

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 89 | Number 2

Article 5

4-1-2014

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 89, 2 (2014). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol89/iss2/5>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

African American History in New Mexico: Portraits from Five Hundred Years. Edited by Bruce A. Glasrud. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2013. viii + 280 pp. Notes, selected bibliography, credits, index. \$29.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8263-5301-6.)

The history of people of African descent in New Mexico and the broader American West extends from the mid-sixteenth century to the present. This history, though not unknown to historians, has rarely been the subject of sustained scholarly attention. *African American History in New Mexico*, a collection of essays edited by Bruce Glasrud, is thus a most welcome addition to both New Mexico history and the history of the American West.

Glasrud's introduction nicely places the history of African Americans in New Mexico within the context of the region's wider past, highlighting the era of Spanish colonialism, the American military presence and settlement in the nineteenth century, and twentieth-century developments such as the increasing presence of African Americans in American popular culture and the civil rights movement. The remainder of the book proceeds chronologically and is composed of previously published essays as well as more recent scholarship.

Of the many successful essays in the collection, a handful stand out. Dedra McDonald's "Intimacy and Empire" offers a fascinating account, based on careful reading of military, legal, census, and marriage records, of the presence of African-heritage individuals in colonial New Mexico. Similarly impressive archival work animates Deanne Blanton's essay on Cathay Williams, which follows the intriguing life of Williams, who was born a female, but lived as

a man, and enlisted as a soldier in the American military in the 1860s. Also of interest is Raymond Wilson's retelling of the boxing match between Jack Johnson and an overmatched rival in Las Vegas, New Mexico, in 1912. Of the many important contributions of the volume, the most notable is the set of oral histories collected by Richard Melzer in which Haroldie Kent Spriggs and Sammie J. Kent offer vivid recollections of their lives and experiences in Tucumcari, New Mexico, in the mid-twentieth century.

Despite its many successes, the collection is not without a misstep or two. Mark Stegmaier's otherwise illuminating account of the passage of a slave code in New Mexico in 1859, a topic rarely discussed even in histories of race relations in New Mexico, might have been improved by either eliminating the rather lengthy reprinting of the code that appears at the end of the essay or by relocating it to an appendix. The collection would also have benefitted from a brief conclusion, especially considering the wide time span—nearly five hundred years—and the broad topical foci that range from military matters to literature and sports to personal reminiscences.

Minor criticisms aside, this collection is a valuable scholarly addition with generally accessible writing and a deft choice of essay topics. It will find a welcome audience among students of New Mexico history, African Americans in the West, and Western historians more generally.

Pablo Mitchell
Oberlin College

Properties of Violence: Law and Land Grant Struggle in Northern New Mexico. By David Correia. Geographies of Justice and Social Transformation series, no. 17. (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2013. xii + 220 pp. 14 halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. \$69.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8203-3284-0, \$24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8203-4502-4.)

Properties of Violence provides analysis of northern New Mexico's Tierra Amarilla land grant, covering events with which many readers of this journal are undoubtedly familiar. David Correia breaks new ground with this book; untapped theoretical approaches and historical sources enable him to inquire further into Tierra Amarilla, land grants generally, and U.S.-Mexico Borderlands history.

Properties of Violence brings an important theoretical perspective to the study of land grants. Drawing from the field of critical legal studies, Correia problematizes concepts often taken for granted, arguing that "law is a site of social struggle where claims over property are constructed and contested."

Thus efforts by speculators to dispossess land grant communities, and those communities' efforts to retain their lands, represented "a struggle over the very meaning of property that played out in courts and on the ground" (p. 7). Correia concludes that this struggle reveals the ways in which "violence is inherent to law and property" (p. 9).

Correia argues that his study brings the agency of the land grant community to the fore in a way that previous scholars have not. Another perspective might be that academics are trained to use terms like "agency" to refer to efforts by claimants to retain their lands whereas those who study these same questions from a legal, non-academic, and interdisciplinary perspective also document such efforts without using the term "agency."

Properties of Violence weaves in broader themes from U.S.-Mexico Borderlands history, including Ute removal in the 1860s and 1870s, land grant community members' subsequent shift to dependence on the partido system and wage labor, and even whiteness and the prominence of the Ku Klux Klan in national politics in the 1920s. Chapter Three, for example, focuses on the startling assertion that the true author of a handbill reminiscent of *La Mano Negra* (a grassroots organization that opposed the privatization of the Tierra Amarilla grant through fence cutting) was the KKK.

Correia effectively demonstrates the contested nature of property, race, and violence into the twentieth century. The second half of the book delineates the ways in which local activists continued to contest the meanings of property in Tierra Amarilla. In the mid-twentieth century La Corporación de Abiquiú, Merced de Tierra, fought legal battles over grant lands. Although common use of the grant persisted well into the twentieth century, the courts "erased" this history and "replaced it with a history of private property" (p. 117). Correia places the famous courthouse raid of 1967 in broader context and notes the role of violence in "imposing private property rights" (p. 144). In the 1980s, El Consejo de la Tierra Amarilla's "paramilitary approach" was a response to police and state violence (p. 150). The epilogue briefly treats the irony of Jicarilla Apache acquisition of swathes of land within the grant's boundaries.

Overall this book represents a welcome marriage of theory and "on-the-ground" archival research which should prove useful to researchers, scholars, and teachers.

Denise Holladay Damico
Saint Francis University (Pennsylvania)

The Spanish Colonial Settlement Landscapes of New Mexico, 1598–1680. By Elinore M. Barrett. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2012. xvi + 280 pp. Maps, 19 tables, appendixes, notes, works cited, index. \$49.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-5083-1.)

Spanish settlement in New Mexico before the Pueblo Revolt of 1680 was sparse. It also left few documentary records so that the task of reconstruction is difficult and at times speculative. Elinore A. Barrett's efforts to do so are assiduous and heroic. In addition to a clear narration of the data, the author has included a bounty of information in the book's many appendixes, ranging from climatic records to tables of those settlers whose names have survived the passage of time.

Barrett has divided her study into three sections: "The Context of Settlement"; "The Demographic Landscape"; and "The Settlement Landscapes." She traces the natural, institutional, and economic landscapes of the early Spanish settlement and then how the colony's population expanded in the years before 1680. Barrett notes, "On the whole, the natural landscape of New Mexico presented Spaniards with difficult conditions for settlement" (p. 13). There were no precious metals, though Spaniards did continue to seek out silver and limited sources of water and timber. Moreover, by the seventeenth century, Spanish colonial laws sought to limit the exploitation of conquered Indians. Therefore, *encomienda* in New Mexico was limited to tribute in goods, not labor. Nonetheless, the conquerors relied heavily on the labor of Pueblo Indians, sometimes recruited through the *repartimiento* and sometimes enslaved, so their *haciendas* and *estancias* remained close to the *pueblos*.

These "scattered rural landholdings" near the Rio Grande and the *pueblos* "had the greatest impact on the landscape of New Mexico" (p. 162). Although the number of settlers was small, and at times declined precipitously, as in the first years of Juan de Oñate's government, the Spanish presence transformed the area through an intensification of agriculture and irrigation, workshops, *reducciones* of the Indian population, and, especially, through the introduction of ranching in cattle, sheep, and goats.

In contrast the towns and villages of the new colony were relatively insignificant. Barrett has crafted an excellent chapter that seeks to reconstruct the settlement of Santa Fe in the early seventeenth century. The capital was symbolically and politically important but its economic role in New Mexico was minor "because New Mexico lacked a viable mining economy and exported only small amounts of commodities such as hides, salt, piñon, cotton and wool textiles, and slaves to mining districts farther south in New Spain . . . the villa did not have a significant commercial function that could

serve as a basis for growth” (pp. 98–99). At the beginning of the seventeenth century, there were fifty Spanish families in the capital; in 1680 there were seventy. The main action was found in the remote farms and ranches of the Española Basin, the Santa Fe River, and the Middle Rio Grande.

Christopher Schmidt-Nowara
Tufts University

Clyde Tingley's New Deal for New Mexico, 1935–1938. By Lucinda Lucero Sachs. (Santa Fe, N.Mex.: Sunstone Press, 2013. 374 pp. 101 halftones, notes, selected bibliography, index. \$26.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-86534-918-6.)

This may be the best book to date on exactly how the state of New Mexico vastly benefited financially and otherwise from the federal government's early New Deal programs. The fellow who pulled hardest on all the strings between Santa Fe and Washington to make that happen was Gov. Clyde Tingley. In his four years in the governor's chair, he virtually turned New Mexico around from extreme depression to a growing state, from top to bottom in nearly every aspect of the state's life and its people.

Lucinda Lucero Sachs's thorough research for her master's thesis on Tingley and the New Deal evolved into this book, which explores how he implemented New Deal programs, as well as who helped him do so. The man, who appeared on the surface to be neither well-educated nor a polished gentleman, was in that respect somewhat like his friend, Will Rogers, who identified with the common man. Tingley, a well-trained machinist, salesman, and experienced management professional, had a masterful mind. He knew how to build, how to make things work, and how to manage people.

Tingley's hometown girlfriend, Carrie Wooster, came to New Mexico from Ohio with her mother in 1910 for tuberculosis treatment. Tingley followed and they married in April of 1911. They soon became involved in Albuquerque city affairs and state government, treating New Mexico like the family they never had. Her philanthropy and political insight matched his knowledge and will to make things happen, creating a valuable partnership and a most fortunate state of New Mexico.

In order to meet federal standards, he reorganized New Mexico's state government, something not all states achieved during that time. Better order, efficiency, and accountability were put in place. The governor made sure that significant advances in essential systems such as education, infrastructure, water, oil, transportation, bridges, tourism, police, and National Guard security were accomplished while providing employment for the needy masses.

Making all that happen through the legislative process was another aspect of Tingley's finesse.

The archival photos and the monumental collection of references and resources will be of great interest to scholars of New Mexico history and the New Deal. I recommend reading *Clyde Tingley's New Deal for New Mexico* to discover how the governor and his associates accomplished so much in only three years. It is doubtful so much could be achieved in so short a time today.

Kathryn A. Flynn

National New Deal Preservation Association

Santa Fe Indian Market: A History of Native Arts and the Marketplace. By Bruce Bernstein. (Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, 2012. 151 pp. 44 color plates, 40 halftones, selected bibliography, credits, index. \$29.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8901-3548-8.)

Santa Fe Indian Market is a work of art worthy of its subject. The pictures are stunning, the cover is beautiful, and even the interior section divides are elegant. Bernstein, the executive director of the Southwestern Association of Indian Arts (SWAIA), which sponsors the Indian Market, is ideally situated to write its history. The book offers a compelling overview of this near-century-old institution, from its early precursors to its modern, internationally known iteration.

The forces that created the Indian Market—the rise of a tourist market in cheap “curios,” a population of non-Native expatriates who embraced New Mexican cultural traditions, and the Pueblo artists who finessed old forms and experimented with new ones—were specific to the early twentieth century. But, the market has persisted and evolved. It is its longevity, Bernstein argues, that has given the market its place as “royalty” and the “authority on Indian art” throughout the world (p. 7).

The book concentrates on this early period; six of the nine chapters explore the years up to 1931. Bernstein guides readers through the iterations as the organizers, rules, and judging criteria change. Non-Natives initially conceived of the market paternalistically, focusing on educating artists and consumers about traditional methods. From 1922–1931 the Museum of New Mexico coordinated it in conjunction with the Santa Fe Fiesta as a program of “public anthropology.” During the 1930s, the New Mexico Association of Indian Art (NMAIA) took over and brought the fairs to the Pueblos, hoping that more artists would emulate the winning pieces. In 1936 the fairs returned to Santa Fe as weekly events under the Palace of the Governors’ portal, and artists gained more agency

in the exchanges. World War II brought stagnation to the fair, but in 1959 the newly named SWAIA regrouped. It shifted away from the original political agenda of creating economic self-sufficiency and “saving the Indian” to an “arts organization” (p. 110). This resulted in specific rules about who could sell what and where as well as a greater emphasis on individual artists rather than culturally representative pieces. By 1962 the association split from the Fiesta and founded the stand-alone Indian Market. Since then it has experienced massive growth. In 1970, 200 artists participated and by 2012 there were 650 booths covering fourteen city blocks. Success has meant greater oversight (the rules now number in the hundreds of pages). Through it all the SWAIA wants “to maintain the Indian Market’s reputation for quality. At the same time, the association does not want to stifle creativity” (p. 126).

Indeed, Bernstein addresses that tension throughout the book, demonstrating the paternalism of the founders as well as the ways Native artists under a combination of financial need, market demand, cultural priorities, and artistic innovation pushed back. His compelling chapter on innovators Maria and Julian Martinez emphasizes this point. Although some of this story may be familiar, *Santa Fe Indian Market* offers a concise overview in an elegant package. The superb images (44 in color and 40 in black and white) enhance the story of change with beautiful shots ranging from early curios to the glorious diversity of the contemporary market.

Cathleen D. Cahill

University of New Mexico

Dinéjí Na ‘nitin: Navajo Traditional Teachings and History. By Robert S. McPherson. (Boulder: University Press of Colorado, 2012. x + 287 pp. 33 half-tones, map, bibliography, index. \$24.95 paper, ISBN 978-1-60732-216-0.)

McPherson begins his monograph with two seemingly unrelated events: the Wallow Fire of 2011 and the Navajo-Hopi land dispute. He offers a brief overview of each in the introduction titled, “Entering the Táchééh,” and sets the foundation for his work. For McPherson, writing with a non-Navajo audience in mind, these two events highlight the importance of including Diné historic and cultural interpretations.

The nine chapters within the monograph can be read either sequentially or individually as each has their own discrete historic event or cultural teaching. The historic events can be found in Chapter 2, “The 1918–1919 Influenza Epidemic”; Chapter 4, “Too Much Noise in That Bunch across the River”; Chapter 6, “He Stood for Us Strongly: Father H. Baxter Liebler’s Mission

to the Navajo”; and Chapter 7, “Seeing is Believing.” In all four chapters McPherson provides a detailed description of events by using primary sources with special attention to the Diné account. But McPherson goes beyond just including Diné perspectives. He also attempts to contextualize them within the Diné belief system. For example, in the case of the Pectol Shields, found in Chapter 7, McPherson writes about the finding of three shields by Ephraim Pectol in 1926. McPherson then moves to the Diné interpretation of the shields offered by John Holiday, a medicine man, called upon by the federal government. Holiday not only interpreted the symbols on each shield but was able to name the individuals who made and cared for the shields until they were hidden away prior to the Long Walk. The chapter concludes with the repatriation of the shields to the Navajo Nation as a result of the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (1990).

The strength of the monograph is McPherson’s ability to capture the reader’s attention at the start of each chapter through storytelling. For example, in Chapter 4, he writes, “Moonlight turned the yellow cottonwood leaves silver as they drifted in the gentle current of the San Juan River” (p. 101). The effect this has on the entire book is that it takes the standard historical narrative and re-centers it as a story. In some way, the Diné approach to understanding the world through stories is approximated and captivates the reader. Thus, the remaining chapters, focused on elements of Diné traditional teachings, can be better understood as cultural teachings through stories. The teachings range from divination and hand trembling found in Chapter 1, “Wind, Hand, and Stars,” to witching and the powers of medicine men detailed in Chapter 3, “Sacred Evil.” Traditional teachings taught in the home and the importance of the Diné language are explained in the remaining chapters: Chapter 5, “Traditional Teachings and Thought”; Chapter 8, “Of Stars, Goats, and Wind”; and the final chapter, Chapter 9, “Gambling on the Future.”

Although written with a non-Navajo audience in mind this monograph would be useful to all readers as it reaffirms the importance of indigenous oral history, traditions, and cultural practices and aims to privilege them in a western setting.

Majel Boxer
Fort Lewis College

Navajo Tradition, Mormon Life: The Autobiography and Teachings of Jim Dandy. By Robert S. McPherson, Jim Dandy, and Sarah E. Burak. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2012. xiv + 292 pp. 44 halftones, notes, bibliography, index. \$27.95 paper, ISBN 978-1-60781-194-7.)

Jim Dandy (b. 1940) is a retired Navajo educator who has spent his life teaching and coaching Navajo children. It is a life characterized by deep belief in and practice of traditional Navajo teachings. Dandy also “fully embraces Mormonism” (p. x). “I hold two beliefs,” he writes, “and it is very sacred to me to have both LDS and Navajo teachings” (p. 120).

The publication of his story marks a change in trajectory for the growing genre of Navajo autobiography. Earlier autobiographies emphasize tribal life in the context of change, reflecting an underlying theme of traditional culture at risk. By contrast, Dandy’s story is not one of waning tradition struggling for survival, but rather “how one man’s life has successfully bridged two different worlds” in the expectation that both worlds will continue (p. xiv).

McPherson, a historian who specializes in Navajo history and culture, is Dandy’s neighbor. Dandy’s long-standing request that McPherson record his life story was facilitated by anthropologist Sarah Burak, who helped with interviewing and managed transcription and preliminary organization. McPherson “fine-tuned” the results, edited, added contextual material (including extensive endnotes on Navajo culture), and, with Dandy, worked to retain the authentic “Navajo voice” often lost in scholarly restatements of Navajo experience (pp. xi, xiii).

The “rich mixture” that is Dandy’s life has wide application. It provides insight into the relevance of Navajo philosophy for contemporary life, illustrates “what a successful experience in the [LDS] Placement Program meant to a youth coming from the reservation,” and shows “how two very different religious traditions can find compatibility on a common ground” (p. xiv).

The book’s eleven chapters are grouped in three sections, beginning with two chapters on “Historical and Religious Context.” The first summarizes Navajo-Mormon relations in the Southwest, with special emphasis on the past half century and the LDS Indian Student Placement Program. Chapter 2, “Praying to Jesus, Standing for Monster Slayer,” is an innovative exploration of similarities in Mormon and Navajo belief. On the face of it, Navajo religion is sharply distinct from Mormonism. Yet beneath the surface are many parallels. The authors conclude that “concepts central to LDS beliefs such as the Godhead, priesthood power, sacrament, prayer, spiritual assistance, and the creation of the world have their counterparts in Navajo teachings” (p. 49). These authors are not the first to note parallels between Navajo and

LDS religious beliefs, but no one has done it better. For the reviewer, this chapter is worth the price of the book.

Chapters 3–7, “Jim Dandy’s Life,” describe his youth and immersion in Navajo culture, his experience in boarding schools and the LDS Placement Program, his conversion to Mormonism, LDS mission, higher education, marriage and family life, and his career as an educator among the Navajo people. His account of boarding school life during the mid-twentieth century reveals a continuation of many of the abuses of earlier decades. From the child’s standpoint, he says, “there was nobody to protect you,” “there was no love or affection,” and “there was discipline all of the time” (pp. 97, 101).

Chapters 8–11, “Jim Dandy’s Teachings,” are “teachings and experiences that he either has learned from his grandparents and parents or has obtained otherwise as he has lived a traditional life” (p. 159). An underlying theme, apparent in every chapter, is respect—respect for life, heritage, kin, the natural world, and spiritual and supernatural forces. Chapter 8, “Holy People, the Creation, and Its End,” includes a version of the Navajo creation story. Chapter 9, “Animals, Birds, and Insects,” assembles Navajo teachings on creatures relevant to Navajo identity and well-being. Stories from Navajo mythology are interwoven with family lore on how one safely relates to these beings. Chapter 10, “Offerings, Songs, and Ceremonies,” treats dealings with the Holy People, including prayers and blessings, spirituality, and the shoe game.

The final chapter, “The Light and Dark Sides,” concerns “avoiding and curing evil” (p. 227). The Holy People share their power with worthy humans, and supernatural powers can be used for both good and evil. Here Navajo tradition is combined with Dandy’s personal experience of the supernatural, including his role in helping to solve the 1987 murders of two Navajo policemen in Monument Valley.

This is a warm, wise book, intended “to point the way for future generations of young Navajos interested in traditional teachings” (p. 248). It merits wide readership among Navajo adults, who will recognize many issues of their lives in its pages, and among students of twentieth-century Southwestern history, Mormon-Navajo relations, and Navajo Studies generally.

Howard M. Bahr
Brigham Young University

In the Shadow of Billy the Kid: Susan McSween and the Lincoln County War. By Kathleen P. Chamberlain. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2013. xiv + 297 pp. 22 halftones, maps, abbreviations, notes, selected bibliography, index. \$27.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8263-5279-8.)

Susan McSween Barber was intelligent, fascinating, shrewd, and courageous. During her long life that lasted from 1845 to 1931, she played an important role in the history of New Mexico. Kathleen P. Chamberlain has spent years researching in libraries and archives to learn about Susan. She has crafted a well-documented, well-written biography of a woman who came into her own during the conflict in Lincoln County.

Susan grew up on a farm in Pennsylvania. She left home at eighteen, and vanished from the records. In 1873, she reemerged in Abilene, Kansas. By this time she had met and married lawyer Alexander McSween. Susan and Alex settled in Lincoln, New Mexico, in February 1875. Alex worked for Miguel A. Otero Sr., a prominent New Mexican. The connection led the McSweens into deep involvement in the famous conflict over land, money, and cattle that precipitated the five-day Battle of Lincoln in July 1878. Alex was killed, while Susan became homeless after their home burned. However, she had good friends who helped, including John Chisum. By 1879 she was back on her feet, receiving support from various sources.

Susan married another lawyer, George Barber, in 1880. She continued to buy land and cattle, enjoying better prospects briefly while living in White Oaks. In 1883 she moved to her ranch at Three Rivers and was soon running 5,000 head of cattle on some 1,158 acres. She devoted herself to her ranch, the cattle business, and the fruit orchards she had planted.

Her life after 1900 revolved around White Oaks, where declining output of the mines brought financial strain to the area. She slowly sold off her land and cattle. By 1905 she had sold most of her Three Rivers property and all of her lots in Lincoln. By then she had moved back to White Oaks for its better social scene. She kept her orchards and vineyards and grew a town garden. She joined a church and some women's clubs, and continued her social life. Various nieces and nephews visited regularly. In 1917 she traveled east, visiting family in Pennsylvania and Baltimore. After her house burned in 1923, she lived in rented homes until her death.

Reporters and historians began interviewing her in 1907 about the Lincoln County War and Billy the Kid. At first she told the story as she lived it, but quickly learned that they wanted a romantic Billy—so she complied. The first movie on the Lincoln County conflict came out in 1930. It was so inaccurate that Susan walked out of the theatre in anger. Just before Christmas

that year she caught flu that developed into pneumonia. She died destitute in January 1931.

Chamberlain has succeeded in this fine biography by making Susan McSween Barber come alive. More on her post-Lincoln years would have added to the portrait, but sources for the later period were likely very scarce. Chamberlain has added to the history of Lincoln County and White Oaks, giving a wonderful portrait of a vibrant woman.

Jo Tice Bloom

Las Cruces, New Mexico

Dolores del Río: Beauty in Light and Shade. By Linda B. Hall. (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2012. xi + 358 pp. 32 halftones, notes, filmography, bibliography, index. \$30.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8047-8407-8.)

Linda B. Hall's excellent example of historical biography reminds one of the exceptional pleasures associated with reading about the Golden Age of Mexican cinema. This is due in large measure to the enormous involvement of the Mexican government in promoting film as a heavily ideologized vehicle of a specific postrevolutionary discourse about Mexico. Dolores del Río exemplifies this panorama well. She was just exotic enough to make it in Hollywood, where there was room for the right degree of foreignness, but not too much. And, concomitantly, del Río was fair enough to be an exotic presence in Mexican films, perhaps no more so than in her great leading role as María Candelaria, where she is almost ethereal, extraterrestrial in the dense ideologized Mexican space she is plopped down in.

Hall is an exceptionally skillful historian. She engages in a fairly straightforward form of historical biography, following her subject chronologically and tracing in clear and appropriately documented order the development of her personal life and her complex professional evolution. Mexican filmmaking of the period aimed for a dense reality effect in an attempt to provide an overly determined interpretation of certain primes of Mexican life of interest to the industry and its government backers. Filmmakers and their backers intended to promote, in calculatedly affective ways, particular sentiments, reactions, convictions, and (assumedly) behaviors on the part of national audiences. This was no more true than in the case of sexual roles, the "feo, fuerte y formal" formula for men, the chaste, demure, and ennobling formula for women.

As much as I liked this highly professional historical account, I must mix one element of praise with a measure of chide. Hall is to be congratulated for addressing, although often no more than in the fashion of rumor, the question of del Río's sexuality. Some of the men in her life, including her

first husband, did not match the male imaginary projected by Mexican films of the day, and none more so than her neighbor and long-time friend Salvador Novo, who lived as an openly gay man at a time when the stakes were very high in Mexico for such a persona. Del Río also moved in lesbian circles, dominated by her contemporary Sara García, *la Abuelita de México* (Mexico's Grandmother), whose private and public lives were very much not of that sort of venerable figure (Hall never mentions García). One of del Río's close friends—and it is here where I must chide—was Frida Kahlo, who also figures prominently in a history of lesbianism in Mexico. However, while recognizing the homoaffective relationship between Kahlo and del Río, Hall notes: "Frida, of course, preferred men to women" (p. 190). Of course, in serious historiography, there is no room for "of courses," and one wonders what the documentary evidence is, and what interpretational metric is being used here for determining sexual preferences.

But this fine book is still very much a definitive study on the magnificent del Río, and I recommend it with much enthusiasm for its scholarship and for its excellent expository prose.

David William Foster
Arizona State University

From the Republic of the Rio Grande: A Personal History of the Place and the People. By Beatriz de la Garza. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2013. xiii + 225 pp. 27 halftones, maps, works cited, index. \$45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-292-71453-3.)

Beatriz de la Garza's personal history of the people who settled on both sides of the Rio Grande places the humanity of the region's inhabitants at the center of her narrative. She chronologically structures the story of the de la Garza family against the backdrop of life-changing historical moments to illustrate how *norteños* in northeastern Mexico survived events from the U.S.-Mexico War to the Mexican Revolution. Likewise, she contextualizes the experiences and struggles of the de la Garza family within the fields of Mexican and Texas history to show the important roles that the people and places of this region of Mexico played in watershed moments.

The author's general narrative chronicles the story of the de la Garza family in northeastern Mexico and South Texas from the 1750s to the 1950s. She traces the historical roots of this elite family back to the first colonists who were recruited by Don José de Escandón to settle the region. Although her general account of the de la Garza family stresses continuity in cultural traditions, her portrayal of family members highlights how some of them adapted to local and national changes.

The use of personal anecdotes to delineate individual family members is one of the strengths of the book. Personal sketches illuminate how certain members within the boundaries of Mexican culture adjusted to changes, and no chapter explains this better than Chapter 5, with its account of the prodigal son. On the one hand, Fabio Lorenzo de la Garza's venture to open his own store in Raymondville, Texas, in the 1920s is the story of the reckless son who loses the family's inheritance. On the other hand, Fabio's determination to live his dreams echoes the tenacity and aspirations of his ancestors and settlers who founded Camargo, Reynosa, and other frontier communities in northeastern Mexico. Both interpretations of Fabio's business undertaking, nonetheless, share something in common; that Mexican cultural practices enabled Fabio as well as his predecessors to live their dreams, even though sometimes their wishes were short-lived and tragic.

By the same token, the family history approach employed to historicize the significance of the people and place in northeast Mexico demands a comment. Although the focus on the de la Garza and other prominent norteño families puts into perspective the humanity of the elite class, it shadows the humanity of the people who worked for them. Readers will certainly be left wondering to which "people" the book's subtitle refers, besides the elites covered in the narrative.

Despite the above observation, this family history of a norteño elite family invites readers to rethink major historical events, and how the analyses of such moments have shaped the conceptual and chronological boundaries of Chicano history. The primary sources employed to write *From the Republic of the Rio Grande*—the author's family archives—will serve as a starting point for future scholars interested in the history of a people who call the Borderlands between South Texas and northeastern Mexico home for over two centuries.

José Guillermo Pastrano
Portland, Oregon

Dragoons in Apacheland: Conquest and Resistance in Southern New Mexico, 1846–1861. By William S. Kiser. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2013. xiii + 354 pp. 17 halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4314-9.)

New Mexico Territory was an arid and sparsely settled area with few towns in the aftermath of the U.S.-Mexico War. The Mexican settlers there, along with a few Americans, led a hard life trying to wring a living from the land by raising crops and livestock. Indians in the area (this work focuses on the

Apaches) often made that life even more difficult. This book tells the story of government efforts to force the Indians to accept peaceful ways or, failing that, to hunt them to the death. It further illustrates how military and civilian officials often had completely opposing strategies on how best to attain peace in the territory.

Military duty was marked by boredom and frustration as soldiers often dealt with insufficient supplies and meager pay, which many gambled away as soon as they were paid. They also faced some of the same difficulties that American soldiers would encounter in Vietnam over one hundred years later. The elusive Apaches, like the Viet Cong, often had foreknowledge of impending military operations and were able to avoid contact by slipping across the border into Mexico. And in both wars, it was the enemy who initiated most engagements. (The similarities were not lost on the soldiers of the later conflict, who often referred to the enemy-controlled jungles as “Indian territory.”)

A reader interested in antebellum Indian fighting in the Southwest will profit from this book as a good place to start, but Kiser’s undisguised sympathy for the Apaches mars the work. He often reminds the reader that the main reason for their murderous raids was that they were simply hungry and trying to find sustenance (pp. 94, 128, 202). This justification might have some legitimacy with regard to Apache raids on cattle or sheep herds, but it falls short when one considers how often Apaches stole horses and mules, kidnapped women, or attacked settlers on the way to California or soldiers on wood-chopping, water-hauling, or mail delivery details. There are mistakes in this book, and although books are rarely completely free of errors, some of these suggest a certain lack of diligence on the author’s part. Perhaps a couple of examples will illustrate. Kiser, for example, misidentifies Winfield Scott as U.S. Secretary of War (p. 75), and when four dragoon companies transferred to Tucson, the author has them leaving New Mexico altogether (p. 187), when, in fact, New Mexico Territory at that time included Tucson. And on the selection of David Meriwether as governor of New Mexico in 1853, Kiser claims that Meriwether’s selection was likely due to his “previous knowledge of and familiarity with the territory, as few eastern politicians could claim a better understanding of its complexities than him” (p. 153). Meriwether, however, only spent approximately one month in Santa Fe almost thirty-five years earlier when Spanish authorities arrested him as a spy. Although none of these are of great importance to the overall theme of the book, they might cause the reader new to the topic to wonder what other errors might be encountered.

James M. McCaffrey
University of Houston-Downtown

At the Border of Empires: The Tohono O'odham, Gender, and Assimilation, 1880–1934. By Andrea M. Marak and Laura Tuennerman. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2013. xiii + 209 pp. 13 halftones, maps, notes, selected bibliography, index. \$55.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-2115-9.)

At the Border of Empires chronicles how reformers, specifically missionaries and Office of Indian Affairs (OIA) officials, targeted the Tohono O'odham in southern Arizona for assimilation through anti-vice campaigns and educational policies aimed at imposing the mainstream culture's gender ideology and economic values. The authors also emphasize Tohono O'odham negotiations with reform efforts, whether by active or passive resistance, and the incorporation of new values and technologies that interested them. The authors contend that this study is warranted because the Tohono O'odham were situated at the nexus of two nation-states, Mexico and the United States, and both were engaged in assimilation and modernization campaigns aimed at minority and immigrant groups.

Chapter 1 provides Tohono O'odham historical background, followed by a chapter on OIA and missionary reform efforts to eliminate indigenous alcohol consumption. The determination of tribal members to maintain ceremonial drinking practices largely undermined OIA efforts, although some Tohono O'odham at times sought assistance from OIA officials and missionaries out of a desire to protect their families from outside influences. The third chapter looks at reformers' efforts to alter Tohono O'odham gender roles by encouraging legally sanctioned, Christian, monogamous marriages, patriarchal households, and a gendered division of labor that emphasized unpaid female domestic labor within the home and male activity in ranching and farming. OIA field matrons, mostly white single women, trained the Tohono O'odham in hygiene and health, as well as gender ideals to which the matrons often did not adhere.

Chapter 4 discusses the implementation of Indian day and boarding schools that followed a gendered curriculum. This chapter also explores the legal and coercive means used to compel attendance and the denominational competition between Catholic and Protestant missionaries. Chapter 5 analyzes how reformers instituted vocational training to inculcate in the Tohono O'odham individual property ownership, the production of surplus, and engagement with the cash economy to prepare them for future citizenship. Gendered curriculum in schools and vocational training through the outing system, paradoxically, increased the numbers of indigenous women entering domestic wage labor in cities. Unfortunately, the transition from a subsistence to a wage economy altered tribal traditions and rendered some Tohono O'odham especially vulnerable to the Great Depression.

Finally, the sixth chapter demonstrates the gendered, and more successful, assimilation process occurring among the Tohono O'odham in Mexico. Once unified by a two-village system, the Tohono O'odham witnessed the imposition of an international border which altered the trajectories of a previously unified people. Although interesting, this chapter's analysis feels somewhat incomplete in an otherwise well-researched narrative.

I enjoyed this book very much and believe it would make a wonderful addition to undergraduate courses. This is a solid study that contributes insights into an understudied group in United States and Mexican history.

Erika Pérez

University of Arizona

Mapping Wonderlands: Illustrated Cartography of Arizona, 1912–1962. By Dori Griffin. (Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 2013. ix + 219 pp. 17 halftones, 55 maps, notes, index. \$55.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-0932-4.)

Dori Griffin tells the story of how Arizona was cartographically represented in its first fifty years of statehood from 1912 to 1962. She concentrates on popular cartography, and in particular, what she terms cartographs: “pictorial, narrative, not-to-scale maps intended for popular audiences” (p. 22). A useful appendix lists the more popular designers including George Avery (1906–1973), art director of *Arizona Highways*, Don Bloodgood (1897–1989) who produced maps for Shell Oil and local chambers of commerce, and Harriet Cobb (1891–1967) who used subtle illustrative techniques in her maps of the state for the private Arizona Mapping Service. Cartographs were produced in large numbers in brochures, guidebooks, and magazines—*Arizona Highways*, *Desert*, and *Progressive Arizona* were important print outlets—and souvenir publications such as postcards. Tourists comprised the largest audience, with both map consumers and, less frequently, the mapmakers themselves represented in the maps. Visitors mainly populated the maps, while residents made cameos. Artists depicted Native Americans as almost a part of the landscape, more natural elements than social beings; they were exotic but unthreatening local color. The cartographs showed an Arizona populated by sunbathers, hikers, and golfers enjoying the wonders of the state.

Griffin not only lifts these mapmakers and their work from the neglect of obscurity, she contextualizes their work as a form of placemaking. They told a story. The cartographs were not scientific documents but cultural artifacts that embodied deeper narratives. She shows how the diagrams flattened and

compressed historical time to present a timeless landscape shorn of contemporary events. However, for tourists, the timeless landscape had to be traversed on modern roads, so there was creative tension between the presentation of a primeval wilderness laced with the modern convenience of roads and hotels. There was also the tension in the empty void presented by tourist publications and the modern opportunities promoted through the booster images of local chambers of commerce. The cartographs attractively filled in the maps, sometimes taking the form of historical vignettes showing Arizona's modern society emerging from primeval wilderness, other times depicting a limitless supply of attractions strung evenly along well-maintained highways, thus presenting an ideal package of accessibility and novelty.

Griffin argues that there were three dominant themes embedded in the cartographic narratives: "The state as lush garden, an alien desert and a futuristic metropolis" (p. 129). The lush garden theme was an important element in the booster imagery that stressed the economic promise of an irrigated land. The desert theme was an essential element in much of the touristic imagery. In 1962 one cover for *Arizona Highways* depicted the state as having moved from "its primitive past," to "its pleasant present," and on its way to "its fantastic future." This theme of progress was at the heart of this third narrative trope and resonates today. Arizona as timeless past, a desert, a lush garden, a place both before historical time and at the edge of modernity all play out in contemporary imaginaries.

The author is to be congratulated for bringing back to public view images circulating at an early stage in Arizona's placemaking. She focuses on an important though neglected form of visual representation and place narration. She has pulled together an impressive range of illustrations.

The book is important in three respects. First, it is a good example of how images shape ideas of place. Second, it highlights the role of ephemeral popular visual culture. Finally, it augments our understanding of how Arizona was represented, imagined, and consumed. The argument is crisp, the illustrations are illuminating, and the result is interesting and informative. This is a good book for anyone interested in Arizona and the Southwest, the twentieth-century history of U.S. cartography, and popular visual culture.

John Rennie Short
University of Maryland, Baltimore County

Across God's Frontiers: Catholic Sisters in the American West, 1850–1920. By Anne M. Butler. (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2012. xxi + 424 pp. 37 halftones, glossary, notes, bibliography, index. \$45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8078-3565-4.)

Across God's Frontiers offers the first comprehensive history of Roman Catholic sisters traveling, working, and living their religion in the nineteenth- and early-twentieth-century American West. Telling their story is an ambitious project—by 1890, more than 11,000 Catholic women religious resided west of the Mississippi River (p. 19). These sisters and postulants came from different backgrounds, spoke different languages (although English dominated in their work), pursued different professions, and served different western communities, from Mexican barrios to Anglo mining camps to Indian reservations. Drawing on extensive archival material, including papers from more than thirty women's congregations, Anne Butler ably conveys the breadth of western sisters' experiences. She also gives readers detailed glimpses into the lives of dozens of these women—from Mother Alfred Moes, the Franciscan behind the Mayo Clinic in Minnesota, to Sister Many Benitia, who mentored and advocated for Mexican Catholic women in Houston. These stories do important work; they speak to the personalities, the idiosyncrasies, and the all-around humanness of women often typecast in American society as otherworldly figures, “perpetually entranced by the supernatural” (p. 170).

Located between two bodies of scholarship—histories of the American West and histories of women religious, *Across God's Frontiers* makes significant contributions to each. Butler identifies sisters as a crucial, overlooked class of western women, and demonstrates their impact on the West by drawing attention to their interactions with its non-Anglo peoples and their role in its emerging, Anglo-dominated economies. She also explores how time spent in the West changed sisters' religious lives. This second project provides the central framework for Butler's study. Over time, she argues, the realities of western living transformed individuals and congregations, forcing them to abandon the rules of enclosure that structured religious life for their European forebears. In responding to day-to-day challenges unique to life in the West, sisters cultivated, albeit unintentionally, new ambitions and new forms of agency. “Out-of-the-ordinary circumstances,” Butler writes, “caused sisters to reassess the boundaries of their abilities, their prospects in religious life, and the reaches of womanhood” (p. 71).

Butler largely avoids romanticizing sisters. She recognizes that these women often shared their own cultures' (both Catholic and American) troubling assumptions about race, class, and gender, and she acknowledges

their fallibility in interpreting the Hispanic and Native cultures they encountered. “Nuns often acted with parochial ignorance and cultural blindness,” she writes in her introduction, “even as they made specific contributions to regional and national events” (p. 4). Despite this critical awareness, there are places in the book where Butler’s interest in personal and collective transformation guides her primarily toward episodes of sisters “cross[ing] boundaries” and challenging cultural biases, and away from offering a full account of the Anglo-, American-, and Catholic-centric worldview that even well-intentioned sisters embodied and pressed upon those they met (p. 227). Her focus in Chapter 7, for example, on group song as a “meeting ground” for sisters and their Native students, could be balanced with greater attention to mutual frustration, born from the “violent linguistic world” sisters participated in as they taught an English curriculum to those students (p. 239). That said, the overall care Butler takes in her book, presenting the complex and nuanced ways in which sisters changed, and were changed by, life in the American West, makes it a must-read for anyone interested in nineteenth-century western life.

Kathleen A. Holscher

University of New Mexico