

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 57 | Number 4

Article 7

10-1-1982

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 57, 4 (1982). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol57/iss4/7>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

BOOK NOTES

The University of Texas Press continues to reprint the works of eminent writer and folklorist J. Frank Dobie. To date eleven books have appeared in paperback, including *Rattlesnakes* (\$6.95 paper) and *Out of the Old Rock* (\$7.95 paper). The former is a collection of stories and information about a southwestern resident. Dobie hooks readers by beginning with accounts of large snakes, some reportedly more than ten feet in length. There are innumerable tales of encounters with rattlers, including one in which pioneer cattleman Oliver Loving was trapped between a Comanche warparty and a large snake. All are told in typical Dobie fashion.

Out of the Old Rock is a collection of Dobie's writings compiled by his wife, Bertha, who followed the request in Dobie's will that someone make a book of character sketches. The characters involved range from the well-known to the unknown—author and artist Tom Lea, folklorist John Lomax, historian Walter Prescott Webb, trail driver W. W. Burton, wildcatter Ed Bateman, cattleman Lupe Quijada of Chihuahua, and New Mexican Clay Allison, "Don Quixote of the Six-Shooter." These sketches, though published previously, do not appear in any of Dobie's other books; all demonstrate Dobie's skill at fleshing out a character study.

Studies in Southern Presbyterian History (B. & B. Printers, Gunnison, Colo.) collects essays appearing previously in historical journals. Historian Harold Parker of Western State College in Gunnison is author of the essays, several of which received awards from the Presbyterian Historical Foundation. Parker also serves as pastor of the Lake City Presbyterian Church, and his *Sermons on the Minor Prophets* is available from B. & B. Printers.

Remember the turn-of-the-century guide and travel books and the promotional literature produced by western states to stimulate immigration and development? *The Land of Enchantment: From Pike's Peak to the Pacific* by Lilian Whitting (Sun Books, Santa Fe, \$15.00 paper), a reprint of a 1906 publication, provides a good example of that genre. According to Whitting the region of Colorado, New Mexico, and Arizona, and Southern California had "sublime and unparalleled scenic sublimity" that was "unrivalled in the world." Even the Alps and Himalayas paled by comparison. That tone is maintained throughout in descriptions of scenic attractions supported by historical information. It is all very romantic and promotional and provides an interesting example of that type of literature.

By contrast *California: History of a Remarkable State* by John Caughey and Norris Hundley (Prentice-Hall, \$21.95 cloth) strips away much of the romanticism in the fourth edition of one of the standard histories of California. It is a broad history that emphasizes political, economic, and social history through the decade of the 1970s, although coverage of the post-World War II years remains brief.

Also dealing with California is *Life Amongst the Modocs: Unwritten History* by Joaquin Miller with a lengthy introduction by Alan Rosenus (Union Press of Eugene, Oregon, \$7.95 paper). Miller was an eccentric nineteenth-century poet and writer who is relatively unknown today. *Life Amongst the Modocs* is a fictional account based to some degree on Miller's experiences during the 1850s; a pro-Indian view.

Book Reviews

AT ODDS: WOMEN AND THE FAMILY IN AMERICA FROM THE REVOLUTION TO THE PRESENT. By Carl N. Degler. New York: Oxford University Press, 1980. Pp. xiv, 527. \$25.00 cloth; \$8.95 paper.

CARL DEGLER HAS WRITTEN a clear, concise summary of the changing roles of women from the late colonial times to the present. Drawing heavily on the growing, if somewhat fragmented and often controversial women's studies literature, he attempts to integrate the factual material and to resolve the contradictions flowing from these various interpretations in his narrative. In addition, Degler uses a number of primary sources—notably federal census data, current government publications, and public opinion polls—to develop his thesis. The plight of contemporary woman, caught between her reproductive and nurturing role in the family cycle and the growing opportunities to enter and succeed in the work force, is summed up in the title of the book.

Modern trends—democracy, individualism, meritocracy, and the Industrial Revolution—have placed women at odds with their role in the family. After establishing the emergence of the modern American family after the Revolution, Degler shows how women were defined by society to fulfill the roles of wife and mother, yet how they have striven to establish themselves as individuals within and outside of such role expectations. Augmenting the important but more traditional materials treating family roles, child rearing, education, and women's work in the home with more recent literature dealing with female sexuality, contraception, abortion, divorce, and alternative life styles, Degler sensitively develops the dominant theme that women sought more control over their own lives as the nineteenth century progressed. Much of this experience is based on sources describing white middle-class women, but he tries to lessen this bias by integrating materials on blacks and immigrants who flowed into northern cities.

Degler uses work throughout the study to illuminate the basic inequality between men and women: "From the outset women's employment was shaped around the family, while man's work, in a real sense, shaped the family" (p. 395). Few questioned the importance of work and careers for men, but dominant social attitudes were slow to change as women began to respond to the opportunities of the Industrial Revolution by working outside the home. Working women were paid less, protected by legislation that discriminated against their advancement, and were denied equal opportunities on the assumption that jobs were less important to them and society than their role in the family. The greatest threat to this traditional stereotype followed World War II when increasing numbers of married women with young children sought careers in the work place.

The inherent contradictions between a woman's family role, career opportunity,

and search for individuality have not been resolved. They permeated female participation in traditional protest movements, from anti-slavery to the temperance crusade, and undercut female solidarity within the equal rights movements, from nineteenth-century equal rights protests through the suffrage campaign and the current effort to pass the ERA. Most women may strive for greater individual expression, but women as a group have been far from united on how best to balance individual aspirations, work, social roles, and the family.

Despite the clear exposition of the various themes in this book, and its important contribution as a well-written summary of much of the literature in the field, some reservations remain. Western historians will find little about frontier women, aside from their being part of an overall rural experience, and there is no mention of female roles in Indian or Hispanic culture. Because of the book's thematic orientation, Degler relies heavily on the published census as the most important continuous data source, with the result that his conclusions are only as strong as the census will allow. For instance, after showing how hard times squeezed individual women out of jobs during the 1930s, he can still assert that "the Depression did not drive women out of the labor force, nor did it send them back to the home" (p. 415). While the census reveals that there were 25.1 percent more women in the work force in 1940 than a decade earlier, which one could attribute to the increased demands of war, the Depression hit hardest between 1929 and 1938, which is the experience such statistics purport to describe. Summary statistics must be used with greater care. It is also unfortunate, considering how conveniently and well Degler brings together the extensive women's studies literature, that there are only a minimum of footnotes, and an absence of a bibliography.

University of Maryland

WHITMAN H. RIDGWAY

FRONTIERSWOMEN: THE IOWA EXPERIENCE. By Glenda Riley. Ames: Iowa State University Press, 1981. Pp. xv, 211. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$18.95.

IN *FRONTIERSWOMEN*, GLENDA RILEY intends to refute the persistent images of sunbonnet saints and debilitated drudges inhabiting the West of myth. Riley succeeds in seriously challenging these and other stereotypes by examining the lives of Iowa's women from 1830 to 1870, principally through their diaries, letters, and memories, augmented by census reports, period newspapers, and secondary sources.

Riley emphasizes the plural of her title throughout her book. She explores the varying motivations and migration patterns of Iowa's early female settlers, their interactions with Indians, and their social lives. Her two finest chapters closely analyze women's work on the frontier, including the material culture of their homes as workplaces, the myriad skills required of them, and the economic importance of those women the census listed as "Not Gainfully Employed." In spite of their prodigiously hard work, Riley denies their exploitation, arguing that frontierswomen "did not see themselves as subordinate, marginal or auxiliary,

... nor did they perceive themselves as oppressed or exploited" (p. 54). Here and elsewhere the author honestly discusses the strengths and difficulties inherent in her source materials, which often raise questions they cannot fully answer and that are open to varying interpretations. Riley quite convincingly presents her interpretation: that, in terms of their expectations, shaped by the norms of their era and their sense of the temporary nature of their frontier hardships, the majority of Iowa's frontierswomen realistically judged their lives as good. The rapid but uneven development of the state is made abundantly clear in Riley's chapter on women's experiences on the home front in the Civil War. Riley's juxtaposition of the letters of a private's wife desperately struggling to manage the farm and several children with the activities of a merchant's widow deeply involved in volunteer work in town underlines the importance of class and urban/rural distinctions as frontier society changed.

In spite of sincere effort, Riley is not as successful in challenging the myth of the purely WASP frontier. Absence of primary source material led her to choose to omit Native American women; although she attempted to cover black and immigrant frontierswomen, she admits that the same problem weakens her chapter on them. Riley does not deal in depth with the varieties of cultural sex role expectations among immigrant women, and her lengthy discussion of the status of blacks in Iowa, while informative, digresses from the female focus of her book. Riley's treatment of the "Strong Minded Women" active in education, business, and women suffrage goes far beyond "woman as civilizer" stereotypes. However, the author rather abruptly notes the sudden collapse of the suffrage drive after its initial victory in 1870, without commenting on the virtually simultaneous census declaration of the end of the frontier in Iowa, at least a striking coincidence.

Since the major thrust of Riley's work is toward diversity, she does not presume to generalize a new image of all frontierswomen from her Iowa data. However, her book should not be dismissed as having purely local interest and significance. The myths Riley proves inaccurate in Iowa are probably as inappropriate elsewhere, and her insistence that frontierswomen be seriously evaluated in their own terms deserves to be heeded by historians of other frontiers. This well-researched, clearly written book, with its lively and memorable use of individual examples, can serve as a model for other such studies and is enjoyable, informative reading for anyone interested in western women.

University of New Mexico

HELEN M. BANNAN

WOMEN'S DIARIES OF THE WESTWARD JOURNEY. By Lillian Schlissel. New York: Schocken Books, 1982. Pp. 262. Illus., notes, tables, index, bibliog. \$16.95.

LILLIAN SCHLISSSEL'S *Women's Diaries of the Westward Journey* carefully analyzes the diaries and reminiscences of 103 women who participated in the 2400-mile overland passage from the Missouri River to the Pacific territories between 1841 and 1866. Her conclusions corroborate certain themes regarding the experience of women on the American frontier that have appeared recently in Christiane

Fischer's *Let Them Speak for Themselves: Women in the American West* (1978) and Julie Roy Jeffrey's *Frontier Women* (1979). Each of these works alters our perceptions about what life in the West was really like, pointing out minute items of daily life that men's records have overlooked. Additionally we are made aware that the frontier was not necessarily a "liberating" experience for women, that though migration was a family affair, the decision to move was a man's decision; that women "did not greet the idea of going West with enthusiasm, but rather they worked out a painful negotiation with historical imperatives and personal necessity" (p. 155). During the passage and on the frontier, expediency often altered women's objective roles; nonetheless, women held on to nineteenth-century beliefs about woman's place, recreating the social fabric of a woman's sphere, relying on close bonding with other women and separation from the men.

The particular importance of Schlissel's work is its detailed focus on a limited time period and the express experience of the overland passage. Analysis by specific categories of ninety-six diaries gives a composite picture of the women involved and also points out experiences that are age-related (e.g., younger women showed greater enthusiasm for the "new roles and broader definition of what a woman might effectively do" [p. 84]), or dependent on the time period of the travel, background of the families, and their reasons for moving. Most important, however, is her well-founded argument that the diaries of men and women are not essentially alike. Women "ultimately perceived the westward trek differently" (p. 14), particularly when it came to such things as relations with Indians, reaction to enormous daily hardship, and to death, whether from cholera, accident, or childbirth. Indelibly stamped on our minds after reading this book is the fact that the legacy of these women who "were neither brave adventurers nor sunbonneted weepers . . . was the survival of the family on the westward journey" (pp. 155, 158).

University of New Mexico

JANE SLAUGHTER

HO FOR CALIFORNIA! WOMEN'S OVERLAND DIARIES FROM THE HUNTINGTON LIBRARY. Edited and annotated by Sandra L. Myres. San Marino, Calif.: Huntington Library, 1980. Pp. xv, 314. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$20.00.

A HARVEST YET TO REAP: A HISTORY OF PRAIRIE WOMEN. Researched and compiled by Linda Rasmussen, Lorna Rasmussen, Candace Savage, and Anne Wheeler. Introductory essays by Candace Savage. Toronto, Canada: Women's Press, 1976. Pp. 240. Illus., timeline, bibliog., credits, index. \$12.50.

TWO RECENTLY PUBLISHED books dealing with the frontier experiences of women, *Ho for California!* edited by Sandra Myres, and *A Harvest Yet to Reap*, edited by a group of Canadian women, show very clearly that there is no boundary between the frontier experiences of women in the United States and Canada. And, even though the Canadian book covers a period somewhat more recent than Myres's volume, there are many experiences the frontier women included in the

books had in common—facing danger, bearing children and raising families under difficult physical conditions, living with poverty or want, making do without conveniences or professional help, and dealing with a sexism inherent in a male-dominated society. Even though westering, that inexorable movement of people across the North American continent, was an experience women and men shared, women in the West were seldom allowed to forget that they inhabited a male-dominated world.

According to Sandra Myres, our perceptions of the women who journeyed west have been shaped by men, since most writers about the experience were men who did not read, or who read and ignored, the journals and reminiscences of the women who went west. The result has been the encouragement of stereotypical views of the western woman; the cure is to read what that woman wrote, and Myres has made this possible by publishing five journals from the period from 1849 to 1870. These accounts, taken from archival material in the Huntington Library, acquaint the reader with travel on three routes between the more settled parts of the country and the Pacific Coast. As we follow these narratives, we see the countryside, we endure the hardships, and we view trail companions through the perspective of women. These women were Mrs. Jane McDougal, who kept a diary of a west-to-east journey through the Isthmus of Panama; Mary Stuart Bailey and Helen Carpenter, who crossed the California Trail in the 1850s; and Harriet Bunyard and Mrs. Maria Shrode, who travelled through Texas, New Mexico, and Arizona in 1869 and 1870. While Carpenter's account is the most extensive and the best reading, all the diaries have a great deal to offer, and they are meticulously edited by Myres.

A Harvest Yet to Reap grew out of research compiled for a film project, and the book maintains its relationship with the visual arts, since it is generously supplied with photographs. The editors of this book took quotations from manuscripts, biographies, autobiographies, letters, advice columns, and a variety of other sources, and they placed them on pages opposite photographs and cartoons that illustrate beautifully the point of the printed material. The result is excellent. How useful it is, for example, to have a description of the rigors of washday described on the one hand, and to have a picture of a frontier woman doing washing on the open prairie on the facing page. The editors divided their material into several sections ranging from "Moving West" through "Winning the Vote," and each section has an introduction that describes the general history of the topic. While this is a book with a clearly stated feminist bias, the editors have been willing to let their quotations and pictures speak for themselves, and they speak eloquently.

There is a passage in *My Ántonia* in which Willa Cather describes the prairies of America. "There was," she wrote, "nothing but land: not a country at all, but the material out of which countries are made." She might well have been describing the land the women in these two books dealt with—the land that some of them helped to tame and civilize. These were the sort of women who contributed to turning land into countries. Their stories, in *Ho for California!* and *A Harvest Yet to Reap*, increase our knowledge of the frontier experience in North

America. These volumes show clearly the relationship between women's experiences in the United States and Canada, and they are works indicating that when pioneers are allowed to speak for themselves, they provide us with fascinating history.

San Jose State University

BILLIE BARNES JENSEN

WITH THESE HANDS: WOMEN WORKING ON THE LAND. By Joan M. Jensen. Old Westbury, N.Y.: Feminist Press; New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1981. Pp. xxiii, 295. Illus., index, notes. \$6.95 paper.

WE DIDN'T HAVE MUCH, BUT WE SURE HAD PLENTY: STORIES OF RURAL WOMEN. By Sherry Thomas. Garden City, N.Y.: Anchor Press/Doubleday, 1981. Pp. xviii, 185. Illus. \$7.95 paper.

ALMOST ANYONE WHO HAS attempted to research a women's history topic will attest to the sad fact that a lack of accessible source materials is a continuing and overwhelming problem. Because women were often illiterate or dependent on an oral tradition, left only scattered writing in diaries and letters, or were disregarded as unimportant by society, their sources have generally not been considered worthy of collection and preservation. These two volumes attempt to remedy that cruel oversight for the vast numbers of rural women who worked the land in the many and varied agrarian regions of the United States.

Jensen, an associate professor of history at New Mexico State University at Las Cruces, conducted her search for farm women's documents, interviews, poetry, fiction, and songs as part of a project sponsored by the Feminist Press. Her energy and diligence in seeking out elusive material has resulted in a comprehensive anthology documenting the lives and thoughts of Native American, black, immigrant, southern, western, and northeastern women. Each section is accompanied by an essay that provides a setting and context for the documents. The concluding section is a series of historical photographs of women during the Depression that heavily features the work of Dorothea Lange and Marion Post Wolcott.

Thomas, coauthor of *Country Women*, a guide for aspiring farmers, derived her original inspiration from the work of Dorothea Lange. After studying Lange's photographs of American country women, she decided to set off across the United States on what turned out to be a seventeen-thousand-mile odyssey interviewing farm women of many ethnic origins, races, and regions. Space limitations have allowed her to present only twelve of those women's interviews, but that scant dozen have an unexpected impact largely due to Thomas's meticulous transcriptions of dialect and even cadence. She has added only a brief biographical introduction to each piece.

The inspiration that Jensen and Thomas drew from Dorothea Lange for their approach to farm women is not the only characteristic they share. Both are farm women themselves. Jensen left teaching for a few years in order to learn to plow,

raise animals, cook on a wood stove, spin and weave on a Colorado farm, while Thomas is a successful sheep rancher on the California coast. Perhaps Jensen's and Thomas's roles as farmers help explain the great sensitivity that both evidence in their treatment of other rural women.

Certainly both books are marked by a celebration of the tremendous achievements of farm women, often in the face of great obstacles and hardships. And, most significantly of all, both books are dedicated to the proposition that the lives and source materials of those women who worked the land in America *are* worthy of collection, preservation, and study.

University of Northern Iowa

GLEND A RILEY

THE IMPACT OF INTIMACY: MEXICAN-ANGLO INTERMARRIAGE IN NEW MEXICO, 1821-1846. By Rebecca McDowell Craver. Southwestern Studies Monograph No. 66. El Paso: Texas Western Press of the University of Texas at El Paso, 1982. Pp. 80. Illus., notes, bibliog., appendixes. \$4.00 paper.

WITH PUBLICATION OF Rebecca Craver's *The Impact of Intimacy*, Texas Western Press continues its record of publishing impressive and important monographs concerning the history of the Southwest. In forty-eight pages of text, the author examines the phenomenon of Mexican-Anglo intermarriage in northern New Mexico during the twenty-five years preceding American conquest. Craver emphasizes in the introduction the lack of historical studies on intermarriage in the Spanish Borderlands, a topic most historians have overlooked.

She focuses her study on Rio Arriba, particularly Taos and Santa Fe, where a high incidence of intermarriage occurred between Anglo men and Hispanic women in the years immediately following Mexican independence. In this slim monograph, Craver asks and attempts to answer several important and provocative questions. She begins by questioning the validity of historical literature that depicts the relationship between local Hispanos and Anglo immigrants as one of mutual suspicion, even hostility. If this description is accurate, she asks, why did so many Hispanic women marry Anglo men? Craver believes that the alleged animosity existing between the two ethnic groups has been exaggerated and that intermarriage in fact testifies to the existing amicable relations.

Craver speculates that Hispanic women married Anglo men for a variety of reasons: physical attraction, willingness to accept people of different race and culture, and economic and social benefits. Anglo males who intermarried did so for parallel reasons: physical attraction, political and financial gains, legal advantages (marriage to a native Hispano facilitated gaining citizenship that legalized trapping and trading activities), and aid in acquiring Mexican land grants.

Anglo men who married Hispanic women prior to 1846 adopted much of Hispanic culture and were in fact absorbed into Hispanic society, but the author notes that intermarriage initiated a reciprocal process of acculturation. Hispanos became somewhat Americanized, and Americans became Hispanicized. The chil-

dren of these marriages, however, established basic identity with the mother's ethnic group, and with rare exception they married Hispanos. Although she singles out three stressful episodes in which ethnic tensions were strong (1837, 1841, 1846), Craver maintains that the majority of Anglos who intermarried lived in harmony with Hispanic neighbors and that amicable relations were the general rule.

This is an attractive publication, well-researched and well-written, with a useful bibliography and informative endnotes. It contains three appendixes listing Mexican-Anglo unions alphabetically by women's surnames, by men's surnames, and church-sanctioned marriages by year. With each new study of intermarriage in the Southwest, based on solid research in church and government records (as Craver's is), our perception of ethnic relations will sharpen and our understanding of the assimilation process expand.

New Mexico State University

DARLIS A. MILLER

AGAINST ALL ODDS: THE FEMINIST MOVEMENT IN MEXICO TO 1940. By Anna Macías. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1982. Pp. xv, 195. Notes, bibliographical essay, index. \$27.50.

THE STEREOTYPICAL PASSIVE, submissive Mexican woman who is unable and unwilling to organize to defend her civil rights adorns the pages of the popular and academic literature. Thoroughly dominated by an authoritarian church and a particularly virulent brand of Mexican *machismo*, the *mujer mexicana* has presumably been incapable of organizing a politically active women's movement. *Against All Odds* contradicts this popular belief by chronicling the evolution of the Mexican feminist movement from 1890 to 1940. Synthesizing a host of often hitherto unutilized documentary materials in order to "piece together lost, neglected, and forgotten history," Macías demonstrates that thousands of women struggled against and overcame seemingly insurmountable obstacles to win their rightful place in Mexican society.

Mexico's feminist movement dates back to the seventeenth century, when Sor Juana Inés de la Cruz denounced the sexual double standard and advocated women's rights to education. Her dream was not realized until the latter nineteenth century, however, when the availability of public schooling for girls produced a small class of educated, professional women who banded together to form an incipient feminist movement. By inculcating socialist ideals compatible with feminist goals, the Revolution of 1910 wooed many women away from the anti-feminist ideology of the church and into the arms of the women's movement. Yet the opposition of many conservative women to the Revolution's anticlericalism reinforced most Revolutionary leaders' convictions that women were politically reactionary. An exception to this rule was Salvador Alvarado, the visionary socialist governor of Yucatán whose sincere commitment to women's rights led him to institute various political reforms and to cooperate with Yucatán's active feminist organizations to sponsor Mexico's first feminist congresses in 1916.

Despite internal conflicts and a lack of sustained leadership, the movement gained momentum during the 1920s and 1930s, as women became increasingly vocal in their demands for electoral equality. By 1939 it appeared as though women's efforts would be successful. A female suffrage amendment was proposed by President Cárdenas, approved by congress, and ratified by the states—only to be pigeonholed by congress, presumably to prevent women from supporting the right-wing candidate in the upcoming presidential election. Although women finally received full electoral rights in 1958, this achievement was a belated and anticlimactic victory for the 1930s feminists.

Macías's informative analysis offers certain lessons for present-day feminists. The advocacy of political leaders such as Alvarado, Carillo Puerto, and Cárdenas was a blessing and a bane for the women's movement. While feminists understandably welcomed such support against the hostile, machismo-dominated climate of early twentieth-century Mexico, they often found themselves manipulated, or their cause sacrificed, in order to further political careers or nonfeminist goals. The top-down mobilization of women in Yucatán and elsewhere may account for the movement's lack of ongoing female leadership and may have contributed to its fractionalization. Clearly, the ideological dissensus and personal discord between moderate and radical feminists impaired the cohesive organization essential to a strong and effective social movement. Perhaps a more unified front could have prevailed against congress's betrayal of the feminist cause in 1939.

Why did congress abruptly reverse its position on female suffrage? Macías's explanation—that the Feminine Idealist Party's support for the rightist Almazán rekindled congressional suspicions of women's political conservatism—is somehow unsatisfying. Supportive evidence concerning the size, composition, and activities of the Feminine Idealist Party would help buttress Macías's argument. Yet one suspects that this explanation may be as much an *ex post facto* rationalization as "the decisive factor" (p. 144) underlying congress's actions. Further research around this complex yet critical issue should address such questions as the depth and pervasiveness of public resistance to women's electoral equality, the political alignments among feminists and politicians, and the position of working class women vis-à-vis feminism and women's suffrage. Clearly in order is a sequel to Macías's book that documents the development of Mexican feminism from 1940 to the present and specifies those factors that intervened between 1940 and 1958 to enfranchise Mexican women.

University of New Mexico

SUSAN TIANO

DOROTHEA LANGE AND THE DOCUMENTARY TRADITION. By Karin Becker Ohrn.

Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1980. Pp. xvi, 277. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$27.50.

KAREN OHRN'S STUDY OF Dorothea Lange is aptly titled as it is as much about the tradition of American documentary photography as about Lange and her work. As Ohrn says, she is not writing a biography, but is reconstructing Lange's life

based on interpretations of her words and photographs. Important to such a "reconstruction" is an understanding of the cultural and artistic climate in which Lange worked.

Initial chapters describe Lange's childhood fascination with "visual representation of all kinds" (p. 3), her early decision to become a photographer, and her operation of a portrait studio in San Francisco in the mid-1920s. Middle chapters follow a pattern: first describing the development of the documentary tradition then analyzing Lange's participation in that tradition. The concluding chapters critique her final work on the family and provide a summary review of the significance of her work. Lange's reputation is as a documentary photographer of the Depression, and Ohrn provides a clear overview of the development of the documentary tradition out of the need to record and understand the effects of the Depression on America. While such an overview does put Lange's work in historical perspective and helps explain her development (particularly for the lay reader), Dorothea Lange is sometimes lost as a focus. A little less background on the bureaucracy of the Farm Security Administration's Historical Section and more on Lange's life during this period would have been welcome.

The best sections of the book are those in which Ohrn provides analyses of the distinctions between Lange's work and that of colleagues such as Imogen Cunningham, Paul Strand, Ansel Adams, W. Eugene Smith, and Margaret Bourke-White. Her critique of the differences between Lange's and Adams's photographs of the "relocation" of Japanese-Americans to detention camps during World War II is convincing and thoroughly supported by the photographs reproduced in the text. Further, such critical work informs not only our understanding of Dorothea Lange's approach to documentary photography, but also enriches our grasp of the subtle distinctions to be made between photographic "documents."

Ohrn is also sensitive to the fact that Lange's work as an artist was affected in various ways by her life as a woman. Ohrn reports Lange's lifelong concern that her role as wife and mother interfered with her artistic concentration. During her marriage to Maynard Dixon, the painter, Lange ran a portrait studio, after the time when doing portraits provided her a satisfying creative outlet, in order to allow Dixon to pursue freely his own art. Lange recognized the problems, and wanted, at the end of her life, just one year during which she could focus totally on her work. On the other hand, she found great comfort in her domestic role, ending her career photographing the intimacies of family life. Ohrn handles this underlying ambivalence with understanding and sympathy. Her presentation of this aspect of Lange's life adds not only to our understanding of Lange's creative output but also to our broader concern for the difficulties all creative women face.

Dorothea Lange and the Documentary Tradition offers information and insight into the reasons Dorothea Lange took the photographs she did. The book also provides some rationale for the popularity of Lange's Depression work and lack of interest in her more intimate documentation of her family. Ohrn does Lange a great service in providing serious analysis of this later work on the family, for Lange's critical reputation rests too exclusively on her FSA photographs. Examples of Lange's photography are used quite effectively throughout the text, but these

later photographs, completed late in her life and rarely reprinted, are a valuable addition to an excellent text.

University of New Mexico

VERA L. NORWOOD

THE AMBIDEXTROUS HISTORIAN: HISTORICAL WRITERS AND WRITING IN THE AMERICAN WEST. By C. L. Sonnichsen. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1981. Pp. 120. Notes, bibliog., index. \$9.95.

"WHY," ASKS C. L. SONNICHSEN, "are there so many bright young faces in the graduate seminar and so few bright old faces at the history conventions?" Well, Sonnichsen himself is still smiling in his eightieth year, and if you are one of those who are overburdened with the *angst*, identity crisis, guilty conscience, or general insecurity that characterize so much of academic history, this book could get you smiling again, too. It is brim full of inspiration and practical advice for members of an informal association he calls the "OHM"—the Order of Minor Historians—that consists primarily of nonacademic historians, some with professional training and degrees but most without, who write local history.

There is balm, for example, for authors of rejected manuscripts, and plenty of straight talk about what it takes to get published. There is advice on what kinds of sources to use and where to find them. And there is advice on writing, in which he exhorts us to shun technical jargon and to let the humor and color of our sources, as well as our own enthusiasm, show through. All of this is backed up, of course, by Sonnichsen's record as a prolific writer, a bibliography that exhibits some of the most tireless research and graceful writing in western historiography.

Few will agree that academic history is in as bad shape as Sonnichsen says it is, or that local history is as well off as he thinks. There is a deep undercurrent of populism in Sonnichsen's thought, a populism that, while it leads him to some fine insights, veers perilously close at times to anti-intellectualism. Sonnichsen clearly scores his points in his attacks on academia's false intellectualism, and one hopes that he intends nothing more.

Among many meritorious essays collected in this volume, one especially, called "Victims of Time: American Pioneers and the Western Historian," deserves wide circulation and discussion. After sketching the various historiographical interpretations of the western pioneer, which have portrayed him as either the agent of Manifest Destiny and higher civilization or the despoiler of natural resources who cheated, supplanted, and eradicated the original inhabitants, Sonnichsen expresses impatience with both views. As an alternative, he proposes a moderate interpretation of the pioneer as generally a decent sort, hardworking and humane, who was obviously limited, as all people are to some degree, by his cultural and intellectual environment. It is a tightly reasoned and mature position and ought to be taken into account in future studies.

Several of the essays have been published previously. My favorite is a reprint from the *Wilson Library Bulletin* called "Dracula in the Stacks," a tribute to the long-suffering reference staff in the library of the Arizona Historical Society. The

chapter is basically an anthology of naive or unfairly demanding requests for research that show up almost daily in the mail, forcing the staff to divert time from more reasonable and important projects and draining the blood of an already none too generously endowed institution. Correspondents range from the little old lady (known in the trade as the "L.O.L.") doing genealogical research to graduate students and university professors who should, one would think, know better. "Dracula in the Stacks" is only a beginning, although a fine one, in the larger task of enumerating the woes of state historical societies today, and one hopes that Sönnichsen or someone like him will pour a little more acid in his inkwell and continue what he has begun. An appropriate next step might be called "Dracula in the State Legislature."

Utah State Historical Society

GARY TOPPING

A SPANISH FRONTIER IN THE ENLIGHTENED AGE: FRANCISCAN BEGINNINGS IN SONORA AND ARIZONA, 1767-1770. By Kiernan McCarty, O.F.M. Washington, D.C.: Academy of American Franciscan History, 1981. Pp. xiii, 116. illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$20.00.

FATHER MCCARTY'S MONOGRAPH is a part of the American Franciscan History Series. This volume is marked by the straightforward style and extensive research in Spanish archival sources characteristic of other offerings in this important collection. In his foreword the author relates that the work is to be considered a companion piece to John L. Kessell's *Friars, Soldiers, and Reformers: Hispanic Arizona and the Sonora Mission Frontier, 1767-1856* (University of Arizona Press, 1976). He states that this was the deliberate intent of both authors. This short piece is represented as being an in-depth analysis of the three-and-one-half years following Jesuit expulsion.

Father McCarty's narrative reveals what transpired after the announcement of the Jesuit expulsion from Spanish mission fields. The heart of his presentation, however, is his discussion of the politics surrounding the replacement of Jesuits in Sonora.

He concentrates on the struggle between secular clergy, represented by Bishop Tamarón, and the Franciscans to gain viceregal approval for occupation of the area. A compromise was finally reached whereby the southern and most lucrative missions were given to secular clerical administration, meaning more receipts for governmental coffers, and the Franciscans were allotted the missions of the northern frontier area of the province. Another interesting situation developed after this settlement when a struggle arose over which Franciscan college was to supply missionaries.

Visitador General Gálvez's attempts at reform resulted in a division of mission administration between the missionary, for the spiritual, and a civil commissioner, for the lands and livestock. This state of affairs almost spelled disaster for the mission system. As a result of Gálvez's first-hand observation of the havoc that

this change wreaked on the missions and his hearing the pleas from the missionaries, he decreed at the end of his tour a return to the previous system of entire administration of each mission in the hands of the missionary.

The author presents some candid and interesting views of activities surrounding the replacement of the Jesuits in the Sonoran missions. The restrictions of a monograph may have led in some instances to a lack of clarity. In the first chapter Father McCarty states that: "The Querétaro college was perhaps in a better position than any of the other colleges to help in the replacement operation. Father Arricivita, chronicler of the Querétaro college, reminds us that the college had given up the Lipan Apache missions in Texas just before it was called upon to accept the Sonora field" (p. 8). However, Fr. Arricivita's account further explains that the Querétarans were reluctant to abandon their Texas field for that of Sonora and that only when pressure from the viceroy, coupled with assurances the Texas missions would be in the capable hands of the Zacatecans, did they acquiesce. Formal transfer of the Texas missions did not come until 1772, several years beyond the scope of this study. Therefore, the author should have further clarified the circumstances under which the Querétarans came to Sonora. Also, more discussion is needed to put these events in Sonora into perspective with the reform policies of Carlos III in New Spain.

Albuquerque

ROSALIND Z. ROCK

SPANISH SCIENTISTS IN THE NEW WORLD: THE EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY EXPEDITIONS. By Iris H. W. Engstrand. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1981. Pp. xiv, 220. Illus., appendixes, bibliog., index, notes. \$25.00.

IRIS ENGSTRAND, PROFESSOR OF HISTORY at the University of San Diego and best known, to this reader at least, for her scholarly translation of José Mariano Mozino's *Noticias de Nutka* (University of Washington Press, 1970), has expanded her focus from Mozino's work at Nootka on the west coast of Vancouver Island to a study of the Spanish scientists who accompanied the two major Spanish scientific expeditions of the late eighteenth century: the Royal Scientific Expedition to New Spain and the Malaspina Expedition.

Engstrand is at one with her topic and writes well. Her reader soon discovers that the value of this handsomely bound and amply illustrated volume lies in the wealth of information it contains—information that she has extracted from archival sources in Mexico, the United Kingdom, the United States, and Spain. She describes in detail the work of the botanists and naturalists of the 1785–1800 Royal Scientific Expedition who, under the direction of Martín de Sesse, epitomized the spirit of the Enlightenment by seeking an understanding of nature through the collection, examination, and classification of the flora and fauna of Puerto Rico and Cuba, Central America, and the west coast of North America. In a similar fashion, she examines the accomplishments of the globe-circling Malaspina expedition (1789–94), which visited South and Central America, the west coast of

North America, the Philippines, and South Pacific. The spirit of the Enlightenment stressed realism, and the work of illustrators such as Cardero, de Suria, Echeverria, and others reproduced in this book, reveals that penchant for accuracy and natural beauty. The author and the University of Washington Press are to be commended for the selection and beautiful reproduction of the five color plates as well as the faithful reproduction of more than forty black and white illustrations and engravings that grace the book. In addition to illustrations, the volume is further complemented by the inclusion of five maps, one of which is a reproduction of what appears to be a contemporary drawing tracing the route of Antonio Pineda y Ramírez from Acapulco to Mexico City (p. 78).

The weaknesses of the book are minor when compared to its strengths but curiously seem to result from that strength, i.e. the wealth of information in the book. Faced with such detail, author Engstrand has fallen into the common trap of including in her text minutiae that might better have been located in footnotes. One brief example will suffice: Antonio Pineda y Ramírez, a first lieutenant in the Royal Spanish Army whose hobbies included natural history, was appointed to the Malaspina expedition and, as head of the scientific detachment in Mexico, journeyed in 1791 from Acapulco to Mexico City. In her account of the Pineda expedition (Chapter 6) the author includes within her text much of Pineda's detailed findings regarding social customs, dress, activities, and conventions of the pueblos visited. Perhaps a greater degree of paraphrasing coupled with presentation of this detail in footnotes would have better served Engstrand's reader.

Furthermore, while an individual's thoughts or words may often convey a more accurate, complete, or colorful image than a paraphrased reproduction—and this doubtless would be the author's argument for inclusion—the overuse of brief quotations, a phrase or two in length ("given to drunkenness," p. 85; "captured interpreters," p. 137) add little and often constitute a minor annoyance. As Professor Engstrand lacks no skill with the pen, I fail to see the need for the frequent use of quotations such as those cited above. Nevertheless, these criticisms are minor and are far offset by the book's strengths. Engstrand's impressive bibliography is testament to her solid, scholarly research. This research has resulted in a valuable addition that will be of interest to historians, ethnologists, and the general reader.

Provincial Archives of British Columbia

BRIAN A. YOUNG