

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 55 | Number 4

Article 7

10-1-1980

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 55, 4 (2021). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol55/iss4/7>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

THESE MOUNTAINS ARE OUR SACRED PLACES. By Chief John Snow. Toronto: Samuel Stevens Publishers, 1977. Pp. 161. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$12.95.

AS AN INTRODUCTION to Stoney Indian society, this is a pleasing and informative book. In the preface, Chief Snow points out that this is not an anthropological text; rather, it is a narration of the Stoney's one hundred years of struggle against restrictive governmental legislation and public indifference. He makes a salient point in claiming that missionaries and anthropologists misunderstood, and thus, misinterpreted the original Indian culture because they "saw their mission as one of imposing their culture on us." Unfortunately, Snow does not correct these misinterpretations, which would have given a true picture of authentic Indian society. Instead, at times, he reinforces the European's stereotyped descriptions. At other times, Snow inclines seriously to the romantic noble savage myth by glorifying the prehistoric Stoney people. He fails to relate the social reality of daily existence, the struggles and the ordinary relationships of the Stoney people.

The author narrates two different themes which run parallel, but separately throughout the book. One theme is an account of traditional Stoney Indians, their beliefs, and life-styles which are portrayed throughout in an excessively repetitious and fanciful manner. They are paragons of the "noble spiritual aborigine." The other theme is a Canadian history of Stoney Indians which coincides rather closely to the white man's standard version. Such a dual narrative leads to confusion and misunderstanding.

Rather than producing a documented oral history of the Stoney's, the author relates a quasi-legendary religious narrative. Indian life is interwoven with spirituality and ethnocentrism. In fact, the entire book is overly accented with indigenous spirituality and Christian religiosity. This may result from the author's personal background, training, and experience. His early education was taken at reserve school, which would have been a Methodist missionary school. Later, he trained at St. Stephen's Theological College. He was ordained as a minister in 1968 and since then has served in that capacity. Despite his voluminous discussion, Snow fails to provide a clear distinction between indigenous spiritualism and Christian religion. Possibly, a reason for this ambiguity is that Chief Snow wants his readers to believe that there is little difference between the two.

Nevertheless, the author presents a unique and readable story of the Stoney people which convinces this reader that much can be learned from the indigenous Indian society. Chief Snow portrays an optimistic picture of Canadian pluralism, in which Indian communities can be economically independent and culturally autonomous within the Canadian Mosaic.

University of California, Davis

HOWARD ADAMS

TENDING THE TALKING WIRE: A BUCK SOLDIER'S VIEW OF INDIAN COUNTRY, 1863-1866. Edited by William E. Unrau. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1979. Pp. xiv, 382. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$20.00

TWENTY-FOUR YEAR OLD Hervey Johnson, an Ohio Quaker, had no desire to fight in the Civil War, but faced with being drafted he enlisted on July 11, 1863 in the Eleventh Regiment, Ohio Volunteer Cavalry. He was assigned to Company "G" along with a number of his friends and spent the next three years in that unit. His regiment was initially engaged in fruitless pursuit of Confederate General John Morgan's raiders and the guerillas of William Clark Quantrell. Within less than a month, however, Johnson's regiment was transferred to Wyoming and spent the next three years guarding the newly constructed transcontinental telegraph and protecting the thousands of emigrants on their way to Utah, California, and Oregon.

Johnson's years at Fort Laramie, Deer Creek Station, Platte Bridge, and Sweetwater Station were eventful ones. The Sioux, Cheyenne, and Arapaho Indians understood the meaning of the "talking wire" and the steady processions of emigrant trains and were determined to defend their homeland and their way of life. And, during Johnson's term of service these Indians were successful in fending off the white invasion.

Johnson wrote often, and in detail, to friends and relatives in Ohio and provides an interesting and continuing narrative of his experiences. He emerges from these letters as an articulate, observant, and sensitive man who did his duty to the best of his ability. He had little respect for the commissioned officers and felt most were unfit for command, yet he obeyed orders and had no sympathy for the enlisted men who deserted.

Living conditions were primitive in the isolated little posts and stations, and Johnson preferred, when weather permitted, to sleep in a blanket under the stars rather than on a straw mattress in a log hut. His diet was often no more than bread and coffee, but on occasion he wrote eloquently of literal feasts of antelope, deer, and bear meat.

Johnson did not remain a pacifist for long after reaching the frontier. He came to despise the Indians whether peaceful or hostile. And, as army and civilian casualties mounted, he longed "to get a redskin" in his sights. He came to believe that pursuit of raiders was futile and that the solution was an unrelenting war against Indian villages. It is clear that he never questioned the right of whites to occupy and develop the region.

Johnson's three-year term expired in the summer of 1866, and his final letters deal with the details of a comparatively uneventful trip home.

Tending the Talking Wire provides an unusual opportunity to view the Indian frontier from the point of view of an enlisted man and to share with him his distaste for military life. William Unrau has done a superb job of editing these letters. He has permitted Johnson to tell his story while adding essential footnotes that add both to interest and understanding. This book is a welcome addition to the literature of the American West.

University of Toledo

WILLIAM H. LECKIE

AGENTS OF MANIFEST DESTINY: THE LIVES AND TIMES OF THE FILIBUSTERS. By Charles H. Brown. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1980. Pp. xi, 525. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$25.00

SOME THIRTY YEARS AGO this reviewer looked forward to making the study of filibustering a major focus of his research. In those years the field was wide open. Only one scholar, Rufus K. Wyllys, had done extensive work on the phenomenon of restless Americans going abroad in search of political and economic power through the use of force. I remember writing several articles on the subject—one on Samuel Brannan's attempt to seize Hawaii (cited in this book), another on the futile last days of filibustering in Lower California (not cited).

Now Charles Brown has moved well beyond these writings to give us a book that spans the many attempts at illegal involvements in the Antilles, Mexico, Nicaragua, Honduras, and into the Pacific Basin. Centered upon the 1850s, the volume describes how freebooting advance agents of Manifest Destiny spilled out of an expanding America onto foreign shores.

The term "filibuster," today applied to prolonged speech making for the delay of legislative procedures, had another, more brutal, connotation in that era. Filibusters went abroad in groups to "free" unprotected, exposed territory from foreign control. The residents of such areas naturally considered the invading filibusters to be land thieves if nothing else. When successful, the filibuster might be acclaimed a hero at home; when he failed he was branded an unprincipled outlaw.

Filibustering was a phenomenon of a restless, youthful America, convinced of its destiny to expand toward the country's "natural frontiers." This enthusiasm had not abated with the acquisition of Texas and California.

During the 1850s it was frequently as unpopular for a Westerner to be opposed to filibustering as it was for a Southerner to be against slavery. Southerners among the filibusters were particularly attracted to projects for spreading slavery into lands farther south. Apologists for filibustering professed admiration for adventurers willing to shoulder rifles in foreign fields, seeing them as patriotic soldiers of fortune.

Most filibusters were victims of insufficient financial backing, poor planning, and bad leadership. Their decline can only be considered fortunate. During the negotiations that led to the Gadsden Purchase, the filibusters proved a particular

embarrassment to United States officials; and in general they lost the United States much goodwill. Filibustering, in fact, had proved itself an outmoded stepchild of Manifest Destiny.

Brown has brought research about the filibusters up to date. His is the best book yet to have emerged concerning this somewhat neglected aspect of the American past.

Occidental College

ANDREW ROLLE

SIXSHOOTERS AND SAGEBRUSH: COWBOY STORIES OF THE SOUTHWEST. By Rowland W. Rider, as told to Deirdre Paulsen. Foreword by William A. Wilson. Provo: Brigham Young University Press, 1979. Pp. xvi, 152. Illus., notes. \$7.95.

THE COWBOY HERO: HIS IMAGE IN AMERICAN HISTORY AND CULTURE. By William W. Savage, Jr. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1979. Pp. xii, 179. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$12.95.

ROWLAND W. RIDER was an old-time cowboy in southern Utah and northern Arizona in the early 1900s. Working all the way south to the Grand Canyon, Rider knew well the villagers and stockmen, the prospectors and gunmen, the Navajos and the Piutes—the whole unique mix of characters who hung around Fredonia and Kanab or who ran loose in the Ponderosa forests of the Kaibab Plateau. In *Sixshooters and Sagebrush* he describes these local people and also the touring famous people he met—men like Zane Grey and Teddy Roosevelt and Julius F. Stone, leader of one of the early float parties down the Colorado River through the Grand Canyon. Just as interesting as his descriptions of the people are Rider's memories of the animals he knew—the cattle and the buffalo, the owl and the wolf and the coyote, but especially the horse. Rowland Rider makes it unmistakably clear here how critically important good horses were. Their temperament, their training, their care and general health were matters of first concern and daily attention to the man who followed the cows. When his horses were well, the cowboy was content. When they were not, the man was troubled. Rider pays tribute to the best of his working horses, and he also tells of the wild ones he often saw. His description of two mustang stallions who fought to the death while their mares and colts looked on like spectators at a boxing match makes this little book worth the money.

Fortunately for the writing, Rider's reminiscences are precise and clear edged. Though nostalgic, he does not dwell on his sentiments but on the subjects he describes. Instead of saying how he feels about the past, Rider focuses on detail and enables us to visualize it. We are moved only indirectly by our private perception of what his feelings must be, and we cannot help, therefore, being brought close to this man. Of the death of his favorite working horse, for instance, Rider gives only the specific details of a very strange accident. He then says: "This took place in 1908 and I went back there in 1921 to build a monument for Hattie, a rock monument. . . ." Of the art of *Sixshooters and Sagebrush*, I have only one complaint. That is that the book is not all cowboy stories. In the last three chapters the focus of the memories changes to a different

age and a different subject—the automobile age and the subject of Mormon spiritual experience. While these may be interesting in themselves, they haven't much to do with the subject of the book's title or with the real center of Rider's liveliest memories. I wish the editor had stopped with the cowboy stories, with Rider's remembering how wonderfully free his boyhood was on the Kaibab Plateau and with his characterizing a cow country people now mostly gone.

If *Sixshooters and Sagebrush* is a primary book about a special part of the American West, William W. Savage's *The Cowboy Hero: His Image in American History and Culture* is a study of the cowboy figure as it appears in popular literature, music, advertising, and film. The first book is the memories of an actual working cowboy while the second is about the mythical one, the cowboy Americans (and Europeans) like to think and dream about. The two cowboys, as Savage points out, have little to do with one another. The one rode horseback and followed dusty cows, worked up a sweat and smelt of manure; the other is almost entirely a product and a tool of our imagination. The one, in his actual form, was a minor figure in American history; the other is, unarguably, a major image and force in our popular culture. What is best about Savage's book is that it moves so widely across the spreading landscape of American culture—moves from truck stop to western clothing store, from cowboy movie to Marlboro Man—and in moving far makes its reader realize how nearly all pervasive and how complexly interwoven in our culture the cowboy myth is. Savage's book also contains provocative sections on the time-honored assumptions and interpretations. Savage is not afraid to challenge even the famous historians when he points out what he calls "the deficiencies of cowboy scholarship."

But *The Cowboy Hero* is an exasperating book to read. The focus drifts from subject to subject almost without apparent rationale or cue. The prose itself varies in quality from brilliantly clear statement to bad cleverness (the uneducated cowboy hero in the B movies "could overcome any adversity . . . without benefit of university") and awkward or unclear sentences. It is true that the book accomplishes exactly what Savage says he intends; that is, it glances at "the uses" to which the cowboy hero "has been put by various people in various media." The author does not evaluate the merits of the popular arts which use the cowboy image, nor does he examine the reasons why Americans seem to need a mythical cowboy. These things Savage does not propose to attempt. The result is that *The Cowboy Hero* is a mix of useful and suggestive scholarship and rather poor writing. The book is, nevertheless, important. Western buffs and scholars will find its suggestions and its probings useful for a long time to come.

Albuquerque, New Mexico

DAVID REMLEY

BAT MASTERSON: THE MAN AND THE LEGEND. By Robert DeArment. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1979. Pp. xiii, 441. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$14.95.

IN THE GUNSMOKE PANTHEON, the name Bat Masterson is not as prominent as Billy the Kid, John Wesley Hardin, Wild Bill Hickok, and Wyatt Earp. However, this biography may improve Masterson's place in line.

Bat began his career in 1874 when buffalo hunters fought off the warriors of Quanah Parker in the famous Battle of Adobe Walls out on the Texas Panhandle.

Three years later Masterson went to Dodge City where he alternated between running a saloon and serving as the county sheriff, between being a near inmate and being a keeper. After his brother, Ed, was slain, Bat became a deputy U.S. marshal. He also sold his talents to the Atchison, Topeka and Santa Fe during its bloody dispute for right-of-way through Raton Pass with the Denver & Rio Grande. And had it not been for a fluke of being called back from Tombstone to Dodge City when another brother had difficulties, Bat Masterson might have become more famous than Wyatt Earp. He missed the Gunfight at the OK Corral by seven months. Not long afterwards, Bat entered the newspaper trade, becoming what boxing authorities considered the foremost pugilistic expert in the country. He died in 1921 at his New York office.

Bat Masterson's biography has significance far beyond the recounting of a dramatic life. He saw an era pass before his eyes. He managed to be involved in various political entanglements, and he knew well such stalwarts as Earp, Holliday, Ben Thompson, Luke Short, Clay Allison, Bill Tilghman, Buffalo Bill, Nat Fleischer, Teddy Roosevelt, and Damon Runyon. His story moves relentlessly back and forth across the nation, for the Masterson biography is the chronicle of a West that is growing up, maturing.

The research is thorough, the writing is well done. If DeArment occasionally gets a little purple with his prose, i.e., "blackhearted, bloodthirsty killers," he nevertheless moves his story along with understanding and a broad brush. *Bat Masterson* comes about as close as a book can to being definitive.

*University of Texas
at El Paso*

LEON C. METZ

HARD-ROCK MINERS: THE INTERMOUNTAIN WEST, 1860-1920. By Ronald C. Brown. College Station: Texas A & M University Press, 1979. Pp. xiv, 201. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$15.95.

THIS HAS BEEN A VINTAGE PERIOD for books about western mining workers. The year 1974 brought two volumes: John Rowe's *The Hard-Rock Men: Cornish Immigrants and the North American Mining Frontier* and Richard E. Lingenfelter's *The Hardrock Miners: A History of the Mining Labor Movement in the American West, 1863-1893*. Both were competent studies that chose to confine themselves to the special topics indicated by their respective subtitles. Now in 1979 we have had two new books that are much more comprehensive than Rowe's or Lingenfelter's. Mark Wyman's *Hard Rock Epic: Western Miners and the Industrial Revolution, 1860-1910* takes for its central theme the immense changes in miners' lives caused by technological innovations and the reluctance of employers to match those changes with corresponding safeguards designed to protect the miners' health, comfort, and even their very lives.

Published only a few months later, Ronald C. Brown's *Hard-Rock Miners: The Intermountain West, 1860-1920* does not cover precisely the same ground as Wyman's. Chronologically Brown extends his field by an additional decade and geographically he focuses more on the Southwest, whereas Wyman gives much attention to such northern areas as Idaho and Montana. More significantly, Brown's approach is different. Where Wyman achieves unity and insight by viewing western mining as a part of the national industrial revolution, with its familiar picture of absentee corporate ownership pitted against immigrant labor, Brown has chosen to present his story as a series of careful, well-documented descriptions and analyses of the principal aspects of the miners' existence. His book is thus more narrative than interpretive. It is a balanced account that will be valuable to anyone who wants to understand a particular problem or to find a convincing illustrative example of what that problem meant in the lives of actual, named miners.

The quality of Brown's book rests upon the excellent research that has gone into it. Wide and discriminating reading in the manuscript and printed resources of nine major libraries lies behind these 168 pages of final text. In style, the book is clear, direct, and always readable. If it lacks the verve that characterizes Wyman's competing volume, nevertheless it has its own virtue of steady, careful presentation.

Students who want to know which book to read should be given the unhelpful advice to try both—and to supplement them with *Lingenfelter's* study of the first thirty years of unionization and Rowe's monograph on one of the two most important immigrant groups (the other being the as yet neglected Irish). On the key question of labor warfare, it's worth noting that these recent books are more moderate in tone than Vernon Jensen's monograph of thirty years ago, *Heritage of Conflict*.

California Institute of Technology

RODMAN W. PAUL

THE LONG ROAD NORTH. By John Davidson. Garden City: Doubleday & Company, 1979, Pp. 190. \$8.95.

MEXICAN WORKERS IN THE UNITED STATES: HISTORICAL AND POLITICAL PERSPECTIVE. Edited by George C. Kiser and Martha Woody Kiser. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1979. Pp. 295. Notes, bibliog., index. \$7.50.

IMMIGRANTS—AND IMMIGRANTS: PERSPECTIVES ON MEXICAN LABOR MIGRATION TO THE UNITED STATES. Edited by Arthur F. Corwin. Westport: Greenwood Press, 1978. Contributions in Economics and Economic History, Number 17. Pp. x, 378. Illus., notes, appen., index. \$18.95.

NO SINGLE ETHNIC GROUP has contributed more to the socio-economic development of the Southwest than the Mexican. Since the turn of the century, Mexican workers have provided a substantial percentage of the labor force in both rural

and urban industries. By the 1920s Mexican immigration had already become a "fixed institution" in the growth and rise of the economic empires of the Southwest. Although constant and yet fluctuating in periods of economic crisis, Mexican immigration to the United States had been both legal and undocumented, seasonal and permanent. Yet, in spite of its crucial importance to both Mexico and the United States, Mexican immigration until recently remained an obscure chapter in labor historiography.

However in the last decade the theme of Mexican immigration has begun to receive widespread attention from scholars, journalists, and politicians. This interest stems from certain factors such as the appearance of a potentially powerful Chicano/Mexican population, the crisis in the U.S. economy and the need for the State to search for scapegoats such as undocumented Mexican workers, and the rise of Mexico as an international oil power. As is the case with the great majority of topics which come "in vogue" suddenly, many of the publications that quickly appear on the market reflect sheer opportunism and a clear lack of commitment to the subject matter. Three such "contributions" are: *The Long Road North* by John Davidson, *Mexican Workers in the United States* edited by George C. Kiser and Martha Woody Kiser, and *Immigrants—and Immigrants* edited by Arthur F. Corwin.

The Long Road North narrates in detail the story of an undocumented worker and those he encounters during his struggle to migrate al norte del Río Bravo. Although the narrative is a sensitive and sympathetic view of the plight of a "typical" Mexican migrant worker, the book on the whole falls short in its overall purpose. The author seemingly was unable to decide whether to structure the study as a documentary or simply as a work of fiction. The combination of both techniques does not prove successful in this case. As a documentary many essential aspects which face Mexicans in an inflationary dependent economy are not discussed. Vital questions such as high unemployment, underemployment, population growth, the widening gap between the affluent and the poor, and the crisis of the agricultural sector are totally ignored. As a work of fiction, the characters are not fully developed so that they appear static, one dimensional, almost existing and functioning in a vacuum.

Among the three studies under consideration the clearest example of opportunism and lack of knowledge or academic distinction is *Mexican Workers in the United States*. The editors state their main purpose in publishing this reader as that of making "useful but less accessible literature readily available" to a general public. While this purpose is certainly valid, particularly in a complex and controversial subject such as Mexican immigration to the U.S., it is not fulfilled in any manner. Only a few items included, such as the "Papers of David H. Stowe," are truly "less accessible." The reader is divided into six sections with the first three presenting chronologically historical data concerning Mexican labor in the United States. The majority of the items are letters from governmental agencies or leaders, newspapers commentaries, and sections from American scholars. Section four concentrates on undocumented Mexican labor. The final two sections explore, superficially, "commuter" labor and the Border Indus-

trialization Programs. As a whole, the book lacks a cohesive organization resulting in a haphazard assortment of dissimilar excerpts leaving unanswered questions and simplistic views.

The most scholarly yet the most disappointing of the three is *Immigrants—and Immigrants*. After considerable financial support and controversy, Arthur Corwin finally published his findings. His edited work, much like his editorials and position papers on the question of Mexican immigration, reflect his polemical style, changing conclusions to suit the trends of the moment, and one-sided interpretations. For example, in Chapter One "The Study and Interpretation of Mexican Labor Migration—an Introduction," Corwin states that one main reason Mexican migrants have not received the same "study" as others is that they "have played a rather inconspicuous role as a rural and industrial proletariat. . . ." He fails to recognize that "role" was precisely the role cast by employers to screen from public view their exploitive practices of a cheap, readily available labor force. Following the introduction are several essays (chapters) dealing with historical data concerning early labor migration trends and causes, U.S. Census Bureau statistics on migration, and both Mexican and U.S. governmental immigration policy. In a separate chapter Abraham Hoffman synthesizes his earlier work on repatriation adding little new material. The reproduction of Ernesto Galarza's "Some Comments on the Mexican Migratory Subculture" is the single inclusion by a Chicano scholar and clearly appears to be a token gesture. The editor turns from historical narrative and statistical review to opinionated commentary in "The Shadow Labor Force." By far the strongest section of the book is the edited "personal stories" of two immigrants. The final two essays deal with Corwin's assessment of the Carter Immigration Plan and a brief statement by Paul Taylor on the future implications of Mexican immigration.

Almost without exception the essays in *Immigrants—and Immigrants* are updated versions of earlier studies. For all its financial backing, advance publicity and generated controversy, the work proves most disappointing. The expected contributions of Mexican consultants were not included.

It is hoped that after this initial series of publications, more comprehensive, original, and sensitive studies will appear on the complex and important question of Mexican immigration to the United States by scholars on both sides of the Río Bravo.

University of New Mexico

DAVID R. MACIEL

DUST BOWL: THE SOUTHERN PLAINS IN THE 1930S. By Donald Worster. New York: Oxford University Press, 1979. Pp. x, 177. Illus., notes, index. \$14.95.

THE DARK TIMES OF DUST BOWL DAYS, made worse by the Great Depression, have produced a variety of memories for residents of the southern Great Plains. Yet little has been done to provide book-length histories of that momentous period. Several almost contemporary works exist, notably Lawrence Svobida's *An Em-*

pire of Dust (1940) and Vance Johnson's *Heaven's Tableland* (1947). Early in 1979 Paul Bonnefield's *The Dust Bowl: Men, Dirt and Depression* was released, followed in slightly less than a year by this book, and 1981 promises yet another dust bowl volume which is now in press. All should be read by those interested in this fragile land area which requires for its use widespread adaptation and flexibility.

Each of these dust bowl epistles sets its own style, and perhaps Worster is the most skilled word-craftsman of the lot. Still, he argues in polemic fashion that capitalistic agriculture is the real culprit, although he concedes that drought might have had something to do with the dust storms of the 1930s and the creation of the Dust Bowl. As such, this is a disturbing book because his alternative to what happened is apparently a tightly-managed or state-run agriculture on the plains. He places no reliance on correct land treatment by most land owners. He also casts off the historian's role to predict dire consequences of exportation of American agricultural strategy and techniques to other countries. In his view such practices inevitably invite the tragedy and the ruination of the land associated with dust bowl days.

Worster has family associations with the southern Great Plains. Although born in California, his growing-up days were spent in former Dust Bowl country. In this his third book he elaborates and expands on a portion of his second book, *Nature's Economy: The Roots of Ecology*. From Part Four, "O Pioneers: Ecology on the Frontier," and especially in that section's last chapter on "Dust Follows the Plow," he introduces the arguments he uses in his *Dust Bowl* book.

Worster is an American Studies specialist now teaching at the University of Hawaii. He has long been in the forefront of ecological and environmental issues. His *Dust Bowl* shows a broad acquaintance with all of the pertinent literature of the southern Great Plains, and he knows the geography of the area. A careful examination of some of his sources shows an occasional misreading which exaggerates his avowed biases. He also introduced "exodusters" as a name for people departing the Dust Bowl without realizing its first use for quite a different group in quite a different time. In spite of these lapses Worster has written a fascinating book. He still retains his "native son's affection" for this portion of the nation, and he is well aware that his primary argument "will not be acceptable to many plainsmen."

Kansas State University

HOMER E. SOCOLOFSKY

THE GRAVE OF JOHN WESLEY HARDIN: THREE ESSAYS ON GRASSROOTS HISTORY.

By C. L. Sonnichsen. College Station: Texas A & M University Press, 1979.
Pp. 90. Notes. \$6.50.

FEW NAMES IN THE STUDY of Southwestern letters and history arouse such regard as that of Charles Leland Sonnichsen, former professor of literature at the University of Texas-El Paso and now senior editor of the *Journal of Arizona*

History. In a career of half a century, this energetic man has produced a dozen volumes about the Southwest and its personalities. These works include, among others: *Roy Bean: Law West of the Pecos* (1942); *Alias Billy the Kid* (1955, co-authored with William V. Morrison); *Outlaw: Bill Mitchell, Alias Baldy Russell, His Life and Times* (1965); and *Colonel Green and the Copper Skyrocket* (1974).

In this slim volume, Sonnichsen brings together three previously-published essays about two of his deepest interests—the place of blood feud in Southwestern history and the part that the “grassroots” historians have played in researching these vendettas. The grassroots historian, says the author, “investigates local matters, [and] pioneer experiences,” especially the violent deeds of the frontiersmen. The author admits that research into frontier violence is difficult, since the participants and their descendants are very reluctant to discuss vendettas, shootouts, and other deadly incidents. Sonnichsen attempts to dispell some misconceptions about vendettas. Rather than being confined to two rival families, these grisly affairs were often factional disputes. The vendettas were not always confined to illiterate backwoodsmen, but “better citizens” often participated. And, far from being set off by a “trivial cause,” feuds often erupted as a consequence of some “intolerable persecution.” These feuds often resembled an “heroic age” and produced men of surpassing stature with the ability to kill many men. In a delightful essay, “The Grave of John Wesley Hardin,” Sonnichsen relates a struggle of more than twenty years to obtain permission to place a marker over the unmarked grave of this infamous gunfighter. In 1965, the author finally overcame obstructions of over-zealous sextons, who feared relic hunters would wreck the gravesite.

Although local historians have always flourished in American society, the author is making a serious appeal to professional historians to share the laurels more fully with a more refined and qualified variety of this provincial scholar, the grassroots historian. As researchers at the township and county level, these enthusiastic investigators search out the minute details of the personal side of frontiersmen, especially the violent attributes of the gunfighters. Through these undertakings, the grassroots historians defend the humble individuals as makers of history and repudiate the academically-oriented historians who portray American history in mere national terms, or, on the more grandiose scale, as a supra-national system. While the grassroots historians often venture near antiquarianism—even Sonnichsen includes the relic collectors within his fold—he is correct when, by implication, he cautions the university-trained Ph.D. historians against a preoccupation with official documentary sources (and air conditioned research rooms). The research for grassroots history often occurs in personal interviews with not always friendly subjects. Whatever the outcome of Sonnichsen’s crusade for recognition of this grassroots historian—he has proposed the creation of an “order of minor historians”—the profession of historians would be wise to examine the contributions of these zealous scholars with much more sympathy.

THE GREAT PLAINS: ENVIRONMENT AND CULTURE. Edited by Brian W. Blouet and Frederick C. Luebke. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1977. Pp. xxviii, 246. Illus., notes. \$15.95.

ALONG WITH NEW ENGLAND and the South, the western grasslands have stimulated some of the most important American regional history. Religion, industrialization, and human bondage have been the persistent themes in the first two cases; the central problem of the Great Plains, on the other hand, has been ecology. Powell, Webb, Smith, and Malin together made that problem clear to Americans. Unfortunately, their work is now getting a little dusty. Worse, there are not many younger scholars ready to fill their shoes, to challenge their views, to do for the grasslands what Genovese has done for the South or Bushman, Thernstrom, and others for New England.

This collection of essays makes that judgment unavoidable. It is based on a 1977 symposium at the University of Nebraska that brought together most of the reputable scholars—geographers and historians predominately—who have been writing on the grasslands. Perhaps most symposia do not produce memorable scholarship, but now and then they do direct attention to a ferment of new thinking. In this case, however, the papers filled in a few details without fundamentally advancing the questions posed by the plains experience, the relation of man to land.

Measured by more modest standards, the essays have some commendable strengths. They are all prodigiously documented and illustrated with maps, graphs, and photographs. Agricultural history is their main thrust. Bradley Baltensperger demonstrates how 19th-century drought forced farmers to change their crops. David Trask argues that Populism was especially strong among farmers who failed to adjust their methods to climate. Other essays by Timothy Rickard, Douglas Hurt, and Leslie Hewes trace agricultural adjustment to environment into the 1930s and beyond, with reassurances that “despite serious exceptions, the ecological balance in much of the Great Plains is reasonably good” (Hewes, p. 177). There is an engaging piece on the country town, others on railroad stations, aboriginal settlements, and population trends, as well as more general interpretations by Gilbert Fite and Mary Hargreaves. All of these are long on facts and precise in argument, but finally they suggest that Great Plains history is still waiting for some bold new energies.

The introduction by Frederick Luebke may be the single most useful part of the book. He sets up clearly the contrast between “environmentalists” like Webb, who exaggerated the ecological adaptation that occurred on the plains and the uniqueness of its institutions, and the “culturalists,” who are more aware of how much the region owes to outside influences. The editor draws our attention, through a quotation from Robert Berkhofer, to the presence on the plains of an economic system—“commercialized farming and the pursuit of profit”—that was inextricably tied to a larger American capitalism. That fact was never adequately appreciated by Webb. The symposium participants likewise do not take that suggestion very seriously, nor do they ask what the ecological consequences

of it would be. Until that is done, the historians of the region will be plowing a worn-out field.

University of Hawaii

DONALD WORSTER

FRONTIER WOMEN: THE TRANS-MISSISSIPPI WEST 1840-1880. By Julie Roy Jeffrey. New York: Hill and Wang, 1979. Pp. xvi, 240. Bibliog., index. \$5.95 paper.

HERE, AT LAST, is a well-written, carefully researched overview of women in the West. Although Jeffrey focuses on only a forty year period, she provides a skillful synthesis of documents women have left describing their own experiences and what historians have said about those documents. Jeffrey sees not one but four frontiers in which women participated: agricultural, urban, mining, and Mormon. But she concludes that in each frontier the ideology of domesticity was pervasive just as it was in the East at that time. Women were not more equal in the West, Jeffrey argues, men maintained their supremacy. While women on occasion challenged that supremacy, they were easily routed and returned meekly to their proper sphere. The multiple frontier approach, the clear thesis about women's experiences—that the ideology of domesticity not egalitarianism triumphed on the frontier—the wide range of sources, and their deft integration all make this an exceptionally useful introduction to women in the West, both for the student and for the teacher of western history. The chapter on the Mormon frontier is particularly successful. Here wide reading in primary and secondary sources has allowed Jeffrey to analyze convincingly the relative power of Mormon women in a polygamous community.

Yet one is left with many unanswered questions about women's frontier experiences and a few nagging doubts about Jeffrey's thesis. Jeffrey explained in her preface that she intended to focus only on "white" (Euro-American) women who came west. Yet in addition to excluding the first majority—Native American and Hispanic women—Jeffrey has also chosen to exclude discussion of how the new minority of eastern women of European descent viewed the other women or whether the presence of women from different cultures affected the tenacity with which eastern men and women clung to the ideology of domesticity in the West. A frontier is a place where cultures meet and that meeting can hardly be ignored by any historian of the West. The argument for inequality on the frontier also seems to imply that there was no change. Jeffrey offers us a paradigm of conflict between ideology and environment, men and women, but it seems to be static. There is no development in this conflict and, at times, the analysis itself becomes mechanistic and overly simple. Instead of convincing, she merely insists. She does not discuss the major change in the relationship of women to the land brought about by the Homestead Act of 1862 or analyze changes in the western economy during these forty years. In her large canvas, she neglects some areas entirely, such as New Mexico, Arizona, and Oklahoma, and says very little about women in Texas and Kansas, thus leaving us unprepared for the great uprising of Kansas and Texas women in the Populist revolt.

Partly, these omissions occur because the basic research to answer these questions remains to be done, and Jeffrey set out to provide a synthesis of what we know about women in the West. As such her book presents a challenge to scholars to continue exploring the interaction of ideology with the material world and of women in different ethnic groups in the West. Now that women have become visible in western history we can get on with the task of describing what they were doing there.

New Mexico State University

JOAN M. JENSEN

GUNPOWDER JUSTICE: A REASSESSMENT OF THE TEXAS RANGERS. By Julian Samora et al. South Bend, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1979. Pp. 188. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$10.95.

THE AUTHORS OF *GUNPOWDER JUSTICE* designate a two-fold purpose early in their book: (1) to separate fact from fiction, and (2) to chronicle recent events in the history of the Texas Rangers, (p. 7). Only in addressing their second goal are the authors partially successful.

There is no doubt that the Texas Rangers, from their inception on the Texas Republic frontier to the present, have been glorified. Liberal and conservative politicians, and historians such as Walter Prescott Webb, have lavished this paramilitary force with unfounded and undocumented praise. Written treatments have done little more than repeat Ranger mythology.

Gunpowder Justice does not degenerate into this pitfall, but it does adopt a methodology similar to that used in most other Ranger works. Secondary sources cited are mostly old texts on Texas history; no archives other than Webb's incomplete revised manuscript are examined. Only three government document sources are scoured, and the authors interview only five persons. This book does not begin to research the problems at hand.

Without an historical grounding, errors abound. Court cases are discussed but from newspaper accounts only. Indians are called settlers; the Texas Cherokees were "up against the Great Plains" and were always "peaceful" (p. 21). One irony is that the authors present Webb's racist Indian treatments as fact yet recognize Webb's attitudes toward Mexican-Americans for what they were.

There is only one redeeming part of this book—the chapters detailing the circumstances behind and the historical significance of the Crystal City Council election of 1963 and the 1967 farmworker strike in the Rio Grande Valley. The brutal role of the Texas Rangers is especially crucial to understanding the Ranger tradition. Here the authors combine their first hand knowledge, newspaper accounts, and interviews to compose a most valuable account of these important events.

Unfortunately, the book is so flawed that those worthwhile chapters may never be fully appreciated or even found by scholars. Notre Dame Press ought to have their manuscripts read by critical outside readers before they commit their resources to what is a most valuable project—telling the documented history of the Texas Rangers. That undertaking still remains to be accomplished.

Texas Tech University

JOHN R. WUNDER

Book Notes

The New Mexico Genealogical Society has provided an important service for those interested in census records by compiling and publishing in four volumes the 1850 territorial census (\$35.00/set) the first U.S. census of New Mexico. In a separate volume they provide the Spanish and Mexican censuses of 1790, 1823, and 1845 (\$15.00). Genealogists and historians will applaud this publication program. A related publication, *New Mexico Cemeteries*, Vol. I (\$8.00), deals with Mount Calvary Cemetery in Bernalillo County and was compiled by Mary Brewer for the Genealogical Society (Box 8734, Albuquerque, New Mexico 87198).

Another recent publication of interest is *Frederick Monsen at Hopi* (Museum of New Mexico, Box 2087, Santa Fe, New Mexico, 87503, \$5.00). Monsen worked extensively among southwestern Indians in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries and was a noted photographer. This volume, originally published in 1907, reprints five articles with photographs on the Hopis.

The Chapel of Our Lady of Talpa by William Wroth is an attractive and interesting study of a family chapel in the Taos area and of the santos and other items that were acquired by the Taylor Museum of Colorado Springs. The items are on display in the museum in a reconstructed chapel. The book is available from the Colorado Springs Fine Arts Center, 30 West Dale Street, Colorado Springs, Colo. 80903 (\$7.50).

In *Pinto Beans and A Silver Spoon*, Lula Collins Daudet and Ruth Collins Roberts (Dorrance & Co., Ardmore, Pa., \$6.95) contribute to New Mexicana by relating memories of their childhood in the Des Moines area of northeastern New Mexico. Theirs is an affectionate and personal account of their homeland.

Deserts on the March by Paul B. Sears was first published in 1935 and is now available in a fourth edition (University of Oklahoma Press, Norman, 1980, \$12.50). A warning about man's destruction of the environment that dealt in part with radical changes in the Great Plains, the book was a pioneering work in the modern conservation movement, but its message is equally significant today.

Of two recent reprints by the University of Oklahoma Press *Kit Carson: A Portrait in Courage* by M. Morgan Estergreen (paper, \$7.95) is of special interest to New Mexicans. This useful one-volume biography was first published in 1962. *Fifty Years on the Old Frontier as Cowboy, Hunter, Guide, Scout and Ranchman* by James H. Cook (cloth, \$14.95) deals with New Mexico as well as with other regions this remarkably-active man visited. Cook drove cattle in Texas, was acquainted with the Sioux, and managed the WS ranch in New Mexico; he describes these and other activities in his book.

Those who have attempted to track down references to adobe and its use will appreciate *Adobe: A Comprehensive Bibliography* by Rex C. Hobson (\$6.95 paper, \$12.00 cloth by Lightning Tree, Box 1837, Santa Fe, New Mexico 87501). Hobson includes books and monographs, journal articles, films, maps, and plans, and he lists foreign as well as American publications. Also published by Lightning Tree is *Fray Angelico Chavez: A Bibliography of His Published Writings* (1925-1978) by Phyllis S. Morales (\$12.00 cloth) which lists books, articles, reviews, and poetry by an accomplished New Mexico author.