

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 58 | Number 1

Article 5

1-1-1983

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 58, 1 (1983). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol58/iss1/5>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

BOOK NOTES

As David Remley states in his afterword to *Johnny Christmas*, the book "belongs on the shelf with a double handful of other interpretive novels of the American West." First published in 1948, this novel of the fur trade by Forrester Blake (University of New Mexico Press, paper, \$6.95) has been overlooked by scholars although it was rediscovered in the 1970s by members of modern mountain man organizations. Set largely in New Mexico and Colorado in the 1830s and 1840s and dealing with such themes as racial and cultural conflicts, the impact of wilderness, and individualism, *Johnny Christmas* is also noted for its descriptive passages. It is a worthy addition to the UNM Press Zia Series, particularly with the afterword by Remley.

Also new from UNM Press is a paperbound edition of *A Taos Mosaic: Portrait of a New Mexico Village* by Claire Morrill (UNM Press, \$12.95), first published in 1973. This is a collection of impressions of people and events and aspects of culture in Taos—D. H. Lawrence, artists, penitentes, as well as average residents.

Other publishers, too, offer new paperback editions. *Jeff Milton: A Good Man with a Gun* by J. Evetts Haley (University of Oklahoma Press, \$19.95 cloth, \$9.95 paper) was first published in 1948. Haley is noted for his biography of cattleman Charles Goodnight and his history of the XIT Ranch. Milton, who stated, "I never killed a man that didn't need killing; I never shot an animal except for meat," was a southwestern law officer who lived in Texas, New Mexico, and Arizona. This is a readable biography of a tough and interesting western character.

Ancient City Press (P. O. Box 5401-R, Santa Fe 87502) offers a paperback edition (\$9.95) of *Santos and Saints: The Religious Folk Art of Hispanic New Mexico*, first published in 1974 by Calvin Horn and subsequently out of print. This contribution to Hispanic folk culture in New Mexico has several new illustrations and a new preface that identifies important publications since 1974. Ancient City Press has produced an attractive volume on an important cultural topic.

The same publisher also offers a facsimile reprint of a special artists and writers supplement to *The Santa Fe New Mexican* of 26 June 1940 (\$10.00). This well done supplement contains a considerable amount of information that remains a handy source of descriptive and biographical material on approximately 150 artists and writers. Marta Weigle and Kyle Fiore have added additional maps, photographs, historical sketches. It is a unique publication.

The Museum of New Mexico Press has reprinted *The Good Life: New Mexico Traditions and Food* (paper, \$5.95), first published in 1949. The author, Fabiola Cabeza de Baca Gilbert, grew up on a ranch at La Liendre, south of Las Vegas and spent most of her life as a home economist in northern New Mexico. The first part of the book describes folk traditions relating to harvest, herbs, Christmas festivities, and others, while the second part is a cookbook of native New Mexican food.

Those interested in New Mexico history will be particularly pleased that UNM Press has reprinted two books by the late William A. Keleher. Will Keleher grew up in Albuquerque, and after working as a reporter for several Albuquerque

newspapers, he entered the legal profession. Introductory sketches by Paul Horgan in *The Fabulous Frontier* (\$19.95 cloth, \$9.95 paper) and by C. L. Sonnichsen in *Violence in Lincoln County* (\$19.95 cloth, \$9.95 paper) provide views of Keleher the man and the scholar, although many will want to read his memoirs, which the Press will also reprint. Keleher is best known to scholars as a major figure in the writing of New Mexico history in the territorial period, and his work remains important today. *The Fabulous Frontier: Twelve New Mexico Items*, first published in 1945, is oriented toward individuals and includes historical sketches of John Chisum, Pat Garrett, John Hagerman, Albert Fall, Oliver Lee, Charles Eddy, and others. *Violence in Lincoln County*, originally published in 1957, is one of the major works in the historiography of the Lincoln County War. One reviewer identified it as the most important work on that conflict. UNM Press is to be commended for its plans to reprint all of Keleher's books.

Book Reviews

GUIDE TO RECORDS IN THE NATIONAL ARCHIVES OF THE UNITED STATES RELATING TO AMERICAN INDIANS. Compiled by Edward E. Hill. Washington, D.C.: National Archives and Record Service, 1981. Pp. xiii, 467. Illus., index. \$13.00.

EDWARD E. HILL, AN ARCHIVIST with the National Archives at Suitland, Maryland, has compiled an excellent guide to records relating to American Indians found in the National Archives. Hill previously compiled a *Preliminary Inventory of the Records of the Bureau of Indian Affairs* (2 volumes, 1965) and *The Office of Indian Affairs, 1824-1880: Historical Sketches* (1974), which became required reading for researchers in the vast Indian records of the National Archives. With Hill's new guide in hand and with the aid of the able staff of the Scientific, Economic and Natural Resources Branch, Civil Archives Division of the National Archives, a researcher can better wend his way through the maze of Indian records.

Hill's new guide is truly comprehensive. The records described range in chronology from pre-federal documents to the closing work of the Indian Claims Commission in the late 1970s. He provides the organizational history of governmental agencies such as the BIA in order to clarify to the reader how and why records became filed in their often confusing way. He sketches the histories of federal offices related to Indian affairs such as the Office of Indian Trade and conveniently lists the factories or posts where the trade was conducted. Hill traces the changes in record keeping including the centralization of BIA incoming and outgoing correspondence in 1907 and the shortlived Shafer "new system" experiment of 1936. Besides Interior Department and BIA records, he includes less well-known sources of Indian materials such as the records of the Treasury Department. He also indicates which Indian records are available at each of the regional Federal Records Centers. Moreover, Hill cross-references related materials, even those out of the National Archives and Record Service system such as those found at the Historical Society of Pennsylvania and the American Philosophical Society in Philadelphia.

His guide will undoubtedly stimulate more scholarship in this field. He mentions that school records at Cherokee, North Carolina, contain more information on agency matters than on education; that the records of the General Accounting Office (RG 217) contain Creek Indian affidavits establishing their entitlement to resettlement in Indian Territory; and that the records of the American Expeditionary Force (RG 120) contain references to Indians transmitting messages in Choctaw at the front during World War I. Hill thoroughly treats the records relating to the Indians of New Mexico. Besides the well-known records of the New Mexico Superintendency, the Mescalero and Pueblo and Jicarilla agencies, and the extensive records of the United States Army Continental Commands,

1821–1920 (RG 393), Hill points out there is valuable information about the Indians of New Mexico in other records. He specifically mentions that the records of the Health Division (RG 75) contain materials relating to the Zunis and that the records of the Division of Extension and Industry (RG 75) include statistical tables, maps, and photographs bearing on Jicarilla Apache history.

Hill's guide is a magnificent reference work that should be on every serious researcher's shelf.

*State University of New York
College at New Paltz*

LAURENCE M. HAUPTMAN

INDIAN CLOTHING BEFORE CORTÉS: MESOAMERICAN COSTUMES FROM THE CODICES. By Patricia Rieff Anawalt. Foreword by H. B. Nicholson. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1981. Pp. xix, 232. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$35.00

INDIAN CLOTHING BEFORE CORTÉS is descriptively titled. The book is an analysis of the primary sources (mainly pre- and post-conquest indigenous books or codices) that contain pictures and/or written accounts of native dress. The examples of clothing gathered as a data base come from six different culture groups extant at the time of the conquest: the Aztecs or Mexicans, the Tlaxcalans, the Tarascans, the Mixtecs, the lowland Maya, and the unknown peoples responsible for the Borgia Group of codices.

Anawalt categorizes the indigenous clothing by following Homer G. Barnett's descriptive system of garment categories: draped garments, slip-on garments, open-sewn, closed-sewn, and limb-encasing garments. Each culture group is discussed separately in chapters. Anawalt first names and explains her sources for the particular culture group's clothing, which is then followed by a clear descriptive text for each garment category. The last two chapters of the book are devoted respectively to a comparative analysis between the clothing of all five culture areas and an explanation and reiteration of the major areas of interpretation or controversy.

The goals of the book are clearly stated, and the author's lucid organization of the data reifies by example these goals. The text is completely illustrated, and all major points and controversies are illustrated so the reader may at all times be cognizant of the issues. That is, Anawalt states her resolution to certain problems, such as the provenience of the Borgia Group codices, but presents her arguments in such clear ways as to establish a discourse with the skeptical reader rather than demanding agreement.

Because this study is so well done, one (this reviewer, at least) wants more, especially some kind of reference or mention of Classic precedents, which in the case of the Maya cultures would present a very different panoply of clothing-types from the Post-Classic Maya examples.

University of New Mexico

FLORA S. CLANCY

MISSIONARIES, MINERS, AND INDIANS: SPANISH CONTACT WITH THE YAQUI NATION OF NORTHWESTERN NEW SPAIN, 1533-1820. By Evelyn Hu-DeHart. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1981. Pp. viii, 152. Illus., notes, bibliog., index \$9.95 paper.

THIS BOOK IS DEDICATED to the author's parents "who taught me to survive" and "to the Yaqui people who fight to survive and can teach us all." Since the author states her didactic purpose so bluntly the reviewer must note that the reader is expected to learn that "four centuries of contact and warfare with the *yori* or white man had not forcefully assimilated or decimated a proud people bent on survival" (p. 1. Note: there are many examples throughout the book of this theme of Yaqui success in refusing to assimilate into the *yori* society).

However, one learns also that during the Cárdenas regime a *zona indígena* (termed a de facto reservation by the author) was created on the north bank of the Yaqui River, but that the Yaqui people did not share in the benefits of the "Green Revolution." "In sum," writes the author, "it seemed ironic that, while alone among Mexico's Indian peasantry the Yaquis possessed rich land, they were not significantly better off" (p. 2).

So would the Yaquis be better off now had they become Mexicans, or are they better off by being able proudly to claim a separate ethnic and cultural identity? The reviewer is not certain as to what the Yaquis can teach us.

Turning now to the historical content (1533-1820) of the volume, one finds a well-planned, carefully and exhaustively documented book. The four chapters discuss the colonial legacy (pre-Jesuit Spanish intrusions, the Jesuit era, the rebellion of 1740 and the end of Jesuit hegemony, the emergence of a Yaqui "arrangement" acceptable to themselves and to the Spaniards, pp. 102-3). The pre-Jesuit Spanish intrusions had taught the Spaniards that "the operational methods which had proved so successful against the sedentary, advanced civilizations of central Mexico were not effective in the far more primitive north . . . Spaniards turned to missionaries for assistance in opening up this frontier" (p. 21).

The Jesuits receive high marks for their organization of a kind of permanent system that remained effective until mining interests (mainly) and general *vecino* economic development began to undermine the Jesuit control.

In descriptions of the Jesuit mission economy and political organization the author has been compelled to use "out of context" sources, but justifies such usage (acceptably in the reviewer's opinion) on the grounds that the Jesuits followed the same blueprint in the missions of the farther northwest as they must have in the Yaqui area (p. 113, note 34).

A fascinating episode is found in the years just before the Yaqui rebellion of 1740 when a petition (July 1739) was presented to the viceroy by Muni and Bernabé (described as Yaqui leaders) who presumably had prepared it, which was a request for greater economic, political, and personal independence from the Jesuits without its being anti-Jesuit or supportive of secularization. Imbedded in the list of requests was the right to carry and use their traditional arms, which were bows and arrows.

The complicated political, economic, and military conditions as background to and as a part of the rebellion of 1740 are well analyzed, especially the parts played

by Gov. Manuel Bernal de Huidobro and by his replacement, Capt. Agustín de Vildósola. The latter feared that a race war would develop; he suspected Muni and Bernabé's activities as a prelude to a new uprising and therefore, at his first opportunity, had these Yaqui leaders captured, executed, and decapitated. "Then he ordered their heads circulated in all the Yaqui pueblos" as a warning. The author concludes that though these brutal executions provoked sporadic acts of defiance, by 1742 the rebellion was at an end. (Curiously, though the index contains a fairly detailed list of topics under "Huidobro" [p. 147], under Vildósola, Agustín (*sic*) de [*sargento mayor*], no topic or page reference is found.)

We come then to the author's forcefully stated conclusion that the Yaquis over the years worked out an arrangement acceptable to themselves and to the Spaniards that allowed them to survive as a distinct people and culture—otherwise had their integration into the colonial society taken place that society's "rigid hierarchy" would have relegated them to the lowest rungs.

The volume contains a detailed critical bibliography and footnotes, an index, and useful maps.

San Francisco State University

THEODORE E. TREUTLEIN

INDIAN POLICY IN THE UNITED STATES: HISTORICAL ESSAYS. By Francis Paul Prucha. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1981. Pp. ix, 272. Illus., notes, index. \$19.95.

THIS IS A COLLECTION OF sixteen essays by the most prolific of the historians concerned with the evolution of American Indian policy. Most of the items have appeared previously in journals of varying availability. The others were delivered as papers before scholarly groups.

With the exception of the last essay, which edges into the early 1900s, the collection is focused on the nineteenth century. Among the subjects of the essays are the problems and opportunities in the writing of the history of Indian policy, overviews of that policy, and the contributions of particular individuals such as Lewis Cass, Thomas L. McKenney, and Andrew Jackson. The role of reformers has been a principal interest of Father Prucha, and this is reflected in the collection as well.

Paul Prucha has never been reluctant to call them as he sees them. This has led him to challenge conventional interpretations such as the linking of Indian removal with the concept of the Great American Desert, an interpretation he singlehandedly demolished. Prucha also offered a balanced evaluation of Andrew Jackson's contribution to Indian policy that made him notorious among some Indian activists and their sympathizers in academic circles. Nor has he been reluctant to challenge a fellow academic who maintained that scientific racism lay at the core of American Indian policy, a thesis readily acceptable in the intellectual climate of the post-Vietnam era. Father Prucha does not bend with the prevailing winds.

As he makes clear in his preface, Prucha's research and writing have been concerned almost exclusively with the development of policy rather than its im-

plementation in the field. He has not studied the history of tribes subjected to the policies formulated by an Andrew Jackson or a Thomas L. McKenney or the impact on Indians of these policies as administered by a Lewis Cass. Thus it would be possible for a historian of the Potawatomi, a tribe that sold land at treaties presided over by Lewis Cass, to have a different view of him than does Father Prucha. The latter sees Cass primarily in terms of how faithfully and honestly he administered the policies of his superiors, not in terms of how the Potawatomi suffered by such policies.

But that is to imply criticism of Prucha for something that he did not set out to do. In the area in which he did choose to work he has greatly advanced our knowledge. In more than a decade, no one has written about nineteenth-century Indian policy without drawing heavily upon his work, as a cursory examination of the notes and bibliographies of recent books demonstrates. Prucha and the University of Nebraska Press have done us all a service by making these essays available in one volume.

State University of New York, Fredonia

WILLIAM T. HAGAN

THE INDIAN OFFICE: GROWTH AND DEVELOPMENT OF AN AMERICAN INSTITUTION, 1865-1900. By Paul Stuart. *Studies in American History and Culture*, Number 12. Ann Arbor, Mich.: UMI Research Press, 1979, Pp. xvi, 243. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$27.95.

THIS BOOK EMPLOYS Philip Selznick's theory of bureaucracy as expressed in an article written for the *American Sociological Review* (1943) to examine the organizational development of the Bureau of Indian Affairs between 1865 and 1900. The author is concerned with the circumstances under which the Indian Office freed itself from external influences, became well bounded, centralized, and directed toward the goal of Indian assimilation through education, land allotment, and citizenship. The author argues that by the end of the century institutionalization in reference to the goal of assimilation resulted in organizational inflexibility and rigidity, which made the Indian Office unresponsive to the needs of its Indian clientele. Thus a mature bureaucracy became a barrier to needed change including the implementation of John Collier's program in the 1930s.

The appointment of agency personnel and the administration of reservations are major themes. Before 1877 the only field officials appointed from Washington were the superintendents and agents. After 1873 superintendents were gradually replaced by inspectors who were key figures in the process of centralization. At first they had extra-organizational allegiances but were made more and more subject to direction by the Indian Office. Inspection reports became increasingly specific and balanced in reporting on such important subjects as education, land allotments, and the abilities of agency personnel. Between 1893 and 1908, agents were phased out, and the administration of reservations came under the control of school superintendents who, along with other field personnel, were placed under Civil Service regulations. This was a complex evolutionary process that

involved the development of regulations and the elimination of denominational and military participation in the management of reservations. The school superintendents became central to reservation management because education was regarded as the key to assimilation.

In dealing with education, the author points out that a very large majority of Indian youth were dependent on government-run schools. In 1883, of eighty-two boarding schools supported by government funds, only fifteen were contract schools run by churches. Tables of federal expenditures reflect a growing commitment to Indian education in the last quarter of the nineteenth century, and the use of denominational contract schools may be viewed as a stop-gap measure while the government expanded its educational facilities and brought them under centralized control through a system of civil service appointment and frequent inspection. The conflict between Commissioner Thomas J. Morgan and the Catholic Bureau of Indian Missions in the early 1890s is seen as the final stage in bringing education largely under the control of the Indian Office. This portion of the book needs, however, to be supplemented with Francis Paul Prucha's recent study of Catholic education on reservations supported with tribal and trust funds. In view of Prucha's evidence, the Indian Office does not appear as "well-bounded" against external influences by 1900 as the author thinks.

The major contribution of the book is that it provides an institutional framework and a conceptual focus for studying well-known material. It also underscores the importance of giving more attention to the subject of Indian education as compared with land allotment in studying the policy of assimilation. One can quarrel with statements regarding the origins of the reservation system and the role of the Board of Indian Commissioners (pp. 70 and 77), which gave advice on policy from the beginning, and still appreciate this monograph as a valuable contribution to scholarship.

St. Olaf College

HENRY E. FRITZ

CHIEF LEFT HAND: SOUTHERN ARAPAHO. By Margaret Coel. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1981. Pp. xiv, 338. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$15.95.

LEFT HAND WAS A HUGE, handsome Arapaho Indian, friendly to whites and able to speak not only Arapaho and Cheyenne but also English, perhaps learned from his brother-in-law, Indian trader John Poisal. Like the Cheyenne chief Black Kettle, Left Hand believed that coexistence with the white man on the plains of Colorado was possible.

When gold seekers arrived, Left Hand and his people were friendly, supposing the intruders would leave when they found their gold. They did not leave; by 1859 they had settled on the site of Denver that belonged to the Indians. Arapaho and Cheyenne leaders and United States agents met to resolve the problem at Fort Wise on the Arkansas. The Indians were duped into accepting arid reservations in eastern Colorado where they were expected to settle and farm like

white men. A succession of dishonest government agents frustrated the Indians; their braves became aggressive; inflammatory newspaper accounts whipped up the people of Denver to panic; the personal ambitions of Gov. John Evans and military commander Col. John Chivington overcame their responsibility to the public; and the result was war between Arapahos and Cheyennes and the white men. Left Hand and Black Kettle withdrew their people to a remote camp on Sand Creek (now Big Sandy) to stay out of the fight, and several army officers assured them they would be safe there. In November 1864, Colonel Chivington and an army of citizen-soldiers marched from Denver and surprised the Indian camp, killing most of the Indians and savagely mutilating their bodies. Left Hand was mortally wounded in the battle.

Margaret Coel tells this appalling story in a plain, forthright style that should appeal to many readers. She does not pretend to scholarly detachment, and her sympathies are with the Indians, as must be those of any disinterested reader of testimony taken at government investigations of the massacre. The story has been told time and time again. Coel adds nothing new, or does she neglect any important information provided by earlier writers. Her book is a good synthesis, attractively presented.

The author is not yet a well-seasoned scholar. Her work contains just a sprinkle of unwarranted assumptions, unreferenced assertions, unreasoned conclusions, and a big unresolved conflict as to the identity of her subject. Coel states that Left Hand's Indian name was Niwot, and that Niwot means "left-handed" in Arapaho. She does not give a source for either statement, nor does she prove that the references to Niwot were not to a younger Arapaho chief named Left Hand or Niwot. My research leads me to believe that Coel's Left Hand was not called Niwot at all, but Namus. Left Hand (Namus) appears in three primary sources. Lt. James Abert met him in September 1846 at Bent's Fort with a group of Cheyenne. Abert's private diary and official report give Left Hand's Indian name as "Namus" and "Ah-mah-nah-co, The Bear Above," a name he acquired after an act of valor. Abert's text and sketches show Namus to be large, exceptionally tall, handsome, friendly to whites, and helpful to Abert in compiling a Cheyenne glossary. This same man signed, as a Cheyenne, the Fort Wise treaty of 1861, his name being recorded as "A-am-a-na-co, Left Hand or Namos." Namus appears again in Alexander Barclay's diary at Hardscrabble on 10 June 1846 as "Poisel's Indian Namus," which Coel quotes. At this point Coel is not quite honest with us. Her footnote to Barclay's diary says, "Barclay was also the first to render Left Hand's Arapaho name as Namus. In subsequent years Niwot would also be rendered Niwathit, Nawat, Nawatch, Norwatch, and Norwanche. . . ." She attempts here to pass off "Namus" as a variant of "Niwot," while denying that Niwot and Namus were the same man.

Coel does not identify her Niwot with Namus because in two of the three references Namus is associated with Cheyennes rather than Arapahos, which is more easily explained than how two Indians named Left Hand, in the same era, at the same place, both extraordinarily tall and handsome, friendly to whites,

linguistically talented, and related to a white man named Poisal, are not one and the same person. As a scholar, Coel has an obligation to follow the evidence wherever it may lead and to explain any inconsistencies or conflict in her sources.

Colorado Springs, Colo.

JANET LECOMPTE

INDIANS, BUREAUCRATS, AND LAND: THE DAWES ACT AND THE DECLINE OF INDIAN FARMING. By Leonard A. Carlson. Contributions in Economics and Economic History, no. 36. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1981. Pp. xii, 219. Illus., notes, appendixes, bibliog., index. \$29.95.

JUDGED EITHER AS A PROGRAM to advance the welfare of American Indians or to promote the economic development of those on reservations, allotment of tribal lands in severalty "was a disaster," writes Leonard A. Carlson. "Rather than encourage Indian farmers, it led to a significant decline in Indian farming" (p. 174). This conclusion will not surprise historians, but the economist's analysis of the implementation and effects of the Dawes Act from 1887 to 1934 makes the work a valuable contribution to Indian studies.

Carlson uses published primary (mostly government) and secondary sources and combines traditional methods with those of the new economic history. The core of the book involves the testing of models and gives quantitative reinforcement to generally accepted views. The writer's first major conclusion is that in area after area the needs of whites, rather than Indian readiness, led to the opening of tribal lands. His second, that allotment actually hindered the development of Indian farming and ranching, is no more surprising. Carlson's approach and methods are revealing, nevertheless.

Indian farming was often developing favorably *before* allotment, the economist claims. Contrary to the assumptions of the late nineteenth-century reformers, Indians rarely engaged in "common" agricultural enterprises, rather benefitting from a "system of use rights," "a workable system of private property" (pp. 88, 167) — though not in the American sense. Allotment was intended, among other things, to increase Indian incentives to farm their lands and to help them learn new skills. "It had the opposite result in many cases," writes Carlson. "Indians often reduced the amount of land they farmed and remained relatively isolated from the white settlers," who sometimes became the majority on the reservation (p. 160).

Carlson concedes that allotment may not have been "the only factor that mattered in shaping economic changes among Indians" (p. 141), but he gives too little consideration to other possible factors. In a recent dissertation (1977), Frederick E. Hoxie showed deep changes in the attitudes of those interested in the "Indian problem" around the turn of the century. Might such changes have had an effect on Indian life? The larger context, in other words, deserves more attention, even in a specialized study. There is much repetition, sometimes helpful, sometimes irritating.

Those, like the present reviewer, who are unversed in cliometrics will find the

quantitative methodology difficult, but in general the book is clearly written. The approaches are effectively explained and the argument backed by copious statistical material, in the text and appendixes. Carlson claims no magic for newer methods, stressing the need to combine traditional and quantitative approaches. He is aware of the complexity of the issues—for Indians, reformers, and the government in 1887, as well as for historians since. And for economists—he also examines the Dawes Act from the perspective of the economic theory of property rights. Admitting the difficulty of arriving at criteria for evaluating such an ambitious cross-cultural experiment, Carlson attempts a systematic appraisal of the act of 1887, based on a number of valid criteria. By almost all these criteria—except that of opening “unused” tribal lands to whites—the policy failed dismally.

Finally, Carlson suggests an alternative policy, tribal-based, one that would have sought to conserve the best of the past while helping Indians adapt to the realities of the 1880s. He acknowledges that such an approach would never have been acceptable to the reformers. But it might have achieved many of their goals more effectively than did the “strikingly perverse policy” (p. 111) that the government actually forced on mostly reluctant Indians, ostensibly for their own good.

University of Jyväskylä, Finland

MICHAEL C. COLEMAN

PAPAGOS AND POLITICS. By Peter Blaine, Sr., with Michael S. Adams. Tucson: The Arizona Historical Society, 1981. Pp. 145. Illus., notes, index. \$15.00 cloth; \$10.00 paper.

PETER BLAINE'S NARRATIVE is an important contribution to our understanding of the so-called “Indian New Deal” of the mid-1930s—one of the most sweeping federal experiments in social change of this century. His grassroots perspective is an interesting and refreshing complement to the generalizing and theoretical cant of accounts written by academics and government administrators. Although describing events of almost fifty years ago, he puts us in touch with issues still simmering and contradictions still unresolved. Much of what he has to say about his experience should be familiar and instructive to other Indian tribal leaders and students of reservation politics today.

For example, he discusses the ideal of popular consensus in Papago decision-making. According to tradition, the good leader carefully explains options to his people and lets them come eventually to agreement. To use anthropologist Henry Dobyns's phrase, he “persuades rather than pushes.” Yet in Peter Blaine's active years the ideal was constantly challenged by the reality of dealing with Anglo government agents pushing for quick decisions. This ideal-real discontinuity still prevails in many reservation communities.

The good leader ideally should work diligently to get something for his people, typically in the form of federal government benefits. But getting something is actually difficult for underpaid tribal chairpersons whose terms of office last only one year; Blaine shares with leaders of other tribes the conviction that one or

two years is simply not enough time for an executive to plan, apply for, and supervise the operation of federal program benefits.

Then there is community factionalism. As on some other reservations, that on the Papago reservation ostensibly pits Papago Protestants against Papago Catholics; but the more fundamental cleavage is between those favoring traditional ways and those seeking "modernization." Thus for the tribal leader, getting something for the people may involve deciding *which* people are to benefit. The ideal of consensus under such conditions is virtually impossible to achieve. Blaine describes his efforts to weave his way among the factions and keeps reminding readers, as he presumably did his constituents, of the consensual idea. Yet he tends to side with the tradition-oriented group.

Ideally, too, the good leader among Papagos and other tribes should be capable of standing up to government administrators in asserting tribal interests (including the preservation of precious tribal water rights). As other tribal leaders often do, Blaine retrospectively portrays himself as a forceful tribal advocate in skirmishes with the Bureau of Indian Affairs. Yet the assertiveness must always leave room for compromise, and Blaine displays evident talent as a mediator or broker between Papagos and Anglos. His broker quality is abetted by his extensive work and educational experience among Anglos—he knows their ways—and by a self-confident eagerness to remain in the public eye.

This oral history is not intended as a well-rounded ethnographic account of Papago life. There are references to Papago ceremonies, kinship and family relations, and tribal sub-group interaction. Editor Michael S. Adams has wisely arranged the fairly short chapters in chronological order rather than by topic and presents a brief introduction to each chapter to help the reader understand the context of Blaine's recollection. The narrative should appeal to readers from a variety of backgrounds.

University of Connecticut

ROBERT L. BEE

CROSSCURRENTS ALONG THE COLORADO: THE IMPACTS OF GOVERNMENT POLICY ON THE QUECHAN INDIANS. By Robert L. Bee. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1981. Pp. xix, 184. illus., notes, index, references. \$18.50 cloth; \$7.50 paper.

IN RECENT YEARS SEVERAL significant new studies have appeared dealing with federal Indian policy, but little attention has been devoted to microcosmic investigations of its effects on particular tribal groups throughout the entire history of Anglo-Indian relations. Robert Bee has provided a valuable case study of this type, focusing on the Quechan, or Yuma, Indians, who reside on a reservation in extreme southeastern California near the confluence of the Colorado and Gila rivers.

After a brief description of traditional Quechan culture and lifestyle, Professor Bee divides his narrative chronologically into four major parts, beginning each

with a general treatment of the government's Indian policy during that period. He then deals with its impact on the Quechans, how they adjusted, and how the effects frequently differed from stated goals and predictions by policymakers. The latter discrepancy is explained by a process of "internal colonialism," a model that Bee uses and that has been used recently by other scholars of Indian policy as well. As colonizers, the government subordinated the needs of the colonized Quechans to those of the Anglos. This involved all-too-familiar stories of economic control over Indian resources, flagrant violation of treaties, and either the elimination of tribal leaders or their transformation into administrators of policy and programs over which they had no control. Even cultural assimilation was never intended to succeed but should also "be seen as part of a strategy for economic manipulation of Quechan resources insofar as it was aimed at undermining any community solidarity. . . ."

Bee does not portray the Quechans as fixed and unchanging recipients of policy handed down. Some characteristics remained consistent, such as family and kinship ties, a consensual style of decision-making, and informal organizational structures, and the Indians adjusted to changes within the context of these traditions. But they also became increasingly skillful at using the Anglo world to gain their objectives, from hiring white attorneys in the 1800s to pressuring various branches of government in bringing about some of the development programs of the 1960s and 70s.

While much of the content is not new or surprising to students of Indian policy, Professor Bee offers several conclusions that will be of interest to them. For example, he seems to support those recent works that emphasize the shortcomings of John Collier's Indian New Deal and Indian Reorganization Act (IRA). Bee not only cites familiar problems, such as tribal factionalism and the undermining of traditional political structures, but adds that the Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) did not loosen the reins of authority and never allowed anything close to the goal of a consensual relationship between tribes and the government. He stresses that a simple lack of understanding was responsible for much of the Quechan skepticism of the IRA, and he blames the BIA for presenting the program in a style and in forums very different from traditional Quechan methods of community communication. The impact of the Indian War on Poverty in the 1960s was far greater and long-lasting, largely because of the investment of more federal dollars.

Several portions of this brief work call for more explanation, especially the termination policies of the 1950s, which are not dealt with except for a brief treatment of Relocation. Termination must have been an important concern among the Quechans since several bills were considered in Congress to terminate all California tribes, and the Mission Indian Federation (which Bee notes was a force in reservation politics) was in the forefront of groups agitating for their passage. Nonetheless, this book makes an important contribution, and one can only hope that we see more similar case studies.

AN ETHNOGRAPHY OF SANTA CLARA PUEBLO, NEW MEXICO. By W. W. Hill. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1982. Pp. xxxi, 400. Illus., appendixes, glossary, bibliog., index. \$35.00.

THIS MAJOR WORK on the second largest Tewa pueblo, with emphasis on ceremonial organization and which Hill was assembling in 1972 at the time of his death, records a period during which much change took place at Santa Clara. While its culture has been relatively untouched by the Western European, there have been interesting changes. Inclusion of data from Jean Allard Jeançon's field notes compiled between 1904 and 1930 and scattered but minimal information in late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century studies, along with items from Elsie Clews Parsons' publications, provide information no longer available from informants.

Certain early practices such as hunting and gathering, obtaining salt from the Estancia Valley, use of flint and steel (for fire making) as well as stone axes, manos, and metates, demonstrate changes that have occurred in the last eighty to one hundred years. Warfare to obtain livestock, captives (who were sold), and jewelry began disappearing in the early American Period. The coverage of the life cycle and social organization indicate additional changes in attitudes or functions, such as the shift in the council as an agency of the cacique with emphasis on religious controls to a role more like a legislative and judicial body as a result of the constitution of 1935.

Another aspect of acculturation was the heavy influence of Christianity on religious and secular behavior pertaining to birth, marriage, and death. Factionalism since the late 1700s, brought about by acceptance of some Western European practices, also contributed to change in relationships, particularly between the moieties.

Agriculture, which included cotton and tobacco, was conducted by patrilineal extended families and had village-wide obligations. Seemingly, no religious activity is directly related to farming, which has decreased since the 1940s due to wage and craft work.

Trade, under religious leaders and with associated religious rites, was conducted primarily to obtain ceremonial or luxury items from neighboring pueblos. Formal trade, however, was carried on with Plains tribes and took several months, often combined with traders from other pueblos. Although Hill does not comment on this system of trade, perhaps it represents a survival of an earlier Mexican *pochteca*-like enterprise.

Editor Lange, who wrote the preface, introduction, geographical, and historical sections, does an excellent job in retaining Hill's planned format, though not in separate volumes as originally conceived, indicating that Hill wished to pursue various aspects of the subject matter to a considerable extent. However, Lange introduces occasional comments where pertinent but keeps them to a minimum. This work is an excellent addition to the literature on the Pueblo people even though Hill was not able to carry it as far as he had planned.

SEMANA SANTA IN THE SIERRA TARAHUMARA: A COMPARATIVE STUDY IN THREE COMMUNITIES. By John G. Kennedy and Raúl A. López. Los Angeles: University of California, 1981. Occasional Papers of the Museum of Cultural History, University of California, Los Angeles, no. 4. Pp. 78. Illus., notes, bibliog., appendixes. \$10.00.

IT IS NOT EASY TO RECORD the Holy Week activities in a Tarahumara community. In this monograph, John Kennedy and Raúl López must be commended for their efforts to set down in print the highly complex pageantry occurring with infinite variations during "Semana Santa" throughout Chihuahua's Sierra Madre Occidental.

Selecting three "villages" at different levels of acculturation and Christianization—Sisoguichic, Samachique, and Aboreáchic—they have detailed, as far as the human eye can grasp, the processions, dances, rituals, and gatherings for the drinking of *sugüi*, the native liquor more popularly known as *tesgüino*, that they observed during the pre-Easter period.

The discussion of each community is divided into two parts: organization and events. The division of the participants into two groups, *fariseos* and *soldados*, *fariseos* and *moros*, *judas* and *fariseos*, as the case may be, is explained. While there are many variations in the pattern of the "events," the similarities are equally striking. No two villages are alike, and other communities follow patterns different from any of these three, a fact of which the authors are quite aware. However, their sampling is as representative as could be found anywhere.

An especially interesting part of this small book is the section devoted to interpretations of the ritual. Explanations are hard to come by, and the answer, as stated in the book, is usually "Because that is how we do it." The roots of the ceremonial practices are clearly aboriginal, though superficially the pattern is strongly Catholic. As the authors point out, however, the proportions in the mixture vary locally according to the degree of church influence. They conclude that, for the Tarahumaras, the purpose of these activities may be: 1. To celebrate aboriginal fertility rites, especially in connection with the Judas figure or figures around which a substantial part of the activities are centered. (A special appendix on the carving of the Judas is included.) 2. To allow Indians to assert their individuality, since during Holy Week their Easter sodalities take over authority from the regular government. 3. To enjoy the drinking of *sugüi* and the social gatherings that this entails.

Any deeper meanings that may exist have most likely been forgotten by the Indians themselves. In the same way as we of the "civilized" world celebrate the Christ story and simultaneously fill baskets with Easter eggs and chocolate rabbits—a likely vestige of early pagan rites of spring—so have the Tarahumaras combined earlier traditions with the newer story told them by the missionaries and find no conflict in this. The social gatherings are ritually important and have always been a dominant feature of Tarahumara life, taking place at all festivals. This custom, practiced before the Christians came, is still observed in the re-

maining gentile communities, as Kennedy has described so well in his previous books on these more remote areas.

This monograph is basically an excellent assemblage of very detailed and commented field notes, often requiring close concentration to follow the ins and outs of the proceedings. Although the layman may find the book rather exacting reading, the photographs are helpful and thoroughly illustrate the text. The diagrams of the procession routes are extremely useful. For the reader interested in studying the seldom-described details of Semana Santa in the Sierra Tarahumara, the information in this paper is invaluable. In fact, this is a work that students in the field of Tarahumara culture have long been awaiting.

*Arizona State Museum
University of Arizona*

MADELEINE TURRELL RODACK

SACRED WORDS: A STUDY OF NAVAJO RELIGION AND PRAYER. By Sam D. Gill. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1981. Pp. xxvi, 257. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$29.95.

SACRED WORDS is a structural analysis of Navajo prayer, a study of "prayer acts" based on a structural comparison of some 300 prayer texts. As Gill's term "prayer acts" indicates, he prefers to see these items not as separate texts but as records of actual ritual performances. Nonetheless, most of the material available to him for study was not thought of or collected with this live and dynamic view in mind. These items exist in books, notes, and archives as texts and are usually given without all the rich details of live context, intonation, gesture, ritual acts, and meaning that one would like to see. For this reason, Gill does not pretend that this book is in the fullest sense a study of the meaning of prayer acts.

The constituent elements, or "units," of Navajo prayer texts are given by Gill in a list on page fourteen. Unlike the structural system of Claude Lévi-Strauss, Gill does not here posit a super-organic structure of which these units may be considered parts, nor does he, like Vladimir Propp, put forward only those morphological characteristics that can be described as functions of the *dramatis personae*. Rather, these units are the building blocks of sacred speech events that may or may not use a narrative thread, that may or may not tie in closely with other similar structures, but that always localize the ritual being performed, provide offerings toward its efficacious fulfillment, express a rather specific plea to the sacred spirits whose powers are being engaged for the purpose of curing someone, and that outline the detailed unfolding of a ritual act that must be performed and sung with great precision. Gill's system dissects the articulations that reflect the Navajo belief that reality—especially ritual reality and matters of health—is created, perhaps even imposed on the world, and controlled by a spoken or sung language. As Gill shows, these units do occur in rather predictable order, and this makes them susceptible to structural analysis and discussion. Even though the material that Gill has used has been mostly preserved in written form, he does take up the matter of style in chapter thirteen, "Poetry, Performance,

and Creativity," a brief but provocative essay that suggests the other dimensions that need to be kept in mind when one approaches the architectural particularities of Navajo prayers.

A brief critique of Reichard's analysis of Navajo ritual shows quickly and clearly some of Reichard's errors and indicates some meaningful areas where further scrutiny may reveal richer aspects of form and function. It is characteristic of Gill that this section is written with kindness and a gentle regard for the pioneering work of Gladys Reichard. There is also a critique of Father Berard Haile's materials, a comparison of his work with that of Reichard, and excellent but brief commentaries on the work of Wyman and Kluckhohn on the classification and description of Navajo ceremony. At the end of the book is a finely detailed set of diagrams (twenty-four pages long) of Navajo prayer structure, summarizing in clear form the matters brought up and discussed in the book. A full and up-to-date bibliography is also provided.

If there is a single complaint one may make about this book, it is that it is too brief. Gill is a good writer, and his discussions are direct, informative and informed, and reliable. One finishes each chapter with a wish that there could have been more discussion, especially with regard to modern prayer performances among the Navajos. Even so, as it stands, it is the most clear and reliable single book on Navajo prayers published to date.

University of Oregon

BARRE TOELKEN

THE CHASES OF CIMARRON: BIRTH OF THE CATTLE INDUSTRY IN CIMARRON, 1867-1900. By Ruth W. Armstrong. Albuquerque: New Mexico Stockman, 1981. Pp. ix, 181. Illus., index. \$9.30.

MANLY M. CHASE with his wife, Theresa, pulled a wagon loaded with clothing, household goods, and family keepsakes onto the Maxwell land grant of north-eastern New Mexico in 1867. After negotiating the purchase of range land from Lucien Maxwell on the Vermejo River, Chase commenced a long and eventful career in the burgeoning cattle industry of the territory of New Mexico.

In *The Chases of Cimarron*, travel writer Ruth Armstrong recounts Chase's struggles, successes, and failures as he expanded his cattle ventures throughout the territory. At one time during the 1880s, Chase was either stockholder or officer in seven large New Mexico cattle companies' outfits that encompassed more than one million acres of land spread over four counties. He pioneered several innovative management techniques in directing these large outfits, many of which other large operators in the territory adopted.

Drawing from Chase's meticulous business and personal records, interviews with existing relatives, and period newspapers, Armstrong relates the Chase story in a popular narrative interlaced with fabricated dialogue. Dialogue gave her the opportunity, as she states in the preface, to make her characters "become real people to the reader," as they did to her.

Still, *The Chases of Cimarron* suffers from a lack of documentation. Aside from

reviewing her sources in the preface, the author compiled no formal bibliography. She failed to footnote her chapters. These regrettable omissions leave the book of nominal value to the researcher.

In addition, there are a number of annoying inaccuracies throughout the book. The author states that Maxwell's father-in-law was granted land in the northeastern part of the province of New Mexico in 1843. From a brief look at several competent secondary works, she could have easily discovered the correct date of January 1841. She also repeatedly misspells the last word of the Jicarilla Apache chief as Juan Brailla, instead of the correct Barilla or Barela.

That Armstrong has not participated in many cattle brandings is evidenced by her brief paragraph on the subject (p. 78). A man on horseback who ropes calves and drags them to a branding fire is a "roper" or "calf dragger," not a "flanker." The flankers throw and hold down calves once they have been dragged to the fire so that they may be branded, earmarked, and castrated. Furthermore, a flanker best not grab a calf's leg to throw him as the author suggests, for that is an excellent way to get kicked!

Nonetheless, *The Chases of Cimarron* is a significant contribution to the rather sparse literature devoted to New Mexico's cattle frontier. The author was able to capture a sense of life as it was on the plains and mountains of New Mexico during the latter part of the nineteenth century, and for that her book serves a useful purpose.

Philmont Scout Ranch

STEPHEN ZIMMER

AMERICAN FARMERS: THE NEW MINORITY. By Gilbert C. Fite. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1981. Pp. ix, 265. Illus., notes, index. \$19.50.

IN AN ERA DURING WHICH scholars of the urban experience have all but dominated the writing of United States history, it is salutary to have available a solid and readable account of American farmers whose contributions to domestic and world economies have been so crucial. Although the author declares that his account of American agriculture since 1920 was written for the general reader and not for specialists, his analysis in fact informs the understanding of all scholars and students of twentieth-century history. Gilbert Fite, born and reared on a South Dakota farm, for many years a professor of agricultural history on the southern plains and more recently at the University of Georgia, manifests a knowledge of and respect for family farmers that is rooted in first-hand experience and life-long observation and study. Aware of the persisting authority of agricultural fundamentalism in the shaping of ideals and programs, his sympathetic narrative analysis has nothing of romance or special pleading in it. Even with the application of science and technology, which greatly lightened the human burden, farming continued to entail drudgery, monotony, and high risk.

Important chapters detail the story of farm politics and government policy—the long battle for parity, the shifting of legislative strategies from marketing to controlled production and credit programs, rural electrification, and the man-

agement of surpluses—and set forth the steady decline in rural influence rooted in the simple demographic facts that by 1980 farmers made up only 3 percent of the total population, and that only a handful of Congressmen numbered as many as a quarter of their constituents as agricultural producers. But Fite's account dwells at greater length, as it rightly should, on the emergence (at an accelerated pace since World War II) of a farm economy capital- and energy-intensive, involving constant technological innovation, and demanding highly sophisticated managerial skills. The introduction of specialized and expensive machines, development of hybrid seeds, the extensive application of chemicals (fertilizers, pesticides, and herbicides), the expanded use of commercial feeds—these constituted the basic dynamic forces that transformed the countryside. Economic necessity—"the almost constant cost-price squeeze on farmers"—dictated a steady growth in size of farm operation until by "1978 only 200,000 farmers produced some two-thirds of all agricultural products; [and] a mere 50,000 of the largest operators received about 35 percent of the total cash receipts from farming" (p. 240). For generations as much a commercial enterprise as a way of life, farming became "a large and serious business"; and the traditional ideal of the family farm had to find its chief celebrants "among those who did not have to make a living on the farm" (pp. 240, 238).

American Farmers carries an authority arising naturally from a lifetime of earnest scholarship. Laced with significant statistical data, the book depicts clearly the forest and the trees (or perhaps one would write the field and the ears of corn). One hopes that Fite's findings and balanced judgments will find their way into the understanding of professional historians, eager students, and concerned citizens.

University of Minnesota

CLARKE A. CHAMBERS

SPANISH CITY PLANNING IN NORTH AMERICA. By Dora P. Crouch, Daniel J. Garr, and Axel I. Mundigo. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1982. Pp. xxii, 298. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$35.00.

SPANISH CITY PLANNING IN NORTH AMERICA considers the New World as the purest area for studying the Renaissance city in its most fully developed form. Although the product of three authors with related urban specialties, the book emerges more like a collection of separate essays than as an integrated whole. Indeed, some of the chapters have previously been published in separate journals of history and city planning and therefore seem almost to stand alone in their content. After a general overview and discussion of city planning ordinances as an embodiment of Renaissance urban thought, the authors turn to specific laws of the Indies representing Hispanic traditions. The planning and history of Santa Fe, St. Louis, and Los Angeles are studied in detail, although the impact of their common heritage—simplicity of form and complexity of social structure—is not well defined.

The theme of the work is commonality and the tenacity of Renaissance forms

within the Hispanic World. The three chosen cities embody the idea that "like the colonial cities of the Roman Empire, those of the Spanish Empire were conceived and executed as propaganda vehicles, symbolizing and incarnating civilization" (p. xx). Nevertheless, the specific events of history, which are duly chronicled, are so different among the three that the parallels are limited. The fact that all three followed similar laws for town founding taken from the Laws of the Indies is only a minor aspect of their urban progress in comparison to the diverse events of their founding and development. Each separate story is, however, complete and well illustrated with early views, plans, and maps.

Author Daniel Garr does an excellent job showing how other cities in California had difficulties developing in the traditional manner. For example, there were no provisions for towns arising out of presidios as at Monterey and San Diego. Even though the founders of Los Angeles followed the basic ordinances of the Laws of the Indies for town founding, the lack of available civilian settlers prevented its remaining a transmitter of Renaissance urban principles.

The laws governing the founding of civilian settlements are based upon a series of 148 ordinances issued by Philip II in 1573 and are fairly well known to most scholars of Hispanic American history. A group of them (reprinted from Zelia Nuttall's translation) have been included in a basic text of readings edited for students by Lewis Hanke, so a reference to their appearance in "an obscure periodical" (the *Hispanic American Historical Review*) as "the only access to them for English language readers" makes them seem more mysterious than they really are. The authors point out that the Nuttall translation is inadequate and incomplete, so Axel Mundigo, with the help of Dora Crouch, has offered a new translation with thirty additional ordinances. These are followed by an extensive commentary. The authors use a manuscript copy published in Mexico's *Boletín del Archivo General de la Nación* (May-June 1935).

The book is attractively printed with abundant illustrations. The bibliography, endnotes, and index are very helpful. City planners, as well as historians, will find the book useful—especially since the many evidences of environmental protection and long-range planning offer an interesting antidote to modern-day critics of urban congestion.

University of San Diego

IRIS H. W. ENGSTRAND

OVER THE CHIHUAHUA AND SANTA FE TRAILS, 1847-1848; GEORGE RUTLEDGE GIBSON'S JOURNAL. Edited and annotated by Robert W. Frazer. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press with the Historical Society of New Mexico, 1981. Pp. xii, 111. Illus., notes, bibliog. \$7.95 paper.

THIS BOOK IS THE FIRST in a projected series on neglected aspects of New Mexico history to be published through a joint-venture arrangement by the Historical Society of New Mexico and the University of New Mexico Press. The selection

of George Rutledge Gibson's Chihuahua and Santa Fe Trails journals is a fortunate beginning. The little volume is a gem of trail lore and meticulous editing.

At the outbreak of the Mexican War in 1846, Gibson volunteered to march in Stephen Watts Kearny's Army of the West from Missouri to Santa Fe. Following three months of respite and boredom in the New Mexico capital, Gibson accompanied Col. Alexander Doniphan to Chihuahua. Gibson's account of his experiences from Missouri to Chihuahua were published in 1935 in Ralph P. Bieber, ed., *Journal of a Soldier Under Kearny and Doniphan, 1846-1847* (Glendale: Arthur H. Clark Company). The present publication of Gibson's journal of his return from Chihuahua to Missouri completes this important first-hand view of the Mexican War and travel between Chihuahua and Missouri by way of Santa Fe.

The book's value is twofold. The publication of the journal will be welcomed by the writers and readers of history, the one for research purposes, and the other for the tangy juice of history that is the delight of the zealots who have discovered these elements from which history is written. This reviewer is not among those who groan at the publication of yet another travel journal. The more the better, I say.

The second contribution of the book is in Robert W. Frazer's careful editing. Through diligent research, he is able to describe Gibson's year in Santa Fe, which interrupted his trip homeward from Chihuahua. This task was difficult because Gibson kept no journal during the year, believing that anything worth knowing could be found in the *Santa Fe Republican*. Indeed, Gibson edited this first American newspaper published in New Mexico. Frazer identifies most of the people Gibson mentions in the course of his travels—and apologizes for his failure to identify all of them—thus adding to the book's interest and its use as a research tool.

Gibson's journal entries for the most part are straightforward and factual, as one might expect from the pen of one who is pausing just for a moment between hard labor and sleep. He was no poet, but he sometimes wrote with feeling, as during a pleasant evening on the plains when he and his companions were "smoking and reposing on the ground, as the sun shed his silvery and mild light over us and then dropped in the western Horizon" (p. 73).

Like many of his military contemporaries, Gibson spent few kinds words on Mexicans. His attitudes, including prejudice, are illustrated by a visit with a Mexican acquaintance near El Paso. Gibson comments on their friendship, but adds that "like all Mexicans he is tricky and I watched him closely without being able to discover anything" (p. 21).

Inevitably, one looking for mistakes will find them. Kearny left Fort Leavenworth a colonel, not a general (p. 41, n. 2). He did not receive the happy news of his promotion until the commission reached him near Las Vegas. A bit more serious is the error on the Chihuahua-Santa Fe map. Gibson did not travel the southern part of the Jornada del Muerto between Robledo and Aleman. His party instead continued along the course of the Rio Grande beyond Robledo to San

Diego before turning northward to begin the dreaded Jornada. There is little else to fault here, in the editing or in the printing.

The book is readable and useful. It is a worthy announcement by Society and Press for their new series.

San Joaquin Delta College

HARLAN HAGUE

REFORMA MEXICO AND THE UNITED STATES: A SEARCH FOR ALTERNATIVES TO ANNEXATION, 1854-1861. By Donathon C. Olliff. University: The University of Alabama Press, 1981. Pp. viii, 213. Notes, bibliog., index. \$21.50.

THIS PROVOCATIVE TITLE PROVIDES a good study of relations between Mexico and the United States during a period of agonizing transition running from expansionism to the beginnings of North American economic imperialism. Researching this period was not an easy task, as the internal politics of the two countries were complicated to say the least; the neighbor to the south was preparing for civil war, and the northern one's forces were massing for similar reasons. Until now we have had studies, done with unilateral sources, and in the case of Mexican historiography, partisan ones. The conservatives claimed to have fought "to preserve the country's sovereignty" and the liberals to have saved Mexico from greater evils. Donathon Olliff's book is based on impeccable research. He is well acquainted with the historical backgrounds of the two countries, and frequently he has consulted the pertinent archives of both nations and has managed to overcome that slightly contemptuous tone of voice that the majority of North American diplomatic historians have when dealing with the past of a weak neighbor. The book can be read with ease, although at times it commits, as many works of diplomatic history do, the small sin of falling into excessive detail. However, he does give a clear picture of the unfortunate course of Mexican diplomacy during the frustrated American expansionism of the 1850s.

The book will oblige readers to make adjustments and corrections in their opinions, as a good history book should. Minister Gadsden turns out to be less sinister and opportunistic; he seems simply the typical liberal expansionist who plays North America's trump card in favor of a "Puro" victory, in recognizing Álvarez's government while still in Cuernavaca. Comonfort also turns out to be a stronger man than expected, when at a crucial moment he accepts Miguel Lerdo's resignation and avoids the establishment of a North American economic protectorate over Mexico.

The book allows the reader to follow the process of North America's evaporating hopes to obtain more land and how, instead, two ideas begin to surface in its diplomacy: one, of establishing a protectorate that would permit the unlimited exploitations of Mexican natural resources; the other, the introduction of economic imperialism in Mexico, through investments and commerce. Minister Forsyth, who took Gadsden's place, seems to have been the precursor of the economic diplomacy, although he worked also on the possibility of a protectorate. His influence was considerable because of his friendship with Miguel Lerdo, who

appeared convinced that if a liberal Mexico was to survive, it would need some form of North American protection. Olliff demonstrates how this belief seems to have been shared by all liberals, for even the moderate Comonfort ended up accepting the Montes-Forsyth treaties in order to obtain U.S. financial support.

The story is long and complicated, but two things stand out. The first is that Mexico continued to escape worse evils, thanks to fortuitous circumstances, such as changes in the United States administration or the sectional vote in the Senate. Second, that Mexican liberals, admirers of the United States, came to be resigned, because of their financial straits, to giving up something in return for the support. In this light, Olliff's conclusion that the McLane-Ocampo treaties were a victory for Mexican diplomacy appears to be correct, since, in the end, such a rabid expansionist as President Buchanan accepted a delay in "territorial transfer until the Juárez government had been strengthened." I am not convinced, however, about his idea that the word "alliance" is simply a synonym for protectorate. Olliff believes that the Mexican "Puros" were defending republicanism and democracy and the majority believed that "these benefits could best be secured by establishing Mexico as an economic protectorate of the United States." He goes on to affirm that each time a treaty was proposed envisioning some form of protectorate, from the time of Comonfort to Juárez, no "significant public outcry against the treaties" was made. The author forgets how small the nucleus of public opinion was in a country of illiterates, with poor communications, and in the throes of civil war; he also ignores the outraged cries of the conservatives, both then and now. I have the impression that the "puro" concept of alliance was less unequal than that of protectorate that Americans advocated, and that the majority of liberals accepted any cession, simply as an inescapable lesser evil. Olliff's book, in spite of these minor flaws, is an important contribution to the study and revision of a crucial period of Mexican history.

El Colegio de México

JOSEFINA ZORAIDA VÁZQUEZ

DICTIONARY OF MEXICAN AMERICAN HISTORY. By Matt S. Meier and Feliciano Rivera. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1981. Pp. xiii, 498. Illus., bibliog., appendixes, index. \$35.00.

IN THE LAST TWO OR THREE YEARS, a spate of reference material has appeared in the field of Chicano Studies. The growth of this literature attests to a couple of things: first, the maturation of Chicano scholars who were in the schools just a few years back; and secondly, the extent of works published by those students and now in need of indexing. The *Dictionary of Mexican American History* reflects this mounting sophistication in Mexican American studies.

The *Dictionary* is modeled after other existing resource texts aiming at convenient categorization of specific subjects, for example *The Handbook of Texas* (3 vols.). The guide defines the term "history" broadly so that it incorporates wide and diverse aspects of the Chicano experience. In its periodization, it is in accord with the consensus of Mexican Americanists—that the history of Texas-Mexicans

starts with the Texas Revolution of 1836, and with the Mexican War of 1846-48 for the rest in the United States Southwest. Thus, most of the items extend back only to 1836, though some do reach back to 1519 when Spaniards begin to intermix with Indians. These discussions are limited to major personalities involved in exploration and the like, however, and are few in number.

Entries are arranged in alphabetical order, and asterisks in many entries refer the reader to related items. Given its definition, the *Dictionary* is not solely a collection of biographical sketches. Instead, the listings include in-group terms like "agabachado" and "agringado," broad concepts like "agricultural labor" and "regional origins in Mexican immigration," and Anglo-American men of fame like Zebulon Pike and John C. Fremont who are only peripherally connected to Mexican American history.

A work of this magnitude is bound to have weaknesses, and a few stand out here. Subjects receive uneven coverage and vary in quality. This perhaps because as many as thirty contributors were involved in the task of assisting the authors. José T. Canales of Texas, thus, receives only four lines while other relatively obscure figures get many more. Alonso Perales, the eminent Tejano lawyer and activist of the 1920s through the 1950s, is not even listed. Further weakening the guide is its paucity of new materials. Most of what is included is already familiar to historians. Closely related to this is the lack of revisionist insights in some of the entries. "Curanderismo" comes readily to mind.

These criticisms, however, do not detract from the overall quality of the *Dictionary*. We have here a handy compilation of items similar to the ones scholars in other fields have long had at their disposal. The novice will learn much, for it is written for students as well as specialists. Suggested readings that follow some of the entries and seven appendixes, comprised in part of a bibliography, a chronology of Mexican American history, a glossary of Chicano terms, and several maps, are assets. Everyone interested in the study of Chicanos will be interested in this significant work.

Angelo State University

ARNOLDO DE LEÓN

THE TEJANO COMMUNITY, 1836-1900. By Arnolde De León, with a contribution by Kenneth L. Stewart. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1982. Pp. xix, 277. Illus., appendix, notes, bibliog., index. \$19.95.

AS ONCE DID THE WORKS OF Nava, Acuña and Servin, De León's *The Tejano Community, 1836-1900* should remain on the best seller list for a very long time. Accompanied by Stewart's impressive statistics, the volume serves to fill an informational gap touching the lives of 20 percent of the state's citizens, a vacuum that Texas historians were either unwilling or unequipped to investigate. De León, however, differs substantially from the writings of other Chicano historians. First, his volume excels with an extended list of primary resource materials seldom approximated by historians investigating Mexican Americans in Texas particularly during the second half of the nineteenth century. Secondly, the author, discards

the approach that projects Tejanos as impassive objects of exploitation. Tejanos of the nineteenth century were not bowling pins positioned in the corridors of time. They were active agents in creating a world for themselves in an era before Texas moved from an agrarian economy into an industrial and urban one. The author underscores the traditional farming skills and the often maligned industry of Tejanos by compelling the reader to understand the word, *obrero*—namely a term describing the working man. Excellence in the cattle economy handed down from Tejano-father to Tejano-son over generations provides historical primacy to their time-tested skills implemented in ranching and wins for these vaqueros a role as mentors of the contemporary cowboy.

Tejanos in urban areas were notably successful in the transportation industry, particularly as teamsters, and virtually monopolized the freighting business during the antebellum period. When railroads displaced oxen and mule carts, Tejano urban obreros joined railroad section crews on the Texas and Mexican Railroad and made significant contributions in uniting the nation. In Texas cities, where the Anglo community administered the economy, a large percentage of Tejanos were managed as skilled artisans, manual labors, domestics, and servants. However, De León also notes that many Tejanos residing in south Texas and particularly in Bexar County were successful physicians, lawyers, newspaper editors, printers, teachers, prominent merchants, and proprietors. Street vendors—albeit ministering mostly to their communities—also were real entrepreneurs in transporting cords of wood, barrels of water, and in serving as merchants of consumable products.

In characterizing Indo-Hispanic Catholicism, De León correctly portrays Tejano adherence to the basic tenets of Catholicism, reception of the sacraments, and celebration of religious feast days. The author properly notes the dearth in the number and, at times, quality of clergy on the Texas frontier and the impact that this lack had upon the Tejano Catholic community. The struggle to practice their faith during the harsh years of the 1800s, however, hardly merits for Tejanos the dubious title of nominal Catholics. The term is far too sociological. The phenomena of religious belief within the Tejano community are founded on theological and eschatological reverence for the supernatural. They were not meant to be quantified nor easily dismissed by the secular disciplines or Stoddard, Carrillo, and Gebler. Tejanos traditionally have venerated and honored the Virgin of Guadalupe and other saints. Attributing to them forms of adoration for the saints is to fail to understand the religious orthodoxy of the Tejano Catholic community. De León's detailed account depicts the strong religious tradition of Tejanos who inherited a deep faith from their Indian ancestors and an intense Catholicism from their Spanish forefathers. The pounding given to the "institutional church," though never indicating what or who it is, reflects less historical judgment and suggests more a preponderant behavioral theory. Historically, Latin Catholics consistently have enjoyed a penchant for life, practicing their faith neither with Celtic rigorism nor with Bible-belt fundamentalism. Tejano Catholics have been an integral part of the landscape for centuries. They are an embodiment of their religious values; they are in essence the church.

The volume should be acknowledged for its historical descriptions of what characterized Tejano culture in the nineteenth century. It should be commended for the myriad data expertly organized into a historical narrative. The accumulation of facts resembling the likes of an A. H. Bello *Texas Almanac* and the author's popular writing style provide the reader with an absorbing account of Tejanos. They are depicted as a people with respect for their cultural heritage and with flexibility to assimilate contemporary realities consistent with their ethnic-social structure. The study reflects the author's wealth of experience about his people and homeland; it is De León the historian at his best.

San Antonio Missions National Historical Park

GILBERT R. CRUZ

MEXICAN RESISTANCE IN THE SOUTHWEST: "THE SACRED RIGHT OF SELF-PRESERVATION." By Robert J. Rosenbaum. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981. Pp. xii, 241. Illus., bibliog., index, appendixes. \$14.95.

THIS PERCEPTIVE AND INTERESTING study of the confrontation between *mexicanos* and *americanos* in the Southwest covers the years 1848–1916 and is written from the standpoint of the conquered. Using a variety of sources that range from archival material to folklore and field interviews, Robert J. Rosenbaum's carefully documented history of *mexicano* resistance to the American conquest and domination emphasizes "what the conquest meant for the conquered, what acquisition meant for the acquired" (p. 4).

The book examines individual and community resistance in Texas, California, and New Mexico, but the greatest attention is given to the history of Hispano-Anglo relations in the "heart of the borderlands." Individual and community resistance movements assessed or reassessed include border disputes like the Cortina episode and the revolutionary plot of San Diego, Texas; leaders of outlaw bands like the legendary Joaquín Murieta and the historically real Tiburcio Vásquez; victims of "lawless law" like the border hero Gregorio Cortez; the Los Angeles "race war" of 1856; the Maxwell Land Grant conflict; competition between Texas cattlemen and *mexicano* sheepmen in Lincoln County; the White Caps of San Miguel county; and the attempt by El Partido del Pueblo Unido "to forge a political movement to protect and enhance the position of all *mexicanos* living under the Anglo American regime" (p. 141).

The author makes good use of the literature that interprets culture, peasants, and political violence in assessing his evidence; the result is an intellectually stimulating book rich in insights that explain why brushfire conflicts dotted the nineteenth-century landscape of the Southwest. Topics treated include a discussion of Anglo-American perceptions of the U.S. conquest and the involuntary citizens that came with the land; cultural, political, and economic differences that provoked hostility and friction; tactics used by the conquered in response to Anglo-American attitudes and institutions; and the types of violence employed by the Spanish-speaking to preserve their way of life.

The most valuable contribution of this study is its conceptual analysis of what

Carey McWilliams originally called correlated "major events in a pattern of conflict which has prevailed from Brownsville to Los Angeles since 1846." In addition, by effectively refuting the Anglo-American version of a speedy conquest accepted by a passive, backward people who would eventually benefit by the change, Rosenbaum confirms McWilliams's idea that "the Mexican-American War was merely an incident which arose some years before and survived long after the treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo."

Further research may qualify some of the interpretations offered in this book. For instance, Rosenbaum by following Harvey Fergusson conveys the impression that from the eighteenth century two major classes existed in New Mexico: *ricos* and *pobres*. The wealthy minority lived in the Rio Abajo area. "Here the great homes of the *ricos* were only a few miles apart; here lived the elite who looked for greater opportunities" (p. 24). Did these "great houses" actually exist, and were the *ricos* of the nineteenth century descendants of the "right people" of the eighteenth century? Other statements might be questioned. Nonetheless, this is an important, concise, intelligent work that gives perspective to twentieth-century developments in the Southwest.

University of Nebraska, Lincoln

RALPH H. VIGIL

REVOLTOSOS: MEXICO'S REBELS IN THE UNITED STATES, 1903-1923. By W. Dirk Raat. Texas A&M University Press, 1981. Pp. xviii, 344. Illus., bibliographical essay, select directory of published materials cited, index. \$22.50.

THIS IS A STUDY, as the title indicates, of Mexican political rebels in the United States between the Immigration Act of 1903 and the early 1920s, when the country was afflicted with Red Scares. The *revoltosos* (Raat's term) were various, often dissimilar, groups of Mexicans in political exile. Professor Raat writes: "The one characteristic they shared was a hostility to the established Mexican government and a desire to use the United States as a revolutionary (or counterrevolutionary) base."

Within Mexico, the limited modernization that resulted from the economic policies of the Díaz regime, produced and mobilized social groups. The most active in the pre-1911 period was the PLM (*Partido Liberal Mexicano*), those who adhered to the ideas of the Flores-Magón brothers, especially Ricardo. The author writes:

It is obvious that the intent of the Partido Liberal was to overthrow Díaz and usher in a democratic and popular system of government. Private property was to be preserved, but the excesses of capital were to be curbed. Class cooperation, rather than class warfare, was stressed. The middle-class aspirations of the working classes were to be realized, capital would be restrained but not abolished, and a democratic, progressive, popular welfarist state would replace the old order.

Professor Raat correctly and properly notes that these were not the precursors of the 1910 Revolution, but "*were* the Revolution of 1910."

Presidents Roosevelt, Taft, and Wilson saw the developmental role of United States capitalists as something akin to a moral responsibility. By 1914 there was large United States investment in the border states (more than \$580 million U.S.) much of which was invested in the border states. Some of these United States capitalists, the author notes, "held extensive properties on both sides of the American-Mexican border. These individuals cooperated with the United States government in a common struggle with the *revoltosos* . . ." These men were as interested in the Mexican government's fight against the revolutionaries in Mexico as they were in the U.S. government's war with the radicals at home.

Author Raat sets on a collision course these forces of industry and the forces of labor leading to the Cananea Strike of 1906, the catalyst of the Revolution. On the U.S. side of the border, the *revoltosos*, or *floresmagonistas*, or PLM, were aided by socialists and others supportive of the labor movement like Samuel Compers, and the I.W.W., at least until the rise of the Madero revolution. At the same time these Mexicans in exile incurred the wrath of the enemies of labor, the strike breakers and capitalists, and their political clout. In exile in Laredo and San Antonio, Texas, St. Louis, Toronto, and Montreal, and finally Los Angeles, the *floresmagonistas* continued to publish their anti-Díaz newspapers and feel the brunt of suppression by the Mexican and United States secret service.

The country, reacting to presidential assassinations and other stimuli, developed extreme antiforeign sentiment. One cannot read Professor Raat's book without being impressed with the illegal United States government suppression of civil liberties of individuals in the United States, who acted within the law, actions that have only recently come to light through the Freedom of Information Act and the scholarly efforts of Professor Dirk Raat.

A word on sources is necessary: the author has prepared a bibliographical essay describing the bibliographical aids, guides, archives, manuscript collections, published documents, newspapers, and pictorial sources used in researching this book. Also there is an excellent bibliography or "selected directory of published manuscripts cited," as the author has labeled it.

The research and the conclusions reached in the book are sound. It is highly recommended for anyone interested in borderlands history, especially borderlands social and labor history.

New Mexico Highlands

GUILLERMO LUX

THE SECRET WAR IN MEXICO: EUROPE, THE UNITED STATES AND THE MEXICAN REVOLUTION. By Friedrich Katz. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981. Pp. xii, 659. Notes, archival sources, index. \$30.00.

THIS BOOK IS AN AMBITIOUS attempt to link the internal dynamics of the Mexican Revolution with the objectives of the leading foreign powers in Mexico. Although the United States had already used the strategy in Cuba to establish its hegemony

in the area, Friedrich Katz views the Mexican Revolution as the first major case example where the European powers sought to exploit social conflicts and anti-colonial struggles against their rivals. To this end, the various powers employed classical nineteenth-century tactics (military intervention) as well as "modern" devices (destabilization of regimes) in Mexico between 1910 and 1920.

That is the essence of the "secret war" in Mexico. But the story, as told by Professor Katz, is far more complicated. In each of the major powers, Mexican policy was the subject of much debate and conflict with the bureaucracy, between different ministries, among special interest groups, and between them and their governments. Moreover, the various factions in Mexico learned very quickly to exploit the foreign rivalries for their own ends. The "core" of this able study is therefore an evaluation of the "influence of external pressures on the programs and policies of Mexico's revolution."

While Professor Katz examines the activities of all of the major powers, he devotes special attention to Germany. This is partly due to the fact that *The Secret War in Mexico* is a revision and expansion of his previous work *Deutschland, Díaz und die mexickanische Revolution*. It also reflects Katz's contention that Germany's role has been minimized and misunderstood. Katz therefore provides extended and illuminating discussion of Germany's changing relationship with Huerta, Minister Paul von Hintze's outlook and initiatives, the Zimmerman Telegram, the Japan "card," the infiltration of German agents in the Carranza regime and the plans and hopes for postwar German influence in Mexico.

While Berlin had some success in orienting Carranza toward Germany, its overall policy failed because of bungling, lack of realism and wartime impotence. In spite of London's spectacular success with the Zimmerman Telegram, British policy also displayed a lack of realism. The United States committed errors, but its analysis of Mexican developments and the German threat was basically sound. Indeed, Washington's success in preventing applications of the clauses of the constitution of 1917 and in keeping Mexico "quiet" during the war, the actual moderation of the Mexican revolution, and America's enhanced strength after the war enabled the United States to influence the course of the revolution and to enjoy by 1920 greater economic predominance than ever before.

However, in a certain sense, Mexico emerged as the real victor. The European war helped by diverting American attention and discouraging intervention. But Carranza, who was far from naive, also deserves much credit. His stubbornness, conservatism (he never intended to implement a program of radical reform), and his manipulation of the foreign powers preserved Mexican independence and integrity. Above all, powerful Mexican nationalism, recognized, accepted, and utilized by virtually all of the revolutionary leaders, held the foreign powers at bay.

This is a big book, and scholars will surely take issue with many of its points. Among them are the emphasis on Germany at the expense of the United States, Katz's interpretations of the revolutionary leaders, Wilson's motivations and the influence of the war on American restraint. A map of Mexico, indicating the various states, is also sorely needed. But Professor Katz's scholarship is impressive, his

presentation is readable, and his thesis stimulating. Scholars in the field will have to consult this work.

University of New Mexico

NOEL PUGACH

ON THE BORDER: PORTRAITS OF AMERICA'S SOUTHWESTERN FRONTIER. By Tom Miller. New York: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1981. Pp. xiii, 226. Maps, bibliog., index. \$12.95.

IN MORE THAN 400 CROSSINGS of the 2000-mile border between the United States and Mexico, Tom Miller drank a lot of beer and collected many bizarre stories in taverns, government offices, farms, bordellos, and barrios. What evolved from his exodus from Brownsville to Tijuana is an amusing and often poignant portrait of life peculiar to a strip of land, far removed from established seats of government, where the cultures of poverty and abundance meet.

Everywhere Miller traveled he encountered persons of all walks of life, who, in efforts to get rich, find adventure, or simply survive, have become involved in the petty or major graft and corruption that characterize the border. Tales of smuggling by foot, air, and water are endless, with drugs only one form of contraband. Mexican dealers buy television sets in quantity at "special prices" in the United States for convoy in sealed boxcars to Mexico for resale. "Coyotes" are available to meet new arrivals from the Mexican interior, sneak them through the international fence, and direct them to the bean fields of Texas or the barrios of Los Angeles. "Parrot Troopers" float illegal birds across the Rio Grande to the U.S. on inner tubes.

Miller describes the Kickapoo Indians who live in a squalid shacktown under the international bridge at Eagle Pass, Texas. According to a treaty made with Andrew Jackson in 1832, they have free access to the United States at all times. A chapter is devoted to the "Borderblasters," a sleazy assortment of con artists who, beginning in the depression years of the 1930s, flocked to Del Rio, Texas. On the Mexican side of the international line they found access to radio equipment so powerful that their spiels promoting everything from goat glands to autographed pictures of Jesus reached all parts of the United States. The most legendary of the Del Rio shucksters was Bob Smith, better known to his countless teenage fans as "Wolf Man Jack," the world's premier promoter of rock and roll.

An unpleasant taint of racism is evident in many of Miller's stories, like the one about the border patrol agent who shot an illegal alien by mistake—twice. He also recounts vividly the infamous Hannigan case in which a southern Arizona rancher and his sons were brought to trial for hog tying and torturing three Mexican aliens.

Miller develops such material to show that the international strip is a "third country with its own identity." He succeeds in this objective. *On The Border* is not only a delight to read; it humanly portrays the culture of survival along the line where the United States meets its enigmatic neighbor to the south.

University of Texas at Arlington

CHARLES C. COLLEY