New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 57 | Number 1 Article 7

1-1-1982

Book Reviews

BOOK NOTES

THE OKLAHOMA PETROLEUM INDUSTRY by Kenny A. Franks ($17.50, University of Oklahoma Press) is a well-illustrated account of one of the most important aspects of Oklahoma history. Franks argues that "Oil and Oklahoma are synonymous" and covers the topic from first explorations in the late 1890s to major discoveries in the 1970s. It is a positive treatment of the oil industry in Oklahoma and of the men who dominated it.

HOPI KACHINA: SPIRIT OF LIFE, edited by Dorothy Washburn ($14.95, paper, University of Washington Press) is an extremely attractive, large format volume that should appeal to those interested in southwestern Indians and in Hopi Kachinas. Although it is a catalogue for a collection at the California Academy of Sciences, it is broad in scope and is of considerable significance. It is heavily illustrated, with a number of color plates. Acknowledged experts, including Clara Lee Tanner, Watson Smith, and J. J. Brody, contributed essays on prehistoric and historic occupation of the Hopi mesas, mural decorations, Kachinas, social organization, contemporary crafts, and modern Hopi painting. It is a beautiful and useful book.

Latin Americanists and students of folk arts may be interested in GUATEMALAN BACKSTRAP WEAVING by Norbert and Elizabeth Sperlich ($25.00, University of Oklahoma Press). It is a detailed study of this weaving technique with ample diagrams and illustrations.

I am constantly struck by the number of books on different aspects of the Mormon experience. Two new titles include DISCOVERING MORMON TRAILS by Stanley B. Kimball (paper, Deseret Book Company, Salt Lake City, $4.95) and THE MORMON PEOPLE: THEIR CHARACTER AND TRADITIONS edited by Thomas G. Alexander (paper, Brigham Young University Press, $6.95). The former will be of particular interest to those who delight in following the trails of the pioneers, for the text is supplemented by useful maps. In addition to the so-called Mormon Trail across the Great Plains, Kimball describes trails from New York, Missouri, various cutoffs, and colonization outward from Salt Lake City. THE MORMON PEOPLE, number ten in the Charles Redd Monographs in Western History, is a collection of six essays on selected aspects of the Mormon experience. Included are studies of polygamy, poetry, the Salt Lake Temple, education, and settlement patterns. The latter, which focuses on the period around 1880, is particularly provocative.

The late Ramon F. Adams was a bibliographer, lexicographer, and expert on the American cowboy. Beginning with COWBOY LINGO in 1936, Adams produced a host of books, including bibliographies such as SIX-GUNS AND SADDLE LEATHER, THE RAMPAGING HERD, and BURS UNDER THE SADDLE. His second book, first published in 1944, was WESTERN WORDS: A DICTIONARY OF THE RANGE, COW CAMP, AND TRAIL, revised in 1968 with a new subtitle, A DICTIONARY OF THE AMERICAN WEST. It is now available in paper from the University of Oklahoma Press ($9.95). Here is the lingo of the cowboy and other Westerners in a reference work that is delightful to read. It is humorous, salty, anecdotal, and informative.

Book Reviews

ROOTS OF RESISTANCE: LAND TENURE IN NEW MEXICO, 1680–1980. By Roxanne Dunbar Ortiz. Chicano Studies Center Publications, Monograph no. 10. Los Angeles: University of California, American Indian Studies Center, 1980. Pp. vi, 202. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. $14.95 cloth; $9.95 paper.

EVERY SERIOUS STUDENT of New Mexico history recognizes the need for a comprehensive analytical study of the role of property control and ownership in regional development. Struggles among sedentary Pueblos, nomadic Utes or Apaches, Spanish conquerors, Mexican settlers, and Anglo entrepreneurs to control land and water have often been keys to establishing economic, social, and political power. Indeed, major transformations over the past 300 years can be explained largely by the ability of one group or another to wrestle control of significant real estate from other occupiers or owners. Moreover, the resources necessary to prepare such a volume have recently become available. Thanks to the dedicated efforts of Myra Ellen Jenkins, microform editions of the Spanish and Mexican Archives have been prepared by the State Records Center; microfilm copies of the Bureau of Land Management archives related to land grants may also be obtained. Specialized works by such scholars as Ward Alan Minge, Victor Westphall, Myra Ellen Jenkins, Albert Schroeder, Marc Simmons, Jim B. Pearson, the late Morris Taylor, and others have also filled many gaps in our knowledge of past land patterns and practices. What is needed is a historian with sufficient energy, dedication, and imagination to utilize these resources in the preparation of a comprehensive synthesis.

The need for such a work makes it painful to report that while contributing in a limited way to the literature of land ownership in New Mexico, Roxanne Dunbar Ortiz's *Roots of Resistance* fails to provide the kind of overview for which historians yearn. The volume's 131 pages of text leave inadequate room for detailed analysis. It also bears too many signs of its original use as a U.C.L.A. dissertation; footnotes, for example, are often too long and sometimes irrelevant. More serious, while most published primary and secondary works are cited, little use has been made of manuscript materials such as those discussed above. Readers familiar with the subject will thus find little that has not appeared previously, and too much space merely recounts already familiar events.

The ideological stance that the author adopts is also disconcerting. Like much radical literature of the sixties or seventies, this book seems to have been written as much to justify revolt as to describe and explain past events and is burdened with excessive revolutionary rhetoric; chapter titles such as "The People Continue" and "Liberation Sabotaged" suggest the tone. Ortiz also analyzes New Mexico history in a Marxist framework. Quotations from Marx open several chapters, and Communist and Socialist scholars (usually writing in a European

or Third World context) are cited. While such a comprehensive ideological structure may be useful in explaining economic and social events, it sometimes encourages oversimplification and the omission of critical cultural, geographical, or political factors. Few specialists will agree entirely, for example, with the conclusion that the land tenure question in New Mexico can ultimately be seen as "a class struggle being waged by the indigenous peoples and former Mexican citizens in northern New Mexico." The book also suffers from an undistinguished format and design; readability could have been enhanced by more comprehensive editing.

Despite these limitations, *Roots of Resistance* provides a basic introduction to the problems of property control in New Mexico and constitutes a fairly unusual example of Marxian economic theory applied to the American Southwest. More important, it may stimulate Dr. Ortiz or some other enterprising student of New Mexico to undertake a much-needed comprehensive study of land tenure in New Mexico.

Central Michigan University LAWRENCE R. MURPHY

SOUTHWESTERN COLONIAL IRONWORK: THE SPANISH BLACKSMITHING TRADITION FROM TEXAS TO CALIFORNIA. By Marc Simmons and Frank Turley. Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, 1980. Pp. xvi, 199. Illus., index, notes, bibliog., glossary. $25.95 cloth; $14.95 paper.

THE EARLIEST RECORD OF AN established smithing industry in New Mexico is the inventory of ironworking supplies brought from Mexico in 1598 to the Oñate settlement north of present-day Santa Fe. The center of the colonial smithing industry soon moved to Santa Fe, where a large quantity of iron products was produced for the settlers in this far frontier of New Spain. All of the iron used for forging was imported from the mills of Europe, especially northern Spain, and reached the blacksmiths in the borderlands only after a long journey through Mexico. While the blacksmiths in the Spanish colonial Southwest did not produce the kind of ornamental ironwork that decorated Mexican buildings in the colonial period, they did produce many utilitarian items, such as hinges, latches, and bridle bits, which often displayed graceful, forged shapes, and decorative, stamped or filed designs. Spanish traditional smithing, with its concertina bellows and square anvil, was continuously practiced in the Southwest from approximately the early seventeenth through the middle of the nineteenth century.

The illustrations of colonial iron objects, the explanation of their use, the glossary of Spanish smith terms, and the discussion of the history and methods of ironworking in New Mexico are the strong points of this book. The title suggests that the history will be of ironworking in the Southwest, but much more attention is paid to the history in New Mexico than to that of other parts of the region. Although the authors have provided interesting introductory chapters, portions of the text on the early history of the technology in the ancient Middle East, and

in Celtic, Roman, Moorish, and Medieval Spain could well have been sacrificed in favor of an amplifed history of ironworking in other parts of the Southwest, in keeping with the stated objectives of the title. There is also some repetition in the text, due to the inclusion of much of the same information under the category of general history as well as under particular subdivisions. For example, a similar explanation of the Spanish bellows appears in both chapters four and five.

The authors state that the custom of grouping craftsmen in certain sections of the Spanish city was due to Moorish influence (p. 14); however, it should be noted that similar neighborhoods flourished all over Medieval and Renaissance Europe, independent of any contact with the Moors. Also, while it is relevant to mention St. Eloy as patron of metalworks, the choice of Velázquez' *Vulcan Forge* (pl. 5) is not an appropriate illustration of the Saint, since Apollo and Vulcan, rather than St. Eloy and Vulcan, are depicted in that painting.

In conclusion, despite the minor objections mentioned above, Simmons and Turley have written a book of great interest to those who admire the skill of the frontier craftsmen in Spanish colonial New Mexico. The authors are obviously quite knowledgeable about the subject and have given a detailed description of the methods and the products of this important Hispanic industry.

University of New Mexico MARY GRIZZARD

EL TRABAJO Y LOS TRABAJADORES EN LA HISTORIA DE MEXICO (LABOR AND LABORERS THROUGH MEXICAN HISTORY). Compiled by Elsa Cecilia Frost, Michael C. Meyer, and Josefina Zoraida Vázquez with the collaboration of Lilia Diaz. México: El Colegio de México and University of Arizona Press, 1979. Pp. xxi, 954. Illus., index, bibliographies, appendixes. $28.50 paper.

THIS THICK VOLUME contains the proceedings of the Fifth Meeting of Mexican and United States Historians held in Pátzcuaro, Michoacán in 1977. The *dramatis personae* is a rich mixture of respected senior scholars such as Raymond Buve, Hugh Hamill, Lewis Hanke, Angel Palerm, Enrique Semo, William Sherman, and Ernesto de la Torre Villar; leading historians in mid-career including Jorge Bustamante, Enrique Florescano, Enrique Krauze, James Lockhart, Eugenia Meyer, Jean Meyer, Arturo Warman, and John Womack; and able researchers early in their professional work. Scholars from Australian, Dutch, Spanish, and French universities, as well as North Americans and Mexicans, are represented (curiously, none of the Mexicanists in Canada participated).

In Part I, twenty-eight papers are divided among twelve panels on various aspects of labor history from pre-Columbian times to the 1970s. Papers on the colonial period are the most numerous, with seven panels on Indian labor, Black labor, forced labor, mining and hacienda labor, and bureaucrats and guilds. One national period panel of three papers is devoted to Mexican labor in the United States. This first part is completed by two excellent overview essays—one by Enrique Florescano on the colonial papers and issues in colonial labor historiog-

raphy; the other by John Womack on the post-Independence papers in the broad context of work/labor history. The second, shorter part of the volume (121 of 920 pages) departs from the labor theme with papers on the historiography of Michoacán (five papers), archives (six papers), "themes in search of historians" (eight papers), and methodology (two papers).

Not surprisingly, the forty-nine papers from this meeting are not closely connected, and the published volume does not stand as a unified work on the subject of Mexican labor history. The standard compartmentalization of colonial and national periods is maintained, and most papers are narrowly focused and based on familiar manuscript and published sources. And we learn more about labor systems in a descriptive way than about the lives and work of laborers and workers. Yet many of the papers are well done and move beyond the moments of high drama—riots and strikes—that have preoccupied labor historians, to explore new topics. New elements of unity and general issues are noted by the twenty-three commentators whose views are included with each of the panels of papers in Part I. Old disagreements between political and materialist explanations, and historicist and class analysis approaches to history come forward in a new light.

This book is a treasure chest of information and ideas for anyone interested in Mexican historiography and labor history. As John Womack observes, labor and workers are lively subjects in professional historiography today. These papers and comments from the meeting at Pátzcuaro document this enthusiasm and good work. Too bad for the reader that he/she misses out on the spontaneous discussion and questions from the floor that must have ensued. At least he/she is spared in this volume the gastritis, occasional bombast, and debater's tactics that also can be had at such gatherings.

University of Colorado WILLIAM B. TAYLOR

WILLIAM H. ASHLEY: ENTERPRISE AND POLITICS IN THE TRANS-MISSISSIPPI WEST. By Richard M. Clokey. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1980. Pp. xiii, 305. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. $18.95.

ONE OF THE MOST SIGNIFICANT yet least known of the early fur trade figures is William H. Ashley. Although his place in the emergence of America's first great industry west of the Mississippi River has been well documented by the late Dale Morgan and others, Ashley, organizer of the initial assault on the fur resources of the Rockies in the 1820s, employer of such larger-than-life figures as Jedediah Smith, Jim Bridger, Hugh Glass, Bill Sublette, and a host more, first lieutenant governor of the state of Missouri, and, ultimately, congressman from his adopted state, has remained remote and enigmatic as a personality. His early background, mercantile development, family life, and even his later political activities are still obscure, in part because the Ashley Papers were lost to fire long before historians could utilize them to form an adequate biography. Now Rich-

ard Clokey, after fifteen years of laboriously searching out scattered manuscript collections, combing musty county records, and mastering the voluminous literature of Jacksonian America, brings us as close to William Henry Ashley as we are likely to get.

While his work will doubtless be the standard biography of Ashley, Clokey, through no fault of his own, does not get us very close to the man. A typical frontier entrepreneur, Ashley apparently went west to earn his future and never looked back. Aloof from friends, colleagues, and antagonists alike, Ashley, heavily involved in public life though he was, sought the background, and kept to a very private, independent course. Thus even Thomas Hart Benton, whose early political life was affected strongly by Ashley's presence in Missouri, did not so much as mention his name in his voluminous *Memoirs*, and only his eulogist, who did have access to the records, offers much insight into his character.

But if Ashley must remain a shadowy personality, his role in Missouri politics is well spelled out by Clokey. A frontier state, Missouri, in the 1820s and 30s, had yet to develop the regular party philosophies and organizations of the eastern states, and this permitted Ashley to pursue a successful career as, his contemporaries noted, a "counterfeit Jacksonian." Claiming ties to Old Hickory while espousing Whig legislation, Ashley maintained support in both camps, and that, combined with his good name and reputation, got him elected to Congress for three terms. Though he did nothing outstanding in Washington, Ashley was considered the expert on western affairs, and his opinion was always sought out and valued. As western spokesman, Ashley found himself torn by the first stirrings of national concern for the plight of the native Americans. Like many of his fellow fur traders, he had great respect for some of the Indians he had known, yet he felt that white men had rights in the West as well. Ashley was not the first, nor the last, to have such mixed feelings, but his articulation on the national stage of the dilemma that was to plague the country from then on helped lay the groundwork for much of the debate to follow.

So here is the Ashley story, brief, well-written, and to the point, offering new interpretations of the life of this many-faceted man. It belongs in any collection concerned with the early West, and will be the new starting point for explorations into both mercantile and political activities on the Missouri frontier.

University of California, Santa Barbara RICHARD E. OGLESBY

COMMUNITY ON THE AMERICAN FRONTIER: SEPARATE BUT NOT ALONE. By Robert V. Hine. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1980. Pp. xii, 292. Illus., bibliog., index. $12.50.

ROBERT V. HINE HAS GRACED western bookshelves with several accounts of social development in the American West. In this nicely produced volume he explores further the sense of community as it appeared and failed to appear on the changing frontier. In so doing, he hacks away at popular myths that portray the fron-

tier as an agency that furthered community spirit. From historians, sociologists, and philosophers concerned with community in the American past, Hine derives that "the ideal community would be culturally and ethnically homogeneous, politically egalitarian, socially and economically classless, and reasonably stable in time" (p. 32). This is probably a more rigorous definition than many communities of any time or place could meet. Few of the places that Hine examines can do so. We learn why as we journey through a tidy collection of representative frontier communities from Puritan villages to several present-day intentional communities. There are "communities of the trail," mining towns, early farm settlements on the plains, later middle-western small towns, Mexican ranches and American cattle towns, ethnic communities, and cooperative colonies.

True community spirit, however desirable or necessary, rarely endured the first hesitant steps of frontier community growth. Too many things worked against it: individualism; the mobility—even the transiency—of many westerners; former class divisions that intruded upon frontier equality; new arrangements of social hierarchy that arose as fledgling communities stabilized; rifts between early settlers and newcomers; family ties; cultural differences; changing economic conditions; and now and then just plain orneriness. Even such traditionally accepted cementers of community as house raisings, quilting parties, fraternal lodges, baseball games, Fourth of July picnics, and helping neighbors through periods of need, are depicted here as infrequent exceptions to the rule and often as mechanisms that tended to divide. Some rare successes were the highly organized Mormon settlement of Orderville, Utah, the Hutterite and Amana colonies, and possibly several modern-day communal efforts. But if Hine laments that community did not develop to its potential on the American frontier, his account is not pessimistic: better that people tried and failed than never tried at all, better for historians to examine the reality of community than to accept bland generalities.

The reader will encounter some new and some familiar communities, some new and some familiar individuals. Among the latter are Anne Ellis of the Colorado mines, making the best of constant moves that the men in her life expected; Seth Humphrey, mortgage agent and observer of life on the northern plains; and John Ballou Newbrough, spiritualist founder of the children's commune of Shalam. Such selected individuals become parts of the whole as they depict representative types of personalities and attitudes in western communities. The book is a thoughtful, highly readable contribution to western history with its stories of individuals and communities woven together so as to create a composite picture of community on the frontier.

Well-selected photographs are appropriately placed throughout the text, and footnotes are located at the bottom of pages.

Edmonds, Washington CHARLES P. LEWARNE

THE SAINTS AND THE UNION: UTAH TERRITORY DURING THE CIVIL WAR. By E. B. Long. Champaign: University of Illinois Press, 1981. Pp. xiii, 310. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. $17.95.

THIS ATTRACTIVELY PACKAGED monograph would be more accurately titled "The General and the Prophet: Patrick in the Den of the Lion of the Lord." It is really the story of Patrick E. Connor, feisty commander of the thousand California Volunteers who came to Utah in 1862 to fight Indians and intimidate Mormons. It tells of the problems he confronted, how he perceived them, and what he did about them.

As for the larger themes blocked out in the title and subtitle, the book tells too little and too much. It fully documents what Brigham Young and the *Deseret News* said about the Union, but whether the rhetoric represented the thoughts and conduct of the whole Mormon populace during the Civil War is unexplored, save for a brief retelling of the well-known, ninety-day service of Colonel Robert T. Burton's Nauvoo Legion company. It voluminously reports the verbal fencing between Young on the one hand and the political and military representatives of the U.S. government on the other, but what else was happening in Utah Territory in the war period is largely ignored.

In electing "to let the participants speak their minds as much as possible" (pp. xii–xiii) the late Professor Long made a mistake, in this reviewer's opinion. Parts of the book almost qualify as documentary history. The result is a fragmented treatment that leaves readers wanting to know more about what actually happened while tempting them to skip some of the repetitious, exaggerated, and partisan contemporary accounts of what happened. Mining, for example, is several times mentioned as the key to Connor's political strategy in Utah, but nowhere does one learn what mining was going on. Indian troubles are alluded to more often than they are described, and even the "Battle on the Bear" is pieced together from reports that leave up in the air the actual number of army casualties (pp. 137, 139). Painstaking research has given us many trees but only a kaleidoscopic impression of the forest.

Brief biographical sketches of some of the secondary characters are helpful. Non-Mormon political appointees like Governor Stephen Harding take on dimensions, and their appointments become explicable. Maps are clear and pleasing to look at, and they appear to be accurate. The selection of pictures—portraits and contemporary scenes—is appropriate and includes a few not seen before by this reviewer. The bibliography is extensive; the footnotes are placed at the end of each chapter. Qualitative judgments of sources cited usually do not go beyond identifying them as pro-Mormon or anti-Mormon, and William A. Linn (*Story of the Mormons*, 1902) is placed on the wrong team (p. 39).

To the extent that *The Saints and the Union* deals with the Mormons and the Civil War it does not modify the conclusions earlier reached by Gustive O. Lar-

son and others. Professor Long makes clear that Brigham Young was a poor prophet on the nature and outcome of the war and on the fate of slavery, at least until mid-1864. On the other hand, Young "took a narrow, shrewd and careful course in his actions, if not always in his words, during the war years" (p. 268). Long's approach is evenhanded, with a slight tilt toward the Mormons. His summing up (pp. 267–276) is judicious and well written. His conclusion that after 1865 it was "no longer 'the Saints *and* the Union' but 'the Saints *in* the Union' " (p. 276) may strike some readers as too sanguine in view of what would yet transpire before Utah became a state in the Union in 1896.

Western Illinois University RICHARD D. POLL

APACHES: A HISTORY AND CULTURE PORTRAIT. By James L. Haley. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday & Company, 1981. Pp. xxi, 453. Illus., bibliog., index. $17.95.

JAMES L. HALEY HAS FOLLOWED his excellent *Buffalo War* with this extensive work that attempts to synthesize available materials from anthropology and history into a comprehensive ethnohistory of the Apache people. Others have made such attempts in recent years, notably Angie Debo in her study of Geronimo and Donald Worcester in *The Apaches*. In a number of ways, Haley's book is the best so far.

Apparently unable to do research among Apaches, Haley did extensive archival and library work. He drew liberally from materials available from anthropologists such as Keith Basso and Morris Opler as well as from the works of Grenville Goodwin. As a result, Haley's book provides much more information about Apache culture than is usual in even the finest traditional historical works. His accounts of Apache interaction with their adversaries over a period of four hundred years is adequate and well-written. Particularly valuable is his perspective that places the blame for much violence in the Southwest on the common criminality of ordinary people, red, white, and brown, who occupied the region.

Where Haley's excellent book falls short is in the failure to integrate what he has presented as Apache culture into terms of Apache behavior vis-à-vis other peoples. One reads of the differentiation between Apache concepts of raid and war, but not of the Apache belief that conflict was the natural state of the universe or that raiding was necessary to advance boys and men to positions of leadership and to provide the volume of goods presented at a maiden's ceremony.

Chapters dealing with selected aspects of Apache culture are often quite good. Those concerning "diyin" (power) and the activities of women are especially fine and fill long existing gaps in historians' writings. Missing from the bibliographic entries on these materials are the works of Eve Ball, while Morris Opler's important works are ascribed to James Officer.

Haley's descriptions of George Crook, John P. Clum, and other lesser lights are among the best to be found. The book is well-illustrated and provided with an extensive, if somewhat flawed, bibliography.

All aspects considered, this has to rank as one of the best general books on the Apaches. Specialists will find it weak in some areas, but no other single volume approaches it in scope. It is one book that everyone who is attempting to understand the Apaches should read.

University of New Mexico D. C. COLE

A HISTORY OF THE CHACO NAVAJOS. By David M. Brugge. Reports of the Chaco Center, No. 4. Albuquerque: National Park Service, U.S. Department of the Interior, 1980. Pp. viii, 542. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. $10.00 paper.

CHACO CANYON CONTAINS not only one of the most significant prehistoric ruins in the Southwest, but it is also a small part of a very large surrounding area known locally as the "checkerboard." A complex mixture of public domain, railroad lands, and Indian homesteads, the general region east of the present reservation has been the scene of numerous local conflicts between competing Navajo and white livestockmen. The various attempts to effect a settlement of the tangled land problems have aroused disputes at the state and national levels. Although Brugge's title and preface indicate that he intends only a limited administrative history of the Chaco Navajos, he fortunately has ventured well beyond that goal in favor of examining a broader picture of the no-man's-land east of the reservation.

The first chapters are devoted to Navajo relations with the Spanish, Mexicans, and Americans who controlled the Southwest prior to the tribe's defeat and subsequent exile to eastern New Mexico during the Civil War. Following Brugge's discussion of the Navajo's return to a newly formed reservation in 1868, he examines the adjustments forced upon those tribesmen who settled to the east. He details the competition for grazing land that resulted after the 1870s from white settlement of the San Juan Valley and the wintering of large commercial sheep herds in areas to the south. The ranchers' demands that the Navajos be confined to the reservation proper resulted in the government's generally unsuccessful efforts to displace the Indians or to expand the reservation boundaries. In the early twentieth century, officials sought to aid the Navajos by homesteading families on the public domain and by establishing an agency at Crownpoint, New Mexico, under Superintendent Samuel F. Stacher. Only limited protection resulted.

Serious archeological interest in Chaco Canyon was rather belated. Richard Wetherill, member of a famous trading family, began excavations in 1896 with the backing of the Hyde brothers of New York. The Wetherill-Hyde partnership was a curious combination of archeology and trading that resulted in a chain of some dozen posts by 1902. Brugge gives considerable attention to Wetherill and his many clashes with Navajos and officials, which usually developed from his high-handed tactics in collecting debts from the Indians. Wetherill was killed in 1910 during one such episode. Three years earlier, Theodore Roosevelt had established the Chaco ruins as a national monument.

Brugge's last chapters are devoted to the continuing conflicts between eastern Navajos and white stockmen after World War I and the government's activities to protect the Chaco ruins by hiring a custodian, fencing out livestock, and stabilizing the ruins with masonry repairs. He discusses the ill-fated attempt to settle the land problem after 1931 when the Interior Department withdrew a large block of the "checkerboard" from entry. In 1938 Indian Commissioner John Collier abandoned the long struggle to win passage of the necessary legislation. In dealing with this and the accompanying controversies over herd reductions and other New Deal policies, Brugge maintains a balanced and objective stance.

Although Brugge is an anthropologist, his versatility permits him to utilize other disciplines successfully. He blends a thorough understanding of Navajo culture with archival records, published documents, newspapers, and secondary sources in a manner that adds much understanding to the book. He is especially effective in dealing with the geography of eastern Navajo country and the often poorly rendered proper names and place names.

Unfortunately, the rigid chronological organization that Brugge adopts does not make for easy reading. His year-by-year chronicling of events with repeated references to such categories as weather conditions, Indian-white relations, federal policies, market conditions, and employment opportunities results in a choppy style and does not permit him to develop major themes over broad periods of time. Regardless of this, Brugge's perspicacity and thorough research will make this work the standard treatment on the eastern Navajos.

Purdue University DONALD L. PARMAN

MOTHER EARTH, FATHER SKY, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: NAVAJO RESOURCES AND THEIR USE. By Philip Reno. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1981. Pp. xvii, 183. Illus., notes, index. $15.95.

THE LATE PHILIP RENO BELIEVED in Indians and their future. A close friend of John Collier, a longtime resident of the Southwest, and an economist who taught during the last decade of his life at Navajo Community College, Reno possessed a special understanding of the challenges inherent in contemporary Native American economic development. This awareness is central to *Mother Earth, Father Sky, and Economic Development: Navajo Resources and Their Use.*

In approximately 125 pages of text, richly supplemented by 12 maps and 24 tables, Reno provides the reader with a compact overview of Navajo economic history and the main issues in the modern Navajo economy. Chapters are devoted, for example, to Navajo range and livestock, water, the Navajo Indian Irrigation Project, forests, coal, oil, uranium, and planning resource use. Navajo economist Al Henderson has also contributed a brief introduction.

Mother Earth, Father Sky, and Economic Development is valuable for several reasons. First, it is a condensed, straightforward study. In a small number of pages, the reader will find pertinent considerations of important questions. Sec-

ond, given its publication by the University of New Mexico Press, the volume should enjoy a wide readership, particularly in the Southwest where Navajo economic issues invariably are matters of concern to the entire region. In addition, the book is up-to-date; much of the significant information is from the latter part of the 1970s. Finally, it is written by a man deeply sensitive to the Navajos and to the unique problems facing developing nations.

One of the study's main strengths also might be labeled a weakness. Because it is a short work, it covers major topics quickly and devotes only passing attention to other useful points. One wishes for greater detail in consideration of oil, for example, or for more information about Navajo cooperatives. And given the number of items that Reno wanted to include, the book is somewhat choppy in its form. Curiously, the book has little on the reactions of Navajo people to the rapid growth and change being experienced within the Navajo Nation. There are some quotations from prominent people, but not much is heard from the average citizen, whose life may well be drastically affected by current developments.

Nonetheless, *Mother Earth, Father Sky, and Economic Development* remains a most useful analysis. Informed by decades of thoughtful observation and experience, it is an appropriate memorial to a man who had a profound concern for native peoples and for the world in which we find ourselves.

University of Wyoming PETER IVERSON

HOLY WIND IN NAVAJO PHILOSOPHY. By James Kale McNeley. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1981. Pp. xvii, 115. Appendixes, index, bibliog. $14.95 cloth; $6.95 paper.

THIS BOOK IS A FASCINATING analysis of what obviously is a central dimension in the traditional Navajo awareness of life. Excerpts from recorded and published chantway myths by various authors are correlated with statements obtained directly in the field with the help of research assistants. Field interpreters began their interviews with Navajo resource persons by asking such questions as "What makes people behave the way they do?" The collective weight of answers obtained in responses to this and similar questions was then taken to support the centrality of Holy Wind in Navajo traditional awareness.

Studies of central concepts of "philosophical" systems (perhaps the term "religion" in the title would have been more appropriate) are essential for Anglo-American minds to enter foreign mental worlds. Gary Witherspoon, in *Languages and Art in the Navajo Universe* (Ann Arbor, 1977), has provided similar descriptive analyses of central Navajo concepts. But notwithstanding the unquestionable worth of such conceptual studies, their method and orientation tend to lure the already dogmatized typical Western reader into relying too much on conceptual and credal information. We must never forget that the traditional Navajo way of presenting religious information is not analytic discourse or definitions but narratives. Perhaps our Western passion for central concepts, key formulas, credal faith statements, and the love of fundamentals is more an element

from our Judeo-Christian heritage than an awareness of what is present in the traditional Navajo field. Boomerang effects are visible all over, and the field has become increasingly complex during the past century.

Anglo-American missionaries, as well as secular scientists, have been very successful in communicating their passion for fundamentals to the Navajo mind. It is in the arena of Western fundamental notions where Navajo minds are being challenged to compete and to "catch up" with us. And, not surprisingly, a singular dogma in Navajo words can turn out to be about as narrow as such a one would be in English. The author is aware of this problem. He recognizes that each informant singer "was the recipient of a particular oral tradition." He reasons correctly that, therefore, "variations between informants in statement and interpretation of beliefs are to be expected." Thus, in order to arrive at an average version of the Navajo "Holy Wind," some of these variations surely had to be ignored in the interpretational process. Such is the nature of human perception and the limitation of mortal minds.

While this respondent thoroughly appreciates the author's analysis of the Holy Wind concept, and while he recommends this book to all students of Navajo religion, he is also infinitely pleased that a few versions of the Navajo Windways have been recorded by the late Father Berard Haile, in the very form in which Navajo priests and devotees to Holy Wind have presented them (published by Wyman, *Windways of the Navajo*, 1962). Perhaps in view of Haile's leading contribution to our knowledge of Holy Wind religiosity, we should from now on read his short essay on Navajo soul concepts with greater sympathy for his station in life. How else but in terms of the Western understanding of souls could the dear Father have explained Navajo soul concepts in a Vatican journal? In our study of Holy Winds we will all sooner or later have to rely again on the Windway materials that priestly singers have, through Father Berard Haile, entrusted to us and posterity—unencumbered by researchers' questions regarding central concepts.

The foregoing thoughts are not offered as criticisms of the author's efforts, rather as caution against specializing in singular, though good, methods of interpretation. Perhaps precisely this kind of a "central concepts approach" was required for us to admit that Navajo Holy People are indeed real living gods. The chapter on "Principles of Life and Behavior" establishes anthropologically what every historian of religions would have regarded as a foregone conclusion. Gods are greater than men; and whoever is greater influences the lives of the lesser. This is the simple religious fact that forms the basis of every ethic. It is indeed exciting to see how contemporary social science is coming full circle from a journey that began with atheistic Freudian psychology and Durkheimian sociology. We are now well on our way to learning the obvious. The gods of sincere religious people were discovered by them in the real world, and what they discovered are not "projections," "social representations," or even "deifications." Religious people everywhere always knew that, instead, mortal men are the projections or creations of the gods. Surely, the great Holy Wind in all his colorful manifest *personae*, joined by a myriad of Holy People (who patiently await their

turn to be recognized also as central figures, some day, in chantways that are dedicated to them or in some new academic report), is whistling now, nay howling with delight, about mankind's perennial religious discoveries.

Springfield, Missouri KARL W. LUCKERT

THE CUMBRES AND TOLTEC SCENIC RAILROAD: THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION STUDY. By Spencer Wilson and Vernon J. Glover. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1980. Pp. xii, 170. Illus., appendixes, bibliog., index. $19.95 cloth; $8.95 paper.

SPENCER WILSON AND VERNON J. GLOVER set out to give the history of all the rolling stock, buildings, tools, and equipment of the Cumbres and Toltec Scenic Railway. They accomplished their aim in great detail in a polished, readable form. A concise history of the railroad, its joint purchase by New Mexico and Colorado, and a description of the route precede the individual listings. Many charts and diagrams, an excellent collection of eighty-seven black-and-white photographs, and eight color plates add great visual interest to the book.

The authors state that "the historic collection of the C&TSRR is a museum of surpassing importance now." They are well qualified, through the research and study evident in this book, to make such a statement and to make recommendations for the continued development of the railroad as a living museum. They suggest establishing a visitor center at each terminal where printed material and exhibits will help the public learn more about the history of early railroading in the Rocky Mountains; outdoor exhibits of rolling stock at both terminals; restoration of more rolling stock to be used in the outdoor exhibits; more effort to halt deterioration of the historic facilities and rolling stock; preservation of the snowshed and wye at Cumbres; and the establishment of a visitor center there.

Full credit is given the two states for their foresight in purchasing the line and to the volunteers who assisted in rebuilding the line and restoring the equipment that make it possible to operate the scenic trip today as a major tourist attraction. One chapter is devoted to the best ways to accomplish preservation and restoration of the tracks, buildings, and equipment. Appendixes and bibliography attest to the thoroughness of the study, and a complete index will assist the reader.

A railroad enthusiast, scholar, or history buff will find the details interesting and informative, and even a casual tourist will find the book fascinating as a trip guide. Beginning at Antonito, it gives the history, uses, and geographical information about every station (past and present), tunnel, trestle, and bridge along the route, many of which are illustrated. Just reading the book is like making the Cumbres run again in imagination.

The book will be very valuable in making the public aware of the historic importance of the C&TSRR, its wealth of potential, and thereby helping insure its protection and further development.

Corrales, N. Mex. RUTH W. ARMSTRONG

TEMPLE HOUSTON: LAWYER WITH A GUN. By Glenn Shirley. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1980. Pp. x, 339. Illus., bibliog., index. $14.95.

TEMPLE HOUSTON, the youngest son of Sam Houston, was born in 1860, in the Texas governor's mansion. Orphaned by the deaths of his father in 1863 and his mother in 1867, he was reared by an older sister. He left home at the age of twelve to become a drover and later made his way to Washington, D.C., where he served as a page in Congress. He returned to Texas and graduated from Baylor at the age of nineteen with a bachelor of philosophy degree.

He was admitted to the bar while still nineteen, and in 1881, Governor Oran Roberts appointed him district attorney for the sprawling Texas Panhandle. A few years later he was elected to the Texas Senate from that district. During his career in Texas while living at Mobeetie and Canadian City, he not only became well known as a brilliant criminal lawyer, but he also made his mark as a man of culture, flamboyant dress, and accuracy with a six gun.

When the Cherokee Outlet was opened to settlement in 1893, Houston moved to Woodward, Oklahoma Territory, where he made his home until his untimely death in 1905. He chose to make his home in Oklahoma not only because of the fresh opportunities available in a frontier area, but primarily because he insisted on being known as Temple Houston rather than as "Sam Houston's boy."

Like his father, Houston possessed the stuff of which legends are made. Clothed in bell-bottom Mexican trousers, wearing a six-gun under his frock coat, and sporting a long mane of black hair, he was regarded as a dangerous adversary. The gunfight in the Cabinet Saloon at Woodward between Houston and the Jennings brothers provided still more grist for the legend mill. When Edna Ferber used Temple Houston as the model for her fictitious Yancey Cravat in *Cimarron*, the legend was perfected.

Legend once completed is difficult to disentangle from fact. In the John Ford movie, *The Man Who Shot Liberty Valance*, one of the characters says that when a journalist has the option of printing the legend or the truth about a man, one should print the legend. Fortunately for the reader of this book, Glenn Shirley has chosen to dwell on the facts. And the truth is that Houston was significant primarily as a circuit-riding frontier attorney with a gift for eloquence and dramatic timing. His famous defense of the prostitute Minnie Stacey at Woodward is one of the many examples in the book of his brilliant courtroom rhetoric.

Glenn Shirley has done a fine job in giving the reader a believable Temple Houston. At times the background information of various court cases almost inundates the reader, but this is Shirley's method of using a man-and-his-times approach rather than a narrow framework for his subject. Although handicapped by the absence of any extensive collection of Temple Houston papers, Shirley has done an exhaustive job of research in newspapers, court transcripts, reminiscences and interviews with Houston's contemporaries, as well as in numerous secondary sources. In summation, the work is a noteworthy contribution to the literature of frontier law.

Central State University of Oklahoma DONALD E. GREEN

LOOK FOR ME IN HEAVEN: THE LIFE OF JOHN LEWIS DYER. By Mark Fiester. Boulder, Colo.: Pruett Publishing Company, 1980. Pp. 504, Illus., bibliog., index. $19.95 cloth.

AROUND THE DOME of the Colorado State Capitol in Denver are sixteen stained-glass windows honoring Colorado pioneers. One of these portraits depicts Methodist minister John Lewis Dyer (1812–1901), the subject of this biography by Mark Fiester. Although always drawn to religion, Dyer first worked in the Wisconsin lead mines and was not ordained until the advanced age of forty-three. Following service in pastorates in Wisconsin and Minnesota, he came to Colorado in 1861, beginning a circuit-riding ministry that carried him to the most remote regions of Colorado and New Mexico. Often traveling between his posts (and carrying the mail) on snowshoes, or "Norwegian skis," Dyer became known as the "Snow-Shoe Itinerent," a name he took for his classic autobiography first published in 1890.

A Methodist minister himself who served for seven years as pastor of the Father Dyer Methodist Church in Breckenridge, Colorado, Fiester has the religious background necessary to understand fully Dyer's life. He states in the introduction that he "was concerned about an historical presentation, hoping the book would be both inspirational to the reader and of value to future researchers" (p. 4). Certainly he has managed to convey Dyer's religious spirit, summing him up at the end as "representative of what the searcher hopes for, prays for, and looks for, in the one who stands in honored place between God and man, speaking to the heart" (p. 474).

Look for Me in Heaven, however, is less successful when considered as a work of history. Too often the author has succumbed to the temptation to include all that he knows about Dyer's life and times, as in the instance where four pages (pp. 149–52) are devoted to a discussion of nineteenth-century cholera epidemics, complete with graphic descriptions of the effect of the disease on its victims. In fact, probably half of the book's five hundred pages could have been pared by a good editor with no loss of essential information. Editing could also have removed the references to source material from the text and placed them with the end-notes, which number only eighty-two, although Fiester's exhaustive research spanned thirteen years. There is, however, a lengthy and helpful bibliography.

It is difficult to criticize a work that was so obviously undertaken and completed as a labor of love. Certainly, it must be said that few historians could understand and do justice to Dyer's Methodist heritage as well as a fellow minister, and we should be grateful to Fiester for his sympathetic portrait. Written from the heart, *Look for Me in Heaven* lacks some of the components of good history, but it does capture the religious spirit of the snowshoe itinerent.

Colorado Historical Society MAXINE BENSON

ON THE TRAIL: THE LIFE AND TALES OF "LEAD STEER" POTTER. By Jean M. Burroughs. Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, 1980. Pp. x, 148. Illus., notes, bibliog. $12.95.

IT WOULD BE EASY to dismiss *On the Trail: The Life and Tales of "Lead Steer" Potter* is just another collection of amusing anecdotes about one of the West's colorful, but minor characters, an interesting but inconsequential sideroad to the history of the region. Jean Burroughs's charming book is much more than this. It is scholarly without being pedantic, and makes a genuine contribution to the written record of New Mexico in the days when the smoothing hand of civilization was first brushing in earnest over the face of those vast territories.

The story of the great cattle trails alone (the Goodnight–Loving, the Stinson, the Western, the Chisum, the Eastern, the National and, of course, the Potter–Bacon Cutoff itself, named in part after the nominal subject of Ms. Burrough's book) is a solid contribution to the epic of the cattle lands of the late-nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. What refreshes is that Ms. Burroughs has the good sense to tie her facts together by concentrating on the "life and tales" of her protagonist Col. Jack Potter, by all odds one of the most original of the many originals who inhabited the area. That "Lead Steer" Potter was larger than life, literally as well as figuratively, keeps the book from being another harvesting of dry and dusty facts.

What refreshes, too, is that Ms. Burroughs wisely lets her hero speak for himself as often as possible. A case might be made that *On the Trail* is not quite "oral history" in the strictest sense of that marvelous free form as we have come to know it in recent years, but it comes very close to it. The fact that Col. Potter was something less than a grammarian and stylist in the pieces he wrote for the *Union County Leader*, and that he needed from time to time the help of an assortment of editors and proof readers should in no wise put off the modern reader. His writings without exception retain the wonderful, breathy, frontier bombast and charm that mark the best work being done in those bygone days.

On the Trail is, essentially, two books, the "Life" by Jean Burroughs, and the "Tales" of Lead Steer Potter himself. It would take a coin toss to determine which will interest the reader more.

All in all, *On the Trail: The Life and Tales of "Lead Steer" Potter* is a stunning and worthwhile contribution to solid New Mexicana and should take a rightful, well-earned place on southwestern bookshelves.

Congratulations are due, not only to Jean Burroughs, but to her publisher, the Museum of New Mexico Press, for providing history buffs and those of us who revel in good yarns of the "olden times" with rich and satisfying fare indeed.

Albuquerque NORMAN ZOLLINGER