

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 91 | Number 3

Article 7

7-1-2016

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 91, 3 (2016). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol91/iss3/7>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews



Moquis and Kastilam: Hopis, Spaniards, and the Trauma of History, Volume 1, 1540–1679. Edited by Thomas E. Sheridan, Stewart B. Koyiyumptewa, Anton Daughters, Dale S. Brenneman, T. J. Ferguson, Leigh Kuwanwisiwma, and Lee Wayne Lomayestewa. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2015. xi + 346 pp. Halftones, maps, appendix, notes, glossary, references, index. \$65.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-3184-4.)

Narrating conquest and colonization in the Southwest, we routinely apologize for the absence of Native American voices. Here at last, thanks to an innovative collaboration between the Arizona State Museum's Office of Ethnohistorical Research (OER) and the Hopi Tribe, Hopi voices are heard (Appendix 1 acknowledges seven Hopi elders and thirty-two other Hopi consultants).

The Hopi History Project, begun in 2000, seeks to heal the lingering wounds of Spanish occupation by putting "Hopi oral traditions about the Kastilam in dialogue with Spanish documents about the Moquis" (p. 13). This first volume sets up the dialogue through 1679. A second volume will resume amid the fury of the Pueblo Revolt and the grim destruction of Hopi Awat'ovi by fellow Hopis, then fade to the arms-length dance of Hopis and Spaniards throughout the eighteenth century.

The Documentary Relations of the Southwest (DRSW), inaugurated in 1975 by the visionary Charles W. Polzer, S.J., has collected, transcribed, analyzed, and translated thousands of documents; compiled invaluable computerized finding aids; and published half a dozen acclaimed documentary editions. This volume, however, is different. Not only does it directly incorporate Native American

voices, but it also sets aside the previous policy of “free translation” and modernized transcriptions (the latter are now available “unmodernized” on the OER website).

Agreeing that “the past is another country,” Sheridan and his editorial team supply a more conservative translation (p. 17). Then, to enable a twenty-first-century reader to better understand the country of seventeenth-century writers, they provide such a wealth of supplementary anthropological, environmental, linguistic, and historical material that their introductions and notes rival the documents in importance.

Hopis today recall that before the Spanish conquest they enjoyed isolation and peace (which often go together). Fulfillment in life was founded upon respect, humility, hard work, and prayer, which simultaneously assured rain. But the missionaries’ suppression of their katsina religion “rent the very fabric of Pueblo life” (p. 234). Hopis learned abusive practices from the Spaniards, corrupting the Hopi way and causing anger, sadness, depression, and guilt, mostly repressed. By bringing these stories to the fore, Hopis hope to heal rather than pass on such feelings to the next generation.

The editors recognize that surviving Spanish documents dealing specifically with Hopis are skimpy and prone to discord and violence. In their introduction to Part II, “Abusive Guests: Missionaries and Encomenderos among the Hopis, 1625–1680,” as if speaking for the Hopis, they reprise a statement by ethnohistorians Bernard L. Fontana and Daniel S. Matson, which reads in part: “Simply to ‘spread news of great joy’ is one matter; to invade the most sacred inner precincts of another man’s being, and thereby to defile him, is something else again. It seems to us there can be no greater form of violence than this” (pp. 121–22).

Colonization is nasty. But is it too much to imagine a kindly Franciscan raised on a pig farm in Spain, a dispossessed second son who has crossed an ocean bearing in the most sacred inner precincts of his soul the priceless gift of eternal life to share, to the point of death, with others who without it will surely endure unspeakable violence for all eternity? We hear repeatedly from Hopi sources of missionaries sending Hopi husbands to distant springs for water while they violate Hopi wives, but nothing of consensual sex, that odd Spaniard carrying water to a Hopi grandmother’s field, or the sleep-deprived Franciscan at pains to save the life of a Hopi child with measles.

Hopi voices, it would appear, are just as biased as Spanish voices. In dialogue, they make us less certain of what we thought we knew. At the same time, *Moquis and Kastiilam* lifts mere documentary editing to a new level—docuarcheological editing. From the grave, I hear Charlie Polzer, creator of the DRSW forty years ago, shouting “Bravo!” “¡Viva!” “Kwakwhay, Pantani!”

John L. Kessell

University of New Mexico

Hoe, Heaven, and Hell: My Boyhood in Rural New Mexico. By Nasario García. Foreword by Marc Simmons. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2015. xv + 340 pp. Maps, 16 halftones, bibliography. \$24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8263-5565-2.)

Initially, I was skeptical of Nasario García's book, *Hoe, Heaven, and Hell: My Boyhood in Rural New Mexico*. A plethora of books tell of childhood experiences in rural towns across America, and there is a sameness about them. Small town life has universal themes and experiences, but I knew that I would be in capable hands with García, who is an expert writer and folklorist.

Much of what Garcia writes about in small town New Mexico are universal ideas and experiences, and rites of passage such as baptisms, weddings, and funerals. A master wordsmith, he imbues his sentences and paragraphs with things essentially New Mexican. Language, after all is a key—if not the key—to opening the mysteries of a given culture. I chuckled as I read García's list of *palabrotas*, or profanities, in Spanish, while I waited in line for confession at my church (p. 229). These are typical words and sayings one would hear, or use, in frustration or anger during the hard work typical of rural peoples and communities. García not only gives examples in sentences or situations, but also provides a handy list of such phrases, along with their English translations. A few echo in my head as I remember my grandfather Maximiano Martínez shout such vulgarities at me and my cousins after breaking his barn door in Mora.

Hoe, Heaven, and Hell is not merely the memoir of a nuevomexicano author who has lived a New Mexican life. It is an excellent collection of folklore and cultural treasures that one can consult over and over again. No less evocative are the descriptions of seasonal cuisines such as the *chile colorado* (red chile) and *arroz con leche* (rice with milk, cinnamon, and raisins) consumed in mass quantities at family gatherings (p. 105). The author lovingly describes the sights, sounds, and smells of a *matanza* (meat market), the sadness of a funeral for a loved one and the *velorio* (celebration), and of course a shared meal. García astutely provides descriptions and lyrics of *alabados* (sacred hymns) chanted by the Hermanos Penitentes at such family events. The book is a treasure trove of folkloric and rural cultural data including charts, word lists, *dichos* (proverbs), and lyrics. The author provides thirty verses, in Spanish and English, of *La Entriega de los Novios*, a song common at most Hispano wedding receptions today (pp. 107–11).

Nasario García is an excellent guide, taking the reader through a life lived in a rural Hispano town in western New Mexico. Read this book, and experience a lifeway that, sadly, is on its way out. *Hoe, Heaven, and Hell* remembers a bygone

era that, perhaps if enough people ingest the contents of this book, might still be lived once again by later generations under the infinite blue sky of Nuevo México.

Robert D. Martínez

Assistant State Historian of New Mexico

With a Book in their Hands: Chicano/a Readers and Readerships across the Centuries. Edited by Manuel M. Martin-Rodriguez. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2014. xxx + 258 pp. Index. \$45.00 cloth. ISBN 978-0-8263-5476-1.)

This collection is a refreshingly inclusive and analytically rigorous interrogation of the historical relationship between the construction of literary histories and canons, and the communicative situations they make accessible to a predominantly Chicano/a readership across time and space. This contribution considers the enduring resonance of diverse literary texts among Chicano/a readers. Organized into three parts, the book centers on the formative role of Chicano/as' access to reading and literary histories and their impact on the communicative situations fueling the educational inroads and strides of Chicano/a readers. Martin-Rodriguez incorporates a combination of personal-reflection essays and oral-interview transcripts of Chicano/a readers and offers a thorough examination of the configuration and scope of the Chicano/a Private Library Index, demonstrating sensitivity to a readership invested in the preservation of the Chicano/a experience in the state of New Mexico. The book magnifies the too often neglected history of reading in the Chicano/a experience. This unique intellectual sensibility captures the importance of constructing an accessible literary history and canon that prioritizes identifying, fleshing out, and learning from the act of reading. Chicano/a readership, for whom reading is a productive course of action in the same U.S. society that marginalizes and mistreats them.

Part one of *With a Book in their Hands* is comprised of twenty personal reflections written by Chicano/a readers who share a deep-seated appreciation for the promise of reading. Each essay compellingly describes reading as a pathway to answering personal questions or navigating personally charged situations. These essays are bound to resonate among diverse readers. The Chicano/a readers frankly state that access to reading and diverse literary histories and canons were not automatic rights but hard-earned privileges. Once enjoyed, reading ignited a newfound approach to their personal relationships, shaped educational goals, and influenced transition into adulthoods in which they

continue to rejoice in reading as an empowering and cherished course of action. Among the most compelling of personal reflections are those shared by Chicano/a readers who use their love for reading as motivation to seek out a community of learners with whom to discuss and enact social change.

These essays also exude a gendered perspective. Chicano/a readers detail how access to reading and diverse literary histories and canons made it possible to see and face gendered realities of alienation, discrimination, and marginalization when interrogating and documenting their family histories. Carmen Tafolla and Veronica Flores Paniagua's essays unpack, with great heart and emotional range, the benefits of gaining access to reading when they came to terms with an irresponsible schoolteacher and a natural disaster as children. *With a Book in their Hands* is persistently and innovatively expansive by envisioning a Chicano/a history that honors the diversity of personal incentives to read as they learn one book at a time.

Parts two and three of *With a Book in their Hands* are wide-ranging and carefully-constructed repositories, respectively, of oral interviews and of the literary travels and writings of prolifically productive advocates of reading. A prominent argument in the third part of the book details learning from a Chicano/a readership committed to preserving the importance of reading in understanding and writing the history of New Mexico. The most revealing oral interviews in the second part of this text are with Helen Fabela Chavez, wife of the late farm worker and labor leader Cesar E. Chavez, and Chicana readers such as Lupe Rodriguez. Both relentlessly advocate Chicano/as proactively pursue reading as integral to their daily confrontation of multiple forms of disenfranchisement within and beyond the context of the classroom and farm work. The infusion of oral interviews enrich the exhaustive accounts and archival indexes of Carlos Morton and Miguel A. Otero's recollections and records of their literary histories, travels, and their varied efforts to shape the history of New Mexico as a field of inquiry. Unfortunately, such a close reading of records focusing on highly privileged readers and writers limits historical understanding of the politics of literacy in New Mexico. Even so, parts two and three of *With a Book in their Hands* echo the respect for Chicano/a reading introduced in the first part of this text, attesting to the nuances and scholarly priorities of this text.

Ana Elizabeth Rosas
University of California, Irvine

Catholic Borderlands: Mapping Catholicism onto American Empire, 1905–1935. By Anne M. Martínez. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2014. xvii + 293 pp. 26 halftones, notes, bibliography, index. \$70.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8032-4877-9.)

John Gast captured the civilizing mission of American Protestantism in his painting *American Progress* produced in 1872. The image depicts a young white woman, “America,” soaring gracefully westward. She wears the “star of empire” on her head, and with her progression, darkness fades as she ushers in new light. Settlers accompany her, while Indians, like the wild beasts, flee her approach—the star being “too much for them.”

The painting depicted the ethos of Protestant America, during a time that imagined itself embarking upon a hemispheric civilizing mission to spread modern culture and values, or Americanism, to older civilizations such as Indians and Catholics, who were deemed “anti-modern.” Catholics themselves, however, had different designs on how to participate in this American project. Anne M. Martínez’s remarkable new book documents the ways in which “U.S. Catholics created a space for themselves in the American empire and participated in that empire in order to sustain a long-standing trans-imperial Catholicism in the borderlands of empire” (p. 2). She defines the Catholic borderlands “as former Spanish territories that had to find their respective places with a growing U.S. sphere of political, economic, and cultural influence in the first three decades of the twentieth century” (p. 3).

Rev. Francis Clement Kelly founded the Catholic Church Extension Society in 1905 with the primary purpose of raising funds to bring the Church to isolated faith communities, mostly in the American West and in Mexico. The following year, Kelly founded *Extension Magazine* and the monthly publication soon enjoyed a larger circulation than other popular magazines, including *National Geographic* and *Atlantic Monthly*. Through various platforms, Kelly immersed “American Catholics into a broader narrative of faith and conversion that embraced the U.S. imperialist project and its subjects, actual and potential, in Mexico especially” (p. 15). He did this partially by glorifying the Spanish past, including Spanish colonies, as necessary constituents of American glory. Thus he transposed a Protestant narrative of progress, empire, and modernization into a distinctly Catholic narrative.

The book critically maps sites wherein Kelly extended Catholicism. Chapter one analyzes home missions. Kelly’s focus was two-fold: to shield American Catholics, especially immigrants, from the corrosive forces of American Protestants; and for the church to “civilize” the Indians “by rescuing them from not just other hostile Natives but from Protestantism as well” (p. 46). Chapter

two explores the American Catholic civilizing mission in Puerto Rico, the Philippines, and Mexico. Chapter three develops “Religious Monroeism,” a theme Martínez continues in the following chapters by describing Kelly’s intervention in Mexico, a response especially to the Cristero Rebellion of 1926–1929. In chapter six, Martínez charts Kelly’s challenge to the pervasive madness of eugenics, which thought of Mexicans as agents of pollution and dilution to American whiteness. Kelly argued that racial mixing could have positive outcomes, as in the case of the Spanish colonization of Mexico.

In the conclusion, Martínez observes poignantly: “Catholic borderlands was not a redemptive space. . . . It was a space where multiple imperial projects . . . redefined the geopolitical landscape of U.S. territorial, social, cultural, and political reach” (p. 222). Martínez’s work is a powerful testament to this proposition, and it is necessary reading for anyone interested in twentieth-century American history, religion, and postcolonial studies.

Luis D. León

The University of Denver

The Border Crossed Us: Rhetorics of Borders, Citizenship, and Latino/a Identity.

By Josue David Cisneros. (Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2014. xv + 229 pp. Notes, bibliography, index. \$49.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8173-1812-3.)

The Border Crossed Us is a fascinating and important interpretation of the meaning of borders in U.S. history. Josue David Cisneros argues that borders not only delineate physical space but also define the boundaries of belonging in the United States, shifting and changing over time. On the one hand, Cisneros focuses on the ways that discourse in the United States “creates, contests, and moves the borders of belonging both metaphorically and materially” (p. 2). On the other hand, he explores the meanings of borders and citizenship that emerge from Latino/a communities within the United States. Using the famous Latino saying, “We didn’t cross the border, the border crossed us,” as a starting point, Cisneros’s book thoughtfully illustrates how borders, both material and metaphorical, shift and change over time (p. ix). He uses debates about Mexican citizenship in the California Constitutional Convention in 1849, issues surrounding the Chicano movement in the 1960s, and current-day debates about immigration as historical examples. By using examples from different centuries, Cisneros shows that anxieties permeating from the borderline have been both adopted and resisted across the United States at various points in time. Ideas of belonging and social identity shifted with the boundaries along the way. He is especially adept at showing how Latinos/as have contributed to this process.

Cisneros's book is useful for academics teaching about borders and borderlands as they relate to national identity. The book is smart, and its incorporation of a wide array of historical examples opens it to use across various disciplines. At the same time the book is overly theoretical, and its jargon-filled prose, hard to penetrate, would be difficult for an undergraduate audience. Although the book overcomplicates some of the discussion, it is still a significant contribution to scholarship on borders and borderlands.

Mary E. Mendoza

University of Vermont

The Chicano Generation: Testimonios of the Movement. By Mario T. García. (Oakland: University of California Press, 2015. ix + 335 pp. 23 halftones, notes, index. \$29.49 paper, ISBN 978-0-520-28602-3, \$65.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-520-28601-6.)

Mario T. García's *The Chicano Generation* makes a substantial contribution to the literature on the Chicano movement specifically and to Latino/a studies in general. The book contains three testimonios by leaders in various areas of the movement in Los Angeles and a brief introduction and conclusion by García. Most studies analyze the farmworkers movement and its leader César Chávez, the southwestern land grants and Reies López Tijerina, or the Crusade for Justice and Corky Gonzales. This work tells the story through the participants' own voices, testimonios by Raul Ruiz, Gloria Arellanes, and Rosalio Muñoz. Each individual made significant contributions to but are not often heralded in the Chicano movement, with the possible exception of Muñoz. As García makes clear in the introduction, these testimonios should be read together to receive a full picture because they "address collective struggles" (p. 2).

The testimonios provide first-person accounts, and tell the stories of Chicano Movement participants in fascinating detail. Honestly, the book is hard to put down. The reader learns of Ruiz's involvement in movement newspapers and the politics of running for office under the La Raza Unida Banner; Arellanes's work with the Brown Berets; and Muñoz's pivotal role in the Chicano antiwar movement. Again, these figures were leaders of the movement but not among those later immortalized. The testimonios narrate the participants' lives before the movement, what led to their involvement, and the lasting effects the movement had on them. The latter stages proved to be particularly compelling as leaders are often frozen in time. Ruiz earned a Ph.D. and became a professor of Chicano studies. After the violence of the Chicano Moratorium, Arellanes left the movement completely and turned to her indigenous roots, and is now

an elder. Additionally, these testimonios humanize the movement, relating how each actor developed a Chicano identity. For example, Muñoz entered college as “Ross” and left as Rosalio. Arellanes explains her transformation into a Chicana feminist through battling sexism in the *Brown Berets*. As a female and gender scholar, I was also particularly interested in Arellanes’s discussion of her body-image issues and her coping with and overcoming them.

García’s masterful editing also makes *The Chicano Generation* a compelling book. He breaks up the chapters into manageable and relevant sections that help the reader follow the story and that enhances its flow. One complaint is that the book focuses solely on Los Angeles, but anticipating the criticism, García states “The city represented the political capital of the movement” (p. 2). Every major facet of the movement, from the farmworkers and the student movement, to the antiwar movement and the Chicana feminist movement, had its roots in Los Angeles. I highly recommend the book for both scholars and students.

Valerie M. Mendoza

University of Kansas

New Mexico Filmmaking. By Jeff Berg (Charleston, S.C.: The History Press, 2015. 144 pp. 51 halftones, appendix, index. \$21.99 paper, ISBN 978-1-4671-1799-9.)

New Mexico is one of the most active film and television production areas in the United States, logging hundreds of projects over the past century. The vast majority of these silver and small screen “shows” were developed—written, financed, and cast—elsewhere, but shot in New Mexico. Jeff Berg uses *New Mexico Filmmaking* as a film journal and also hosts retrospectives of films made in New Mexico at theaters throughout the state. Additionally, Berg includes notes on films shot in New Mexico, comments on production and quality, and a list of his favorite films made in New Mexico.

New Mexico drew filmmakers beginning in the nascent days of the art, as Thomas Edison’s company and others experimented with moving picture technologies. Silent films followed as the technology transformed into a business. Film crews took advantage of the state’s scenic locations and landscapes to provide depth for early Westerns. D. W. Griffith, Mary Pickford, and Tom Mix each worked on projects in New Mexico.

Even as filmmaking consolidated and organized into the Hollywood studio system, producers and directors found cause to shoot in New Mexico. The studios, almost solely based in Los Angeles, would have benefited from shooting Westerns in California, as many of them did. Working in New Mexico brought travel costs and separated the production from its parent company. The demand

for Westerns, however, meant that studios needed to find unique locations; studios brought films to New Mexico primarily for this purpose and without financial inducement. According to Berg's interviews, in 1967 the New Mexico state government and private businesses reached out to the studios to entice film production.

The practice of attracting film and television productions crystalized in 2002 when New Mexico officially offered a rebate to filmmakers. This incentive rewarded productions that came to New Mexico by returning a portion of their in-state expenditures. Studios could consequently send work to New Mexico in order to save money on ever-growing film budgets. As a result, scores of projects arrived in New Mexico after 2002 and many of them had little need for the landscape as backdrop for a Western. *The Land of Enchantment* stood in for Afghanistan, Mexico, and Wyoming, among other far-flung locations.

Berg organizes the chapters chronologically beginning in the late-nineteenth century and concluding near the date of publication. The author recounts a number of enlightening tidbits and covers the astounding breadth and scope of films made in New Mexico. For example the film *Salt of the Earth* (1954), shot near Silver City, was the brainchild of a company created to harbor talent black-listed during the McCarthy Era. Toward the end of the book, Berg presents lists of films based on novels and those featuring Native American talent. The lists and the book as a whole could prove useful for anyone seeking to gain a quick grasp of the history of New Mexico filmmaking.

Jason Strykowski

Santa Fe, New Mexico

Education at the Edge of Empire: Negotiating Pueblo Identity in New Mexico's Indian Boarding Schools. By John R. Gram. Foreword by Theodore Jojola. (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2015. xviii + 242 pp. Half-tones, 12 tables, notes, bibliography, index. \$45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-295-99477-2.)

Stories of federal officials forcing assimilation throughout Indian Country have been told effectively for several decades. John Gram's goal is not to dispute this narration, but to look at the other side of intercultural relations: Native peoples' influence on their children's education. In particular, he focuses on the power relationships between Pueblo communities, and Indian boarding schools located in Albuquerque and Santa Fe, New Mexico. Just as today, policy decisions made in Washington, D.C., did not always play out the way federal officials intended. Gram's research reveals that Pueblos exercised a great deal of agency in their education: independent Pueblo communities acted on their

own agenda and local federal agents responded. Unintended consequences prevailed in the American Southwest, where students maintained cultural identities despite systems of assimilation.

The analysis is consistent with research by scholars such as David Wallace Adams, Brenda Child, Clyde Ellis, and others who highlight the complexities of intercultural relations and Native use of schools as resources for their people. Gram's contributions are his in-depth analysis of Pueblo-United States relations and of the limits of federal power "at the edge of empire" (p. 8). He shows that when poorly-funded schools' survival depends upon student enrollment (linked to federal monies), superintendents made cultural concessions to Pueblo leaders to enroll more students. Consequently, school administrators altered the school calendar, permitted family visitation, and established summer and winter breaks allowing Pueblo students to go home. Some superintendents considered paying children to attend, others provided food for visiting families and their animals. A few superintendents even helped Native people secure jobs. Interestingly, teachers and staff supported the influence of tribal councils of students from Native pueblos on school dynamics.

Gram organizes his study into five thematic chapters. The first two, "The Economics of Education" and "The Consequences of Competitions," reveal that efforts to increase enrollment and competition with Catholic schools for students led to alterations in the assimilation agenda. The third chapter, "Geographies of Imagination," examines how students who attended schools within their geographical and cultural homeland blunted the assimilation program. Chapter four, "Everyday Encounters," shows the persistence of tribal languages in boarding schools, and the impact of disciplinary actions on students. He notes that students often seemed to spend more time at work than in classrooms. The chapter entitled "The Integration of Worlds" locates most student experiences somewhere between outright rejection of school and total assimilation. Gram concludes in "The Successful Legacy of Assimilation's Failure" that since students were able to maintain their cultural identities, most were able to reintegrate back into their communities. Turning the tables on a typical assimilation equation suggests that within the federal failure were the seeds of Pueblo successes.

Like many scholars, Gram faces the challenge of limited sources. His response is to fill in gaps in his historical record by using examples from other federal schools. He highlights federal agents more often than specific Pueblo individuals or families. Limited oral accounts, combined with Theodore Jojola's foreword, provide Pueblo voices beyond evidence gleaned from federal documents and superintendents' diaries. Hopefully, future Pueblo scholars will provide additional student experiences and perspectives to enhance historical

understanding of Native students explored in the book and pictured on the dust jacket.

Advanced students and scholars of history, anthropology, and American Indian studies will appreciate the detailed research and endnotes, and mull over twenty pages of tables on the lives of boarding school students after they returned home. Readers will appreciate the historical context that the book provides for contemporary Americans grappling with similar issues of school choice and competition, increasing efforts to systematize education, and the consequences of tightening educational budgets.

Robert W. Galler Jr.

St. Cloud State University

Calamity Jane: A Reader's Guide. By Richard W. Etulain. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2015. xii + 263 pp. 26 halftones, index. \$34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4871-7.)

Lost for more than a century in impenetrable thickets of myths, folklore, and outright lies, the woman born as Martha Canary and buried as Calamity Jane has only recently been reclaimed through the indefatigable research conducted by scholars such as James D. McLaird and Richard W. Etulain. In the volume at hand, historian Etulain adds to his renown as the pre-eminent student of the cultural construction of the American West with this exhaustive examination of Calamity's protean incarnations. Intended as a companion piece to his biography, *The Life and Legends of Calamity Jane*, published in 2014, this densely-packed compendium begins with brief introductions to Martha Canary's life and then to Calamity Jane's mythology. However, the chapters serve merely as a prologue for the main event: the extensive annotated bibliographies devoted to reference works, manuscript collections, legal documents, newspaper articles written during and after Calamity's life, books and pamphlets, essays and scholarly articles, dime novels, contemporary fiction, motion pictures, television, and critical studies. He also includes a survey of Calamity Jane as captured in the photography of her time, drawn from James McLaird, to erode existing stereotypes about Calamity's customary appearance. Finally, an epilogue entitled "Unfinished Business" directs the reader's attention to a host of projects about Calamity Jane that the energetic and ambitious might undertake.

Throughout this "reader's guide," Etulain offers concise and astute critiques about hundreds of sources that, since the 1870s, have contributed to the establishment and elaboration of Calamity's legacy—or infamy, depending upon the

work. No aspiring student of any dimension of Calamity's life and times could possibly ignore this invaluable resource. Nor is it likely that any fair-minded researcher could disagree with his conclusion that ink rather than blood or beer was the liquid that swirled most commonly through Calamity's life. Having assiduously pursued her presence in the novels, films, and television programs of the twentieth and twenty-first centuries, Etulain has charted the enduring grasp that Calamity's myths have exerted upon all realms of popular culture as they are concurrently evolving in response to other changing popular norms. His engaging evaluation of Calamity's presence in British author J. T. Edson's late-twentieth-century "Adult Westerns" and in television epics such as *Buffalo Girls*, *Wild Bill*, and, especially, *Deadwood*, highlight how inextricably Calamity has insinuated herself into American popular consciousness. Scholars striving to come to grips with the influence and significance of other figures swaddled in legend could draw most profitably upon the example that Richard Etulain has set for them. Once more, many students of western history will find themselves in his debt.

Peter J. Blodgett

Huntington Library

Wanted: The Outlaw Lives of Billy the Kid and Ned Kelly. By Robert M. Utley. (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2015. 31 halftones, maps, bibliographic essay, index. \$30.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-30021668-1.)

In the decade after his retirement from the National Park Service in 1980, Robert Utley wrote three key books and several journal articles on the Lincoln County War. Through his writings and research, Utley became a recognized expert on William Bonney, AKA Billy the Kid. Ten years later, in 1998, while Utley was touring Australia, he visited Edward "Ned" Kelly sites when his wife, Melody Webb, suggested Ned Kelly was Australia's Billy the Kid. Utley initially dismissed the idea, but later came to realize that there was merit to the theory.

For the past one-hundred-and-thirty-five years both Billy the Kid and Ned Kelly have transitioned from footnotes in local history to national heroes and international phenomena. Both are enigmatic; yet, both have international followings and, in effect, have become the defining symbols of the expansion of national culture for both the United States and Australia. Utley uses this dual biography to describe each man's youth, early manhood, and outlaw years. In doing so, he makes an honest attempt to separate the known facts of each individual from legend.

Utley notes comparison between the two: both outlaws lived at the same time, died young, lost their fathers at a young age, were helped by sympathetic locals after becoming outlaws, and wrote letters to their respective governors. He portrays Bonney as an irresponsible, fun-loving youth who was a master of escape, and who drifted on the edge of trouble his entire life. Kelly was the son of an Irish convict father and Irish mother and a man whose outrage against colonial authority forced him to live in the bush. His hatred compelled him to steal livestock, kill policemen, and rob banks in order to gain notoriety and to provide financial assistance to his supporters.

Utley states he has mined available Billy the Kid sources and has utilized his previous research in writing the Kid's biography. However, the book is not without distractions. Utley has chosen not to include endnotes. He regularly quotes individuals without identifying them or the source of the information. Additionally, there are minor mistakes and questionable statements such as when he states the Montaña Store was opposite the Torreon or when he claims Bonney fathered two children who died young of diphtheria. There are a few errors in the Kelly biography as well when he writes Aaron Sherritt was killed on 24 June 1880 instead of 26 June and that it was William (instead of Thomas) Lonigan who was killed at Stringybark Creek.

This book is a good introduction for people perhaps familiar with one of the subjects but not the other. Utley's work adds to other recent works on the Kid, such as Marc Gardner's *To Hell on a Fast Horse* (2011), or Frederick Nolan's revised edition of *The Lincoln County War: A Documentary History* (2009). Regarding Ned Kelly, the interested reader may also consult the works of Australian author Ian Jones, primarily his *Ned Kelly: A Short Life* (1995). Utley's works will have its niche in the biographical interpretation of two pivotal characters living at the same time under somewhat similar circumstances. *Wanted: The Outlaw Lives of Billy the Kid and Ned Kelly* provides a perspective from which to compare and contrast Billy the Kid and Ned Kelly and their response to the uniqueness of their respective place in history.

Gary Cozzens

Lincoln Historic Site, New Mexico

Ladies of the Canyons: A League of Extraordinary Women and Their Adventures in the American Southwest. By Lesley Poling-Kempes. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2015. 373 pp. Halftones, notes, bibliography, index. \$24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8165-2494-5.)

A survey of the cover of *Vogue* in the early twentieth century reveals the world of stylized feminine beauty. Porcelain-skinned, flawless women dressed in shirt-waists and sporting Gibson-girl hairstyles gaze out into a rapidly changing world. Not only was the world getting smaller thanks to improved transportation and communication but personal freedoms were expanding. The combination seemed to push the long-accepted boundaries of women's roles and to help create the New Woman in the new century.

Several of these New Women are the subject of this book. The protagonists are well-educated women from affluent families. Most importantly, they held strong desires to break free of the traditional roles of wife and mother that Victorians expected of women, and to strike out on their own in search of autonomy, employment, and adventure. The women surveyed in this volume travelled to the American Southwest during a time of transition in women's lives and of an awakening interest in Native American culture, art, and music.

Poling-Kempes writes that her quest to know the "ladies of the canyon" began when she was researching the life of Carol Bishop Stanley, founder of the Ghost Ranch, a place most associated with artist Georgia O'Keeffe. Researching archives and public records, Poling-Kempes came across an informal alliance of women who had traveled to the Southwest in search of new lives.

Natalie Curtis Burlin, a trained musician, recorded and wrote about Hopi music. Alice Ellen Klauber, a native Californian, studied art in Europe and became friends with a host of influential artists of the era including Robert Henri. Carol Bishop Stanley hailed from Massachusetts, studied music, and stayed close to her family before venturing into the Southwest and discovering a new life as the wife of a rancher. These women are just a few of the talented and hearty individuals portrayed in this book who found solace in the canyonlands of the Southwest and whose lives Poling-Kempes portrays.

Their journeys into the Southwest brought the women into contact with locals including Louisa Wetherill. She provided the women with an introduction to Indian Country and hosted renowned guests such as Theodore Roosevelt. Social gatherings provided opportunities to share information and organize for the establishment of cultural centers and museums in Santa Fe, which was developing as an art colony in the early twentieth century.

This book fills an important niche in the history of the Southwest. The text skillfully brings together the intertwining lives of these women. Circles of

acquaintanceships and friendships bound them together. They encouraged and supported each other and were New Women by “disposition and circumstance” (p. 316). All the women portrayed in this volume blossomed in the hot, dry, sunny conditions of the desert lands and in the company of like-minded souls who understood the need to fulfill talents and pursue dreams. Hiking, riding, and sleeping under the stars became common practice, and the Southwest canyon lands became their home—the place where these new women could expand their talents, commune with friends, and relish a new freedom far removed from *Vogue*.

Patricia Ann Owens
Lawrenceville, Illinois

The Notorious Luke Short: Sporting Man of the Wild West. By Jack DeMattos and Chuck Parsons, foreword by Rick Miller. A. C. Greene Series, no. 16 (Denton: University of North Texas Press, 2015. xxii + 352 pp. 53 halftones, maps, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-1-57441-564-0.)

Jack DeMattos and Chuck Parsons have produced an engaging and exceptionally well-researched book tracking the life of Luke Short, one of the West’s lesser-known gunfighters and “sporting men.” DeMattos and Parsons rightly suggest that Short was much more the latter than the former.

The authors first examine Short’s role in the Dodge City War of 1883. The altercation began when a group of Dodge City citizens elected a mayor and town council that sought to end drinking, gambling, and prostitution. Short—who was one of the proprietors of the Long Branch—defied their ordinances. In late April, Short was involved in a gunfight with a deputy. Either Short had tried to assassinate the deputy or vice versa. Both men emerged unscathed and neither was tried. The incident provoked Dodge citizens to form a vigilance committee to force Short and his friends to leave town. Although Short left, he soon came back, this time with his gunfighter friends, including Wyatt Earp. The reformers and the sporting men managed to work out an accommodation.

DeMattos and Parsons do an excellent job of presenting contradictory opinions and evidence. They are more interested in reporting, however, than interpreting. Hence they do not give readers a useful summary analysis explaining their own views on the peculiar sociological and political forces that led to the “war” and its denouement.

The narrative then follows Short as he traveled to San Antonio and Fort Worth, Texas, where he again invested in saloons and got into more shooting scrapes. In the most famous of those gunfights, Short killed Jim Courtright, a private

detective. Courtright allegedly extorted money from saloons by threatening to turn them in for disobeying gambling ordinances. When Short refused to pay, Courtright pulled a gun. Short shot him three times, killing him. Here, too, readers want a summary analysis giving the authors' views on what happened.

Although engaging, the book lacks ambition. Scholars learn little about homicide rates, self-defense laws, or gun control in western towns. The authors offer relatively little about the anti-vice forces that sought to drive Short out of business in both Dodge City and Fort Worth. Readers learn little about Western politics, culture, and sociology more broadly, apart from what the book mentions about Short's life. Nor do they address anything about gender norms and relations, despite the fascinating relationship between Short and his wife.

What we do learn, however, makes the book worthwhile. Although the authors do not argue a scholarly thesis, they succeed admirably in separating fact from fiction in earlier accounts of Short's life. DeMattos and Parsons chronicle not only Short's role in the Dodge City War, but also as a married man, a boxing promoter (and avid fan), and, oddly, as an occasional religious exhorter. The social background remains blurry but the portrait is well delineated.

Daniel Herman

Central Washington University

Texas Mexican Americans and Postwar Civil Rights. By Maggie Rivas-Rodriguez. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2015. xv + 171 pp. 16 halftones, notes, bibliography, index. \$24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-292-76752-2.)

Maggie Rivas-Rodriguez explores the struggle of Texas Mexican Americans for legal, educational, and political equality. The author's interest dates to her days as a political reporter for the *Dallas* (Tex.) *Morning News*. Her experience provided access to Mexican American leaders whose oral histories form the basis of this work, which examines their assertion for civil rights both locally and nationally. The author notes that inequality was "woven into the system" and made it difficult to separate "political participation, voting rights, educational opportunity, and so on." Rivas-Rodriguez further contends, "Mexican American people persevered, resisting and making gains as possible" (p. 1).

Integral to their perseverance was a proactive strategy. The author cites two examples in which hard work and determination brought genuine improvements over institutionalized exclusion. In Alpine city schools, primary schools were segregated, with the "Mexican" school located in the barrio. Alpine had only one high school; technically, it was segregated. Few Mexican American children attended, however, because of hostility or lack of academic preparation.

The result was a lack of educational and thus vocational and economic opportunity. In 1969 Mexican American elected officials and parents took the case directly to the Texas Education Association and to state legislators in Austin. After receiving little response from Texas officials, parents simply enrolled their children, en masse, in the white schools. This proactive approach forced officials to integrate and improve the schools.

Proactive strategy and the long-awaited election of Mexican Americans to public office also helped. Raymond Telles became the first minority elected mayor of El Paso in 1960. Like other Mexican American leaders of his time, Telles was a military veteran and respected businessman. He realized that he could not overtly challenge institutionalized inequality without incurring electoral wrath from white supporters. Instead, he appointed a Latino to the city's Civil Service Commission. Albert Armendariz immediately questioned the practice of allowing Fire Department officials to preview hiring lists, and more importantly, of crossing out Hispanic names. Surprisingly, Armendariz was given unlimited access to city hiring records and El Paso changed its hiring practices to prevent departmental vetting of potential hires that moved qualified applicants to the top of hiring lists and that disregarded racial and ethnic considerations.

The Mexican American Legal Defense and Education Fund (MALDEF) was founded in 1968 to provide ongoing legal challenges to systemic exclusion of Mexican Americans in public education, employment, and political access. This problem was readily found in Texas, where many key civil rights cases originated. For example *Sweatt v. Painter* (1950) ended segregation of higher education and set a precedent for *Brown v. Board of Education* (1954), and *Delgado v. Bastrop* (1948) technically eliminated segregation based on ethnicity. Cases such as these, often supported by The League of United Latin American Citizens and the American G.I. Forum, eroded Jim Crow discrimination. MALDEF was another proactive effort to "have our own lawyers fight our own cases" (p. 77). The organization sought out Mexican American attorneys and provided promising Latinos law school scholarships. This kind of self-help, as Rivas-Rodriguez points out, broadened opportunities for Mexican Americans everywhere.

Mark Stanley

University of North Texas-Dallas

American Indian Treaties: A Guide to Ratified and Unratified Colonial, United States, Foreign, and Intertribal Treaties and Agreements, 1607–1911. By David H. DeJong (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2015. viii + 348 pp. Halftones, 6 tables, 1 list, notes, bibliographic essay, bibliography, index. \$40.00 paper, ISBN 978-1-60781-426-9.)

American Indian Treaties combines solid and concise analysis with thoroughly-researched reference material. The guide is an outgrowth of work the author did as a research assistant for the late Vine Deloria at the University of Arizona. DeJong builds on the works of Deloria, Francis Prucha, and others to create an invaluable resource for the research of American Indian treaties. The helpful bibliographic essay at the end of the volume underscores the nature of the work as a reference and calls for additional scholarship on Indian treaties.

The guide is comprised of eight chapters followed by six tables and a comprehensive list of treaties with Native nations. DeJong provides a far-reaching analysis of the subject beginning with chapters on context and intertribal treaties before moving on to colonial, and then federal ratified and unratified treaties. The next chapters examine treaties between Native peoples and individual states including the Republic of Texas and the Confederate States of America, followed by a chapter analyzing post-treaty agreements that dealt mostly with railroad rights-of-way and land cessions. The broad coverage of the chapters excuses a few omissions, such as Russian treaty making on the Pacific Coast and the manipulation of individuals and rivalries during treaty councils.

The author uses ethnographic information to help readers understand the perspectives of Native peoples in treaty negotiations. DeJong centers his analysis heavily on Iroquois scholarship and shows the sharp divides between American Indian views of diplomacy and the duplicity with which the United States and European colonial powers so often acted. The author's divisions, such as ratified and unratified treaties, or the Articles of Confederation and the Constitution, provide for interesting comparison and provoke much thought.

Demonstrating a long period of careful work, the tables offer a valuable reference for any scholar of American Indians. The tables prompt comparison and analysis on their own and provide a strong basis for future research. Modern spellings of some tribal names, most notably those from California could have improved these otherwise very useful resources. Although there is value in the inclusion of spellings employed within the treaties themselves, the lists should include the modern nomenclature for all nations. For example, today Kumey-aay is preferred to Dieguino. The author does this for the "Papago (Tohono O'odham)" (pp. 254, 277). Additionally, the "Alphabetical Listing of All Treaties by Tribal Nation" would be similarly enhanced by changing the order so that

Tohono O'odham could be found instead of the Papago or, to use a California example, the Cahuilla instead of the "Ka-we-as" (pp. 254, 277).

The work nevertheless remains strong. After years of effort, DeJong has made a strong contribution to the field of American Indian history and provides scholars an invaluable reference that will no doubt spawn future comparative scholarship on American Indian treaties.

T. Robert Przeklasa

Riverside Metropolitan Museum