New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 54 | Number 4 Article 5

10-1-1979

Book Reviews

Book Reviews

THE AMERICAN WEST: NEW PERSPECTIVES, NEW DIRECTIONS. Edited by Jerome O. Steffen. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1979. Pp. x, 238. Notes, index. $14.95.

THE FACULTY AND PRESS of the University of Oklahoma recently have challenged Western historians to take an increasingly wide-angle view of their field. Two previous volumes helped place the American West in the context of world frontiers. This collection of essays urges a multidisciplinary approach to the frontier experience.

Five of the eight essays suggest new conceptual approaches to the study of the coming of White society to the Far West. Using early North Dakota pioneers as examples, John C. Hudson calls for detailed community studies to define more precisely the makeup of frontier families and their complex patterns of migration. If historians are serious about their interest in the effect of the frontier environment on human behavior, Roger G. Barker suggests, they should state formally their assumptions and test them empirically. Ronald L. F. Davis warns that only when historians isolate key elements such as time of appearance, modes of production, and local geography will they be able to understand the uniqueness and similarities of Western cities within the larger urban experience of the United States.

Of this group, the two best efforts are by John Opie and Jerome O. Steffen. The first proposes nothing less than a new "ecological thesis" of U.S. history, which, among other things, would put the advance of Euro-American society into a new and more critical perspective. Previously admired triumphs of pioneers over the land might well have begun unpredicted changes we are only now beginning to comprehend. Steffen suggests two categories of frontiers—insular and cosmopolitan. Because of its isolation and demands, only the first produced fundamental changes in attitudes and institutions, and the only true insular frontier of our history has been that of the trans-Appalachian farmer.

Of the other contributors, Reginald Horsman surveys the best recent writings in American Indian history and recommends greater attention to the place of Indian-White relations in the larger context of European-aboriginal contact. Gene M. Gressley calls for Western states to transcend their jealousies and develop a regional identity to overcome their disadvantaged place in the federal

system. Examining the work of Vardis Fisher, A. B. Guthrie, Jr., and Wallace Stegner, especially the latter's *Angle of Repose*, Richard W. Etulain argues that such novelists sought meaning and continuity in the past in the finest historical tradition. Historians, he implies, can profit from their literary and historical insights.

Some readers no doubt will complain of excessive jargon in some of the essays, and certainly the volume should have been edited a bit more closely for style and capitalization. But overall, the contributors demonstrate the vitality of Western history when the field is approached with imagination and the points-of-view of other disciplines.

University of Arkansas at Fayetteville ELLIOTT WEST

THE PEOPLE AND THE KING: THE COMMUNERO REVOLUTION IN COLOMBIA, 1781. By John Leddy Phelan. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1978. Pp. xix, 309. Illus., notes, index. $25.00.

THE LATE PROFESSOR PHELAN who died in July 1976 was an expert in Latin American Colonial Bureaucracy and Society. His final book enhances his well deserved reputation. His previous works, especially *The Kingdom of Quito in the Seventeenth Century: Bureaucratic Politics in the Spanish Empire* explored the inner workings of the Spanish colonial bureaucracy and how it conciliated tensions and conflicts. *The People and the King* studies the conditions under which the bureaucratic system of conciliation broke down, leading to a major colonial rebellion in Colombia in 1781. This revolt, dubbed the Communero Rebellion, enlisted some twenty thousand people who wished to force the Spanish King to revoke a series of fiscal and administrative changes, usually spoken of as part of the Bourbon Reforms.

Phelan's study of the documentation for the Communero Revolution pictures the conflict as a constitutional crisis within the Empire, a clash between imperial centralization and colonial decentralization. The goal of the dissenters was creole self government under the aegis of the crown rather than separation from Spain. As such the rebellion cannot be considered a precursor of political independence or a frustrated social revolution. Phelan brings to bear a convincing array of data that shows the roots of nineteenth-century federalism and anticlericalism in the 1781 rebellion. The author concludes that although the rebels were unable to reorder Colombian society they were successful in gaining concessions from the monarchy which returned the decision making in Colombia to an "unwritten constitution" in which the colonists had great influence.

As in all of his works Professor Phelan presents well written exposition, logical analysis, and thought-provoking commentary. He has examined a broad range of archival documentation in Spain and in Peru and Colombia, and he has integrated the printed primary and secondary materials with archival data with great skill. Latin American historians should be especially grateful to Professor

Peter H. Smith for assuming the final editorial responsibilities for this book after John Phelan's untimely death.

Tulane University RICHARD E. GREENLEAF

SEEDS OF DISCORD: NEW MEXICO IN THE AFTERMATH OF THE AMERICAN CONQUEST, 1846-1861. By Alvin R. Sunseri. Chicago: Nelson-Hall Publishers, 1979. Pp. xii, 195. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. No price.

FIRST A FEW COMMENTS on the technical aspects of Professor Sunseri's book: the sources used by the author are, with a few exceptions, basically the usual ones cited by those investigating nineteenth-century New Mexico—and they are good. However, it would have been refreshing and even better yet had he also incorporated the scholarship of the entire generation of young Mexican-American-Chicano historians that has been active since the 1960's. Their interpretations of events such as the protests at the University of New Mexico and New Mexico Highlands University are both significant and seminal.

There are a few minor flaws with regard to the *Seeds of Discord:* in the Glossary "Azlan" should be "Aztlán," accents and diatricial marks are omitted (which is not unusual in books printed in English), "Coronado" should be "Vásquez de Coronado," "black" throughout the book should be "Black." The term "genízaro" should be explained further: these people usually were Christian women and children who had been raised captive slaves of the nomadic Indians so they acculturated to the extent that once ransomed, they did not fit into the Christian-Spanish communities. Hence, being neither Spanish nor Indian they were used by government authorities to colonize frontier settlements such as Abiquiú.

The author writes of the land, the people, the coming of the Anglos, and the cultural confrontations, but does not answer the very important question that he raises: "Why was it not until the fifth generation that Mexican-Americans revolted?"

Professor Sunseri has edited and written a book that covers the period 1846-61. Inasmuch as the occupation began in 1846, he begins there. Why he stops in 1861 is not completely evident. Certainly the problems he deals with continued for the entire Territorial Period, and some even to the present. The title *Seeds of Discord* gives his readers a clue; this was the period in which the seeds were sown, and the harvest is now being reaped.

The author sees progress in the recent activism of "Corky" Gonzalez, Tijerina, César Chávez and others and states: "The prospects for the future, however, are much brighter than in the past." He says: "There are many manifestations of this phenomenon of change for which these men are primarily responsible." Also, "Despite these gains there is yet a great amount of work to be done." Without detracting from Professor Sunseri's intentions, I submit that the ethnic occurrences in the Southwest are much like the spontaneous combustion that

erupted in Mexico after 1910. There and here in the Southwest, many people who did not view themselves as leading any movement or revolution, and without regard for ethnic background, fought back as oppressed people. Likewise, the diversity between the lower Rio Grande Valley and east Los Angeles and northern New Mexico is as great as that between the various Native American peoples. There was and is not any single direction *or leadership* which makes it so difficult to explain just what is "El Movemiento." This diversity, especially between generations, extends even to opinions on whether or not the new activism is indeed progress.

In summary, *Seeds of Discord* is a contribution to the literature that should be read by all serious students of New Mexican and Southwest history.

New Mexico Highlands University GUILLERMO LUX

THE SACRAMENTO-SAN JOAQUIN DELTA, THE EVOLUTION AND IMPLEMENTATION OF WATER POLICY: AN HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE. By. W. Turrentine Jackson and Alan M. Paterson. Davis, CA: California Water Resources Center, University of California, 1977. Pp. 192. Illus., notes. $5.00.

A CRITICAL FEATURE of California's water program during the past century has been to control saline intrusion into the Delta peat land. Discussions have centered on barrier construction in San Francisco Bay, within the Delta itself, or on maintenance of sufficient pressure from Sacramento and San Joaquin river flow to block saline encroachment. Central Valley Project development of the 1940s and 1950s exacerbated this problem, particularly as the Bureau of Reclamation limited its liability for saline control. Delta saline intrusion encompassed a plethora of local and state interests and issues.

Three principal solutions to this problem dominated public attention since the thirties. The Reber Plan proposed to construct two huge earthen dams within San Francisco Bay, thus dividing it into fresh and salt water lakes. This proposal attracted engineering, newspaper, labor, small business, and farm support. Arrayed against it were state and federal water agencies condemning its economic infeasibility, Delta agriculturalists who feared potential levee destruction, and Oakland city officials who perceived a threat to its harbor facilities.

By the early sixties this pressure combined to divert attention to other, less spectacular, solutions. The Biemond Plan envisioned barrier construction within the Delta. Although it received the support of state water officials, the project has never been authorized owing to protests within the Delta and Contra Costa County. Occupying the western edge of the Delta country, Contra Costa depended upon quality fresh water supply to support its burgeoning population and industrial growth. County officials later spearheaded opposition to the third alternative to saline intrusion, the Peripheral Canal scheme of 1963, for virtually identical reasons. This proposal, seeking to facilitate Sacramento River water insertion into the Delta channels, met new objections as well. Whereas the Reber and Biemond plans failed to meet benefit-cost ratio standards, the Peripheral

Canal faced such decisive criteria as environmental, wildlife, recreational, and quality water control considerations.

This transition in policy-making standards is thoroughly discussed by Jackson and Paterson. Relying on the Reber file, state and federal reports and bulletins, correspondence, and interviews, they have presented a workmanlike study of the Delta saline encroachment problem. Maps, photographs, and charts are skillfully utilized to illustrate points made in the text. This study provides useful material to scholars in the field, but its prose is such as to limit general interest. Even so, Jackson and Paterson have produced a worthy contribution to the growing bibliography of California water development history.

New Mexico Military Institute STEPHEN P. SAYLES

LATIN AMERICAN WOMEN: HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES. Ed. Asunción Lavrin. Westport, CN: Greenwood Press, 1978. Illus., index, notes. Pp. xiv, 343. $22.50.

THE OUTRIGHT GENERALITY of its title speaks not only for this book's broad compass—essays covering five countries during 400 years—but also for its vantage point on a whole field of inquiry untouched until recently. As Asunción Lavrin and her contributors make clear, historians of Latin America have either ignored half the population, singled out a few heroines, or accepted the passive, family-bound female stereotype. Studies of any sort in this field are rare in English. Thus the 2500 items in Meri Knaster's superb bibliography, *Women in Spanish America* (G. K. Hall, 1977), are almost all in Spanish, while in English, the very few books of Latin American women's history have appeared only since 1975.

Anyone concerned with women's studies or Latin America can be grateful for *Latin American Women.* In the past, circumscribed role-expectations and meager records have made the social history of women hard to study, even that of upper-class white women. But this collection, with its densely detailed accounts, helps change all that by suggesting the full variety of women's experience and activity. The eleven essays, written (with one exception) by North American women, discuss: urban women in colonial Mexico, women's roles in colonial Brazil, Indian women in sixteenth-century Peru, the activities of Mexican noblewomen over four generations, Indian nuns in Mexico City from 1724 to 1821, eighteenth-century convents in Bahia, the view of women in colonial journals, women's participation in the independence of Gran Colombia, education and feminism of Argentine women, the (now-forgotten) feminist press in nineteenth-century Brazil, a women's liberation movement in Yucatan.

As an example, take Evelyn Cherpak's essay on the independence period in Gran Colombia, 1780-1830. "Women were not passive bystanders," she says. They held and attended *tertulias* or salons where independence and revolution were discussed, they distributed propaganda, fought in the field or at home, engaged in espionage, donated money, supplies, many services, and they suffered

as well. Yet after the revolution, Cherpak points out, women gained little in the way of political and legal rights or personal autonomy. Both women and men held to traditional roles and attitudes.

These essays are thoroughly researched, richly documented, generally well-written, and they are conscious, above all, of opening an undeniably significant field.

San Francisco State University MARY LOWENTHAL FELSTINER

JEWELRY OF THE PREHISTORIC SOUTHWEST. By E. Wesley Jernigan. School of American Research, Southwest Indian Art Series and University of New Mexico Press. 260 pp., illus. $24.95.

THOUSANDS OF NECKLACES, bracelets, pendants, hair pins, and other ornaments made of shell, stone and bone among other materials have been recovered from prehistoric Southwestern sites during the last century. Illustrations and discussions of these are usually found only at the end of archaeological monographs under headings such as: "miscellaneous items of stone, bone and shell," "objects of personal adornment," or other similar phrases. Until now, no systematic attempt to organize ancient Southwestern ornament into some sort of meaningful order had been published or perhaps even attempted. Like sherds in an archaeologist's back-fill these were artifacts whose potential meanings were ignored.

Wesley Jernigan's book is the first published effort to recover some of the historical and social meanings of an entire class of artifact that had, until now, been appreciated sensually while being ignored intellectually. He has organized and classified an enormous body of data in an effort to define traditions of Southwestern ornament in terms of material attributes, manufacturing techniques, form, and decorative styles. The volume is the second in the Southwest Indian Art Series of the School of American Research and the University of New Mexico Press. Designed by Dan Stouffer, Jr., it is illustrated by 101 charts, maps and line drawings done by the author, and sixteen color plates.

These charts are intended to be visual descriptions of the stylistic development of various kinds of ornament recovered from different parts of the Southwest. In the words of the author they show ". . . the range of forms as well as their typical manifestations." Further, ". . . the forms tell their own story . . . [;] the words are simply my comments on that story." The last statement is, of course, nonsense. Forms, like objects (and here the words are used synonymously) are meaningless until people give meaning to them. The forms that Jernigan has charted tell no story at all; the story is in how they have been organized by the author in these charts and in the discussion of the charts that are the test. The framework for all of this depends on the ". . . character and interactions of three great cultural traditions. . ." by which are meant the Hohokam, Mogollon, and Anasazi.

Jernigan's charts demonstrate (once again) the homogeneity of Hohokam ornamental styles. They reinforce the impression supported by the text that the

Hohokam did things and made things in a manner distinctively different from the other prehistoric Southwesterners. However, the charts of Mogollon and Anasazi ornament tell quite another story that seems often to be denied by the text. Some show sequences (as for example Fig. 48 and 49 of "Mogollon" carved shell objects) that are Hohokam in character. Others show stylistically distinctive sequences that are severely limited in their distribution; characteristic of a particular place rather than of either Mogollon or Anasazi cultures (see Figs. 60 and 61). Most, however, are merely generic, and their formal attributes are distinctive of no smaller cultural sphere than that of the Greater Southwest. Reliance on prevenience of these highly portable luxury goods appears to have led to the creation of false sequences that replicate each other (compare Figs. 37 and 72 for example). The charts are interpreted as though they *should* demonstrate the sort of homogeneity of Mogollon and Anasazi that they do for the Hohokam, but they do not; and ambiguities and contradictions are the consequence.

For four decades most Southwestern prehistorians have been using a cultural framework for taxonomic purposes that the framework cannot support. A similar kind of analysis of another artifact class such as pottery or architecture would work as well for the Hohokam and as badly for the Mogollon and Anasazi as does this study of ornament. It is virtually impossible to define a single Mogollon or a single Anasazi tradition of ornament making, pottery design, or anything else. All that can be defined are generic pan-Southwestern traditions (that might or might not overlap with the Hohokam) and variations of these that occurred at particular places or times such as on the Jemez Plateau or during the Mimbres Phase. The limited success of Jernigan's analysis is, apparently, a function of his inability to believe the stylistic evidence of his own charts.

At the same time, this is a tribute to Jernigan's persistence and his organizational skills. Less dedicated analysts would have quit as demonstrated perhaps by the paucity of earlier literature on the subject. Any initial classification of so large a body of disparate data must be treated as provisional, and this volume is no exception. Its value should be measured by the questions raised rather than the answers given, and it raises a fundamental question concerning both the utility and the validity of the "three cultures" scheme that has been the point of departure for Southwestern pre-historians for so long a time.

There is, finally, another issue to be discussed. There may have been a time when stress was placed on sensual appreciation of ornament to the detriment of intellectual understanding, but here the reverse is true. Both the drawings and the photographs are surprisingly insensitive to the real life quality of the ornaments pictured. Those drawn by Jernigan seem to exist only as specimens to be pinned to a chart; those photographed are strewn on colored surfaces like costume jewelry in a hock shop. Even the color of the dust jacket and the photograph on it appear to be conscious rejections of an aesthetic sensuality. It is too bad, for Jernigan writes eloquently and enthusiastically of the ornamental art, its materials, techniques, and the people who made and used the objects. His charts are much less and his words much more than he thought.

Maxwell Museum of Anthropology J. J. BRODY

THE COLLECTED WRITINGS OF FREDERIC REMINGTON. Ed. by Peggy and Harold Samuels. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday & Co., 1979. Pp. xx, 648. Illus., notes, bibliog. $19.95.

FREDERIC REMINGTON (1861-1909) is known to most students of the American West for his illustrations, paintings, and bronzes; few know of his work as an author. Yet, in a journalistic and literary career spanning almost twenty years, he produced 112 separate pieces of prose, ranging in length from the four-paragraph "The Art of War and Newspaper Men" (*Harper's Weekly*, December 6, 1890) to the novel-sized *John Ermine of the Yellowstone* (1902) and *The Way of an Indian* (1906). Most of these works have been lost sight of in the acclaim given his oils and bronzes, and only in the last few years have any of the longer works been reprinted.

Now, however, Peggy and Harold Samuels have made all of Remington's written work newly available to the scholar. Their book is a hefty one, reprinting every article, essay, and piece of fiction known to be by Remington. Its double-column pages are open and legible, and the attractiveness of the work is enhanced by a selection of black-and-white illustrations taken from the pictures that the artist used to dramatize his own writings. It is a worthy volume, valuable to the scholar and the Western aficionado alike.

The arrangement of the book is straightforward and logical. The editors open with a six-page introduction taking Remington's career to 1882 and the episodes that, five years later, gave rise to his first published work ("Coursing Rabbits on the Plains," *Outing*, May, 1887). His subsequent writings follow in chronological order, uninterrupted by editorial comment or scholarly apparatus. The notes resume at the end of the text, supplying thirty-three pages of editorial and biographical narrative spiced with excerpts from Remington's letters and various critical studies. Here appear some discussion of Remington's fulminations on the Sioux uprising, American labor problems, and the Spanish-American War; an account of the developing competition between him and his friend, Owen Wister, which led to the publication of *John Ermine of the Yellowstone* in the same year as the better-known *The Virginian*; and some useful critical generalizations concerning the artist's status as journalist and author. A five-page bibliography of primary and secondary works completes the volume.

Frederic Remington was first and foremost a painter and sculptor; he will never rank as a significant American author. His writings, however, stand as valuable and largely untouched documents of the development of the West. Remington was present at the end of the Old West, and he was extremely conscious of the significance of what he was seeing. As he writes of the coming of the white man, the impact of the military and of technology, and the fading of the Indian, he provides a first-hand, sympathetic record of the course—and cost—of Western history. By making these writings easily available to the researcher, the Samuels have done Western studies a distinct service.

Texas Christian University FRED ERISMAN

WOODEN RITUAL ARTIFACTS FROM CHACO CANYON NEW MEXICO: THE CHETRO KETL COLLECTION. By R. Gwinn Vivian et al. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1978. Pp. viii, 152. Illus., notes, references. $5.95.

THIS REPORT BRINGS TO THE FORE the results of salvage work done in 1947 by Gordon Vivian following extensive flood damage at Chetro Ketl, one of the twelve large towns in Chaco Canyon. The subsequent removal of overburden to protect an intact lower story of Room 93 resulted in the recovery of more than 200 items of painted wooden artifacts; the largest single collection from an Anasazi site. Following his father after more than two decades, R. Gwinn Vivian, in 1972 assumed responsibility for the completion of the report. While the time lag in completing this work may be lamentable, the results are quite commendable.

Discussion of the collection involves the general description, a survey of comparative material from Mogollon and Anasazi sites, and an ethnographic comparison of wood use in ritual contexts. Here one appreciates the delay of 30 years as the reader is spared the initial, intuitive interpretations and reliance on rote ethnographic parallels common to some earlier research. However, Vivian does take care to outline and credit the various stages of development in analysis and thought concerning the collection over the years. In a similar vein this report is not a fielding of old caveats on ceremonialism but is examining the spectrum of ritual, or non-utilitarian, implications of the painted wood collection.

The careful consideration of both provenience data and physical nature of the wood has, I feel, correctly influenced the conclusion that the specimens represent stored, vandalized, and mixed items and not, as initially thought, the destruction of an intact altar with related parts. Establishing the nature of the collection was critical to approaching functional interpretations for the painted wood; a goal tentatively realized by the authors. Their suggestion that the collection represents carried or worn items during public displays (in contrast to stationary displays such as altars) is best supported by specimen morphologies and to some degree by ethnographic and scant archaeological comparisons, for which are offered appropriate cautionary notes.

Five appendices form the bulk of the volume underpinning the discussion and providing some rare but related information on Chetro Ketl. Dodgen's exhaustive descriptions and measurements of the individual artifacts and artifact classes, together with her technical analysis of pigments, decorative technique and style, and binding methods, provide the nuts and bolts of the report to which further researchers will turn for comparative purposes. The numerous accompanying photos of specimens lack scales, but otherwise are clear, large, and well articulated with the descriptions. A species identification of the artifacts, and a dendrochronological study of both roofing beams and a few painted wood specimens complete the collection of directly related appendices. Voll's report on the excavation of Room 92 (adjacent south of Room 93) is entirely ancillary to the purpose of the volume. However, its value as a contribution should not be underestimated as it is currently the only published report on the stratigraphy, architecture, and contents of any room in Chetro Ketl. Despite extensive excava-

tions under Edgar L. Hewett in the 1930s, the basic nature of Chacoan town archaeology is largely unreported, and therefore Voll's discussion is worthwhile.

Wooden Ritual Artifacts from Chaco Canyon New Mexico is clearly organized and well written. It is richly illustrated, including several color plates of aviforms, discs, arrows, a "plume-circle," and decorated slats which add substance and feeling to the descriptions and discussion. The conclusions are well grounded in the consideration of the collection's provenience, its analysis, and comparative surveys of ritual wood in prehistoric and historic contexts of occurrence and use. Readers interested in either Chacoan assemblages or the subject of prehistoric decorated ritual paraphernalia in the Southwest will find this volume a valuable addition to both subjects.

National Park Service PETER J. MCKENNA

WATER TRAILS WEST. Ed. by Donald Duke. The Western Writers of America. Garden City, NY: Doubleday & Company, 1978. Pp. xiv, 271. Illus., index. $12.95.

ONE OF AMERICA'S MOST EMINENT NAUTICAL ARCHAEOLOGISTS, George Bass, rightly complains that "the study of the origins of agriculture, urbanization, animal domestication . . . are all considered valid fields of study . . . yet the study of the craft that spread these concepts has been virtually ignored . . . . Western civilization simply would not be what it is today without ships." The economics of maritime trade, the design and evolution of hulls, naval warfare tactics, and the historical base in which ships of all sizes and description played their roles is a field that badly needs more attention.

By recognizing the importance of waterways in this country's expansion and development, the work under discussion furthers useful general knowledge in an area that has been neglected. Canals, rivers, lakes, and the two oceans with the fantastic variety of commercial craft that traveled upon them are focal to any discussion of North America's past and, indeed, present growth.

From the earliest days of the hide and tallow trade that kept New Englanders in boots and shoes to the explosive migratory effects of the Gold Rush and beyond, maritime expertise struggled to expand the frontiers to their limits and, as Robert McCaig points out in his chapter, "The Great Canoe Trail," "the thrust of empire was west, always west."

Vessels were constructed (or adopted from Indian design) to accommodate prevailing regional conditions and the kind of freight to be shipped. Their variety of innovative design marks a splendid epoch in New World genius; it was a technology that was to influence the rest of the world. From the maneuverable and easily portaged canoe of the early explorers to the canal barge and river steamer to the ultimate in grace and glory, the Yankee clipper that could take the Horn in a voyage from New York to San Francisco in record-breaking time, these vessels linked a continent and added immeasurably to the building of a nation.

Wherever there was a body of water, some form of transportation was attempted. Military posts and settlements in the California-Arizona desert, almost to the Utah line, were supplied by flat-bottomed boats on the Colorado River that were said to make six knots "on little more than a heavy dew." Adaptive engineering, consumate skill, and great personal courage mark the conquest of the West by water.

Neither particularly scholarly nor exhaustive, *Water Trails West* is exactly what is introduction promises, "a pleasurable . . . bit of storytelling" about America's westward migration aboard water-borne transportation. It is backed by just enough detail to whet the appetite for more.

University of New Mexico ERIC BERRYMAN

THE OTOMÍ. VOLUME 1: GEOGRAPHY AND FAUNA. By Jesús Salinas Pedraza, in collaboration with H. Russell Bernard. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1978. xiii, 248 pp., illustrated. $15.00.

SALINAS AND BERNARD have given us an unusual cultural document: an extended text written in Otomí by Salinas and translated (by way of Spanish) into English on facing pages. This volume deals with the geography and fauna of the Otomí region, centering on the state of Hidalgo, Mexico. It presents an intriguing mixture of materials that, in more traditional ethnographies, would be separated under headings such as ethnozoology, technology, economics, and folklore. Nevertheless, the organization does show the effect of the more than fifteen years that Salinas has worked with anthropologist Bernard. This is certainly not a "naïve" text: it treats species systematically and, for the most part, impersonally. Indeed, Salinas is a school teacher, fluent in Spanish, and his style reveals a variety of influences. For instance, when we are told that mice "carry disease," it is difficult to judge whether this statement reports a traditional Otomí belief or ideas from other contexts (p. 80, paragraph 284).

In describing some species, Salinas was moved to include personal anecdotes (e.g., pp. 146-154 on the rattlesnake). These make the book a good deal more readable than if it were simply an enumeration of localities and animals. Paragraphs and sentence groups are numbered to facilitate cross-referencing between the text and the translation. There is no index, but it is not difficult to locate particular items. A brief example should give some idea of the kinds of material presented:

> The badger. 83. The badger, as its name in Otomí implies, eats corn wherever it finds it. It's very harmful, and wherever it has eaten it looks like a pig had been there. One knows right away what kind of animal was eating there. 84. One sees where it has trod; its footprints are like those of a chicken, but crossed. It also drinks aguamiel. At the beginning of and during the summer is when they come out to cause damage. When they are

> caught they're made into barbacoa. 85. Its meat is tasty like that of the possum. Its skin is not thick. To cook it, you pull out the hair, wash it very well, add spices, and put it in the oven. (p. 42)

In the original text, the first sentence of this paragraph looks like this:

> 83. Rc tsathc nguu mcngc rc thuuhu tsa yc daethc hab+ dc z+di. (p. 43; the characters + and c represent short i and o respectively)

Occasional footnotes expand on the identification of a locale or a life form, giving genus and species when these are known.

Salinas and Bernard want these texts to be read by future generations of Otomí in their own language. (This was the reason given for not including a Spanish translation.) I really cannot judge the adequacy of the practical orthography they have developed, but the text appears to be comparable in authenticity to those written for Boas by James Teit. As the authors note, the Otomí themselves will be its critics. My only complaint is that the section on phonology is much too brief and gives no references to other works on the language. (One also wonders what kinds of information that would be present in an oral rendition are lost in the written form.)

The striking line drawings by Winfield Coleman enhance the appearance of the computer-set text. The UNM Press is to be commended for publishing this work. It will give linguists, folklorists, and ethnologists useful material with which to explore what might be termed the "ethno-ethnography" of Otomí culture.

University of New Mexico PHILIP K. BOCK

WESTERN WOMEN IN HISTORY AND LITERATURE. By Sheryll and Gene Patterson-Black. Crawford, NE: Cottonwood Press, 1978. Pp. iv, 140. Bibliog., appendix.

THE SEARCH FOR MATERIALS documenting women's experience in the history of the United States is an exciting one. The results of the search allow us not only to describe women's history, but also can alter standard views of the United States past. To broaden our vision in this way we need to re-examine traditional historical sources, to uncover the particular sources which express women's experience, and to be aware of the proliferation of important secondary works that have appeared in the last decade. *Western Women in History and Literature* by Sheryll and Gene Patterson-Black is an invaluable tool in this endeavor.

Based on the understanding that "the true nature of western American women has been hidden, omitted or distorted in most conventional historical and literary sources" (Introduction), the authors begin with two essays which illustrate this point, showing that "women inhabited the wide open spaces of the west, not just its calico ghettos," working as doctors, publishers, homesteaders and businesswomen. After dispelling traditional myths of women as "reluctant

pioneers" and discussing women's motives for moving west, their attitudes and expectations, the Patterson-Blacks move on to a bibliographic listing of the sources which can be used to provide a more accurate picture of western history.

The first section, Research Tools and Backgrounds, consisting of 492 entries, mostly annotated, provides a comprehensive list of traditional primary and secondary materials pertinent to women's history, including regional and state archival holdings as well as current journal literature. The remainder of the book, with well over 1500 entries, is divided into The Individual Focus, Personal Statements, and the Literary Impulse. This is perhaps the most significant section of the work, for here are included many of the non-traditional sources so crucial to the understanding of the full range of women's past. Among the listings are diaries and letters, oral history, autobiographies, novels, poetry and drama. Each section is preceded by an important discussion of the historical significance of the materials, and of the methodology relevant to their use.

Finally it should be mentioned that though the authors are most familiar with materials relating to the history of the plains states and to Colorado and Wyoming, their listings also provide substantial documentation for the history of women from all classes, races, and ethnic groups in the West in general. A careful examination of *Western Women* will surely encourage "further reading and will generate ideas for further research." (Preface)

University of New Mexico JANE SLAUGHTER

J. EVETTS HALEY AND THE PASSING OF THE OLD WEST. Comp. and ed. by Chandler A. Robinson. Austin: Jenkins Publishing Company, 1978. 239 pp. Illus., bibliog. of Haley's works, index.

J. EVETTS HALEY is an unusual individual, some would say a person to be envied, yet a man whom writers could easily typecast as a semitragic figure in a Shakespearean drama. Energetic and knowledgeable, with tremendous writing skill, he has composed excellent historical works, especially the biographies of Charles Goodnight and Jeff Milton. He has also succeeded in the business world and obviously has few—if any—financial worries. Haley is, however, a throwback to another century, another culture, another way of life, a voice "crying out in the wilderness" for those unhindered, individualistic "good old days" when laws were few and societies uncomplicated. For forty years he has railed against those forces who would weaken, indeed destroy his image of America. He has tried to place "patriots" of like mind in positions of political leadership. But he has not been too successful, for as he put it in 1975: "The 100% conservatives, largely our kind of die-hards, will never, of course, get their perfect man. In fact there was only One and he was nailed to the cross two thousand years ago" (p. 14).

J. Evetts Haley and the Passing of the Old West is, in the main, eulogistic, with a number of close friends and associates or admirers commenting about various

aspects of Haley's life. Once past the preface by Evetts, Jr., which is sprinkled with maudlin expressions about a beloved father as well as an extreme disdain for the "liberal American news media" and the "socialist message" of the Methodist Church (pp. 13, 17), then the reader will enjoy well-written essays about Haley. Chandler Robinson, Melvin Bradford, Savoie Lottinville, and Al Lowman discuss Haley's books and writing style; Richard Morehead explains how Haley and Texans for America were objecting to certain state textbooks which, in their opinion, did not "stimulate creative, wholesome thinking" or "provide an atmosphere of moral affirmation" (p. 82); Don Bradshaw, who has collected all of Haley's works, shows the warmth and humanness of his hero and friend; and Joseph Warren bitterly reflects on the controversial *A Texan Looks at Lyndon* and how the Democrats and Lyndon Johnson used an "evil tactic to destroy a book by discrediting its author" (p. 112). But the most revealing essay is Joe Frantz's "Memoir on J. Evetts Haley," in which he offers real insight into the makeup and thinking of this controversial Texan.

So for this reader *J. Evetts Haley and the Passing of the Old West*, which has updated Chandler Robinson's bibliography of Haley's works, is both enjoyable and worthwhile. Haley is the state's John Wayne, a glorious anachronism, a cowboy and a cowman who is one of the foremost authorities on range history, yet an ideologue who is blind to the social and political realities of modern America. Although flamboyant and controversial on political matters, he is a warm, engaging individual as well as a gifted writer and historian. Possibly Frantz described him best by saying that "values might be changing, all sorts of unseen forces might be at work, but Evetts was like the rock that standeth by the water. He didn't move, he didn't change. Even a rock erodes, softening its contours with time, but not Evetts. His edges remained as granite sharp as ever" (p. 121).

Texas Christian University BEN PROCTER