New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 90 | Number 3 Article 7

7-1-2015

Book Reviews

Book Reviews

Four Square Leagues: Pueblo Indian Land in New Mexico. By Malcolm Ebright, Rick Hendricks, and Richard W. Hughes. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2014. x + 452 pp. Halftones, 12 line drawings, maps, tables, appendixes, notes, glossary, works cited, index. $65.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-5472.)

In a land beset by frequent tragedies, there are few greater tragedies than the extensive loss of land grants in New Mexico history. Despite American promises dating back to the Kearny Code of 1846 and the Protocol of Querétaro of 1848, 96 percent of all land grant confirmations were denied by American courts or commissions by the early twentieth century. Historians have studied the massive loss of Spanish land grants in some detail. Much less attention has been given to the complex fate of Pueblo land grants since the late seventeenth century. *Four Square Leagues: Pueblo Indian Land in New Mexico* helps to correct this imbalance with a major contribution to the study of New Mexico history.

Few historians are better qualified to write a book on Indian land grants than the award-winning authors of *Four Square Leagues*. Rick Hendricks is the New Mexico State Historian and one of the country's leading authorities on Spanish colonial history and land grant issues. Attorney Malcolm Ebright is the director of the Center of Land Grant Studies and the author of many relevant works, including *Land Grants and Law Suits in Northern New Mexico* (1994). With forty-four years of practice in the field, Santa Fe attorney Richard W. Hughes is recognized as among the foremost experts on Indian law in the Southwest.

Four Square Leagues addresses four main aspects of Indian land grants in central and northern New Mexico. First, the authors consider the use of the

"mysterious Indian league" employed to measure Pueblo grants to equal 17,350 acres each (p. vii). Next, the book focuses on the Pueblo reaction to the transition from Spanish to Mexican sovereignty after Mexican independence in 1821. The book's third goal is to study the fundamental changes to Pueblo land status with the coming of New Mexico statehood in 1912. Finally, the book examines the Pueblo Lands Act of 1924, passed in opposition to the notoriously unfair Bursum Bill.

Hendricks, Ebright, and Hughes have achieved their four goals with one or more chapters devoted to each purpose. Using legal documents and court cases found in libraries and archives as near as Santa Fe and as distant as Mexico City and Spain, the authors tell the "story of Pueblo resilience and cultural survival in the face of repeated and persistent efforts by non-Indians to encroach on Pueblo land" (p. 325).

The greatest strengths of *Four Square Leagues* are its thorough documentation, excellent maps, and remarkable case studies of seven Pueblo land grants, dating from Spanish colonial times to the recent past: Santa Ana, Picuris, Sandia, Santa Clara, Cochiti, Jemez, and Taos. The University of New Mexico Press has done its usual fine work, publishing a book that is destined to be a classic in New Mexico historiography. *Four Square Leagues* is not the definitive study of Pueblo land grants (hardly the authors' intent), but it is a superior treatment of a vitally important, highly relevant subject in New Mexico's past—and present.

Richard Melzer
University of New Mexico, Valencia

Enduring Acequias: Wisdom of the Land, Knowledge of the Water. By Juan Estevan Arellano. Querencias Series. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2014. xi + 220 pp. 24 halftones, notes on sources, index. $24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8263-5507-2.)

Once again Juan Estevan Arellano unravels the world of agriculture, land, and water for his readers in this, his fifth book. Indeed, Arellano previously compiled and translated into English *Obra de Agricultura* (Treatise on Agriculture), the first book in Spanish about agriculture, written in 1513 by Gabriel Alonso de Herrera and considered by many to be the "father of Spanish agriculture." Life-long farmer, poet, writer, philosopher, and, above all, a researcher of Hispano history as it relates to land and water in northern New Mexico, Arellano can trace his ancestry to the very beginning of Spanish civilization in our state.

Although this book primarily focuses on acequias, his opening chapter, "Sacred Water," provides a broad perspective of arid landscapes around the world and how inhabitants of the land have continued to collect and bring water to their fields. Among many other revelations, the text points out that what we call today El Camino Real was also once known as "Camino de Agua"—the water road.

The Moorish heritage of agriculture and water management, particularly during the period when Spain was ruled by Muslims between 711 and 1492, is emphasized throughout *Enduring Acequias*. Indeed, Arellano informs us that "One of the most neglected aspects of northern New Mexico history is the influence of the Arab world" (p. 166).

The meat of this book assuredly pertains to acequias (open-air communal irrigation canals) that were first dug here by Juan de Oñate's colonists in 1598. By the time of the Pueblo Revolt in 1680, nearly twenty-three acequias had been constructed by the colonists. Today every small community in northern New Mexico is defined by its "acequia madre" (mother ditch). With some phraseology in Spanish, the book details the strong connection between acequias and Spanish land grants with focus on the Embudo Land Grant, where Arellano has lived all his life. He states that, "all my knowledge of acequias comes from lifelong experience as a small farmer in Embudo. It hasn't come from books,"—although I personally know for a fact that he was extremely well read (p. 151).

In making a strong case for preserving acequia irrigation systems, Arellano laments many recent changes in farming techniques that have resulted in a loss of useful wild plants that formerly grew alongside acequias and were harvested by families for the table. Among the undesirable modifications, he cites the use of pesticides and replacing flood irrigation with drip systems that deprive useful wild plants of water. The book concludes with the author's thoughts on measures that should be taken to ensure the conservation of our agricultural landscape.

What a tragedy to have to end this review on a terribly sad note: Juan Estevan Arellano died at age sixty-seven on 19 October 2014, just a few months after the publication of *Enduring Acequias*. Northern New Mexico has lost a towering figure and one of its staunchest champions. I have lost a colleague and friend.

William W. Dunmire
University of New Mexico

Range Wars: The Environmental Contest for White Sands Missile Range. By Ryan H. Edgington. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2014. xiii + 268 pp. 13 halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $70.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8032-3844-2, $30.00 paper, ISBN 978-0-8032-5535-7.)

Historian C. L. Sonnichsen called the Borderlands of south central New Mexico the "Last of the Frontier West," a fearsome desert where "the only creatures who sleep with both eyes closed are dead" (C. L. Sonnichsen, *Tularosa: Last of the Frontier West*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1980, p. 3). Home to warring Apaches, cattle rustlers, and rogue lawmen, this "frontier" died in a cataclysmic explosion on 16 July 1945 when the first atomic bomb was detonated at a site code-named "Trinity" in the White Sands Proving Ground near Alamogordo. As depicted in Ryan H. Edgington's history of modern-day White Sands, a new kind of frontier emerged from the blast. Never mind that it is still sparsely populated, bereft of moisture, and hazardous to unwary strangers. Edgington makes the case that the White Sands missile range and its environs comprise a seriously undervalued region, "A place largely overlooked in Cold War historiography" or relegated with other nuclear test sites to a "dead west"; rather, he contends that, "White Sands was an origin of ecosystem science [and] the birthplace of the American space program" (pp. 2, 6).

Scientists captured their first images of the earth's curvature from rockets fired from the missile range, while the military and scientific installations that grew up around the test site added $200 million to the regional economy. Most surprising are the environmental benefits of the range cited by Edgington. In the vast open spaces where errant missiles fall to earth and human entry is barred, wildlife has flourished as never before. The missile range, writes Edgington, has become a safe harbor for endangered bighorn sheep, Northern Aplomado falcons, and a variety of other imperiled species, recasting the national security state with its arsenal of destruction as a defender of the natural world.

Edgington does not overlook the human sacrifice involved in the creation of White Sands—the extirpation of private ranches and rural communities that began with an executive order in 1942 forcing dozens of families to abandon their homes and cutting off their access to more than one million acres of public range land. He dutifully recounts the bitter fight for just compensation by the ranchers, though he points out they never owned most of the range where their livestock grazed. It was always federal land.

Regional historians are like entomologists who discover vibrant life forms in obscure, seemingly moribund places. Edgington's profile of White Sands has skillfully depicted the vibrancy of a region known to Spanish explorers as *Jornada del Muerto*, the Walk of the Dead (p. 6). Unfortunately, Edgington fails to

acknowledge the plight of people who are still on that path. They are the "downwinders" who blame decades of illnesses and deaths on radioactive fallout from the 1945 nuclear blast. The most lethal ingredients of that fallout may remain toxic for thousands of years, long enough for the downwinders to finally win compensation for their suffering and for historians less sanguine than Edgington to have the last word on the "dead west."

Frank Clifford
Los Angeles Times

Recognizing Heritage: The Politics of Multiculturalism in New Mexico. By Thomas H. Guthrie. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2013. xvii + 317 pp. 26 halftones, line drawings, map, appendix, notes, references, index. $70.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8032-4610-2, $35.00 paper, ISBN 978-0-8032-4979-0.)

In *Recognizing Heritage*, Thomas H. Guthrie explains relationships between New Mexico's colonial heritage and multiculturalism. Among contemporary topics, Guthrie deftly discusses the historical evolution, restoration, and uses of the Palace of the Governors in Santa Fe. He specifically explores the *portal* program as an expression of multiculturalism, which exclusively allows Native Americans to sell their artwork at the Palace of the Governors. Opponents decry the authenticity of the practice that, historically, never existed, and its unfairness to other vendors. On a multicultural level, the Museum of New Mexico defends the portal program as an educational opportunity that goes beyond commercial interests.

Guthrie examines the Hispanic side of multiculturalism against the backdrop of the 400th Anniversary of New Mexico's settlement in 1598. Although he diligently compiled various modern-day opinions about Spain's expansion into New Mexico, his approach to the subject is less than impressive, as his analyses of historical issues fall short of a balanced story. Indeed, the research is perhaps not the strongest element of the book. The author presents quotations, such as, "Isn't the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo really people whining about land taken unlawfully—people who took land themselves? We have little or no sympathy there," without adequately analyzing or addressing them (p. 155). Although Guthrie maintains that multiculturalism includes the broader American society and its heritage, his discussion of the role of American history in this study is somewhat lacking. A multifactor analysis could have included, for balance, American history highlights about pivotal events between the founding of Jamestown (1607) and Wounded Knee (1890).

Guthrie summarizes the National Park Service's (NPS) role in creating the Northern Rio Grande National Heritage Area (NRGNHA). He assumes that

Hispanics in the NRGNHA sought federal affirmation of their history and culture and were given approval by the NPS and politicians to do so in order to bring their heritage into the fold. Overall, Guthrie does not adequately consider other local and national factors at play. For example NPS already has Spanish colonial heritage sites and historic trails throughout the nation that address the Hispanic/Latino heritage. Since the 1960s, the Chicano Movement evolved into a twenty-first century clarion call for the preservation of Latino heritage across the nation. The quest by Hispanics to tell their own history as part of the national narrative is not necessarily driven by multicultural agendas. It includes historical processes and antecedents such as *resistencia*, or cultural resistance, which emanated from the nineteenth-century Anglo American occupation of the Southwest. Cultural resistance largely explains the retention of the Spanish language, traditions, folklore, religion, and history, despite pressures from the dominant society to abandon them. Similarly, Native Americans support indigenization, a global movement of Native peoples that may explain the recent move to rename Pueblo towns to their pre-Spanish names and reveal their heritage on their own terms.

Guthrie's book raises more questions than it answers, but opens the way for a frank discussion of multiculturalism in New Mexico and Latino American heritage as a part of our national story. To that end, this book is recommended for classroom use.

Joseph P. Sánchez
Director, Spanish Colonial Research Center
University of New Mexico

Father of Route 66: The Story of Cy Avery. By Susan Croce Kelly. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2014. xv + 272 pp. 21 halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $24.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4499-3.)

Father of Route 66: The Story of Cy Avery is a detailed biography of Oklahoma businessman Cy Avery (1871–1963) with a focus on his pivotal role in the creation of the U.S. highway system and U.S. Highway 66. A native of Pennsylvania, Avery moved with his family to rural Oklahoma in 1884. He ended up prospering there and eventually moved to Tulsa, where he played a significant role in the development of the oil-rich town. Susan Croce Kelly describes Avery as a businessman, civil servant, and local booster whose influence reached the national level with his involvement in highways.

In the 1910s, he joined the growing "good roads movement" as it was just getting under way and successfully promoted the construction of paved highways in Oklahoma. In 1925 Avery was appointed to a national highway board

charged with choosing the numbers assigned to individual routes within a new national system of highways and used his position to route as many major highways through Oklahoma as possible. An unsuccessful battle between Avery and the governors of Virginia and Kentucky over road numbering led to the designation of the proposed highway from Chicago to Los Angeles as Route 66 instead of the more prestigious Route 60.

Detailed and well written, the book places Cy Avery in the context of the early and mid-twentieth century and the culture and history of Oklahoma. It describes his involvement in farming, road building and promotion, creating Tulsa's first waterworks, its first municipal airport and, most importantly, the planning and marketing of Route 66. At times the book presents excessive detail, such as the numerous descriptions of good roads picnics and meetings Avery attended throughout his career, and his dealings with a host of tangential politicians and highway officials who are difficult to keep up with.

Avery was the kind of fair-dealing public official and promoter we would all like to have in office, and his life was mostly successful and stable, which makes the book more of an interesting history of the period and the road than a fascinating biography. With the exception of his opposition to the Ku Klux Klan in the 1920s and some relief efforts he undertook after the infamous 1921 Tulsa race riot and during the Great Depression, Avery seemed to lack a vision that went beyond business and the special interests of Tulsa and road building. Although forward thinking, he represents practicality but not a truly idealistic, imaginative, or altruistic worldview. The author successfully makes the argument that Avery had a significant role in making Route 66 an international sensation, but also credits "migrants in the 1930s, millions of soldiers during World War II, postwar vacationers, novelist John Steinbeck, songwriter Bobby Troup, and legendary crooner Nat King Cole" (pp. 193–94).

Factual and well researched, the book will interest those fascinated with the history of Route 66, American highways generally, and Oklahoma history.

Peter B. Dedek
Texas State University

Constructing Community: The Archaeology of Early Villages in Central New Mexico. By Alison E. Rautman. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2014. xvii + 284 pp. Line drawings, 11 maps, 20 tables, references cited, index, about the author. $60.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-3069-4.)

The study of community organization has long been a central concern of archaeologists of the Southwest, resulting in a voluminous literature that illustrates

both the allure and complexity of this anthropological concept. Alison Rautman's *Constructing Community* contributes to this literature through an analysis of Ancestral Pueblo settlements in the Salinas area ranging from the small pithouse villages built circa AD 600 to the massive Tiwa, Piro, and Tompiro pueblos founded in the fourteenth century and later encountered by Spanish conquistadors and missionaries. Best known as the location of Salinas Pueblo Missions National Monument, the Salinas region has received little archaeological attention in comparison to other parts of the Southwest. Rautman's book provides an accessible and needed summary of Salinas archaeology, particularly for the era prior to the founding of the historically documented pueblos. The slow, steady growth of ancient populations in the Salinas area during this period, coupled with a lack of evidence for major episodes of interregional migration, contrasts sharply with other areas of the Southwest where ancient population booms and busts and resulting migrations were more common. As a result, Rautman can focus more closely on local factors and their role in community transformations, making the case that Salinas archaeology is a useful foil for thinking about Ancestral Pueblo communities more broadly.

The book begins with a discussion of how archaeologists make inferences about social organization and interaction within sites that contain evidence for multiple, small-scale social units living in close proximity to one another. Some might view the emphasis on detailed analyses of particular sites, rather than the wider local and regional social context within which the ancient residents of those sites existed, as a shortcoming of Rautman's approach to community. She acknowledges this issue, but notes her exploration of regional interactions is limited by the lack of detail in the extant Salinas archaeological record, especially in terms of archaeological survey coverage. Her analysis of a series of excavated villages nonetheless provides an opportunity to revisit interpretations of site-level variation in social organization and interaction that have often been taken for granted in recent Southwest archaeology.

The main contribution of the book is a chronological tour of what Rautman's and other excavations tell us about changes in household and site-level social organization as Salinas residents adopted new forms of architecture and settlement patterns in response to shifts in subsistence, mobility, and conflict. She does an excellent job of walking the reader through the basics of archaeological interpretation, although in places a more quantitative approach might have yielded stronger inferences. During the latter portion of the book, Rautman pays close attention to the role of violence in shaping village organization in the 1300s, but an examination of the factors leading to conflict at that particular time could have been more thoroughly explored. Overall, *Constructing Community* ably examines an alternative trajectory in the development of early

villages in the Ancestral Pueblo world and raises a number of new research questions for the Salinas region and beyond.

Gregson Schachner
University of California, Los Angeles

Spanish Colonial Lives: Documents from the Spanish Colonial Archives of New Mexico, 1705–1774. Edited by Linda Tigges. Translated by J. Richard Salazar. (Santa Fe, N.Mex.: Sunstone Press, 2013. 694 pp. Maps, glossary, appendix, bibliography, index. $45.00 paper, ISBN 978-0-86534-971-1.)

Spanish Colonial Lives features transcriptions and translations of fifty-four documents from the Spanish colonial archives dating from 1705 to 1774. This falls largely between the death of Gov. Diego de Vargas and the governorship of Juan Bautista de Anza. Many of the documents come from the second volume of Ralph Emerson Twitchell's *Spanish Archives of New Mexico* (2008). Editor Linda Tigges explains that she selected the sources in the collection to provide examples of everyday lives (p. 9). These reflect the hardships that residents of the province of New Mexico faced. After a historical introduction, Tigges provides a synopsis of each document followed by an English translation by J. Richard Salazar and a transcription of the original Spanish source.

The majority of the documents concern economic issues, some involving interactions between various groups—Spaniards, Pueblos, genízaros, and nomadic Indians. Documents 29 and 30 describe disputes between Albuquerque residents and successive governors over trade restrictions. In Document 40, Gov. Tomás Vélez Cachupín adjudicates a contract dispute, stating the rights of each party and providing remedies to resolve the dispute. Several documents refer to issues regarding the use or maintenance of acequias (Docs. 23, 33, and 35). In Document 35, Gov. Joachín Codallos y Rabal orders residents to clean, clear, and redirect the acequias madres of Santa Fe to improve their flow. He threatens to fine those who refuse to participate.

Other documents pertain to legal, religious, or military issues and describe various perils experienced by those who lived in the kingdom of New Mexico. Document 9 describes how a caravan from El Paso survived an Apache ambush. The settlers, with a small military escort, had stopped at the El Muerto watering hole while crossing the desert-like Jornada del Muerto. Two animals were killed, but after a short skirmish, the convoy continued on to Santa Fe. Several of the soldiers testified to the attack in Santa Fe, providing several written accounts of the incident. Document 53 describes an investigation of flood damage caused by the Rio Santa Fe and the Rio Chiquito in 1767 by the governor, religious leaders, and notable citizens.

Spanish Colonial Lives also includes twenty-one illustrations, and seven maps (two reproductions and five new ones) that show New Mexico in the eighteenth century. Tigges and Salazar also provide a glossary that defines technical terms found in the documents. The collection includes biographical footnotes that correspond to the first time a person's name appears. An index has subject matter entries, place names, but most noticeably, the names of individuals found in the fifty-four sources. Genealogists will particularly find the collection useful. The transcriptions have the abbreviations spelled out and Salazar's translations are clear, making *Spanish Colonial Lives* suitable for undergraduate courses and graduate study.

Scholars interested in the northern frontiers of Nueva España, Bourbon-era Latin America, or the U.S. West will find this collection valuable, as it provides insights to the quotidian hardships nuevomexicanos faced in the first three quarters of the eighteenth century.

James E. Dory-Garduño
Dory-Garduño Law Firm

The Horrell Wars: Feuding in Texas and New Mexico. By David Johnson. Forward by Bill O'Neal. A. C. Green Series, no. 15. (Denton, University of North Texas Press, 2014. xviii + 249 pp. 20 halftones, appendixes, endnotes, selected works consulted, index. $24.95 cloth, ISBN 978-1-57441-550-6.)

The post–Civil War Southwest—rife with Reconstruction antagonisms, multiple Native conflicts, ethnic divisions between nuevomexicanos and Anglos, and often compromised criminal justice systems—was a hotbed for potential, and often realized, violence. Among the many who navigated this cauldron were the Horrells, a large extended family that floated between Texas and New Mexico during the 1870s.

By many accounts, the Horrells have gone down in history as trouble-making, violence-prone losers, a family who was nearly wiped out in a final feud against the Higgins clan and their supporters. In *The Horrell Wars*, David Johnson provides a well-documented overview of the Horrell family that includes a detailed outline of where they came from, who they married, and their resulting offspring. After introducing the family, Johnson describes the various conflicts the family became embroiled in and their outcomes. In the process, he challenges the prevailing view of the Horrells. In Johnson's perspective, it was not always their fault, and although they ultimately paid a high price in lives during these conflicts, they often and effectively fought back.

One of the challenges of narrating these internecine feuds is the conflicting historical documentation of events that historians must wade through to find some sort of objective truth. Johnson does a fine job of digging through resources ranging from military reports, court records, newspaper accounts (which are notoriously problematic), and interviews. When faced with conflicting details, he presents the evidence for the reader to decide and, when possible, forms a conclusion based on the available sources.

This book is an excellent overview of not only the Horrells, but of the time and place in which they lived. On one occasion they became embroiled in a war with nuevomexicanos in Lincoln, New Mexico, that bordered on a feud of extermination. Johnson downplays the ethnic/racial overtones of this particular episode, arguing that events rather than ethnicity were more important in driving the violence. Nonetheless, this type of violence between Hispanos and Anglos was fairly common as both groups sorted out issues over land and political control. This feud's overtones of ethnic division and the readiness of the participants to resort to deadly violence would set the stage for the far more notorious Lincoln County War.

Overall, this is a compelling, complicated, and often tragic history of a family who often looked for trouble and found it or, despite their best efforts, trouble still managed to find them. At times this was due to their reputation, as described in the final chapter, which documents how Matt and Tom Horrell were brutally gunned down in 1879 while being held in a Meridian, Texas, jail for a crime they in all likelihood did not commit. At other times, however, trouble found the Horrells due to the unsavory company they kept.

Besides being a fascinating narrative set in the Southwest, the book provides numerous photos of the participants and useful appendixes—including one that helps the reader keep the cast of Horrell characters and their relations to each other straight, an admirable task alone.

Paul T. Hietter
Mesa Community College

Viewing the Ancestors: Perceptions of the Anaasází, Mokwič, and Hisatsinom. By Robert S. McPherson. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2014. xiii + 242 pp. 21 halftones, notes, bibliography, index. $34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4429-0.)

Robert McPherson is a professor at Utah State University's Blanding Campus, where almost two-thirds of the students are Native American, mostly Navajo. Ten of McPherson's fifteen books are on Navajo themes—biographies, Native

American studies, histories, and ethnohistories. *Viewing the Ancestors* is far more ethnological than historical; indeed, his theme and his arguments would be right at home in cultural anthropology.

His title may baffle most readers: Anaasází is Navajo; Mokwič is Ute; and Hisatsinom is Hopi—the three major tribes in the Four Corners region. His book surveys differing ways these three groups "view the ancestors"—that is, the ancient ruins that dot their lands. McPherson's emphasis is clearly on Navajo, with far more material devoted to this group than on the Ute and Hopi. His sources include published anthropological and historical accounts, and interviews with many Native people, almost all of whom spoke as individuals and not official representatives of their tribes—an important distinction.

The Navajo (Diné) Nation is the largest in area and second largest in numbers of all American tribes. The Nation covers northeastern Arizona, northwestern New Mexico, and a bit of southeastern Utah. Navajo traditional lands no longer within the reservation extend well into southwestern Colorado. This is the Four Corners country, famed for its ruins: Mesa Verde, Chaco Canyon, and thousands of other picturesque sites to lure hikers, photographers, and archaeologists.

McPherson shows us, anecdotally, the meaning of these ruins to the aboriginal peoples. For Hopi, they are Hisatsinom, ancestors of Hopi and other Pueblo peoples—but not ancestors of Navajos. For Utes, they are Mokwič, non-Utes. For Navajos, it is complicated. Anaasází (commonly spelled Anasazi) is, so to speak, a bone of contention among the Navajo, and between the Navajo and the Hopi, and the Navajo and the archaeologists. Archaeologists and historians have long assumed that the Four Corners ruins were "ancestral Puebloan" (a term used today in preference to Anasazi), because Navajo migrated into the Four Corners centuries after the ruined villages were deserted. New data suggest that the Navajo may have arrived much earlier; McPherson summarizes current scientific arguments and for these and other reasons urges archaeologists and historians to take seriously Navajo views.

But which views? Navajos themselves—three hundred thousand individuals in ninety separate clans—show a wide range of opinions, as McPherson documents in interviews. Some Navajo call the Anaasází "ancient strangers/enemies" (dangerous, then and now); others think the Navajo interacted with Anaasází in a type of multicultural society; still others claim Anaasází were actual ancestors. These ideas are situational and evolving; nothing is set in stone—until now. While reading this book, I met with the Navajo Nation Tribal Historic Preservation Officer (THPO). The THPO announced that, henceforth, it will be Navajo Nation policy that all Anaasází ruins under Navajo jurisdiction are to be declared ancestral to Navajo, and that Pueblo-friendly terms such as

Hisatsinom or "Ancestral Pueblo" are henceforth forbidden. McPherson wants historians and archaeologists to take Navajo claims seriously, and the Navajo THPO indeed made it so. But, I think, the Hopi would disagree.

Stephen H. Lekson
Museum of Natural History
University of Colorado, Boulder

Debating American Identity: Southwestern Statehood and Mexican Immigration. By Linda C. Noel. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2014. xiii + 246 pp. Notes, bibliography, index, about the author. $55.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-3045-8.)

Linda C. Noel's *Debating American Identity* is a unique perspective on immigration in the U.S. Southwest that introduces the employment of marginalization and pluralistic approaches in addition to the typical exclusionist and assimilationist arguments common to this debate. Her book focuses on "four national debates over statehood and immigration during the first third of the twentieth century," and each of these debates comprises one section of this four-part book (p. 5). In Part I, "The Late Territorial Years: 1898–1912," Noel highlights the four basic strategies utilized to deal with immigration: exclusion, assimilation, pluralism, and marginalization. Utilizing the statehood struggles of New Mexico and Arizona, she effectively argues that people of Mexican descent in New Mexico maintained positions of power partly due to their economic and social standing, as well as their longevity in the region. People of Mexican descent in Arizona did not establish the powerful economic bases that nuevomexicanos had, and therefore faced different circumstances upon attempting statehood, particularly exclusion and, later, marginalization (pp. 30–37). In the end, both territories fought for statehood, but exclusionist attitudes that people of Mexican descent were "unfit" for a mostly "pure, white, and Anglo-Saxon nation" prevailed (p. 15). Thus, statehood would not come for both until 1912.

In Part II, "Transformations: The First World War Era, 1917–1922," Noel highlights the effects of World War I on the United States and the encouragement of Mexican immigrant workers in the Southwest to assist in the war effort. She explains the contracts that summoned Mexican immigrant workers and required them to return after their contracts expired. Thus by 1921 white society's antagonistic attitude toward these "temporary workers" provided negative incentive for immigrants to remain. By classifying immigrants as temporary workers, they became marginalized as a working class, but also as individuals. Noel argues

that even the workers began considering themselves temporary workers, particularly because many came from the lower classes and lived in temporary or transient housing. Attitudes against temporary workers grew in the United States, and when Mexican president Alvaro Obregón's regime (1920–1924) encouraged workers to return to Mexico—and with them, their skills and knowledge for the Mexican state—workers felt both the push-and-pull factors to return home. In Part III, "Immigrant Restriction Debates, 1926–1930," Noel highlights the utilization of marginalization tactics on workers that developed out of the previous period, as a way to ensure that immigration would have little-to-no effect on national identity. Part IV, "Repatriation, 1930–1935"—the shortest segment by far—highlights the strong anti-immigrant attitudes that pervaded American society during the Great Depression. In all Noel aptly explains the four themes of exclusionism, assimilation, marginalization, and pluralism as a method to control immigration's effect on national identity during a time in which the United States entered the world stage in the Spanish American War and World War I.

Sandra Mathews
Lincoln, Nebraska

Burton Barr: Political Leadership and the Transformation of Arizona. By Philip R. VanderMeer. Foreword by Alfredo Gutierrez. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2014. xiv + 257 pp. 15 halftones, tables, notes, essay on sources, index. $40.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-3057-0.)

Ask who was the single most consequential politician of twentieth-century Arizona, and people might say Sen. Barry Goldwater, the driving force of conservatism; Sen. Carl Hayden, father of the Central Arizona Project; Sen. Ernest McFarland, sponsor of the G.I. Bill and Majority Leader of the U.S. Senate; or U.S. Rep. John Rhodes, Republican leader of the U.S. House. Arizona has not lacked for giants.

But on a state level, a strong case can be made for Burton Barr, who served twenty years as majority leader of the Arizona House of Representatives during a time of enormous growth and change. That Barr, who left the House in 1986 and died in 1997, is nearly forgotten, except for his name on the Phoenix Central Library, is an indication of Arizona's frantic population churn and political, social, and economic reshaping. Philip R. VanderMeer, an associate professor of history at Arizona State University, sets out to reclaim and understand Barr's reputation, success, and ultimate tragedy in *Burton Barr: Political Leadership and the Transformation of Arizona*.

VanderMeer is well-suited to the task. His *Desert Visions and the Making of Phoenix, 1860–2009* (2010) is the finest history we have of the nation's sixth-most populous city. This biography's foundation is a series of interviews conducted with many Arizona politicians and other leaders by the late Jack Pfister, who served fifteen years as general manager of the Salt River Project, and his colleague, Brent Brown. Pfister's intention was to write a history of Arizona politics but he died in 2009. The reader should know that Pfister and I were friends.

The biography traces Barr from his family's Eastern European Jewish roots to migration to the Pacific Northwest, Barr's combat service in World War II, and his move to Phoenix, where he became a successful salesman of fixtures to grocery stores, eventually establishing his own company. He ran as a Republican for the House in 1964 and became majority leader two years later.

Barr personified the shift of the legislature from rural to urban control with reapportionment following the Supreme Court's "One Man, One Vote" ruling (1964). More than any other lawmaker, Barr can be credited with moving through bills that modernized state government and addressed issues such as education, transportation, health care, and the environment.

He frequently worked with Democrats, notably Sen. Alfredo Gutierrez, the Democratic leader of the State Senate. Intelligent, witty, non-ideological, relentless, and an unapologetic dealmaker, Barr was also a mentor to countless lawmakers. Unfortunately, when Barr tried to run for governor in 1986, he was hobbled by a poorly-run campaign. More significantly the state had become much more conservative. As a dealmaker interested in getting things done through compromise, Barr made enemies in an increasingly rigid ideological party.

VanderMeer is not a stylist. His biography lacks sweep and verve. Instead, he is tightly focused and cautious in his conclusions. Those minor qualms aside, he has provided us with an invaluable contribution to Arizona and legislative history.

Jon Talton
Phoenix, Arizona

West Texas: A History of the Giant Side of the State. Edited by Paul H. Carlson and Bruce A. Glasrud. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2014. xii + 308 pp. 20 halftones, maps, selected bibliography, contributors, index. $19.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8061-4444-3.)

West Texas addresses a significant need in Texas historical literature and provides in one volume a set of original essays that address a wide range of the life, history, peoples, and place that make up the "giant side" of the Lone Star State. Given the richness and diversity of this region (or set of regions) of Texas, it is

surprising that there is no general history of West Texas, and that it has taken so long for a volume of essays like this to appear. Fortunately, Bruce Glasrud, Paul Carlson, and the other contributors who have assembled here do an excellent job of correcting this oversight.

For this volume, the editors define West Texas as the area west of a shallow-arced line stretching south-southwest from Wichita Falls on the Red River to Del Rio on the Rio Grande. The land encompassed is larger than many states, and contains such geographic diversity that it is subdivided into four subregions. The scope of the book is far-reaching, addressing the geological and geographic history, as well as the peoples who have settled and lived in the region from prehistoric times to the present. The book then addresses the political and economic history of West Texas before moving to the region's social and cultural history.

It is rare that an edited collection of essays exhibits a consistent theme. The authors and editors of this volume share a vision of West Texas combining the vastness of space that combines the arid plains with mountains and deserts to create a beauty persistent throughout the region and quite unique from that of East Texas and South Texas. Within this vast space a diverse people have created a prosperous economy, built cities and educational systems, and rich cultural and social institutions. Each aspect is addressed in one or more of this volume's eighteen essays. Although readers will not find a single narrative history of the western half of the state, they will achieve a much clearer understanding of this important region, its history, and its people, and discover in the well-crafted essays a Texas that extends far beyond the Alamo and San Jacinto, and one that is far removed from the economics and politics of east and central Texas that dominate most Texas histories. Carlson, Glasrud, and their team of contributors have crafted a fine book that broadens our understanding of Texas history by extending its boundaries. They have also challenged Texas historians to pay greater attention to the western part of the state and provided them with a set of essays that open the doors to a number of potential research topics that should stimulate more study and writing on this vibrant and historically rich section of the state.

Cary D. Wintz
Texas Southern University

Creating the American West: Boundaries and Borderlands. By Derek R. Everett. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2014. xv + 302 pp. 12 halftones, 17 maps, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4446-7.)

The now well-established turn to transnational history challenged the impor-

tance of national borders in limiting historical studies. This change revitalized the field of Borderlands history with global topics and settings. Derek R. Everett provides a thoughtful and engaging corrective to the location for the contested transnational spaces that the newer scholarship favors. He asserts that the internal organization of a nation may produce what he terms "intranational borderlands" (p. 221). Everett looks to the division of the lands of the United States beyond the Mississippi River that became territories and states as examples of this internalized boundary marking.

His chosen case studies demonstrate the local dynamics and national politics that ultimately resulted in the invisible state lines that travelers drive and fly across today. Each line seems to have its own distinct story with shifting applications of either geography—often in the form of rivers or mountains—or of geometry, in the form typically of latitudes and longitudes, to mark the proposed boundaries. How to carry out such demarcations started in the formative years of the new United States, but took on new meaning in the aftermath of the Louisiana Purchase in 1803. In this vast new region, state boundaries "introduced U.S. institutions into formerly foreign land for the first time and proved essential in its transformation into distinctly American territory" (p. 45). Yet, where to draw these new boundaries provided a series of problems and disputes. In the case of the western Arkansas boundary (see Chapter 3), Cherokees and Choctaws with treaties and petitions manipulated the proposed dividing line perhaps more expertly than the settlers and politicians in the new territory. Farther west, after the U.S.-Mexico War added more land to the national holdings, the southwestward pivot below Lake Tahoe for the line between California and Nevada had surprising consequences for the interests of the Mormon Church, mining magnates, and local communities.

At several points threats of secession or calls for the formation of a different state within a proposed state demonstrated the disaffection of various groups. These protests usually failed or we would now have, for example, the state of "San Juan", which was desired by mining interests in southern Colorado and some politicians in the town of Pueblo. These state-makers fancifully assumed that Hispanic residents artificially cut off from New Mexico would be supportive and could even make the case to incorporate land from northern New Mexico (pp. 180–81).

Everett recognizes that "Following a century of line-drawing since the early twentieth-century most Americans have accepted the existence of state boundaries with scarcely a thought" (p. 216). His book asks that we think again about how these lines were drawn and sets the stage for additional studies to determine what these boundaries do and do not create for peoples of the American West.

Clyde A. Milner II

Three Decades of Engendering History: Selected Works on Antonia I. Castañeda. Edited by Linda Heidenreich with Antonia I. Castañeda. Original Interviews by Luz María Gordillo and a conclusion by Deena J. González. Number 9 in the Al Filo: Mexican American Studies Series (Denton: University of North Texas Press, 2014. xiii + 452 pp. 14 halftones, map, permissions, acknowledgements, bibliography, index. $39.95 cloth, ISBN 978-1-57441-568-1.)

For many historians, including this reviewer, the works of Antonia I. Castañeda that take center stage in *Three Decades of Engendering History* made the study of Chicanas and Mexicanas not only feasible, but valid. Castañeda paved the road for future historians of Chicanas and Mexicanas by providing a framework with which to work from a historical perspective. Among the significant contributions of Antonia Castañeda was how she weaved the history of Chicanas and Mexicanas from women, gender, race, class, and regional analytical angles, thereby leaving a profound mark on the field. From California, to the Midwest, to Texas, Chicanas and Mexicanas were historical actors, shaped their local communities, and influenced national and transnational developments. The numerous articles and chapters published by Castañeda that appear in this book, together with candid *pláticas* (conversations) with Castañeda, form the bulk of this fine collection. Articles reprinted here such as "Sexual Violence in the Politics and Policies of Conquest" had a remarkable impact on the field and continue to be frequently cited. Castañeda revealed a hidden angle of women's history in the greater history of conquest and colonization. Further, her work as a whole importantly highlighted that, although new scholarship on women in the American West had broken with the usual male-centered historiography and had begun to acknowledge and promote a multicultural history of the region, Anglo and European American women were the standard by which Spanish, Mexican and Mexican American, Asian and Asian American, and indigenous women were to be measured. Castañeda rightly critiqued and challenged this assumption.

Her more recent scholarship centers on the little-known histories of women and lullabies, "Lullabies and Canciones de Cuna." Through thick description of lullabies that women passed down from generation to generation, Castañeda reminds us of the power of women's oral traditions and historical memories in encounters between varieties of cultures in multiple frontier and border regions. In Californiana Dorotea Valdez's words, despite "[having been] denied the privilege of mixing in politics or in business," because of her position as a woman, and while "[her] education has been very limited," she informed her interviewer, "my memory is good" (p. 356). Through the use of recorded interviews like Valdez's and oral lullabies, Castañeda recovers and repositions the

lives and historical experiences of women.

Especially welcomed are the rich interviews conducted by Luz María Gordillo that serve as guideposts for the reader, and the honest assessment of the future of the field from Deena González. This collection on Castañeda's work is a must-read for anyone examining the history of the greater U.S. West and its Borderlands, women and gender, and the greater Americas. In brief, the collection is timely, instructive, and inspirational. It allows students to access the critical works of Castañeda in one book. The useful introduction provided by Linda Heidenreich and the conversations between some of the key founders of Chicana history, including Emma Pérez, Deena González, and Antonia Castañeda, remind us of the real struggles, collective action, and passion for the study of long-ignored and historiographically absent communities that comprise the study of Chicana and Mexicana history. Although the field continues to grow and attract scholars from across the world, there is still much more to do. This collection will inspire many to continue to do, in Gloria Anzaldúa's words, the "work that matters—que vale la pena."

Sonia Hernández
Texas A&M University

Contingent Maps: Rethinking Western Women's History and the North American West. Edited by Susan E. Gray and Gayle Gullett. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2014. x + 302 pp. 12 halftones, map, editors and contributors, index. $40.00 paper, ISBN 978-0-8165-2889-9.)

In *Contingent Maps*, Susan E. Gray and Gayle Gullett offer a collection that enhances our understanding of race, gender, and place in the American West, revealing how Western women's history continues to be a vibrant—and vital—field. Challenging the "despair" among practitioners about the state of the field, Gray and Gullett advocate using place as a critical category of analysis. Drawing upon the work of feminist geographers, they define place "as a way of understanding" that is "created by an infinite variety of social relations" (p. 11). Focusing on how places are constantly evolving social constructions, they encourage readers to "think of place as a verb, as something that is performed, something that actively creates and maintains power relations" (p. 11). The ten essays included in the volume—all published previously in *Frontiers: A Journal of Women's Studies*, which Gray and Gullett co-edited—illuminate how places are always contingent; how diverse people negotiated and contested conquest, colonialism, and the effects of modernity; and how local and global networks

shape—and were informed by—place.

The chapters are divided into three thematic sections, each with a brief preface placing the chapters in conversation with one another. "Identities and Place" contains four chapters that take the reader from the Native American women's lodges of the Pacific Northwest to Angel Island to the clubs and courtrooms of Los Angeles to show how Native women, Japanese immigrants, cross-dressing Hollywood players, and World War II–era Pachucas crafted gendered and racialized identities, all while helping to "make" modern Western cities. The three essays that comprise "Colonized Places" address how race, gender, and myth-making undergirded colonial power in the West. Nostalgia for an "imagined" West obscured conquest, but also fed tourist fantasies. Contributions on Navajo weavers and Native American domestic servants particularly illuminate how women found creative ways to resist political and economic disenfranchisement, challenged the stereotypes that fueled a burgeoning tourism industry, and asserted a measure of agency over their lives and livelihoods. The final section, "Networks and Place," examines how modernity, industrial capitalism, and global migration facilitated the creation of broad social networks that challenged political, economic, and racial power. From the copper mines of Arizona to the garment industry of Los Angeles to the late-twentieth century San Antonio art scene, the three chapters in this section reveal that labor and community organizing moved fluidly between local interests and global forces and concerns for justice, and relied upon the connections forged in historically transnational places.

The individual chapters are fascinating in their own right, and the collection holds together surprisingly well, especially considering that these were originally stand-alone journal articles. This is accomplished through a strong introduction that clearly identifies the major themes in U.S. women's and Western history, and a detailed argument for the ways that place is a lens that offers new insights. The collection's ultimate strength rests in Gray's and Gullett's vision for the utility of place as an analytical tool, and in their careful selection of essays that thoughtfully incorporate this tool into their own work.

Monica Perales
University of Houston

The National Council on Indian Opportunity: Quiet Champion of Self-Determination. By Thomas A. Britten. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2014. ix + 337 pp. 22 halftones, maps, charts, tables, notes, works cited, index. $45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-5499-0.)

Thomas A. Britten's latest book dramatically reintroduces historians, and the

nation, to both the existence and importance of the short-lived National Council on Indian Opportunity (NCIO). Britten argues convincingly that the NCIO made significant contributions to Native American culture during its existence between 1968 and 1974. These contributions included aiding Native and federal efforts toward Native American self-determination; access to federal aid programs; assisting in Native acquisitions of grants, loans, and jobs; land restitution, betterment of reservation housing and economic development; the provisioning of information through conferences and workshops; and, most importantly, the end of the failed termination policies.

The NCIO had its beginnings on 6 March 1968 when Pres. Lyndon B. Johnson issued Congress the first executive message that solely addressed Native American affairs. That same day, the president issued Executive Order 11399 that established the NCIO. The council consisted of seven cabinet secretaries, six hand-picked Native American members, and the vice president of the United States. The council's primary goals included coordinating agency cooperation for Native Americans to better access federal programs and services, and then appraising these programs and suggesting improvements. However, Britten notes that as part of LBJ's "Great Society" efforts, the NCIO came "about five years too late" (p. 9). Interest and optimism concerning such efforts had already waned as similar programs had failed and the war in Vietnam tainted government efforts elsewhere.

The NCIO faced further obstacles as it sought to fulfill its objectives. These included an entrenched Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) bureaucracy that stringently resisted any efforts that infringed on its perceived control of Native American affairs. Moreover, the original mandate of the council was to address reservation-based problems. But the reality of a large non-reservation urban population of Native Americans led quickly to a broader strategic effort. The council also faced significant challenges when it came to funding and leadership turnover. LBJ's decision not to run in 1968 and the victory of Richard Nixon created instability in council leadership. Despite these obstacles, Britten convincingly argues that the NCIO proved surprisingly effective. It brought Native Americans into the national decision-making process concerning their own goals and interests and how best to address the achievement of those goals.

Perhaps most importantly, Britten engages with the larger issues of colonialism. Placed in the larger colonial context, the NCIO can be seen as an effort to "fix" the inherent reservation problems of poverty, substance abuse, and violence, but to do so from a distinctly Anglo perspective. The symptoms of colonialism were to be cured, but the larger causes of land deprivation, and political, economic, and social disenfranchisement and alienation were ignored. Britten also discusses the possibility of the federal government "co-opting" Native American issues in order to blunt more radical strategies for self-determination. The author correctly con-

cludes that LBJ and his administrator's goals were not about "co-optation." These men were products of their time, which translated into providing greater opportunities for Native Americans. As such they perhaps hoped to cure the ills associated with being a Native American in these United States.

Jeff Means
University of Wyoming

Life among the Indians: First Fieldwork among the Sioux and Omahas. By Alice C. Fletcher. Edited and with an introduction by Joanna C. Scherer and Raymond J. DeMallie. Studies in the Anthropology of North American Indians Series. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2013. xii + 418 pp. 13 halftones, 37 line drawings, map, musical examples, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. $65.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8032-4115-2.)

Meeting Omahas Suzette La Flesche and her brother Francis in 1879 when they accompanied Ponca Chief Standing Bear to Boston fueled aspiring and pioneering ethnographer Alice Fletcher to begin her Native fieldwork. Especially interested in Native women, in September 1881 Fletcher arrived at the Omaha Reservation in Nebraska. Accompanied by La Flesche, her husband Thomas Tibbles and a small tribal party, Fletcher headed north for the Spotted Tail Agency, Dakota Territory. Fletcher stayed one week and upon receiving Hunkpapa Sitting Bull's surprise invitation, she detoured east to Fort Randall military post, where Sitting Bull was unjustly held under house arrest. Fletcher returned to the Omaha Reservation in November 1881 and remained there for months with La Flesche's family, the household of Joseph La Flesche.

Five years later, in 1886, Fletcher commenced writing a lively, first-hand account narrative of her time among Lakotas and Omahas. She relied closely on her extensive field notes and diaries and believed that Charles Scribner's Sons was interested in publishing her story. She revised the manuscript in 1887 but for unclear reasons neither Scribner's nor any company published it. Fletcher wrote *Life among the Indians* for a non-Native audience with the primary purpose to challenge widespread Native stereotypes. Always the ethnographer, Fletcher included rich Lakota and Omaha cultural details, and as an Indian reformer, she rebuked Indian agency treatment of Natives. She divided *Life among the Indians* into two halves: "Camping with the Sioux" (fourteen chapters); and "The Omahas at Home" (twelve chapters).

Fletcher presents only Lakota accounts in Part One, primarily from her week at the Spotted Tail Agency, but she also adds an Elk dreamer performance and Ghost Lodge ceremony she witnessed at the Pine Ridge Agency on a separate

June 1882 trip. On the same trip Fletcher again visited Sitting Bull's camp at Fort Randall, where spiritual leaders shared parts of a White Buffalo Ceremony. Part Two lacks the travel drama and ceremonies of the Lakota chapters, and Fletcher instead emphasizes the domestic Omaha reservation life she witnessed among one faction: the educated, pro-allotment La Flesche family.

Fletcher's field notes and diaries from 1881–1882 are likely the more important scholarly resources, but *Life among the Indians* deserves attention because it reveals her empathy, sense of humor, and self-deprecating qualities: virtues which endeared her to Native people. And unlike her formal anthropological writings, Fletcher took liberties to write as an attached observer, emphasizing human interest stories important to her and her Native informants.

Life among the Indians also reflects her early anthropological maturation. By 1886 and 1887 she was six years removed from her first fieldwork. She had started to understand her own Eurocentric biases, and had embarked on her life-long and incomplete journey to understand the wisdom of Native cultures. The last three chapters address Fletcher and Omaha allotment, and these preface her primary failing, which was not about anthropology, but policy. Fletcher ignored tribal allotment critics, who understood that federal Indian land policies were always about stealing tribal lands. Like many Fletcher thought she knew better, and that was tragic indeed.

Dennis J. Smith
University of Nebraska, Omaha

American Carnage: Wounded Knee, 1890. By Jerome A. Greene, foreword by Thomas Powers. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2014. xviii + 599 pp. 48 halftones, maps, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. $34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4448-1.)

American Carnage provides the most thorough examination to date of the Wounded Knee massacre and the month that preceded it. It falls between the works of Jeffrey Ostler and Heather Cox Richardson, on the one hand, and Robert Utley, on the other hand, in assessing blame. Unlike the former, Greene seems to accept that the U.S. Army's deployment was inevitable given the dynamics of representative but racially-delimited democracy. He follows Ostler in recognizing the peaceful intent of the Sioux Ghost Dance and the hunger that drove Sioux unrest, and credits Nelson A. Miles for seeking a bloodless resolution. Greene carefully traces the process of uncertainty, misperception, and miscommunication that culminated in what he variously labels a massacre, a mass killing, and a "deadly riot" by the soldiers, echoing to my mind the "police riots"

of the 1960s (p. 233). Greene generally follows military accounts, to the point of reporting that several Sioux revealed hidden weapons after the first shot was accidently fired in a scuffle with a deaf warrior, whereupon the army opened fire. This fire quickly "ceased to be defensive," evolving "into purposeful yet indiscriminate killing" as "all personal constraint and self-possession fell away" (p. 234). Although he maintains that the search for Sioux weapons was "carefully controlled," Greene appears sympathetic to Miles's condemnation of Col. James Forsyth's conduct of the attempt to disarm the Sioux, and he follows Ostler in condemning the army's support for Forsyth (p. 225).

A chapter based on Sioux testimonies concludes that "discrepancies between army and Indian accounts mainly concern the outbreak of the shooting" (whether warriors were armed or revealed their arms), and quotes a Sioux blaming the deaf warrior and an agitated medicine man for precipitating the firing, but the soldiers "for wanton killing" (p. 287). Combined with "deadly riot," the latter term seems the most accurate depiction of what the soldiers did. Thus, although the circumstances were different from the intentional massacres at Bear River, Sand Creek, or the Marias River, the outcome was "practically identical" (p. 379). Page 378 presents several apt conclusions: "Strategic failure occurred…in misidentifying a need for troops;" and "No premeditated intent seems to have existed." Though the soldiers were not intoxicated, many were untrained, and "the critical tactical failure lay in permitting the Indians to break through the soldier cordon," which led to chaos at close quarters, a loss of control by the officers (some of whom, I would say, do not seem to have tried very hard), and the beginning of indiscriminate killing.

As one expects from Greene, the strength of *American Carnage* lies in meticulous detail, providing the widest range of primary source evidence, particularly from personal papers. However, many readers may reject the implication that the Sioux brought on the shooting. Ultimately, even his comprehensive detail ends in uncertainty: "why it happened at all will probably remain unresolved"—a testament to the complexity of the tragedy (p. 380). No matter the true reason, the result was "an unchecked and devastating slaughter of innocents" (p. 271).

Samuel Watson
United States Military Academy