New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 60 | Number 4 Article 7

10-1-1985

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr

Recommended Citation
. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 60, 4 (1985). https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol60/iss4/7

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in New Mexico Historical Review by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

BOOK NOTES

State Maps on File, available from Facts on File, 460 Park Avenue South, New York, N.Y. 10016, is a customized guide expressly designed for easy study and photocopying. Divided into seven geographical sections, each volume includes an average of twenty maps per state covering politics, environment, natural resources, economics, demography, transportation, physical geography, weather, energy, and history. Organized in O-ring binders, the volumes are customized to each state's requirements for teaching state history and offer advantages for photocopying that standard atlases lack. The seven-volume set is available for $250.00; individual volumes are $55.00.

During the last several years the University of Arizona Press has reprinted a number of southwestern classics, but none has been as beautifully done or as significant as the new printing of Herbert E. Bolton's *Rim of Christendom: A Biography of Eusebio Francisco Kino, Pacific Coast Pioneer* (cloth $40.00). Bolton was fascinated with Kino, the padre on horseback, and dealt with his life in previous studies. He found Kino's manuscripts in Mexican archives and discovered related materials in other repositories and then traced the travels of the explorer, missionary, and cartographer. *Rim of Christendom* remains the standard biography of Kino and is augmented by a new introduction by noted Borderlands scholar John Kessell.

An important book of a different type is *Native American Periodicals and Newspapers, 1828–1928: Bibliography, Publishing Record, and Holdings* (Greenwood Press, cloth $49.95). Compiled by Maureen Hady, edited by James Danky, and with a foreword by Vine Deloria, Jr., this large reference work will be of invaluable assistance to scholars as well as to Indian people. Sections of the book describe indexes used in compilation of the volume, sources for the purchase of microfilm, and a guide for users of the bibliography. More than 1100 titles are listed alphabetically, each with location sources, beginning and ending dates of publication, names and tenures of editors, subject focus, and languages used other than English. There are subject, editor, geographic, chronological, catchword, and subtitle indexes.

Interpreting the Indian: Twentieth-Century Poets and the Native Americans by Michael Castro (University of New Mexico Press, cloth $22.50) deals with the use of Native American themes by American poets in this century and identifies the longing to be an Indian as a major tradition in American poetry. Castro discusses early popularizers and anthologizers, including Mary Austin, and moves on to Lew Sarett, and John Neihardt, Charles Olson, and Jerome Rothenberg, concluding with a chapter on the emergence of Indian poets in the 1970s. This is an interpretive study of poets and their work with excerpts from selected poems.

Several new reprints will be of interest to western historians. *Longhorn Cowboy* by James H. Cook (University of Oklahoma Press, cloth $14.95) was first published in 1942. This new printing includes a foreword by Donald E. Worcester. It is an autobiographical account that complements Cook's *Fifty Years on the Old Frontier.* Joining a cattle drive in 1872 at the age of fifteen, Cook went up the trail five times. In 1882 he helped an English friend establish a ranch near Silver City, ultimately selling his interest and moving to Nebraska where he discovered the fossil quarry that today is Agate Fossil Beds National Monument.

The University of Arizona Press continues to reprint the work of Dane Coolidge, early twentieth-century writer and photographer. *California Cowboys* (paper $7.95), first published in 1939, is a collection of stories about the cattle business and cowboys and vaqueros in California, Arizona, and Mexico.

The Cowboy Hero: His Image in American History and Culture by William Savage (University of Oklahoma Press, paper $7.95) was first published in 1979. Savage deals with images and popular culture and discusses Wild West shows and early cowboy hero William Buck Taylor, rodeo, film, and music. He also demonstrates how the cowboy image has been used to sell merchandise.

Two publications are available from the Center for Anthropological Studies in Albuquerque. *Spanish Colonial Frontier Research,* compiled and edited by Henry F. Dobyns (paper $14.00 plus handling), is a collection of ten essays by numerous scholars, including Dobyns, anthropologists Charles Fairbanks and Raymond Willis, and John Van Ness of the Center for Land Grant Studies in Santa Fe. The emphasis is archaeological with four essays on the eastern Borderlands, one on the Caribbean, and one each on New Mexico, Arizona, and California. The essay by Van Ness is on the Polvadera Grant. *Forgotten Places and Things: Archaeological Perspectives on American History* (paper $26.00 plus handling) is edited by Albert Ward. It consists of forty papers presented at the meeting of the Society for Historical Archaeology; topics range from the general to the specific. The geographical range is from Maine and Virginia to Alaska, but several articles relate specifically to the West and Southwest with discussions of railroad sites, logging camps, and David Brugge's essay on Navajo activity areas.

Readings in Latin American History is a two-volume collection (each $32.50 in cloth and $14.75 in paper; Duke University Press) edited by John J. Johnson, Peter Bakewell and Meredith Dodge, each of whom was associated with the *Hispanic American Historical Review* during the time that that journal was located at the University of New Mexico. Johnson, a distinguished Latin Americanist and esteemed colleague, served as editor. The essays in these volumes were selected as representative samples of the best articles published in the past fifteen years and to illustrate trends in Latin American history. The volumes should be of particular value to students.

Book Reviews

THE GALAZ RUIN: A PREHISTORIC MIMBRES VILLAGE IN SOUTHWESTERN NEW MEXICO. By Roger Anyon and Steven A. LeBlanc. Albuquerque: Maxwell Museum of Anthropology and University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. xi, 612. Illus., references, appendixes. $35.00 paper.

THE GALAZ RUIN, located in the Mimbres River Valley of southwestern New Mexico, has long been known as a large Classic period Mimbres site from which was obtained a rich assortment of more than 800 Mimbres bowls, examples of perhaps the most widely known prehistoric art form in the United States. Recent investigations there by the Mimbres Foundation, and reevaluation of the data and collections obtained by the Southwest Museum and the University of Minnesota during their pioneering excavations between 1927 and 1931, however, have revealed that the village had a lengthy occupation (c. A.D. 550–1350) extending before and after the Classic Mimbres period (c. A.D. 1000–1150), and that the significance of the site goes well beyond its importance as the source of an important pottery collection.

This comprehensive and profusely illustrated site report is unlike the conventional findings of most field programs. It combines the results of a modern salvage archaeological effort, conducted while commercial looters were actually destroying part of the site, with innovative archival work, artifact analysis, and examinations of collections, field notes, and catalogues in museums where earlier researchers had deposited their Galaz materials. The authors attempt to bring together in this volume all extant data about the ruin, interpreting the earlier work in light of current understanding of the Mimbres. This project was no easy task, but it has been accomplished in fine style and in a manner that is both general in nature and attractive to the public and in which the technical details of the site are made available to professional archaeologists.

For those who need a review of southwestern archaeology, and the position, characteristics, and importance of the culture that flourished for a time along and about the Mimbres River, there is a synopsis of previous research in the region that led to the inclusion of that portion of New Mexico as part of the Mogollon culture, one of the three major cultural entities in the Southwest—the other two being the Anasazi and Hohokam. The Mimbres culture is considered a regional specialization of the Mogollon sequence that has been divided chronologically into Early Pithouse, Late Pithouse, Classic Mimbres, and Postclassic Mimbres periods.

At the Galaz Ruin, the early expeditions from the Southwest Museum and the University of Minnesota dug a number of pithouses and cleared several room clusters of two superimposed pueblos that rested upon the earlier abandoned

subterranean dwellings. In modern terminology, the pithouses were of the Late Pithouse period, and the two pueblos may be assigned to the Classic and Postclassic Mimbres periods respectively. Primary objectives of the first diggers were to recover a large collection of Mimbres bowls, but they also kept records of their fieldwork and catalogued the specimens collected. Fortunately, the collections and related documents were curated in museums of the two institutions.

During the years between 1931 and 1975, when the Mimbres Foundation undertook limited controlled excavation at Galaz, pothunters practically destroyed the site, seeking the highly marketable pottery hidden beneath its surface. The Classic and Postclassic Mimbres pueblos had succumbed to the shovels and mechanical earthmoving equipment of the looters, leaving only a few peripheral areas of the site undisturbed. In those locales, which contained some Late Pithouse period structures, the Mimbres Foundation conducted its excavations for two seasons.

The unreported findings of the two expeditions of six decades ago are blended with those of the recent salvage activities to the extent that the earlier, sometimes incomplete, notes will allow. The resulting report contains detailed descriptions and discussions as well as numerous tables, charts, and appendixes concerning Galaz architecture, ceramics, burials, floral and faunal remains, and stone and bone artifacts. Many sections have succinct summaries suitable for the lay reader.

The authors evaluate the archaeological and ecological evidence in reference to settlement patterns, subsistence, trade, and interaction. The place of the Galaz community within the Mimbres region and probable causes for the collapse of the Classic Mimbres also are set forth. Of particular importance to anyone interested in the artistic accomplishments of the ancient Mimbreños is the appendix presenting photographs of all the complete painted vessels and a selection of the unpainted ones excavated at the Galaz site—a total of 887 specimens. How many more pothunters removed is unknown.

The thorough documentation of the Galaz Ruin finally confirms a long-held notion that it was once among the most significant villages in the Mimbres Valley. Understanding what took place there contributes immensely toward comprehending the Mimbres as a whole.

Arizona State Museum, University of Arizona ROBERT H. LISTER

DINÉ BAHANE': THE NAVAJO CREATION STORY. By Paul G. Zolbrod. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. xi, 431. Bibliog., notes. $29.95.

THAT THERE IS BEAUTY IN MUCH THAT pertains to the Navajo religion is a fact Navajos themselves not infrequently observe. There is artistry in the drypaintings, costuming, and rock art; music in the songs and chants; poetry in the prayers and litanies; and, finally, a narrative power in the myths and legends that is easily lost in any translation. Zolbrod has succeeded in rendering a reflection of that power into English.

His newly published version of the Navajo creation story is based primarily on the version Washington Matthews published in 1897, but it also integrates portions of other early recorded versions where incidents not included by Matthews appear of sufficient importance that Zolbrod thinks they are needed in order to achieve his purpose. This purpose is to present a text that has aesthetic merit, or, as he states the matter, that can be viewed as poetry.

While some Navajos regard the religious traditions of their people as symbolic, many others are fundamentalists in their beliefs. They not only hold these traditions sacred, but see them as literal truth. That there are differing versions is a matter for Navajo theologians to resolve, should they feel the need to attain a strict consistency. Zolbrod treats the text as literature and gives emphasis to style, allowing the impression that for the Navajos, the account is a story that can be adjusted rather freely to the interests of a narrator and his audience.

Whether Zolbrod's approach has resulted in a hybrid version that few Navajo singers would accept or a congruent melding of compatible elements is beyond my ability to judge. As a text that will provide a readable version for the nonspecialist who wants an understanding of the basics of Navajo religious thought, however, this book has much to recommend it.

Despite his concern for aesthetics, Zolbrod has not abandoned scholarship, and he gives justification for his decisions, identifies the sources of insertions, and provides ample comparative references, as well as discussions of significant terms and concepts. His presentation of the Navajo terms for many proper nouns is especially welcome, for mere translations can be misleading. Use of the Young and Morgan orthography will make these terms accessible to anyone willing to use a modern Navajo-English dictionary.

Appreciation of the arts of another culture can be the first step toward an understanding of that culture, but it is no more than a beginning in what can become a long journey. Beauty is only skin deep, it is said. *Diné bahane'* is an excellent introduction to the Navajo sacred literature, but for the unwary reader it can be a deceptively simple view of what is actually a very complex subject. It also provides leads in its notes and bibliography for a deeper understanding, leads that are well worth following for those who want more than a first impression. I have one final quibble. This book deserves an index.

Albuquerque DAVID M. BRUGGE

NAVAJO COYOTE TALES: THE CURLY TÓ AHEEDLÍINII VERSION. By Father Berard Haile, O.F.M. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1984. Pp. vi, 146. Illus. $17.95 cloth; $8.95 paper.

IN THE SOUTHWEST, coyote is a household word. He appears as protagonist in countless tall tales, poems, and paintings. He is elusive and wary; frequently heard, but rarely seen. His haunting cry punctuates the tranquil night with mockery. He captures our imagination and arouses our fantasies. His stories

delight and provoke us. The genre invites comparison with the familiar Br'er Rabbit parables of our childhoods.

While the antics of coyote thus have universal appeal, among the Navajo, the role of coyote transcends mundane chicanery. Hence the publication of the Curly Tó Aheedlíinii version of Navajo coyote tales provides a new and rich source of information that not only illuminates Navajo world view, but also substantiates the salient principles of symbolic inversion. Although the Navajo coyote frequently appears in the familiar guise of trickster, many of his adventures occur in mythological times where his alliance with supernatural beings places him in sacred context. When he reverses the order of the universe and abrogates sanctioned moral values, coyote provides a dialectical tool for analyzing and restoring an ordered universe. Since balance, order, and harmony are fundamental precepts of Navajo metaphysics, coyote defines the ideal universe by his ingenious deviations from it. Although the book is divided into sections that chronicle a series of related misadventures, the entire work can be viewed as a metaphorical cycle of anarchy and restoration. When coyote courts chaos, he not only dramatizes the dangers, uncertainties, and contradictions inherent in life, he also creates an opportunity for renewing the norm. He is the sacred clown incarnate; a symbolic rebel with a cause.

The intervention of supernatural beings in the frequent occurrences of coyote's death and salvation constitutes an embellishment that is distinctively Navajo. Navajo ceremonies are predicated upon inferential principles of reciprocity in which the assistance of the supernaturals is enlisted to restore and maintain individual and collective harmony. Furthermore, the participatory role of the supernaturals is integral to the regeneration of the cosmos in general and the Navajo people in particular. Thus the relationship between coyote and the supernaturals reflects a fundamental axiom of the Navajo belief system.

In his introductory essay editor Karl Luckert, a professor of religious history, discusses Navajo coyote tales within theoretical and historical contexts. While Luckert's theoretical posture may provoke controversy, his comments nonetheless provide an interesting point of departure for the reader's adventures with coyote. The seventeen stories that follow were collected by Father Berard Haile, O.F.M., during the 1930s. Fr. Haile spent fifty-four years on the Navajo Reservation at the Franciscan Mission at St. Michael's, and his prolific contributions to Navajo linguistic and mythological studies have received wide recognition. The publication of *Navajo Coyote Tales* constitutes another significant addition to the constellation of his achievements. It is to be hoped that any future publications based on Fr. Haile's research will contain more comprehensive information concerning the life and work of his important scholar of Navajo culture.

The bilingual format of *Navajo Coyote Tales* contributes to the educational value of this publication. The inclusion of a Navajo text not only honors the cultural significance of the native language, it also has instructive potential for Navajo and Anglo students of linguistics. Father Haile would have approved.

Wheelwright Museum SUSAN BROWN MCGREEVY

MINERS OF THE RED MOUNTAIN: INDIAN LABOR IN POTOSÍ, 1545–1560. By Peter Bakewell. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. xvi, 213. Illus., bibliog., index. $19.95.

DESPITE ITS IMPORTANCE IN WORLD ECONOMIC HISTORY, the South American silver mining center of Potosí has been little studied. This oversight is not due to any lack of sources; far from it, for the archives of Europe and America are filled with records about the world's most important source of silver in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Thus the research project begun on Potosí in 1970 by Peter Bakewell, an expert on colonial Mexican mining, is an important endeavor, the results of which have been a series of original essays on the technology of mining, the levels of refined silver output and local entrepreneurship, and now this impressive and elegantly written book. In a bold effort, he takes on the difficult and much debated issue of Indian mine labor in the first century of exploitation. This subject has aroused fierce controversy over the last two centuries, from liberal and conservative historians of the nineteenth century to the most recent Marxian interpretations. The forced drafting of Indians (in the so-called *mita*) for use in these mines has been the basis of both an anti-Hispanic Black Legend and questions as to the capitalist or "feudal" nature of the mining industry.

Bakewell's careful reconstruction of labor arrangements and their changes over time is an original and extraordinarily important work that in turn opens up new sets of issues for debate. He begins by downplaying the role of Viceroy Toledo, who is traditionally seen as the cold-blooded autocrat uniquely responsible for the creation of the mita system. Draft labor existed from the beginning and was sporadically used in the twenty years prior to the mita decree of Toledo in 1572. The viceroy was always ambivalent about the system and sought to guarantee Indian initiative. Although his introduction of mercury amalgamation in place of wind-driven smelters wiped out Indian domination of the refining process, Toledo attempted to assist Indians who wanted to shift into the new amalgamation process and also legislated in favor of Indian entrepreneurs who had traditionally rented the mines from the Spanish owners and brought in their own wage labor gangs.

While Bakewell finally provides as definitive answers as possible on the long-debated questions of the wages, working times, and conditions of the *mitayos* (or workers in the mita draft), his most original contributions deal with the free-wage laborers who have been almost totally ignored in the literature. These include the free Indians who had no ties to the communal kin groups (the so-called *yanaconas*) and the mitayos who worked during their so-called rest period (*de huelga*). These wage laborers, generally called *mingas*, numbered more than one-half the local silver industry work force by the beginning of the seventeenth century. They were the most skilled workers in the mines and dominated the refining labor force and were the highest paid Indian workers, being the only ones to receive a free market wage. All of these findings, as Bakewell clearly recognizes, significantly change the prevailing view on the Potosí Indian mine labor question.

Having resolved so many thorny issues, Professor Bakewell's work inevitably raises many new ones that are not fully resolved. For example, his explanation of the disappearance of the yanaconas and the Indians who rented mines (*indios de varas*) in the last quarter of the sixteenth century is not convincing. Surely the mines still offered considerably more profit than any farming activity in this period, and the cause for their disappearance probably has more to do with a new aggressiveness and higher capitalization of the Spanish mine owners who finally decided to utilize fully their own mines. His discussion of the decline of the mita draft in the seventeenth century is a bit too biased by the Potosí materials he uses. Recent scholarship has stressed a more complex view from the originating communities, and these new findings are not fully incorporated into his own rather hasty discussion of the seventeenth-century decline. He also never fully decides whether the communities of the seventeenth century were still required to pay for the total number of Indian mitayos listed in the original drafts of the 1570s, or if the continuing decline in actual workers was also reflected in a decline in substituted workers or payments. My impression is that both actual workers and payment for replacements effectively declined, which would challenge some of the author's conclusions about transfers of capital from rural to mining activities.

Having unraveled complex and often ambiguous documentation and guided us judiciously through the morass of conflicting information, Peter Bakewell has also raised new and important issues that will have to be explored further. There is little question, however, that he has produced a classic work that will define the field for many years.

Columbia University HERBERT S. KLEIN

CARL GORMAN'S WORLD. By Henry and Georgia Greenberg. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. 195. Illus., bibliog., index. $45.00.

CARL GORMAN'S LONG AND DIVERSE CAREER as a Navajo artist and leader offers rich potential for biography. Born in 1907 to Nelson and Alice Peshlakai Gorman, Carl grew up in a family that valued education and operated a successful trading post and ranch at Chinle, Arizona. Resisting the harsh discipline of mission school, Gorman spent a week in a detention cell, and, along with a young uncle and a brother, he ran away and returned home. He later completed his education at Albuquerque Indian School.

Afterward, Gorman returned to his father's ranch. At the age of twenty-two, he married a young, educated Navajo, and the following year the couple became the parents of Rudolph Carl Gorman, perhaps the most renowned Indian artist of this generation. Carl supported his family, soon increased by two additional children, by driving a truck, bootlegging, and interpreting for the government during the New Deal era.

Enlistment in the Marine Corps as a Navajo Code Talker early in World War II led to several important changes in Gorman's life. He first entered combat at Guadalcanal in 1942 and remained until late in the war when hospitalized for

malaria. His first marriage ended in divorce in late 1944 when Gorman came home on furlough. After World War II, Gorman fulfilled a long-standing interest by attending Otis Art Institute in Los Angeles from 1947 to 1951.

Since the latter date, Gorman has pursued a highly diverse career. He worked many years as a technical illustrator, continued to study art at night, remarried, and started a second family. Gorman also began to exhibit his work, sometimes jointly with his oldest son, R.C., whose own art career flourished in the 1960s. In 1964 Gorman returned to the reservation as director of the Navajo Arts and Crafts Guild, and two years later the tribal government hired him to compile an oral history, a project terminated before its completion. Gorman then taught art and Navajo history and culture at the University of California at Davis until 1974 when he returned to the reservation to compile a catalogue of Navajo herbs and plants and to encourage the integration of Navajo and white medicine.

Although the authors provide an interesting outline of Gorman's career and often deal effectively with his personal life, they have not fully realized the extraordinary potential of their subject. Because of their lack of a detailed knowledge of Navajo history and culture, the Greenbergs have not always adequately treated the complex relationships between Gorman and his "world," and, for the same reason, numerous factual errors and misinterpretations plague their narrative. Their discussion is similarly weakened by a romantic viewpoint that either ignores or deals superficially with important phases of Gorman's life. Perhaps most frustratingly, the authors give too little attention to his artistic career, what influences shaped his work, and how his contributions fit into the general development of Indian art since the 1940s.

Esthetically, *Carl Gorman's World* is a superior work. An abundance of photographs of Gorman and his family and several excellent color reproductions of his art accompany the text. The book is nicely printed on good quality paper, and the layout and binding are both attractive. It is unfortunate, however, that the editors were not equally painstaking in reviewing the biographic content.

Purdue University DONALD L. PARMAN

SOUTHWEST INDIAN DRYPAINTING. By Leland C. Wyman. Santa Fe: School of American Research, 1983. Pp. xxiii, 320. Illus., notes, references, index. $55.00.

INASMUCH AS LELAND C. WYMAN'S CONTRIBUTIONS to the ethnology of the Navajo Indians are all landmark achievements and well known, a reviewer of his magnum opus may be forgiven if he departs momentarily from the detached style to which academicans are accustomed. It is difficult to reflect on this book without being affected by personal reminiscenses. *Southwest Indian Drypainting* was already in the making when this reviewer first met Wyman, fifteen years ago; it has been the object of discussions at every meeting since then. Finishing and seeing this work through the publishing process became the hope to which the author and his mate clung for more time together. It became a race against time that only he won, as a lonely man. Readers who have become accustomed to receiving new

Wyman books periodically and this reviewer, who tried to cheer him on to undertake yet another project on Navajo ceremonialism, have to realize that *Southwest Indian Drypainting* will be the author's last.

Even though Wyman's fascination for his subject matter clearly transcends ethnic boundaries, his work focuses for the most part on the drypainting of the Navajo Indians. For the student who wishes to expand beyond Wyman's primary focus area, the author offers as starting points for comparison the drypainting traditions of the Apache, Pueblo, Papago, and southern California Indians. In "Appendix A" Wyman offers an invitation to a larger journey of worldwide scope and comparison.

The reader who is initially attracted to this volume for its handsome format, or for the quality of its illustrations, is in for an additional surprise. The southwest Indian art style that the author discusses as "drypainting" and that others have explained as "sandpainting" reaches far beyond the realm of aesthetics. In Navajo Indian culture the technique of drypainting overlaps and blends with medical and religious practices. The world at large in which sickness occurs, with all its overpowering and greater-than-human dimensions, is reduced in drypainting to more manageable miniworlds of symbolic presences. Cosmos (order) is thus imposed on chaos by Indian drypainters who, by aesthetically reconciling their worlds, make visible their goodwill for harmonious order, health, and wellbeing. Wyman is sensitive to the psychological and religio-cosmic dimension in which southwest Indian drypainting happens. At many points in this book, where less disciplined writers would have settled for leaps into vagaries and aesthetic abstractions, Wyman provides well-defined ceremonial action patterns and specific links with native mythology—i.e., with native theory and meaning.

This book stands as the crowning achievement—nay, a celebration—of a productive scholarly life that has been dedicated to the twofold task of understanding *Homo sapiens* scientifically as well as humanistically. How much easier and better the fieldwork of students of Navajo ceremonialism could have been—so this reviewer reflects on his labors and on the labors of others—if *Southwest Indian Drypainting* had been in our hands before we started.

Southwest Missouri State University KARL W. LUCKERT

THE SHOSHONI-CROW SUN DANCE. By Fred W. Voget. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1984. Pp. xix, 348. Illus., maps, bibliog., index. $19.95.

THE CROW INDIANS OF MONTANA, like other plains tribes, traditionally performed the Sun Dance as one expression of their religious life. Unlike the Sun Dance of other tribes, that of the Crow focused on warfare: the ceremony was initiated by a man's vow to avenge the death of a relative, and the dance itself was the first step in forming a warparty to attack the enemy. Associated with the buffalo and with seasonal renewal, the Sun Dance nonetheless hinged on the revenge vow and was therefore not necessarily an annual event. The suppression of intertribal warfare by the U.S. government effectively ended the Crow Sun Dance, with the last ceremony taking place about 1875.

According to tradition, the Crows had given the dance to the Kiowas, and they in turn, through a Comanche intermediary, had passed it to the Wind River Shoshones. Among the Shoshones the dance became institutionalized as an expression of traditional faith. Shorn of its association with revenge, the ceremony came to center around healing. In 1941 the Sun Dance went full circle when the Crows borrowed the ceremony back from the Shoshones and reintegrated it in its new form into social and religious life.

Voget's book begins with a synopsis of Crow history, culture, and society and a summary of the literature on the traditional Crow Sun Dance. The heart of the book is a discussion of the process by which the Crows reclaimed the Sun Dance. The intermediary was William Big Day, a Crow, who had been excommunicated from the Roman Catholic Church for participating in the Native American Church. Peyote was introduced to the Crow about the time of World War I and served as a ritual linking the present to the past. Big Day was led by his visions to participate in the Shoshone Sun Dance in 1939 and 1940. The next year he invited John Truhujo, a mixed-blood Mexican-Shoshone medicine man who had developed a reputation as a Sun Dance leader, to return the ceremony to the Crow reservation. Voget draws in-depth portraits of these men that provide social and psychological perspectives on this ritual revitalization. Detailed description of the ceremony and its symbolism provide a valuable record of the new "Shoshone-Crow" Sun Dance.

The ceremony took immediate hold among the Crow as old men vowed to perform the Sun Dance each year until the end of World War II to pray for the safe return of Crow soldiers. Voget chronicles the politicization of the Sun Dance in the attempt of the tribal council to co-opt it as a part of the annual Crow Fair. This action led to a proliferation of Sun Dances that came to be not tribal but district level events. Truhujo served as mentor, transmitting his power to Crow Sun Dance leaders and serving as advisor as late as 1975. Yet his innovations in the ritual have not survived in the Crow ceremony. However, contemporary Crows follow Truhujo's lead in articulating symbolic correspondences between the Sun Dance and Christian belief. This correspondence allows the ceremony to function as a statement of Indian faith without being at odds with Christian religions. The Crow Sun Dance today is concerned with individual and group needs for health, increase, and prosperity. Voget sees in these concerns a strong continuity with the past, providing a sense of historical stability and cultural persistence.

Voget's major fieldwork on which this book is based was carried out from 1941 to 1948 and in 1975. He therefore has an excellent historical perspective that allows for a close examination of the initial diffusion and subsequent institutionalization of the ceremony among the Crows. An impressive photographic record complements the text. Altogether, this study is a valuable contribution to the history of American Indian religion and to the processes of religious revitalization that have been especially active during the past fifty years, since the Indian Reorganization Act, among tribal groups on the plains.

Indiana University RAYMOND J. DEMALLIE

THE RESERVATION BLACKFEET, 1882–1945: A PHOTOGRAPHIC HISTORY OF CULTURAL SURVIVAL. By William E. Farr. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1984. Pp. xxii, 210. Illus., bibliog., index. $24.95.

THIS BOOK IS A POWERFUL PICTORIAL RECORD of life among the Blackfeet Indians of northwestern Montana during the reservation period from 1882 to 1945. The photographs are coordinated with, and reinforced by, a well-written text that sets the stage and discusses important periods of reservation life. The book should be in the library of anyone interested in the Blackfeet of Montana and adjacent Alberta.

The story begins in 1855 on Montana's Judith River when the still powerful Blackfeet nation signed a treaty with the United States government. Only twenty-five years later the buffalo abruptly vanished and the now-starving buffalo people—the once powerful Blackfeet—slowly made their way to the Old Agency, near modern Browning, where they expected government rations of food to be issued. Rations were not issued as expected and, hence, in the Starvation Winter of 1883–84, 600 Blackfeet, or about one out of five, perished before spring. It was a terrible beginning to the reservation period.

Conditions did not improve in the years following the starvation tragedy. Political pressures on reserve boundaries intensified, as whites looked enviously at the rangelands, timber, water, and mineral resources of the reservation. In 1886 and again in 1895, the Blackfeet were forced to sell off land to meet current expenses and to pay for short-term, ill-conceived development projects. Although $3 million was realized from these sales, the money was squandered, swindled, or stolen by a succession of incompetents masquerading as Indian agents.

By the turn of the century the emphasis was on education of the young; Indian life could be trained out of them, the authorities thought. Schools, whether run by the agency or by a religious order, concentrated on such things as discipline, short hair, the English language, scrubbing floors and faces, and slopping pigs. An elected tribal council was organized, another part of the process of converting warriors to farmers, Blackfeet to whites.

Much discussion went into the need for an economic base for the reserve. Two points of view emerged. First, many favored grazing and stock-raising because they saw in it a parallel with the buffalo-hunting days. Second, others favored farming because they saw it as a way to force upon the Blackfeet acculturation and assimilation into the Christian, white society. At first ranching prevailed, but trespass by white rancher's cattle (10,000 head in 1904) and hard winters, as well as a cattle market that Indians found hard to understand, demanded economic reorganization. Successive agents zeroed in, in their turn, on irrigation, permit grazing of cattle, mixed farms, and permit grazing of sheep. All proved to be economic dead ends, and, by the beginning of the 1940s, the Blackfeet were as dependent a people as they had been in 1886.

Farr devotes a chapter of his text and an excellent assortment of photographs to the Sun Dance, the most sacred ceremony of the Blackfeet. In early summer, the scattered bands came together and formed a great circle camp at a selected

site. There, after careful preparation, they built a medicine lodge and dedicated it to the sun, the source of all power. However, the only way the Blackfeet could retain the ceremony in the face of white opposition was to change its date to coincide with the Fourth of July celebration. Thus the Sun Dance tended to become a kind of tourist attraction even while it retained its religious significance to the Indians.

Farr ends his book in 1945, a book, according to James Welch, that was a labor of love, of sympathy, of outrage, and of truth. Farr selected 1945 as the cutoff date because, he suggests, postwar Blackfeet were a different reservation people. Their Indian character remained but was more personal, more private. Cultural institutions were also more jealously guarded. A younger, better educated generation began to search for truths in the old beliefs, and the art of photography was as common on the reserve as formerly it had been outside the reservation. Farr concludes, "The new photographic record is as Indian as before but greater decoding efforts are required and it needs to be done by the Blackfeet themselves. That is another book, theirs and not mine."

Galt Museum, Alberta ALEX JOHNSTON

INDIANS OF CALIFORNIA: THE CHANGING IMAGE. By James J. Rawls. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1984. Pp. xvi, 293. Illus., bibiog., index. $19.95.

THIS FASCINATING ETHNOHISTORICAL VOLUME tells more about the white population than the aboriginal residents of California. Such is the intention of James Rawls. His book is concerned with the images of California Indians and the evolution of those perceptions from the 1760s through the 1870s.

Rawls has approached his subject with an extremely impressive review of the literature of California for this period. He has tapped travel narratives, diaries, letters, newspaper accounts, government reports, as well as theses, dissertations, and other secondary sources. From these he has crafted a study concerned with the evolving image of the native Californians: enslaved mission neophytes, primitive "Diggers," useful laborers, expendable and repulsive savages; fit subjects for removal and, possibly, "civilization."

Rawls's analysis subtly pervades his narrative and is reinforced with precise introductory and concluding remarks throughout the book. Although working with hundreds of quotations that present the images and perceptions of the Indians, he has crafted these passages into a tightly written account focused on the changing themes that he has identified.

The author is unequivocal about the message of these perceptions of California Indians: "The quotations from the historical sources are exact, yet the images of the Indians are often distorted by the overriding self-interest of the observers." To Rawls these accounts, while distorted and inaccurate in their presentation of the natives, tell compellingly about the needs of the observers: "If there is a larger truth here, it is that these images tell us more about the image makers than about their subjects" (p. xiv).

Most white observers failed to grasp the complexity of aboriginal lifeways in California. Few showed awareness of the tremendous linguistic diversity or the existence of subcultural patterns within the state. The American observers of the mid-nineteenth century were especially ethnocentric: they saw these people as obstacles. Since the Indians were often unclothed and unclean, their removal was little different from shoving aside an object. Rawls explores white persons' aversions to dirt and to people of dark complexions and comments: "It may have its origins deep in the recesses of the unconscious" (p. 195).

In a moving epilogue, prefaced by an Achumawi creation tale, Rawls sketches the historical outlines of events after 1870 that displayed a new consciousness about the condition and prospects of the first Californians. From the depths of despair and at a nadir in population, the Indians of California have—in a little over a century—made steady strides. While a number of tribes have vanished as linguistic or cultural entities, those that have retained their modest lands have retained and reintroduced many elements of their distinctive cultures. In a very real sense, Rawls has proposed in the epilogue the format for his next book.

This volume, appropriately, joins the long-running Civilization of the American Indian series of the University of Oklahoma Press. It is produced with that publisher's usual attention to design and quality.

Lewis and Clark College STEPHEN DOW BECKHAM

WOMEN AND INDIANS ON THE FRONTIER, 1825–1915. By Glenda Riley. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. xvi, 336. Illus., notes, index. $24.95 cloth, $12.95 paper.

DID NINETEENTH-CENTURY FRONTIERSWOMEN view Indians from the same perspective as their male counterparts? Did these women alter their attitudes toward Indians? How did their private assessments of Indians compare with those of published accounts? These questions are addressed in Glenda Riley's *Women and Indians on the Frontier*. The monograph offers some intriguing answers.

Riley contends that the published record on this subject—both comtemporary and historical writing—has glossed over the wide differences that separated the reactions of frontiersmen and frontierswomen to Indians. Moreover, she criticizes the record for its conclusion that both women and men on the frontier viewed Indians with horror and fear. Riley suggests that the perpetuation of this myth from the early 1800s to the present is, in essence, error compounding error. With revisionism as her major goal, she then reinterprets the role of women in this complex arena of cultural intermingling.

In her quest for the truth, Riley has depended heavily on original sources. After perusing journals, diaries, and memoirs of scores of women that are deposited in archives throughout the nation, she has concluded that frontierswomen responded to Indians very differently from men. Moreover, women saw Indians in the context of how they perceived their own role in nineteenth-century America. She argues persuasively that these women, unlike frontiersmen, had greater opportunity to

meet and mingle with Indians, especially Indian women, through the universal medium of womanhood: home, family, and children. This sharing enabled Indian women and frontierswomen to abandon the stereotypes that had circumscribed their initial, fleeting impressions of the other's culture, whether Indian or white. Through the agencies of trade, healing, and domestic skills, Indian and non-Indian women began to see each other as individuals, as human beings sharing common bonds of humanity. Riley cites case after case of frontierswomen who made the transition from hostility to compassion, respect, and affection. Men, however, were unable to transcend their initial goal of subduing western environment and its inhabitants. Consequently, they remained rigid and inflexible in their attitudes toward Indians.

Riley defends her approach to this topic through several disclaimers. One of these explains that the book is "White history rather than white-Indian or Indian history" (p. xvi). Thus, her portrayal of Indians is largely limited to the perceptions of frontierswomen. She notes that their views are ethnocentric; moreover, she points out that they "do not portray Indians accurately" (p. xv). Nonetheless, the reader is left with a one-sided, often harsh portrayal of Indians. A few ethnological explanations for the cultural behavior so criticized by these women could have resulted in a more balanced account. The Indians who appear in these pages are the bête noire of Indian historians or anthropologists, for these are usually generic Indians, lacking geographic or cultural trappings. Influenced by myth and media, frontierswomen probably saw their first Indians as generic, but a modern historian needs to identify them, wherever possible, by group or tribe. "White" history notwithstanding, an Indian's identity was inextricably linked with group: Comanche, Dinéh, Yakima, Papago, Osage, or Creek.

Despite these flaws, *Women and Indians on the Frontier* contributes extensively to our understanding of the unique relationships that developed between these women of the trans-Mississippi West. In addition to spurring further reseach in the area, it should be a valuable reference source for those interested in cultural interaction on the frontier.

University of New Mexico MARGARET CONNELL SZASZ

LEWIS AND CLARK AMONG THE INDIANS. By James P. Ronda. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1985. Pp. xv, 310. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. $24.95.

THE FASCINATION THAT THE LEWIS AND CLARK EXPEDITION has for Americans derives in large part from its apparent success. In contrast to the exploration of the Australian interior, for example, it was well planned and well executed. Among its successes, according to conventional wisdom, was the establishment of friendly relations with most of the native tribes encountered along the way. Tradition has it, for instance, that as a result of the captains' diplomacy the Nez Perce Indians remained loyal to the United States government until the Chief Joseph outbreak of 1877.

Professor Ronda, applying the techniques of ethnohistory to the Lewis and

Clark expedition, has examined the phenomenon of Indian-white contact as manifested on that journey. Although his effort to present the Indian side of the story is necessarily restricted by the paucity of usable materials, he succeeds in looking at the expedition from a new perspective. If the result is not exactly a "revisionist" interpretation, it does portray Lewis and Clark as more fortunate than judicious. Handicapped by language barriers, persistently misconceiving the nature of intertribal relations, and overestimating the influence wielded by the government, they negotiated "peace treaties" between long-time enemies, who promptly resumed their raids and counter-raids as soon as the captains had gone on.

In their personal relations with the Indians, Lewis and Clark were somewhat more successful, but again and again they narrowly missed precipitating violence, and often the natives' restraint saved the day. The one time that bloodshed occurred, when Lewis and Reuben Field killed two Blackfeet, the white men were lucky to get away alive. Moreover, the captains' journals frequently reflect a belligerence that was fortunately not displayed in their actions.

If Lewis and Clark's success as diplomats was more modest than the popular imagination would have it, their reputation as ethnographers is more solidly deserved. Their verbal and pictorial descriptions and artifacts they collected constitute a real contribution to our knowledge of the northwestern tribes. Nevertheless, they were limited by certain preconceptions. They were best at rendering the material culture of the Indians, things they could see and touch. When they tried to generalize about native beliefs or practices or about the virtues and defects of particular groups, they revealed themselves to be prisoners of stereotyped views of the Indians. Whole tribes were denigrated because they failed to correspond to European notions of physical beauty.

Ronda does not try to undermine the reputations of our two most famous explorers, however. In fact, he obviously admires both men, especially Clark, who, as Bernard DeVoto has told us, really liked Indians. Although their formal utterances contained condescending phrases lke "the Great Father's dutiful children," Lewis and Clark displayed, in their day-to-day contact with the Indians, a much less patronizing attitude. What the author attempts to do is to stress the importance of the Indian role, often overlooked, in assuring the expedition's success.

If the book has a flaw, it is that Ronda idealizes Indians and overemphasizes their contributions. Their leaders are credited with a mature and realistic wisdom that is contrasted sharply with the captains' bungling attempts to rearrange tribal relations to suit the objectives of the U.S. government, when in fact the chiefs' speeches, as recorded by the Americans, reveal mostly a policy of saying what they thought would please their listeners. One may also question Ronda's version of Arikara-Sioux relations, which he characterizes as an "alliance," albeit a shaky one. Most white observers, including the trader Tabeau, who lived with the Arikaras for several years, perceived that tribe as the unwilling victims of Dakota domination.

But these minor objections apart, the book is a balanced, sensible account of an aspect of the expedition that has long been too uncritically viewed as a complete

triumph. And as Ronda freely concedes, Lewis and Clark, with less experience in dealing with Indian tribes than many of their successors, managed better than these later professionals in Indian relations. Had subsequent Indian policy been molded by men blessed with the captains' restraint and humanity, the history of Indian-white relations might have been less a cause for regret than it was.

Mankato State University ROY W. MEYER

PUEBLO INDIAN WATER RIGHTS: STRUGGLE FOR A PRECIOUS RESOURCE. By Charles T. DuMars, Marilyn O'Leary, and Albert E. Utton. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1984. Pp. vi, 183. Illus., notes, index. $22.50.

THIS WORK DETAILS THE pro-Indian and anti-Indian stances as presented in several lawsuits, the most central being the Aamodt case, a protracted legal battle over a minimal volume of water. The implicatons of the case are clearly greater than the monetary value of the rights being adjudicated.

Employing topical rather than chronological treatment, the book begins with evaluation of the Pueblo water right as founded on aboriginal occupancy and possession. A stronger section follows concerning the Pueblo claims as based on the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo. Since legal obligation to former Mexicans who became U.S. citizens under the treaty has the status of constitutional law, a full understanding of what rights the Pueblo Indians had under Spain and Mexico is necessary. Pueblo water use as a "Winters Right" based on an interpretation of a Supreme Court decision of 1980 is the most favorable Indian position. It is an argument founded on a frequently upheld but recently less respected idea of government creation, protection, and expansion of native water rights, to the exclusion of non-Indian users. The Pueblo Lands Acts of 1924 and 1933, the Middle Rio Grande Conservancy District, the International Boundary Commission, and the Indian Claims Commission decisions all complicate any clear picture of Pueblo rights.

For those seeking answers to legal questions, this book is disappointing. Rather, it reopens avenues of legal speculation long considered *res judicata*. The purpose seems to be that of laying out each argument, dissecting it, and leaving the dismembered carcasses strewn where they fell. No legal argument is exempt, nor do the authors come to any conclusion. The footnotes belie the publisher's assertion that the three authors have earlier published widely on water as it relates to the subject of this study. The book seems more the musings of lawyers indecisive concerning which avenue of approach they would take in presenting "the true facts."

A weakness of the work is that none of the authors is grounded in Spanish language nor Spanish law. A valiant attempt was made, but telltale signs of linguistic weakness are evident. The result is dependence on secondary sources, with their dubious translations and poorly reasoned interpretations, at points where the authors' ideas ought to have been presented. For example, a basic lack

of knowledge about *repartimientos* and *encomiendas* is inherent in a statement that "every [early] grant of land carried with it a grant of native persons."

The most worthwhile historical contribution is the first of several appendixes (pp. 119–29) entitled "Chronology of Pueblo Events Affecting Water Rights," a selection abstracted from the Aamodt case reports of William Taylor and of Michael Meyer and Susan Deeds. This listing provides a true framework for significant future research.

St. Mary's University DONALD C. CUTTER

AMERICAN INDIAN AND ALASKA NATIVE NEWSPAPERS AND PERIODICALS, 1826–1924. By Daniel F. Littlefield, Jr., and James W. Parins. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1984. Pp. xxxv, 482. Appendixes, index. $45.00.

HAVING PREVIOUSLY COLLABORATED ON *A Biobibliography of Native American Writers, 1772–1924,* Littlefield and Parins, professors of English at the University of Arkansas at Little Rock, now present a handy reference guide to, as they put it, "newspapers and periodicals edited or published by and about American Indians or Alaska Natives and those whose primary purpose was to publish information about *contemporary* Indians or Alaska Natives" (pp. vii–viii).

Limiting themselves to publications appearing between 1826 and 1924, the authors have profiled 226 newspapers and periodicals ranging from the well-known Indian newspapers and reform periodicals to little-known and short-lived newspapers and magazines published at Indian schools and missions throughout the country. Fortunately, Alaska Native groups were not excluded from this reference work.

In their introduction, Littlefield and Parins discuss the types of newspapers and periodicals they have surveyed here: tribal newspapers, the official organs of Indian tribes to inform their people of the activities and policies affecting them; nontribal newspapers more independent than official tribal organs and that often arose because of tribal factionalism; intertribal newspapers and periodicals, as well as the reform press, to advocate reform in Indian affairs or propagandize for or against specific issues; literary periodicals, which provided Indian authors an outlet for poetry and fiction; and Indian school and mission publications, which informed white supporters about "successes" among the Indians, while educating Indian and Alaska Native charges with spiritually uplifting and practical articles.

The greatest portion of this book is, of course, given over to profiles of individual newspapers and periodicals. The authors have provided a brief sketch of the life of each publication, including biographical information on its editors, a history of the schools, missions, reform organizations or tribal factions that started the publication, descriptions of types of articles offered readers, and discussions of changes in editorial outlook. All this information proves valuable, and through it we can see how each publication and editor viewed their purposes and positions in the quickly changing world of Indian Affairs in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. When editors worked on more than one publication (or when an agency, school, or mission had more than one newspaper) the biographical or historical

information is repeated in the appropriate profile, thereby assisting the researcher who might be interested in one or two publications and does not have time to search through the book for the significant information. It is confusing, however, to find this information sometimes in the main text of a profile and sometimes in the footnotes following each profile. Three appendixes, listing titles by location, tribal affiliation, and in chronological order follow the alphabetically listed profiles.

Redundancies in the text, the authors' propensity to editorialize in their own right, and perhaps readers' disappointment at the cut-off date of 1924 should not discourage the use of this long-needed reference work.

Anchorage, Alaska GARY STEIN

THE SOUTHWESTERN JOURNALS OF ADOLPH F. BANDELIER, 1889–1892. Edited by Charles H. Lange, Carroll L. Riley, and Elizabeth M. Lange. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. xxi, 785. Illus., bibliog., notes, index. $47.50.

THIS FOURTH VOLUME in the series of Bandelier's southwestern journals brings to a close its editors' project, begun in 1966, of publishing all the journals with each volume annotated.

The present work is a remarkable achievement, surpassing its predecessors not only in clarity of format (and thus in usefulness to researchers) but also in the quantity and very wide range of its notes. The notes give the impression that from the beginning of 1889 to early 1892 everything that Bandelier, his personal friends and enemies, or his myriad of unseen correspondents ever thought of, did, or attempted to do, was recorded by his editors with truly Boswellian diligence. This activity produced a very hefty volume; while only 126 printed pages are given to the transcribed journals themselves (both written or typed on Bandelier's ancient Hammond that, to his disgust, was always breaking down, and switching frequently between English, German, French and somewhat awkward Spanish), there are 471 pages of notes. Many of these notes are several pages long, and all are highly detailed, drawn from sources in all parts of this country as well as abroad.

But despite their bulkiness, almost all the notes furnish rewarding reading, both for anthropologists who may either track with gratitude or dismiss with skepticism Bandelier's pioneer footsteps, or for historians attempting to define New Mexican events and characters of a century ago. These historical reconstructions might be either of New Mexican relevance in general, geographically extensive (they include Bandelier's several trips to Júarez and Mexico City), or more or less confined to a smaller area around Santa Fe. During the four years from 1889 through the first few days of 1892, Bandelier either lived in Santa Fe or made his headquarters there, riding (or often walking!) as far afield as Santo Domingo to the south and San Juan to the north, with frequent side-trips east and west.

Perhaps better than in preceding volumes is the present book's demonstration of Bandelier's distinctive personality, which either attracted or alienated his more

conventional acquaintances. His scientific curiosity about widely diverse subjects was insatiable and uncompromising. Equally impressive is the now saddening story of his constant struggle to make enough money by his enormous output of writings in four languages to support his immediate family and numerous other relatives. He was often reduced to selling long articles to local and foreign papers for about two dollars apiece—and was glad to get even these paltry payments to save himself from utter destitution. The commercial failure of his novel *The Delight Makers* was a blow, as also was the vain outcome of his lengthy efforts as sales agent (with a posible large commission in view) for Thomas B. Catron's huge Tierra Amarilla grant. His financial woes often were accompanied by poor health—or at least by physical discomforts about which he railed in the journals with a bitterness that seldom, however, interfered with his writing.

Bandelier was forty-nine when he began his Santa Fe–based work, and although he mourned that he had begun to show his age, except upon occason when his real or imagined difficulties overwhelmed him, he was far from being the mentally dulled and gloomy-visaged misanthrope that some of his critics have asserted. He still enjoyed meeting his many friends in town and making frequent visits with some of them to Fischer's Santa Fe brewery and beer-garden, a mile or so out Palace Avenue. His journal entries become poetic when they mention the advent of the springtime bock beer season.

As suggested above, however, this final volume of the Bandelier series is less important for throwing new light upon its protagonist's extremely complex personality than in serving as an unduplicated storehouse of references, skillfully systematized by the book's editors for students working in many different disciplines. Despite its rather daunting price, due to its bulk and currently high publishing costs, it should find an honored place in every scholarly southwestern library.

Museum of New Mexico BRUCE T. ELLIS

THE EXPLORERS: NINETEENTH CENTURY EXPEDITIONS IN AFRICA AND THE AMERICAN WEST. By Richard A. Van Orman. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. xiii, 243. Illus., notes, index. $19.95.

THIS BOOK DEALS WITH THE GREAT EXPLORATIONS in America and Africa in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries that historians often label the era of Manifest Destiny and the Scramble for Africa. Motivated by an interest in science, national expansion, and a missonary zeal to uplift people considered backward, the United States and Great Britain were the most active nations in exploration during this period. The author reports that he has studied the careers of sixty explorers, but the emphasis is upon those who were most famous, their travels, and the records they left behind. Their approach to the unknown land was along the great river systems of the Nile, Niger, and Congo in Africa, the Missouri, Red, and Arkansas in the American West.

The impact of the ideas of the scientific and literary world of the Enlightenment that encouraged exploration and created a more scientifically minded explorer is

basic to our understanding of their activities. Patrons are essential for all exploration, and Thomas Jefferson in the United States and Sir Joseph Banks in Britain are presented as ideals. The vast literature of exploration is classified by Van Orman into three categories: quests, odysseys, and ordeals. In Britain these travel accounts were widely read, second in popularity only to novels.

After studying the explorers, Van Orman concludes that they were complex personalities and that no single explanation of their motives is satisfactory. Some British explorers did have one thing in common, however; half were born in the lowlands of Scotland. In the exploration experience, native guides were of the utmost importance both in Africa and America. Rather than chronicling the experiences of Lewis and Clark, Pike, Long, Wilkes, and Frémont in the American West and Burton, Speke, Park, Livingston, and Stanley in Africa, emphasis is upon their comparative ages, the comparative distances they covered in a typical day's march, how they organized and managed their travels, the beasts of burden and porters they used, the risks they took, their drive and optimism.

The result of this activity was world prominence for the explorers. The world waited for news of their exploits, they became national heroes, and their journals were best sellers. The information they acquired inspired a new look at people and their environment, learned societies were organized and expanded, and many new ideas about race and nationality were explored. In contrast, the land was taken from the natives, their culture eroded, and human dignity violated. And we are still left with the question, Was it to be a better future for the natives compelled to show gratitude and obedience towards the white man, or was it the beginning of their degradation and hatred?

This study has all the hallmarks of professional historical writing: logical organization, thoughtful interpretation, and a lucid style. If there is imbalance it is the greater emphasis on the American West. The general reader may be disappointed in not finding the usual descriptive and exciting chronicle of the journeys of exploration, and all those less familiar with the history of Africa will long for more information about the personalities and activities of those exploring that continent. In fine, Van Orman is to be congratulated on undertaking and successfully completing a study of comparative frontier history, an approach historians of the American West have long neglected.

University of California, Davis W. TURRENTINE JACKSON

KIT CARSON: A PATTERN FOR HEROES. By Thelma S. Guild and Harvey L. Carter. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1984. Pp. xii, 367. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. $18.95.

THIS BOOK IS THE LATEST ADDITION to a towering bibliographical monument dedicated to Carson, a construction that promises to go on and on. In offering justification for still another biography of Carson, the authors explain they intend to present an updated and readable account based on recent documentary discoveries, many of them incorporated in the notes of Harvey L. Carter's earlier *Dear Old Kit* (1968). That work, essentially a heavily annotated reprinting of

Carson's memoirs, is now out of print. Not all of the finer points included in the notes there have been carried over to the present work, so that serious readers, interested in full particulars, will find it necessary to consult *Dear Old Kit.*

During the past two decades, meticulous research on several larger subjects dealing with the American West has cast new light on Carson's career. That is especially the case with a host of recent publications on the fur trade and the Navajo wars. The authors make abundant use of these—key examples being LeRoy R. Hafen's monumental *The Mountain Men and the Fur Trade of the Far West* and Lawrence Kelly's *Navajo Roundup*—but they also add new information on Carson's command at Fort Garland, for instance, that represents their original discoveries in primary sources.

The book is an entertaining and, for the most part, authoritative recital of the main events in Kit's life, as they are now known. It is also basically a defense of his attitude and actions, in fact, a healthy antidote to much of the nonsense written about Kit in the past few years by ill-informed persons who have some ax to grind.

Regrettably, the one blot on Carson's reputation—not the oft-condemned Navajo campaign in which he acquitted himself decently—is treated only briefly and in a perfunctory manner. That matter was his execution, under orders of Frémont, of three innocent prisoners taken during the American conquest of California. Kit makes no mention of the affair in his dictated memoirs, suggesting that in after years it was for him a source of remorse or shame. The episode is in need of serious investigation to determine his degree of culpability and the amount of blame that should be assigned to Frémont.

Details surrounding Kit's early youth remain sketchy, although the authors manage to summon a few new pieces to help fill in the picture. More information on that period, however, is surely recoverable.

Factual errors are few and of a minor nature. One of note, however, occurs on p. 24, wherein the authors repeat an old story started by Gregg to the effect that the Becknell party, crossing the Santa Fe Trail in 1822, was near death by thirst when the timely killing of a buffalo and the drinking of water from the stomach proved its salvation. Kenneth L. Holmes has convincingly shown that the incident actually happened to the Benjamin Cooper party in 1823.

Since interest in Carson shows no sign of diminishing, this biography will appeal to a wide readership. It can be recommended as a solid introduction to the life of one of the most fascinating figures in the great saga of the American West.

Cerrillos, N. Mex. MARC SIMMONS

PIRATES & OUTLAWS OF CANADA, 1610–1932. By Harold Horwood and Edward Butts. Garden City: N.Y.: Doubleday & Company, 1984. Pp. 260. Illus., biblog., index. $17.95.

HISTORY IS A DISCIPLINE more readily open to the amateur practitioner than other academic subjects. It possesses no arcane language of its own; its subject matter is as vast as human experience itself; and it remains popular with large numbers

of people who regularly buy and read books in their particular field of interest. Writers of differing backgrounds, at their best, have often made significant contributions to the subject; at their worst, they have produced amateurish, uncritical accounts that perpetuate old stereotypes. *Pirates & Outlaws of Canada, 1610–1932* is an entertaining book that possesses the strengths and weaknesses of its particular genre.

In eighteen brief sketches, Harold Horwood and Ed Butts present a potpourri of tales of men on the fringes of North American society, ranging from seventeenth-century Newfoundland pirates such as Peter Easton to nineteenth-century desperadoes like Bill Johnston, the ruffian who controlled parts of the Thousand Islands in the St. Lawrence River. The book ends with a study of the famous clash in 1932 between the R.C.M.P. and Albert Johnson, the "Mad Trapper of Rat River." The writing is lucid and readable, but some chapters lack organization and are unfocused. "Sea Wolves of the Golden Age," for example, seems a bit thin and sketchy while "The Grey Ghost of Fundy" rambles to a weak conclusion. Some of the earlier subjects, such as John Phillips and Bartholomew Roberts, seem to have had little to do with Canada. The most satisfying portraits are those in the last third of the book.

More serious than this unevennness are the uncritical repetition of standard myths and the presentation of factual errors. Etienne Brulé was not killed, for example, solely because of his offensive sexual behaviour. Hiawatha was not the only legendary creator of the Iroquois Confederacy. Factual errors concerning native people seem particularly evident. Iroquet was an Algonquin, not a Huron chief. Indian sexual mores, while liberal by contemporary European standards, were not wholly permissive. The Indians, contrary to then-prevalent missionary opinion, did possess religious views that were fairly sophisticated. Even tribal identities seem to become confused at times in this book: Plains Crees, Swampy Crees, and Algonquins are not clearly distinguished. Careful research would have prevented such mistakes.

The authors of *Pirates & Outlaws of Canada, 1610–1932* have clearly set out to entertain their readers; they have largely succeeded in that ambition. Good history should do more, however, than merely entertain; it should also inform and enlighten. Had Horwood and Butts made use of a wider range of source materials, such as the appropriate volumes of the *Dictionary of Canadian Biography,* they might have written a better book. As it stands, *Pirates & Outlaws* is readable but ultimately unsatisfying.

Huron College DOUGLAS LEIGHTON

REBELS ON THE RIO GRANDE: THE CIVIL WAR JOURNAL OF A. B. PETICOLAS. Edited by Don E. Alberts. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. ix, 187. Illus., bibliog., index. $19.95 cloth, $9.95 paper.

THIS IMPORTANT FIRST-HAND ACCOUNT, by a soldier in the Confederate brigade of Henry H. Sibley, spans the period from 21 February to 15 June 1862. It opens

with the battle at Valverde, New Mexico, covers the fighting around Santa Fe and Albuquerque, as well as the difficult retreat over the mountains west of Fort Craig, and concludes as the Texans limped homeward past Fort Quitman in west Texas.

The journal contains lively views of the combat at Valverde and Glorieta, as well as comments on the shifting psychological moods of men under fire and after battle. Peticolas also offers information on weapons, foraging for food, positive and negative attitudes of enlisted men toward officers, and the resentment of cavalry at being dismounted. Furthermore, he reveals the sometimes exaggerated Confederate hopes of civilian support and rumors of Union losses or reinforcements. Frequent attention is given to camp conditions and life, which at different times included reading, religion, dancing, drinking, gambling, and struggles to overcome weather problems, disease, and lack of water. Descriptions of terrain, towns, and people are excellent, as one might expect of an artist who often sketched along the way.

More than thirty drawings by Peticolas, with photographs and maps, are used to illustrate the volume. Editor Don E. Alberts has observed the path the journal author followed and has compared this account with others to provide enlightening footnotes throughout the diary. In the introduction Alberts offers a brief biography of Peticolas, a Virginian who moved to Victoria, Texas, as an attorney in 1859. The editor then reviews the organization of Sibley's brigade in Texas and its advance through New Mexico before the beginning of the journal. In the epilogue he summarizes the service of Peticolas through the rest of the war in Louisiana and his civilian life afterward.

The editor seems quite accurate when he describes the account and drawings as "the best personal records kept by any participant in the Confederate invasion of New Mexico." Publication of the journal is even more valuable because the original has remained in the hands of the family, unused by earlier historians of the campaign.

Texas Tech University ALWYN BARR

FARMERS IN REBELLION: THE RISE AND FALL OF THE SOUTHERN FARMERS ALLIANCE AND PEOPLE'S PARTY IN TEXAS. By Donna A. Barnes. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1984. Pp. x, 226. Bibliog., index. $20.00.

STUDENTS OF POPULISM will find Donna A. Barnes's *Farmers in Rebellion* a provocatively different kind of study, although she also covers the usual subjects in a Populist state history. For instance, Barnes scrutinizes the powerful Southern Alliance, which began in Texas. She also gives strong but appropriate emphasis to the Alliance Exchange, "the largest and most dramatic effort to build a counterinstitution ever attempted by a protest organization in America." She focuses too on the state's People's party, characterized as the "final protest strategy of the Alliance movement." These approaches are almost standard for historians of southern agrarian protest. But Barnes, a sociologist, gives her study an intriguing

sociological twist and in the process makes historians reflect upon some of their well-established conclusions.

Barnes analyzes two theories regarding the development of protest, using the Southern Alliance and the People's party in Texas as models. She analyzes the better established structural strain perspective, an approach receiving increasing criticism since the sixties, and the newer, less tested mobilization perspective, which she thinks the more valid. Barnes largely rejects the explanations of protest based on the older approach, asserting that the newer mobilization theory is better able to withstand the growing skepticism of the standard historical interpretations of agrarian protest.

The mobilization view, in contrast to the structural strain perspective, does not perceive the source of conflict as emanating from disruptive social chanage. Indeed, to mobilization theorists conflict is inherent in any stratified society; no disruptive change is necessary. Barnes contends that Karl Marx placed too much emphasis on the latent power of society's discontented elements and not enough on the external support often available to them. She also concludes that historians of Populism are inclined to ignore the mobilization theory, preferring the simpler cause-and-effect relationship provided by the structural strain perspective although Lawrence Goodwyn is an exception to this rule in his *Democratic Promise*. Barnes admires his keen appreciation of the difficulties the Southern Alliance and the People's party encountered in mobilizing a successful protest movement but thinks he tends to "romanticize" their often extraordinary efforts.

Barnes's major contribution is her astute analysis of these two theories and their application to the Lone Star state. Some may criticize her decision to limit the study to Texas, but she argues convincingly that Texas is a historically rich scene. Indeed, a perusal of fifteen years of archival newspapers was a necessary step in the preparation of her monograph. Others will find her study difficult to read, but considering the theoretical nature of her approach, it is written with considerable clarity despite its utilization of sociological jargon. Barnes's *Farmers in Rebellion* should be required reading for historians of Populism, a movement undergoing constant reassessment. Other diligent historians will find the book rewarding too.

University of Northern Colorado ROBERT W. LARSON

THAT EVERY MAN BE ARMED: THE EVOLUTION OF A CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHT. By Stephen P. Halbrook. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. xii, 274. Notes, index. $19.95.

HALBROOK, A SOCIAL HISTORIAN AS WELL AS practicing attorney, has produced a thorough study of the volatile issue of gun registration and gun control and their relation to the Second Amendment of the United States Constitution.

"A well regulated militia being necessary to the security of a free State, the right of the people to keep and bear arms shall not be infringed." This language

is taken by organizations such as the National Rifle Association and many individuals including Halbrook as prima-facie evidence that the Constitution protects American citizens from attempts by the government to control their ownership and carrying of firearms. What, then, is to be said about the Gun Control Act of 1968? What are we to say about the ban on handguns enacted by the village of Morton Grove, Illinois, in 1981, and the refusal of the Supreme Court to overrule the lower court's validation of this ordinance as not inconsistent with the Constitution?

The author understands, though he does not agree with, the legal bases of the rulings on gun control legislation. For one thing, the Second Amendment, in common with the other amendments of 1791, enjoined Congress, but not states and not municipalities like Morton Grove, from intruding on the rights of the people.The Fourteenth Amendment, which restrained states from denying their people due process of law and the equal protection of the laws, has over the years since 1923 been interpreted as incorporating most of the injunctions that the amendments of 1791 had applied to states, but not the Second Amendment. This remains unincorporated, unabsorbed by the Fourteenth. Halbrook argues that excepting the right of the people to keep and bear arms is inconsistent and absurd. But the proceedings in the Morton Grove case reiterated the earlier position of the court, excepting the Second Amendment from those popular rights that are secure from state encroachment.

The other ruling in which the courts have construed the Second Amendment is that its purpose was to prevent Congress from disarming the state militias. The fact that "the right of the people to keep and bear arms" is in juxtaposition with the necessity of a well-regulated militia has been taken to mean that the people corporately and not private citizens are thus protected. Consequently neither the Federal Firearms Act of 1934 nor the Gun Control Act of 1968 violates the Constitution.

Halbrook has studied diligently much of the judicial record, rulings by the district and circuit courts, state and federal, as well as the Supreme Court. He directed particularly close attention to *U.S. v. Cruikshank*, *Presser v. Illinois*, *U.S. v. Miller*, and *Quilici v. Morton Grove*, all of which have been the basis for the prevailing opinion that the Second Amendment provides no constitutional right for a private citizen to retain weapons against regulation by state and local governments. He presents an ingenious, though not entirely convincing, argument that such decisions as *Cruikshank* have long been misinterpreted. This case, he writes, "has been cited by modern gun prohibitionists as a precedent for the proposition that the Fourteenth Amendment implies no individual right to keep and bear arms. Actually, the court decided nothing of the kind, and *Cruikshank* asserts the fundamental character of the right to bear arms" (p. 156). Similarly, *Miller* has, in Halbrook's judgment, been misinterpreted and wrongly used to support firearm regulationists.

Rightly or wrongly, however, the courts in various jurisdictions and at various levels have taken such precedents as these to permit some forms of firearm control. Halbrook cites a considerable number of such pertinent rulings. There are others

that he overlooked, or at least did not cite, such as *Eckert v. City of Philadelphia* (1971), *U.S. v. Oakes* (1977), and *Vietnamese Fishermen's Association v. Knights of the Ku Klux Klan* (1982).

The author is at pains to make the point that his position on gun control legislation and the proper interpretation of the Second Amendment is not a monopoly of the political right. And he believes that we have not heard the last word on the issue. Those who would restrict or ban private use of firearms will escalate their efforts to pass legislation at the state and local levels. And since (as he puts it) "it is equally certain that their dedicated opponents would seem to have no intention of relenting, a showdown at the U.S. Supreme Court appears inevitable" (p. 196).

University of New Mexico WILLIAM M. DABNEY

ORAL HISTORY: AN INTERDISCIPLINARY ANTHOLOGY. Edited by David K. Dunaway and Willa K. Baum. Nashville, Tenn.: American Association for State and Local History, 1984. Pp. xxiii, 436. Index. $29.50 cloth, $17.95 paper.

WHEN ORAL HISTORY BEGAN TO DEVELOP as something more than a research tool for historians, in the late 1950s, it was seized upon by disciplines other than history. The technique for preserving facts and impressions from the memories of presidents, corporation chairmen, doctors, judges, and quite a few Indian chiefs (and everyone else in almost every walk of life), turned what had been the preserve of a handful of zealots into a bewildering forest where thousands of subjects spoke millions of words into the waiting microphones of interviewers. By use of this technique we would learn about the unwritten happenings, opinions, and thoughts of the famous, as well as unknown individual Americans.

The first wave of enthusiasts wanted to know "how to do" every aspect of the technique and how to organize into programs the ever-growing reels of tape and typed transcripts. Through its workshops and colloquia, the Oral History Association has gone far in satisfying the need for basic information. Dunaway and Baum have, in this interdisciplinary anthology, carried the process one step farther. By judiciously selecting some of the best writing on not only how to do oral history, but also on the application of the technique to subbranches of history and other disciplines, they have made available in a single source a great amount of information that provides a basic reference tool on the subject.

The organization of the volume is very good. It takes the reader from Louis Starr's overview of oral history from the perspective of 1977 to one of the earliest writings on oral history, that of Allan Nevins; then on to the questions of applications for the techniques, the many problems and successes encountered by project directors, interviewers, educators, and finally to the ultimate keepers and preservers of many of the results: librarians.

One of the most unusual and compelling articles is that of Alex Haley, author of *Roots*. In recounting his experiences with oral history, he makes an excellent case for historians and others to be constantly on the alert for opportunities to

use the technique in different ways where more traditional means for gathering data may be inadequate or impossible to use.

The footnotes are sensibly placed at the end of each chapter. One small quibble about organization has to do with the bibliography appended to Willa Baum's article, "The Expanding Role of the Librarian in Oral History," (pp. 387–406). The bibliography is useful and was attached to the original version. However, the average reader would prefer to find a bibliography at the end of the volume. It would have been a nice touch if an updated version of the Baum bibliography could have been included in the accustomed place. Such an addition would also have added to the reference value of the anthology.

It is a pleasure to note that the publisher has brought out a paper edition at lower cost. On behalf of the many small oral history projects on limited funding, for whom this work is especially helpful, I applaud the decision of the American Association for State and Local History to do this.

Dwight D. Eisenhower Library JOHN E. WICKMAN