[New Mexico Historical Review](https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr)

Volume 89 | Number 4 Article 5

10-1-2014

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 89, 4 (2014). https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol89/iss4/5

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in New Mexico Historical Review by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

New Mexico: A History. By Joseph P. Sánchez, Robert L. Spude, and Art Gómez. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2013. 384 pp. 18 halftones, maps, table, suggested readings, index. $26.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4256-2, $19.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8061-4663-8.)

Histories of New Mexico have a long tradition, beginning with Gaspar de Villagrá's *Historia de la Nueva México* (1610). Relatively few authors, however, have attempted to recount the entire sweep of this history in a single volume, and no one has made such an effort in almost a generation. One reason for this lack of production is almost surely the challenge presented by the fact that New Mexico's history has so many constituencies, or, to put it another way, so many histories.

Instruction in New Mexico history is now mandatory in the state's schools. Typically, a survey of New Mexico's history from its Spanish colonial past through the end of the territorial period is taught in the seventh grade. High school students learn about New Mexico history from the attainment of statehood in 1912 to the present in the ninth grade. Often teachers with little knowledge of the state's history and even less experience trying to teach it are called upon to handle these mandatory classes. This situation has created a demand for a concise and complete narrative of New Mexico history. The authors of this volume have responded with a very approachable text that should go a long way toward meeting this pressing need.

The text begins with a brief chapter on the prehistory of the area of the Southwest that eventually became New Mexico. There are nearly 475 years of recorded history of New Mexico. The book devotes two chapters to the familiar narrative

of Spanish exploration, conquest, and settlement from 1539 to Mexican Independence in 1821. A chapter relates the rather brief history of Mexican administration, which officially ended in 1848. The authors deal with the period from prehistory to the advent of U.S. administration in less than a third of the book. The final two-thirds of the book are roughly divided evenly between the period from 1848 to 1925 and from 1925 to the present. This division of the material is particularly well suited to the amount of time devoted in New Mexico schools to each historical period.

The authors have all enjoyed long and distinguished careers in the National Park Service. It comes as no surprise, then, that throughout their book, and beginning in the first chapter, they point out significant New Mexico sites that are part of the park system, such as El Morro National Monument and Carlsbad Caverns National Park. This focus is completely appropriate given the role New Mexico has played and continues to play as a leader in the preservation of prehistoric, historic, and natural sites.

Rick Hendricks
New Mexico State Historian

The Diaries of John Gregory Bourke: Volume Five, May 23, 1881–August 26, 1881. Edited and Annotated by Charles M. Robinson III. (Denton: University of North Texas Press, 2013. ix + 482 pp. 81 halftones, maps, appendix, bibliography, index. $55.00 cloth, ISBN 978-1-57441-468-4.)

Volume five of Charles Robinson's commendable effort to publish the complete diaries of John Gregory Bourke is now available. When the University of North Texas Press presented the first volume of this worthy endeavor in 2003, Robinson believed the project would require five or six volumes. Now as many as a dozen volumes are projected. Regrettably, Robinson will not be able to see this endeavor through as he passed away a short time ago. Fortunately, the press has resolved to see the project to completion.

Of these volumes, the fifth encompasses the shortest period thus far—23 May–26 August 1881—and is largely devoted to Bourke's ethnological tour of the various pueblos in New Mexico and Arizona Territories. After a hasty trip to Dakota Territory to observe the Great Oglala Sun Dance at Pine Ridge, Bourke traveled to New Mexico where he began a methodical examination of the Rio Grande pueblos, which included Santa Clara, San Juan, Picurís, Taos, San Ildefonso, Nambé, and Santo Domingo. Bourke, who held the rank of first lieutenant in the U.S. Army, had been formally assigned this duty, and thus did not have to perform such research incidental to his regular responsibilities.

Bourke was not a trained ethnologist, but possessed a keen eye and the discipline resulting from a Jesuit education to perform such tasks. As Robinson points out, Bourke's approach to Native Americans was "slanted," and his commentary is replete with derogatory remarks. For example in a glaring instance of cultural condescension, he haughtily remarked to a Sioux chieftain, "Your religion brought you the buffalo, our[s] brought us locomotives and the talking wires" (p. 99). He was appalled at the "ignorance" and squalor of the pueblos, and he accused the residents of these communities of hypocrisy in their religious observances, believing they continued pagan rituals in the guise of Catholic worship. At the same time, Bourke found opportunities to compliment Natives. They "are mutually helpful in the whole business of daily labor," he wrote, and are "intelligent, bold, good-natured & shrewd" (pp. 24, 37). Bourke also reflected the patriarchal attitude of American males toward women as the "weaker" of the sexes. He wrote, "With woman, Religion is the grand underlying emotion of life" (p. 130). He found the few non-Natives residing among the Pueblo to be in a perilous position since they could easily sink "to the level of the savages" (p. 258). The culminating event of this present volume is Bourke's visit to the Moquis (Hopis) of Arizona Territory in order to observe their Snake Dance. He goes into great detail in his description of this widely-publicized ritual, but endures it only with great difficulty, characterizing this practice as akin to "Dante's Hell" (p. 288).

In this present volume, Charles Robinson maintained his respectable editing standards in spite of his illness (much of the volume was edited while he was confined to bed). While limitations of space forbid the inclusion of the many clippings and other items found in the original diaries, the editor does include many of Bourke's illustrations. A helpful appendix of biographical sketches of persons mentioned in this volume is also included. Readers who have examined the original diaries, which are housed at the U.S. Military Academy at West Point, will welcome the easy accessibility now afforded by Charles Robinson's work. The originals are very difficult to use. We look forward to the publication of additional volumes in the future.

Larry D. Ball
Arkansas State University

Junípero Serra: California's Founding Father. By Stephen W. Hackel. (New York: Hill and Wang, a division of Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2013. xv + 325 pp. 30 halftones, maps, notes, further reading, acknowledgements, index. $27.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8090-9531-5.)

The effort to declare Fr. Junípero Serra (née Miguel Jose) a Catholic saint went into high gear in 1987 when Pope John Paul II visited California. The call for the canonization of the founder of the California missions opened up a controversy regarding whether he merited sainthood. Both proponents and opponents made compelling arguments. Steven W. Hackel's biography of Father Serra, consisting of eleven chapters and an epilogue, is both unique and refreshing. He considers Serra to be a product of his time and the Mallorca environment and also a person who possessed a complex, albeit eccentric, personality.

Unlike other writers who prefer to examine Serra's actions as a missionary, historian Hackel concerns himself with exploring the mindset behind them. Hence, Hackel believes being born on the island of Mallorca influenced Serra's decision to become a missionary. Historically, the island had been home to Christians, Jews, and Moors. With the Spanish Christians' *reconquista* of Mallorca in the late 1200s, its residents chose to live their lives more devoted to God and families expected at least one child to become a priest. Hackel notes that some Mallorcan priests would make it their life's mission to travel to distant lands either to defend Catholicism or to win new converts. Among the great Franciscan missionaries from Mallorca, Fr. Ramon Llull travelled to North Africa and Palestine to convert Jews and Muslims while St. Francisco de Solano sought to convert native Peruvians. In 1749 Serra tried to emulate Llull and Solano by journeying to New Spain. Hackel claims Serra was also inspired by a nun, Sor María de Ágreda, who believed Native Americans craved religious conversion so much that they would do so upon first sight of the Franciscans.

Hackel notes that Serra was fascinated with saving souls through self-mortification. While a novice he began to flog himself, slept little, and fasted on a daily basis; at times he would resort to harsher forms of physical punishment. After reaching the port of Veracruz, Hackel says that Serra insisted on walking to Mexico City as a way of doing penance; along the way he was bitten by a mosquito on one of his legs and refused to treat it. The leg became ulcerated and despite intense pain, Serra insisted on walking to each of his missionary assignments throughout New Spain. Hackel also notes Serra had a strong faith in divine intervention. On the same journey to Mexico City, Serra and his group reached a rapidly rising river by nightfall and were assisted by a mysterious "Christian" who showed them where to cross it safely and also provided

them with food and shelter. Hackel mentions quite a few situations when Serra felt divine intervention in times of grave danger or great need.

Before establishing the Alta California missions, Hackel observes that Serra spent eight years at the Sierra Gorda, several years conducting popular missions in Central Mexico, and a few years in the former Jesuit missions of Baja California. Yet, Hackel notes that Serra repeatedly witnessed the lackluster enthusiasm Natives displayed toward Catholicism and the Franciscans. In the end, Serra did not have an impressive record of achievements for all his years in New Spain. When given the opportunity to serve as its founding president, Serra gladly left to establish the missions of Alta California. Hackel mentions that Serra, now much older, insisted on being part of the expedition that would trek up to Alta California. After reaching San Diego in 1769, Hackel observes that Serra committed himself to building a "ladder" of missions in the new territory. In the process, Serra felt that the intervention of the military stymied his efforts to transform Natives into devout Christians. In 1772 Serra returned to Mexico City to convince Viceroy Bucareli to give the Franciscan missionaries almost complete authority over the Natives of Alta California. However, Serra and his Franciscan brethren achieved only unremarkable numbers of conversions and the missions never evolved physically beyond primitive structures, a far cry from the prosperous and productive missions that followed in the early 1800s.

Hackel must be commended for his incisive and highly readable revisionist book. He considers Father Serra a product of the reconquista and the Counter-Reformation and, as such, portrays him as a zealous missionary driven more by his desire to save the souls of his flock than to caring for their earthly needs. From this perspective, it will be difficult to see Fr. Junípero Serra as a saintly figure for the twenty-first century.

Gregorio Mora-Torres
San Jose State University

The Plan de San Diego: Tejano Rebellion, Mexican Intrigue. By Charles H. Harris III and Louis R. Sadler. The Mexican Experience series. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2013. xvi + 338 pp. 23 halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $45.00 paper, ISBN 978-0-8032-6477-9.)

The Plan de San Diego, a plot to overthrow the U.S. government in the American Southwest in 1915, has received scholarly attention for its racial implications, and particularly the histories of imperialism, violence, and discrimination that created a climate in which such a scheme could materialize. These studies tend to situate the Plan within the context of the U.S. Southwest or the U.S.-Mexico

Borderlands. In their most recent collaborative project, Charles H. Harris III and Louis R. Sadler use newly available archival sources to rewrite the history of the Plan de San Diego. According to the authors, the significance of the Plan lies not in its origins or its stated goals, but rather in how it was ultimately used. More than a racially motivated scheme rooted primarily in south Texas, they argue that the Plan was deeply linked to the Mexican revolutionary government's diplomatic strategies. Their central premise is that Pres. Venustiano Carranza effectively used the Plan de San Diego as leverage to demand formal recognition and support from the Wilson Administration.

This book is primarily a narrative account of the Plan de San Diego and its aftermath, although the final chapters provide more historiographical and interpretive analysis. The authors incorporate a variety of sources; however, they draw their main conclusions from accounts that emerged in the papers of one of the plot's main proponents, Agustín Garza, and newly accessible documents from the Federal Bureau of Investigation. In the majority of the chapters Harris and Sadler tend to allow the sources to speak for themselves, a strategy with definite benefits and drawbacks. Although the resultant narrative is rich with details, at times the sources require more context and critical analysis. For instance the authors acknowledge that U.S. intelligence reports relied heavily on Mexican informants that represented competing political factions; however, they do little to problematize the effects the informants' loyalties might have had on the "intelligence" they ultimately provided U.S. officials (p. 90). Harris and Sadler also frequently use terminology as it appears in the sources without sufficiently examining the historical significance of word choices, particularly when it comes to descriptions of plot participants; the politically loaded terms "bandits," "raiders," "insurgents," "sediciosos," "gangs," and "guerrillas" appear almost interchangeable in this text.

Finally, although the effort to situate the Plan de San Diego within the context of the Mexican Revolution is laudable and compelling, the Revolution and the U.S. government's interests in it often come across as one-dimensional. The authors' repeated assertion that Carranza "dominate[d] the Mexican Revolution from 1913 to 1920" is especially jarring, not because it is necessarily untrue (it is certainly debatable), but because it grossly oversimplifies a long, complicated, violent process (p. 258). Despite some of these drawbacks, Harris and Sadler's efforts to re-insert Mexico, the Mexican Revolution, and diplomacy into the history of the Plan de San Diego add an important dimension to our understanding both of this incident and of the early-twentieth-century U.S. Southwest and Borderlands more broadly.

Lisa Pinley Covert
College of Charleston

Chicano Education in the Era of Segregation. By Gilbert G. Gonzalez. Al Filo: Mexican American Studies Series, no. 7. (Cranbury, N.J.: Associated University Presses, 1990; reprint, Denton: University of North Texas Press, 2013. xxxvii + 291 pp. 10 halftones, endnotes, bibliography, index. $18.95 paper, ISBN 978-1-57441-501-8.)

Almost twenty-five years after its initial release, *Chicano Education in the Era of Segregation* remains the most critical monograph on the history of U.S. Latino education. From Americanization to intelligence testing and segregated schooling, Gonzalez assesses the broad terrain of the "Mexican problem"—the code phrase adopted by Euro Americans in the early twentieth century to explain their beliefs that a combination of genetic pathologies afflicted the Mexican child and emanated from culture, language, and migration. The Mexican problem, he argues, became both evidence and rationale for substandard educational programs that targeted Chicano children in the Southwest and eventually all Latino children across the nation deep into the twentieth century.

Gonzalez insists, and rightly so, that "when we study Chicano-Latino history we are not merely studying the past; we are studying political processes and social conditions originating over a century ago, which continue today" (p. xxxvi). Given the relevance of his work to contemporary schooling, the seven chapters—which still read fresh—provide much needed context for understanding the history of Chicano education across a range of topics including culture and language, Americanization, intelligence testing, vocational training, migrant education, inter-American and intercultural education, and de jure segregation. He weaves the explanations of these school policies and practices into much larger frameworks (e.g., organic, functional, and assimilation theories) so that we can understand how mass compulsory education emerged from Progressive Era social science as a "political institution with an economic function to fulfill" (p. 203).

In a new preface, Gonzalez demonstrates how modern politicians and scholars revived the Mexican Problem in the twenty-first century and translated it into a justification for simultaneously unraveling civil rights gains and policing schools as border zones. Today, the new targets of increasingly hostile education policies are migrants and the undocumented displaced by NAFTA. For example DREAMers—youth whose parents brought them to the United States without legal authorization—must meet "educational requirements" in order to qualify for Pres. Barack Obama's "deferred action" initiative. Gonzalez aptly points out the historical irony of the DREAM Act, as undocumented youth who "drop out"

(approximately 20%) are not eligible for delayed deportation. "Families are once again divided," he writes, "this time by a temporary legal definition distinguishing children from parents, high school graduates from dropouts, older brothers and sisters from their siblings" (p. xxvii).

Chicano Education must be required reading for graduate students of the history of education and Chicana/o-Latina/o studies. The text is also ideal for upper-level undergraduate courses as each chapter can stand alone, particularly the short studies of *Méndez v. Westminster* (1946) on de jure segregation and the gendered analysis of Americanization in the Mexican family. Scholars and students seeking to understand the severe undereducation and generational poverty of contemporary Latino families will appreciate Gonzalez's carefully grounded, evidence-based assessment.

Laura K. Muñoz
Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi

The Roots of Latino Urban Agency. Edited by Sharon A. Navarro and Rodolfo Rosales. Al Filo: Mexican American Studies Series, no. 8. (Denton: University of North Texas Press, 2013. xvii + 167 pp. Map, chart, tables, bibliography, index. $24.95 cloth, ISBN 978-1-57441-530-8.)

How do Latinos respond to particular urban conditions and relate to the wider political system? That is a question that lies at the heart of *The Roots of Latino Urban Agency*, a new collection of essays edited by Sharon A. Navarro and Rodolfo Rosales. Focusing on Los Angeles, San Francisco, Chicago, Miami, and San Antonio, the volume seeks to demonstrate how Latinos in each city have exercised "urban agency" to achieve specific political outcomes. With an eye toward the future of Latino politics, the editors suggest that an analysis of Latinos in the city provides an avenue into the internal diversity of the nation's largest minority population.

In total the essays reflect an expansive definition of political agency. Pieces by Ralph Armbruster-Sandoval on grassroots coalitions in Los Angeles; Melissa R. Michelson on community struggles for education in Chicago; and Richard Edward DeLeon on the battles against redevelopment and gentrification in San Francisco, all make strong cases for Latino political participation outside the traditional electoral framework. Perhaps the strongest study of the volume, DeLeon's case study argues that Latino urban agency is both contextual and reactive and employed in opposition to forces that would otherwise erase the community's presence. By contrasting similar struggles in the sixties and seventies with more recent mobilizations against gentrification in the early twenty-first century,

Latino political agency emerges as a nimble and purposeful effort in the modern United States.

Essays on Miami and San Antonio present more traditional examinations of political participation, focusing on the role of Latinos in the electoral process. In an overview of the rise and fall of Miami politician Manny Díaz, three authors—Jessica Lavariega Monforti, Juan Carlos Flores, and Dario Moreno—examine the limits of "agentic leaders" and the linking of Latino political interests to urban development dollars. Sylvia Manzano and Arturo Vega use electoral data to study the voting habits in the largely Latino city of San Antonio. With a focus on the failed mayoral campaign of Julian Castro in 2005, the authors investigate the connection between voting and ethnic identification, arguing that San Antonio's Latinos are a less cohesive ethnic voting bloc than Latinos in Los Angeles, Denver, or Miami.

The Roots of Latino Urban Agency makes a necessary—although limited—contribution to our understanding of Latino political participation. The editors' expressed goal of highlighting the diversity within Latino America through its multilayered record of political agency at times suffers under the specificity of each case, unable to more fully explore that diversity within any single urban environment or equitably compare it across cities. The reader is left with evidence that Latinos are not a homogenous political population, but not a firm sense of whether that difference is rooted in some distinct features of these cities or the type of political agency examined by the authors of each case study. Still, these limits notwithstanding, the volume provides a deeper understanding of the importance of Latinos to the twenty-first-century political future of the United States.

Tomás F. Summers Sandoval, Jr.
Pomona College

Power to the Poor: Black-Brown Coalition and the Fight for Economic Justice, 1960–1974. By Gordon K. Mantler. Justice, Power, and Politics Series. (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2013. 362 pp. 20 halftones, notes, bibliography, acknowledgements, index. $37.50 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8078-3851-8, $27.95 paper, ISBN 978-1-4696-2188-3.)

In *Power to the Poor: Black-Brown Coalition and the Fight for Economic Justice, 1960–1974*, Gordon K. Mantler explores African American and Mexican American efforts in developing coalitions to address poverty and justice in America. Being a common and pervasive issue within both communities, poverty seemingly held the most potential to unite these two groups to challenge structural

inequality. Mantler argues that although economic inequality was the primary issue instigating multiracial and multicultural collaborations, divergent economic realities and variant strategies of how to confront this problem exposed the difficulty and complexity of sustaining such coalitions. This was especially evident in the Poor People's Campaign, which Mantler contends is the era's most impressive attempt at such a coalition. Mantler emphasizes the historical importance and significance of this event by revealing its notable and far-reaching impact. He reinterprets it not as a failure but as a pivotal moment in the period's history, explaining how it shaped and transformed people, organizations, and justice movements. It exemplified the interplay of identity politics and coalition politics, revealing the complex political realities and dynamics of America's two largest racial/ethnic minority groups. With this analysis Mantler exposes the tremendous challenge of building successful coalitions and alliances despite common interests and experiences.

Limited scholarship has been written about the relationship between the African American and Mexican American civil rights movements and how each influenced and impacted the other. Much of this scholarship uses an inadequate framework that oversimplifies the effects of these interactions and fails to highlight the complicated ways racial/cultural perceptions persisted and manifested in the movement. African Americans and Mexican Americans entered coalitions with different histories, experiences, and ideas, as well as racialized beliefs about themselves and each other. This resulted in organizational infrastructures that maintained differences between the two groups. By studying the movements simultaneously, therefore, Mantler adds to the existing scholarship by showing the complexity of multiracial relationships.

Mantler analyzes leadership and organizations in several locations: California, Denver, New Mexico, the American South, and Chicago. As Mantler demonstrates, rural and urban poverty, and the means to address them, were very different. Mantler also examines national events as well as activities of the federal government. By simultaneously evaluating regional and national developments, Mantler shows their interconnectedness and cross-influences.

Mantler contends that poverty is the key issue that motivated these parallel movements to develop coalitions. According to Mantler, by the 1960s, activists in both communities shifted their focus from desegregation efforts to address issues of poverty as a root of injustice. By the mid-1960s, African Americans and Mexican Americans began to formulate poverty-focused coalitions that emerged on the national stage at the March on Washington. Maintaining that the War on Poverty failed to adequately address economic inequality and the Vietnam War reinforced poverty in America, activists intensified their coalition efforts, which reached its peak with the Poor People's Campaign in the late 1960s.

Although racial identity motivated coalitions, it also undermined them. As different groups attempted to work together, they began to keenly recognize their differences. Coalition politics, therefore, intensified racial identities. With a heightened sense of group identity, group members left coalitions feeling more empowered and determined to create their own power structures, as seen in the rise and development of a national Chicano Movement. Scholars will find Mantler's research valuable for several reasons. It skillfully brings together the histories of the African American and Mexican American civil rights movements and shows their development both regionally and nationally. By examining key moments, organizations, and leaders, and demonstrating how they influenced, affected, and propelled each other, Mantler reveals the interaction and interplay of these two movements. This study also challenges scholars to move beyond the black-white binary. Finally, it encourages scholars to reconsider the historical significance of the Poor People's Campaign.

Ramona Houston
Atlanta, Georgia

Hidden Chicano Cinema: Film Dramas in the Borderlands. By A. Gabriel Meléndez. (New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 2013. xi + 271 pp. 14 halftones, notes, bibliography, index, about the author. $85.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8135-6107-3, $26.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8135-6106-6.)

In this very interesting and insightful study, A. Gabriel Meléndez examines the broad spectrum of films and photographs that were made about the Borderlands dating from the early 1900s through the 1990s. These products have been essential in constructing the image of Mexicans and Mexican Americans in the popular imagination of mainstream Anglo society. The author draws on the theory of proxemics, the study of human space in a cultural context, to focus on how, beginning in the early twentieth century, filmmakers and photographers established a spatial orientation separating themselves from the objects of their endeavors who were often depicted as either exotic or socially inferior members of Hispanic communities in New Mexico and elsewhere in the Southwest.

In chapter one, Meléndez discusses a few of the representative ethnographic and commercial entertainment films such as those produced by Lubin Southwest Film Company. He also comments on the photographs of Charles Lummis, a journalist whose work about New Mexico was popular with the mainstream reading public. The films and photographs served to denigrate the indigenous Native American and Mexican American populations by creating and perpetuating negative stereotypes that persisted for many decades. In chapter two, he

critiques Lummis's negative characterization of New Mexico's Brotherhood of Penitentes. The exaggeration and distortion surrounding the Penitentes was fueled by those who tried to link the murder of Carl Taylor, a freelance writer, to this religious group. In chapter four, Meléndez also discusses the photography of Russell Lee who came to New Mexico employed by the Farm Security Administration and whose photographs served to depict the poverty and devastation that the Depression had left in its wake in the nuevomexicano communities. He then contrasts the films *Salt of the Earth* (1954), a progressive semi-documentary film about a miners' strike, and *And Now, Miguel* (1953), a United States Information Agency-sponsored film that tends to romanticize New Mexico's Hispano population. In chapter five, Meléndez provides a nuanced discussion of two Hollywood feature-length films, *Giant* (1956), set in Texas, and *Red Sky at Morning* (1971), set in New Mexico. He analyzes how both films confront matters of race, class, and social hierarchy.

In chapters six, seven, and eight, Meléndez investigates how key Chicano/a and non-Chicano/a filmmakers and writers such as Moctesuma Esparza, Esperanza Vásquez, John Nichols, Danny Lyon, and Paul Espinosa began in the 1970s and 1980s to develop what he calls a "new proxemics," which, in part, is an aesthetic of "locating the source of Borderlands concerns and the stories these concerns have engendered" (p. 245). Some of the films discussed in these chapters are: *Tijerina* (1969), *Llanito* (1972), *Agueda Martínez* (1978), *The Lemon Grove Incident* (1986), *The Milagro Bean Field War* (1988), *La Llorona* (1991), and *Los Mineros* (1991).

Although there are several other studies of the individual filmmakers and photographers covered in this book, Meléndez's monograph is the first to provide a theoretical framework—proxemics—that illustrates how the image-making of the Borderlands changed from the early to the late twentieth century.

Charles Tatum
University of Arizona

Colorado Women: A History. By Gail M. Beaton, foreword by Tom Noel. Timberline Book Series (Boulder: University Press of Colorado, 2012. xv + 380 pp. 52 halftones, line drawing, notes, further reading, index. $34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-1-60732-195-8.)

Colorado Women: A History offers a compelling narrative of how women significantly impacted the historical changes in the land now recognized as Colorado. Gail M. Beaton presents readers with an absorbing narrative and in-depth analytical view that places Native, Hispanic, Asian, Anglo, and African American women and their descendants in the center of the Colorado story.

State and territorial histories present chronological monographs of the people, events, and policies that contributed to state growth and development. Publishing a state history is not an easy task, especially if you are ambitious enough to piece together a narrative from scratch. Traditionally, women have made sparse appearances in these accounts, usually with the purpose of playing supportive roles in a story dominated by an all-male cast of characters. Beaton's exhaustive research finally moves Colorado women beyond the suffrage movement, Baby Doe Tabor, and Dust Bowl experiences. The fascinating stories she presents overlap and emerge as "Layers through time" (p. xii). Beaton unravels these layers to show how Colorado women's community engagement made important national and international contributions outside the Rocky Mountain State.

Beaton provides a road map of how to accomplish the difficult task of telling a women's state history, while also addressing the vital themes of race, gender, ethnicity, sexuality, religion, labor, and activism. Beaton appropriately begins the book with indigenous women. There is a noted absence of oral tradition and the unfortunate use of the anthropological term "pre-history"; however, this section provides a compilation of interesting discussions on Native gender dynamics in the Colorado region prior to European contact. Subsequent chapters discuss pioneer women, western expansion, Anglo settlement, and the women's club movement, wherein Beaton weaves new evidence to inform a familiar narrative. For example she includes sections on the establishment of the Negro Women's Club Home, the involvement of women in the Ku Klux Klan during the Progressive Era, and the inclusion of environmental concerns. Such topics include fresh interpretations of Colorado's formative years. Beaton weaves this narrative together with biographical vignettes, which illuminate the voices of women that remain prominent throughout the text.

Some of the most fascinating sections of the book appear in the chapters that cover the years following World War II. In the "Modern Era" chapter, Beaton introduces readers to facets of social history that rarely appear in state histories. Here she uncovers layers of history on the discrimination of gay and lesbian communities, the role of Coloradoan Patricia Scott Schroeder in the rise of the U.S. Women's Movement, Latina/Hispanic activism, and Ute women's involvement in the National Congress of American Indians.

Students and scholars of Colorado and western women's history will find this book very useful for both the classroom and research. Beaton's intricate research and accomplished storytelling make a welcoming impression that further complicates women's history in the American West. *Colorado Women* is certainly an indication that scholars have just started to scratch the surface of this crucial field.

Elaine Marie Nelson
University of Nebraska Omaha

Encounters in Avalanche Country: A History of Survival in the Mountain West, 1820–1929. By Diana L. Di Stefano. Emil and Kathleen Sick Series in Western History and Biography. (Seattle: Center for the Study of the Pacific Northwest in association with University of Washington Press, 2013. x + 171 pp. 20 halftones, map, notes, bibliography, index. $34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-295-99314-0.)

In 1910 Sarah Covington feared disaster when her train was trapped by a snowstorm in the Cascades. She survived for a week but was instantly killed when an avalanche buried her and ninety-six other people. Covington's diary is a poignant testimony in Diana Di Stefano's illuminating study of western encounters with avalanche country, an elevated region that extends from New Mexico to British Columbia and from the Sierras to Alaska. Miners, workers, and residents had to evaluate the risk of avalanches and the responsibility for safety as the mountains became an industrial landscape.

Di Stefano begins with trappers, guides, and migrants who developed local knowledge about the mountain environment. Individuals such as mailmen and itinerant preachers in the nineteenth century also adapted to snow conditions with snowshoes, skis, and new building methods. However, indigenous knowledge by Natives plays little or no role in this account.

By the 1880s, corporate mines and railways exposed a year-round workforce to avalanches, a risk increased by deforestation and extractive mining techniques. Miners viewed the risk from avalanches as a communal obligation rather than an individual responsibility, and communities organized rescues in mining towns. However, the trans-mountain railways built by transient labor across exposed terrain fostered a very different legal response to avalanches.

The heart of this book is a detailed discussion of court cases that contested legal responsibility for deaths by avalanche on mountain railways. An avalanche near Revelstoke, British Columbia killed fifty-eight people on the Canadian Pacific Railway in 1910, more than half of a shoveling crew from Japan. Similar cases involving an avalanche in 1893 on the Denver and Rio Grande Railway in Colorado, and the avalanche on the Great Northern Railway that killed Covington in 1910, are models of legal analysis and social history.

Competing narratives emerged telling of heroic efforts by railway men after an accident or complaints of corporate negligence. Railway workers claimed expertise about nature based on their local knowledge that discounted the possibility of avalanches where they had not occurred previously. The kin of the deceased wanted to hold railways accountable for foreseeable and preventable disasters. The railways argued—and courts usually upheld—that avalanches were Acts of God. A jury verdict against the Great Northern was overturned by a conservative

court in Washington State. Although the railway later abandoned the tracks at the site of this avalanche, not until the introduction of worker's compensation laws in the 1920s were similar changes made in the legal landscape.

By examining this tangled history of corporate power, legal responsibility, and local knowledge, *Encounters in Avalanche Country* is a significant and timely contribution to the ongoing discussion of environmental disasters in the Mountain West.

Peter H. Hansen
Worcester Polytechnic Institute

Fevered Measures: Public Health and Race at the Texas-Mexico Border, 1848–1942. By John Mckiernan-González. (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 2012. xvi + 416 pp. 12 halftones, maps, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $94.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8223-5257-0, $26.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8223-5256-1.)

In *Fevered Measures*, John Mckiernan-González examines a series of public health measures at the Texas-Mexico border from the mid-nineteenth to the mid-twentieth century. By exploring various campaigns to contain smallpox, typhus, and yellow fever, he provides multiple examples of conflicts between federal public health officials' goals and local residents' need for medical autonomy. He demonstrates that U.S. public health authorities established medical borders that did not correspond to the nation's political borders. Instead, they created medical borders to separate suspected "diseased" populations from the general U.S. population in often futile efforts to protect the latter from epidemic diseases. The implementation of federal public health campaigns often clashed with local understandings of disease, citizenship, and status. Doctors and public health officials repeatedly enforced quarantines and forced vaccinations against the will of local residents. However, border residents did not passively accept medical authorities' actions, but rather resisted public health measures in creative and determined ways.

Daily cultural practices and various officials' misunderstanding of the ethnic Mexican population undermined the enforcement of public health measures at the Texas-Mexico border. Medical officials not only ignored internal class differences among Texas Mexicans, but they also failed to distinguish between Mexican nationals and Mexican Americans. Federal officials considered ethnic Mexicans an internal health threat within territorial borders, which led to the creation of regional quarantines. Yet quarantine enforcement ignored Mexican Americans' civil rights and failed to acknowledge the quarantines' considerable disruptions (e.g., forcible destruction of housing, loss of jobs, and starvation).

Rather than considering Mexican Americans' and African Americans' negative experiences with medical authorities and their suspicion of the federal government, federal officials blamed these populations' cultural practices for disease. Moreover, these officials ignored the border's porous nature and the region's dependence on the relatively free movement of people and goods across the international boundary.

Fevered Measures is a transnational study that uses Spanish- and English-language sources from Mexico and the United States. Diplomatic correspondence allows Mckiernan-González to explore the debate between Mexican and U.S. authorities over public health measures. Although Mexican and U.S. officials agreed on the use of quarantines, they disagreed about Mexicans' medical knowledge and their adaptation of modern medical practices. They also clashed over the medical racialization of Mexican immigrant workers, who were targets of forced vaccinations as conditions for entry into the United States. *Fevered Measures* details federal medical officials' views and arguments justifying quarantines and vaccination programs with extensive documentation from the State Department and the U.S. Public Health Service. Mexican officials strongly disagreed with U.S. authorities over public health measures and took exception to the latter's condescending views of Mexican culture and medical practices. By adeptly using local and national newspapers, Mckiernan-González provides captivating accounts of local residents' perspectives on and resistance to enforced measures. *Fevered Measures* joins Natalia Molina's *Fit to Be Citizens* and Alexandra Stern's *Eugenic Nation* as essential studies of public health campaigns among Latinos. It deserves to be widely read by scholars of U.S. history, Latino studies, public health, and border studies.

Omar S. Valerio-Jiménez
University of Iowa

Global West, American Frontier: Travel, Empire, and Exceptionalism from Manifest Destiny to the Great Depression. By David M. Wrobel. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2013. xv + 312 pp. 55 halftones, notes, selected bibliography, index. $39.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-5370-2.)

Between 1830 and 1900 almost 2,000 travel books were published in the United States; even more were published in Europe. A widespread reading audience appeared insatiable for first-hand information about the larger world. Perhaps no region was of more interest to American readers than their own far West, an exotic land of dramatic landscapes, picturesque inhabitants, and thrilling adventures. Countless stories of Indian raids, buffalo stampedes, and mining adventures were published in book form and serialized in magazines in the sec-

ond half of the nineteenth century. As Ray Allen Billington and others have argued, travel books helped create the myth of the American West as the most exceptional region of the world's most exceptional nation.

But the mythic western travel narrative, still well represented at bookstores today, is only one part of the story. In *Global West, American Frontier*, David M. Wrobel, professor of history and Merrick Chair in Western History at the University of Oklahoma, offers a revisionist history of travel writing about the American West. Although the reigning narrative suggests travel writers became increasingly cosmopolitan in their outlook at the start of the twentieth century, Wrobel offers a counter-narrative of nineteenth-century travel writers envisioning a global West who in the early-twentieth century gradually turned their focus to the exceptional nature of the American frontier. Selectively covering over one hundred years of travel through the West, from George Catlin to Jack Kerouac, readers will enjoy his profiles of little-known but worthy authors such as Antonio Scarfoglio and Mary Kingsley, as well as new perspectives on luminaries including Mark Twain, Theodore Roosevelt, and Jack London. The connections Wrobel draws between western regional guides, automotive narratives, and nineteenth-century world travels are often surprising and enlightening. The book is as entertaining and lavishly illustrated as its subject matter merits, and offers a pleasant diversion to armchair travelers with an interest in historical precedent.

Wrobel's approach has been shaped by the scholarship of western historians, including Susan Lee Johnson and Louis Warren, who have convincingly documented the international context of traditional western topics like the California Gold Rush and Buffalo Bill's Wild West show. His is not the only recent work to attempt to integrate western travel writing into a global context. Monica Rico's *Nature's Noblemen: Transatlantic Masculinities and the Nineteenth-Century American West* (Yale University Press, 2013) focuses on the transnational forces that shaped the western exceptionalist genre, primarily in the late nineteenth century. Although Rico and Wrobel cover some of the same authors, Wrobel's volume navigates a longer span of time and utilizes a more radical thesis. Given recent scholarship on American cosmopolitanism, particularly the work of Kristin Hoganson, the conclusion that travel writers became less rather than more cosmopolitan in their outlook seems a bit forced. But Wrobel never claims his is the only, or even the dominant, narrative. Readers might wish for more specificity about the relative strengths of the reigning and counter narrative, but this is nonetheless a useful contribution to the globalization of western history that is also a pleasure to read.

Amy S. Greenberg
Pennsylvania State University

The Red and the White: A Family Saga of the American West. By Andrew R. Graybill. (New York: Liveright Publishing Corporation, a division of W.W. Norton and Company, 2013. xix + 339 pp. 49 halftones, maps, table, notes, bibliography, index, about the author. $28.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-87140-445-9.)

Andrew Graybill's book, *The Red and the White: A Family Saga of the American West* tells the story of Malcolm Clarke, a failed West Point cadet turned successful fur trader in the nineteenth-century American Northwest. Clarke married into a Piegan family, which, at the time, was not unusual. Many white fur traders of the period took Native American women as their brides. What makes Clarke's story unusual is that his murder—committed by his wife's cousin—touched off events that led to a little-known massacre of the Piegan people that occurred on the Marias River in the early morning hours of 23 January 1870. In order to avenge Clarke's murder, an army campaign was launched to hunt down the Piegan responsible for his death. Instead of killing those individuals responsible for Clarke's death, however, the U.S. Army appears to have simply massacred the first Piegan camp it came across—thirty-seven lodges of "friendlies" headed by Heavy Runner. Graybill's evidence indicates that this was not a mistake; soldiers were ordered to fire upon the camp, even though they had been informed that Clarke's murderers were not present and that they were, in fact, Heavy Runner's people.

Graybill does not provide a reason for why the U.S. soldiers committed this massacre, even though they knew Clarke's murderers were not in the camp. Perhaps in the minds of the American soldiers, Clarke's murder stood as a symbol for all of the perceived murders and depredations committed by Piegans against whites—who were at the time methodically usurping Piegan lands and resources. If this were the case, then it may not have mattered to the soldiers which Piegans they killed. This may help to explain the excessive response of soldiers, who fired into the camp for over an hour even though no resistance was offered (p. 126). Ultimately, however, that such genocides like the Marias Massacre (or Sand Creek or Wounded Knee) occurred is inexplicable. There is no meaningful explanation for the genocide that was committed against Native people in this country; and certainly there is no justification for it. Thus, that Graybill does not attempt to provide an explanation for why the Marias Massacre occurred somehow seems fitting.

However compelling the story of the Marias Massacre and its impact on Piegan communities is, it is not the central story of Graybill's book. The central narrative focuses on the experiences of three of Clarke's descendants who were people "in-between" because they were both Piegan and white. With its description of the lives and difficulties of these "in-between" individuals, the book will

appeal to a varied audience: to readers interested in Piegan ethnohistory, in race and ethnic relations in the American West, and in historical biography.

Tracy L. Brown
Central Michigan University

Making Rocky Mountain National Park: The Environmental History of an American Treasure. By Jerry J. Frank. (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2013. xiv + 253 pp. 30 halftones, notes, selected bibliography, index. $34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-7006-1932-0.)

In this book, Jerry Frank injects the case of Rocky Mountain National Park into the discussion of whether, in an institution like a national park, there is nature or only culture. A popular conception of the park's founding is that Enos Mills, the "John Muir of the Rockies," made its creation his mission. As Frank reveals in this environmental history, Mills played a role, but the story of "Rocky" is much more complex. The park was a product of economic boosters, the rise of tourism in the American West, the particular "character" of Colorado in the early twentieth century, the political boost that an "accessible" national park might give the drive to create a national park agency, and the truly preservationist motives of Mills, J. Horace McFarland, and other national park advocates. Legislation drafted over a period of years was approved by Congress in January 1915.

The title of the book says much about how the author approaches the park's story. Congress may have drawn park boundaries, but that decision was only the beginning of the process of "making" this park. Roads and trails were built. The park experience was carefully constructed by National Park Service (NPS) planners and landscape architects for visitors who usually arrived and toured the park by automobile. Visitation grew especially after World War II. In the 1960s, the "lens of ecology" was focused on the effect visitors were having on the natural environment of the park. Park management, driven primarily by tourism to this point in Rocky Mountain history, began to shift as managers incorporated what Frank calls the "science and culture of ecology" into their management (p. 3). Frank clearly describes management changes to recreation, fisheries, wildlife, fire, and insects, all affected by this shift.

A theme throughout the book is that all involved with national parks must "come to terms with the role of humans and our history in making this magnificent place" (p. 205). What he means by this is unclear, although Frank suggests that national parks, attempting to be pristine and natural, have tried too hard to erase human history from park landscapes. Parks are, after all, "made" and

managed by humans, so erasing culture must be impossible. On the other hand, protecting naturalness in part of the national park system has always been a national park goal. NPS attempts to balance the cultures of tourism and ecology in its management could be better understood in Frank's telling of the Rocky Mountain story if this one park's context within the national park system was clearer.

Despite uneven writing and occasional distracting errors of fact and chronology scattered throughout the book, Frank has added to our understanding of how Rocky Mountain National Park came to be the place and experience it is today.

John C. Miles
Western Washington University

The Last Days of the Rainbelt. By David J. Wishart. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2013. xviii + 202 pp. 17 halftones, 19 maps, 10 graphs, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8032-4618-8.)

This book, focusing on the spread of a farming frontier in eastern Colorado and adjacent areas in Kansas and Nebraska in the decade from 1886–1896, offers a great deal more than such limited subject matter might suggest. David J. Wishart manages to tell a compelling and important story that challenges interpretive models that have shaped the understanding of the American West in general and the Great Plains in particular.

The essential element in that story was a myth generated in hope, encouraged by what passed for science at the time and promoted by governments, railroads, and media. This was the belief that rain would follow the plow, altering the regional climate and thereby creating a rainbelt where agriculture could flourish. Farmers had been pushing onto the plains for a generation by the time the myth reached its height in the 1880s, but the movement of the railroads spurred a surge of population growth with many counties in the area increasing from as little as three persons per square mile to thirty times that number in a decade. Then harsh realities intruded; by 1890 prevailing weather patterns forced settlers into wasted investments in rainmaking and the abandonment of farms and towns. Some estimates projected that as many as 500,000 people left the region.

Wishart's history of the rainbelt could be dismissed as an isolated occurrence affecting only a small region and relatively smaller numbers of people except for the qualities of the book and its relationship to larger themes. He draws effectively from settlers' accounts of their perceptions and experiences, adding a rich sense of the human dimension of a tragic loss of hope for thousands. The

larger themes are seen in the ways the history of the rainbelt paralleled developments leading to the Dust Bowl and the agricultural practices that contributed to its destructive forces. Wishart discusses these elements in his epilogue, but his account offers important contrasts to simplistic declensionist depictions as seen in Ken Burns's recent PBS documentary, *The Dust Bowl*. Wishart's close examination of local and individualized sources leads to a history that is both objective and nuanced. Those qualities are also seen in his discussion of the problems that confront the Great Plains presently. These range from the fragile link to federal agricultural policy to the certainty of future droughts. The projected impact of climate change and the continuing decline of the Ogallala aquifer ensure that future challenges will rival if not exceed those faced by the rainbelt and the Dust Bowl.

In short this is both a good and an important book. Wishart and others concerned with environmental preservation might want to consider the ways in which some regional agricultural subsidies could represent investments in the national infrastructure, but that issue is beyond his focus. The only real problem I found was with the halftone depictions of population and precipitation changes in the region, which were almost as problematic as helpful for me, but otherwise I recommend it without reservations.

Alvin O. Turner
East Central University, Ada, Oklahoma

Shooting Arrows and Slinging Mud: Custer, the Press, and the Little Bighorn. By James E. Mueller. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2013. xii + 260 pp. 12 halftones, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4398-9.)

Shooting Arrows and Slinging Mud: Custer, the Press, and the Little Bighorn makes a valuable contribution to the copious literature on the military defeat that stunned the nation in July of 1876. The book is logically organized and begins by contextualizing the military campaign in a manner that provides essential background without over-simplification, and then proceeds to the shocking news as related to the public by the press. Mueller points out that the major news stories of the time were not about subduing the Plains Indians but instead directed to Reconstruction and the upcoming presidential election. The Hamburg Massacre in South Carolina, reported three days after the Little Bighorn disaster, turned attention to the more pressing problem of racial violence in the South. The faraway battle was, Mueller writes, "an interesting story rather than an impact story" (p. 144). Americans were also focused on the technological advances displayed at the dazzling Centennial Exposition in Philadelphia.

Such new inventions as the telephone, the typewriter, and the gigantic Corliss engine not only seized the national imagination but reflected the way the country wanted to see itself.

When more information about the Little Bighorn became available, the papers tended to blame the generals and politicians for what was usually referred to as a "slaughter" or "massacre." Custer, whose Civil War exploits were still remembered, was typically portrayed as heroic. Most news sources expressed some sympathy for the wrongs suffered by the Indians, but savages who scalped and tortured were still first and foremost the enemy. Paradoxically, what made the story less newsworthy was the national consensus that Indians needed to be subdued and placed on reservations. Mueller's thorough review of newspaper coverage of the event also explores an area usually neglected—humor. Many jokes were made about Indians, but military men regarded as culpable were also ridiculed. Mueller is undoubtedly correct in suggesting that such humor reaffirmed American superiority to an enemy and defused some of the tension and fear generated by the brutal defeat.

In his final chapter, Mueller brings press treatment of the Little Bighorn up to date. Considering Custer's reputation, the negative has predominated: the image of the dashing cavalier has given way to that of an inept bungler. Comparing the newspaper response in 1876 to the reporting on twenty-first century wars, Mueller finds more transparency in the past. Papers then were overtly partisan, but partisanship could be transcended or set aside, as when Republican papers praised Custer's heroism. Now, under the guise of nonpartisanship there may be a hidden agenda—and less reliable information as well. Mueller does not use the word "narrative" in his illuminating addendum, but it would have been a useful label to describe the way news is presented. Because telling a coherent story is preferable to simply retelling a number of discrete facts, the desire to create an understandable narrative has led writers astray, both in writing about the Little Bighorn—and Iraq.

Louise Barnett
Rutgers University

Claiming Tribal Identity: The Five Tribes and the Politics of Federal Acknowledgment. By Mark Edwin Miller, foreword by Chadwick Corntassel Smith. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2013. xiv + 475 pp. 14 halftones, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8061-4378-1.)

Claiming Tribal Identity is a highly successful, and very brave, effort by Mark Miller (no relation) to explain why the Five Tribes of Oklahoma support

the controversial Bureau of Indian Affairs Federal Acknowledgement Process (FAP), a process that determines which groups of non-federally recognized peoples are legitimate Native American tribes and which fail the tests. A number of well-researched recent books have supported the recognition of particular tribes. But no one has taken up the task of explaining why already acknowledged groups sometimes actively and vehemently oppose the recognition of other groups, and, in the case of the Five Tribes, go so far as to create a "Fraudulent Indian Task Force." These tribes fear the loss of revenue, backlash against them, and the enhancement of existing stereotypes because of the actions of fakes.

Mark Miller is the right one for this task. He is an historian with a strong earlier book on federal acknowledgement, and now he has zeroed in on the problem of false claims. He does not hold back but he is thorough and fair. He has done a massive job of compiling documents and interviewing key players. He looks at the issues through the lens of the American Southeast, a hotbed of activity by non-recognized groups since the 1960s, but he clearly understands the issues on a national scale and raises all of the big questions—the role of phenotype and of blood quantum in identity, for example. He provides some of the critiques of the FAP, and develops detailed case studies of the Lumbee and other Southeast groups. Miller makes clear throughout that questions of identity and tribal status are historical and not merely primordial and shows the many ways in which scholars and community intellectuals have gone about framing questions of identity. He demonstrates that the task of the FAP is to acknowledge the violation of the inherent sovereignty of tribes in existence at the time of contact, and not to recognize groups which arose later.

Miller's work is an exceptional history of U.S. public policy generally and the internal politics surrounding Indian issues more specifically. It is loaded with fascinating details. Choctaw law in 1875, for example, required in-marrying whites to swear an oath, pay a fee, and have a witness testify to their moral character to become members of the nation (p. 90). A chief of the Five Tribes thought anthropologist Sol Tax was a communist (p. 110).

Although this book makes clear the rising importance of money changing hands, pandering, and lobbying in the recognition process, Miller does not actually say that outright illegal activity is part of the story. In the case of the Samish of Washington State, for example, federal officials were twice found in court to have colluded against the tribe's bid for recognition. He mentions that fishing rights cases brought by "many seemingly assimilated Indians in Washington State had the remarkable effect of uniting a wide array of groups against tribal treaty rights" (p. 138). But this is blaming the victim. These tribes (many of which I have worked with for over forty years) are composed of peoples

whose mid-nineteenth-century treaties were disregarded and they should not be faulted for standing up for themselves. I believe Mark Miller would get this point were he to see it from where I stand.

Bruce Granville Miller
University of British Columbia

Civil War General and Indian Fighter James M. Williams: Leader of the 1st Kansas Colored Volunteer Infantry and the 8th U.S. Cavalry. By Robert W. Lull. War and the Southwest Series, no. 12. (Denton: University of North Texas Press, 2013. xvii + 289 pp. 37 halftones, maps, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. $24.95 cloth, ISBN 98-1-57441-502-5.)

In 1827, thirty-four years prior to the outbreak of the Civil War, New York rid itself of the last vestiges of slavery. It was in this environment of free-soilism and abolitionism that James Monroe Williams was born in 1833. Destined for a life of adventure and patriotism, Williams moved west from upstate New York to Wisconsin to Kansas in time to experience a brewing sectionalism, Civil War, and conflict with Indians.

In 1850s Bleeding Kansas, Williams participated in Jayhawking expeditions against pro-Southern sympathizers. At the onset of the Civil War in 1861, Williams rode with James Henry Lane's infamous Kansas Brigade, an experience that would prove invaluable to later independent command. Williams's next role seemed only logical given his strong abolitionist sentiments—the recruitment and organization of African Americans into some of the Union's first all-black regiments. The Battle of Island Mound, Missouri, 29 October 1862, stands as the first engagement between black Union troops and Confederates, demonstrating the resilience of African Americans as soldiers.

Serving as Lieutenant Colonel commanding the 1st Kansas Colored Volunteer Infantry Regiment, and later as brevet Brigadier General of the 79th U.S. Colored Infantry Regiment, Williams participated in many hard-fought battles that won Union control of Oklahoma and western Arkansas. Lull addresses the role of African Americans at the controversial battles of Cabin Creek, Honey Springs, Poison Springs, and Jenkins Ferry, where giving quarter to prisoners was a rare luxury. Lull breaks from the action long enough to address discriminatory pay issues and the replacement of black officers.

Williams won a rare commission as a captain of cavalry in the post-Civil War Indian conflicts. His continual service took him to remote duty stations in the hostile Southwest where life was exemplified by boredom, rugged patrols, and sharp engagements with Apaches. Williams eventually found solace as a

rancher after debilitating arrow wounds rendered him unfit for military service. He passed away in 1907 at the age of seventy-three.

Lull presents a readable, informative account of the life and military career of a significant figure in the western Civil War and Indian conflicts. The book is not without minor shortcomings. Whereas Lull avails himself of official records, contemporary biographies, and newspaper articles, the reader is left wanting for personal accounts from Williams, which are virtually non-existent. Lull's work suffers from balance when he avoids acknowledging Williams's involvement in atrocities, or explains it away as justified reprisals. Adding a discussion on the description and effectiveness of weaponry would bring a clearer understanding of the realities of the battles fought between those using Sharps repeating rifles and those equipped with antiquated smoothbore muskets and shotguns. Only one typographical error was found with the date 26 October 1863, which should read 1862 (p. 53). All in all, *Civil War General and Indian Fighter James M. Williams* is a long-awaited addition to the history of the Trans-Mississippi West and a valuable insight into the role and struggles of African Americans.

Stephen S. Michot
Nicholls State University

A Frontier Life: Jacob Hamblin, Explorer and Indian Missionary. By Todd M. Compton. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2013. xix + 642 pp. 41 halftones, maps, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. $44.95 cloth, ISBN 978-1-60781-2340-0.)

In Jacob Hamblin's own words, he had "by appointment, lived a frontier life for 30 years" (p. 458). This is the theme of Todd M. Compton's new biography of Hamblin. Hamblin was the "Buckskin Apostle" to the Indians and the "Leather-stocking of Utah," but his major exploits as an explorer and a mediating diplomat are often overlooked (p. xiv). Compton corrects this oversight by focusing less on Hamblin's missionary efforts and more on his commitment to solve Mormon-Indian conflicts through peaceful negotiation and his commitment to explore new routes as a means of facilitating Mormon colonization. In this Compton is eminently successful.

Hamblin's life has been examined before, but Compton adds to these earlier works by bringing a fresh perspective to his extensive primary sources. Compton's most important contribution is his in-depth descriptions of Hamblin's almost three dozen exploratory expeditions and his often hazardous treks to negotiate Mormon-Indian peace. After helping to establish southern Utah Indian missions and Mormon colonies, and at the behest of Brigham Young,

Hamblin led annual exploratory and colonizing missions into Arizona and Nevada. Compton argues that Hamblin was one of the first important explorers of northern Arizona, the Grand Canyon, and the Colorado River, and as such became an invaluable asset to John Wesley Powell's later expeditions as guide, interpreter, and Indian liaison (although, Compton implies, he was not always given credit for his work).

Compton also emphasizes the complexities and paradoxes of Hamblin's life. While stoutly defending Indian rights and seeking their betterment, Hamblin was also one of Brigham Young's preeminent agents of colonization in Indian lands. Hamblin would have been conflicted as both an advocate for the Indians and as an agent of the expansive colonization that usurped their resources and led to starvation, disease, and death.

The book has some flaws. Despite detailing Hamblin's explorations, the book frustratingly lacks maps that actually trace his routes. Also, to emphasize Hamblin's path breaking accomplishments, Compton argues that his trek in 1858 to the Hopi made him the first white man since Antonio Armijo (1829) to ford the Colorado at the Crossing of the Fathers—ignoring the fact that New Mexico–based emigrants, traders, and mountain men had used this crossing for decades as part of the southern branch of the Old Spanish Trail. Finally, although Compton tries to maintain an objective, scholarly view of Hamblin, he clearly likes his subject and despite his efforts the book occasionally slips toward a triumphal narrative.

Nevertheless, Compton's biography is a masterful addition to our understanding of the conflicted, often paradoxical, but always religiously devoted Jacob Hamblin. Compton tries to be evenhanded, provides expansive historical and cultural context, and presents opposing views on controversial topics—from negotiating at Fort Defiance to his role in the Mountain Meadows cover-up, and his convoluted relationship with John D. Lee. Ironically, this apostle to the Indians was generally unsuccessful in converting and acculturating Indians (to his frustration), while his successful missions as explorer, colonizer, and diplomat helped facilitate the Euro American expansion that nearly destroyed local Native populations.

Sondra Jones
University of Utah