New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 60 | Number 3 Article 6

7-1-1985

Book Reviews

BOOK NOTES

Cowgirls: Women of the American West, An Oral History by Teresa Jordan, was first published in 1982 and is now available in paper (Anchor Books, Doubleday $10.95). A pioneering work, it focuses on women in the cattle business and related activities in Colorado, Wyoming, and Montana. Jordan was raised on a ranch in Wyoming and based her book on selections from more than one hundred interviews (with women who work on ranches or in rodeos on a regular basis). Thus it is not a book about ranch wives; it is about owners, ranch hands, and bronc riders. Oral history is interspersed with excerpts from autobiographies, newspapers, poetry, and songs, and the text is well illustrated. *Cowgirls* is readable and interesting and includes such notables as Marie Scott of Ridgeway, Colo., and Fern Sawyer of Nogal, N. Mex.

Of related interest is *The Last of the Wild Horses* (Doubleday, cloth $30.00) with text by Martin Harbury and photographs by Ron Watts. This book gives worldwide coverage to wild horses from places as varied as Mongolia, Australia, Sable Island of Canada, the Camarque region of France, and the American West. There more than one hundred color photographs, many of which are stunning. This is an attractive coffee table book.

A number of books have recently appeared in the field of Mexican history. Broadest in coverage is *Mexico, volume forty-eight in the World Bibliographical Series by Clio Press* (cloth $35.00). Compiled by Naomi Robbins and edited by Sheila Herstein, its 165 pages include 640 entries in forty-eight subject categories, including geography, flora and fauna, prehistory, history, religion, foreign relations, and literature, in addition to a thorough index. *Mexico* is intended for general readers and librarians, covers only works in English, and includes brief annotation.

The Olmecs: The Oldest Civilization in Mexico by Jacques Soustelle (Doubleday, cloth $17.95) was first published in France in 1979 and is aimed at a general audience. It describes the rise and disappearance of Olmec civilization, noted for its pyramids, sculptures, wall paintings, and hieroglyphic writings. Mayan civilization receives attractive coverage in *Maya Ruins of Mexico in Color* by William M. Ferguson in collaboration with John Royce (University of Oklahoma Press, paper $16.95). This pictorial guide includes approximately 200 color plates and accompanying text. Ferguson works in aerial photography and has samples of such work in this book, but readers should anticipate his forthcoming book with the University of New Mexico Press that will consist largely of aerial photographs of Anasazi sites in the Southwest.

After many years of work the University of Utah Press and School of American Research have completed the final volume of the *Florentine Codex* (cloth $35.00). This is the introductory volume, and includes a preface by Miguel Leon-Portilla and introductions by Arthur Anderson and Charles Dibble. A number of noted New Mexicans have been involved with this project over the years. Edgar Hewett wanted Adolph Bandelier to translate Sahagun's Nahuatl text into English; Lansing Bloom microfilmed the codex in Spanish, and Bertha Dutton and others of the School of American Research have been associated with this work in various ways. This particular volume has Sahagun's prologues and interpolations, the general bibliography, and general indexes. The completion of the *Florentine Codex* is a significant accomplishment.

The School of American Research is also responsible for *New Light on Chaco Canyon* (School of American Research Press, paper $9.95). Edited by David Grant Noble, this large format paperback consists of articles by experts such as Robert H. Lister and W. James Judge, past and present directors of the National Park Service Chaco Center at the University of New Mexico. The articles are written for general readers and describe current theories about Chaco Canyon and its people. J. J. Brody deals with art, William Lumpkins with architecture, William Gillespie with the environment, Robert Powers with the road system,

Polly Schaafsma with rock art, Michael Zeilik with archaeoastronomy, and David Brugge with the Chaco Navajos, a topic that he has covered more fully in a separate monograph. Jim Judge sets the stage with his introduction and Bob Lister describes the history of archaeological research in Chaco Canyon. This heavily illustrated volume is a fine example of "popular" archaeology and should be required reading for general readers interested in the subject and particularly for those planning a visit to Chaco Canyon.

Other attractive and heavily illustrated books are *Santa Fe: Then and Now* (Sunstone Press, paper $14.95), *Akicita: Early Plains and Woodlands Indian Art from the Collection of Alexander Acevedo* (University of New Mexico Press, paper $9.95), and *Yazz: Navajo Painter* (Northland Press, paper $17.95). The former is designed to show what Santa Fe looked like one hundred years ago and utilizes more than eighty historic and modern photographs. *Akicita* was first published in 1983 as a catalog for an exhibit of Indian artifacts at the Southwest Museum. Seventy-eight color photographs effectively illustrate this fine collection of traditional Indian art. *Yazz* consists of a biographical sketch of Navajo artist Beatien Yazz (Jimmy Toddy), an evaluation of his art, and autobiographical comments by the artist as well as some fifty illustrations of his paintings.

In 1947 Joseph Epes Brown recorded the seven sacred rites of the Oglala Sioux, and his book has been widely used since that time. In *The Gift of the Sacred Pipe* (University of Oklahoma Press, cloth $29.95), Vera Louise Drysdale has condensed the original text and added illustrations but unfortunately failed to add a bibliography on Oglala religion.

Noted southwestern historian George P. Hammond is author of *The Weber Era in Stockton History* (Friends of the Bancroft Library). Charles Weber, a German immigrant, was a member of the first overland party from Missouri to California in 1841 and founded the city of Stockton. He was a merchant, rancher, and miner. Hammond effectively describes Weber's life and provides valuable comments on California during a period of significant change.

Between the Sacred Mountains: Navajo Stories and Lessons from the Land (University of Arizona Press, cloth $35.00, paper $19.95) was first published in 1982 by the Rock Point Community School on the Navajo Reservation. This book consists of Navajo comments on the environment, culture, history, and contemporary issues such as relations with Hopis and resource use.

The University of New Mexico Press recently published *The State Parks of New Mexico* by John Young (cloth $19.95, paper $9.95), a guidebook to state parks ranging from Bluewater Lake to Villanueva State Park on the Pecos. This heavily illustrated volume includes a brief history of each park and a description of facilities.

Texas Politics: Constraints and Opportunities by Wilbourn E. Benton (Nelson-Hall, cloth $26.95, paper $13.95) is now in its fifth edition. It is a standard text on Texas politics at the state, municipal, and county levels.

Western outlaws are the subject of *Historical Atlas of the Outlaw West* by Richard Patterson (Johnson Books, Boulder, Colo., paper $14.95). This large format volume is well illustrated and is organized by states, localities, and communities. The text describes activities of outlaws in and around each town. Eleven pages are devoted to New Mexico. A bibliography and index accompany the text.

Two recent publications focus on specific areas in New Mexico. *Time of Trouble, Time of Triumph* by John D. McKee (First Presbyterian Church, Socorro, paper $13.50) is a centennial history of the First Presbyterian Church of Socorro. Using church records, newspapers, and published materials, McKee relates the history of the church to that of the community. *You Take the Sundials and Give Me the Sun* by David Townsend (*Alamogordo Daily News*) consists of twenty-two short historical sketches about the Tularosa Basin. Subjects range from Mescalero Apache history to Oliver Lee, Albert B. Fall, John Prather, and the atomic bomb. Each item appeared as an article in the *Alamogordo Daily News*.

Book Reviews

THE DAY THE SUN ROSE TWICE. By Ferenc Morton Szasz. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. xi, 224. Preface, notes, index. $15.95.

BEGINNING IN 1943 there arrived in New Mexico some of the world's most distinguished scientists bringing with them and developing soon thereafter some of the world's most sophisticated technology. More than two billion dollars were spent under wartime exigencies and urgencies to develop and test the world's first atom bomb, which was detonated because of political pressures at 5:30 A.M., Mountain War Time on the morning of 16 July 1945 on a stretch of semidesert land in the south central part of the Land of Enchantment. New Mexico, and the world as well, would never be the same again. Advanced technology and modern science were forcefully imposed on an area not far removed from a frontier mining and grazing economy.

In this fast-paced, well-written, deeply researched monograph, which reads like a gripping adventure tale, Ferenc Morton Szaz presents the story of the Trinity site nuclear explosion. In nine succinct chapters he acquaints the reader with the scientific knowledge necessary to comprehend what the physicists, engineers, physicians, meteorologists, and others were doing in Los Alamos and at the Trinity site. He examines their activities within the framework of wartime concerns and local conditions, including the question of weather. Individuals frantically working at the edges of scientific knowledge, fearful that the outcome of the war depended on their efforts, developed a momentum that, taxing their energies to the utmost, brought their combined, cooperative efforts to a successful conclusion.

Szasz examines these themes and the aftermath, as well as the legacy of the explosion, in part by focusing on individuals, utilizing in several instances recently declassified manuscript sources, and by relating developments in New Mexico to broader concerns affecting the course of the war and the direction of the postwar world. Particularly interesting is his discussion of the historiography that has flourished concerning the validity of exploding atom bombs over Japanese cities and the questions pertaining to President Truman's decision. Szasz carefully examines the reasons offered, both pro and con, for using the bomb and offers a meaningful alternative analysis within the context of the conditions under which Los Alamos and other scientists worked to develop the weapon. This debate has extended far beyond the range of academic discussion involving historians, scientists, and theologians. It is now a public issue and shows little sign of disappearing.

Certainly the Trinity explosion launched a new era, which Szasz notes in his

introduction and spells out in his chapters. Everything about the project marked a "first" that changed the world in which we and our posterity will live out our lives. Among the most important issues first raised were the still unanswered questions of whether nuclear explosions might generate enough heat to ignite the atmosphere and turn the planet into another star. By producing the world's initial experience with airborne radioactive fallout, Trinity raised questions that have yet to be resolved.

What occurred on a mid-summer day in 1945 in a remote area of a picturesque and equally remote American state changed the course of history and offers the distinct possibility that the biblical account of Armageddon can be translated into reality. Certainly the events of that day make a mockery of T. S. Eliot's prophecy in "The Hollow Men" of "This is the way the world ends, not with a bang but a whimper."

Szasz's impressive study should attract a wide audience, and when it appears in paperback, it most assuredly will.

Iowa State University RICHARD LOWITT

JAMES C. MALIN, HISTORY AND ECOLOGY: STUDIES OF THE GRASSLAND. Edited by Robert P. Swierenga. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1984. Pp. xxix, 376. Selected bibliog., references, index. $13.95 paper.

JAMES C. MALIN WAS ONE OF AMERICA'S most original historians. A quiet, retiring scholar who taught at the University of Kansas from 1921 to 1963, Malin was not nearly so well known as Walter P. Webb, Edward Everett Dale, and a number of other contemporaries who studied and wrote in the field of western history. His writings did not gain as much attention as they deserved during his lifetime because he published some of his most important books himself, and because they were rather ponderously written. One had really to want to know what Malin had to say to plow through some of his works.

Malin wrote eighteen books and monographs and nearly 100 articles. These covered a fairly wide range of topics, varying from a general history of *The United States after the World War* (1930) to his difficult and highly interpretative, *The Grassland of North America: Prolegomena to Its History* (1947). His reputation rests mainly on his grassland studies in which he integrated history and ecology. According to Malin, it was man more than environment that determined the course of human events, but man, he argued, must fit into the natural environment.

In bringing together a large sample of Malin's writings, Robert P. Swierenga has edited a highly important book. He begins with a most insightful and stimulating essay on "Malin's Ecological Interpretation of the Grassland," which is the best summary available on Malin's thought and its effect on later writers. For those who have struggled through Malin's grassland studies, Swierenga's interpretative summary is most welcome.

The book is divided into four parts. Part I includes some of Malin's best interpretative writing on the grassland. A second section deals with case studies of those who adjusted to the grassland, an aspect of Malin's writing that towered above that of most of his contemporaries. Part III provides examples of Malin's writings that deal primarily with farm population and agricultural development in Kansas. In this section the reader is treated to some of Malin's statistical methodology. The final section is a selected bibliography of Malin's principal writings.

Professor Swierenga has chosen well from the writings of James C. Malin, works that should be more readily available and more widely read. The editor introduces each selection with a perceptive discussion of the reading to follow. Both Professor Swierenga and the University of Nebraska Press are to be congratulated for this outstanding publication. It will be of use to historians, economists, environmentalists, and others.

University of Georgia GILBERT C. FITE

VOICES FROM THE OIL FIELDS. Edited by Paul F. Lambert and Kenny A. Franks. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1984. Pp. xii, 257. Illus., index. $19.95.

DURING THE LATE 1930S, Ned DeWitt, Welborn Hope, and other employees of the Federal Writers' Project recorded and transcribed scores of interviews with oil field workers in Oklahoma. In twenty short chapters, organized by job specialties for the most part, Paul F. Lambert and Kenny A. Franks present the best of this material, along with brief introductions, succinct explanations of technical terms, and about forty well-chosen photographs.

The result is a lively and significant book, which contains highly specific descriptions of job skills and procedures common to all parts of the oil patch between 1900 and 1935. Most of this work was taxing and occasionally dangerous. For example, shooters, who made and worked with nitroglycerine, rarely survived their first accident or mistake. Rig builders, roughnecks, and casing pullers ran the risk of injury or death from falling objects, hydrogen sulfide, and explosions. Those who survived were often worn out by age forty: tank builders were ruptured and had varicose veins, while roughnecks added back injuries and missing fingers to the toll heavy work exacted.

Through most of *Voices*, the interviewees expound their experiences and opinions, offering vivid expressions of attitudes and life styles. Hard work was man's work: "You've got to have muscle when you're roughnecking" (p. 76). Work was intermittent; even when steady work was available, hands took off to spend their wages when a job was done: "the dice caught a lot of what I did make anyway" (p. 67). Men who worked together drank together, and real men could hold their liquor: "Beer don't make you drunk 'less you've got a big imagination or you're nervous to start with" (p. 103). Such material provides interesting reading for the general reader and useful examples for social and business historians.

The scholarly value of the interview material, however, is sometimes impaired by several weaknesses. Without an explanation of the editorial procedures of the interviewers, oral historians may be at a loss to identify an authentic text. The absence of the normally abundant swear words, for example, suggests heavy and consistent editing, and the highly regular sentence structure seems inauthentic. One chapter, "Oil Mixes Right Handy with the Lord," begins with several pages of narrative, much like a short story. Although Lambert and Franks provide a brief description of their editorial procedures, the practices of DeWitt, et al. are obscure.

A further problem occurs because Lambert and Franks tend to include tall tales without warning to the reader. For example, Jake Simms, who worked for either the I.R.S. (p. 157) or the F.B.I. (p. 158), or possibly for both, tells of forty-seven killings in one night in front of the Palace Dance Hall in Chancre Flats, near Seminole. In addition, the editors, themselves, claim that as many as 100,000 boomers flocked to Seminole County "within a few months" of the opening of the Greater Seminole Field in 1927.

The most serious shortcoming of *Voices,* however, is inherent in the original material: the interviewers focused their work too narrowly on working men. The only women considered are a prostitute and an apparently psychotic widow—hardly representative of the large numbers of women and children who lived and worked in the oil fields. As a result the book offers a partial but somewhat distorted view of life in the oil fields of Oklahoma.

Even with these limitations, *Voices* is often compellingly interesting, and it provides useful insights into the life, work, and society of men in the oilfields before World War II.

University of Texas–Permian Basin ROGER M. OLIEN

WATER RIGHTS: SCARCE RESOURCE ALLOCATION, BUREAUCRACY, AND THE ENVIRONMENT. Edited by Terry L. Anderson. San Francisco: Pacific Institute for Public Policy Research; Cambridge, Mass.: Ballinger Publishing Company, 1983. Pp. xxiii, 348. Illus., bibliog., index. $35.00.

THIS VOLUME IS ONE OF A SERIES of Pacific Studies in Public Policy designed to engender, through research and commentary, new departures in public policy. More particularly, this work seeks to apply the "New Resources Economics" panacea of the free market to solving the present water crisis facing the nation, especially the West. The crisis derives from a combination of factors including a taxpayers' revolt against funding monumental and conveyance systems, rising energy costs, increasing environmental sensitivity to projects' impact on riverine ecosystems and instream flow. At issue is the ultimate depletion of surface and ground water sources. The economists who have authored this collection of articles are sanguine in their belief that the time has come to put into practice an all-embracing water rights transfer system, whereby cheap water can be purchased

for higher value purposes in the marketplace. *Privatization* is to replace or to supplement the *publicization* of water institutions, allegedly a failed system in place since the turn of the century. Originally, the system was dominant in providing cheap water for agriculture and for operating according to the so-called principle of "distributive politics." These contributors are not lacking in the ideological fervor with which they denigrate the rent-seeking bureaucrats and constituents of the Reclamation Bureau and Army Corps of Engineers projects, state water agencies, and local water districts. The market approach for allocation of water seems especially apropos to the capacity of the urban and industrial sector to pay high prices for scarce water supplies. Current studies have demonstrated the elasticity of water pricing. Consequently, the time is ripe to utilize the free market mechanism to its maximum extent in order to achieve conservation of this scarce resource, as well as put in place a more rational system of allocation.

The articles agree that former conditions justifying public sector water resource functions are no longer significant. These included exorbitant capital start-up demands, the potential for monopoly and speculative exploitation by private enterprise, and the variable nature of water supply. They minimize the obstacles that must be surmounted in applying the free market mechanism to the allocation of both surface and ground water resources, as well as in such arcane fields as providing essential instream flow and pollution rights. The authors are primarily interested in demolishing the institutional structure that prevents water rights from becoming articles of private property freely negotiable for sale or lease so owners can capitalize on higher value markets.

This reviewer found the Rucker and Fishback study most insightful. It traced the combined rent seeking maneuvers of Bureau of Reclamation bureaucrats and land owners as they exploited the tax free and excess land provisions of the law to their advantage. The best example of institutional change to permit a water rights market is found in the New Mexico statute, where the state engineer's authority facilitates the exchange of water rights. Even here, the Ginser and Johnson study points out the resistance that a local water district offered, motivated by its survival needs.

Overall, the substantial contribution of this book is to present an alternative system of water distribution that will be more efficient, truly cost effective, and conserving of water resources. Each study presents a model of an improved system based on market forces and econometric analysis. These reformers wish to revamp the public sector's institutional dominance with its rigid adherence to riparian rights, appropriative water rights held by water districts or state and federal agencies, and block market forces that could deploy water rights to their highest value. Overlooked are the consequences of such a drastic overturning of present systems. Questions arise, however. What bodies in the private sector will be responsible for constructing the infrastructure for storing and conveying water to new high-priced customers? What happens to bypassed agricultural districts? The Owens Valley–Los Angeles story is an example. Finally, what public agencies will administer the water rights market? Will the much-abused water districts persist

in this guise? Certainly this new dispensation will have to be introduced in each state on a gradual basis.

San Jose, Calif. LAWRENCE B. LEE

THE LAND BEFORE HER: FANTASY AND EXPERIENCE OF THE AMERICAN FRONTIERS, 1630–1860. By Annette Kolodny. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1984. Pp. xv, 293. Illus., bibliog., index. $28.00 cloth, $9.95 paper.

OBVIOUSLY, ANNETTE KOLODNY HAS FOUND HER LIFEWORK. This book is the second of a projected trilogy on her chosen topic, the historical relationship between (white) women and the land in American literature. Kolodny's first book, *The Lay of the Land,* analyzed the attitudes of European males toward the American land in the colonial period. Using the tools of feminist scholarship, Kolodny found that women and the land were equated and that men sought domination of a blatantly psychosexual nature over this female landscape. *The Lay of the Land* was a significant contribution to American literary criticism.

This second, eagerly awaited volume, *The Land Before Her,* brilliantly extends the insights of the first book. Now we see the land as it appeared in the literary imagination of American women of the colonial period and the early nineteenth century. The female sense of the land, Kolodny argues, has been fundamentally different from the male version. She traces the process by which American women came to terms with the land, beginning with frightened and deeply alienated first encounters and culminating in the high tide of midwest settlement as women confidently imagined the transformation of the land into a cultivated landscape. No violent "taking" of the land occurs here, no heroism. Instead there is the mundane (albeit mysteriously moral) creation of a kitchen garden.

Kolodny derives her thesis from an impressive range of sources, the best known of which are captivity narratives (real and fictional) and popular nineteenth-century women's novels. Underpinning that research is Kolodny's extensive reading in women's nontraditional literature, in particular, diaries and letters. From these varied sources, Kolodny builds her case for a peaceful, domestic, modest female perspective on the land. In the process, she very quietly and without fuss reveals the male bias of previous considerations of the frontier myth.

Some people have expressed disappointment that Kolodny's research has revealed such an unadventurous, prosaic female view of the land. This search for female heroes is surely misplaced. The strength of Kolodny's argument rests on the fact that the female version is so different from the male. The extent of the difference makes essential a reconsideration of the frontier myth.

In her concluding chapter, Kolodny offers a tantalizing preview of a new female approach that combines the domestic and the adventurous, which she will explore in her third volume, a study of women's responses to the trans-Mississippi West.

In the meantime, read *The Land Before Her*. It is a brilliant, engrossing, important study.

Washington State University SUE ARMITAGE

MORMON ENIGMA: EMMA HALE SMITH. By Linda King Newell and Valeen Tippets Avery. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday & Company, Inc. Pp. xiii, 386. Illus., notes, tables, index. $19.95.

EMMA SMITH, WIFE OF THE MORMON PROPHET Joseph Smith, has too long been caught between two extreme, conflicting interpretations. She is either the noble, patient, near-perfect Emma, constantly protecting the image of her maligned husband, or she is the once "elect" lady who was the ideal wife of a prophet but who betrayed her religion and demonstrated her corruption by not following Brigham Young to the West, by marrying a nonbeliever, and by supporting the Reorganization headed by her son, Joseph Smith III. *Mormon Enigma* rescues her by creating the image of a woman who was not just "an appendage and helpmeet to prominent men," but also "a capable, articulate, and influential individual in her own right who profoundly affected the development of the religious movements with which she was associated." The authors' solid research makes a convincing case, and their book is a highly important contribution to the fast-growing body of scholarly Mormon studies.

From the time Emma eloped with Joseph in 1827, the reader is touched with vivid accounts of hardship and struggle in connection with all the highlights of their next seventeen and a half years together. Throughout Emma is protrayed as a loving, caring, and supporting wife in everything except the matter of polygamy. Three years after Joseph's brutal murder she married Lewis Bidaman, with whom she lived in the Nauvoo Mansion House until her death in 1879.

The overriding issue in the book, however, is plural marriage. Joseph received a revelation authorizing the practice as early as 1831, but at first kept it hidden from Emma as well as most church members. When he finally broached the subject to Emma, she rejected the idea, and as he continued to press polygamy, this became the major point of stress in their otherwise seemingly ideal relationship. She even used the Women's Relief Society, over which she presided, as a tool to fight polygamy. When she finally consented to the idea, she claimed the right to choose Joseph's plural wives, wrongly assuming that he had not yet taken any. She chose four young women, all of whom were living with the Smith family, but little did she realize that Joseph already had several plural wives and that two of her choices, Eliza and Emily Partridge, were among them.

Almost immediately Emma began again to deny the validity of the plural marriage doctrine, eventually claiming that it was begun by Brigham Young. Her greatest aim after Joseph died seemed to be to protect her sons from the stigma of believing that their father had ever taught or practiced it, and just shortly

before her death she firmly denied the practice again. The denials are puzzling, given the general integrity ascribed to her, and are never satisfactorily explained.

Emma Smith was remarkable in her patience and compassion. After all her pain over polygamy, she even forgave her second husband when he was unfaithful to her and sired a son, Charles, by the young widow Nancy Abercrombe. What's more, in 1868, when Charles was four years old and his mother was having serious financial problems, Emma took him into her home and raised him as her own, and later she hired Nancy to work for her. Just before Emma died, she called Nancy and Lewis to her bedside and asked them to marry so the boy would have proper parentage. "An extraordinary act of compassion," the authors call it, and so it was.

As important as *Morman Enigma* is to Mormon historiography, it is not without its flaws, particularly its lack of balance. For one thing, only about sixty pages are devoted to the last thirty-two years of Emma's life, after she married Bidamon, and about half of that is given to the activities of her sons. More importantly, the heavy emphasis on a single issue, polygamy, leaves the treatment of the political and economic issues surrounding Joseph and the resulting controversy in Nauvoo wanting. Finally, and most important, the authors do a disservice to Joseph and Emma in the general image they leave of Joseph. In spite of a few efforts to build him up, they create in the minds of their readers a weak, deceptive Mormon prophet. Undoubtedly, he had human faults and failings, but he was also a man of warmth and compassion who attracted thousands of loyal disciples who followed and trusted him. The authors easily could have provided a more balanced, believable interpretation, but the reader is left wondering why the strong-willed, moral, and deeply religious woman they create could contine to love and show loyalty to the kind of man who emerges here. If there is any enigma in the book, that is it.

Brigham Young University JAMES B. ALLEN

MABEL DODGE LUHAN: NEW WOMAN, NEW WORLDS. By Lois Palken Rudnick. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. xvi, 384. Illus., index. $19.95.

MABEL DODGE LUHAN (1879–1962) PURSUED her own soul relentlessly, even frenetically. She was a woman of immense ego, consumed by the need to "find herself" in relation to the universe. For many years she assumed that her major role was to encourage and inspire creativity in those of genius. The place in which she finally "found herself" was Taos, New Mexico. This book is almost as much about Taos as it is about Luhan.

While always self-engrossed, Luhan was also aware of important issues in her world. She appears to have known almost everybody of importance in America (and often in Europe), particularly in the creative arts. She knew social reformers

as well, and in her young days was involved with the "lyrical left," or Greenwich Village radicals.

Lois Palken Rudnick has portrayed Mabel Luhan's life with infinite detail. Reading this book, one is no longer apt to think patronizingly of Luhan as the eccentric dilettante or the amateur author who wrote because her psychiatrist told her she needed something to do. Rudnick has recorded the many relationships Luhan maintained with important people of the day, several of whom she introduced to the American public. The number of writers who used Luhan as a prototype for their works is by itself an astounding list: these included Carl Van Vechten, D. H. Lawrence, Frieda Lawrence, Jacques-Emile Blanche, Max Eastman, Myron Brinig, N. B. Hapgood, and Witter Bynner.

Rudnick's well-researched work depicts the world in which Luhan grew up, the rebellious daughter of a wealthy Buffalo banking family during the late Victorian period. As a young widow, she was sent to Europe to recover from her loss (and to quell a scandal involving her and a local doctor). She married Edwin Dodge and established an exquisite villa in Florence, Italy, attracting such guests as Gertrude Stein, whose talents she recognized long before the general public did. Tiring of the "artificiality" of Europe, Mabel, with her son and husband, moved back to New York. Determined to be the "new woman" of the period, she became sexually and intellectually involved with members of the radical movement. Shedding her second husband, she married Maurice Sterne, an artist. It was he who first persuaded her to come out to New Mexico; here, he was sure, she would be able to find release from her tortured search for fulfillment.

Taos was Mabel's spiritual resting place; she seems to have experienced at last the epiphanies that helped in her personal odyssey. The most important influence was the Taos Pueblo Indian Tony Luhan, who became her fourth husband; they were married for more than forty years. He introduced her to the ways of life in the Taos pueblo, where she found in the religious customs and ceremonies something that satisfied her. She also found Taos to be a place of beauty and inspiration, which she energetically insisted on sharing with acquaintances for the rest of her life. The most notable was D. H. Lawrence, her greatest prize, but she was hostess to many other famous figures as well.

Rudnick has conveyed the beauty of the Taos landscape that exemplifies the power of the Southwest to inspire creative people. She has also given a detailed picture of other places and times important to Mabel Dodge Luhan.

The flaws are relatively minor. Because Rudnick records Luhan's life according to the major figure important to her at the time, there is inevitable chronological overlapping. While the author gives a plethora of detail on some phases of the subject's life, she is rather reticent about Mabel's relationships with husbands two and three and mentions her son only briefly. The lack of information about these vital and close ties may contribute to the reader's difficulty in sympathizing with Luhan's long search for her place in the world. On the other hand, this may be due to the subject herself; someone with such a monumental ego, such consistent narcissism, and such wealth may evoke fascination, rather than sympathy.

Mabel Dodge Luhan: New Woman, New World is a fine biography. It is also worth reading for anyone interested in the state of American society in the first half of this century, in the history of the arts in America, or in the development of Taos as a cultural center.

Copiously supplied with excellent photographs, the book also includes a complete and useful index.

Kearney State College HELEN WINTER STAUFFER

MISSIONARIES, OUTLAWS, AND INDIANS: TAYLOR F. EALY AT LINCOLN AND ZUNI, 1878–1881. Edited and annotated by Norman J. Bender. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. xxi, 234. Illus., bibliog., notes, index. $17.50 cloth, $9.95 paper.

EDITOR AND ANNOTATOR NORMAN J. BENDER INDICATES in the preface that this book recounts the confrontation between the eastern Anglo-Saxon value system of Taylor and Mary Ealy and those sets of values operating in two frontier cultures of territorial New Mexico. Specifically, Ealy was a medical missionary for the Presbyterian Church who had the misfortune to find himself in Lincoln, New Mexico, at the height of the Lincoln County War and in the Zuni Pueblo at a time of particular sensitivity to external threats to Indian culture. Clearly, the Ealys did not prevail, for hostility drove them from Lincoln and futility from Zuni. The Ealys did, however, leave their mark not so much on Lincoln or Zuni but on students of New Mexico history, for their records of their experiences presented in this work provide unique and insightful pictures of two special conditions in New Mexico's past.

Professor Bender builds on the earlier efforts of Maurice Fulton and Robert Mullin and uses various sources to allow the Ealys to record their impressions. These sources include Taylor Ealy's diary, extant in the Lawrence Ealy Collection at the University of Arizona; the transcriptions of Ealys' daughter Ruth from her parents' diaries and correspondence, which she published in a book, *Water In a Thirsty Land;* letters in the Sheldon Jackson Collection in the Presbyterian Historical Collection in Philadelphia; and letters from Taylor Ealy to U.S. Indian Agent Ben Thomas in the National Archives.

These accounts reflect few if any successes, and Bender may have correctly subtitled this book, "Three Years of Fear and Frustration on the Frontier." The arrival of the Ealys in Lincoln could have not been more untimely, for it coincided with the murder of John Tunstall, which ushered in a period of violence that they witnessed from behind various "barricades" for six months of 1878. From Lincoln they were soon sent to Zuni where they were unexpected, unprepared for, and generally unwelcome. Continued difficulty in providing reasonable accommodations for the family and the school, persistent conflict with the Indian Agent, lack of response from the Zuni populace, and finally the death of their first son all contributed to their decision to return to Pennsylvania.

Professor Bender does an outstanding job, especially in editing the materials. He provides extensive and accurate background that puts the Ealy observations in an historical context sufficient for those readers not especially familiar with the time or places. Every name or reference, however peripheral, is given extensive consideration in explanatory endnotes. A very thorough bibliography that includes references to holdings of the Presbyterian Church furnishes adequate sources for further work on Presbyterian missionary activities on the western frontier. Bender's interpretive efforts to tie the experiences of the Ealys to the cultural winning of the West are interesting; however, it is questionable whether the Ealys, especially after reaching Lincoln, saw themselves in that role. Taylor Ealy probably better typifies the young, innovative, American entrepreneur in his development of the T. F. Ealy Baby Powder Company than the rearguard agent of Manifest Destiny. Mere presence in the Southwest during the period did not make the Ealys a civilizing force. It did, however, make them witnesses, and in this capacity they rendered a valuable service to New Mexicans. Professor Bender not only makes the testimony of the Ealys available but, through careful editing, more meaningful. Students of history and professional historians should profit both from the substantive content and editorial craftsmanship.

New Mexico Military Institute WILLIAM E. GIBBS

THE INDIAN MAN: A BIOGRAPHY OF JAMES MOONEY. By L. G. Moses. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1984. Pp. xvii, 293. Illus., bibliog., index. $24.95.

THIS IS THE FIRST BIOGRAPHY of a distinguished scholar who made major contributions to American Indian ethnology. Because of his lack of formal training and a university affiliation, James Mooney's contributions have not received the attention his biographer feels they merit. Moses' exhaustive research and felicitous writing should remedy that. This is a biography that not only firmly establishes the scholarly reputation of Mooney, but by placing him in the context of his times, tells a great deal about the history of the discipline of anthropology.

Best known for his work on the Ghost Dance, Mooney published that classic only a decade after joining the staff of the Bureau of Ethnology. In his thirty-six years with the bureau he made significant contributions in other areas, including Plains Indian heraldry, North American Indian demography, Cherokee myths, Kiowa calendar history, and the peyote religion.

A man of principle, Mooney's championing of the right of Native Americans to practice their peyote rituals finally caused him to be barred from reservations by the order of the commissioner of Indian affairs. To the firm believer in field work that Mooney was, this exclusion was a disaster, although his deteriorating health had made further extended field trips unlikely in any eventuality.

As a field worker, Mooney combined an ingratiating personality with intellectual curiosity and the persistence necessary to get the job done. He was also prompt to take advantage of new technology, making good use of a camera and experi-

menting with the Edison Graphaphone, a forerunner of today's ubiquitous tape recorder.

Unfortunately, Mooney in his prime had difficulty finishing projects, and in his last years his energy level was quite low. As a result he left behind large quantities of undigested field notes. These, because of his poor penmanship and the absence of disciples that he would have had with a university connection, have been unexploited, and ethnology is the poorer for that fact.

Moses manages to remain objective in his evaluation of a man whose admirable qualities might have seduced a less able biographer. The author makes no effort to conceal Mooney's early acceptance of assimilation as the only answer for the Indian, not an acceptable view these days. Like many contemporary friends of the Indian, Mooney believed that most Native Americans would lose out in the struggle for survival. Nevertheless, in time he would move toward a belief in cultural pluralism, today's conventional wisdom. As Mooney made this transition, he found himself increasingly at odds with missionaries and such vocal champions of complete assimilation as Richard H. Pratt. His critics would first charge him unfairly with staging a Sun Dance that he might document portions of it on film, and later belabor him for helping legitimize the Native American Church and its controversial use of peyote.

All of this is presented with a wealth of detail, relieved by a lively style. This reviewer found particularly pleasing such descriptions as the one of the rough-hewn John H. Seger who, "in the polite company of missionaries and teachers, swam about like a porcupine among swans" (p. 150).

This biography should stand the test of time.

State University of New York College, Fredonia WILLIAM T. HAGAN

FLORENTINE CODEX: GENERAL HISTORY OF THINGS OF NEW SPAIN. BOOK 2, THE CEREMONIES. Second edition, revised. Fray Bernardino de Sahagun. Trans. by Arthur J. O. Anderson and Charles E. Dibble. Santa Fe: School of American Research; Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1981. Pp. 247. Illus., notes, appendix. $40.00.

CODEX EN CRUZ. By Charles E. Dibble. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1981. Vol. 1. Pp. 63. Illus., indexes, bibliog.

CODEX EN CRUZ. ATLAS. By Charles E. Dibble. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1981. Vol. 2. Pp. 57. Illus. Vols. 1 and 2, $45.00

TWELVE VOLUMES COMPRISE the *Florentine Codex,* of which *Ceremonies* is perhaps the most significant. As a study of the vital center of Aztec life, culture, and religion, this volume serves an especially valuable purpose. It is also a highly significant document that reveals the process and relationship of oral tradition. The document is based on pictorial codices and the scholastic system of knowledge and learning that came from the *calmecac* centers of pre-Columbian Mexico.

The development of what would become the *Florentine Codex*, over the period 1547–77, involved intensive periods of collaboration between the Franciscan fathers and a wide range of Aztec elders. Sahagun, a Franciscan father, was devoted to more effective proselytization of the Aztecs through a missionary program based on comprehension and use of language and a clear understanding of the customs and institutions of Mexico's native people. This project became known as the *Historia de las Cosas de Nueva España*. That effort, lasting nearly sixty years, revolved around the gathering of data, organization, and many editings of the *Historia* manuscript. Sahagun's techniques were modern by contemporary ethnographic field-study procedures. Carefully worded questionnaires were employed to elicit specific, yet varied, information on the society and its institutional system. The knowledge of such individuals was codex-based, ideally suited to compilation of the types of information Sahagun needed. *Ceremonies* represents an example of the correlation of pictorial codex and verbal exposition that characterized the pre-Columbian systems of recording and transmitting ritual, historical, genealogical, and other knowledge.

Ceremonies is also a description of the Aztec ceremonial calendar (*tonalpohualli*). Like others of the ritual codex genre, it provides a detailed description and account of all facets of the ceremonial system of ancient Mexico. Described are gods of each of the major months and the five "left over" days—*Nemontemi*. The *Atamaluahliztli*, a major feast celebrated every eight years, is depicted as well as examples of ritual scenes. An appendix contains extensive descriptions of the priests and their many services that were necessary to maintain the intensive pantheon of Aztec gods. Excellent accounts are given of the size, location, and activity that took place in nearly eighty temples, shrines, and other important sites. The final entry of the appendix includes perhaps the most eloquent passages of material found in the volume. These entries are the oaths and songs offered to the major gods.

Revision of *Ceremonies* occurred in two ways: (1) extensive review and retranslation of all text, resulting in longer passages, often repetitive, but obviously closer to the original Nahuatl. The result is a greater sense of drama in the ritual scene. An intensity is conveyed by the repeated phrases that transmit the oral traditions' special detail to personal emotion while describing the high detail of the ceremony. (2) All passages on the songs were changed by translating the Nahuatl as verses rather than the simple paragraphs of the earlier edition (p. 221 ff.). The authors are to be commended for this change. The verse form more accurately conveys the ceremonial rhythm, and with the metric sounds, which appear to be notations for musical instrument or vocal accompaniment, one is able to appreciate the full significance of the ritual drama. The overall effect is dramatic and greatly enhances the value of these materials.

Codex en Cruz is a pictorial manuscript depicting native life in the Valley of Mexico, particularly Texcoco. The final manuscript consists of three pages divided into quarters, each extending from a center point in a windmill arrangement. Each arm chronicles, in native pictorial style, a history of fifty-two years, the

Aztec "century" for the region. The codex reports annual events from 1402 through 1533. Depicted are extensive accounts of political and kinship ties involving Texcoco and its dependent centers of Chiautla and Tepetlaoztoc. Relationships of these municipalities with the great Aztec capital, Tenochtitlan, also appear in the accounts. Throughout, important incidents of war, famine, and other events are recorded for respective rulers and regions.

The appearance of these works enriches the growing collection of primary documentation, albeit in facsimile, and extensive studies on the historiography of this virtually untapped corpus of information on Mesoamerican civilization. After three decades of deliberate dedication, the publication of these works also provides a fitting tribute to the lifetime work of Professors Dibble and Anderson. As the *decanos* of the *Nahuatlistas*, their scholarship and contributions and that of others in native literature and philosophy are indeed a legacy of which all who undertake the study and analysis of culture and history can be proud.

Institute of American Indian Arts DAVE WARREN

EXPLORATIONS IN ETHNOHISTORY: INDIANS OF CENTRAL MEXICO IN THE SIXTEENTH CENTURY. Edited by H. R. Harvey and Hanns J. Prem. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. vii, 312. Illus., contributors. $35.00.

THIS COLLECTION OF ESSAYS PROVIDES a valuable sampler of current trends in ethnohistorical study of the native cultures and societies of central Mexico. Although about one-half of the essays deal with colonial Mexico, a major focus is on the effort to reconstruct the social organization of Aztec Mexico, its class structure, land tenure systems, and other similar issues. In their useful introduction, H. R. Harvey and Hanns J. Prem trace the evolution of Mexican ethnohistory from the sixteenth century to the present. Since World War II there has been a notable increase in interest and publications in ethnohistory, accompanied by a shift in emphasis regarding source materials, from the classic Spanish accounts to Indian pictorial and textual documents, a growing concentration on local level materials, and the use of a wide variety of interdisciplinary methods and techniques.

Woodrow Borah's stimulating essay deals with problems confronted by ethnohistorians in working with source materials. Especially interesting are his comments on the "puzzling discrepancy" between Spanish and Indian accounts regarding Aztec social organization. This discrepancy has led some scholars to question the reliability of the most important of the traditional Spanish sources, Alonso de Zorita's famous *Relación*. Properly dismissing the notion that Spanish students like Zorita knew little about Aztec society or that they exaggerated or were simply wrong, Borah suggests other more convincing explanations: (1) there were "marked regional differences that have yet to be explored," and (2) "the conquest, by changing the balance of power and pressures, brought rapid change even in the

earliest years," with the result that the situation portrayed in the Indian records was very different from that which existed on the eve of the conquest.

Equally instructive is H. R. Harvey's careful survey of past and current research on land tenure in ancient Mexico. Like Borah, Harvey rejects the attitude of scholars who discount the value of early Spanish accounts, especially that of Zorita, because of discrepancies between those accounts and later Indian and Spanish documents dealing with land litigation, bills of sale, and other issues. He concludes that the early accounts "provide a general outline of a system that is not incompatible with what can be seen in actual practice from local documents." He adds, however, that "what seems to emerge from individual case studies . . . is that the land tenure system varied with locality or region and, in any case, was more flexible than a literal interpretation of Zorita and some other general descriptions seem to allow."

Pedro Carrasco's essay on the various types of marriage among ruling dynasties in ancient central Mexico clearly demonstrates that, whatever may have been the situation among commoners, those marriages were determined not by prescriptive marriage rules defined by kinship categories but by political relations and succession rules of the ruling houses. James A. Offner's study of household organization in the Texcocan heartland concludes that traditional descriptions of Aztec household organization, inheritance, and land tenure "are clearly inadequate and must be supplemented by the study of archival material." In the same vein, S. L. Cline's study of land tenure and inheritance in late sixteenth-century Culhuacan argues that "prehispanic land tenure was more complex than standard sources indicate."

Finally, one must commend two essays by German scholars. Hanns J. Prem's essay on early Spanish colonization in Puebla refutes the claim of François Chevalier that the Spanish effort to make Spaniards in the Puebla region engage in small-scale agriculture was a success; Prem shows that in Puebla, as elsewhere, there developed a system of immense Spanish estates worked by Indian labor. Wolfgang Trautmann's innovative essay employs a center-periphery model to trace the succession and direction of such processes as the abandonment or resettlement of pueblos, the rise of haciendas, and race mixture in colonial Tlaxcala.

Santa Fe BENJAMIN KEEN

FOUR LEAGUES OF PECOS: A LEGAL HISTORY OF THE PECOS GRANT, 1800–1933. By G. Emlen Hall. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. xxi, 367. Illus., maps, notes, index. $24.95 cloth, $14.95 paper.

THIS IS A WELL-CRAFTED BOOK of many uses. It will be read with profit by anyone interested in the struggle to possess Indian lands in the Southwest. It reveals the greed and corruption of speculators, both Hispanic and Anglo, who exploited the Pecos Indians, and it chronicles the inconsistency of congressional and court decisions, always at the expense of the Pecos survivors.

Hall's interest in Pecos is more than casual. He is an attorney who lived and worked there from 1971 to 1980. He knows the land, and he knows the language. For him, the writing of *Four Leagues* is a kind of "legal history with a vengeance" (p. xviii), in which members of his profession participated in the emasculation of what had once been a proud and powerful Indian community.

The approach is chronological. Hall notes how Pecos Pueblo had begun to weaken under Spanish rule and how Hispanic population explosion during the first thirty years of the nineteenth century led to the search for arable land. By 1803, and with Gov. Fernando Chacón's approval, Spaniards had moved onto lands bordering the Pecos River and inside the Pecos league.

When Mexico won its independence from Spain, the movement toward Pecos accelerated. Whereas the boundaries of the Pecos league had been disputed during the Spanish colonial period, after 1821, Mexicans moved right in claiming that the 9 November 1812 and 4 January 1813 laws the Spanish Cortes passed gave the Mexicans the right to develop excess Pueblo lands (*sobrantes*) in order to improve the dismal state of agriculture. The newly organized legislature of New Mexico (*diputación*) contributed to this encroachment by providing allotments of Pecos land to Mexican citizens, while others simply bought what they coveted from the Indians. Meanwhile, the Indians insisted on their right to dispose of land, arguing that they were equal citizens in the eyes of Mexican law. As their numbers declined, the pueblo became weaker, until finally the last choice piece of agricultural land was deeded over to Juan Estevan Pino by José Cota acting on behalf of the entire pueblo. By 1846, when the North Americans arrived in New Mexico with a new set of laws, the few surviving Pecos Indian families had left the pueblo to live with their relatives at Jemez.

The remainder of Hall's narrative deals with the status of Pecos pueblo and its lands under United States jurisdiction. He provides illuminating biographical sketches of those who used their money, their wiles, their position, or their power to get a piece of land that President Abraham Lincoln had patented to the Pecos pueblo in 1864. He shows how the speculative interest in Pecos reached the financial markets of New York; how the entire grant was bought and sold many times over by people whose singular objective was to make a profit on the resale; and how this kind of outside activity finally resulted in Hispanic landowners' registering their Mexican period land titles in the San Miguel County Court House.

In the final chapters, Hall discusses the conflicting claims to Pecos pueblo and the significance of the decision in *U.S. v. Sandoval*, 1912, which both reversed the ruling in *U.S. v. Joseph*, 1877, and won back for the Pueblos the protection of the federal government. However, when the Pueblo Lands Board finally turned to the Pecos grant, it decided that no lands could be returned to the Pecos survivors, that all Indian claims to Pecos pueblo were extinguished, and that a cash award of $28,145 could be made to the Indian survivors. When this act occurred in 1936, Pecos pueblo ceased to function as a legal entity.

Hall has written a superb book. He has unraveled numerous legal knots in a

presentation that is crisply written, sensitive to human foibles, and powerful in its conclusions. He has the touch of one who has lived intimately with his subject, turned over every document to satisfy the scholar's curiosity, and distilled the evidence with an evenhandedness that merits praise. *Four Leagues of Pecos* is a tour de force written by a modern-day "Pecoseño."

Fort Collins, Colo. DANIEL TYLER

SCHOLARS AND THE INDIAN EXPERIENCE: CRITICAL REVIEWS OF RECENT WRITING IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES. Edited by W. R. Swagerty. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984. Pp. x, 268. Index. $22.50 cloth, $9.95 paper.

SCHOLARS AND THE INDIAN EXPERIENCE is the thirtieth volume in the D'Arcy McNickle Center (formerly the Newberry Library Center) for the History of the American Indian Bibliographical Series. Unlike previously published studies in the series, which focused on literature pertaining to one particular subject, this book contains recent literature on several subject areas.

Editor William R. Swagerty, a member of the Department of History at the University of Idaho, has assembled ten essays, each written by a specialist. They are: "Native American Prehistory" by Dean R. Snow, "Native American Population Collapse and Recovery" by Henry F. Dobyns, "Spanish–Indian Relations, 1513–1821" by W. R. Swagerty, "Anglo–Indian Relations in Colonial North America" by J. Frederick Fausz, "Indian–White Relations: 1790–1900" by Frederick E. Hoxie, "Twentieth Century Federal Indain Policy" by Donald L. Fixico, "Contemporary American Indians" by Russell Thornton, "Native Americans and the Environment" by Richard White, "Indian Tribal Histories" by Peter Iverson, and "The Indian and the Fur Trade" by Jacqueline Peterson and John Anfinson.

In each essay, authors comment on the recent and important literature in their respective areas of expertise and conclude with a selected bibliography. Sources cited include books, articles, and doctoral dissertations. As is common in such studies, the quality of the essays varies, particularly regarding the authors' evaluations of the literature. Some authors should have provided more in-depth critical observations of the literature relating to their subject areas. Others, however, supplied significant critiques of the sources.

Scholars and the Indian Experience contains an introduction by Francis Jennings, director emeritus of the D'Arcy McNickle Center in which Jennings traces the purposes of the center's publications. This book should be a useful resource guide for scholars and college students.

Fort Hays State University RAYMOND WILSON

JOURNAL OF A MOUNTAIN MAN: JAMES CLYMAN. Edited by Linda M. Hasselstrom. Missoula, Mont.: Mountain Press Publishing Company, 1984. Pp. xi, 295. Index, bibliog., maps. $24.95 cloth, $9.95 paper.

JOURNAL OF A MOUNTAIN MAN is the second in a series of fur trade classics to

be published by Mountain Press, under the general editorship of Winfred Blevins. This publication brings to a broad audience the important writings of James Clyman, one of the famed "Ashley men" who in the 1820s mounted the first successfully orchestrated assault on the fur resources of the central Rockies. Clyman is considered a very credible source in the primary literature of the fur trade. His chronicle spans the years from 1823 to 1871, with data concentrated in the 1820s and 1840s. James Clyman is perhaps best remembered for his terse but stirring accounts of the disastrous affray in 1823 between Ashley's trappers and the bellicose and intractable Arikaras and, later, the "surgical" ministrations he applied to Jedediah Smith, after the incipient explorer was badly mauled by a grizzly bear.

Of equal interest, however, are the nine field notebooks Clyman kept on the trail to Oregon and California from 1844 to 1846. Far from being a greenhorn, Clyman's experience and wisdom made him an important addition to the caravan. His comments include observations on fellow travellers, Indians, Mexican Californios, landscape, animal life, and his former companions in the fur trade. A few excerpts of his homely poetry and some ancillary documents are also printed here.

The foundation for this reprinting is the masterful scholarship of Charles L. Camp's *James Clyman, Frontiersman* (1960). Much of editor Linda M. Hasselstrom's work consisted of recasting Camp's exhaustive annotations, which are presented in an abridged narrative format at the beginning and end of chapters. The chapters are further divided by subheadings that highlight noteworthy features within the text.

In her introduction, the editor has the "conspicuously sober and meticulous" Clyman poised in stark contrast to his "tough and savage" peers, presumably the rest of trapperdom. This comparison, like other passages, evinces a tendency toward oversimplification and generalization from notions that have become associated with the trappers. This weakness, in combination with a form of post-frontier romanticism, has conspired to uphold the "popular" imagery of the mountain men, while failing to provide any fresh insights on the "reckless breed." Fur trade scholars have argued, countered, and commented at length over expectant capitalists, frontier proletarians, corporate ruthlessness, and other socioeconomic characteristics of a profoundly diverse group of men whose major unifying earmark was the occupation they followed. The bestowal of the term "mountain man" has the effect of at least partially obscuring all other facets of a man's life, due to a transcendent, mythic quality with which Americans have invested these men-turned-heroes.

This book was published "with the general reader in mind," and we applaud those who have revived this significant work, and at a reasonable price. However, as the editor states, "the scholar is advised to find a copy of Camp for the smaller details and references to repositories of original Clyman material."

National Park Service BARTON BARBOUR

OVERLAND TO CALIFORNIA WITH THE PIONEER LINE: THE GOLD RUSH DIARY OF BERNARD J. REID. Edited by Mary McDougall Gordon. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1983. Pp. xvi, 247. Illus., maps, bibliog., index. $19.95.

WHILE FOR MOST CALIFORNIA EMIGRANTS the overland journey was a family farmer's emigration, the gold fever of 1849 caused many men unused to the rigors and routines of farm and frontier life to head for the gold fields. In this marvelously edited diary of one man's excursion, we discover life on the "Pioneer Line," a commercial St. Louis venture that for $200 offered Eastern passengers a berth in specially built "carriages," tented sleeping quarters, meals, and one hundred pounds of allowable baggage. The line guaranteed to get the passengers to California in sixty days or less. But plagued with bad planning, underfinancing, and poor leadership, the trip took more than 150 hard days of travel and cost the lives of a considerable portion of the company.

The diarist in this book is Bernard J. Reid, a western Pennsylvania schoolteacher, newspaper editor, and sometime surveyor in his mid-twenties, who decided, after reading Frémont's best-selling report of his 1842 expedition, to take the chance of "going west and growing up with the country." Later, in his old age, Reid wrote a journal based on the diary. This publication reproduces the introduction from the journal, the diary in its entirety, and interposes additional detail from the journal and Reid's letters home, as well as the reminiscences and letters of several other participants in the "Pioneer Line."

Like Reid, most passengers were urban-raised and middle-class greenhorns, hardly suited to the rigors of overland travel. None were so "green," however, as the men who organized the line. Progress in the late spring of 1849 was laborious, even on the relatively easy leg of the journey to Fort Kearney. West of Fort Laramie the company began to worry that they would not make it, and visions of the stranded Donner party haunted them. Some men set out on their own, abandoning their baggage and fares, but for most that was too much of a risk. So the passengers took matters into their own hands. They convened a meeting, elected officers and an executive committee, and overthrew the authority of the captain and proprietor. "Pioneer train on its last legs, and needs reform," wrote Reid. "Meeting called in the corral at 1 o'clock to adopt measures for lightening the train" (pp. 80–81).

From these events Gordon suggests an important conclusion: "Even though the Pioneers remained armed and in the majority, they still refrained from violence," and "demonstrated to the end that the frontier did not lead necessarily to lawlessness. The restraints of their social conditioning in the East carried over into the wilderness." Moreover, despite the lack of kin and family cohesion "the passengers did forge strong fraternal bonds among themselves," connections that Reid suggested when he wrote that there had been a "family jar [or fight] in our mess" of single men (p. 97). Men shared food, assisted the sick and straggling, and demonstrated very little of the "each man for himself" kind of individualism that supposedly characterized the American frontier.

The Pioneer Line offers an interesting contrast to other overland experiences. Reid's diary is lively and colorful, and the juxtaposition of journal, diary, letters, and accounts of others make this one of the finest editions of an overland diary to appear in many years.

Mount Holyoke College JOHN MACK FARAGHER

WEST BY SOUTHWEST: LETTERS OF JOSEPH PRATT ALLYN, A TRAVELLER ALONG THE SANTA FE TRAIL, 1863. Edited by David K. Strate. Dodge City: Kansas Heritage Center, 1984. Pp. 193. Illus., bibliog., index. $7.95.

IN 1863 PRESIDENT LINCOLN APPOINTED Joseph P. Allyn to be one of the associate justices of the supreme court for the newly created Arizona Territory. Allyn, with most of the other territorial officials, left New York in August 1863 to travel overland to Arizona. Before he left his native Connecticut, Allyn agreed to provide the *Hartford Evening Press* with periodic accounts of his experiences and observations in the West. His letters were published in the newspaper during the next several years.

The twenty letters republished here cover Allyn's trip from St. Louis, Missouri, to Fort Wingate (located at the present San Rafael), New Mexico. The route the party followed, accompanied by a large military escort, included the Santa Fe Trail via the mountain branch. Allyn describes the towns and military posts through which he passed, the Indians encountered, the problems and incidents of western travel—in fact, everything intended to interest and instruct the eastern reader unfamiliar with the West. Because the Civil War is underway, the impact of that conflict on the areas through which he travels is always present in his correspondence. Allyn is a perceptive observer, and his writing is colorful and often amusing.

In addition to a general introduction, the editor has provided an introduction to each of the five sections into which he divides the letters. The letters are reproduced as they appeared in the newspaper; the misspellings, as noted, are probably a result of the inability to decipher Allyn's handwriting. The numerous misspellings of personal and place names in other portions of the book, however, are unexplained. Factual errors also occur, such as the editor's statement that the invading Texans occupied Fort Craig (p. 117) and the substitution of Camp Floyd, New Mexico, for what should be Camp Floyd, Utah (p. 179). Furthermore, many of the sources cited in the footnotes are not included in the bibliography, and the index is incomplete.

Still, Allyn's letters are an interesting addition to the published travel accounts for the West. They can be read for pleasure, but they also contain much of use for the serious student of that period of the West. Although the account published here ends at Fort Wingate, Allyn's subsequent correspondence has been published in John Nicholson, ed., *The Arizona of Joseph Pratt Allyn.*

Casa Grande, Ariz. ROBERT W. FRAZER

TEXAS COWBOYS. Edited by Jim Lanning and Judy Lanning. College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 1984. Pp. xvii, 233. Illus., bibliog. $15.95.

IN MAY OF 1915 GEORGE W. SAUNDERS, founder of the Old Time Trail Drivers Association, contacted the membership of his fledgling organization requesting each member to write a personal account of the "dangers, vicissitudes, and hardships" they endured while driving cattle and horses up the trail from 1865 to 1896. The more than three hundred reminiscences received were subsequently published in two volumes (1920, 1923) entitled *The Trail Drivers of Texas*.

In 1938, writers with the Works Projects Administration (WPA), Federal Writers' Project in Texas began to collect similar first-person narratives from former trail drivers along with accounts from men who had worked on many of the early ranches of the state. Copies of these narratives, nearly four hundred in number, were sent to the Library of Congress in response to instructions from the WPA Washington office in 1940.

Forty-two years later, Jim and Judy Lanning reviewed the narratives in what became the Texas Rangelore Collection at the Library of Congress and selected thirty-two representative pieces to form the present volume. Their purpose, as stated in the introduction, was to "present first-person narratives of old-time Texas cowboys recounting their perceptions of range life" (p. xi).

The reader of *Texas Cowboys* learns of the often-told perils incident to stopping stampedes, pushing cattle across swollen rivers, and counteracting Indians and cattle rustlers. The portion of each narrative, however, that fulfills the editors' purpose and makes the book of special value is that which reveals the predominant attitudes and preoccupations of these men of the early Texas range. Almost to a person, each informant discusses such pertinent cowboy subjects as loyalty to one's brand, their devotion and overwhelming interest in horses, and the changes brought about in range work because of the coming of railroads and fences into Texas.

The editors have done well in grouping the narratives into five thematic chapters with accounts by ranch cowboys, trail drivers, wranglers/horse breakers, minorities, and women. Because the WPA informants were interviewed more than twenty years after the *Trail Drivers* accounts were collected, some informants detail events different from those of their earlier colleagues. For example, along with encountering accounts of trailing cattle to railheads in Kansas and pastures in Montana, one also reads of later and shorter drives to shipping points such as Amarillo or markets like Fort Worth.

Photographs by cowboy photographer Erwin Smith are included to illustrate typical events or situations in the text and are indicative of the editors' genuine understanding of their subject. Altogether *Texas Cowboys* is an oral history that makes good, informative reading for everyone interested in cowboy life on the early Texas range.

Cimarron, N. Mex. STEPHEN ZIMMER

HASHKNIFE COWBOY: RECOLLECTIONS OF MACK HUGHES. Edited by Stella Hughes. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1984. Pp. xiii, 234. Illus., index, $17.50.

BY THE 1920S THE FAMOUS HASHKNIFE OUTFIT no longer controlled the immense rangelands that its original investors had acquired in northern Arizona in 1884. Seemingly endless stretches of open land still remained the dominant characteristic of the area, although a few small towns had grown up along the main line of the Santa Fe railroad. As Mack Hughes relates in *Hashknife Cowboy: The Recollections of Mack Hughes,* that sparsely settled terrain was "sure fine for cattle ranchin'." Compiled and edited by Stella Hughes, the book details the experiences of a young ranch hand during the twenties and early Depression years. More than two dozen illustrations by western artist Joe Beeler accompany the narrative and effectively complement Hughes's descriptions of the events and incidents of his boyhood years in northern Arizona.

The Hashknife brand belonged initially to the Aztec Land and Cattle Company, but when it failed in the early twentieth century Flagstaff's Babbitt brothers purchased most of its holdings along with the famous brand. By then Hashknife cowboys were no longer the "wild and lawless bunch" described by Earle R. Forrest in *Arizona's Dark and Bloody Ground.* Mack Hughes's father disputed the dime novel stereotypes, arguing that most Hashknife employees were just hard-working cowboys, anxious to make a living. "It was them western story writers that ruined their reputations," he explained to young Mack.

Hughes went to work for the outfit in 1922 at the age of twelve and spent most of the next thirteen years on its payroll. Cowboys' wages were meager then—only thirty dollars a month and "found." Even a top hand like his father drew only sixty-five dollars a month. Indeed, Mack Hughes never made much money as an employee of the Hashknife ranch; he accumulated a "neat little pile" only in the early 1930s when a local bootlegger hired him as a truck driver at five dollars a day.

Pleasant working conditions hardly compensated for the low wages, and a cowboy's chores invariably were physically demanding and usually dirty. Hughes recalls the clouds of dust that enveloped roundups and remembers well the stinking process of dipping cattle to prevent an outbreak of the "scab." Such accounts are as vivid as his occasional praise for the region's clear air and pristine scenery. A chapter on "Winter at Sixteen Mile" recounts the solitude of a winter camp on Chevelon Creek—"the most awful lonesome place in the whole, wide world."

Hughes never explains directly the powerful lure that attracted men to the lifestyle of a cowboy; more often he is content to explain that "You gotta want to be a cowboy." His reminiscences suggest, however, that a sense of independence and self-confidence were strong incentives. Earning the respect of older ranch hands and enjoying the camaraderie among cowboys no doubt contributed also. Upon leaving the Sixteen Mile camp in 1924, Hughes could boast that "I'd sure come up a notch in the world, holding down a winter camp by myself, a full

month's pay in my pocket, and ridin' to town to visit my folks wearing real cowboy boots for the first time in my life."

Beyond acquiring a few personal possessions over the years, Hughes's years as a Hashknife cowboy brought little else tangible. His hopes of owning his own spread grew slimmer each year and perhaps induced him to abandon Hashknife country in 1935 to go to work on his uncle's ranch near Superior, Arizona.

Hashknife Cowboy is an enjoyable book, and it will appeal to general readers and professional historians. The book is an important contribution to the historical literature on the twentieth-century cattle industry; it also illuminates a significant portion of the history of the Little Colorado River area of northern Arizona.

Northern Arizona University GEORGE LUBICK

UNLIKELY WARRIORS: GENERAL BENJAMIN GRIERSON AND HIS FAMILY. By William H. Leckie and Shirley A. Leckie. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1984. Pp. xv, 368. Illus., bibliog., notes, index. $19.95.

THE LECKIES HAVE SKILFULLY WOVEN three stories into a single fascinating narrative. This is the story of Gen. Benjamin H. Grierson, the story of the military events of the Civil War and Indian conflicts in which he participated, and the story of the Grierson family. That such a complicated undertaking is successful is testimony to the Leckies' abilities as historians and to a remarkable family's habit of laying all bare in a great outpouring of paper, then saving the paper for posterity.

Ben Grierson was not one of America's great soldiers, but he played a role in the Civil and Indian wars significant enough to deserve chronicling. He left civil life in 1861 a failed merchant and penniless music teacher to demonstrate leadership, energy, and military aptitude in the western armies. As colonel of an Illinois cavalry regiment, he led the famed "Grierson's Raid" through Mississippi in 1863, then repeated the triumph a year later. He emerged from the war a major general of volunteers, which gained him a colonel's commission in the postwar regular army. For the next twenty-five years he commanded the Tenth Cavalry, one of two mounted black regiments. In Indian Territory, Texas, and Arizona, Grierson and his "buffalo soldiers" wrote a record of punishing service and constructive achievement that went largely unrecognized and even ridiculed because of widespread prejudice against blacks, both in and out of the army. In the Leckies' rendition, both military history and military biography are competently presented.

An even greater virtue of the book, however, is the portrayal of Grierson the man and the Grierson family. The voluminous Grierson Papers permit this to be done with unusual authority. Grierson himself was a gentle, kindly man, competent and energetic in military endeavors though judged by many to be too tolerant to enforce proper discipline and, out West, too ready to see the Indian side of the question.

With his wife, Alice Kirk Grierson, Ben pursued a rocky course that featured

pleasure and pain, warm affection and cold rejection. Alice also brought to the union a fatal gene that struck the Grierson children with insanity. Not only the relationships of the immediate family are probed, but also of brothers, sisters, and in-laws. These Griersons and Kirks may not be of great historical significance, but their story, as expertly presented by the Leckies, is always interesting and often absorbing.

Unlikely Warriors should rest on all bookshelves devoted to military and frontier history and may be commended to all who simply wish a good story, well told, about people trying to cope with one another and with themselves.

Santa Fe ROBERT M. UTLEY

CITIZEN SOLDIERS: OKLAHOMA'S NATIONAL GUARD. By Kenny Franks. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1984. Pp. xiii, 234. Bibliog., illus., index. $24.95.

IN 1895, IN AMPLE TIME FOR MEMBERS to participate in the Spanish-American War, the territorial government of Oklahoma established the state's first citizen militia. In 1908 this state militia became the Oklahoma National Guard, with a complement of 945 men. With congressional approval of the National Defense Act of 1916, the government directed the reorganization of state guard units and the general upgrading of their combat preparedness. Shortly after this action, President Woodrow Wilson federalized the Oklahoma National Guard and sent it to the Rio Grande. Mexico was suffering a revolution, and in March 1916, Mexican bandit-revolutionary Francisco "Pancho" Villa had led his *soldados* across the international border in an attack on Columbus, New Mexico. Wilson ordered the United States Army into Mexico to capture Villa. He also called up several National Guard units, including the Oklahomans, for border duty. The army ended its chase in January 1917, but the Oklahoma Guardsmen remained at the border until 31 March 1917.

The Oklahoma guardsmen were home only briefly, however, for their services were needed in the impending war in Europe. The Oklahomans participated in the Meuse-Argonne offensive and in several other battles. After the war, all national guard divisions were restructured. Between World War I and II, the Oklahoma group became part of the Forty-Fifth Infantry Division. The Thunderbird Division, as it was known, was federalized again in August 1940, as war loomed in Europe. In July 1943, the men of the division joined the allied invasion of Sicily and later battles at Salerno and Anzio. At the end of the war the Forty-Fifth returned to its state duties.

In 1950, with the Communist invasion of South Korea, the division once again was called to federal service. It was the first national guard division to enter the fighting and engaged in several bitter battles. The Oklahomans did not return home until 1954.

While this work contains information primarily about the foot soldiers, it also includes a brief outline of the establishment and operation of the Oklahoma Air

National Guard. Organized in the 1930s, this group was mobilized and served during World War II. It, too, was recalled for the Korean conflict.

This book is not intended to be a comprehensive nor interpretive history. It contains only general information about activities of the Oklahoma National Guard. The author researched most of the text from secondary sources, although he also used a few primary materials in the Oklahoma National Guard Museum in Oklahoma City. This is basically a popular, pictoral history. Adequate maps, excellent Bill Mauldin cartoons, and photographs make this a worthwhile purchase for the military history buff.

Oklahoma State University JOE A. STOUT, JR.

KARL BODMER'S AMERICA. Introduction by William H. Goetzmann; annotated by David C. Hunt and Marsha V. Gallagher; artist's biography by William J. Orr. Omaha: Joslyn Art Museum; Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1984. Pp. viii, 376. Illus., notes. $65.00.

IN THE SPRING OF 1833, a scientific party led by an experienced German naturalist, Maximilian, Prince of Wied-Neuwied, ascended the Missouri River to a remote fur trading post, Fort McKenzie, hundreds of miles above St. Louis in the heart of Blackfoot territory. After a brutal but productive winter on the upper Missouri at the Mandan trading post of Fort Clark, Maximilian's party returned to St. Louis the following spring. The most significant work to come out of this scientific blitzkrieg was that of Maximilian's hired artist, Karl Bodmer, a young Swiss draftsman. Reflecting the ethnological interests of his employer, Bodmer drew remarkably detailed portraits of tribes of the upper Missouri—Omahas, Sioux, Mandans, Crows, Blackfeet, and Assiniboines—and their accoutrements. Although the American artist George Catlin had sketched his way up the Missouri to the Yellowstone just a year ahead of Bodmer, the Swiss artist had greater time and skill. Bodmer's drawings, more accurate and fully realized than Catlin's, capture the personalities of individual Indians. Catlin and Bodmer were the first artists to draw the Missouri River tribes, and for many Indians these drawings would be the last. A smallpox epidemic in 1838 took the lives of all of the Mandans and half of the Blackfeet. Bodmer's images remain the best visual record of a world rapidly vanishing in the face of white encroachment.

For a time, Bodmer's drawings also vanished. Eighty-one aquatint plates based on Bodmer's American sketches were published in Europe in 1839, but most of the original drawings disappeared into the Wied castle on the Rhine, not to surface again until after World War II. Today, Bodmer's original American sketches and watercolors are housed at the Joslyn Art Museum in Omaha.

In 1984, on the 150th anniversary of the expedition, the Joslyn mounted an impressive exhibit, *Views of a Vanishing Frontier.* The exhibit contains some 120 Bodmer sketches and watercolors; *Karl Bodmer's America,* a beautiful, oversize book, contains reproductions of nearly three times that number of Bodmer draw-

ings—almost the entire collection at the Joslyn. The illustrations, individually explicated by David C. Hunt and Marsha V. Gallagher, curators at the Joslyn, comprise the bulk of this book. The decision to print the illustrations on uncoated paper gives them the delicate appearance of watercolors, but represents a gamble. Uncoated paper absorbs ink and makes the task of controlling colors more difficult. The printer was not up to the challenge. Some images copied well, but reproductions of some of Bodmer's best-known watercolors lack vividness of color and tonal range.

Another Joslyn curator, William J. Orr, provides a brief, fascinating biography of Bodmer, and the artist's work is suggestively evaluated and placed in context by America's most renowned historian of the art of exploration, William Goetzmann. In addition to explaining the significance of Bodmer's Missouri River drawings, Goetzmann argues that if Bodmer's sketches of his trips between the East Coast and St. Louis, and of a side trip to New Orleans, had been published, they "might have been the best illustrated travel book of Jacksonian America" (p. 18). *Bodmer's America,* together with the excellent exhibition catalogue, *Views of a Vanishing Frontier,* now makes Bodmer's remarkable work easily accessible and understandable. This is a splendid achievement, worthy of the work of the artist.

Southern Methodist University DAVID J. WEBER

VIEWS OF A VANISHING FRONTIER. By John C. Ewers, Marsha V. Gallagher, David C. Hunt, Joseph C. Porter. Omaha: Center for Western Studies/Joslyn Art Museum; Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1984. Pp. 103. Illus. $29.95.

GEORGE CATLIN WAS NOT THE FIRST ARTIST to paint a gallery of Indian portraits. Nor was he the first to paint Indians in their own setting. His claim to primacy rests on the fact that he *was* the first to paint an extensive record of Indian life on his own initiative, thus distinguishing himself from those artists who accompanied U.S. government expeditions, and from the two other well-known Indian painters of the 1830s, Karl Bodmer and Alfred Jacob Miller, who were hired by foreign patrons to accompany them into the American interior in 1833–34 and 1837, respectively. Artists and patrons alike were linked in interesting ways. Bodmer with Prince Maximilian of Wied saw Catlin's Missouri River Indian paintings in St. Louis in 1833 and instead of retracing his 1832 travels up the Missouri came near to traipsing overland to Santa Fe partly at the instigation of the Scottish nobleman Sir William Drummond Stewart, later Miller's patron and an acquaintance of Catlin personally familiar with his work. In the end, Maximilian and Bodmer ascended the Missouri further than Catlin, to Blackfoot country, and produced their record of the Missouri tribes. All this seems relevant because the 150th anniversary of the Maximilian-Bodmer expedition has inspired a major retrospective exhibition and several publications advancing the case for Karl Bodmer as the supreme painter of the American Indian in the 1830s.

Views of a Vanishing Frontier, the exhibition catalogue, makes the case implicitly (with excellent plates of some of Bodmer's scenes and portraits) and explicitly (in John C. Ewers's "An Appreciation of Karl Bodmer's Pictures of Indians," one of three scholarly essays in the catalogue). As for the plates, Bodmer's watercolors are striking, meticulous representations of exactly what he saw before him, executed under the eye of his demanding patron. Joseph Porter's essay on Maximilian effectively places him in the early nineteenth-century natural history tradition dominated by a "zeal to acquire specimens and record factual details" and dedicated to "observation, description, and classification" (p. 12). Bodmer's work faithfully mirrors Maximilian's concerns. Beneath his vivid colors and fine draftsmanship is an almost clinical detachment, which helps explain the enthusiasm of an ethnologist like Ewers who credits Bodmer with the most accurate (and artistic) depictions extant of an intertribal battle, a sizable Indian village, the interior of an earth lodge, a full-length figure, and an Indian dance. Because Bodmer's subjects were dressed up for the picture-taking, their finery is not really representative, though as Ewers points out, the notion of tribal costume is skewed by the extensive interchange documented in Bodmer's studies and the influence of individual taste. In short, Bodmer accomplished what he set out to do. His work preserves specimens under glass, as close to one kind of reality as we will ever come. It is not as clear that Bodmer captured the human reality, the person, before him; his is the art of precisely rendered surfaces, not interiors. In this respect Catlin, for all his manifest weaknesses, was the superior portrait painter.

Besides the essays by Ewers and Porter, *Views of a Vanishing Frontier* includes Marsha Gallagher and David Hunt's chronicle of Maximilian and Bodmer's travels in the American interior. A special feature of the exhibition and the catalog is a selection of ethnographic and historic objects (some of which are illustrated) that complement Bodmer's pictorial record of the expedition.

University of Victoria BRIAN W. DIPPIE

PUEBLO DECO: THE ART DECO ARCHITECTURE OF THE SOUTHWEST. By Marcus Whiffen and Carla Breeze. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. Pp. xi, 125. Illus., notes, index. $19.95.

PUEBLO DECO CONTAINS THREE PARTS: 1) Introduction, a brief historical summary by Marcus Whiffen of the Art Deco movement; 2) Examples, a factual catalogue of selected southwestern Art Deco buildings; and 3) Color Plates, a collection of glossy color photographs by Carla Breeze of those buildings. Suggesting a scaled-down coffee table book (like the presently popular "economy size" automobile) with its elegantly phrased yet lamentably compact text aggrandized by the artistic detailing of numerous photographs, it belongs to an increasingly familiar academic genre. The most direct prototype is Cervin Robinson and Rosemary Haag Bletter's *Skyscraper Style: Art Deco New York* (1975), although one might also think of David Gebhard and Harriette Von Breton's *L.A. in the 1930's* (1975) if one over-

looked the utilitarian photographs of that book. These books share the common premise of being introductions to a long-ignored, recently rediscovered subject. But if introductions per se are perfectly acceptable, the introductory premise of Art Deco books is rapidly becoming (like the 1950s automobile) a methodological dinosaur. When, this scholar wonders, are historians going to stop *introducing* the Art Deco as if no one had heard of it? When, instead, are they going to start *studying* it with the thoughtful analysis that it deserves?

The consequent frustration is illustrated by the authors' treatment of their purported subject. Apart from a catalogue so incomplete that even Whiffen admits that it is "not a complete guide" (p. 19), the general and regional definitions of Art Deco are terse to the point of raising more questions than they answer.

Chapter IV of the Introduction, "Art Deco in the Southwest," devotes most of its three pages to historical background on the evolution of Pueblo and Spanish styles. One short paragraph deals with southwestern Art Deco (p. 19). We are told that "Pueblo-style forms are combined with ornament from North American Indian sources" or that "Indian motifs are used in a frankly modern architectural setting"; and that these motifs, "taken from pottery, basket work, jewelry and textiles," share qualities of "angularity, repetitiveness, and abstraction . . . with much Art Deco ornament, so that aesthetic as well as regional considerations sanctioned their use." This assertion agrees with the claim made on page 16 that Art Deco was primarily "a style of ornament," although it hardly explains why the many buildings included in the book that do not use Indian motifs qualify as examples of Pueblo Deco.

The confusion is compounded by a claim made earlier on page 16 that Art Deco architects were "intent on creating works of architecture that should be, first of all, contemporary—expressive of their time, of their present." Since the modernism of Indian motifs is never explained, it remains unclear why their use on such buildings as the KiMo Theater in Albuquerque *is* Art Deco—although the KiMo, a movie theater located on the automobile strip of Route 66, was certainly expressive of its time. It is revealing in this context that Whiffen, when summarizing Art Deco's origins, fails to mention Hugh Ferriss, the New York City architect whose studies of skyscraper *massings* directly influenced American Art Deco architecture.

Although Art Deco was a highly decorative style, its aesthetic identity lay, not in its widely varied ornamental motifs, but in more abstract formal qualities that determined a building's forms as well as its details. Art Deco's contemporaneity was expressed by a stylistic coherence of architectural form and ornament according to the qualities of "angularity, repetitiveness, and abstraction"; having introduced those qualities, Whiffen needs to re-examine works like the KiMo Theater to explain why its entire design, not just its Indian motifs, is Art Deco, and to explain how—if at all—this Art Deco aesthetic was inflected by its use in the Southwest.

University of New Mexico CHRISTOPHER MEAD

THE REEL WEST: CLASSIC STORIES THAT INSPIRED CLASSIC FILMS. Edited by Bill Pronzini and Martin H. Greenberg. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday & Company, Inc., 1984. Pp. ix, 177. $11.95.

EDITORS BILL PRONZINI AND MARTIN H. GREENBERG have resurrected ten short stories that presumably "inspired classic films." The stories are certainly worth reading in their own right and represent the early mastery of Bret Harte ("Tennessee's Partner"), Stephen Crane ("The Bride Comes To Yellow Sky," filmed as part of *Face to Face*), and O. Henry ("A Double-Dyed Deceiver," filmed as *The Texan*), along with the postwar writing of James Warner Bellah ("Massacre," filmed as *Fort Apache*), John Cunningham ("The Tin Star," filmed as *High Noon*), Steve Frazee ("My Brother Down There," filmed as *Running Target*), Elmore Leonard ("Three-Ten to Yuma," filmed as *3:10 to Yuma*), Dorothy M. Johnson ("The Man Who Shot Liberty Valance"), Frank Gruber ("Town Tamer"), and Jack Schaefer ("Jeremy Rodock," filmed as *Tribute to a Bad Man*).

The subtitle of this anthology is misleading in that most of the short stories did not become "Classic" films. Only *High Noon, Fort Apache,* and, arguably, *The Man Who Shot Liberty Valance* merit such distinction. I doubt that other than the most avid fan of B-westerns will have sampled or even know of the filmed version of "Tennessee's Partner," "My Brother Down There," or "Town Tamer." (One wonders about the editors' familiarity with the better-known *3:10 to Yuma* since they mistakenly have Felicia Farr playing Van Heflin's wife instead of the lonely barmaid.) Film scholars may also wince at the notion that a short story "inspired" a film (Classic or otherwise), as if screenwriters and directors had little to do with the venture. The introduction does at least suggest that some of the short stories, because of their brevity, "contributed only the basic idea of the movies they became."

Still, for the film historian, this collection is valuable for exploring questions of authorship. For example, it is clear from reading John Cunningham's "The Tin Star" that blacklisted Carl Foreman's screenplay for *High Noon* accounts for the film's decidedly critical view of a western community. By the same token, screenwriter Michael Blankfort and director Robert Wise must take the blame for the talky melodramatics of *Tribute to a Bad Man* when that film is compared with Jack Schaefer's lean and leathery portrait of "Jeremy Rodock."

Whether Hollywood filmmakers improved or diminished their original material, they cannot be faulted for having selected the kind of literary fare offered in this volume. It is good to have most of these short stories back in print.

Texas A&M University JOHN H. LENIHAN

ZANE GREY'S ARIZONA. By Candace C. Kant. Flagstaff, Ariz.: Northland Press, 1984. Pp. xix, 184. Illus., bibliog., notes. $14.95.

ONE OF THE TRULY DEPLORABLE CIRCUMSTANCES under which western literary

scholars have to operate is the continuing presence of the Zane Grey papers under the capricious administrative custody of the Grey family rather than some public archives where access could be had at least under some consistent policy, however restrictive. Studies of Grey's life and work consequently fall into two main categories: those written by a mediocre lot who somehow gained access to the mother lode but failed to mine it properly, and those who have exhibited some interpretive skill but have been forced to exercise it only upon the novels and whatever Grey collections are publicly accessible.

Candace C. Kant's new study is a refreshing exception, though the more pessimistic among us will wonder if whatever mystifying alignment of astral bodies that conspired to bring this capable scholar into contact with at least a major part of the Grey materials will ever repeat itself. But no matter. Let us be thankful that Kant had access at least to liberal portions of the Grey correspondence (though not, evidently, the extensive diaries kept by both Grey and his wife, diaries that surely would have been a major help to her), and that she had the diligence to support the opportunity by visits to other major Grey collections, a thorough reading and understanding of his books, and especially by utilization of a considerable variety of fugitive newspaper and magazine articles by and about Grey, a wonderfully revealing body of source material largely ignored by previous scholars.

Her theme, indicated by the title, is Grey's real-life experiences in Arizona and the ways in which he turned them into fictional and cinematic material. If one expands the term "Arizona" slightly, as she does, to include the canyon country of southern Utah, her thesis is correct that Grey's experiences in that area and the creative works based on those experiences are absolutely central to his life, thought, and art.

The book is divided into two main sections: biographical and literary, with an added chapter on the Grey movies. In each of the two main sections, she considers his experiences and novels relating to four geographical regions: the canyons, the Navajo–Hopi reservations, the southern Arizona desert, and the Mogollon Rim. It is a bit of a lopsided scheme, as she acknowledges, for Grey's love for the desert never rivaled his attachment to the other regions.

Kant is fully aware of the contemporary intellectual and political developments by which Grey was influenced and against which he reacted, though she devotes little space to comparisons with other similar writers who dealt with some of the same themes that concerned Grey. One applauds, too, her consideration of the Grey movies; students of western literature are increasingly including cinema within their purview to good effect, and Kant's chapter helps deepen and extend her literary studies.

In spite of its seeming geographical limitations, *Zane Grey's Arizona* is the finest interpretive study of Grey's life and work available. It calls to our notice once again the need for a full-scale literary biography, but unrestricted access to the sources will obviously have to precede that.

Utah State Historical Society GARY TOPPING