

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 53 | Number 1

Article 6

1-1-1978

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 53, 1 (2021). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol53/iss1/6>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

GERONIMO: THE MAN, HIS TIME, HIS PLACE. By Angie Debo. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1976. Pp. xx, 480. Illus., notes, index, maps, bibliography. \$14.95.

IN THE LONG HISTORY of warfare between Indians and whites, no tribe proved more formidable than the Apache and no tribal leader more formidable than Geronimo. The story of his final stand against a considerable portion of the U.S. Army has been told many times, most recently and authoritatively by Dan L. Thrapp in a series of meticulously researched studies of the Apache wars. Geronimo remains today a figure of endless fascination.

Angie Debo's work is the second full-scale biography of Geronimo in recent years. It suffers from the defect of most biographies of Indian leaders—sparsity of sources. Before the period Geronimo became well-known to whites, she had to rely mainly on his own reminiscences and those of his cousin. Both are vague on time and place and for the most part unconfirmed by other sources. As a result, many chapters of the book tend to be a general history of the Chiricahua Apache in which Geronimo is but fleetingly and speculatively glimpsed, and these chapters are drawn largely from Thrapp's work. Even after Geronimo became a celebrity, of course, the chief sources are the words of white men. But these exist in an abundance that permits his role in the last years of warfare to be documented with assurance, although more from the white point of view than the Indian.

Angie Debo is well qualified to make the best of a bad situation. She knows Indians as a lifelong student of Indian history and culture. Especially useful is her sure identification of family and tribal relationships of notable individuals, an area fraught with traps for the unwary. Also valuable is her chronicle of the two decades of captivity in Florida, Alabama, and Oklahoma that followed the final surrender. These years make up about one-fourth of the book. This biography is doubtless as authoritative as is possible given the limitations of source material. Even though, contrary to the subtitle, it is more time and place than man, no future biographer is likely to get any closer to the man.

*Advisory Council on
Historic Preservation*

ROBERT M. UTLEY

HOURLY OF TRIAL: THE CONSERVATION CONFLICT IN COLORADO AND THE WEST, 1891-1907. By G. Michael McCarthy. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1977. Pp. 327. Bibliog., index. \$12.50.

FIFTEEN YEARS AGO Elmo Richardson published *The Politics of Conservation*—a scholarly treatise that provided a new perspective to the conservation controversy that swirled around the administration of Theodore Roosevelt. Traditional interpretation of the period had focused upon the careers of a few men and their actions in the nation's capital; Richardson looked to the West, carefully examined the role played by a variety of westerners and replaced former oversimplification with sound interpretation.

Author McCarthy faithfully follows the path blazed by Richardson in this case study of the conservation conflict in Colorado. Correctly assuming that "Colorado's experience was the West's experience . . . and the western experience was the national experience," McCarthy begins his narrative with the passage of the controversial Forest Reserve Act of 1891 and concludes with the equally controversial Public Land Convention held in Denver in 1907. While his sentiments are admittedly with the pro-conservation forces, he maintains an admirable objectivity throughout. Insurgents (those opposed to forest reserves, public land leasing, coal land withdrawal and grazing taxes) are not cast in the traditional role of villains but instead are identified and described as having been as moralistic, idealistic and sincere as were their opponents.

This examination of the people and forces operating in Colorado adds reinforcement to Richardson's thesis that western conservation support and opposition cut across both political and economic lines, and that sound economic rationale underlay both ideologies. Those opposing the conservation measures promulgated by the federal government were doomed to fail, McCarthy says, because they were a fragmented minority within the state and their occasional demagoguery and intemperance could not overcome the popularity and energy of Teddy Roosevelt and Gifford Pinchot.

The author might have followed Richardson's path a bit further and extended his inquiry through 1912. McCarthy's claim that the Public Land Conference of 1907 provided a watershed—that anti-conservation forces declined thereafter—ignores the turmoil of the next four years: The second Public Land Conference held in Denver in 1911; the gubernatorial race of 1912 pitting arch-insurgent Ammons against conservationist Costigan; and the passage of the Forest Homestead Act in 1912. Other shortcomings exist. An overuse of quotations contributes repetition and redundancy. Thorough research of newspapers is evident, but contemporary periodical literature is ignored. Oklahoma University Press must be faulted for the extremely poor photographic reproduction. Grey and grey is a weak substitute for black and white.

The objective analysis provided in the book is enhanced by the final chapter. Here, the author examines present-day controversies involving Coloradans in particular and westerners in general. Questions and resulting contentions raised by the energy crisis, the use or non-use of coal and oil shale, and the expansion of

ski areas and land "development" are presented with calmness and clarity. Due to McCarthy's admirable restraint, his discussion of men, motives and morals will provide profitable reading for conservationists, preservationists, developers and exploiters. And that, in today's polarized approach use, is both rare and welcome.

University of Montana

H. D. HAMPTON

FRIAR BRINGAS REPORTS TO THE KING: METHODS OF INDOCTRINATION ON THE FRONTIER OF NEW SPAIN, 1796-97. Translated and edited by Daniel S. Matson and Bernard L. Fontana. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1977, Pp. vii, 177. Illus., maps, notes, app., lex., bibliog., index. Cloth \$12.50, paperback, \$6.50.

THIS BOOK is a highly detailed documentary study of frontier missionary methods and existing conditions in the region of Pimeria Alta during the later colonial period. The report, written in 1796-97, consists of some 105 numbered paragraphs interspersed with pertinent contemporary letters. It contains not only historical and ethnographic information, but also sets forth proposals for governmental reform. Many statistics are contained therein, such as the number of pueblos and inhabitants in a particular area, leagues between settlements, and baptisms performed in Pimeria Alta from 1768 to 1796. The report also includes commentaries on the Laws of the Indies, suggestions for improving mission life, and judgments about various Indian groups of the region.

Father Diego Bringas, a native of Alamos, Mexico, attended the Franciscan College of Santa Cruz in Querétaro and by 1795, at age 33, had become the college's procurator. As such he went as an official visitor to the missions of Pimeria Alta and wrote his report. Unfortunately, as the editors point out, the "lengthy document, instead of being delivered to the Spanish king, was relegated to territorial archives." Nevertheless, the report contained so much valuable information with regard to mission history that a number of persons felt it should be translated and published. Indeed, the translation alone, begun in 1964, is an important contribution to scholarship.

The report is preceded by an introduction covering the life of Father Bringas, the role of his report, and a brief summary of the relationship of church and state in the frontier regions of New Spain. The editors also describe local Indians and their confrontation with Jesuit and Franciscan missionaries. The final section of the introduction includes several broad comparisons of the age of discovery and expansion with modern times and some generalizations about the differences between "Western Man" and "Indians." These are open to question.

Although the introduction is meant for the general reader, the report is rather specialized. Fortunately, there are biographical and explanatory footnotes which give considerable additional information and are preferable in form to the anthropological reference system used in the introduction. The editors have provided a lexicon of Spanish words that is generally helpful but contains a few

items, e.g., *alcalde mayor*, *gente de razón*, *patronato real* and *soldados del país*, needing further clarification. A *villa* is not "smaller than a pueblo and larger than an *aldea*" but a town having been accorded rank and privilege—size is not a factor.

This book is attractively printed and reproduces two original maps by Father Bringas showing the places he visited. In summary, the report is a valuable reference source for students of Spanish Borderlands history.

University of San Diego

IRIS WILSON ENGSTRAND

GLOBE, ARIZONA. By Clara T. Woody and Milton L. Schwartz. Tucson: The Arizona Historical Society, 1977. Pp. 1, 262. Illus., notes, index. \$15.00.

ALMOST EVERY SMALL TOWN in America seems to have its resident local historian, usually someone of great age and enthusiasm but little professional training. Clara T. Woody to some extent fills this position in Globe, Arizona. However, she is much more than an enthusiastic amateur; she has been systematic in her collecting, has solicited and used the advice of professionals, and was an early believer in the value of oral history. Unfortunately she never found the time to write the four books she intended to author. In 1974 individuals at the Arizona Historical Society arranged for Milton Schwartz, a graduate student at the University of Arizona, to sort through, edit, and digest her notes and jottings into a history of her hometown. In addition, several employees of the Historical Society, especially C. J. Sonnichsen, who wrote an introduction to the volume, contributed to the project.

In its own curious way, this book therefore is the product of a committee—and it reads like it, for it has little unity or balance. Actually the purchaser will get two books and an article for his fifteen dollars. As the title implies he will have a history of Globe. The Apache wars, the frantic search for silver, the beginnings of a crude frontier village, the arrival of farmers and ranchers in the vicinity, the building of a railroad, the development of civic institutions, and the growth of the copper mines and smelters—all are covered. However, almost half of the book deals with the Pleasant Valley War during which two families, the Grahams and the Tewksburys, tried to kill each other. Finally, there is a superfluous chapter about Pearl Hart who robbed a stagecoach outside Globe and who perhaps returned there late in life as the wife of a local rancher.

No doubt, some official at the Arizona Historical Society, believing that the history of Globe would not sell well, decided to throw in the information about the Pleasant Valley War and Pearl Hart in hopes of increasing sales. The sad result is a large volume lacking balance, but which does include excellent information for some future history of Globe or about the battles between outlaws and lawmen in that general region.

Memphis State University

ODIE B. FAULK

IGLESIA PRESBITERIANA: A HISTORY OF PRESBYTERIANS AND MEXICAN AMERICANS IN THE SOUTHWEST. By R. Douglas Brackenridge and Francisco O. García-Treto. San Antonio: Trinity University Press, 1974. Pp. ix, 262. Notes, bibliography, index, illustrations. \$8.00.

IGLESIA PRESBITERIANA has broken fresh ground. Co-authors Brackenridge and García-Treto, professors in the Department of Religion at Trinity University, are to be congratulated for their industry, their organizational clarity and avoidance of maudlin moralizing all too common in ethno-historical studies. Extensive use of church records in the Presbyterian Historical Society and wide-ranging interviews afforded them an overview on an important subject, one richly deserving the handsome publication accorded it by Trinity Press. Henceforth their book is a required source for those probing the fusion of Mexican and Yankee cultures in the American Southwest.

This area of Presbyterian history spans well over a century. Brackenridge and García-Treto have divided their account into three broad periods: 1830-1910, nearly half the text; 1910-1960; and 1960 to the present, approximately thirty pages. Their task was formidable. Balance demanded the inclusion of differing groups of Mexican Americans (the term "Chicano" is eschewed because of its "emotional overtones") stretching from Texas over New Mexico, Colorado, and Arizona into California. Furthermore, it proved necessary to trace the dual labors of the Presbyterian Church U.S. (southern denomination) and the Presbyterian Church U.S.A. Notwithstanding this organizational thicket, the reader seldom loses his way. Constructing this meticulous framework has imposed a rather bland style. Fortunately, significant Mexican and Anglo Presbyterian churchmen and women come alive. Among the dedicated individuals to whom the authors devote considerable attention are John A. Annin, Gabino Rendón, Melinda Rankin, James A. Menaul, and Paul L. Warnshuis; the regrettable ecclesiastical feud between the hard-working W. S. Scott and Robert D. Campbell is not dodged.

Because Brackenridge and García-Treto are so determined to examine all of the cardinal features of the multifaceted Presbyterian activities (schools, hospitals, neighborhood counseling, etc.), they slight the broader, changing Anglo-Mexican socio-economic relationships during these years. Spanish-speaking Americans are not mute in these pages. However our view of the Latinos tends to assume an impression of Mexican passivity contrasted with WASP dynamism. When such a petty yet paramount factual error as the misdating of the world's most famous gold discovery slips by both scholars, one is inclined to believe that their failure to include more background information has resulted simply because neither man is well informed on the wider ramifications of Western American history.

Surprisingly it was not until decades after the Mexican Cession before evangelizing in the American Southwest surpassed the "missionary zeal focused on the interior of Mexico" (p. 12). By the 1880s, growing numbers of Mexican

and Anglo Presbyterians were demonstrating by word and deed how unjustified was the racial stereotype of the dull "lazy Mex." Yet because these impoverished rural people were unable to support their own local Presbyterian churches, eastern subsidies had to be continued, and the Anglo belief in Mexican sloth was thus perpetuated. Ironically, not a few Mexican converts soon "far excelled 'American' Presbyterians in practicing family worship, in observing the Sabbath, and in home training of children" (p. 29). One is reminded of Hawaii where Polynesian Christians put to shame the ostensible Christian haole. Following the Second World War and the mushrooming permissiveness practiced in American homes, older, pietistic Mexican Americans have had to confront an abhorrent degree of "secular and unchristian" behavior (smoking, drunkenness, etc.) among their youth. Markedly distinct opinions on the efficacy of César Chávez and La Raza have likewise magnified a generation gap.

In concluding their volume, Brackenridge and García-Treto state "if one could summarize in a single word the panorama of the Presbyterian church's relation to the Mexican American in the contemporary situation, that word would probably have to be 'ambivalence'" (p. 222). How do they view future possibilities for Iglesia Presbiteriana? Their final sentence voices a note of optimism. "There is hope, as yet alive in the hearts of many Anglos and Mexican Americans, that it will be possible to see within the Presbyterian family in the United States a bilingual, bicultural Mexican American constituency, no longer 'an orphan child of the denomination,' but a strong, mature, and contributing adult brother" (pp. 224-225).

*California State University
San Jose*

TED HINCKLEY

THE FIRST BISHOP OF SONORA: ANTONIO DE LOS REYES, O.F.M. By Albert Stagg.

Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 1976. Pp. ix, 109. Illus., maps, notes, bibliog., index. \$8.50 cloth, \$4.50 paper.

LUCKIER THAN New Mexico's vocal Fray Alonso de Benavides, who tried in vain to parlay a few years of missionary experience and a visit to the Spanish court into consecration as the colony's first bishop, Sonora's Fray Antonio María de los Reyes brought it off. By loudly advocating reform in an age of reform, and by cultivating arch-reformer José de Gálvez, the irrepressible Father Reyes alienated his fellow Franciscans, caught the conscience of the king, and won his miter in 1782 as first bishop of Sonora, Sinaloa, and the Californias.

Albert Stagg, whose maternal grandfather married a great-grandniece of Bishop Reyes, has graciously introduced us to a beguiling and exasperating relative. A quarter of the text is by Reyes himself, mostly letters readably translated and interspersed in italic. Still, it is difficult to tell whether Reyes' professed compassion for the downtrodden Indian ran deeper than his rhetoric. Stagg believes that it did. Most of the friar's Franciscan contemporaries, from whom little is heard, thought not.

Some of the exaggerated claims made in support of the Reyes nomination have found their way into the text unchallenged. The bishop-to-be, for example, was never leader of the fifteen Franciscans dispatched by the Querétaro missionary college to Sonora in 1767 to replace expelled Jesuits. As a check the author might have consulted the two-part pious chronicle of the college by Isidro Félix de Espinosa and Juan Domingo Arricivita.

Stagg's slender volume has resurrected Antonio María de los Reyes. Now let someone set him in that peculiar, peripheral Spanish quarter of the philosopher's heavenly city. Reyes deserves a full-dress, life-and-times biography. With that, no doubt, the bishop would be first to agree.

University of New Mexico

JOHN L. KESSELL

CRAZY WOMEN IN THE RAFTERS. MEMORIES OF A TEXAS BOYHOOD. By Paul Patterson. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1976. Pp. xii, 242. Preface, epilogue. \$8.95.

CONTRARY TO initial reactions evoked by the title, this book, thankfully, is not about psychology in the American West. Rather, as the subtitle explains, it is an account of the early childhood experiences of Paul Patterson, a former cowboy who regretted the transition to school teacher and writer. The setting for *Crazy Women in the Rafters* is the West Texas county of Upton, near the Pecos River within the larger geographical entity that oilmen call the Permian Basin.

The central theme of the book is migration in the first quarter of the twentieth century. Paul Patterson, as the next-to-the-last child in a family of seven, was the victim of horror stories narrated by his older brothers, either as mischief to make him cry or as an intramural activity to break the monotony of riding in a slow-moving wagon from place to place. One story, which became the source of inspiration for the title, concerned dilapidated and abandoned shacks in the Staked Plains country, all visible reminders, the brothers declared, that the devil had assisted God in the Creation. The high point of the story was that the isolation, aridity, and flatness of the terrain did not affect cattlemen (who liked it) as it did women (who, upon losing their faculties, retreated to the rafters). Shepherders, allegedly members of a lower social stratum, were the only men apt to become insane on the prairie, but they did not inhabit the rafters because they feared crazy women.

At the outset it is obvious that the volume is directed at a special audience, particularly boys of all ages who can identify with a bygone era in Texas when herding cattle on horseback was seemingly the only honorable occupation for any respectable man. For the author the external struggle was achieving the elusive status of cowboy. Internally the conflict was the Patterson family trying to break out of a cycle of poverty. Sometime between the twenty-ninth and thirtieth move that the Pattersons made, the mother, exasperated by the constant migration, took her savings earned as a rural telephone operator and retired to a boarding house in Altrus, Oklahoma. The father, with assistance of the eldest daughter,

held the family together as they drifted from one job opportunity to the next. Then, almost haphazardly and without campaign strategy, the father turned to politics and won election to the office of county judge. Protocol and community position notwithstanding, Judge Patterson supplemented his public income with odd jobs, such as freighting and performing marriage ceremonies. Even with this modest degree of prosperity, the father did not permit his family to alter its lifestyle. With an occasional flash of wit, the author commented: "If Papa, naked, had his choice between a \$1.98 barrel and a \$2.00 suit of clothes, he'd turn down the suit and go home in the barrel" (p. 202).

Crazy Women in the Rafters is a series of interrelated stories, some more poignant than others, which for the most part are entertaining. The author did not postulate a lofty thesis, except to proclaim that he had set a world record in covered-wagon moving (thirty-six relocations). The book's underlying theme is that the Patterson family—despite poverty, privation, and considerable migration—never accepted charity. They not only survived, but in the end they thrived.

Four centuries ago, Francisco Vásquez de Coronado made the Llano Estacado famous because his explorers endured the hardships of migrating through the region and lived to write about it. Admittedly the Pattersons in no way compared themselves to the historic stature of Vásquez de Coronado. In their own time, however, they achieved the rank of minor folkheroes simply by having the audacity and determination to reside in an uninviting, inhospitable land.

University of Texas at San Antonio

FELIX D. ALMARAZ, JR.

THE PIONEER YEARS, 1895-1914: MEMORIES OF SETTLERS WHO OPENED THE WEST. By Barry Broadfoot. Toronto: Doubleday and Company, 1976. Pp. 403. \$12.50.

THIS BOOK, like Walt Whitman's poem, "O Pioneers!" is a celebration of pioneer folk for their enduring spirit and optimism in the face of impossible circumstances. Like its predecessors, it is a random collection of oral reminiscences, the third in a series beginning with *Ten Lost Years*, a dust-bowl memoir of western Canada, and *Six War Years*, a popular recollection of World War II in Canada. *Pioneer Years* is essentially the raw stuff of social history, calculated to recall a sense of the past rather than offer explanations of its development. In common with other recent popularizers, Broadfoot the journalist poses as the anti-historian consciously rejecting dry-as-dust accounts of railways, freight rates and institutional growth which have preoccupied a previous generation of Canadian historians. But, in his insistence upon "telling it like it was," he is claiming to have rediscovered the wheel of history originally invented by such pioneer historians as von Ranke, Carlyle, Bancroft and Parkman. As history, it is a refreshingly naive voyage of discovery, much in the same spirit as the pioneer experience itself.

Despite its documentary form, the book conveys a moral in the tradition of its nineteenth-century forbears, and the reader is confronted with the familiar polemic of anti-frontierism and Victorian moral uplift. By these lights, the Canadian West was not the wild and woolly frontier of the United States, but a land of law and order "where everything proceeded at a measured pace, and what had to be done was done, with intelligence, reason and diligence." The familiar forces which peacefully organized and tamed the Canadian frontier are relentlessly paraded before the reader in full regalia—the Mounties, the Canadian Pacific Railway, the Dominion Land Office, and the little white schoolhouse on the prairie. The occasional villains of the piece are also there, usually Americans who, as land promoters, whiskey traders and slippery operators, threatened to disturb the orderly march westward of civilization.

The book is in fact replete with stereotypes. The English remittance man is roundly portrayed as a sad reminder that old-world aristocracy was ill adapted to the harsh environment of the northern plains. Token gestures are made to include the ethnic minorities, and gross caricatures are deployed to entertain—the Chinese cook, the Jewish pedlar, and the illiterate Bohunk, to name a few. The Indians are scarcely mentioned, and their absence appears less lamented than the extinction of the buffalo. Such distortions are further compounded by puritanical anachronisms which present the disconsolate farm wife and the village whore as the predominant feminine roles in the early west.

In the final analysis, *Pioneer Years* is an illusion of memory as insubstantial as the desert-like mirages it creates. Occasionally, it brilliantly recaptures the sensory past so compellingly recalled in Wallace Stegner's *Wolf Willow*. More often, it succumbs to the fragmentary perspectives of diminishing memory and the cranky distortions of old age.

The University of Calgary

A. W. RASPORICH

THE NAVAJOS: A CRITICAL BIBLIOGRAPHY. By Peter Iverson. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1976. \$3.95.

THIS BIBLIOGRAPHY is one in a series of similar works sponsored by the Newberry Library Center for the History of the American Indian. Some of the guides deal with Indian cultural areas, others treat individual tribes, and still others concern historical or contemporary issues. All strongly emphasize ethnohistory. Iverson's work is the fifth published thus far.

Iverson employs a format that is simple and useable. Approximately the first half of the bibliography is devoted to Iverson's evaluation of the major works published on the Navajos. His discussion is organized under such headings as "Basic Texts and Studies," "Bibliographies," "Navajo Accounts and Documents," etc. The second half of the bibliography consists of an alphabetical listing of items. Again usability is apparent. At the beginning of the second part, Iverson recommends five studies for the beginning student and eighteen studies

needed for a basic library collection. In the general listing of items, asterisks designate those works suited for secondary school students.

Little criticism is warranted for either the format of the bibliography or Iverson's application of it. One may occasionally quibble with his selection of items or his evaluations, but his treatment indicates clearly that Iverson is a well read and astute student of the Navajos. His bibliography will meet the needs of specialists in their introductory research and more than satisfy the requirements of general readers.

Purdue University

DONALD L. PARMAN

THE SPELL OF NEW MEXICO. By Tony Hillerman. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1976. Pp. viii, 105. \$5.95.

THE CHARACTERISTICS of a particular environment have an effect upon the life pattern and responsive attitudes of the residents. Because the lifelong experience of natives engraves in them ingrained traits, which are accepted by them as a matter of course, their response, too, adds a distinct human milieu to that of the physical surroundings.

Together, the landscape and the people create the "Spell of New Mexico," felt by both natives and newcomers alike, but with a depth that defies adequate expression by the average participant. It is the newcomer, then, with contrasting experiences elsewhere, who senses immediately the effect of the change in location. If the newcomers are not overburdened with the labors and worries of subsistence and if they are endowed with keen insight and charming word power, then from their pens flow artistic and philosophical descriptions that they admit are still inadequate; yet selections from the writings of several sum up what many others have long experienced without attempting a definition.

With consummate skill, Tony Hillerman, veteran journalist and author, has brought together in one small but revealing volume the choice selections of responses wrought by "The Spell" upon a dozen observers, including himself, all of whom originally were outsiders, but with time in New Mexico ranging from a few months to several years. Represented in these selections are Mary Austin, Oliver La Farge, Conrad Richter, D. H. Lawrence, C. G. Jung, Winfield Townley Scott, John De Witt McKee, Ernie Pyle, Harvey Fergusson, and Lawrence Clark Powell.

This reader began marking especially meaningful, condensed, expressive passages for representative quotations in this review, but soon the list was so long that this kind of sampling was abandoned. Besides, not brief quotations, but the full context, needs to be absorbed in order for the full meaning of "The Spell" to sink in and reveal to the reader what his subconsciousness has been trying to say to him all along. After a second or third rereading, the book should be sent to friends elsewhere in order to answer for them, "Why New Mexico?"

New Mexico Highlands University

LYNN I. PERRIGO