4-1-1978

The Trouble with Texans: Manuel Alvarez and the 1841 "Invasion"

Thomas Esteban Chavez

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr

Recommended Citation

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in New Mexico Historical Review by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, Isloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.
In 1841 an army of about 320 men, fourteen wagons, and one howitzer left Austin, Texas, for Santa Fe, New Mexico. Delayed at the start, the expedition became lost en route and subsequently ran out of food with the result that all were famished when they entered New Mexico. Little did they know of the commotion they would cause in that Mexican department. They were also oblivious to the trouble they would bring to the United States Consul Manuel Alvarez, Spanish merchant and ex-trapper, who was stationed there primarily as an overseer of the trade along the Santa Fe Trail. Texan invasion of New Mexico created real problems for Alvarez. As representative for American citizens, he was already somewhat alienated from the Mexican population. Arrival of the expedition confirmed the New Mexican fears of Texas, and seemed also to implicate all Anglo-Americans in New Mexico in a conspiracy to undermine the Mexican government.

Although Texas had claimed its independence in 1836, the Mexican government refused to recognize it, considering herself at war with a rebellious department. Native New Mexicans saw the approaching Texans as an extension of the war. The question of whether or not Mirabeau Lamar, the president of Texas, or his commander, Major General Hugh McLeod, really intended to force their claims of an extended Texas is moot since the New Mexico population was certain they were and rumor quickly spread that all the Americans were in sympathy with the Texas cause. Yet this probably was not true with the majority of extranjeros.
A motive for the expedition came from innocent activities of American merchants trading with New Mexico. Especially important was a successful 1839 caravan which Josiah Gregg had taken to Santa Fe from Arkansas. This had attracted Lamar's attention and the Texas president reasoned that his new government would benefit considerably from Santa Fe trade via a southern route. To that end, in early 1841 Lamar appointed William Dryden commissioner to New Mexico. However, Dryden had run afoul of New Mexico Governor Manuel Armijo over the murder of a man named Alexander Daley near the placer mines southwest of Santa Fe. Because of Armijo's lax treatment of the culprits, Dryden led an angry protest which brought a nonviolent confrontation with the Mexican militia. The result was that Dryden had very little or no respect for the Mexican people.

Other Americans, such as Thomas Rowland, William Workman and Charles Bent, were also accused of being Texas agents. Rowland denied such accusations but his house in San Miguel was ransacked anyway and he subsequently sought restitution of one thousand dollars in damages through Consul Alvarez. Charles Bent and William Workman were accused of similar complicity by Juan B. Vigil, a lawyer in Taos. This accusation incensed both merchants and they resorted to frontier-style justice. Since the government had recently enacted decrees for deporting extranjeros, the two men had little trust in Mexican law. Instead they immediately found their accuser and demanded he prove his charges. Apparently Vigil's answer was not sufficient, for Workman started beating him, first with a whip and then with his fists, until Bent called him off. As Bent explained, such violence was necessary because Vigil expected it. Bent added he "would rather wipe [sic] a man... then [sic] have him punished ten times by the law." Bent advised Alvarez of the incident, and, when later arrested for it, asked the consul to solicit the governor's aid. "You will recollect the promises [of gunpowder] I told you that had been made to one in Santa Fe. Now they will be tested." Alvarez was also to tell the governor that he would get the powder Bent had promised. The local judge suspended the case, confining Bent to his house, and the next day Bent sent Armijo, via Alvarez, one keg of powder and ten kegs of coffee. The consul received a set of seven volumes of history for his efforts. Bent was then released.
But this did not stop the source of the problem, for Vigil continued to accuse other Anglo-Americans; he even threatened the local judge. In March 1841 Bent and four men planned to give Vigil a more severe beating, but the barking of dogs allowed the intended victim to make a hasty retreat. He then took refuge in Cordova where he asked for an armed escort out of the valley. A few more scares, thought Bent, and the problem would be solved.9

Others, however, were not convinced. Fearing for their families' lives, Workman and some friends decided that they would be better off elsewhere. Dryden already had fled because local authorities had found a letter addressed to him from a member of the Texas army.10 As early as January 1841, the extranjeros had known of the Texans' plans, and possible effects of the proposed Texan visit had them worried.11

The situation worsened for the extranjeros when Governor Armijo received definite word that the Texans were getting close. On September 11, Comanche Indians reported their position and four days later two deserters from the Texan expedition arrived in Santa Fe. Alvarez got wind of a rumor that the deserters had named some prominent New Mexican extranjeros as spies for the expedition.12 Such rumors upset the public and they confirmed Alvarez's worst fears. At one point the local militia had to disperse a mob in the Santa Fe plaza. As U.S. consul, Alvarez was the only official to whom the Americans could turn. He hoped his previous diplomatic forays with Armijo would now serve him in good stead. Alvarez would now have to draw on his experience since protection of human life was the issue at stake. As the Texans approached, Armijo became more impatient.13 Matters came to a head in late September of 1841.

Immediately after the initial Comanche reports, Alvarez had a personal conference with Armijo to express his concern for the Americans' safety. The consul officially petitioned that all alcaldes and jueces de paz of towns in which foreigners resided be ordered to respect foreigners' persons and property. This the Governor verbally promised, and Alvarez was satisfied with the government's action.14 He was pleased that the governor had informed him of the Texan approach and had assured him that the necessary precautions would be taken. Alvarez responded that "this proposition appeared to me just and to inform me of it [was] kind, for which I am infinitely gratified."15 An official replied on
behalf of the governor that Alvarez could be assured of the governor's word. He promised all the protection required in conformity with the treaties between the two countries. However, the governor offered protection only on the condition that the foreigners give no aid to the Texans. The next day, when the two deserters arrived, Alvarez received information that some Americans had been insulted by local Mexicans. This knowledge, plus mounting excitement over arrival of the deserters, caused him to repeat his previous requests. He did not blame the governor for the incidents, for he realized Armijo could not be responsible for everything. Alvarez received a conciliatory reply but other worried American citizens drafted a letter to Secretary of State Daniel Webster expressing fears of robbery and murder.

These fears were soon realized. A few minutes after Armijo and his army marched out of Santa Fe, the governor's nephew, Ensign Don Thomás Martín, and a friend, Sergeant Pablo Domínguez, galloped into the plaza. They took a Texan prisoner out of jail and, with a crowd of locals, entered Alvarez's office in an apparent attempt to harass the consul. Alvarez was convinced that their goal was assassination. Martín got to Alvarez first and, just as he was "about to master him," Domínguez came to Martín's aid. Meanwhile the mob followed, shouting, "saquenlo afuera! [sic] mátlenlo [sic]!"—drag him out! Kill him! Alvarez received a knife thrust in the face. Had not Armijo's Secretary, Guadalupe Miranda, ridden up and dispersed the mob, Martín would have killed the consul. While there is no evidence that Governor Armijo had prior knowledge of the incident, it evidently did not upset him. Martín and Domínguez soon received military promotions, while the subsequent treatment accorded Alvarez was, at best, unpleasant. The episode created a martyr's reputation for Alvarez, and widespread fame. Virtually anyone who mentioned him in subsequent years made some reference to this brutal treatment.

During the next few days, consul and Mexican government petitioned each other. Alvarez expressed concern about both intentions of the Texans and safety of American citizens. In an official capacity, he had to deal with the Texans since their country had been recognized by the United States. To this end he sought permission to meet with the expedition's leaders, a request which
made the Governor suspicious. Could the American consul be seeking to inform the Texans of something? Another of the myriad of requests for assurance that the Americans be protected led to a disgruntled reply from the governor on September 22, 1841. When Alvarez explained that he felt it his duty to see the approaching Texans, Armijo withdrew his official recognition of the consul. From the Governor’s viewpoint, this eliminated any need for Alvarez to leave town. He no longer had any official capacity, and meanwhile the Governor issued a circular that prohibited all travel in the direction from which the Texans were coming. This would keep Alvarez and others in Santa Fe, preventing them from providing any information to the Texans. Alvarez refused the governor’s subsequent offer to join the Mexican camp.

Meanwhile, some of the Americans had had enough and met secretly at Abiquiu to leave for California. In December the Rowland-Workman party of twenty-three Anglos and three Mexicans reached their destination. All were acquaintances of Alvarez, and one of them even had asked him to bribe an official, Don Agustin Durán, for a passport. Many of these people continued to correspond with Alvarez, thus establishing one of the earliest New Mexico-California connections which later developed into profitable business operations, especially in sheep. Alvarez even received reports from ex-New Mexicans on the progress of the Mexican war in California. His efforts on their behalf were not overlooked. As his friend who needed the passport wrote, “and now farwell [sic] to you my very much respected friend. I shall often think of you and your very great exertions on my behalf both as a friend and in your official capacity as American Consul.”

The California-bound party was able to slip away unnoticed since all attention centered on the San Miguel area, southeast of Santa Fe. There, the first of the hated Texans struggled into view. Actually, however, most of New Mexican anxiety was in vain. The Texans’ ill-planned, ill-equipped, and ill-directed journey through the plains, where Indians harassed them constantly, was far more discouraging than the ragamuffin militia they met. A little trickery, such as unkept promises of good treatment, was enough to make the invaders give up their arms. The prisoners were kept under guard at San Miguel until Armijo, dressed in his finest uni-
form, could address them. Then they were forced onto a treacher­
ous march to El Paso where eventually they received better treat­
ment. Another victory was thus added to the legend of Armijo's 
military prowess—since his rise to power in 1837, he claimed to 
have saved Mexico's northern department twice within four years, 
and because of the distance between Santa Fe and Mexico City, 
appearances often mattered as much as reality.

Even as the news of the captive Texans came in, the harried 
Alvarez scarcely had time to tend to his wounds, much less com­
plain about American rights. Several Americans, and Thomas 
Falconer, an English citizen, were among the prisoners. More as­
tonishing was the discovery of a native Mexican with the invaders. 
He was Antonio Navarro, an ex-senator in the Mexican govern­
ment.31 One of the Americans was George Wilkins Kendall, editor 
of the New Orleans Picayune. He set off to Santa Fe strictly as a 
journalist but unfortunately he had used the Texan expedition as a 
means to get there. Even though he and Falconer had proper 
passports, Governor Armijo refused to act, insisting that they re­
main prisoners with the rest. Undaunted by his close scrape with 
death, Alvarez sought Kendall's release. Observing the gover­
nor's belligerence, Alvarez protested that the incarceration of 
American citizens among the Texans was a disgrace to the United 
States government.32 Alvarez then met with Charles Bent and 
James Magoffin, a longtime trader on the trail, to discuss extra­
legal means of securing Kendall's release. Together they raised 
three thousand dollars. They offered this to Armijo for the release 
of the American editor and the Mexican, Navarro, "to shew [sic] 
that we were not altogether partial to the Americans."33 Armijo 
rejected the offer, and Kendall, Navarro, and Falconer marched 
with the rest of the prisoners to Mexico City.

Governor Armijo feared that other Texans, possibly a second 
force, might be heading toward Santa Fe. Consequently he ex­
tended his order forbidding travel toward the southeast. This 
prohibition caused a critical delay in granting Alvarez a passport 
for the United States, resulting in a wait of nearly a month.34 The 
consul was anxious to get to the States for he had a long list of 
complaints for which the American government could justifiably
demand reparations. Foremost was the fact that the United States consul had been physically abused and robbed. This was far more blatant than any previous incident. Any delay in granting him a passport only served to prove his point, especially since the winter season was fast approaching.

On September 28, the governor reaffirmed his earlier decree on travel and refused Alvarez’s petition to rescind the order. A few days later Alvarez received an answer to another of his petitions. It stated that neither he nor any other foreigner would be allowed to leave New Mexico. Within a week after the Texans arrived Alvarez had been ready to leave, but Armijo allowed the unrecognized consul to wait impatiently for over a month. It was not until October 25, 1841, presumably when Armijo became convinced that no new Texan threat was developing, that Alvarez and fifteen Americans received their passports.

Fearing that the governor might change his mind, the Alvarez party left Santa Fe the next day. They bypassed Bent’s Fort on the upper Arkansas River and took the hazardous Cimarron Cut-off. The party then divided, five members detouring down the Arkansas River and four others going ahead.

Alvarez took a risk crossing the plains in late October. Snows fell on the small party near Council Grove at Cotton Wood Creek. They were stopped in three feet of snow and found themselves unable to keep a fire going. There they suffered their first casualty when John Richmire, one of the four men who had gone ahead, froze to death four miles from camp. By then, however, the main body had caught up with the other three. Two were so badly frozen and sick that Alvarez decided to leave them with one healthy person while the rest struck out for aid from Missouri settlements. They made it to Independence on December 15, and by the 17th help had worked its way back to Council Grove. Unfortunately, a second man died before the rescuers arrived. Not one of the original Alvarez party escaped frostbite. Some of the survivors suffered severely, and only Alvarez’s insistence that everyone keep moving saved the remainder.

In St. Louis, the consul presented to the federal government his losses totalling $8,210. The tally proved him to be something
more than a poor man. He claimed a loss of two riding horses, one buffalo horse, "two Jacks of superior size and breed," thirty-six mules, one gun and other utensils, as well as personal baggage. 42

Alvarez was careful to bring all his official correspondence with him. Before leaving Santa Fe he collected everything and after his safe arrival in Missouri, he wrote to Daniel Webster. He informed the Secretary of State of his arrival and of his plans to "proceed to the seat of government" to relate the injuries suffered by United States citizens in New Mexico. Alvarez included a narrative "nearly agreeing with the facts" for the department's inspection. A statement signed by American residents of New Mexico would be presented at a personal interview. Alvarez delayed the meeting until "after some repose which is necessary to recruit my health impaired by a troublesome journey." 43 However, a narrative, petition, and personal interview would not suffice. Webster had no way to predict what the consul had in store for him. The narrative was a thirty-two page memorial, meticulously footnoted, with the original documents attached. Those letters written in Spanish were accompanied by English translations. In all, he included over sixty letters substantiating the text of the memorial. 44 Upon Alvarez's request, the State Department returned the original letters in exchange for his own hand-written copies. 45 The impressive memorial formed only one part of his statement, since Alvarez also wanted to remonstrate to Congress. He collected letters of introduction, and hoped to meet the Speaker of the House, John White, or even persuade someone to use his "aid and influence with Mr. Clay and other friends." 46

By February, 1842, Alvarez was in Washington, and asked Webster what the State Department planned to do about the incidents contained within the memorial. 47 The department replied that Waddy Thompson, recently appointed minister to Mexico, would be instructed personally "to make proper representations to that government." 48

A couple of weeks later, Alvarez entered a second petition on his own behalf. He reiterated the attempt on his life and emphasized the outrage by claiming that even though the Mexican government had initially recognized him as the United States consul, the local Mexican authorities did nothing by way of reparations or
apologies. For this he asked for an indemnity of $2,500. For payment for the "arbitrary detention" which caused the deaths of two men, he asked $2,000 more. Alvarez argued that his "arrest" from September 16 to October 25 was worth $5,000. Finally, he wanted $8,200 for his losses on the trail. 49 This amazing petition seemed not to faze Webster. His prompt reply the next day touched on the question of Alvarez's proper citizenship, a question from which the consul was allowed to withdraw. 50 Alvarez's petition received a much less cordial reception than the memorial presented on behalf of the American residents. In a succinct and brisk document, Webster told Alvarez that his lack of U.S. citizenship prevented the United States from seeking reparations from the Mexican government on his behalf. Because he was never granted an exequatur, Webster concluded, "there cannot, for the present at least, be anything done in your behalf." 51

As a result of this, Alvarez decided he should apply for U.S. citizenship. On April 9, 1842, in the St. Louis Court of Common Pleas, he became a United States citizen. 52 There were two obvious reasons for this: first, Governor Armijo had always hesitated in answering his request for personal protection because the consul had been a Mexican citizen; 53 second, Webster had reasoned that the United States could do nothing because Alvarez was not an American citizen. 54 Through naturalization, the consul felt he would eliminate such problems in the future.

Alvarez and his two witnesses, Theodore Papin and Pascaul L. Cerri, two old fur trapper friends, had to bend the facts to gain the coveted citizenship for him. They certified that Alvarez had resided in the United States for "at least five years, and in the State of Missouri at least one year, immediately preceding this application." This, of course, was untrue. It took almost a month before Alvarez worded a two-sentence letter to inform Webster of his naturalization and let him know "I leave [for Santa Fe] tomorrow." 55 It is clear he was bitter at the lack of appreciation he received for his consular efforts.

The people on whose behalf Alvarez risked his life were equally disgusted with Webster. George W. Kendall and Josiah Gregg drew a clear portrait of Alvarez's heroism in their respective works Narrative of the Texas-Santa Fe Expedition and Commerce
of the Prairies, in which they wrote that though Alvarez had risked his life for his countrymen and only narrowly escaped, the United States government did nothing in his behalf.56

The intense mistrust and constant misunderstanding which characterized relations between Alvarez and the New Mexican government, complicated by the intervention of Texas, showed clearly the tensions that existed among cultures that crossed in the Southwest. Such economic and political conflict, some innocent, some intentioned, provided additional fuel for the fire that broke out at the end of the decade. In such an environment, fear of open warfare could become a self-fulfilling prophesy. Manuel Alvarez personified the fragmentation which plagued New Mexico in the mid-nineteenth century, as a region belonging to Mexico, but largely dependent economically on the United States, changed into a part of the United States still tied culturally to Mexico. Those crosscurrents have never disappeared from life in the Rio Grande basin.

NOTES


2. Lavender, Bent's Fort, pp. 205-6. Lavender's citation on the eventual outcome of the episode is wrong (fn. 3, p. 425). The correct citation is Alvarez to Secretary of State, July 1, 1843 (not December 18), U.S. Department of State, Consular Dispatches, Santa Fe, Manuel Alvarez, Washington 1842, M-199, copy in possession of author; and Alvarez to Guadalupe Miranda, March 12, 1841, RI 187, W. G. Ritch Papers, Huntington Library, San Marino, California. The last indicates that Alvarez had little more success in pursuing the matter through less threatening channels. Alvarez thanked Armijo "for his goodness" in getting the assassins of an American named Daley retried by the Supreme Court.


4. Thomas Rowland to Alvarez, October 26, 1841, no. 262, Benjamin Read Collection, State Records Center and Archives, Santa Fe.

5. Charles Bent to Alvarez, February 19, 1841, no. 47, Read Collection.

13. Daniel Tyler, “Gringo Views of Governor Manuel Armijo,” *New Mexico Historical Review* (NMHR), 45 (January, 1970):29. There were some lighter moments such as a letter Alvarez received from Bent in January 1841. Alvarez’s friend related that Padre Martinez reported that the Texans were in California. Bent wondered how they got there and that Martinez should be made “Pope for his geographical knowledge.” Bent to Alvarez, January 30, 1841, no. 46, *Read Collection*.
14. *Memorial*, p. 21; Alvarez to Miranda, September 14, 1841, frame 1340, reel 29, *Mexican Archives of New Mexico* (MANM), Governor’s Papers, State Records Center and Archives, Santa Fe. A copy attached to the *Memorial* is numbered “26.” Here, Alvarez is chronologically wrong. If as the *Memorial* implies, he met and wrote to Armijo after the arrival of the deserters the letter should have been written on September 15, not September 14. And, as the letter indicates he wrote a day later it must have been written on September 16.
15. Alvarez to Miranda, September 15, 1841, MANM.
16. Miranda to Alvarez, September 14, 1841, no. 214, *Read Collection*. A copy attached to the *Memorial* is lettered “V.”
18. Alvarez to Miranda, September 15, 1841, frames 1342-44, MANM.
19. Merchants to Webster, September 16, 1841; copy attached to the *Memorial*, lettered “Z.”
23. James Josiah Webb, *Adventures in the Santa Fe Trade 1844-1847*, Southwest Historical Series, Vol. I, Ralph P. Bieber, ed. (Glendale, 1931), p. 263. Webb writes a few years after the fact and demonstrates how fast the reputation was established. Recent histories of the period also help to perpetuate the incident. For example, see Lavender, p. 216.
29. Dr. J. H. Lyman to Alvarez, August 8, 1841, *Read Collection*.
30. Dr. J. H. Lyman to Alvarez, August 8, 1841, *Read Collection*.
32. Lavender, *Bent's Fort*, p. 217. Lavender claims that Kendall was the only American citizen while Alvarez (*Memorial*, p. 28) intimates there were more.
33. *Memorial*, p. 28.
34. Miranda to Alvarez, October 1, 1841, no. 221, *Read Collection*; and Gregg, *Commerce of the Prairies*, p. 163.
35. Miranda to Alvarez, September 28, 1841, no. 219, *Read Collection*.
36. Miranda to Alvarez, October 1, 1841, no. 221, *Read Collection*.
37. Manuel Armijo, Passport for Alvarez and fifteen Americans, October 25, 1841, no. 18, *Read Collection*.
41. Gregg, *Commerce of the Prairies*, p. 163; and Alvarez to Webster, March 2, 1842, *Consular Dispatches*.
42. Alvarez to Webster, March 2, 1842, *Consular Dispatches*.
43. Alvarez to Webster, December 15, 1841, *Consular Dispatches*.
44. *Memorial*.
45. Alvarez to Webster, February 13, 1842, *Consular Dispatches*.
47. Alvarez to Webster, February 13, 1842, *Consular Dispatches*.
48. Webster to Alvarez, February 16, 1842, no. 307, *Read Collection*.
49. Alvarez to Webster, March 2, 1842, *Consular Dispatches*.
51. *Memorial*.
52. Official certificate attesting to Alvarez's naturalization, no. 5, *Read Collection*.
54. Webster to Alvarez, February 16, 1842, no. 307, *Read Collection*.
55. Alvarez to Webster, May 4, 1842, *Consular Dispatches*.