New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 59 | Number 1 Article 7

1-1-1984

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 59, 1 (1984). https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol59/iss1/7

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in New Mexico Historical Review by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

BOOK NOTES

Salinas: Archaeology, History, Prehistory, the annual bulletin of the School of American Research, is available from that Santa Fe institution. It consists of six essays on those pueblos in the Estancia Basin. Authors include Richard Lange, Polly Schaafsma, John Wilson, and Joe Sanchez.

Documentary Publications (Route 12, Box 480, Salisbury, N. C. 28144) recently published two books relating to the Mexican Revolution. *Blood Below the Border: American Eye-witness Accounts of the Mexican Revolution* (cloth, $27.95) and *Abajo El Gringo: Anti-American Sentiment During the Mexican Revolution* (cloth, $27.95) are edited by Gene Z. Hanrahan and consist of collections of documents on those topics.

Another important collection of documents is *Papers Concerning Robertson's Colony in Texas,* vol. 9, edited by Malcolm D. McLean (University of Texas at Arlington Press, cloth, $25.00). This large volume in an award-winning series deals with Sterling Robertson's colony, founded in the 1830s in the area north of Austin. The documents, which also include Spanish records for the region, consist largely of official land grants to 132 individuals for a total of 474,630 acres. Genealogists in particular will find this volume very useful.

First published in 1963, *Southwestern Book Trails* by Lawrence Clark Powell is now available from William Gannon, Publisher, 143 Sombrio Drive, Santa Fe (paper, $7.95; library binding, $15.00). Powell focuses on the literature of the Southwest and also along the way says a lot about people and places.

Among recent publications relating to New Mexico and the Southwest is *Time, Space, and Transition in Anasazi Prehistory* by Michael S. Berry (University of Utah Press, cloth, $20.00), a revision of a doctoral dissertation in which the author challenges the traditional description of a gradual development of Anasazi culture. He argues that Basketmaker-Pueblo evolution was characterized by abrupt transitional events and that a series of droughts caused a mingling of peoples resulting in a new synthesis of material culture traits in the ensuing stage. Berry suggests a new way of evaluating Anasazi development although not all experts will agree with his conclusions.

The South Corner of Time: Hopi, Navajo, Papago, Yaqui Tribal Literature, edited by Larry Evers (University of Arizona Press, $35.00 cloth, $14.95 paper) is a collection of prose and poetry largely by contemporary authors supplemented by a fine group of photographs. It first appeared as a volume of *Sun Tracks,* an American Indian literary series published by students and faculty at the University of Arizona and consisted then of published and unpublished material. This is a good collection of southwestern Indian literature and is a useful contribution to a subject of growing interest.

Book Reviews

TUCSON, THE LIFE AND TIMES OF AN AMERICAN CITY. By C. L. Sonnichsen. Maps by Donald H. Bufkin. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1982. Pp. xiv, 369. Illus., maps, bibliog., index. $29.95.

TUCSON IS THE TWENTIETH MAJOR BOOK on the Southwest published by C. L. Sonnichsen, who is senior editor of the *Journal of Arizona History* and H. Y. Benedict Professor of English, Emeritus, University of Texas at El Paso. It stands as a model municipal history, and, like the author's other works, is lucidly written, meticulously researched, and comprehensive in treatment.

Beginning with the founding of Tucson, 20 August 1775, by don Hugo O'Conor, a red-headed Irishman in the employ of the Spanish government, the story follows the development of a royal presidio on the site and the struggling efforts of Jesuits, and later Franciscans, to establish a missionary program among the neighboring Papagos. As a "post farthest out," to use Sonnichsen's descriptive phrase, Tucson remained a backwater place to the end of the colonial period.

The sleepy adobe hamlet on the banks of the Santa Cruz River did not begin to stir until the mid-nineteenth century. Evidently, isolation had produced some advantage in the formation of citizens' character. Robert W. Bliss, who marched through with the Mormon Battalion in late 1846, commented: "The people here are the most friendly and intelligent I have seen of all the Spaniards."

When Congress approved the Gadsden Purchase on 29 June 1854, Tucson became an American town and the only one of any importance between Mesilla and San Diego. With arrival of the first Overland Mail coach in 1858, it became a noted stage stop, infamous for bad food. "There were jerked beef, and beans, and some things they called bread and coffee," lamented one weary passenger. "You ate what was pushed to you."

The Civil War briefly disrupted life in the town, as it was occupied first by Confederate troops and afterward by Gen. Henry Carleton's California Column. In the midst of the conflict, Lincoln signed the bill (24 February 1863) creating the territory of Arizona from the western half of New Mexico.

As the foremost community in the new territory, the author notes, Tucson should have been designated the capital. But Carleton was opposed since it was a hotbed of southern sympathizers. So the capital went north to Prescott. Later in the decade, it was transferred to Tucson where the first government offices were lodged in a series of adobe buildings with dirt floors and dirt roofs.

With advent of the railroad in 1880, respectability grew in Tucson. Economic stimulation came from mining and stock raising in the surrounding countryside and from the rise of merchant princes within the town itself. An invasion of health-seekers, lapping into the twentieth century, contributed both to the economy and to the increased "Americanization" of the place.

The author dwells at length upon the modern era—the two world wars and the effects of the Great Depression. And, as in earlier sections, he gives emphasis to the leading figures whose business interests and notions of progress shaped the destiny of the expanding metropolis.

Sonnichsen does not shy away from sounding warnings and pointing out flaws with regard to the direction Tucson is now going. That is suggested by his alliterative chapter headings: "Precarious Paradise" and "The Price of Progress." Its remoteness from the mainstream of American life, its location in the arid reaches of the lower Sonoran Desert, and especially its rapidly declining water supply, he says, have led modern residents of Tucson to buy prosperity on the installment plan, unmindful of the inexorable bill collector.

The author's sweeping perspective and efficient control of a vast number of sources contribute to the success of the book. It should be a welcome addition to the library of all serious southwestern readers.

Cerrillos, N.M. MARC SIMMONS

AFTER THE GOLD RUSH: SOCIETY IN GRASS VALLEY AND NEVADA CITY, CALIFORNIA 1849–1870. By Ralph Mann. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1982. Appendixes, notes, bibiog., index. $25.00.

THIS STUDY IS MORE THAN A TALE OF TWO TOWNS. Using the latest quantitative methodology and computer techniques, essential to contemporary social historians, the author has provided an in-depth analysis of society on the urban mining frontier.

The history of Grass Valley and Nevada City is presented in three distinct periods: 1849 through 1856 when the settlements struggled for survival and attempted to establish middle-class values; 1856 through 1863, a period of economic depression, political reorganization, and social stability; 1863 through 1870 when the emphasis shifts to industrial mining, resulting in clashes between the foreign- and native-born and between miners and owners. Throughout each period, Mann is concerned with the ethnic mix in the communities, an effort to establish nationally recognized value systems, and the development of family structures. In Gold Rush society he notes contrasts between these towns and the surrounding townships. Detailed information is provided on housing, living arrangements, occupations, boosterism, fear of impermanence, social deviation and disorder, roles of women, the Nisenan (the local Indian tribe), Irish, Cornish, Blacks, Chinese, and numerous other institutions and people. Emphasis in the period was upon reform and the establishment of order, campaigns launched by newspaper editors and supporters of churches and schools that culminated in the physical segregation of undesirable institutions and people.

Depopulation resulted from mining rushes to the Fraser River in British Columbia and to the Comstock of Nevada. Depression set in threatening the two communities. In the struggle for survival, dissimilarities developed with Nevada

City emphasizing commerce and Grass Valley the quartz industry. The Comstock encouraged trade and business in Nevada City and provided improved mining techniques that assisted Grass Valley. Nevada City became Republican; Grass Valley, Democratic. The political partisanship in the era of the Civil War reflected economic and ethnic differences in the two communities.

The quartz boom of the middle and late 1860s wrought many changes. The middle class, becoming more secure and separate, bolstered family life notably in Nevada City. In Grass Valley, ethnic and racial groups developed a greater self-consciousness, and attempts to introduce dynamite and Chinese work forces led to the creation of a Miner's Union and a strike. The result was an attack upon the Chinese with Grass Valley becoming a Cornish miners' town.

The author has utilized three types of sources. Tremendous, at times almost overwhelming, data has been gleaned from the federal censuses of 1850, 1860, and 1870. Numerous newspapers and town directories for the two communities provide the narrative, and the values, concerns, and attitudes of the inhabitants are reflected in diaries, sermons, and travel accounts. With magisterial skill, Mann has integrated, analyzed, and interpreted these divergent sources into a unified study. In a concluding chapter he masterfully summarizes life in these communities as mining towns, frontier towns, and industrial towns and then compares them with the findings of other such scholars of town life as Lewis Atherton, Robert R. Dykstra, Don Harrison Doyle, and others. In the process he makes clear the significant contribution that his generation of historians has made to our understanding of social history, urban history, and the American West. It is a book replete with information and ideas worthy of pondering.

University of California, Davis W. TURRENTINE JACKSON

CUSTER VICTORIOUS: THE CIVIL WAR BATTLES OF GENERAL GEORGE ARMSTRONG CUSTER. By Gregory J. W. Urwin. East Brunswick, N.J.: Associated University Presses, Inc., 1983. Pp. 308. Illus., notes, bibliog., appendixes, index. $20.50.

IN THE PREFACE TO HIS BOOK, author Gregory J. W. Urwin asks: Why another Custer book? A good question, and one reasonably answered by his belief that research on Custer's career as a Civil War general would broaden the scope of Custer studies, which have largely dealt with later operations leading up to the Little Big Horn disaster. Such an approach holds great promise for the reader interested in Civil War or the Indian wars, especially when the author modestly claims that *Custer Victorious* "is the only *informed* analysis of its kind." Unfortunately, that promise is not fulfilled.

Urwin makes the classic mistake of identifying all western and Civil War historians as either Custerphobes or Custerphiles, ignoring the vast majority who see the young general as neither a central figure during or after the war nor as completely competent or incompetent. With that as a basic assumption, the book is pitched directly at the "pro-Custer" reader, apparently with the purpose of

providing better ammunition with which to continue "the good fight." The young author's technique is to condemn previous unfavorable works and scholars, while praising those that reflect his own preconceived notions. Graham, Brininstool, Dustin, Merritt, and Van De Water are damned; Gray, Monahan, and Frost are applauded (applause often well deserved). Moreover, the author is proud of that lack of objectivity, pointing out that his work "is meant to strike a blow against all those recent flawed and illiberal histories that have been foisted on the reading public. . . ."

Even with such an attitude, good scholarship and good writing might have made *Custer Victorious* a worthwhile contribution. Sadly, neither is present. Urwin presents a facade of scholarship that may not be obvious to the casual reader. He cites many primary sources, including memoirs of soldiers who served with Custer, family letters, and the *Official Records*. The latter are used to support the noncontroversial aspects of Custer's Civil War activities, while the author carefully extracts favorable passages from the other works to support his major contentions. Urwin overlooks many other significant sources dealing with Custer in the Civil War. For instance, he ignores applicable unpublished theses and dissertations. While he treats the wartime rivalry between Custer and Wesley Merritt, he fails to consult the only biography of Merritt, even though that work was completed eight years before *Custer Victorious* was released. Even worse, the author did not use any of the important Custer holdings of the National Archives or Library of Congress.

Perhaps as a result of these oversights, many errors of fact creep into Urwin's book. For example, the 16 August 1864 Battle of Cedarville is described as "one of the most brilliant actions George Custer ever directed . . . scarcely paralleled by the annals of war." However, Custer did not direct that fight; rather, he fought beautifully under the direction of his commanders, Merritt and Torbert. The author also errs in detailing the preliminaries to that battle, but offers no authority for his remarkable narrative, neglecting to include a single citation for his three-page description of the subsequent combat. That kind of imprecision is more typical than rare. In fact, Custer did not command or direct any battle during the Civil War, but the reader would never know it from Urwin's book.

Urwin's writing style is little better than his research. In his acknowledgments, the author describes himself as having been "a discouraged young poet." Perhaps that is the problem. The terms "Custer," "Boy General," and "Old Curly" rotate with amateurish regularity, as do the overly familiar terms "Marse Robert," "Old Beauty," and unbelievably, "Bald Dick" (General Richard Ewell). At one point, the author claims that Ewell "flung the divisions of . . . Kershaw and . . . Lee back at those Yankee marplots." No wonder the South lost—faced with marplots! Purple prose also abounds to annoy the reader.

In short, this book is an arrogant exercise in misinformation. Its subject holds great promise for objective analysis, but what emerges in *Custer Victorious* is, to use the author's terms, "hero worship by a romantically-inclined Custerphile."

Kirtland Air Force Base, N.Mex. DON E. ALBERTS

WOLVES FOR THE BLUE SOLDIERS: INDIAN SCOUTS AND AUXILIARIES WITH THE UNITED STATES ARMY, 1860–90. By Thomas W. Dunlay. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1982. Pp. viii, 302. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. $21.95.

THIS WORK BY THOMAS W. DUNLAY brings together a wide range of historical and cultural resources that should prove to be one of the most solid works written to date on the subject of the American Indian and his relationship to the non-Indian. When topics related to the West are skimmed by authors, generally it is because the primary material is scattered and elusive. Another difficulty related to avoidance of certain topics has to do with oral history as a "solid" frame of reference. In this work, however, Dunlay turns to a variety of resources to get at a difficult subject.

Throughout the work he has provided ample biographical detail that helps to explain why American Indians served as military aides, and the author also covers a wide geographical area in time and space to get at the wide diversity of opinions scouts represented.

This narrative is not a mere recital of actions and events in which scouts participated. Dunlay has separated his examination logically and succinctly into several major questions having to do with what kinds of men became scouts, why they often worked against their people, and the viewpoints of other Indians and non-Indians concerning scouting. Dunlay has interpreted his materials, utilizing, for example, the incident at Cibicu in the White Mountains when Apache scouts turned against the soldiers with whom they had been soldiering.

The Army seemed to care little about, or to recognize, differences among tribes, partly of course, a historical problem since the military had, for the most part, its point of view about the disposition of the Indian. On the other hand, Indian viewpoints are scarce, almost nonexistent in nineteenth-century accounts. Existing accounts of Indian life have for the most part been handed down, told to others and like any account given 100 or more years later, been subject to deterioration. In general, non-Indian authors have written most accounts although occasionally such authors as Eve Ball have been able to record the Indian version of what occurred during campaigns and within Indian societies. Still, most available accounts contain a European bias. When such non-Indian accounts as that of Anton Mazzanovich are utilized, the works prove, upon closer examination, to be good examples of a regular army soldier's viewpoint written forty years after the events and are often ego-boosting efforts on the part of old soldiers.

More to the point, Dunlay has done an excellent job of illustrating the varied kinds of scouts in action; he discusses movements of tribes under pressure from other tribes and concentrates on differences among tribes. The volume has the large overview, the grasp of the total picture—for example on page sixteen, the view of federal officials; and on page seventeen, the concern of the army. Dunlay has also been impartial in summing up his views in the conclusion. In addition, he has searched widely for excellent primary archival material focusing on Indians as scouts and on the psyche of soldiers who appreciated or disliked the scouts.

If there are faults in this work they are not those of the author. The type face

is too small, ergo difficult for old scouts to read. The notes are appropriate at the back of the work. The problem, however, is that there is no bibliography. While the bibliographical essay is fine, it does not replace a standard bibliography.

Overall, Dunlay's work deals with a number of questions about the scouts' interaction with the army on the frontier: how they came into being, how others viewed them, what their own people thought of them. The nagging problem, however, that plagues all researchers interested in the history and culture of the American Indian is the lack of sufficient primary material giving Indian viewpoints and, conversely, the preponderance of the United States Army documents providing very diverse viewpoints.

University of San Diego RAY BRANDES

COVERED WAGON WOMEN. DIARIES & LETTERS FROM THE WESTERN TRAILS 1840–1890. Vol. 1, *1840–1849*. Edited and compiled by Kenneth L. Holmes. Glendale, Calif.: Arthur H. Clark Co., 1983. Pp. 272. Illus., map. $25.00.

THIS NEW SERIES from the Arthur H. Clark Company is designed to make available previously "unpublished manuscripts or rare printed journals" (p. 12) that women wrote about their experiences in the great emigration westward of the nineteenth century. For this first book in a projected series of ten volumes, Kenneth Holmes assembled the writings of thirteen women who made the trip west in the 1840s. These materials now repose in private collections as well as in the Southwest Museum Library, the Henry E. Huntington Library, the Oregon Historical Society, the Bancroft Library, and the Historical Department of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. Some of the authors whose documents appear (for example, Tamsen Donner, Virginia Reed, Keturah Belknap, Patty Sessions, and Elizabeth Dixon Smith [Geer]) will be familiar to readers acquainted with the historiography of women in the West since scholars have frequently cited these women's writings. The materials from the private collections, however, have been less accessible, and their publication may represent the most unique contribution of the volume.

Covered Wagon Women is divided into twelve sections; for each the editor provides an introduction to the diary or letters it contains. Letters predominate, since nine of the thirteen authors left letters rather than diaries, but no more than two letters by any one correspondent appear. The introductory sections are a noteworthy feature, as are the notes to the texts of the letters and diaries. Holmes used contemporary newspapers, census materials, and family records to provide a brief history of each author and to identify other people mentioned in the documents. He also indicates where and when the letter or diary has been published before and how the version in *Covered Wagon Women* differs from earlier renditions. And, of special import to readers interested in women's experiences in settling the West, Holmes specifies which authors left additional records and where these are located.

Despite the useful introductions and notes, however, volume one is disap-

pointing. A number of typos mar the text, but more important is the uneven editing. The editorial tone varies from that of a scholar to that of a folksy neighbor reminiscing about the "good old days." Particularly significant is Holmes's apparent unfamiliarity with recent books whose authors have drawn heavily on some of the writings included in this volume. No doubt his commentary would have been enhanced had he consulted what Glenda Riley, Lillian Schlissel, Julie Roy Jeffrey, and Sandra Myres have written about women in the West.

Nonetheless, *Covered Wagon Women* achieves its intended purpose and makes available interesting documents women wrote about their western experiences. With additional care, perhaps the succeeding volumes in the series will not only fulfill the original intent, but exceed it.

Albuquerque CHERYL J. FOOTE

WOMEN OF THE WEST. By Cathy Luchetti in collaboration with Carol Olwell. St. George, Utah: Antelope Island Press, 1982. Pp. 240. Notes, illus., bibliog., chron., appendix. $25.00.

FOR A NUMBER OF YEARS historians and popular writers have more or less ignored western women (with perhaps the exceptions of Narcissa Whitman and Calamity Jane). But the discovery of the frontierswoman in the 1970s has brought forth a near deluge of books purporting to illuminate the lives of "ordinary women" in the trans-Mississippi West. The latest, and by no means the best, entry in the field is Cathy Luchetti and Carol Orwell's *Women of the West*. The volume features a coffee table format; edited texts of eleven women's diaries, letters, or reminiscences; and approximately 140 black and white photographs.

Although attractive in design, the book offers few new contributions to the fields of either western or women's history. All or part of nine of the eleven texts have been published elsewhere. The two previously unpublished manuscripts—those of San Francisco Black woman Pauline Williamson and German immigrant and domestic servant Anna Ogden, offer a glimpse into a little-known aspect of women's lives, but neither is particularly helpful in revealing women's lives in the West. Either could have been written in an eastern city as easily as in a western one, although perhaps this is in itself an interesting point.

At first glance the photographs seem to offer more promise, but on closer inspection, at least fifteen were published in the Time-Life volume (although certainly some are worth seeing again); twenty-eight are of posed family groups, many unidentified; and another dozen are formal studio portraits that tell little about the women, their lives, or activities. Several of the full-page reproductions have little or nothing to do with women: for example, a street scene (sans women) in Ottawa, Kansas; an agreement in 1852 between an immigration company and a male immigrant; and a page from a manuscript census return in 1870 remarkable only for its seventeen Chinese.

The author warns us that this is not "an academic history" (p. 14), and indeed it is not. There is little or no attempt at synthesis or interpretation, a number of

statistics are included without adequate documentation, and there are several factual errors. For example, Luchetti writes that 800,000 women "came West" (p. 14) and that 800,000 women lived "west of the Mississippi in 1900" (p. 26), but the source of these confusing figures is obscure at best. Nor is there any excuse for the entry in the chronology that "Texas's war of independence from Mexico" began in 1846 (p. 218), ten years after the Texas victory at San Jacinto.

This is a pretty book, but it has little to recommend it to the serious student or to readers familiar with the current literature.

University of Texas at Arlington SANDRA L. MYRES

WOMEN AND WESTERN AMERICAN LITERATURE. Edited by Helen Stauffer and Susan Rosowski. Troy, N.Y.: Whitson Publishing Company, 1982. Pp. v, 331. Illus., notes. $22.50.

EVOLVING FROM THE WESTERN LITERATURE Association's meeting in 1980, this collection of essays combines firsthand accounts of women in the West with analytical essays concentrating on myth versus reality in western literature. Under the first of four major headings, "Shaping the Western Frontier: Women in History," June Underwood's interesting article portrays women's organizations as a civilizing element in the westering process. Yet, these organizations are rarely mentioned in western American literature, and when they are, they are shown as "trivial or pernicious"—a literary stereotype antithetical to the truth. The author posits that this literary reaction is the result of disenchantment with the status-seeking aspect of clubs and the American penchant for idealizing the loner. Women's organizations and the need for "bonding" appear mostly in autobiographies, according to Underwood.

Susan Armitage depicts women traditionally as "reluctant pioneers," an impression gleaned from primary sources. Other firsthand accounts of westering women, provided by Darlene Ritter and Margaret Solomon, support this impression. Ritter's study, for example, shows how women immigrants (and probably men, too) suffered, in addition to physical hardships, the emotional trauma of leaving family in the Old World.

In the second section, "From Fact to Fiction, Myth as Filter," Barbara Meldrum investigates western literature in which myth has mitigated reality and advises us to move beyond stereotyping as some western writers have managed to do. Dealing also with the concept of myth, David Remley skillfully analyzes much that has been written on Sacajawea to dispel some of the myth surrounding the Indian benefactress to the Lewis and Clark Expedition. Remley downplays the myth of a sexual relationship, reminding readers that Sacajawea's husband Charbonneau served as guide for the expedition. Caren J. Deming's essay on miscegenation in popular western history and fiction comes to the obvious conclusion that such a slant is denigrating to Indian and white women.

The most interesting essay of the collection, "The Emergence of Helen Chal-

mers," by Frances M. Malpezzi shows how Frank Waters's *The Woman at Otowi Crossing* transferred real life character Edith Warner from fact to fiction in the character of Helen Chalmers. As the hostess of a tearoom at Otowi in New Mexico, Chalmers leads a life of primal duality leading to psychic fusion and transcendence. At ease with Indian *caciques* and Los Alamos scientists alike, the protagonist stood at the crossroads of a civilization, the meeting ground of two cultures, and of past and future. In an astute analysis, the author shows how Waters used the Navajo Emergence myth as a stylistic vehicle to chronicle the life of Chalmers. As the Atomic Age is born, so too Chalmers anticipates rebirth by taking a spiritual journey allowing her to escape the ravages of cancer through death and ultimate transcendence to "the realm of the mythic."

Kathleen Norris explores the western roots of feminism in Agnes Smedley's *Daughter of the Earth* and concludes that the author's childhood oppression by her parents and awareness of the low value placed on women serve as bases for her feminism. In interviews with Sue Matthews, authors Dorothy M. Johnson and A. B. Guthrie, Jr., discuss how they treated pioneer women in their works.

Representative of the third section, "Images in Transition and Conflict," is an analysis by Frances Kaye of the feminism of Hamlin Garland. In a traditional interpretation, Kaye finds the roots of Garland's feminism in his emotional identification with farm women of the middle border and their interest in the arts. She concludes that Garland's personal conflict derived from his psychological need to maintain his superiority over men and women and his fear of sexuality.

In an original study, John Murphy analyzes Willa Cather's character, Antonia Shimerda, and determines that she is a counter-culture figure—a heroine who has an illegitimate child—an image quite different from the traditional "proper woman" heroine of that era. Catherine Farmer, Patricia Lee Yongue, Joseph Wydeven, and Mary Ellen Walsh also address conflicts between myth and historical reality.

In the final section, "Shaping Imaginative Frontiers," the works of several individual authors are examined. Barbara Rippey studies Mari Sandoz, Samuel Bellman analyzes Constance Rourke; Melody Graulich writes about Eudora Welty, Elaine Jahner about Paula Gunn Allen, and James Work about Mary Austin. Of these, the moral statements in Austin's *Land of Little Rain*, which Work refers to as one of the "touchstone works of American nature writing," are relevant in today's fast-moving technological society. For one "obsessed with one's own importance in the scheme of things," Austin advises the human animal to reestablish a proper relationship to the land in its natural state. For, as Indian poetess Paula Gunn Allen states, "Iyani, we are the land."

One of the major assets of this collection is that there are numerous moral statements for the sensitive reader to absorb. Although the essays contribute little in the way of original interpretation, they do call attention to the stereotyping, the myth versus reality, and the sometimes conflicting images of women as portrayed in western literature. Such consciousness-raising may serve to educate the reader and alert the prospective writer. Therefore, despite their uneven quality

and the inevitable typesetting and proofing errors, these essays constitute a worthy contribution to a subject area still containing room for scholarly investigation.

Sandia National Laboratories
Albuquerque NECAH S. FURMAN

NEE HEMISH: A HISTORY OF JEMEZ PUEBLO. By Joe S. Sando. Foreword by Alfonso Ortiz. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1983. Pp. xviii, 258. Illus., appendixes, notes, bibliog., index. $19.95.

RECENT HISTORICAL LITERATURE ABOUT INDIANS has produced a more positive view of the Native American's role in our society. However, authors of works in this modern genre remain predominantly non-Indian. Joe Sando attempts to balance this inequity with *Nee Hemish, A History of Jemez Pueblo.* Previously, he wrote what has become a standard work on Pueblo history, but in this new volume Sando concentrates on the reservation where he was born and raised. His intimate knowledge of events at Jemez leaves the reader with something more than a literary acquaintance with the village. Instead, one feels that he has journeyed through the ancient pueblo with the aid of an excellent guide.

Given the centuries of conflict between Indians and outsiders, it is only natural to expect a tone of resentment in a tribal history by a Native American. While Sando understandably takes a pro-Indian point of view, his conclusions are hardly based on mere prejudice. For example, he utilizes recent archeological studies that refute the standard theory concerning Indian origins. He combines native oral tradition with other origin theories to produce a more inclusive statement on this subject.

While the question of land ownership has caused considerable consternation for the Jemez people and other Native Americans, the author is quick to point out that this vexation has perplexed indigenous populations throughout the world. However, Sando demonstrates that the loss of sacred areas is particularly painful for Native Americans because of their respect for nature and the inextricable tie between their religious practices and the land that surrounds Indians. He strengthens the Jemez claim to their lands by documenting their claims and losses since the American takeover of the Southwest. In addition Sando traces the histories of various grants that comprise the modern reservation and treats efforts of the Jemez people to receive compensation for land losses from the Indian Claims Commission. Since most of the Jemez land problems came about after the Spanish period, the author places most of the blame for land problems on a careless Mexican government and irresponsible American leadership. Sando makes a particularly strong case against the United States about the condemnation of Jemez land for the construction of the Santa Fe Northwestern Railroad in the 1920s.

Nee Hemish is not without its faults, however. For example, the author is repetitive about the establishment of the surveyor general's office in 1854. He also skips from one time frame to another (p. 30), which tends to make the train of thought hard to follow. In the section on irrigation and agriculture, he cites an

1890 report of the Interior Department, but he fails to mention the author's first name even though it appears in the bibliography. Most exasperating is the inclusion of Appendix V, which purports to be a comparison of Indian and Anglo cultural values. This list is too stereotypical to display any accurate representation of either group.

Regardless of its shortcomings, Sando's book is an excellent popular account of the Jemez Pueblo and its people (including immigrants from Pecos). The more personal side is covered in the chapters on native artisans, education at Jemez, and the sport of running (in which the Jemez people have excelled throughout their history). Sando provides an excellent and much-deserved tribute of individual people who have excelled in their fields. Finally, Sando's pride in his heritage should discourage those who feel that reservation life represents a failure of a communal lifestyle. Clearly this lifestyle should not be abandoned. As the author points out, the trend of moving away from Jemez has reversed. Its residents now find contentment in their combination of modern and traditional lifestyles.

Southern Utah State College JIM VLASICH

CARLOS MONTEZUMA AND THE CHANGING WORLD OF AMERICAN INDIANS. By Peter Iverson. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1982. Pp. xv, 222. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. $17.50.

THE UNIVERSITY OF NEW MEXICO PRESS has produced its second grade-B book on Carlos Montezuma. The first, a somewhat borrowed and romantic tale published in 1951 (Oren Arnold, *Savage Son*), is little more than social history suggesting how that era viewed Native Americans. The second, while a vast improvement on Arnold's story, nonetheless preserves myths and fails to demonstrate full grasp of the abundant documentary sources on Carlos Montezuma's life and times and the movements in which he played key roles.

The title of this book misleads; it is a partial biography of Dr. Montezuma—missing some extremely critical episodes—and relates the articulate Yavapai only to the Society of American Indians and his tribal community at Fort McDowell, Arizona. Professor Iverson neglects Montezuma's activities with Native American communities and organizations in California, Washington, Montana, and the Great Lakes region. We do not see Montezuma and his attorney, Joseph W. Latimer, cultivating the press and the many "friends-of-the-Indians" individuals and organizations of the early twentieth century. Nor do we learn anything about Latimer himself, though the two worked closely together for more than a decade!

Carlos Montezuma dedicated his life to achieving two goals through constitutional means: citizenship for all Native Americans and abolition of the Indian Bureau. Yet Iverson fails to cite as available a source as the *Congressional Record* that documents how Montezuma's Capitol Hill supporters tried to translate his ideas into legislation! We learn nothing from Iverson's account about the life led in Chicago by one of the most prominent urban Indians of all time; nor does this

book inform readers about Dr. Montezuma's extensive contacts with Native Americans in other urban centers.

The strengths of Professor Iverson's book on Carlos Montezuma lie mainly in its updates on his participation in the Society of American Indians and in a detailed, tightly documented account of the land and water struggles of the Fort McDowell Yavapais. Readers interested in a complete account of Dr. Montezuma's many lives must await a more comprehensive and thoroughly researched treatment than Peter Iverson offers in this sadly deficient volume.

Papers of Carlos Montezuma JOHN W. LARNER

HOPI PHOTOGRAPHERS, HOPI IMAGES. By Erin Younger and Victor Masayesva, Jr. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1983. Pp. 7, 111. Illus., notes, bibliog. $25.00 cloth, $14.95 paper.

READING THIS BRIEF WORK can be accomplished in less than two hours; yet, the impact of life as seen by inhabitants in an almost closed society is important not only because Hopi Indians are a society with a unique history, but also they have endured from time predating the Spanish era in the middle of the sixteenth century, and this pictorial history cannot be measured by its thickness.

Tracing the history of recording Hopi society by government and missionary activities through journals, sketches, early and recent photographs, the author has discussed what so many outsiders have failed to perceive—that these Hopis have tolerated the outsider and, at the same time, have preserved and enhanced traditions, despite the false images (by photographing Hopis wearing feathers, thus equating them with a Sioux stereotype) and fixed positions (women making baskets outside because indoor photography was impossible).

This edition is divided into two parts—first, a history, and second, an inclusion by contemporary Hopi photographers who have recorded their people naturally and the land beautifully: Jean Frederick's collection of people, Owen Seumptewa's faces, Freddie Honhongva's views of villages and youngsters, Merwin Kooyahoema's and Fred Kootswatewa's panoramas of the land and villges, Georgia Masayesva's doorways and young ladies, and Victor Masayesva, Jr.'s people in homes and as dancers.

This land in northeastern Arizona has withstood onslaughts of the Spanish, intrusions of westward-moving Americans, and aggravations from its neighbors, and, at the same time, has remained a peaceful vista. Here there are unparalleled scenes seldom seen anywhere. To be able to record this scene for current and future generations is true art—that which can be enjoyed and treasured now and by future generations. These images and these people constitute a heritage that is unique in this collection. It anything is omitted, it would be the identification of places in the collection of Fred Kootswatewa, yet this does not detract from another volume in the Sun Tracks Series from the University of Arizona Press, which has produced a very successful series of editions in the past. What this collection does for anyone who has never seen Hopi land and people is to introduce

a people and their land; what it does for those of us who have been there is to remind us of the everlasting beautiful panoramas and of those who have toiled in and cherished a tradition and history simply known as Hopi.

St. Leo College KARL E. GILMONT

SHADOWS OF THE INDIAN: STEREOTYPES IN AMERICAN CULTURE. By Raymond William Stedman. Foreword by Rennard Strickland. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1982. Pp. xix, 281. Illus., notes, bibliog., chronology, index. $24.95.

RAYMOND W. STEDMAN, PROFESSOR of English and Communications at Bucks County (Pennsylvania) Community College, presents in this book chapter by chapter various stereotypes of the American Indian in the hope that his fellow Americans will overcome them and recognize the First Americans for the people they were and are. Both Stedman and Rennard Strickland, who introduces the book, worry that the stereotypes so long dominant in white understanding of Indians still provide the basis of white policy now and for the future. In fact, the author argues that his fellow Americans seem more insensitive to Indians than to any other minority today.

Although the author surveys briefly the entire history of Indian imagery in all media, he concentrates, given his purpose, on the present century and popular culture as represented in such media as television, motion pictures, and advertising. At the end of the book Stedman presents rules by which his readers can recognize Indian stereotypes in the popular media: demeaning vocabulary (ugh! etc.) rather than regular conversation, infantile thinking and nonadult conceptualization, a single ethnic identity (usually Plains "feather-bonnet" tribe) as opposed to varied tribal affiliation, comic interludes of firewater and stupidity, extinct and vanished peoples rather than living and dynamic persons, and all-noble or all-savage, all saint-like or all-evil rather than normal individuals with homes, families, and emotions (other than war-like).

To convey the falsity of the stereotypes, the author adopts an ironic tone and amusing style that belies his seriousness, never more so than in his chapters on "Indian Talk" and "Lust Between the Book Ends." His brief topical chapters argue that Indian women are viewed customarily as either Indian princesses (the Pocahontas school) or as "squaws," a term whose derogation reduces all Indian females to drudges or worse. Usually, and conventionally, Indian men are either noble or wild savages, either lustful rapists or mighty warriors, either loyal shadow companions of whites (from Friday to Chingachgook to Tonto) or implacable enemies. Miscegenation is as forbidden in modern movies as in nineteenth-century novels, with the offspring suffering character defects for their parents' "sins." Even recent efforts of authors and media directors to atone for their predecessors' errors still repeat Indian stereotypes by misrepresenting tribes, motives, customs, or languages, all in the name of ecology, liberation, or peace.

An impressive sixty-six pages of illustrations accompanies the various chapters

showing vividly the stereotypes. The author also provides a lengthy chronology and a short bibliography to help the reader. This book is meant more for the lay reader rather than the scholar, for the pictures are not well identified as to date or provenience, and the argument and footnotes are minimal. The book is interesting on the popular level, however, and should be added to the list of those other volumes on Indian imagery that have appeared recently. It provides a good introduction to the most prominent stereotypes. It offers not so much a comprehensive picture as the high points in a long history of misperception with emphasis on the past seven decades.

University of Michigan ROBERT F. BERKHOFER, JR.