

# New Mexico Historical Review

---

Volume 56 | Number 1

Article 5

---

1-1-1981

## Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

---

### Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 56, 1 (1981). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol56/iss1/5>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact [amywinter@unm.edu](mailto:amywinter@unm.edu), [lsloane@salud.unm.edu](mailto:lsloane@salud.unm.edu), [sarahrk@unm.edu](mailto:sarahrk@unm.edu).

## BOOK NOTES

Recent reprints from the University of Oklahoma Press include *John Selman, Gunfighter* by Leon C. Metz (cloth, \$9.95) and *Victorio and the Mimbres Apaches* by Dan L. Thrapp (paper, \$9.95). Selman, who gained notoriety for killing John Wesley Hardin, was active in southern New Mexico and west Texas and was later killed in El Paso. Thrapp's highly regarded study of Victorio is a welcome addition to the paperback list because it is well written, thoroughly researched, and well illustrated, the latter reflecting Thrapp's interest in visiting important sites covered in his narrative.

The University of Texas Press has begun reprinting in paper the writings of J. Frank Dobie, one of the giants in southwestern literature. Two titles are *Tongues of the Monte* (\$6.95) and *A Texan in England* (\$6.95). The former is on the folklore and folkways of northern Mexico, an area that Dobie knew intimately. The latter is an often humorous account of his stint as a visiting professor at Cambridge University in England. Both are typical of Dobie's work.

The University of Texas Press, the University of New Mexico Press, and other publishers have demonstrated increased interest in reprinting important works of western fiction. Three new titles in the Zia Series of the University of New Mexico Press are *Go In Beauty* (paper, \$5.95) and *Portrait of an Artist with Twenty-Six Horses* (paper, \$5.95) by William Eastlake and *Little Valley* by Raymond Otis (paper, \$5.95). *Go In Beauty*, published in 1956, was Eastlake's first novel and is largely set in New Mexico. An afterword by Delbert E. Wylder provides an evaluation of the book. *Portrait of an Artist with Twenty-Six Horses* appeared in 1963 to critical acclaim and received the Lettres Nouvelles award as the best foreign-language novel published in France in 1972. Set in the checkerboard area of northwestern New Mexico it forms a trilogy with *Go In Beauty* and *The Bronc People*.

*Little Valley*, set in early twentieth-century Santa Fe and small Hispanic villages to the north, was originally published in England, although Otis was a member of Santa Fe's literary community in the 1930s. As Marta Weigle states in her afterword, this is an important social document as well as a well-crafted novel. *The Wind* by Dorothy Scarborough (cloth, \$10.95, University of Texas Press) caused considerable controversy when published in 1925 because of the portrayal of the tragedy, hardship, and loneliness of a woman's life in west Texas. By contrast *The Wolf and the Buffalo* by Elmer Kelton (Doubleday, cloth, \$12.95) is a modern novel set on the southern plains in which a Comanche warrior and a former slave turned soldier are the main characters.

A book that deals with western literature and writers is *Will James: The Last Cowboy Legend* by Anthony Amaral (University of Nevada Press, cloth, n.p.) which is a revised edition of a book published in 1967. James, who had been a working cowhand, became a famous artist and a writer of *Smoky, The Cowhorse, Scorpion, A Good Bad Horse*, and a number of other books dealing with the part of the West that James knew best.

# Book Reviews

SUPPLEMENT OF A BIBLIOGRAPHY OF UNITED STATES LATIN AMERICAN RELATIONS SINCE 1810. Edited by Michael C. Meyer. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1979. Pp. xxvi, 193. Index, \$19.50.

THE RESEARCHER AND TEACHER will happily welcome this up-dating of Trask, Meyer, and Trask, *Bibliography*, now a dozen years old. The two Trasks having gone on to other fields, Professor Meyer compiled the *Supplement* without their help.

The functions and formats of the two volumes are the same and—wisely—even the main section headings have the same titles and cover the same periods.

But the few changes are important; Chapter X—"The United States and Latin America since World War II"—has been expanded to include the Johnson, Nixon, and Ford administrations. Most welcome to this reviewer, and probably to most users, is a new subsection in this same chapter labeled "Dependency and Multinational Corporations," covering some eighty entries. Chapter XI now includes a section on the "Law of the Sea." These are the most significant changes from the original volume.

Otherwise the justification for a supplement is to add the materials published since 1968; but Meyer has gone beyond the call of duty and picked up a large number of works that escaped the first bibliography. Casual checking indicates that this is a sizable group. He should also be applauded for *cross-referencing* the new work to items in the old, a challenging task.

Complaints about this work really should not be mentioned—a very few typos at most. And I note with a sigh that the original sold for \$14.95 while the supplement, at less than half the size, sells for \$19.50. But buy the book anyhow; you need it.

Arizona State University

THOMAS L. KARNES

NATIONAL PARKS: THE AMERICAN EXPERIENCE. By Alfred Runte. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1979. Pp. xiv, 240. Illus., index. \$16.50.

WITH THIS BOOK Alfred Runte lifts the history of a unique American institution to a new level. Much of the previous writing about national park history has been legislative and administrative. One thinks of John Ise's *Our National Park Policy: A Critical History* (1961). In organizing his account on a park-by-park

and director-by-director basis, Ise often missed the significance of his subject. Runte, on the other hand, prefers to write intellectual or cultural history. His subject is the meaning of national parks in the American context and how that meaning has changed over time.

Three of Runte's generalizations stand out as major interpretative contributions. While he does not present entirely new ideas, Runte is adroit at building evidence for them from national park history. The first is *monumentalism*. Runte argues that the early parks were not valued for their ecological significance so much as for their status as monuments of national pride. Thus the early preservation efforts focused exclusively on the spectacular in nature—deep canyons, high mountains, long waterfalls, huge trees, and unique geysers. The point was to impress the world by finding in America's nature the equivalent of Europe's admittedly superior culture.

The "*worthless*" *lands* thesis is arguably Runte's most original idea. He puts forth convincing evidence that the United States Congress (expressing the dominant view of the people) gave national park status only to land that had no economic potential. The Yellowstone region, for example, was declared to be too high and cold for agriculture and therefore "safe" to make a park. Corn was also hard to grow in the Grand Canyon, but the Colorado River did have hydropower potential and, Runte explains, Congress left a neat loophole in the 1919 establishing legislation permitting such development. Hetch Hetchy Valley was actually removed from Yosemite National Park (1913) when demanded by San Francisco as a reservoir. With reference to the continuation of mining in some parks and monuments, Runte points out that many Americans still feel uncomfortable about permanently protecting what might make a dollar. But the defeat in the 1960s of dams proposed for the Grand Canyon suggests the growth in public esteem of an alternate point of view.

Runte's third interpretative tool is *carnivalism*. He contends that the typical early visitor, along with national park leaders, looked upon the parks as resorts and circuses rather than as preserves of unmodified nature. Not only hotels but golf courses, tennis courts, swimming pools, and ski tows appeared in the parks. As late as 1945 bears were fed with hotel garbage in Yellowstone National Park as tourists watched the spectacle from a specially constructed grandstand. The "firefall," a huge bonfire pushed over the cliffs into Yosemite Valley, continued until 1969. By this time, however, new conceptions of what national parks should be and how they should be operated were gaining ground. Runte traces the emergence of a biocentric, as opposed to anthropocentric, philosophy of park management and concludes his book with a discussion of park "purists" such as Edward Abbey.

Several excellent folios of illustrations and detailed footnotes add much to the value of this major contribution to American environmental and cultural history.

*University of California, Santa Barbara*

RODERICK NASH

THE SOUTHWEST. By David Lavender. A Regions of America Book. New York: Harper and Row, 1980. Pp. 352. Bibliog., index. \$15.95.

DAVID LAVENDER'S *Southwest* takes its place alongside four other single-volume surveys of the region that have appeared in the last two decades: W. Eugene Hollon's *The Southwest: Old and New* (1961); Odie B. Faulk's *Land of Many Frontiers* (1968); Lynn Perrigo's *The American Southwest* (1971); and D. W. Meinig's *Southwest* (1971). This naturally begs a question. Did we need another one-volume synthesis? Lavender demonstrates that we did.

In clear and colorful prose, which seldom drifts into the purple range of the spectrum, Lavender summarizes the high points of regional history from prehistoric times to the present. Like geographer Meinig, Lavender defines the Southwest as Arizona and New Mexico (no matter that the dust jacket blurb suggests a broader canvas). In this respect, Lavender's *Southwest* is more restricted than Perrigo's and Faulk's, which included Texas and California, and Hollon's, which embraced Oklahoma as well as Texas. Lavender touches on events beyond New Mexico and Arizona only when they illuminate his main subject, and this affords him space to portray the region in rich but never excessive detail. He provides sharp characterizations of major figures and examines questions that other general surveys either omit or gloss over—such as how New Mexico lost southern Colorado, and how Arizona got its name.

Author of twenty-one previous books, most touching on some aspect of regional history, Lavender knows his craft and has steeped himself in the historical literature. He summarizes the results of recent scholarship and provides a balanced and sensitive look at some of the region's most controversial issues—those dealing with Indians, Mexican-Americans, the Mexican-United States border, aridity, and violence. If his treatment of the twentieth century is light, so is the scholarly literature on which he had to depend. Nonetheless, Lavender carries several important themes down to the 1970s and occasionally links the distant past to the present, as with his description of the role of the statue of "La Conquistadora" in the Pueblo Revolt of 1680 and its contemporary annual pilgrimages to the chapel of El Rosario in Santa Fe.

As might be expected in an undocumented narrative aimed at a popular audience, description and anecdote often prevail over analysis. Lavender does not romanticize the region, however, and asks hard questions. He wonders, for example, why Jesuit Eusebio Francisco Kino has achieved such fame while other missionaries toiled in obscurity, and concludes that Americans could identify with Kino, who was "the epitome of expansionism, and Anglo-Americans have never known any other approach to the frontier" (p. 68). Lavender does not shy away from describing bats in the churches as well as ornaments, or from debunking New Mexico's famed Civil War Battle of Glorieta as of little significance. Along the way he makes mistakes, but except for his sloppy handling of the Spanish language, these are perhaps inevitable in a work of this scope.

*The Southwest* may stand for the 1980s as the most detailed, balanced, and in-

teresting introduction to the last four-and-a-half centuries of man's recorded activities in New Mexico and Arizona.

*Southern Methodist University*

DAVID J. WEBER

THE AMERICAN INDIAN: PREHISTORY TO THE PRESENT. By Arrell Morgan Gibson. Lexington, Mass.: D. C. Heath & Company, 1980. Pp. 618. Illus., notes, index, glossary. \$14.95.

PROFESSOR GIBSON of the University of Oklahoma, author of numerous works on the American Indian, has sought "to present a resource for courses and studies in American Indian history and to provide timely information and useful interpretation to the general public." This is a traditional history, chronologically organized, which seeks to incorporate something about all periods and all tribes in 618 pages. The first five chapters provide an ethnographic overview derived from published anthropological surveys. The next five chapters recount the contact of Spain, France, Holland, Russia, and Great Britain with the Indians. There follows a series of chapters largely concerned with U. S. involvement with the Indians, organized by period. The last two chapters deal with "Native Americans in the Twentieth Century, 1945 to the Present" and "The Indian Legacy."

The encyclopedic character of the work may meet the needs of some college courses but must be disheartening to the casual reader. Because of the attempt to be all-inclusive, important events are given short shrift. For example, the Indian wars of Virginia in the period of Bacon's Rebellion are dealt with in seven lines. King Philip's War is dealt with in two pages and described as a "conspiracy" under the heading: "The Indian Revolt of 1675." Throughout the book Gibson is forced to depend upon the research of others, and it is not surprising that he cannot go into detail about the opposing interpretations of virtually every aspect of Indian-white interaction. Perhaps this is not a criticism of the author so much as it is of the textbook format within which the author is constrained to write.

Each chapter concludes with a short bibliography and a few footnotes, but the bulk of the writing is unfootnoted and derived from general study of the various sources. While the coverage is comprehensive, Gibson goes into particular detail on the history of Indian-white relations in the Plains, and particularly Oklahoma. Emphasis is also given to warfare rather than to other forms of interaction between whites and Indians, and to the recent past in comparison with the distant past.

Although his work is primarily descriptive, Gibson is not unwilling to express his own point of view about the characters in the drama of Indian-white relations. Thus, in speaking about the non-Indian citizens and leaders in the new state of Oklahoma, he notes that "They were racist, ethnocentric, and contemptuous of Indians and indifferent to their plight" (p. 508). In speaking of Indian traders he notes that "Frontier traders were scoundrels of the first order. However, colonial Carolinians seemed particularly depraved, surpassing all

wilderness merchants except perhaps the Russian *promyshlenniki* for vicious exploitation, sharp practice, malicious cheating, and consistently callous treatment of Native Americans" (p. 211).

A helpful "glossary" provides a useful way in which the student can keep some of the special terms involved in Indian history easily in mind. The illustrations are plentiful and well selected. In sum, Gibson's book is a useful addition to the number of potential texts available to the student of Indian history.

*Office of American Studies,  
Smithsonian Institution*

WILCOMB E. WASHBURN

AMERICAN INDIAN ARCHERY. By Reginald and Gladys Laubin. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1980. Pp. xii, 179. Illus., notes, glossary, bibliog., index. \$12.50.

AMERICAN INDIAN ARCHERY is a profusely illustrated and lovingly written guide to a poorly understood yet important subject. As the author explains in the introduction, "I have always been interested in Indian archery myself and have found most of the popular conceptions about it to be erroneous, as are most of the preconceived notions about Indians, [and] I would like to correct some of the false impressions and try to give a true picture of this ancient art as practiced by most of our original Americans." Accordingly, the author presents a quick overview of the history of Indian archery before launching into chapters that discuss Indian bows, bow making, sinewed bows, horn bows, strings, arrows, quivers, shooting, medicine bows, crossbows, and blowguns. Since the author is an avid devotee of Indian arts and crafts, each chapter is literally a step-by-step manual on the art of bow making, arrow making, and the like. Interspersed with the practical do's and do not's are bits of Indian lore, anthropology, and history such as "Coronado reported bone arrowheads for the Pueblo tribes" (p. 124); "the final touch to an arrow to be used for hunting buffalo was to ceremonially smear it with buffalo blood" (p. 117); and "Le Page du Pratz said the Natchez made bows of acacia, first with bark strings, later with strings of hide" (p. 21).

The author and his wife travelled extensively here and abroad to examine museum collections of Indian bows, arrows, and related materials in order to form educated opinions about their manufacture, diversity, and utility. Their conclusion is that most aspects of American Indian archery are unappreciated, a result of inaccurate and misinformed writing on the subject. They have found Indian archery tackle to be equal to, if not better than, modern, machine-made equipment.

This book is difficult to evaluate, especially in the framework of the traditional review, because it is primarily a highly personalized presentation of facts and stories about Indian archery. The drawings are by the author; the photographs for the most part are by his wife. All the archery tackle illustrated, most of which the author made, comes from his personal collection. (A few photographs from specimens in museum collections would have been instructive as well as interest-

ing.) The writing is generally clear and straightforward, but the constant insertion of extraneous facts and asides tends to distract rather than instruct. Some of this material, in fact, seems to serve little purpose other than to flesh out what would otherwise have been rather thin chapters.

Nevertheless, the book will find a receptive audience. One of the first efforts to assemble a fact book on the subject, it will doubtless be welcomed by those devotees of Indian arts and crafts who are anxious to learn something about the Indian use of archery tackle, the ingenuity needed for its manufacture and care, and the place it occupied in aboriginal daily life. They will indeed, as the author believes, "find new, valuable, and important information between these covers" (p. ix).

*Smithsonian Institution*

HERMAN J. VIOLA

CIVILIZATION AND THE STORY OF THE ABSENTEE SHAWNEES. By Thomas Wildcat Alford. Foreword by Angie Debo. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1979. Pp. 203. Illus. \$5.95.

ORIGINALLY PUBLISHED in 1936, this volume contains the reminiscences of Thomas Wildcat Alford, a mixed-blood Shawnee born in Indian Territory in 1860. Although the volume is subtitled *The Story of the Absentee Shawnees*, it does not focus upon the history of these people, but is a biographical statement describing Alford's boyhood experiences, his attendance at Hampton Institute, and his efforts to bring "civilization" to his fellow tribesmen. Alford's narrative is burdened with numerous personal incidents of little interest to serious scholars, but the volume is valuable for other reasons. His early chapters offer an interesting description of Shawnee culture in the third quarter of the nineteenth century. In addition, the text illustrates that Alford was a successful product of the government's program of forced acculturation, for he wholly subscribed to the White value system.

Alford spent his childhood in a Shawnee society that retained much of its traditional culture. As a boy, Alford was carried on a cradle-board, spoke only Shawnee, and shared a wigwam with other members of his family. His narrative provides an informative discussion of the Shawnee social system and indicates that the Absentee Shawnees still clung to the old ways, preparing traditional foods and performing the ceremonies of their fathers. Like other Shawnee boys, Alford spent long hours in the forest, passing through a puberty rite that confirmed his place as a Shawnee warrior. Although he attended a mission school near Shawnee, Oklahoma, he remained tied to many tribal ways and had only a limited knowledge of the world outside the Shawnee community.

In 1879 Alford was enrolled in Hampton Institute, and after graduating from the school, he dedicated himself toward bringing the White man's "civilization" to his people. He returned to Indian Territory and served as a schoolmaster at the Shawnee Boarding School where, in addition to academic subjects, he taught his pupils "the very rudiments of civilization . . . such simple things as the use of



chairs to sit on, the correct way to eat at a table, the use of knives and forks, and the care of their beds such as spreading sheets properly" (p. 126). Thoroughly convinced that the Dawes Act would be beneficial to his people, Alford later served with the surveying crews that allotted the Shawnee and Kickapoo lands.

As Angie Debo points out in the introduction to this volume, Alford's outspoken support of White cultural values would make him unpopular in most modern Indian communities. But the volume offers interesting insights into the world-view of those native Americans who accepted a life-style dictated by the White majority. Of course most tribesmen refused such acculturation, yet Alford's narrative serves as a revealing statement for that minority of Indian people who willingly chose to walk the White man's road.

*Texas Christian University*

R. DAVID EDMUNDS

*LIFE OF GEORGE BENT: WRITTEN FROM HIS LETTERS.* By George E. Hyde. Edited by Savoie Lottinville. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1968. Reprint 1979. Pp. xxv, 389. Illus., maps, bibliog., index. \$14.50, \$6.95 paper.

*THE LIFE OF GEORGE BENT* covers the years of 1826 to 1875 in the life of the half-Cheyenne and half-white son of Owl Woman and William Bent. His mother was a daughter of White Thunder, Keeper of the Cheyenne Sacred Arrows. His father was a co-founder of Bent's Fort located on the Upper Arkansas River in Colorado. George was among the earliest of individuals of dual Cheyenne-white heritage, but who throughout this book closely identified, in his words, with, "My People, the Cheyennés." He was sent to school in Missouri where he became proficient in the English language. He fought in the Confederate Army, and upon returning to Colorado, he went to live with the Cheyennes to escape Union sympathizers.

George Bent presents brief but valuable historical and cultural information on the tribes in precontact times. He also details the Cheyenne experience in the loss of their Sacred Arrows, and presents a Cheyenne perspective of Sand Creek, the Washita, Adobe Walls, and numerous other incidents of tribal-white conflict, which serve to balance the usual white view of Cheyenne history. The book is a well written narrative, which is occasionally interspersed with Cheyenne terminology that leaves the average reader baffled, but which lends to its authenticity. The value of the book lies in the unique first person presentation of the dual world of George Bent, who uses the literate tools of his white ancestry to convey the too often untold experiences of his Cheyenne heritage.

*The Life of George Bent* is highly interesting and informative. It presents ethnohistory from an experiential standpoint, teaching much of Cheyenne tribal society and their struggle to maintain their identity as a people. It is an important work for those interested in Cheyennes, Indian history, and the American West.

*University of Montana, Missoula*

HENRI(ETTA) WHITEMAN

THE PEACE CHIEFS OF THE CHEYENNES. By Stan Hoig. Foreword by Boyce Timmons. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1980. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. Pp. xiv, 206. \$14.95.

STAN HOIG HAS PRESENTED here a different image of the Cheyenne Indians than one probably has retained through the years from the classic portrayal by George Bird Grinnell in *The Fighting Cheyennes*. The Cheyenne chief was "essentially a man of peace," (p. 8) while the war societies provided an outlet for the aggressiveness of the young men. These societies often wrested tribal leadership from control of the peace chiefs.

While the author centers his discussion around famous chiefs of the early and late nineteenth century of both Southern and Northern Cheyenne, he uses that method as a vehicle to summarize briefly the entire story of the Cheyenne from the earliest mention of them by French explorers in the Minnesota region in 1667 to near the end of the nineteenth century when the reservation period began. He also mentions the battles in which they were involved.

One often notes what seems a contradiction, as in the case of Yellow Wolf who was killed at Sand Creek, in that Hoig calls him a prominent "warrior, chief and tribal elder" (p. 27) but maintains that he "sought to keep the Cheyenne nation at peace with the whites" (p. 27). This, however, only repeats Hoig's thesis that although a man rose to prominence as a warrior, once he became chief, his age and wisdom generally caused him to urge peace with the whites who overwhelmingly outnumbered the Indians. In fact, a Cheyenne could not retain membership in a war society once he became chief. All the great chiefs are included—Black Kettle, Bull Bear, Dull Knife, Little Wolf, Stone Calf—and many more.

The Cheyenne split into three bands, the Northern, Southern, and the war-like dog soldiers in the central area. Young hostiles from the two peaceful tribes joined the dog soldiers. The warrior societies gained dominance, and the peace chiefs could not control them. The chieftain system had no machinery to enforce laws or discipline within the tribe. The United States government could not always control the actions of its soldiers and citizens on the frontier. Often the peace chiefs "perished in the resulting crossfire" (p. 121).

A note of sadness naturally prevails in that many peace chiefs perished accidentally and unnecessarily at the hands of whites. The last peace leaders then brought their people to the final unhappy acceptance of reservation life and at least a partial walking of the white man's road.

The author brings together well much scattered information from both published accounts and primary sources about the various Cheyenne chiefs. He relies a great deal on Grinnell and others but uses many contemporary newspapers, written reminiscences, and reports of the commissioner of Indian Affairs. While the author advances his thesis numerous times throughout the book, he fails to take the opportunity in the last chapter to tie together his numerous points in a satisfactory concluding paragraph or longer essay.

THE NEW DEAL AND AMERICAN INDIAN TRIBALISM: THE ADMINISTRATION OF THE INDIAN REORGANIZATION ACT, 1934-1945. By Graham D. Taylor. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1980. Pp. xiii, 203. Notes, bibliog., appendixes, index. \$14.50.

GRAHAM D. TAYLOR, an assistant professor of history at Dalhousie University in Canada, has written an important book about the Indian New Deal. In the first three chapters, the author surveys the consequences of land allotment, the origins of the new Indian reform movement during the 1920s, and the controversy over the Wheeler-Howard bill. The rest of this volume details the impact of the 1934 Indian Reorganization Act on tribal political organization and the development of Indian economic resources.

The main thesis of Graham's book is that the Indian Reorganization Act was flawed by its reliance on tribal organization to promote Indian social and economic development. Commissioner John Collier and his associates falsely concluded that tribes were unified political entities capable of directing Indian aspirations. Instead, factional division characterized tribal life. Internal disunity stemmed from wide variations in acculturation, mixed versus full blood rivalry, religious and cultural differences, and economic conflict where small groups of individuals monopolized reservation resources.

The Indian Reorganization Act intensified this factionalism. Bitter disputes arose among the Blackfeet, Hopi, Minnesota Chippewas, and Pine Ridge Sioux over who would control their new tribal governments. Centralized tribal governments were met with suspicion throughout the Southwest where they threatened the local autonomy of the village or band.

According to Taylor, the Indian New Deal fell short of its proclaimed goal of guaranteeing internal tribal sovereignty. Tribal governments organized under the Indian Reorganization Act were given only a minimal amount of fiscal responsibility. Constitutions and charters of incorporation contained legal provisions that subjected important council decisions to administrative review. Concerned about advancing the Indians' economic recovery, Indian Bureau officials continued to supervise closely the expenditure of tribal funds and the granting of loans from the IRA's revolving credit fund.

The failure to establish tribal organizations that had widespread community support undercut the economic programs favored by the Department of the Interior. Land consolidation on checkerboarded reservations faltered because only a small number of Indians voluntarily placed their allotments and heirship lands under tribal control. Furthermore, Congress refused to fund adequately the IRA land purchase program or implement regional land use plans based on surveys undertaken by the Soil Conservation Service and the Bureau of Indian Affairs.

The value of this book lies in its critical assessment of the organization of tribal governments created during the 1930s. Unfortunately, Graham has generally limited his discussion to the Southwestern and Plains Indians. Separate chapters on the administration of the Oklahoma Indian Welfare Act and the Alaska Reorganization Act of 1936 would have strengthened the author's arguments.

The analysis of the economics of the Indian New Deal also is incomplete. We need more information about the success or failure of tribal business cooperatives and credit associations, the activities of the Arts and Crafts Board established by Congress in 1935, the cattle repayment program, and the efforts to manage Indian forests and mineral deposits.

On the whole, Taylor's book is soundly researched and attractively written. It is a welcome addition to the growing historical literature critical of Commissioner John Collier and the Indian New Deal.

*University of Texas, Arlington*

KENNETH R. PHILP

THE COMMISSIONERS OF INDIAN AFFAIRS, 1824-1977. Edited by Robert M. Kvasnicka and Herman J. Viola. Foreword by Philleo Nash. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1979. Pp. xviii, 384. Notes, bibliog., index. \$19.75.

FROM JOHN C. CALHOUN'S CREATION of the Bureau of Indian Affairs in March 1824, to Benjamin Reifel's resignation on the eighth day of the Carter administration, forty-three men have served as head of the Indian service, and all but two of them formally as the Commissioner of Indian Affairs. (At present the duties of the commissioner are being performed by an assistant secretary of the interior for Indian affairs. But as Philleo Nash, former Indian commissioner under Presidents Kennedy and Johnson, writes in his foreword to this volume, the increased status of an assistant secretary of the interior may be only a symbolic victory.) The nature of this most difficult job, whether as commissioner or assistant secretary, remains unchanged.

Just as in the past, even though Indian policy continues to be developed, challenged, and amended by the various branches of government and by the tribes themselves, the commissioners of Indian affairs have figured prominently not only in the execution of policy but also in its formulation—in the negotiations of treaties, the settlement of claims, and a host of other matters. Many of the commissioners were men possessed of high idealism, while a few were rogues. Many reflected the ethnocentrism of their times and regarded Indian cultures as vestiges of a barbarous state of civilization that would quickly succumb to an enlightened and muscular Christian stewardship. All, regardless of their training or temperament, had to swim through the maelstrom of "Indian affairs."

A few of the commissioners have received considerable scholarly attention, but now Robert M. Kvasnicka and Herman J. Viola have brought together in a single volume biographical sketches of each commissioner, arranged chronologically, and written by thirty one of the leading scholars of Native American history.

The sketches vary in length and detail, in part because of the sparseness of available sources for some of the early commissioners. Most of the sketches are between five and seven pages of text and highlight the commissioners' careers in and out of government service. An author's note on sources appended to each of the biographies and the lengthy bibliographic essay, "Major Research Sources," written by Kvasnicka, make this work an invaluable reference tool. The editors

have also included a list of commissioners' *Annual Reports* in the congressional serial sets, including page numbers. Since the *Annual Reports* were often printed in as many as three separate editions, as either House or Senate executive documents, or in "department editions," this list provides a simple and convenient guide that has been much needed.

The only flaw in this handsomely bound and printed book is the unexplained failure to include photographs or reproductions of painted portraits of the commissioners. Such pictures would have further removed part of the obscurity that surrounds many of these men. But despite this lapse of editorial judgment, the book is a great benefit to scholars, well written and edited, and well worth the price.

Northern Arizona University

L. G. MOSES

THE CHURCHES AND THE INDIAN SCHOOLS; 1888-1912. By Francis Paul Prucha. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1979. Pp. xii, 278. Appendixes, illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$16.50.

By 1912, as the Protestant reformers were declining in influence, Catholics "had clearly come of age in Indian affairs" (p. 205). Thus Francis Paul Prucha, a leading scholar of Indian-white relations, ends his latest book. In *American Indian Policy in Crisis: Christian Reformers and the Indian, 1865-1900* (1976) Prucha focused on the Protestants, whose efforts culminated in the deceptively successful Dawes Allotment Act of 1887. *The Churches* is a meticulous study of the struggles of the Bureau of Catholic Indian Missions (BCIM) to maintain its church's schools and influence in the face of mounting government responsibility for Indian education, and the ending in 1900 of "contracts"—direct federal appropriations to mission schools. The BCIM also had to contend with widespread anti-Catholicism and the bitter opposition of Protestant reform and mission groups, headed by the Indian Right Association (IRA). In this unedifying conflict the government increasingly found itself caught between the BCIM and the IRA.

The BCIM had "largely succeeded" by 1912, Prucha believes. "The principle that Catholic Indian parents had some say in where their children went to school," and in whether their share of tribal money could be used to support Catholic schools, "had been pretty well established." Greater rights were being accorded Catholic pupils in government Indian schools. Such "victories" indicated the growing importance of Catholics both in Indian affairs and in the nation.

In this detailed, chronological study Prucha lucidly explains why each of the "victories" was important to the Catholics after the crisis of 1900. *The Churches* is based almost entirely on primary sources, especially the records of the BCIM, the IRA, and the government. There is an extensive bibliography of primary materials and a shorter one of secondary sources. The author is sympathetic to Catholic efforts, but this is rigorous, scholarly history. The usually intolerant zeal of both Catholics and Protestants is exposed, principally by quotation.

However, Prucha allows a slight chagrin to intrude occasionally: we are told in one case that "Protestant carping" did not die out after 1912 (p. 205). In places the book threatens to become a campaign history of day-to-day tactics and battles. A conclusion might have been added, placing the Catholic success more deeply in the context of national and Indian affairs. And so might an epilogue: one is left with the impression that Catholics, Indians, and the government lived happily ever after 1912.

These are small blemishes on a carefully researched and admirably clear contribution to the history of Catholic-Protestant relations and of Indian "uplift." The book is also a sad commentary on insensitivity. All groups believed themselves to be working for the Indians. But, as Prucha points out, the Native Americans were given little say and were sometimes treated as mere pawns. And the otherwise divided groups were united in their assumption that the Christian civilization in some form was the only acceptable way of life for all Indians.

*University of Jyväskylä, Finland*

MICHAEL C. COLEMAN

THE REMEMBERED EARTH: AN ANTHOLOGY OF CONTEMPORARY NATIVE AMERICAN LITERATURE. Edited by Geary Hobson. Albuquerque: Red Earth Press, 1979. Pp. xi, 427. Illus. \$8.95.

THE REMEMBERED EARTH is a collection of prose, poetry, and illustrations, in the form of drawings and photographs, by contemporary Native American writers. The editor, Geary Hobson, has taught courses in the Native American Studies program at the University of New Mexico from 1976 to 1978.

Hobson begins his study with an interesting and informative look at Indian literature. He explains that Indian literature of today is based on and is a continuation of the oral traditions and beliefs of the past. Indeed, in its written form most contemporary Indian literature still stresses the same themes of the oral traditions that have been passed down from generation to generation for centuries. Themes such as the Indians' love and respect for the land, their close family relationships, and the ever-present threats from the dominant society to eradicate Indian culture continue to be emphasized by Native American writers. Hobson also provides a bibliography of Indian literature, containing books by both Indian and non-Indian authors and names of periodicals that publish Native American literature.

The Indian contributors to this anthology are from various geographical regions of North America, including Mexico, Canada, and Alaska. Even an Hawaiian author is included; although Hawaiians are not considered American Indians, they are, according to Hobson, in a true sense "Native Americans." At the end of the book there are short biographical entries on each of the authors which contain, among other things, their tribal heritage and publications. Some of the contributors, notably N. Scott Momaday and Simon J. Ortiz, are already

well-known literary figures. Others are in the beginning stages of their writing careers, and a few of them will achieve fame.

Most of the selections in the book are well done, particularly those describing reservation life and urban Indians trying to cope and survive in an alien environment. Some of the language in the selections is, however, quite profane and could offend readers. Nevertheless, more books like *The Remembered Earth* are needed. This inexpensive (based on the current inflated prices of books) volume can easily be adopted for courses in Native American literature.

Fort Hays State University

RAYMOND WILSON

CUENTOS CHICANOS. Edited by Rudolfo A. Anaya and Antonio Márquez. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico, 1980. Pp. 109. Illus., contributor's notes. \$3.50. Reprinted from *New America* 4, no. 1 (Dept. of American Studies, U.N.M.).

AMERICAN INDIAN POETRY. By Helen Addison Howard. Boston: Twayne Publishers, 1979. United States Authors Series 334. Pp. 191. Notes, bibliog., index. \$11.95.

*CUENTOS CHICANOS* AND *AMERICAN INDIAN POETRY* share some common elements: both focus on the written and oral traditions of the Chicano and Native American, both introduce the technique of storytelling and both address the free verse form and rhythms manifest in both cultures. But here the comparisons end.

Helen Addison Howard's monograph falls far short of the edited work by Rudolfo Anaya and Antonio Márquez. Howard pedantically approaches her subject matter while Anaya and Márquez allow the *cuentos*, or stories, to speak for themselves. She attempts judicious evaluation of early translators and interpreters of Indian verse while they let each cuento sing its own song. Howard seeks to show that her efforts help advance "cultural knowledge" while Anaya and Márquez assume that knowledge as part of the reader's repertoire. Howard's publisher selected a rather drab, expensive layout while the *New America* staff produced an attractive, easy-to-read, inexpensive design.

*Cuentos Chicanos* collects twenty-one short stories about the Chicano experience. Rather than an academic overview, the work provides vignettes of Chicano cultural realities as seen through the eyes of various gifted Chicano writers. Exceptional among them are Alberto Río's "La Boda," E.A. Mares's "Florinto," José Armas's "El Tonto del Barrio," and Leo Romero's "Owl." The other cuentos appeal in their own ways to the reader.

Throughout *Cuentos Chicanos* runs an indirectness of feeling about the Southwest one can readily associate with the Chicano. The strong family ties, rich folkloric tradition, and linguistic phenomena of the Chicano are all alive and present here. Besides presenting how a Chicano sees, feels, and grows up, the stories express the sense of temporal continuity in the Chicano lifestyle. E.A.

Mares describes the Old Town junkman Florinto: "He had set his course, on a destination un poco mas alla, further on down the road, around the distant curve into the dream time where the carnival whirled and the good times rolled forever." Of course, some of the cuentos deal with disorientation, violence, and frustration, but all richly express the Chicano reality.

Helen Addison Howard's intent is threefold: to introduce Indian poetry by discussion and citation of poetic samples from works by better known translators/interpreters; to expound upon free verse form "peculiar to Native American prosody"; and to evaluate cultural contributions made to the American experience through critical analysis of Indian poetry. In carrying out this cumbersome task, the editor culled material from the literary translations of Alice C. Fletcher, Frances Densmore, and Natalie Curtis Burlin. In addition, she includes the interpretations of Lew Sarett, Mary Austin, Eda Lou Walton, Alice C. Henderson, and Constance L. Skinner. Unfortunately, Howard presents biographical sketches and various linguistic data on non-Indian poets but very little Indian poetry. With the exception of her discussion of the Indian's poetic spirit, Howard's monograph essentially reinterprets early twentieth-century transliterations.

One feels an even greater uneasiness about her statement that "Characteristics of Native American poetry are subjects that are close to the daily lives of a *primitive* people" (italics mine). She continues to say there is a lack of critical teaching of that Indian poetry currently in print. Yet Howard stresses the need to treat Indian poetry as part of a "virgin field" for American poets, including Indian poets. One wonders at her lack of recognition of the Indian oral tradition. Concerning oral tradition as a mode of communication, she says, "The study of Indian poetry is relatively new since much of the significant work has been done since 1910." The world of Indian verse, such an intrinsic part of American Indian history, has been and is still expressed quite well, especially in the Southwest. One has but to glance at the works of Lewis H. Morgan, Frank Hamilton Cushing, and Jesse W. Fewkes to affirm this. Moreover, contemporary Native American poets such as Leslie Marmon Silko, Simon Ortiz, Duane Niatum and Ray A. Youngbear (among others) continue adding to a lyric tradition. Indian poetry is not a so-called virgin field.

In short, *Cuentos Chicanos* adds richly to the body of Chicano literature while *American Indian Poetry* fails to explore Native American literature and thus does it a great injustice. For the reader seeking an introduction to Indian verse, I suggest *The Remembered Earth*, an anthology of contemporary Native American writers, edited by Geary Hobson.

*Southwest Hispanic Research Institute,  
University of New Mexico*

ROBERTO M. SALMÓN