New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 81 | Number 2 | Article 6

4-1-2006

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr

Recommended Citation
. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 81, 2 (2021). https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol81/iss2/6

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in New Mexico Historical Review by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

UFOs over Galisteo and Other Stories of New Mexico's History. By Robert J. Torrez. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2004. xii + 169 pp. 19 halftones, bibliographic notes, glossary, index. $16.95 paper, ISBN 0-8263-34435-0.)

In 1992 a Santa Fe editor asked Robert J. Torrez if he would like to write a regular New Mexico history column for her publication. Torrez agreed, and since at that time he was state historian with the New Mexico State Records Center and Archives (NMSRCA), he had unprecedented access to an often-overlooked collection of rich primary materials. *UFOs over Galisteo* consists of more than thirty-five of these newspaper columns, all supported by brief biographical notes, as well as a helpful glossary of archaic Spanish terms. Taken as a whole, this shotgun collection of essays provides a tantalizing glimpse into the lives of ordinary New Mexicans from the eighteenth to the early twentieth century.

Because the NMSRCA is the official government repository, many of the essays by Torrez focus on the prominent public concerns of the time period: the early-nineteenth-century Hispanic settlers' fear of Ute and Navajo raiders; the near panic when a Ute delegation visited Santa Fe in 1844; disputes over acequias and failed business ventures; and an almost comical "Taos tax revolt" in 1816.

The official records also contain numerous tales of people running afoul of the law. From 1849 to 1908, for example, territorial officials legally executed fifty-one people. Accused murderer Theodore Baker of Las Vegas has the dubious distinction of being hanged twice, as the initial vigilante effort fell short of the mark. Hillsboro teenagers Valentine Madrid and Alma Lyons were headed for the same fate—for allegedly slipping arsenic into Madrid's husband's coffee—but the governor commuted their sentences to life imprisonment at the very last moment. (They were eventually pardoned in 1920.) In 1896 the *Silver City Enterprise* noted with apparent glee that

nine accused murderers were scheduled to be hanged on the same day, which "beats the record for the west" (p. 87). Territorial New Mexico seems to have earned its reputation as a fairly rugged place in which to live.

Perhaps ironically, the written documents that Torrez draws upon also point to the crucial role that words played in this largely oral culture. In 1880, for example, several people swore that they saw an "air machine" shaped like a large fish hovering over what is now Lamy. The consensus: it was a balloon sent from China with a secret message for a traveler. In 1910 rumors of a widespread Taos Indian revolt caused the governor to call out the militia, only to discover that a single fence had been cut in a land boundary dispute. When Santa Fean Anna Maria Romero called a woman a *puta* (whore) in public, she was forever banished to Albuquerque. In a largely oral culture, words can carry a power all their own.

Overall, this brief collection of essays is a delight. Torrez strikes just the right tone as he skillfully lifts the curtain on the semi-obscure worlds of scores of "forgotten people" in New Mexico's complex and fascinating past.

Ferenc M. Szasz
University of New Mexico

Santa Fe Hispanic Culture: Preserving Identity in a Tourist Town. By Andrew Leo Lovato. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2004. xiii + 140 pp. 13 halftones, 4 maps, bibliography, index. $24.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8263-3225-0.)

Tourism, Santa Fe, Hispano culture, and identity make for an interesting mix and are the stuff of academic musings. Andrew Leo Lovato attempts to understand the dynamics of cultural intervention in New Mexico in his book *Santa Fe Hispanic Culture*. Over the last 120 years, various individuals and groups in collusion with the tourist industry have attempted to manipulate Hispano cultural production to produce a myth of Spanish colonial traditionalism through the process of commodification. This myth essentializes the Native peoples of Santa Fe and the surrounding villages into bearers of New Mexico's cultural essence—archetypal New Mexicans living not in an arid and punishing landscape but in a mythic land of sunshine and enchantment. In this mythic landscape, Hispano material culture and intellectual property have been recontextualized by elite arbiters of culture and displayed in galleries, museums, and markets. These venues display the landscape and cultures of New Mexico as historical tableaux,

transcending the complexities of everyday life and representing Native people as "other," or as Ian McKay describes, spectacles to be appropriated and enjoyed within the objectifying gaze of tourism.

The ungainly and somewhat cumbersome term *commodification* denotes a particular social construction of things that people value: commodities. Commodification, then, refers to the social process of transforming and converting ideas, objects, and events into articles of trade or commerce in the capitalistic marketplace, and turning social activities into economic ones. Lovato's book is an example of "contested commodification," in which the author shares his personal and social conflict about the process and its result.

The engine that drives much of Lovato's analysis is tourism. Tourism is the glue that binds together the various stakeholders in Santa Fe—locals, artists, politicians, and patrons. Lovato attempts to explain how tourist consumption and tourist site productions merge to create a tradition of tourism in New Mexico and Santa Fe that feeds the economy but dilutes the local culture. These economic and social transactions include the commodification and the marketing of Hispano cultural production as well as the transformation of Hispano identity. Lovato relies on a few texts to move the discussion of tourism and the preservation of Hispano identity forward, particularly the well-researched work of Chris Wilson. However, one of Lovato's shortcomings is his reliance on a limited range of texts, which waters down his research.

Lovato's book addresses an important topic with great scholarly potential, but he fails to treat the subject with academic rigor. *Santa Fe Hispanic Culture* may serve as an introductory text that will perhaps pique the interest of the passing tourist, but readers seeking source material or insights into the complex questions of identity and culture in the multifaceted town that is Santa Fe should look elsewhere.

Dennis Peter Trujillo
Albuquerque, New Mexico

¡Chistes! Hispanic Humor of Northern New Mexico and Southern Colorado. Edited and translated by Nasario García, foreword by John Nichols. (Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, 2004. xiv + 176 pp. Glossary. $29.95 cloth, ISBN 0-89013-430-8, $19.95 paper, ISBN 0-89013-431-6.)

Respected New Mexico folklorist Nasario García, now over ninety years old, has dedicated much of his distinguished career to gathering and

preserving Nuevomexicano folklore through interviews with scores of *los viejitos* (the old ones). This endeavor is not an idle mission. In certain areas of Nuevomexicano art and culture, there is a race against time to record and safeguard traditional folk literature, music, choreography, and visual art techniques. The living repositories of the old ways, as recited, written, created, danced, or expressed since colonial times through the early twentieth century, have almost all disappeared.

A former professor of languages at New Mexico Highlands University, García has collected, translated, and published several collections of folk tales and histories. In *¡Chistes!* (anecdotes or jokes) he turns his attention to the humor of northern New Mexico and southern Colorado, two areas that have been united as one cultural region much longer than they have been separated by a state line. The result is a book of hilarity that is unique in current New Mexico literature.

Here, the reader will find jokes presented in both English and Spanish, and listed alphabetically by the names of the forty-three men and women who provided them during interviews with García, and through prior publications by Juan B. Rael and Philomeno Sánchez. The contributors range in age from sixty to ninety years old, and thirty-four of them live in rural communities.

The chistes touch on a variety of themes from expansions on a simple observation, "Corn is Like a Lie," to pranks, "Bread Made of Dung," double entendres in the original Spanish (with explanations in English), the ubiquitous don Cacahuate and doña Cebolla (Mr. Peanut and Mrs. Onion, classic characters of border humor), and, interestingly, outwitted kings. New Mexico chistes about royalty prompt curiosity about their age and origins, given the established antiquity of some Spanish folk poetry on the subject of royalty that has been collected in New Mexico. Some of these jokes could have been told in colonial times, but others are definitely contemporary. Most are witty, clever, funny, or silly. For others, "you had to be there."

To assist with navigating New Mexico's well-known Cervantian variations of the Spanish language, the author includes a glossary of regional words and their standard Spanish versions. John Nichols provides an amusing foreword to set the stage, and García's introduction provides helpful background and context to the anecdotes. This book should be of interest to a wide audience of folklorists, anthropologists, linguists, bilingual and Spanish-

speaking readers in general, and Nuevomexicanos of all ages with an interest in their cultural legacy.

Mary Montaño
University of New Mexico

Georgia O'Keeffe and New Mexico: A Sense of Place. By Barbara Buhler Lynes, Lesley Poling-Kempes, and Frederick W. Turner. (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2004. 143 pp. 66 color plates, 20 halftones, index. $39.95 cloth, ISBN 0-691-11659-8.)

If you know northern New Mexico, you will cherish the images and three fine essays in *Georgia O'Keeffe and New Mexico: A Sense of Place*. If not, it will make you yearn to go there to experience for yourself its epic mountains, canyons, rivers, and deserts.

For forty years, O'Keeffe roamed much of this territory. Sometimes she made notations in pencil, pen, and watercolor. Sometimes she set up her easel on a windy site. Sometimes she took her own photographs in order to enlarge or compress a space she wished to render on canvas later in her studio. New Mexico was the country of O'Keeffe's spirit and she painted it from sixty known sites during 1929 to 1971, when at the age of eighty-four, she lost her central vision to macular degeneration.

The images reproduced in this small, lovely book are instructively organized into eight of O'Keeffe's favorite places: Taos, Alcalde, Tierra Azul, Black Place, Chama River, White Place, and the territories around her Abiquiu and Ghost Ranch homes.

As Barbara Buhler Lynes points out in her essay, O'Keeffe's depictions of the landscape look literal at first glance, but they are intrinsically abstract. Often natural colors are used as points of departure to intensify her palette; the forms are manipulated. When we become aware of this, the paintings become excitingly ambiguous—at once potent and reticent—like the painter herself.

The book's contemporary photographs, taken by Mark Kane and Herbert Lotz, capture O'Keeffe's actual sites and illustrate just how inventively she synthesized points of view and how often she relied on camera lens information to do it (two photographs by Todd Webb depict her wielding her own Leica). The compression of space in *Red Hill and Bones* in 1941 (p. 106) is a perfect example.

Georgia O'Keeffe and New Mexico allows us to see how often the artist chose to emphasize the same abstract geometric forms in this landscape that she had loved and used since 1915—especially the triangle (*Hill, New Mexico*, 1935, p. 23), the spiral (*The Mountain, New Mexico*, 1935, p. 94), the circle (*Red Hills and White Flower*, 1937, p. 97), and the curving plant forms of Art Nouveau (*Stump in Red Hills*, 1940, p. 107).

Lesley Poling-Kempes's essay documents and describes the geologic layers—Cretaceous, Jurassic, Triassic—of the great cliffs around O'Keeffe's beloved Ghost Ranch, which she painted repeatedly. She is known even to have put stone dust and sand into her pigments to attain a secret verisimilitude.

Frederick W. Turner offers a personal glimpse of Santa Fe's regional and social history—a realm O'Keeffe chose not to enter—and then describes a recent pilgrimage he took to some of her favorite hills, gullies, and cliffs: still remote, still beautiful. O'Keeffe's essential solitude is never more apparent than in her unpeopled western landscapes. She grasped their truth through all of her senses—not just her eye. Perhaps this freedom that she felt to be different—to be herself—is what makes her art so American.

Sarah Whitaker Peters
Bronxville, New York

A Woman of the Century, Frances Minerva Nunnery (1898–1997): Her Story in Her Own Memorable Voice as Told to Cecil Dawkins. Edited by Cecil Dawkins, foreword by Max Evans. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2002. xii + 151 pp. 23 halftones. $12.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8263-2851-2.)

"At last spring finally came. Anita was about nine months old. I dug what cash I had left out of the gallon jar, provided myself with a little from the larder, put the baby in a basket on the seat [of the Model T] beside me, and I picked up and left this preacher. I couldn't stand him. I aimed to start a new life" (p. 38).

Frances Minerva Nunnery was twenty-two years old when she purchased a Model T Ford touring car with a World War I Liberty Bond, outfitted it as a camper and left her "arranged" marriage in rural Colorado to start a new life in New Mexico. What a life it turned out to be. Born in 1898 in Covington, Kentucky, Nunnery died nearly a century later in Silver City, her last home among the many she made for herself in New Mexico. Her life spanned the twentieth century and she witnessed all the rapid industrial, technologi-

cal, and social changes of that period. Nunnery not only made the most of new opportunities, she shaped them to her liking. Born in an age when women endured rigid gender restrictions on their behaviors and lifestyles, Nunnery lived her life according to what she wanted to do next. She has been described as unconventional, a maverick, and a tanned and weathered Earth Mother, but above all, Nunnery was a clever, industrious woman, an entrepreneur in the best sense of the term.

In the early decades of the twentieth century, many Americans contracted tuberculosis, including Nunnery, who in 1919 was working for Westinghouse in Pittsburgh. The company offered to transfer her to the Denver office and pay medical expenses while she recovered in the mountain climate, but her mother had another plan for the daughter who she thought ought to be more "respectable": marriage to a Colorado man who had been attending a Bible Institute in Pittsburgh. "And that was the beginning of the worst time of my whole life," Nunnery reported to her editor and friend, Cecil Dawkins. Not one to stay in a situation she did not like, she loaded up the Model T with her nine-month-old baby daughter Anita and headed over Raton Pass, coasting "down into a place where they spoke another language" (p. 39).

Her first stop, and a place she would return to later as a real estate agent, was the quiet Hispanic-Indian village of Taos. Because her parents had been in New Mexico when the railroad was being built and had described a landscape of mesas and buttes, filled with the smell of sage and piñon, Nunnery believed she had "inherited New Mexico in my blood. It felt like coming home" (p. 42). Though she continued to "run around the state in the Model T looking for a place to settle" (p. 43), she never lived anywhere else because "New Mexico has everything" (p. x). In 1929, when a banker offered her two ranches in Catron County that the bank held through foreclosures, she became a rancher. Later she purchased two others in Mountainair and Eagle Nest. In Datil, a tiny town in west central New Mexico, she bought, rebuilt, and restored the once-bustling Navajo Lodge and ran a turkey farm. In Albuquerque, however, her entrepreneurial spirit was at its best. Her first job, thanks to her Model T, was as a chauffeur. Next she hauled manure from a South Valley stockyard and sold it as fertilizer for gardens and yards. She worked as a maid at the Franciscan Hotel, became the first woman bus driver in the city, worked as a grocery checker, and pumped gas. Her creative work ethic took her into the boardinghouse business where she roasted, packaged, and sold peanuts on the back porch and at a hotdog stand. She opened an auction house; bought, repaired, and sold old cars; developed a

delivery service by putting sidecars on motorcycles and hiring young boys to deliver groceries and other goods; and became a blues singer in Albuquerque nightclubs. According to Nunnery, "You had to have two or three things going to keep you busy. . . . I've worked hard all my life, but work's always been my pleasure. . . . Do the best you can with the tools you've got; if you're not making mistakes you're not doing anything" (p. 148).

Nunnery's life was not without sorrows. Circumstances forced her to send her four-year-old daughter back east to live with her mother. The mother-daughter relationship was challenged again when Nunnery's estranged husband kidnapped the child and took her to Africa; it took Nunnery four years to get Anita back. Nunnery was almost raped by a brother-in-law as a teen, and endured marital rape by her first husband. She later remarried and divorced again. She thwarted a burglar in her Taos home in her seventies, and suffered from arthritis the last fifteen years of her life. Although she is mostly silent on how she felt about these events, her identity as a twentieth-century western woman comes through "in her own memorable voice."

Writer Cecil Dawkins has shaped a fascinating portrait of this strong and strong-minded woman based on interviews with Nunnery in her Silver City home in the 1990s. Like many western memoirists, Nunnery is spare in recounting her emotions; nevertheless, the reader is left with the distinct impression that she lived an adventurous and meaningful life, loved by all who knew her. Hers is a welcome addition to the growing list of personal accounts that enhances our knowledge of women's and western history. I wish I had known her.

Sandra Schackel
Boise State University

Continental Crossroads: Remapping U.S.-Mexico Borderlands History. Edited by Samuel Truett and Elliott Young, foreword by David J. Weber. American Encounters/Global Interactions. (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 2004. xiv + 344 pp. Halftones, maps, notes, index. $22.95 paper, ISBN 0-8223-3389-9, $79.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8223-3353-8.)

Continental Crossroads evolved from various encounters among scholars of Borderlands, Chicana/o, and Latin American history, and from a manuscript symposium at the William P. Clements Center for Southwest Studies at Southern Methodist University. For the most part junior scholars, the con-

tributors represent a trend away from persistent traditions of Borderlands scholarship situating work on northern Mexico and the U.S. Southwest within respective nation-states and segregating the training of scholars within fixed geographic emphases — U.S. or Latin America (although even here the weaker grounding in Latin American history produces minor errors in some of the essays). David J. Weber states in the foreword, "They make a case that American history should be transnational as well as transcontinental" (p. ix).

Although the concepts of frontiers, borders, and Borderlands have become theoretically fashionable and perhaps a bit too encompassing in an era of globalization, editors Truett and Young offer an introduction that concisely lays out the historiography of the U.S.-Mexico Borderlands within its regional (and Chicana/o) contexts and explains the imperative for delinking Borderlands history from the logic of a specific region (American West, Southwest, Mexican North) or nation-state. While noting the marginalized positions of the Mexican North and the U.S. Southwest compared with their respective nations until recently, they take issue with Jeremy Adelman and Stephen Aron who have argued that the rise of hegemonic nation-states in the early nineteenth century fixed the Borderlands as "nationally and ethnically bounded" (p. 15). The contributors to this volume describe a much more fluid transnational context in the U.S.-Mexico Borderlands (in spite of increasing barriers from the 1930s), and their selections are situated in recent approaches that emphasize the complexities of ethnic and gendered identities.

We see how ethnic conflicts were negotiated and at times transcended in essays by Raúl Ramos on cooperation between San Antonio Tejanos, Apaches, and Comanches; by Grace Peña Delgado on Chinese merchants and laborers in the Arizona-Sonora border region; and by Karl Jacoby on the African American colony in the Laguna region of Durango. Andrés Reséndez complicates Benedict Anderson's thesis about print capitalism and the nation-state by examining competing literary forms by Mexicans, Kiowas, and Anglo Americans that produced different notions of ethnic and national difference. Benjamin Johnson goes beyond questioning who authored the Plan de San Diego in 1915 to explore in detail how it deepened divisions among Mexicans in south Texas and laid the basis for subsequent political alignments. Patriarchy looms large in two essays: Louise Pubols's analysis of how Californios in southern California retained power for decades after U.S. occupation, and Barbara Reyes's look at how elites appropriated and manipulated the story of a murder perpetrated by a woman in

Baja California to further ideologically different ends in the late colonial period and at mid-nineteenth century. Alexandra Minna Stern explores the ways in which gender stereotypes and models contributed to the racialization of the border. The editors' contributions—Elliott Young on border journalist Ignacio Martínez and Samuel Truett on border "policeman" Emilio Kosterlitzky—examine the careers and mentalities of these border crossers to show how their transnational identities mingled with their Mexicanness and patriotism as they grappled in very different ways with modernity in the early twentieth century.

This collection demonstrates that engaging the social and cultural complexities of Borderlands history allows for the historical emergence of individuals, groups, and encounters whose histories have been erased by hegemonic approaches. At the same time, we must be careful not to overemphasize their agency, as the last essay by Stern implicitly cautions. What this volume makes clear, however, is that ethnic and power relations in the Borderlands have not evolved in black-and-white contexts, neatly delineated by national hegemony and geographical borders.

Susan M. Deeds
Northern Arizona University

Frontier Texas: History of a Borderland to 1880. By Robert F. Pace and Donald S. Frazier. (Abilene, Tex.: State House Press, 2004. 272 pp. Halftones, maps, bibliography, index. $19.95 cloth, ISBN 1-880510-83-9.)

Written in the best narrative tradition, *Frontier Texas* is full of good stories, wonderful yarns, and pleasing anecdotes. It covers the larger Abilene country, an area of greater west Texas that the authors, professors of history at McMurry University in Abilene, call a "borderland" between regions of settlement. Perhaps ironically, the authors close their narrative in the year 1880, when railroad leaders established Abilene. The book addresses Comanche life, Spanish exploration, Texas Rangers, frontier military posts, bison hunting, cattle and sheep ranching, cattle trailing, and other topics traditionally associated with early Anglo occupation of the area.

The authors see the wide, wind-swept prairie country, a region rich in grasslands that once supported enormous herds of bison and cattle, as a natural borderland over which various groups competed for control and occupation. Comanches, for instance, wrestled the territory from Lipan

Apaches and then battled Spanish soldiers, missionaries, and settlers for the land. Later, Texas settlers, supported by aggressive Texas Ranger forces and a growing number of federal military troops, moved into the Comanche-claimed territory.

There is much that is familiar in the book, but there is also much that is new, especially some of the tales used to illustrate broader themes. The major theme centers on the struggle for the land, and as a result the book contains much information on battles, skirmishes, fights, and ambushes, especially between Comanches and federal and state forces. A second important theme is the transformation of the region, including the extension of overland mail service, the post–Civil War expansion of cattle raising, the introduction of barbed wire, and the building of early railroads. A third theme relates to frontier personalities; carefully chosen vignettes describe many of the region's "heroes" and leading figures, including men and women, blacks and American Indians, and settlers, soldiers, and explorers.

The book contains many photographs and eight superb maps. It also contains a few drawings, some of which are recent renditions that unaccountably attribute modern features to such historical characters as Cynthia Ann Parker, making them look like twenty-first century figures—fashion models in Cynthia Ann's case.

Finally, the authors designed the book to serve as something of a companion piece to a large, new museum—a "historical attraction" and visitor center called "Frontier Texas" located on the east side of downtown Abilene. Clearly, this engaging and informative little book will stand solidly on its own.

Paul H. Carlson
Texas Tech University

Presidio, Mission, and Pueblo: Spanish Architecture and Urbanism in the United States. By James Early. (Dallas, Tex.: Southern Methodist University Press, 2004. xii + 260 pp. 16 color plates, 138 halftones, notes, bibliography, index. $49.95 cloth, ISBN 0-87074-482-8, $29.95 paper, ISBN 0-87074-484-4.)

James Early opens *Presidio, Mission, and Pueblo* with a comment by Walt Whitman that "Spanish character" would be, in time, an important part of "America's" (i.e., the United States) national identity (p. 1). Early's employment of this prophetic observation as a point of departure not only validates his work but also sets the tone for the volume.

Each chapter focuses on a state located in the Southeast coastal and Southwest areas of the country, i.e., Florida (including parts of Georgia and South Carolina), Louisiana, New Mexico, Texas, Arizona, and California. The chapters begin with a historical survey of the region, followed by a discussion of specific settlements, their founding, development, and architecture. The first chapter provides a summary of what Early more fully develops in the next six; the final chapter presents a brief historiography of the study of Novohispanic settlements and architecture. This last section concludes with a historical recap that seems unnecessary, given its brevity and the fact that this information is thoroughly covered in the preceding chapters.

One of the book's strengths is its comprehensive survey of architectural and urban traditions that not only predate the United States, but inform a significant part of its living cultural heritage—one that has been overshadowed, historically, by the U.S.-British colonial period, and geographically, by New England. Ironically, the indissoluble conjunction of U.S. and Mexican geography, histories, and populations is implicit in Early's nation-oriented approach. The U.S.-Mexico border, established in 1848, not only fragmented contiguous space but most significantly time and memory. What remained within the United States' geopolitical framework was reconfigured in response to the politically driven demands of emerging nationalist ideas and representations. This observation underscores a potentially problematic approach in historical surveys of this sort: imposing a contemporary, organizational model onto a geographic and cultural context, which was conceptually, politically, and spatially aligned along very different lines. States did not yet exist and are thus irrelevant, if not precarious, as interpretive paradigms for this material.

Language, writing style, and inadequate editing, too, pose certain problems. For instance, Early's use of the term *North America*, identifying only what is now north of the border, is questionable, given its imprecision, since Mexico is part of this geographic category. Similarly, other items of information may need to be double-checked, such as the statement regarding pre-contact Pueblo Indian building practices. The text can also be difficult to follow at times, since the reader must frequently skip back and forth in time, successively shifting from one site to another.

James Early's text remains a valuable introduction to northern Novohispanic architectural traditions. The detailed information he provides paints a vivid picture of the social and physical environments in each of the noted sites, facilitating further inquiry. Early's timely project to properly address

material normally marginalized in both U.S. and Colonial Mexican art and architectural studies, and to more widely disseminate this research, constitute significant contributions to our understanding of architecture and urban design in early modern America (i.e., the Western Hemisphere).

Ray Hernández-Durán
University of New Mexico

Rio Grande. Edited by Jan Reid. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2004. xxiii + 337 pp. 50 duotones. $29.95 cloth, ISBN 0-292-70601-4.)

Famed editor Robert Giroux once remarked that "most editors are failed writers—but so are most writers." Jan Reid's editorial debut proves him to be just the opposite—a successful writer with impressive editorial skills. In *Rio Grande*, Reid has assembled an intoxicating mix of prose, conveying the enchantment, struggle, and mystery of the river. Elmer Kelton's easy, conversational manner is a delight of perception and familiarity. Elena Poniatowska's tiny story from Guerrero Viejo is a lyric from a tragic love song. Selections from *Texas Monthly* display a contradictory neo-journalistic mix of the dispassionate and the lurid.

Classics such as Josiah Gregg's *Commerce of the Prairies* and John Reed's *Insurgent Mexico* add touches that no contemporary writer can approach. Taste this snippet from war reporter Reed, describing Ojinaga, Chihuahua, during the Mexican Revolution: "You got sudden glints, where the sun flashed on field guns; strange, thick clouds of smoke rose straight in the still air. Toward evening, when the sun went down with the flare of a blast furnace, patrols of cavalry rode sharply across the skyline to the night outposts. And after dark, mysterious fires burned in the town" (pp. 105–6).

In company such as this, it would be too much to expect Reid to be the finest writer in the mix, and he does not rise to that stature. All of the authors are solid writers, even if some of the reports have a certain sameness. True, the acerbic wit of Molly Ivins comes off as shallow in comparison to the likes of John Graves, Aristeo Brito, or María Eugenia Guerra, but the book would not be the same—and would not be a fair sampling—if the frivolous did not mingle with the profound.

Reid chose an arresting selection of photographs to accent the varied texts. Unexpectedly, it is the much-admired (if over-enhanced) pieces by Ansel Adams that come off worst. They cannot compete with the simple

geometric composition of Laura Gilpin's work, the gritty reality of Alan Pogue, the timeless postcard portraits of Robert Runyon, or the stark landscapes of Earl Nottingham. And there are the remarkable vistas of Marathon, Texas photographer James Evans, and the telling bandito-era shots by Wilfred Dudley Smithers. What is it about this landscape, this people, that produces such photographic impact?

There is only one flaw worth mentioning in the book, and it is a flaw that imbues most work that purports to be about the Rio Grande. Reid's book is not about the Rio Grande, any more than the others are. That is good, for as a river, the Rio Grande is in fact a mediocre specimen for most of its length. The book is about the people of the Rio Grande, about their lives and loves and conflicts and deaths. It is a compelling story that seizes you and never lets go.

Jefferson Morgenthaler
Boerne, Texas

Battle for the BIA: G. E. E. Lindquist and the Missionary Crusade against John Collier. By David W. Daily. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2004. xii + 216 pp. Halftones, notes, bibliography, index. $39.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8165-2437-8.)

Following the Civil War, the U.S. Indian Bureau invited missionaries from America's mainline denominations to join with it in the project of "civilizing and Christianizing" the nation's Native peoples. The agreed upon goal of all those involved in this undertaking was to assimilate Indians into America's social, economic, and religious mainstream. However, by the opening decade of the twentieth century, these assimilationists had begun to split into two philosophically opposed parties. The more radical of these groups held that Indians should be compelled to integrate into American society without delay, accusing those who temporized on assimilation of paternalism. Moderates held that assimilation should be a gradual process, cautioning their more radical kinsmen that attempting to rush Indians from "savagery" to civilization was not only unrealistic but destructive.

While these parties bickered among themselves regarding the best method of assimilating Indians, social and political forces were coalescing that would soon challenge their shared assumptions concerning who Indians were and

what they ought to become. One of the most influential spokespersons of these anti-assimilationism forces was John Collier, an educator, social worker, and political activist whom Franklin D. Roosevelt would eventually name his Commissioner of Indian Affairs. As commissioner, Collier sought to transform the goal of U.S. Indian policy from assimilating Indians to revitalizing tribal communities, religions, and values through the passage of a complex piece of legislation alternatively known as the Wheeler-Howard Act or Indian Reorganization Act (IRA). Suddenly, radicals and moderates had a common enemy who made the differences between their respective positions appear comparatively minor.

In his excellent new book, *Battle for the BIA*, David W. Daily describes the campaign of one of the missionary establishment's most respected members, Gustavus Elmer Emmanuel Lindquist, against Collier's reforms. After setting forth the historical background and ideological bases of this struggle, the author depicts how Lindquist skillfully used the financial backing of the Home Missions Council and his association with other missionary and political leaders to hem in Collier's attempts to revolutionize Indian policy. Among his most important victories was the emasculation of some of the Wheeler-Howard Act's key provisions concerning land reform and tribal self-government. The maintenance of a strong missionary influence in federal Indian boarding schools and other Bureau of Indian Affairs institutions, despite Collier's attempts to limit church-based participation in these operations, was also a Lindquist triumph.

One of the most fascinating elements of this story is the very mixed reaction of Protestant Indians to Lindquist's anti-Collier campaign. Thus, even though by the mid-1930s a significant number of Protestant Indians had developed vested interests in the "melting pot" Americanism that was the ideological centerpiece of Lindquist's version of assimilationism, many of them rejected the abrogation of treaty rights and federal protections that Lindquist had come to espouse toward the end of his career as requisite for Indian civil rights and political equality.

In addition to providing an excellent history of the Lindquist-led crusade against John Collier, *Battle for the BIA* raises questions concerning the meaning and possibilities of Indian sovereignty. In both regards it is a significant contribution to the literature.

Harvey Markowitz
Washington and Lee University

Art of the Warriors: Rock Art of the American Plains. By James D. Keyser. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2004. 128 pp. Halftones, 89 color plates, 6 line drawings, 20 maps, notes. $45.00 cloth, ISBN 0-87480-811-1.)

Part of the Le Seuil world rock art series, *Art of the Warriors* is a large-format, lavishly illustrated volume. Clear photographs, line drawings, and maps present the richness of Plains rock art. The majority of the images examined are pictographs, or paintings on rock, and petroglyphs, or carvings into rock, from the Northern Plains. This is the region in which Keyser has done most of his work over the past twenty-five years and on which he has published widely. His new volume brings together various ideas he has partially explored elsewhere with new observations and recent developments in the study of rock art, including advances in the ability to more closely date the enigmatic works.

Keyser attempts to relay the physical locations in which the rock art he examines have been found. The relationship of the images to their places of creation and use is vital, although exactly what those relationships are may never be known. In some cases, however, it is obvious that certain locations, where eroded sandstone formations exist or major rivers meet, were chosen because of spiritual associations of place or their accessibility to trade or transport. Others denote rich areas for hunting or record battles with great specificity. Animals and humans dominate the art, but many anthropomorphic figures are depicted. As non-Native people and their trade goods entered the Plains, they, too, appeared within rock art.

The author draws upon the previously developed system of classifying rock art into different categories by proposed date, style, and apparent subject. He provides a brief historic outline from the archaeological past to the twentieth century, with the greatest emphasis on the nineteenth century. It was during this era that much of the battle imagery was undoubtedly recorded; Keyser argues for the meaning, style, and importance of these works in comparison to other Plains representational art such as hide painting and drawings on paper. A significant difference, however, between these art forms is that rock art was not portable but became a permanent part of a specific location.

Rock art also references ceremonial aspects of Plains life including vision quests, and Keyser explores these as well as apparent fertility images and abstract carvings and paintings. Using ethnographic analogy and the direct historic method, Keyser suggests meanings for this more esoteric rock art based on nineteenth- and twentieth-century Plains beliefs and practices.

Keyser's volume is an important contribution to the study of world rock art in general and Plains imagery specifically. Its value lies in Keyser's clear knowledge of his subject and in the rich illustrations that will widen the audience for rock art. The volume, however, may be incorrectly titled; it might better have been *Rock Art of the Northern Plains* given its almost exclusive focus on the northern parts of the region. Perhaps another project will more fully explore the rock art of the Southern Plains.

Joyce M. Szabo
University of New Mexico

Weaving a Legacy: Indian Baskets and the People of Owens Valley, California. By Sharon E. Dean, Peggy S. Ratcheson, Judith W. Finger, Ellen F. Daus, with Craig D. Bates. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2004. xiii + 182 pp. 18 color plates, 180 halftones, maps, chart, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. $55.00 cloth, ISBN 0-87480-807-3, $24.95 paper, ISBN 0-87480-808-1.)

Profusely illustrated, *Weaving a Legacy* is comprised of five chapters and four appendixes. It features a cornucopia of information guaranteed to thrill aficionados of California Indian baskets, especially since baskets from this region lack the attention garnered by more familiar types such as those woven by Pomo or Lower Klamath River Natives.

The first chapter, "Gathering the Willow," begins with geological and geographical characteristics of the region located in east-central California. The area was ultimately occupied by the Owens Valley Paiutes who speak a Mono language of the same name in the Numic branch of the Uto-Aztecan language family of the Great Basin. The cycle of hunting, gathering, and trapping varied, depending on seasonal availability of foods. Prior to contact, Paiutes had an eclectic diet that utilized over forty different plant species, fish, waterfowl, and larger game. The people constructed thule-thatched houses in semi-permanent camps, and Paiute women created many types of twined baskets for specific uses including food gathering, preparation, and storage. Larger baskets were woven to carry loads or for use as cradleboards.

Chapter 2, "Splitting the Willow," describes the changes that occurred during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries with the arrival of a succession of outsiders: explorers, miners, the military, ranchers, and farmers. The Paiutes became increasingly marginalized due to the encroachments on

and appropriations of their lands and water rights. The newcomers' success was relatively short lived, however, as Los Angeles appropriated the water rights, constructed aqueducts, and essentially drained Owens Valley. Paiute subsistence and wage labor opportunities decreased dramatically, resulting in widespread impoverishment. During the Depression, the federal government relocated the Paiutes to four reservations in Inyo County, California.

Chapter 3, "Weaving the Willow," surveys the numerous types, styles, designs, shapes, and materials utilized by the Owens Valley Paiutes. A series of line drawings clearly illustrate various techniques commonly used and, in conjunction with accompanying descriptions, could be referenced by novices willing to tackle the time-consuming processes. Over a dozen caps, also woven and worn by Northern Paiute and Panamint Shoshone women, are depicted. The production of coiled baskets increased due to influences related to the Arts and Crafts Movement. However, made-for-sale baskets were not as avidly collected, as they lacked complex designs incorporated by several other California groups. The biographies of fifteen basketmakers, some with photographs, are featured. Several basketmakers served as key consultants for Julian Steward's *Ethnography of the Owens Valley Paiute* (1933).

"Treasuring the Willow," chapter 4, features stories and photographs of Paiute and Anglo collectors, and surveys the role of boosters and dealers such as George Wharton James and Grace Nicholson. Several narratives reveal the friendships that developed between basketmakers and their Anglo neighbors or employers. The final chapter, "Replanting the Willow," features a small coterie of contemporary weavers of Owens Valley, and demarcates the reasons for the decline in the practice. Its future looks uncertain as lack of access to appropriate materials and time constraints inhibit the activity.

The first two appendixes record selected flora and fauna of Owens Valley and known Owens Valley Paiute, Panamint Shoshone, or Mono Lake Paiute/Yosemite Miwok makers who wove baskets during the heyday. Appendix III lists ten museums with holdings and provides details related to type, weave, provenance, and in some cases, the name of the weaver. Appendix IV describes each basket illustrated in the book, and includes the names and dates of makers and collectors, if known. The endnotes provide useful details that clarify the text, and the bibliography is quite comprehensive.

Weaving a Legacy reveals a fine and fruitful collaboration among the authors, their Native consultants, museum specialists, and living collectors. Information gleaned from published and unpublished sources and personal interviews is effectively integrated, and Paiute terminology is appropriately

utilized. The only shortcoming of this book concerns the dearth of information linking basketmaking to Paiute cosmology. Such links could be made based on evidence found both in this book (pp. 6, 35, 88) and in several works by Julian H. Steward listed in the bibliography (p. 168). Such a framework was effectively used by Sara Hill in *Weaving New Worlds: Southeastern Cherokee Women and their Basketry* and Ellen Moore's *Navajo Beadwork: Architectures of Light. Weaving a Legacy* will be of interest to museologists, art historians, students of material culture, and Indigenous Studies.

Kathy M'Closkey
University of Windsor

Custer and Me: A Historian's Memoir. By Robert M. Utley. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2004. xii + 253 pp. 35 halftones, maps, bibliography, index. $37.95 cloth, ISBN 0-8061-3638-3.)

Custer and Me is a good title for Robert M. Utley's memoir—not an autobiography, he stipulates, because the volume records his memories and does not engage in the more rigorous process of checking recall against the record. It is also a memoir in the sense that it is partial and deals with things that interest Utley; it is not intended to be comprehensive. The title is appropriate because it establishes a thread that links a young boy growing up in Indiana in the late 1930s to the distinguished former chief historian of the National Park Service who at age seventy-six remains a prolific U.S. West historian.

Utley was smitten with General Custer when he saw Errol Flynn portray him as a perfect cavalier hero in *They Died with Their Boots On*, a movie released in December 1941—just days before Pearl Harbor and America's entry into World War II. Utley had found a wartime hero, and he scoured his local library for books. They ranged from Frederick Whittaker's 1876 panegyric *A Complete Life of Gen. George A. Custer* to Frederic Van de Water's iconoclastic *Glory Hunter*, published in 1934 just one year after the death of the general's widow. Utley was determined to keep the torch lit and in 1947, as a seventeen-year-old high school student, jumped at the opportunity to spend the summer as a "historical aide" at the Custer Battlefield National Monument. It was the first of six successive summers at the battlefield under the tutelage of a crusty old Bostonian who had served in the Seventh Cavalry prior to World War I and who brooked no revisionist nonsense in his superintendence of the Custer shrine. Capt. Edward S. Luce

taught Utley history as advocacy; beyond lay the deeper waters of disciplined research and analytical balance.

With history his passion, Utley completed his B.A. at Purdue and abandoned thoughts of law school to pursue a master's degree which he received in 1952 from Indiana University. He would revise and publish his thesis ten years later as his first book, *Custer and the Great Controversy*. But plans for a Ph.D. were delayed by military service and then permanently derailed when, as a lieutenant, he was transferred to the History Section, Joint Chiefs of Staff, launching his career as a public historian. Readers interested in national issues of historical interpretation and preservation will find much of interest in the chronicle that follows. Utley's career took him in 1957 to the National Park Service, where he became chief historian a decade later. After serving as director of the Office of Archeology and Historic Preservation and deputy executive director of the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation, he took early retirement in 1980 to write full-time. By then he had published what would have been his doctoral dissertation, *The Last Days of the Sioux Nation* (1963), and more than a dozen other books and pamphlets, establishing himself as the leading historian of the frontier military.

Though he was a founding member of the Western History Association and its first non-academic president, he felt the sting of professional snobbery directed at those without a Ph.D., and this is another recurring motif in his memoir. Today, having enjoyed great popular success through his books and on television, as well as a proper measure of academic recognition, he is at peace with himself and happy in a second marriage, to historian Melody Webb, that provides a personal note in what is, after the early, evocative chapters, mainly a professional record, albeit an engrossing one.

Utley writes prose notable for its precision and clarity, and this book is no exception. He is deft at characterization, but not given to sustained self-analysis here. He admits to mistakes, and judges his 1976 address during the ceremonies marking the centennial of Custer's defeat—a moment of great tension with Indian protest edging toward violence—as naïve in its plea to view past events objectively. After all, his mentor Captain Luce had made the Little Bighorn battlefield a shrine to Custer's memory. Triumphalism is out of vogue in Western history today, and Utley has changed with the times. That said, he does not look back "in contempt or shame" (p. 44) on his youthful service under Luce. He helped dig graves, fill them in, and played taps when American soldiers who had fallen in World War II were reburied at the Custer Battlefield. Luce, in one of the most touching passages in the

book, remarked that Utley "not only prepared their beds but sang them to sleep and tucked them in" (p. 29). That image resonates, lending force to Utley's comment: "We were products of our time and place, reflecting the larger society. We thought and behaved just as our later critics would have thought and behaved had they been our contemporaries" (p. 44). There is a world of wisdom in that observation: Bob Utley is one historian who understands that the past is a foreign country.

Brian W. Dippie
University of Victoria

Return to Aztlan: A Journey into an Ancestral Past. By Jaime F. Torres. (n.p.: Xlibris, 2002. 584 pp. Halftones, maps, charts, appendixes, bibliography. $33.29 cloth, ISBN 1-4010-6110-9, $22.94 paper, ISBN 1-4010-6109-5.)

Return to Aztlan by Jaime F. Torres tells the story of the author's ancestors in the Torres and Gallardo families against the sweeping backdrop of several centuries of Mexican and Mexican American history. The book offers an account of the author's exploration into his genealogy, while linking that more personal tale with the most noteworthy events of the day. The approach works very well at times. The family histories illustrate larger issues of race and caste, frontier life during the colonial and early national periods in Mexico, and the personal impacts of Indian wars, foreign interventions, the hardships of the Revolution, and eventual immigration to the United States. It is a story that resonates with the larger Mexican experience in that country and the United States.

Based on exhaustive genealogical research in numerous Mexican archives and the records of the Latter Day Saints, the book is a work of personal passion that also benefits from extensive use of the most relevant secondary sources by both Mexican and North American scholars. The author's command of the existing literature is impressive, especially that of Mexican experts in the history of the Mexican North. Certain episodes, like his telling of the events of the U.S.-Mexican War, blend family and national history well. There is, however, much time spent recounting the trials and tribulations of the primary research conducted that adds more length than nuance to the history being told. The patient reader can gain valuable insight into how major events impacted actual people, but must sift through other less compelling anecdotes regarding the researcher's dead-end leads and unresolved familial

details. When uninterrupted, the historical narrative flows nicely. Other forays away from the larger chronological story, like those exploring the meaning and feeling of the *corrido* (ballad or folksong), or of *curanderas* (female healers), reflect the writer's contagious intellectual curiosity. The reader benefits from these excursions into Mexicanidad.

When the Revolution broke out, the Torres family suffered personal losses, causing some family members to migrate to El Paso, where the author's father Jesus found work in an iron and machine company and later became involved in the founding of a mutual aid society. The story is told with the love and care of a son and speaks to larger issues of immigration, discrimination, and accommodation; it lends a human face to that period and should spark interest in readers whose own family histories may resonate with that of the Torres-Gallardos. Despite segregated schools and ethnic hostilities that characterized the Texas border regions during the early twentieth century, the family managed to educate the children, and indeed, based largely on influences at home, Torres developed an interest in mechanics and became an accomplished engineer. In that sense, the book is also about identity formation, and the author's efforts demonstrate the value of this kind of personal historical exploration that may encourage other Mexican Americans to explore their own heritage.

The book often succeeds in linking personal stories with major historical moments, but it is also a family history and a good part of its more than four hundred pages is dedicated to that more personal endeavor. Offering corridos, photographs, and narrative that cover a wide sweep of time, *Return to Aztlan* manages to develop a sense of continuity that links early Spanish ancestors to Mexican frontiersmen in a story, like many others, that leads to a Mexican American in present-day California.

Paul Hart
Texas State University

Manifest and Other Destinies: Territorial Fictions of the Nineteenth-Century United States. By Stephanie LeMenager. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press. 2005. viii + 285 pp. Notes, index. $50.00 cloth, ISBN 0-8032-2949-5.)

One of the problems with Henry Nash Smith's classic work, *Virgin Land: The American West as Symbol and Myth* (1950), is that the book assumes that behind the many nineteenth-century texts it examines, there is an

"American Mind" somehow informing each of them, from James Fenimore Cooper's literary tales to Frederick Jackson Turner's essays. The book shares this fault with the consensus histories by Perry Miller, Daniel Boorstin, and Richard Hofstader. The idea of an American Mind, and its monolithic presumptions, was itself a product of an old narrative habit but was especially a result of World War II, which had a profoundly nationalizing effect on the country's two cultures (á la C. P. Snow): the humanities and the sciences. Following the consensus era, a subsequent group of scholars from the humanities would eventually thoroughly deconstruct the American Mind and other powerfully heuristic meta abstractions and narratives, including the famous frontier thesis. These critiques, which focused on objectivity, reason, and even truth itself, whether self-evident or otherwise, were aimed not only at the work of unreconstructed scholars within the humanities, but at science itself on epistemological grounds or as ideology. Science was found complicit in the capitalist conspiracy, started long ago by Francis Bacon, to commodify the planet. And just as Henry Nash Smith's *Virgin Land* clearly was a creation of the consensus mind, Stephanie LeMenager's *Manifest and Other Destinies: Territorial Fictions of the United States* invites comparison with Smith's book in terms of content and organization, and is reflective of postmodernism's transnationalism and French-borrowed theory.

Right from the beginning, LeMenager makes it clear that her literary West is not Wallace Stegner's, another student of the consensus school. Stegner's West is determined by such objective criteria as the amount of annual rainfall (less than twenty inches) and thus can be located, with some precision, on a map. LeMenager's "pre-West" includes the inland deserts and buffalo-populated plains, especially the Great American Desert, sailors and sailing ships on whale-filled oceans, and the Mississippi River and the old Southwest, which Smith had dismissed as too "southern" (p. 2). However, she finds Michel Foucault's "heterotopia" more useful for her purposes than aridity. As she puts it, heterotopia is a "species of counter-site that Foucault theorized as 'simultaneously mythic and real contestations of the space in which we live'—in brief, sites that challenge hegemonic spatial representations and praxes like Manifest Destiny and, in so doing, inspire revisionist historiography" (p. 4). Stegner's regionalism has inspired plenty of new history, of course, including the dust-blown works of Donald Worster.

And if space is a pretty flexible concept for LeMenager, so is time. She argues that "Washington Irving, Herman Melville, Mark Twain, even James

Fenimore Cooper were dimly aware of Patricia Nelson Limerick's revisionist assertion that 'the events of Western history represent, not a simple process of territorial expansion, but an array of efforts to wrap the concept of property around unwieldy objects,'" such as "animal skins, valuable minerals, ocean megafauna, liquor, and captive or enslaved persons" (p. 5). To go along here, it would seem more likely that Limerick was aware—and not dimly—of these writers, than the other way around. For postmodernists who assert (never prove) that texts shape our view of reality rather than reflect nature in any real sense, the flight of time's arrow is apparently arbitrary and notions of cause and effect are but unfortunate habits of mind.

Still, LeMenager's ambitious book in which she draws "upon authors who share a common interest in representing regional environments that operated as heterotopias, interrupting accepted national histories and forcing reevaluation of what kind of future might develop from the nation's past" (p. 7), should attract even hoary modernists. These scholars, of course, also think it is entirely proper for history to discuss the roads not taken as well as the ones that were; to reflect that once upon a time our antebellum and postfrontier writers ("postfrontier" because the western frontier appeared closed on more than one occasion before the Civil War) envisioned multiple destinies that were commercial as well as agricultural, seafaring and riparian as well as settler-based. In short, the soil-centric national epic of western expansion reflected but one set of meanings and boundaries entertained by America's early writers; it is well to remember that the nation's Manifest Destiny was not so manifest after all.

Kevin J. Fernlund
University of Missouri, St. Louis