans, Schilz is on more solid ground. After the rush of Americans to acquire Texas land began following annexation, the Lipan were doomed. Caught between Mexican and American forces and harassed by the Commanche, they were steadily reduced in numbers and scattered. The tribal history that Schilz traces has a dismal ending, one all too common in American Indian annals.

Morris Opler
Cornell University

I Tell You Now: Autobiographical Essays by Native American Writers. Edited by Brian Swann and Arnold Krupat. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1987. xv + 283 pp. Bibliography. $19.95.)

The title of this volume comes from the last line of the lead essay by Mary Tallmountain, "I tell you now. You can go home again" (p. 13). Eighteen Indians discuss their individual struggles as writers and as Indians. Some of the essays are full of anger and others exude the quiet and determined strength of survivors. Most of the writers grew up entangled by personal circumstances in the machinations of the termination policies of the 1950s. Some were veterans of World War II, Korea, or Vietnam, others endured relocation, and a few have memories of the Indian New Deal and the resulting backlash upon Indian cultural and political sovereignty.

In a literary sense the articulators in this volume describe personal odysseys of self-determination, defining for themselves a way of being at home with their identity as Indian people. Though many have interspersed pieces of their writings to demonstrate how interconnected their work and their lives are, it is the personal journey of each that is most engaging. Most in their expressions find peace with their mixed ancestries, often polluted traditions that must be purified or reinterpreted, or removals from their relatives, ancestors, and sense of place.

The contrasts in voice and rhetoric are refracted into a textured discourse. The editors are sensitive to let the writers speak for themselves. The brief introduction points out how much this volume is part of the historic continuity of American Indian autobiography as a genre. A selected reading list and addresses of serials that publish the authors are included in the volume and help make such literature even more accessible. The work can take its rightful

place in American Indian literature courses as more readers discover the descriptive power of these life stories.

David Reed Miller
Smithsonian Institution

Survival This Way: Interviews with American Indian Poets. By Joseph Bruchac. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1987. xiii + 363 pp. Bibliography. $28.95.)

Anyone interested in contemporary poetry or in contemporary American Indian culture will find *Survival This Way* to be an important volume. Edited by Joseph Bruchac, this book complements his 1983 anthology of Native American poetry. Unlike the earlier work, *Survival This Way* only presents one poem from each author. Through edited interviews conducted by Bruchac, the poets explain their motivation for writing, the sources of their inspiration, and the extent to which their Indian heritage is reflected in their creative output.

A few of the poets such as N. Scott Momaday and Simon Ortiz have already found their national audiences, while younger poets like Diane Burns and Karoniaktitie have only begun to mature. Space is given to both seasoned poets and younger writers. Every author speaks of his or her need for written expression as a function of establishing self-identity as an Indian within the dominant white culture. Native American poetry frequently expresses Indian spiritualism and a deep, profound sense of place. Linda Hogan explains that she began writing poetry because "the split between the two cultures in my life became a growing abyss and they [the poems] were what I did to heal it; to weave it back together." Many of the authors' poems represent points of convergence with their ancestors or grandparents and with myths and traditions sacred to their people and their clans.

Lance Henson explains that some Cheyenne poems deriving from chants are never meant to be published, and Joy Harjo condemns the phenomenon of "The White Shaman" or the white poet replicating versions of American Indian poems based on traditional Indian themes. Maurice Kenny also criticizes poets who are "not really using their own roots." In these interviews the Indian poets proclaim their creative identity, not solely on the basis of their Indian roots, but because they see the present and project the past through a cultural perspective in which time and space are reflected in language—not dominated by it. Though these are separate voices, they often speak as one, and reading a single poem and then reading about the author's personal perspective offers rare insight into the poet's heart.

At times Bruchac leads too forcefully with his interview style. Publishing interviews with twenty-one poets may not be as effective as editing in-depth interviews with a select few poets, but this is undoubtedly a significant book that helps establish a new canon within American letters.

Andrew Gulliford
Western New Mexico University

The New Native American Novel: Works in Progress. Edited by Mary Dougherty Bartlett. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1986. viii + 132 pp. Illustrations. $22.50 cloth, $9.95 paper.)

Tales spun by nine authors, master weavers at fiction's loom, are included in *The New Native American Novel: Works in Progress*. The writers, Native Americans all, are Paula Gunn Allen, Elizabeth Cook-Lynn, Michael Dorris, Louise Erdich, Linda Hogan, Glen Martin, N. Scott Momaday, Louis Owens, and Gerald Vizenor.

This anthology has been expertly compiled with a clear love for the poetry of language by editor Mary Dougherty Bartlett. Newcomers to the world of Native American writing would have been better served, however, had Bartlett fleshed out her two-page preface, which comes across as perhaps too much of an insider's piece.

Singling out one or two pieces in *The New Native American Novel* for special attention in the space allotted here would create an unfair impression about unexamined works. Be assured that each creation displays such an impressive clarity of style, depth of exposition, and inspiring originality that publication of the larger works of which these excerpts are but tantalizing samples is eagerly awaited.

All writers are well-advised to work with material about which they happen to know something. So it is not surprising these selections are bound up in some way with experience in Indian America. Still, one cannot be blamed for wondering when the litmus test of ethnicity will no longer be administered. Have we not arrived at an odd place indeed when authors are described as "Laguna/Sioux/Lebanese-American" or "Choctaw, Cherokee, Irish-American"? What difference does it make and who, really, cares?

If being pointed out as a Native American, American Indian, whatever, focuses attention on the work of a writer deserving recognition, fine. But once that task is accomplished the time comes to remove the crutches of ethnicity. What makes the point important here is the fact that each of the writers featured in this volume richly deserves recognition and praise, utterly without qualification.

In the meantime, *The New Native American Novel* presents offerings by nine gifted writers blessed with a remarkable clarity of vision, sureness of purpose, and creative agility. These are people whose works, even in-progress, are well worth reading. As editor Bartlett points out, this book was compiled "to suggest what the future may hold." Judging by its contents, the future for those of us who enjoy reading enduring works of fiction should be bright as summer's sun.

Ronald McCoy
Paul Dyck Foundation, Research Institution of American Indian Culture, Rimrock, Arizona

The Life and Times of James Willard Schultz (Apikuni). By Warren L. Hanna. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1986. xviii + 382 pp. Illustrations, maps, appendix, notes, bibliography, index, $24.95.)

Biography can provide one of the most important perspectives of history. Placing the accomplishments of an individual into a mainstream of events

establishes the role of that person in the historical process. In this book, Warren L. Hanna offers a historical perspective of the career of James Willard Schultz, a late nineteenth and early twentieth-century western writer.

Born in 1859 into a middle-class family in Boonville, New York, Schultz grew to maturity as an avid outdoorsman. At the age of sixteen he traveled to Fort Benton, Montana Territory, to satisfy a driving curiosity to see the West. The native New Yorker stayed in Montana for the next twenty-six years. He worked as an Indian trader and a hunting guide, but most importantly he developed a consuming interest in the Pikuni band of Blackfoot Indians. He learned their language, accompanied their hunting parties, and married a Pikuni woman.

Schultz's intimate association with these people made possible his career as a writer. *Forest and Stream* published his first article in 1880, and his most successful work, *My Life as an Indian*, appeared in 1907. By cultivating his capacity as a storyteller, Schultz developed a primary readership among young people. He reached his peak of popularity and financial success in the 1920s. Before his death in 1947, he published thirty-seven books and a plethora of short stories, most dealing with topics about native Americans.

Hanna, a retired attorney, attempts to recognize Schultz's accomplishments as an author and to reveal the real person. This approach is certainly appropriate, but the book never quite fulfills its promise. Although the author refers frequently to Schultz as a primary figure in the creation of Glacier National Park and as a champion of Indian rights, he does not adequately establish how influential Schultz's efforts were in these causes. Hanna does not hide personal problems—alcoholism, a contentious second marriage, and financial irresponsibility—but fails to relate clearly the impact of these difficulties upon Schultz's career. The book also suffers from organizational problems because it is arranged both chronologically and topically. However, *The Life and Times of James Willard Schultz* does succeed as a tribute to an important author of a unique genre of the literature of the American West.

William P. Corbett
Northeastern State University, Tahlequah, Oklahoma

Willa Cather in Person: Interviews, Speeches, and Letters. Edited by L. Brent Bohlke. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1986. xxx + 202 pp. Illustrations, index. $17.95.)

The late Brent Bohlke has provided a valuable service for readers of Willa Cather by collecting virtually all of the interviews and speeches and some of the letters of this major American writer. Most of the items included have appeared in print before, but they were widely scattered in time and place; now they are conveniently contained in a single three-part volume. As one might expect, the book also provides, as Bohlke himself says, "a more intimate and impromptu glimpse of the artist." It is not, however, Cather's unguarded, private voice that one hears but rather her less polished public one. Another benefit of this book is that it helps clear away a prevailing misconception: that Cather became a somewhat embittered recluse who tried to avoid publicity

altogether. "[I]n reality," Bohlke says, "Cather remained a public figure, but a more discriminating one in her middle and late years."

As editor, Bohlke has intruded very little upon the material he presents. Besides standardizing orthography and syntax in all cases but one (an interview so inept that it deserves reprinting verbatim), Bohlke's major contribution is to provide a concise historical/biographical headnote to each piece in the book. At least one of these headnotes contains a bit of misinformation, however: contrary to what Bohlke says, Mesa Verde was discovered long before 1882 and not by Richard and Al Wetherill.

Perhaps because it is by far the longest, the first section, "Interviews," is the richest. Although some of the details are erroneous (the errors occasionally perpetrated by Cather herself, by the way), one still finds here a good deal of pertinent information. Readers of this journal will be especially interested in how Cather defends her authority to write about the Southwest. It is interesting, too, to see how consistently Cather was perceived by her interviewers as a serious, gifted, unpretentious writer in control both of herself and her material.

The book does have limitations, but for the most part they stem from problems either inherent in the material itself or created by Cather herself. For instance, most of the so-called interviews are really little more than reports based upon interviews, just as most of the speeches are only second-hand accounts of what Willa Cather said, as she seldom spoke from a complete text that could be reprinted. Like the speeches, the number of letters here is meager but for different reasons: Cather destroyed as many of them as she could, and she inserted a clause in her will that prohibits the publication of and even quotation from any letters not already in print. Evidently, Bohlke did not find all of the previously published letters (see Marilyn Arnold's *Willa Cather: A Reference Guide*, 1986, for a few others), but it is unlikely that anyone could: the sources are often so obscure and unexpected.

As Bohlke says, "Willa Cather was a splendid letter writer," but these few samples merely "whet the appetite" for more. Until the hundreds of others are made available—if they ever are—Bohlke's book will be the closest anyone will come to a collection of the documents of Willa Cather, the person.

David Harrell
University of New Mexico

In the Footsteps of John Wesley Powell: An Album of Comparative Photographs of the Green and Colorado Rivers, 1871–72 and 1968. By Hal G. Stephens and Eugene M. Shoemaker. (Boulder, Colorado: Johnson Books/The Powell Society, 1987. x + 286 pp. Illustrations, maps, tables, bibliography, index. $34.95.)

From Grassland to Glacier: The Natural History of Colorado. By Cornelia Fleischer Mutel and John C. Emerick. (Boulder, Colorado: Johnson Books, 1984. x + 238 pp. Illustrations, maps, charts, bibliography, index. $9.95 paper.)

Grand Canyon National Park: Window on the River of Time. By Tim McNulty. (San Rafael, California: Woodlands Press/Grand Canyon Natural History Association, 1986. 72 pp. Illustrations. $16.95.)

The Colorado River simply exudes romance, tragedy, and history from its turbid and turbulent waters. It is the most talked about and written about river

in the American West. All of this attention underscores its importance. With its origins in the alpine regions of Wyoming and Colorado, it wends its way over two thousand miles, with seven states and two nations siphoning off its invaluable resource. Whatever salt-laden water remains enters the Gulf of California.

As the river curls its way in a generally southwestern direction, it has carved magnificent canyons, canyons that have inspired artists, writers, poets, and photographers. Certainly the photographer Pat O'Hara found inspiration and presents the stunning results in *Grand Canyon National Park: Window on the River of Time,* a photographic journey above and through one of the natural wonders of the world. The book is divided into four parts: an introduction (Footsteps in the Sand); the south rim (The High Desert's Edge); the river (Within Canyon Walls); and the north rim (Mountain Above the Gulf). Turning the pages one senses the immensity of the canyon, and yet, appreciates the diminutive aspects of nature through a close-up photo of an ice design, an Indian Paintbrush, or a Seco Lily.

The narrative to *Grand Canyon National Park* is written by Tim McNulty, described as a writer, poet, and conservationist. Should we expect that such a book will contain much history? No, the human past receives only a momentary glance, one page to be precise. The lack of concern with human activity underscores the fact that this book is impressionistic rather than specific. It is a nature book, and McNulty is comfortable in writing of natural history, describing the changing seasons and the changing moods of the Grand Canyon. Of course, the primary attraction is the photography, and McNulty's narrative is simply frosting for those who wish to partake. The lens tells the story, and it is what catches our eyes, our thoughts, and our emotions. The book is one of the "coffee table" productions that fill the book shelves of the national park visitor centers. It ought to sell well, but it surely will not be as enduring as that which it portrays.

Like *Grand Canyon National Park, In the Footsteps of John Wesley Powell* features photography. To be more precise, however, it is rephotography, comparing the new with the old. Hal G. Stephens and Eugene M. Shoemaker are two geologists captivated by John Wesley Powell's epic Colorado River adventure. In 1967 they proposed to the United States Geological Survey a rephotography project as part of the hundred-year commemoration of Powell's 1869 expedition. On that first watery gamble, of course, Powell and his men did not have the skill, equipment, or time to photograph. The great river canyons of the Green, the Yampa, and the Colorado rivers and the sculpted side canyons would be explored, recorded, and photographed in Powell's 1871–1872 expedition, a less romantic but more scientific undertaking. E. O. Beaman and John K. Hillers dramatized the journey with their photography. Considering the difficulties under which they worked, they produced an exceptional visual record. Stephens and Shoemaker identified 150 of Beaman's and Hillers' camera sites, and have reproduced 110 comparative sets in the book.

The result of their effort is mesmerizing. Comparative photography with a one-hundred-year lapse can not help but capture the viewer's interest. As you turn each page you are caught up in ecological detective work that ferrets out the change. Sometimes it is noticeable, sometimes subtle, and often almost

non-existent. Obviously, Flaming Gorge Reservoir and Glen Canyon Dam have wrought extreme change, making comparative photography impossible. Tamarisk, an exotic bush from eastern Europe, has invaded the river banks. However, as Arizona's ex-governor Bruce Babbitt states in the introduction, "the reassuring testimony of the century of time captured in this book is that the canyons of the Colorado are virtually eternal." The visible change, of course, is mostly man induced. Babbitt has it right when he warns that "the task for us . . . is to keep the works of man out of the process, leaving time and the river to their geological destiny" (p. viii).

Fascinating though *Footsteps* is, it could be more. The shortcoming of the book is its rather myopic view of the meaning of the Powell surveys. The authors use a wide-angle lens to capture the photographic past, but they feel no need for a broad approach to history. For them, the meaning of Powell's magnificent adventure is technical and scientific, not cultural. Both authors are geologists, and with the help of some twenty-five other geologists and scientists they document the geology of the photographs in an understandable and competent fashion. One cannot help but wonder, however, if a humanist or two might not have added perspective. Is it self-serving to suggest that this work would be much richer with the insight of a historian? Would the contribution of Wallace Stegner, William Goetzmann, or Roderick Nash have added breadth and meaning to the scientists' efforts? I think so. *In the Footsteps of John Wesley Powell* as produced is a fascinating exercise. A wider vision on the part of the authors could have produced a work of more lasting value.

It would be convenient to tie in *From Grassland to Glacier: The Natural History of Colorado* with the previously reviewed books, but it strains the imagination to do so. Cornelia F. Mutel's and John C. Emerick's manual has little in common, save the word Colorado and a common appreciation of nature. *From Grassland to Glacier* is intended as a guide to the natural history of the state of Colorado. In efficient fashion, the work examines the location, physical appearance, dominant plants and animals, ecological processes, and use by humans of each ecological zone or unit. In their decision to include human activity, Mutel and Emerick are free to comment on the effect of artificial channelization of streams, overgrazing by cattle, the spread of housing developments, logging, and off-road vehicles. Although they occasionally sound alarms, the authors' criticism of human activities is not severe, rather like a feather than a sledgehammer.

While *Grand Canyon National Park* is a picture book, and *In the Footsteps of John Wesley Powell* is a fascinating rephotography work, *From Grasslands to Glacier* is a layman's guide to Colorado natural history, meant to be slipped into the day pack to enhance a Sunday outing. Each book has its purpose, each will appeal to a different segment of the reading public, and each has made a contribution in its respective genre.

Robert W. Righter
University of Texas, El Paso

Bacon, Beans, and Galantines: Food and Foodways on the Western Mining Frontier. By Joseph R. Conlin. (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 1986. xii + 246 pp. Illustrations, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $27.50.)

The study of Western American history has changed markedly in the last decade. "Real historians," as author Joseph Conlin characterizes them, have begun to explore areas formerly avoided as the domain of anthropologists, antiquarians, and sociologists. Material culture, food and drink, and social customs are slowly and deservedly being recognized as respectable areas of historical endeavor.

Bacon, Beans, and Galantines is a well-researched and interestingly written investigation of the diet of miners during the California Gold Rush. Beginning with the eastern American diet at mid-century, author Conlin argues that Americans were the best-fed people on earth. The average caloric intake was on the order of four thousand calories, much of it corn, potatoes, dairy products, and pork. Farmworkers and laborers burned up far more calories than the sedentary worker of today, who barely maintains his or her waistline on two thousand calories.

Having established the dietary norm for the period, Conlin reviews the suggestions on provisioning made by various emigrant guides. If one followed the advice in these guidebooks to the letter, Conlin found that the average forty-niner subsisted well off an ample three thousand to ten thousand calories per day of biscuits, bacon, beans, dried fruit, coffee, and tea. While some ill-prepared groups ran into trouble because they set off poorly provisioned, quite a few would-be miners ate better on the trail than in California.

Those taking the long sea route to California were less fortunate. Commercial passenger ships often skimped on meals, making a bigger profit at the expense of their passengers' health and stomachs. The best-fed passengers were those who chartered their own ships and provisioned them independently.

Once in California it could be feast or famine, exorbitant or reasonable prices. Initially, prices were outrageous due to scarcity of food and the high rates charged by freighters taking cargo to the mining districts. Soon after a camp was established, however, competition grew, freight rates fell, and the quantity and variety of food increased. Well-to-do miners who were once happy with bacon and beans could now dine on oysters, salads, champagne, roasts, fish, and liqueurs. Larger camps featured lunchrooms, saloons with free lunches, and full-service restaurants—all detailed in this work.

An important contribution is Conlin's examination of various dietary diseases, notably scurvy, which is caused by a lack of vitamin C. Some historians have painted a picture of a frontier continually plagued by the disease. Researching the medical progression of the disease, Conlin discovered it to be slow acting and present only when there was a complete absence of vitamin C in the diet. Scurvy was not endemic on the trail because of the periodic availability of vegetables and fruit. In California, now a major citrus-growing region, the disease was more common because vegetables and fruit supplies were rare in remote areas and because of ignorance about what caused the disease.

Bacon, Beans, and Galantines is a pioneering work in American dietary history and deserves to be read by a wide audience in fields as diverse as history, anthropology, and dietetics.

Byron A. Johnson
Albuquerque Museum

Grand Illusions: History Painting in America. By William H. Gerdts and Mark Thistlethwaite. (Fort Worth: Amon Carter Museum, 1988. 182 pp. Illustrations, notes, index. $21.95.)

What a splendid title for a much needed work on the neglected subject of history painting in America. This book, unfortunately does not live up to its billing. Jan Keene Muhlert's foreword tells us why: "The genesis of these essays lies in a proposal, dating back to 1979, for an exhibition at the Amon Carter Museum on the subject of American history painting. After much preliminary work, the project was reluctantly abandoned because of the unavailability of many of the primary examples that would be crucial for its success."

So, what we have here are three essays relating to a phantom exhibition; a show that never was. Its centerpiece was clearly to have been major works by Emanuel Leutze, establishing, in the authors' view, his pre-eminence in the field of American history painting in the mid-1800s. Paintings by his forerunners and peers, and presumably some of his Teutonic colleagues, would have filled out the rest. The final essay of the book, "The Düsseldorf Connection," would have little relevance, otherwise.

During the period under discussion, history painting was considered the pinnacle of the visual arts. Its subject matter included scenes from literature, mythology and the Bible, as well as the more familiar depictions of historical events and important battles. The themes of these large scale narrative works were meant to be of an uplifting nature, to express national pride, to celebrate the heroic. They also served as vehicles to demonstrate wealth, power and prestige. It is no surprise that in the Old World the patrons for all of this were royalty, government, and church.

In the American colonies, however, for a painter, portraiture was the only game in town. Not until after Yorktown would the execution of such magnificent works become a remote possibility. Even then, these few dreamers were obliged to cross the seas for instruction in London or Paris. They returned with high hopes of patronage and appreciation. They found little of either.

Thus, we follow the progression from Copley and West to Leutze and Homer. The flow is enlivened throughout by quotes from the artists themselves, critics, and contemporary periodicals. The changing perceptions regarding the form are highlighted with engaging (and *uplifting*) tracts from journals such as *Godey's Lady's Book, Port Folio,* and *The Crayon.* Things are seldom dull.

Mark Thistlethwaite gives us a nice running account of the frenetic jockeying involved in the commissioning of the eight 12′ × 18′ history paintings for the Rotunda of the new Capitol. John Trumbull (who served as General

Washington's Aide-de-Camp) got the first four, only to have Virginia Representative John Randolph dismiss his "Declaration of Independence" as a "Shinpiece, . . . for, surely never was there, before, such a collection of legs submitted to the eyes of man." Conversely, Trumbull gives a pithy bit of advice to an aspiring young painter: "You had better learn to make shoes or dig potatoes than become a painter in this country." Considering the many problems in securing eight paintings, it is fitting that while Trumbull's grand display of tibia and fibula was finished in 1818, the last of them, William Powell's "Discovery of the Mississippi by De Soto," was not completed until 1847.

Conversely, the more modest form of genre painting (ordinary folk engaged in everyday tasks) soon outstripped its high falutin' rival in popularity. A feisty young America was looking at itself and liking what it saw. Never overly awed by the posturings of Europe, one suspects that they might have found Peal's "The Roman Daughter" (a buxom signorina breast feeding her pappy) a howler and Vanderlyn's *Marius Amidst the Ruins of Carthage* a bore. The French loved *Marius,* Napoleon wanted to buy it, but the painting did Vanderlyn little good in his subsequent lobbying for a Rotunda panel. It took him over thirty years to nail a commission. Still, the authors assure us, history painters refused to throw in their smocks; they daubed ever onward. Or, at least (according to Thistlethwaite) until 1883, when, presumably history painting died, not with a bang, but with a wimpish competition in Philadelphia. William Gerdts pulls the plug at an even earlier date. In the context of the show-that-never-was, this might have sluiced by. In a book sub-titled *History Painting in America?* I don't think so.

This sudden demise of the very art form under discussion does serve a purpose. It allows Thistlethwaite to make the statement, "Whenever history painting is considered, surely the one image that most immediately comes to mind is Emanuel Leutze's . . . 'Washington Crossing the Delaware.'" This may well have been true if this prickly of all painting forms had given up the ghost before Anheuser-Busch's frontal assault on the collective American consciousness: "Custer's Last Fight." Surely the heady combination of patriotism and serious guzzling rose to new heights; the beer barons made advertising history; the Custer myth went into orbit. When it comes to the Ultimate American Icon, I think Mark might just have the wrong George.

It is to the authors' credit that while they cover much of the same ground, they seldom tread on each other's toes. For the most part, their views are mutually enhancing. Their efforts provide us with a vocabulary helpful in sorting out the vagaries of this difficult art form. They are to be commended, too, for giving us a brief glimpse into the passionate struggle of these early painters who dreamed on a grand scale.

Eric von Schmidt
Westport, Connecticut

Book Notes

Carrizozo Story. By Johnson S. Stearns. (Carrizozo, New Mexico: Johnson S. Stearns, 1987. 131 pp. Illustrations. $10.00 paper.) Copies may be obtained from the author at Post Office Drawer 159, Carrizozo, New Mexico 88301.

Eldorado or Adventures in the Path of Empire. By Bayard Taylor. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988. xxvii + 375 pp. Illustrations, notes, appendix. $9.95 paper.) Reprint of the 1949 Knopf edition, with an introduction by Robert Class Cleland.

Colorado River Country. By David Lavender. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1988. xii + 238 pp. Illustrations, map, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. $11.95 paper.) Reprint of the 1982 edition.

High Sierra Country. By Oscar Lewis. (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 1988. ix + 291 pp. Index. $8.95 paper.) Reprint of the 1955 edition.

Nevadans. By Rollan Melton. (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 1988. xviii + 275 pp. Illustrations, appendix, index. $8.95.) Foreword by Robert Laxalt and portraits by Christine Stetter.

Views of Texas 1852–1856: Watercolors by Sarah Ann Lille Hardinge. By Ron Tyler. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1988. 76 pp. Illustrations, notes, index. $19.95 paper.)

Ethnicity & Assimilation: Blacks, Chinese, Filipinos, Japanese, Koreans, Mexicans, Vietnamese, and Whites. By Robert M. Jiobu. (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1988. xiv + 269 pp. Charts, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $48.50 cloth, $16.95 paper.)

Dreamers & Defenders: American Conservationists. By Douglas H. Strong. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988. x + 295 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. $26.95 cloth, $9.95 paper.) Reprint of the 1971 edition.

Clarence King: A Biography. By Thurman Wilkins. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1989. xiii + 524 pp. Illustrations, map, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth, $16.95 paper.) Revised and enlarged edition of the 1958 Macmillan publication.

The Trampling Herd: The Story of the Cattle Range in America. By Paul I. Wellman. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988. 433 pp. Illustrations, map, index. $10.95 paper.) Reprint of the 1939 edition.

Pony Trails in Wyoming: Hoofprints of a Cowboy and U.S. Ranger. By John K. Rollinson. Edited by E. A. Brininstool. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988. 425 pp. Illustrations, map, index. $29.95 cloth, $11.95 paper.) Reprint of the 1941 edition.

A Tenderfoot Bride: Tales from an Old Ranch. By Clarice E. Richards. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988. 226 pp. Illustrations. $18.95 cloth, $6.95 paper.) Reprint of the 1920 edition with an introduction by Maxine Benson.

The Bullwhacker: Adventures of a Frontier Freighter. By William Francis Hooker. Edited by Howard R. Driggs. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988. xxi + 167 pp. Illustrations. $5.95 paper.) Reprint of the 1924 edition, with a new introduction by David Dary.

Indians, Infants and Infantry: Andrew and Elizabeth Burt on the Frontier. By Merrill J. Mattes. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988. v + 304 pp. Illustrations, map, notes, index. $8.95 paper.) Reprint of the 1960 edition.

Gunner Jingo's Jubilee. By Thomas Bland Strange. (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1988. xix + 546 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes. $14.95 paper.) Military memoir of the Canadian North West Rebellion, originally published in 1893.

Family Farming: A New Economic Vision. By Marty Strange. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988. xi + 311 pp. Charts, tables, bibliography, index. $18.95.)

The Last Chance Canal Company. By Max R. McCarthy. (Provo, Utah: Charles Redd Center for Western Studies, Brigham Young University, 1987. ix + 131 pp. Illustrations, maps, table, notes, bibliography. $6.95 paper.)

Instant Cities: Urbanization and the Rise of San Francisco and Denver. By Gunther Barth. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1988. xxix + 310 pp. Maps, notes, bibliography, index. $12.95 paper.) Reprint of the 1975 edition, with a new preface by the author.

Extending the Rafters: Interdisciplinary Approaches to Iroquoian Studies. Edited by Michael K. Foster, Jack Campisi, and Marianne Mithun. (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1984. xvi + 422 pp. Illustrations, maps, charts, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $56.50 cloth, $19.95 paper.)

Wild Rice and the Ojibway People. By Thomas Vennum, Jr. (St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 1988. ix + 357 pp. Illustrations, map, chart, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth, $14.95 paper.)

Hasinai: A Traditional History of the Caddo Confederacy. By Vynola Beaver Newkumet and Howard L. Meredith. (College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 1988. xvi + 144 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. $16.95.)

To Honor the Crow People: Crow Indian Art From the Goelet and Edith Gallatin Collection of American Indian Art. Edited by Peter J. Powell. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988. 48 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography. $18.95 paper.)

Yellow Sun, Bright Sky: The Indian Country Stories of Oliver La Farge. Edited by David L. Caffey. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1988. 212 pp. Notes. $22.50 cloth, $12.95 paper.)

Wind from an Enemy Sky. By D'Arcy McNickle. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1988. 265 pp. Notes. $9.95 paper.) Reprint of the 1978 edition, with an afterword by Louis Owens.

Mezcal. By Charles Bowden. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1988. xi + 152 pp. Illustrations, $19.95.)