New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 46 | Number 4 Article 6

10-1-1971

Book Reviews

Book Reviews

THE SPANISH BORDERLANDS FRONTIER 1513-1821. By John Francis Bannon, with Foreword by Ray Allen Billington. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1970, Pp. xii, 308. Illus., maps, bibliog., index. $4.75.

THIS VOLUME in the "Histories of the American Frontier" series, edited by the distinguished historian Ray Allen Billington, is, as Dr. Bannon states in his preface, a golden jubilee volume. In 1921 Dr. Herbert E. Bolton's *The Spanish Borderlands* appeared in the "Chronicles of America" series. Dr. Bolton was pioneering in a scarcely recognized field. Dr. Bannon, one of his many students, set out to synthesize the long and complex history of the Spanish Borderlands. His problem was, unlike Dr. Bolton's, one of abundance. The vast majority of the many books and articles cited in the bibliographical notes were published after 1921.

The Spanish Borderlands is a term that has sometimes been limited to the Southwest and California, although when he coined it Dr. Bolton included all of the former Spanish areas from Florida to California. It is the broader concept that Dr. Bannon accepts. He points out something occasionally forgotten or overlooked, that when Anglo-American pioneers reached the western Borderlands they were not entering a wilderness, a true frontier, but a settled region into which the Spaniards had introduced their civilization long before. And despite the later clash of cultures, many of the early visitors to New Mexico and California were happy to adopt this way of life. Certain legal concepts, furthermore, such as community property and liberal adoption laws, they found preferable to Anglo-Saxon practice.

In comparing the Spanish and Anglo-American frontiers the author recognizes significant differences. "The Anglo-American was aggressive and acquisitive: the hope of gain, broader opportunity, and personal advantage drove him westward. He was rarely motivated by anything other than individual aggrandizement. But most of all, he was free to go or come, to stay or withdraw; he was, in general, answerable to no one but himself. At times the laws of his country bothered him little or not at all. The Spanish frontiersman was regimented, closely governed, and restricted. He might be free to go or not to go onto a far frontier. But, once there, he was committed." (P. 6.)

Other differences were in the degree of racial mixture and in the role of Christianized Indians, for the Spaniards sent colonies of Tlascalans, Aztecs, and even Ópatas to the frontiers to help convert the wild tribes into useful citizens. The Spanish Borderlands frontier was frequently a defensive one, a situation not characteristic of any Anglo-American frontier except in Oregon.

"So here is an American frontier, sometimes like but more often unlike familiar Anglo-American patterns. It is a frontier that is historically on a collision course with the more aggressive and more successful Anglo-American westward movement. Its background will be important when the two meet. And, even apart from the confrontation, its history has interest in itself as an example of man's pioneering enterprise." (P. 7.)

In demonstrating that interest Dr. Bannon deals with the explorers, such as Coronado and De Soto, the first settlements, the Pueblo Revolt and the reconquest, the coming of the French and the Spanish move into Texas, the occupation of California, the Provincias Internas, and Louisiana. The final chapter deals with Spain's last years in the Borderlands.

This is an excellent synthesis, a welcome addition to the rich and growing literature on the Borderlands. As a series volume it compares favorably with Charles Gibson's *Spain in America* ("New American Nation" series) which, a few years ago, replaced Bourne's earlier work of the same title. Both reflect the considerable advance in historical scholarship in the past half-century.

Texas Christian University DONALD E. WORCESTER

THE JOURNAL OF JACOB FOWLER. Edited, with notes, by Elliott Coues, with a preface and additional notes by Raymond W. and Mary Lund Settle and Harry R. Stevens. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1970. Pp. ix, 152. Bibliog., index. $7.95.

A SEASONED 57-year-old frontiersman, Jacob Fowler trapped and traded his way up the Arkansas River from Fort Smith to the Rockies in 1821, as second-in-command of a group led by Hugh Glenn. Through a chance meeting with New Mexican traders near Pueblo, the Americans learned that Mexico had won its independence and that they would be welcomed in Santa Fe. So Glenn led some of his group south, reaching Santa Fe in early January 1822. The Glenn-Fowler party, then, arrived in New Mexico in a pivotal year, having been preceded there by a matter of weeks by groups under William Becknell and Thomas James, who reached Santa Fe on November 16 and December 1, respectively. Fowler's journal, which is more complete than Becknell's brief diary and more truthful than James's

recollections, has long been a valuable source for understanding these traders who opened New Mexico to Yankee commerce, and for providing an early Anglo glimpse of New Mexico and of Indian configurations along the Arkansas. In point of time Fowler's journal takes its place alongside the writings of Zebulon Pike and Stephen Long, but unlike those explorers, Fowler, made no impact on his contemporaries, for his journal was not published until 1898 by Elliott Coues.

Coues's original edition preserved Fowler's extraordinary grammar and phonetic spelling, which have delited reeders ever sense. Happily, the present editors, Raymond and Mary Settle and Harry Stevens, have preserved Coues's transcription. Apparently they did not, however, check Coues's work against the original journal preserved today at the University of Chicago. On a few occasions (such as p. 24) a fresh reading of the manuscript might have been illuminating. Along with Coues's transcription, the editors have wisely retained his introduction and notes, supplementing them with their own fine commentary. The editors' preface, though, is a disappointment. It does not assess the significance of the Glenn-Fowler expedition or of Fowler's journal in light of recent scholarship. The editors, for example, do not even indicate that Coues did not have the writings of Becknell and Thomas James available to him. Nor does the editors' preface provide an up-to-date biographical sketch of Fowler. Although Raymond Settle published an article-length biography of Fowler in 1966, the editors have not bothered to correct errors in the biography of Fowler that Coues published.

The great contribution of this new edition is its notes. Coues's notes, accurate and useful in the main, have been meticulously amplified and corrected by the editors. Seventy years of scholarship between the two editions have aided them in clarifying previously obscure persons and places, and in tracing Fowler's route with precision. Indeed, if any criticism is to be made of the notes, it is that they are too fulsome. For example, the editors use Fowler's mention of a fandango in Taos as the occasion to discuss Padre Martínez, who was not even at Taos at the time. Mention of the Arkansas River sets the editors off on a gratuitous twenty-seven line note, reminiscent of Bancroft, which discusses the origin of the name Arkansas. Occasionally, these extensive notes are disorderly. Zebulon Pike, for example, is introduced late in the book (p. 97), well after the editors have made frequent reference to him. In a volume which seeks to illuminate a man's travels, the lack of a map is curious. But a reviewer can never be certain if the publisher or the editors are to blame for that omission.

If this new edition is not, to this reviewer's taste, a model of graceful modern editing, it is a thorough, careful, and eminently useful piece of

work, even to the index which embraces the footnotes as well as the text. Fowler's story of a dangerous crossing of the plains amidst unknown tribes, Lewis Dawson's fatal fight with a bear, the Negro Paul's ribald encounter with a señora of Taos, these and other incidents in this journal have long deserved a wider readership than the scarce 1898 edition made possible. But Nebraska is to be commended for not merely reprinting Fowler's journal, but for publishing what is, essentially, a new book. Libraries that have the original edition by Coues will need to own this one, too, for the older work has clearly been supplanted. Fowler's journal should not need to be re-edited for another seventy years, at least, and if the task is undertaken again, the notes of the Settles and Stevens will doubtless be incorporated into the new effort.

San Diego State College DAVID J. WEBER

THE STRANGE STORY OF WAYNE BRAZEL. By Robert N. Mullin. Canyon, Texas: The Palo Duro Press, 1971, Pp. 40. Illus. $4.00.

ROBERT N. MULLIN, former resident of Las Vegas, New Mexico, El Paso, Texas, and other southwestern towns, now retired, a long-time executive of the Gulf Oil Company, living in Laguna Beach, California, is the author of *The Strange Story of Wayne Brazel,* published by The Palo Duro Press of Canyon, Texas. Mr. Mullin's book, with many interesting photographs of a bygone day, richly deserves a place on the top shelf of any New Mexico library. J. Evetts Haley of Canyon, Texas, prominent southwestern author, has written a glowing foreword praising the book highly, saying among other things that "no one else but Bob Mullin could have successfully rescued Brazel from oblivion." Wayne Brazel became an important figure in New Mexico history on February 29, 1908, when he surrendered to the Sheriff of Dona Ana County and admitted that he had just killed Pat Garrett, killer on July 14, 1881, of William H. Bonney, "Billy the Kid," at the home of Pete Maxwell in Fort Sumner, New Mexico. Mr. Mullin has compressed in 37 pages of print the complicated and fascinating story of the emergence of Brazel and his mysterious disappearance. He takes the reader with him on his dogged efforts to follow the trail of Brazel from the date of his birth to the day when Mullin was obliged to throw up his hands and say he could travel no further. Although he admitted that he had killed Garrett many people in Las Cruces and in the country about doubted his word. There seemed to be a universal opinion that Jim Miller, a well-known Texas gunman, was paid $5,000 to kill Garrett upon condition that he should not be obliged to stand trial, but that those participating in the conspiracy would furnish a person who would admit that he had killed Garrett.

At the conclusion of his work Mr. Mullin wrote as follows: "After many years of investigation this writer must conclude that no matter how unwisely this unlucky man acted at the time, he did not pull the trigger that ended the life of Pat Garrett. And clearly the most convincing evidence points to South America as the end of the trail for Jesse Wayne Brazel."

Albuquerque, N. M. W. A. KELEHER

THE FRENCH LEGATION IN TEXAS. VOLUME I, RECOGNITION, RUPTURE, AND RECONCILIATION. Translated and edited with an Introduction by Nancy Nichols Barker. Austin: Texas State Historical Association, 1971. Pp. 358. Illus., app. $12.00.

IN September 1839 the French Monarchy became the first European nation officially recognizing the Republic of Texas. Soon thereafter the French government appointed a little-known diplomat, Alphonse Dubois de Saligny, as chargé d'affaires—a position he held during most of the period of French recognition. In this collection of documents M. Saligny emerged as an unusual French diplomat of his day, for during his career he held high posts in government and earned many honors, yet in the end did disservice to his country, dishonored his name, and lived the balance of his life in disgrace. His political demise was a result of his handling of Franco-Texas diplomacy, not because the United States annexed the new Republic.

M. Saligny's schemes in Texas were more a farce than tragedy, resulting partly from his unusual personality. His contemporaries described him as vain, irrascible, capable of chicanery, and prone to great exaggerations. He became involved with an innkeeper in Austin when he killed some of the hotelman's swine, whereupon he hurriedly left Texas until local anger subsided. Unwilling or unable to accept blame for his diplomatic failures, he penned numerous, lengthy letters to his superiors, alibiing his failure to follow instructions or to accomplish his missions. He falsely reported his travels in Texas and the United States and constantly erred in his reports concerning diplomatic and political problems in Texas. His verbose style demonstrated little evidence of great knowledge, yet his syntax was good, and through this correspondence his personality and conflicts with contemporaries emerged. So biased were his reports that one must analyze carefully every statement to ascertain its validity.

Nevertheless, throughout this diplomatic correspondence French willingness to establish trade outlets and gain influence in the New World was evident. Also significant, M. Saligny reported Texas efforts to exploit the

Chihuahua to Santa Fe trade, and to profit from the large droves of wild cattle freely roaming the ranges. According to the temperamental Frenchman, Texas was still a rugged frontier area where few banks existed, where travel was always arduous, and where marauding Indians constantly struck within twenty miles of Austin. The French diplomat was generous in his condemnations, for he severely criticized both Sam Houston and the United States for their parts in Texas politics.

Professor Barker, a specialist in European history at the University of Texas at Austin, added an introduction and editorial remarks that provide the necessary background for understanding this correspondence. Great care was taken to produce accurate, clear translations, and many of M. Saligny's biased remarks, as well as numerous errors, were indicated in adequate notes. Thus, the publication of these letters sheds new light on an important period of Texas history. The Texas State Historical Association has provided historians with a worthwhile and interesting collection of documents. It is to be regretted, however, that no index was included, for this addition would have made the work even more useful. Yet, with careful attention to editorial comments, this work is a useful tool for studying the history of Texas and the American West.

Missouri Southern State College JOE A. STOUT, JR.

DALLAS STOUDENMIRE: EL PASO MARSHAL. By Leon Claire Metz. Austin and New York: The Pemberton Press, 1969. Pp. xii, 162. Illus., bibliog., index. $6.95.

LEON METZ has produced a double-edged biography containing a segment of the life story of a raw, frontier town, and a segment of the life story of the man who tamed this town. El Paso during the 1870's was a sanctuary for the lawless. Saloons and "whorehouses outnumbered churches a hundred to one." City fathers wailed "we . . . have turned loose upon us hordes of vagabonds, gamblers, burglars, thieves and particularly murderers." A succession of town marshals seemed unable to abate the lawlessness. Regularly the El Paso mayor appealed to the governor to send a detachment of Texas Rangers to patrol the streets.

In this atmosphere of violence entered Dallas Stoudenmire, a tall strong two-gun man. The mayor and aldermen appointed him town marshal on April 11, 1881, and in less than two years he made life and property secure. Stoudenmire worked jail prisoners at keeping the city streets clean and in good repair, he enforced local ordinances, collected fines, and helped officials collect taxes. He policed El Paso's half dozen opium dens and "decreased the number of worthless curs" by enforcing the dog-tax

ordinance. Authorities admitted that he was the first town marshal to take the duties of the office seriously.

Stoudenmire was a high-spirited person and showed no favorites. Ironically, his dedication and devotion to duty, a source of pride for El Paso citizens in the early days of his tenure, became a source of scorn, contempt and resentment. As the civic alienation grew, Stoudenmire turned more to the bottle. One night in a drunken fit he fired his pistols into the steeple of St. Clement's church. The author defends Stoudenmire for his escape in strong drink by the comment: "If trying to bring peace to an ungrateful town while constantly facing the spectre of assassination made an alcoholic and an unconscionable killer out of him it probably would have done the same to any man in his situation."

In his unbiased enforcement of the law Stoudenmire made many enemies for "Strong and fearless men always do. The Texas Rangers disliked him and the politicians feared him. He answered insult for insult, threat for threat. But towering above his animosity for these two factions loomed his implacable hatred" for the Manning brothers "who completely dominated the gambling and prostitution interests in El Paso." Stoudenmire's feud with the Manning brothers ended in the town marshal's death during a bloody fist and gunfight when the Manning brothers ganged up on him.

This book has an essence of balance and fairness in assessing Stoudenmire's character. It is a contribution as a treatise on urban history of a raw frontier town. And it is readable. *Dallas Stoudenmire* is carefully researched, based largely on original records including El Paso town council minutes, contemporary local newspapers, files of the Texas Rangers, and extensive correspondence by the author with knowledgeable informants.

University of Oklahoma ARRELL M. GIBSON

DELIGHTFUL JOURNEY DOWN THE GREEN AND COLORADO RIVERS. By Barry M. Goldwater. Tempe: Arizona Historical Foundation, 1970. Pp. xii, 209. Illus., maps, apps., bibliog. $15.00.

IT IS GOOD to have this book in print. With Norm Nevills in 1940 Barry Goldwater made the river run from Green River, Utah, through Labyrinth, Stillwater, Cataract, Narrow, Glen and Grand canyons to Lake Mead. At that time less than a hundred persons had taken the same trip since 1869 when John Wesley Powell completed the pioneer voyage.

The Nevills' party spent forty-seven days on the water which the author remembers as a "delightful journey." He maintained a diary of the

trip which was reproduced in mimeograph form for private distribution. Greatly condensed versions—one in the January issue of *Arizona Highways* —were published in 1941.

For thirty years Colorado River enthusiasts, historians and river runners have gone to the libraries to consult the Goldwater diary for the variety of information it contains. They can find it in the bookstores now, a handsome quarto enhanced by ninety-six of the author's 1940 photographs. Included are supplemental essays on prehistoric man in the Grand Canyon by anthropologist Robert C. Euler and on the geology of the Colorado canyons by Carleton B. Moore. O. Dock Marston, river historian, is carried on the title page as special consultant.

Goldwater journeyed the Colorado before it was dammed and controlled; he has much to say about the adventures of riding a wilder river and a freer one than we have now. And, of course, the voyagers traveled in wooden boats of the Nevills type and not in neoprene pontoons. The diarist took time to write at length on historic spots; he essayed hypotheses on geology and described prehistoric ruins and modern Indians. There are some good passages on the joys of wilderness travel, particularly through canyons in Arizona, where he observed the sky is bluer, the air more bracing, and where the birds sing with more buoyant notes!

I would put Senator Goldwater's *Delightful Journey* on the same shelf with Powell, Dellenbaugh (and the other diarists of Powell's second voyage), Kolb, Eddy, Stanton and Stone.

University of Utah C. Gregory Crampton

The Image of Arizona: Pictures from the Past. By Andrew Wallace. Albuquerque: The University of New Mexico Press, 1971. Pp. vii, 224. Illus., bibliog., index. $15.00.

This is a visual history of Arizona, consisting of more than six hundred drawings, woodcuts, sketches, paintings, and photographs. It is a companion volume to *New Mexico in the 19th Century* and *Colorado's First Portrait,* also published by The University of New Mexico Press, which is to be congratulated for excellent and attractive formats.

Under chapter headings of: Native Dwellers, The Land, Spanish and Mexican Arizona, Making a Territory, Apache Wars, Commerce and Industry, Towns, and Territorial Life, Professor Wallace has arranged the visual history with informative captions and fine explanatory texts to tell the history of Arizona before it became a state of the union. It would seem that the author assembled every visual representation which has to do with the early history of Arizona. He gleaned through *Harper's Weekly,*

Harper's Monthly, Scribner's, Century and other magazines for the period 1850-1912 for every reference, and there were many, because drawings and stories regarding the Southwest were always welcome escape literature for people of the East. He has gathered together the relevant drawings of people who accompanied the early explorers and photos in collections with which he became familiar when he was associated with the Arizona Pioneers' Historical Society.

It isn't a book one reads in the ordinary sense, but what a pleasant way it is to absorb knowledge of the Indians of Arizona, the missions, the extremes of topography, the flora and fauna, mining methods and equipment, political history, agriculture, cattle ranching, etc. It is a thoroughly enjoyable book for anyone interested in the history of the Southwest, whether young or old, amateur or professional. The book does extremely well what the author set out to do, i.e., draw together all the published illustrations and photos which exemplify the history of Arizona. It makes no pretense of being a comprehensive written text, but one emerges from the book with more feeling for the total picture of Arizona; and through use of the bibliography and index one can read in depth the pertinent materials. It should be on the bookshelf of anyone interested in the history of the southwestern portion of the United States.

Fort Lewis College, Durango ROBERT W. DELANEY