

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 52 | Number 1

Article 5

1-1-1977

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 52, 1 (2021). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol52/iss1/5>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

- THOMPSON, *The Army and the Navajo: The Bosque Redondo Reservation Experiment*, by Darlis A. Miller. 73
- PAPANIKOLAS, *The Peoples of Utah*, by Charles S. Peterson. 74
- PERRY, ED., *With Santa Anna in Texas: A Personal Narrative of the Revolution*, by Ramon Eduardo Ruiz. 75
- TERRELL, *The Plains Apache*, by Donald E. Worcester. 77
- TYLER, *Red Men and Hat Wearers: Viewpoints in Indian History*, by Peter Iverson. 78
- VERNHAM, *The Rawhide Years: A History of the Cattlemen and Cattle Country*, by Robert W Richmond. 79
- HAMMOND, *Alexander Barklay, Mountain Man*, by David J. Weber 81
- FRANZ, ET AL., *The Walter Prescott Webb Memorial Lectures: Essays on Walter Prescott Webb*, by L. Tuffly Ellis. 82
- ALEXANDER, ED., *Essays on the American West, 1974-1975*, by Michael P. Malone. 84
- ABOTT, *Colorado: A History of the Centennial State*, by Liston E. Leyendecker. 85
- HAINES, *The Plains Indians*, by Donald Berthrong. 86
- SCULLY, *Pueblo, Mountain, Village, Dance*, by Robert C. Euler. 87

THE ARMY AND THE NAVAJO: THE BOSQUE REDONDO RESERVATION EXPERIMENT, 1863-1868. By Gerald Thompson. Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 1976. Pp. xxi, 196. Illus., maps, notes, app., references, index. \$8.50.

THIS is a straightforward chronological account of the rise and fall of the Bosque Redondo Navajo Reservation established on the banks of the Pecos during the Civil War. It is a story familiar to most students of western history. To end raids on frontier settlements, General James H. Carleton initiated a campaign against the Navajos in 1863. A scorched-earth military foray into Navajoland ultimately resulted in the surrender of thousands of Navajos who were then relocated along the Pecos, far removed from their ancestral homeland.

Carleton hoped to civilize the Indians on the reservation, teaching them new habits of thought and new modes of living. His experiment encountered endless problems: crop destruction by insects and rainstorms, disease of near-epidemic proportions, raids by Comanches, and conflict with Mescalero Apaches who shared the same reservation. Amid charges and countercharges of graft, incompetency, and escalating expenses, Carleton transferred out of the territory and the Navajos returned to their homeland.

The author's most important contribution to this story is the wealth of detail used to document the administrative history of the reservation. Thompson examines the quarrel between Carleton and Garrison over subsistence contracts, for example, and this helps explain Carleton's vindictiveness toward the latter officer, though—curiously—Garrison's extended "arrest" resulting from this quarrel goes unrecorded.

Thompson pictures Carleton as "a model Christian warrior," motivated by forces of humanitarianism and engaged in a unique experiment to transform Navajos into white men. Unlike Bailey who stresses the evils

of the Bosque, calling it a concentration camp, this author stresses its positive accomplishments—development of mutual trust between soldiers and Indians, emergence of a new sense of tribal unity, and gradual assimilation of Navajos into white culture. The author fails to develop the political implications of the reservation, however; neither does he explore in any depth Carleton's economic motives for removing Navajos and Mescaleros from their homelands. It is unfortunate that more information on Navajo women at the reservation was not presented. Either this material is not available or Thompson unwittingly ignored its importance.

The work is well written and research has been extensive, though apparently the Steck papers at the University of New Mexico were not consulted. A few errors are present, but these are minimal: McCleave was captain in the California volunteers, not the Regular Army (p. 77); Hart's Mill was located in Texas, not east central New Mexico (p. 177). In short, this is a good factual study of the Bosque Redondo Reservation, one which can be useful to and enjoyed by professionals and students alike.

New Mexico State University

DARLIS A. MILLER

THE PEOPLES OF UTAH. Edited by Helen Z. Papanikolas. Salt Lake City: Utah State Historical Society, 1976. Pp. viii, 499. Illus., index. \$7.50.

THE COOPERATIVE enterprise of eighteen writers, this book is a "commemoration" of the various peoples—native Americans and immigrants—who make up Utah's "cultural groups." Under the general editorship of Helen Z. Papanikolas who has long been noted for her excellent work with the history of Utah Greeks, *Peoples of Utah* is organized along group lines in fourteen chapters that appear in chronological sequence. It is published as a Bicentennial effort by the Utah State Historical Society.

Appropriately Utah's native Americans—the Navajos and the Utes; Southern Paiutes, and Gosiutes—are presented in the first chapter. The contributions of early immigrant groups are treated next, with successive chapters devoted to the British, Blacks, Scandinavians, Jews, Continental immigrants and the Chinese. The remaining chapters of the book trace the twentieth century arrival and contributions of Canadians, Italians, Japanese, Yugoslavs, immigrants from the Middle East, Greeks, and finally Utah's largest recent immigrant group, Spanish-speaking peoples. People moving to Utah from various areas of the United States are not identified as cultural groups nor dealt with as such.

In most cases the authors of the individual chapters are members of the groups about which they have written. In the exceptions to this rule, authors have interests in ethnic or immigrant studies of long standing.

Chapters are descriptive in character and one finds little by way of interpretation in the individual chapters, although the overall interpretive point of the book that cultural groups have not only been diverse but of great importance in Utah's development is both apparent and significant. There is some variety in the length and the effectiveness of chapters. Two chapters to which Mrs. Papanikolas contributes ("Japanese Life in Utah" and "The Exiled Greeks") are among those most effectively treated as is William Mulder's chapter on Scandinavians, Frederick Buchanan's treatment of the British, and Jack Goodman's presentation of the Jews. Not surprisingly but nevertheless disappointingly, three of these five chapters (those dealing with the Greeks, British and Scandinavians) comprise stories well developed elsewhere in Utah's historiography, while several of the weaker essays are at best only sketchily treated elsewhere. Representing initial efforts, several of the latter point to mounting interest in the full spectrum of Utah's social history and promise an expanding, more balanced treatment as scholarship advances in those areas.

The photographic essays which accompany each chapter are outstanding. Including many photos not previously published, these provide a visual experience in the state's broader social history. Their general excellence represents a benchmark from which the individual authors, Mrs. Papanikolas and the Utah Historical Society may all take satisfaction. All of the chapters are fully documented. Footnotes cite a wide variety of oral and primary as well as secondary sources. Happily they appear at the bottom of each page. With such assets to recommend the book, it is somewhat disappointing that there is no bibliography. Particularly for those chapters that represent a breakthrough in Utah's social history, the lack of an annotated bibliography is disappointing. Maps charting the areas of concentration for the various groups also would have been useful to readers not well acquainted with Utah's geography.

In summary *The Peoples of Utah* is a solid achievement for the Bicentennial Year and a significant contribution to the history of one western state.

Utah State University

CHARLES S. PETERSON

WITH SANTA ANNA IN TEXAS: A PERSONAL NARRATIVE OF THE REVOLUTION. By José Enrique de la Peña. Trans. and ed. by Carmen Perry. College Station: Texas A&M Press, 1975. Pp. xxx, 202. Illus., notes, index. \$10.00.

ON OCCASION, usually when least expected, some minor historical gem appears. *Santa Anna in Texas* falls into that category. Ably translated and

edited by Carmen Perry, this small book is the diary of José Enrique de la Peña, a captain in the Mexican army sent north to put down the rebellion in Texas in 1836. It first appeared in Mexico in 1955 in a collection of manuscripts edited by José Sánchez Garza with the title *La Rebelión de Texas*. However, the Sánchez Garza edition deleted parts of the diary and corrected words and sentences in order to make reading less difficult; Perry's edition is an exact translation of the diary as originally written by de la Peña.

A native of Jalisco, de la Peña joined the Mexican navy in 1825, after completing a degree in mining engineering. At the early age of nineteen he published in *El Sol*, a Mexico City newspaper, a collection of articles critical of David Porter, a native of Boston and former commodore in the U.S. Navy named admiral of the Mexican navy at the recommendation of Joel R. Poinsett, then United States minister to Mexico. His criticism ignored by Mexican authorities, de la Peña resigned his naval commission, but time proved him right. Soon after, he entered the Mexican army, apparently unwilling to give up his career in arms, and later participated in the battle against the Spaniards at Tampico in 1829 where he won an award for valor. He wrote his account of the Texas campaign with the same valor that led him to criticize his superior in the Mexican navy and distinguish himself in the battle at Tampico.

The account of the Texas episode is divided into two parts. In the diary, which de la Peña often wrote on horseback, are recorded the events of the day. Here he describes difficulties with weather, the plight of the oxen that pull the supply wagons on long marches, the untrained character of much of the Mexican soldiery, and the incompetence of many officers. As he recorded daily events, de la Peña also made notes to himself of things he wished to write about at greater length; later he incorporated this material into his account, but took care to keep it separate from the events of the diary. While objective in his reporting and often critical of his cohorts, de la Peña wrote with the eyes and ears of a loyal Mexican officer. He gives a Mexican account of the Texas campaign and this, ultimately, is the strength of the document.

To American readers, as the blurb on the dust jacket indicates, the highspots in the diary may be de la Peña's account of two controversial episodes. Davy Crockett and six companions, he says, did not perish in the attack on the Alamo, but after their capture when General Antonio López de Santa Anna, the commander of the Mexican forces, had them shot. Of equal surprise is de la Peña's claim that Santa Anna ordered the final assault on the Alamo after he learned that its last defenders planned to

surrender or flee; had this happened, believes de la Peña, Santa Anna would have lost his chance at glory.

Whether these claims have validity, only time and additional documentation will tell. However, the value of the diary as a historical document is self-evident. And, because of de la Peña's insights and writing style, which Carmen Perry captures in her translation, it is a magnificent and intriguing narrative to read.

University of California, San Diego

RAMON EDUARDO RUIZ

THE PLAINS APACHE. By John Upton Terrell. New York: Thomas Y. Crowell Company, 1975. Pp. xii, 244. Maps, notes, bibliog., index. \$7.95.

IN HIS "Author's Note" Mr. Terrell states that "This narrative represents a conscientious effort to portray the Plains Apache as they appeared and as they lived and died in their traditional homeland, the High Plains. . . ." The book is apparently inspired by George E. Hyde's *Indians of the High Plains* (Oklahoma, 1959), which concerns "Plains Apaches" more than any other people. Since the footnotes are few and incomplete—only one cites page numbers—Terrell's statements must be accepted on faith. Several scholarly works that should have been consulted, such as Albert H. Schroeder and Dan S. Matson, *A Colony on the Move: Gaspar Castaño de Sosa's Journal, 1590-1591* (School of American Research, 1965) and Dolores A. Gunnerson, *The Jicarilla Apaches: A Study in Survival* (Northern Illinois University Press, 1974), are not listed in the bibliography.

There are, moreover, a number of positive statements which must be challenged, and which undermine one's confidence in the book as a whole. Some of them are not even germane to the subject.

According to linguists, for example, it is not true that the Kiowa language "sprang from two distinct linguistic stocks, the Tanoan and the Shoshonean . . ." (p. 24). It was a distinct language. Concerning the Kiowas' tradition of an alliance with the Crows, the author states (p. 25), "That cannot be correct." But the Kiowas borrowed the *Kado*, Medicine or Sun Dance, from the Crows, and they made long journeys to trade with them even after they had migrated to the southern plains. The author also asserts that the so-called Kiowa Apaches were closely related to the Jicarillas and Lipans. The *Handbook of American Indians North of Mexico*, edited by Frederick W. Hodge (BAE Bulletin 30), says, with regard to the Kiowa Apaches, "They seem never to have been connected

with the southern division." Gunnerson concluded from linguistic evidence (p. 153) "that the Kiowa Apaches have been geographically and politically more remote from the Jicarillas than have the Lipans, and for a longer time." The relationship of the Kiowa Apaches to the Kiowas was not (p. 26) "incomparably unique." The Athapascan Sarsi had a somewhat similar relationship to the Blackfeet, and the Sumas, Janos, and others were closely associated with Apache bands of northern Mexico in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries (see Jack D. Forbes, "The Janos, Jocomes, Mansos and Sumas Indians," *New Mexico Historical Review*, 32 [October 1957]: 319-34).

Discussing the spread of Spanish horses across the plains, the author asserts (p. 46) that "instinctively, like the buffalo, the horse migrated, following the grass and the seasons." Poetic but untrue. It is well known that in open country horses, tame or wild, instinctively remain on the range where they were born. It was because of this characteristic that mustangers could run them down by riding in relays. When first pursued a wild herd might run sixty miles before turning back, but other riders could wait, confident that it would return.

Part Two, "The Indé," discusses the physical appearance and culture traits of the "Plains Apache" (Plains Athapascans would be more accurate) taken, according to the footnotes, from accounts of the Coronado expedition and from Charles F. Lummis, *Land of Poco Tiempo*, which deals with the Apaches of the deserts and mountains of southern Arizona and New Mexico, far from the Plains. The *Handbook of American Indians* states, under "Athapascan," "The tendency of members of this family to adopt the culture of neighboring peoples is so marked that it is difficult to determine and describe any distinctive Athapascan culture, or, indeed, to say whether such a culture ever existed."

"The Pueblos, an enslaved people . . ." (p. 124), is another example of inaccuracy. The Pueblos were not enslaved (some even owned slaves) however oppressive Spanish rule may have been.

It is regrettable that unnecessary errors such as the above were allowed to destroy the credibility of what might otherwise have been a respectable book.

Texas Christian University

DONALD E. WORCESTER

RED MEN AND HAT WEARERS: VIEWPOINTS IN INDIAN HISTORY. Edited by Daniel Tyler. Boulder: Pruett Publishing Company, 1976. Pp. iv, 171. Illus., index. \$5.95.

RED MEN AND HAT WEARERS is a collection of eight papers and a summary critique from a 1974 conference on Indian history held at Colorado State

University. The volume is divided into two parts: "Non-Indian Views of Indian-White Contact" and "The Indian Response." Daniel Tyler of Colorado State University edited the book.

Well over two-thirds of *Red Men and Hat Wearers* is devoted to papers by non-Indian scholars John C. Ewers, David Miller, Donald J. Berthrong, Robert L. Munkres, Joseph H. Cash and W. David Baird. These perspectives focus almost exclusively on the Native Americans of the High Plains and "the White intrusion thereon" during the nineteenth century. The six papers are arranged chronologically and treat, in pairs, Indian and White perspectives during the early, middle and reservation periods. In this order, Ewers, Berthrong and Cash summarize Indian viewpoints, while Miller, Munkres and Baird examine White attitudes and images.

For the most part, as they freely admit, the contributors cover familiar territory and make tentative generalizations. Readers acquainted with this era will find little new and nothing startling. While the papers generally are well written and well conceived, they serve primarily—to borrow Baird's use of Sam Johnson—to remind us rather than instruct us.

Tyler indicates the conference "gave more time to the Indian speakers, who not only critiqued the formal papers, but also discussed in some detail the Indian view on a number of related subjects." What remains a mystery is the limited space afforded these perspectives. In five pages, Tyler attempts to summarize the views of Dave Warren, Ruth Roessel, Allen Slickpoo, Jim Jefferson, Shirley Hill Witt and others. It would have been far better to let these people speak for themselves. The remainder of this ephemeral section is allotted to an article on Indian humor by R. David Edmunds and an exhortation by Vine Deloria, Jr., to get the writing of Indian history beyond the great battles from 1862 to 1890 and into the twentieth century.

Deloria's plea is not only an ironic footnote to the organization and emphasis of *Red Men and Hat Wearers*, but a timely reminder to all of us engaged in the field of Indian history. Historians, in Deloria's words, tend toward "a teeth-gnashing determination to concentrate on familiar topics." Most of these topics fall with stunning regularity on the other side of that continental divide of Western history: 1890. The twentieth century soon will be over; the writing of twentieth century Indian history is just beginning.

University of Wyoming

PETER IVERSON

THE RAWHIDE YEARS: A HISTORY OF THE CATTLEMEN AND THE CATTLE COUNTRY. By Glenn R. Vernam. Garden City: Doubleday & Company, Inc., 1976. Pp. xii, 227. Illus., index. \$7.95.

THIS SMALL BOOK is not bad but I do not really know why the publisher chose to bring it out in this edition. It would be a more likely seller in

paperback at the newsstand. It is a rehash of many things about the West that have been said very well by a number of authors over many years.

There are some good stories told about cowboys and the West—many of which may be classified as folklore—but few that have not been told before. Coverage on cattle and horses is pretty good but it certainly adds nothing to Dobie's earlier work and, in fact, a great deal of it is drawn from Dobie. There is material on the Pony Express and other notable rides and riders, none of which has much to do with cowboys, and there are discussions concerning cattle towns and the characters who inhabited them. In the latter category there are some errors in fact and some dubious statements. Joseph G. McCoy sent not Jesse Chisholm but a man named Sugg south to contact Texas drovers and Dodge City became a cattle market in 1875, not in 1873. And, if both the terms "red light district" and "boot hill" originated in Dodge that is news to a lot of people.

There is interesting information on saddles and accoutrements but there are good things already in print on these subjects, including a book by the same author. There are redundancies as Vernam goes back and forth between geographical settings, ethnic backgrounds, and the other kinds of things that affected the development of the American range cattle industry.

Vernam overdraws a number of generalizations and probably makes too much of the "nobility" of the cowboy and his employers. Not all Westerners were 'good guys' (Vernam even contradicts himself a couple of times) anymore than all Eastern capitalists in the cow business were merely interested in a fast buck or a land-grabbing scheme. I suppose some Western prostitutes did really have hearts of gold but *not* Rowdy Kate. Dora Hand's Dodge City funeral was big because she was a popular actress, not because she grubstaked cowboys. (She may have offered other services in Dodge City, but for pay.)

The author apparently has worked as a cowhand and a saddlemaker which gives him some valuable personal background but it has to be mostly twentieth century experience, even though his contacts at times could have been with people intimately connected with the late nineteenth century. The dust jacket points out that he was "only seven months when his family moved from Kansas to Nebraska by covered wagon"—whatever that proves.

Lastly, no matter how much an individual knows about his own West he cannot write "a history of the cattlemen and the cattle country" without including in his bibliography the basic works by people such as Joe Frantz, E. E. Dale, Robert Dykstra, Wayne Gard, Everett Dick, Lewis Atherton, Nyle Miller, Joseph Snell and, certainly, Joseph G. McCoy.

Vernam's book can be read easily and with some pleasure but it adds little to the historical literature of the American West.

Kansas State Historical Society

ROBERT W. RICHMOND

ALEXANDER BARCLAY: MOUNTAIN MAN. By George P. Hammond. Denver: Old West Publishing Company, 1976. Pp. xiv, 246. Illus., notes, app., index.

UNTIL NOW Alexander Barclay has been an obscure figure in Western history. The few who know his name associate him with Barclay's Fort, a trading post he built in 1848 at the junction of the Mountain and Cimarron branches of the Santa Fe Trail not far from Las Vegas, New Mexico. Indeed, it is some measure of Barclay's obscurity that no biography of him appeared in LeRoy Hafen's monumental ten volume series, *The Mountain Men* (1965-1972).

At first glance, then, it may seem surprising that George Hammond could locate enough information to produce this book-length biography. But Hammond has had an extraordinary advantage and opportunity. Barclay's private papers and diary have been cached at the Bancroft Library for Hammond's exclusive use and remained closed to other scholars until the publication of this volume. Many of us, then, have looked forward to the completion of Hammond's editing of the papers, hoping not only to learn more about Barclay, but to see what information Barclay might provide about the extraordinary people and places he knew.

Born in London in 1810, Alexander Barclay left home for Canada at age twenty-three to try his hand at homesteading. Three years later he saw greater opportunity in St. Louis and moved there. After two years of clerking, the footloose Barclay left St. Louis for a position as chief factor at Bent's Fort on the Arkansas. Four years at Bent's Fort served as a kind of apprenticeship for Barclay to learn about the Indian trade. By 1842 he felt ready to launch into business as an independent trader. His timing, however, was bad. The market for beaver fur had declined and the era of the Mountain Man was drawing to a close. Barclay survived by farming and trading buffalo robes. The eve of war with Mexico found him settled with other derelicts of the fur trade in the makeshift community of Hardscrabble on the Mexican side of the Arkansas. When the United States seized New Mexico in 1846 Barclay characteristically abandoned his home for opportunity elsewhere, this time buying real estate at the strategic site on the Santa Fe Trail where he would build his fort. Fortune still eluded Barclay, and he hoped to reverse his luck by selling his fort to the U.S. government.

Instead, in 1851 the Army built Fort Union seven miles away. Barclay's last big gamble had failed. The next years brought a series of setbacks, accompanied by declining health. He died in 1855.

This outline of Barclay's life emerges in large part from letters which he sent to his brother and sister in London. The letters reveal Barclay to be well educated and sensitive, and they make fine reading despite a pretentious writing style that even his brother criticized. Barclay could be philosophical ("the rustling of Autumn's fresh strewn leaves reminded me on the decay of nature, how brief, how unsubstantial our season of life," p. 15), and romantic ("I am afloat on the sea of fortune and shall start with the first favorable breeze, with my usual disregard of the whereabouts of my destination," p. 35). These letters will disappoint some historians, however. They tell a good deal about Barclay, but as Hammond notes, Barclay failed to provide "the kind of powerful description of his environment, of his daily life, and of the traders and trappers and Indians everywhere about him that only an educated man such as he could have penned so well," (p. 28).

Some historians will also be disappointed by Hammond's editing of Barclay's diary, which covers the years from 1845 to 1850 and contains the kind of mundane details that delight many social historians. But Hammond chose not to publish Barclay's letters in their entirety. Instead, he has woven extensive quotations from the letters into a narrative biography and has omitted portions of the letters that seemed unimportant or repetitious. Most scholars, then, will want to consult the manuscripts at the Bancroft Library. Many readers, however, will applaud Hammond's decision. He surmounted severe organizational problems to present Barclay's life in sensible, topical chapters, and his narrative illuminates Barclay's often vague letters and transforms them into an appealing, readable adventure story.

This is a big, beautiful book of the sort that one expects from Fred Rosenstock. Among the illustrations is a surprise: three watercolors painted by Barclay himself and apparently never before reproduced. These are a portrait of his New Mexican mistress, Teresita Suaso, a view of buffalo and another of his fort.

Southern Methodist University

DAVID J. WEBER

THE WALTER PRESCOTT WEBB MEMORIAL LECTURES: ESSAYS ON WALTER PRESCOTT WEBB. By Joe B. Frantz, W. Turrentine Jackson, W. Eugene Hollon, George Wolfskill, and Walter Rundell, Jr. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1976. Pp. xxii, 123. Notes. \$7.95.

A STRANGE thing happened on the way to the publishers in 1975: authors came bearing manuscripts about Walter Prescott Webb in such number that three books appeared the following year on this most famous of Texan-grown historians. The planners of the annual Walter Prescott Webb Memorial Lectures at the University of Texas at Arlington chose the tenth anniversary of the series to have four speakers concentrate on the man for whom the program is named. To these speeches the editors added a paper by Walter Rundell, Jr., winner of the first Webb-Smith Award for the best study on the subject of the year's lectures, and an introduction by Ray Allen Billington, to produce *Essays on Walter Prescott Webb*.

Two of the essays, those by Joe B. Frantz and Rundell, are biographical. Frantz, who knew Webb better than any historian living today, examines the background that gave rise to *Divided We Stand* (1936), a political and economic tract in which the noted scholar attempted to demonstrate how the South and West were being exploited by the North. Born of southern stock, reared in a marginally successful agricultural area, educated largely in Texas, and married to a deeply committed daughter of Dixie, Webb was a product of his cultural and environmental heredity, and through *Divided We Stand* became an evangelist for his region.

Rundell concentrates on a short but not particularly happy period of his biographee's life, the public school teaching years. Financial stress, the dullness of small-town life, and the distance of his sweetheart contributed to Webb's difficulties in those years. They were important years though; during that period he developed an interest in folklore, gave several papers, and published an article. On the basis of his achievements, the University of Texas called him back to Austin in 1918 to join the department of history.

W. Turrentine Jackson explores similarities and differences in the manner that Australians and Americans handled native populations, used labor, mined resources, developed land policy, and applied agricultural methods in advancing the frontiers in their respective nations. He also presents an excellent bibliographical note on some of the more important works dealing with the comparison of frontiers.

Using Webb's *Great Plains* as a starting point, W. Eugene Hollon takes a look at the West in the 1970s, concentrating on the region's aridity. Hollon frets about the present and the future of the area due to the shortage of water, the growth of population, and the planned industrial and mining development of that desert-like land; but like Webb, he believes that ultimately man will accept the West as it is and will adjust himself to the reality of its lack of water.

In an application of Webb's Great Frontier thesis to the field of international law, George Wolfskill maintains that that legal arrangement developed with Western man's drive for economic and social freedom growing out of the expansion of trade and commerce following the age of discovery. With the boom conditions created by the great frontier having long ended, with the influence of capitalists diminished, and with totalitarianism a force to be feared, the unifying spirit of international law is not nearly so forceful as before. Some new arrangement must be brought about to supplant it, and Wolfskill makes a call for men to cooperate now, while there is still time for a new plan.

Although not the last word on Webb, this volume and the other two recent publications on him have probably preempted the subject of this Texan, at least for awhile.

University of Texas at Austin

L. TUFFLY ELLIS

ESSAYS ON THE AMERICAN WEST, 1974-1975. Edited by Thomas G. Alexander. Provo: Brigham Young University Press, 1976. Pp. vi, 147. References. \$4.95.

THIS VOLUME, a gathering of essays from the Charles Redd Lectures at Brigham Young University during academic year 1974-75, is the sixth in the series of *Charles Redd Monographs in Western History*. Reflecting the format of the lecture series, the essays span a broad range of topics and draw from such diverse disciplines as history, sociology and literature. The essays include a study of "The Western Experience of Henry Adams" by Richard A. Bartlett, a characterization of Mormon poetess-prophetess Eliza Snow by Maureen Ursenbach Beecher, an assessment of McCarthyism in the Utah-Wyoming-Idaho-Montana region by F. Ross Peterson, a treatise on "Social Accommodation in Utah" by sociologist Clark S. Knowlton, a comparative frontier study of northern China and the West by Paul V. Hyer, and a glimpse into the "Paradox of Mormon Folklore" by an English professor, William A. Wilson.

Obviously, while "these essays deal with various aspects of Western development" and address "the diversity of Western experience" (p. 3), they focus heavily upon Mormonism and upon Utah. Three of the six papers—those on Eliza Snow, social accommodation, and Mormon folklore—seem directed not only toward L.D.S. topics, but toward L.D.S. audiences as well. Professor Hyer's study of Chinese and American frontiers, on the other hand, is devoted primarily to Mongolia. Thus regional historians will find most valuable the essays by Professors Bartlett and Peterson. In his interesting paper, Bartlett concludes that Henry Adams failed to join in

the Turnerian shift of American historiography toward frontier themes because of his own provincial and diletantish limitations. F. Ross Peterson's description of "McCarthyism in the Mountains," focusing on selected Senate races of 1950-54, is well done and insightful.

This book, in sum, will prove most rewarding to students of Mormon society and culture. Its focus is much more heavily Mormon than "Western," and perhaps this emphasis should henceforth be noted in selecting either subjects for the essays or titles for the volumes. In its physical construction, finally, the book could stand improvement. It is well bound, but its typed, narrowly spaced lines and ragged right margins detract from its appearance.

Montana State University

MICHAEL P. MALONE

COLORADO: A HISTORY OF THE CENTENNIAL STATE. By Carl Abbott. Boulder: Colorado Associated University Press, 1976. Pp. viii, 324. Illus., maps, notes, app., bibliog., index. \$9.50-text, \$12.50-trade.

THIS BOOK is one of several, single-volume histories of Colorado which have appeared during the state's centennial year. Although written as a beginning text, it seems designed for readers who seek a deeper, more interpretive knowledge of the state's past. Professor Abbott covers standard materials but focuses on selected aspects and themes as he departs from the chronologically arranged dates, events, and names one usually associates with an introductory work.

His main concerns lie with the land and how various people have treated it. Thus, he describes the parts played by boosters during the area's growth, and the conflicts between the several regional, cultural, and socio-economic groups over the ground and its use. The author manages to touch on all geographical sections, but dwells on the history along the eastern slope between Fort Collins and Pueblo.

New Mexico residents will be interested in his treatment of southern Colorado as a frontier of northern Mexico. This portion of Colorado history usually receives short shrift in works of this nature; but Abbott spends most of a chapter describing how the Hispanic culture of the area was disrupted by the Anglo entry.

Readers will find that the sections dealing with industrial warfare, attempts at municipal reform, and the early decades of the twentieth century, generally, are nicely executed. Other segments of the book are not as strong. His chapter devoted to the growth of Denver since World War II reads like a chamber of commerce tract, since he lauds the new skyline, but mentions nothing about the wanton destruction of the old

downtown. His account of contemporary racial tension, while good, impressed this reviewer as being tacked on towards the end, almost as an afterthought. It should have been included earlier in the book. Finally, he lists Jerome B. Chaffee among those who sought to prevent actual violence during Denver's City Hall War in 1894. The senator died in 1886. Such errors detract from a volume whose basic soundness is reinforced with a good choice of maps, a new selection of pictures, and a few novel insights. All of the positive features combine to form a slightly divergent account of Colorado's background which should entertain as it enlightens its readers.

Colorado State University

LISTON E. LEYENDECKER

THE PLAINS INDIANS. By Francis Haines. New York: Thomas Y. Crowell Company, 1976. Pp. x, 213. Maps, notes, bibliog., index. \$8.95.

AFTER the last Ice Age, mammoths, giant sloths and large bison inhabited the region of the Great Plains. As the climate became drier, these animals became extinct and the people who depended upon them for their food wandered off to the woodlands. By 1200 A.D., the 750,000 square mile area extending from Canada to Texas which comprises the Great Plains was unpopulated by humans although it teemed with animals. Thirty million buffalo, a smaller specie than the pre-historic animal, and small game animals, antelope, deer, and elk made the Plains a hunter's paradise. After 1200 A.D., hunters began to penetrate the Plains for meat and skins, a prelude to the migration of Indian tribes. In 1780 the Plains tribes reached their peak population of 130,000. This book traces the origins, migrations and cultural developments to about 1855 of the Plains Indian tribes, twenty-seven in total, who either lived on the Plains or immediately adjacent to that region.

Traditions of the Pawnee, who were among the earliest of the historic Plains Indians, make no mention of territorial conflicts with indigenous people as the Pawnee moved on to the Plains. In settling along the extents of the Platte and South Platte valleys, the Pawnee encountered no resistance but wars did break out as other newcomers settled into the sparsely populated region. Under pressure from Apache, Sioux, Cheyenne and Arapahoe, the Pawnee villages receded eastward until by the nineteenth century they held onto the eastern portion of the Platte Valley. The Pawnee in common with other Plains tribes in 1781 began to fall prey to the diseases brought by white men. The first great epidemic of smallpox decimated the strength of many Plains tribes. The impact, of course, fell most heavily upon those tribes in closest proximity to whites not only in 1781 but later when both smallpox and cholera swept through the villages of the Indians.

At least eight separate languages were spoken by the Indian inhabitants of the Plains. Regardless of language, all tribes shared in the distinctive cultural institutions which contribute to the commonality of the culture of the Plains region. The dependence of the Plains tribes upon the horse and buffalo, the emphasis upon war and raids for vengeance or horses, the dominance of the warrior societies and the general adoption of the Sun Dance delineate the Plains peoples from those of the mountains or woodlands. Because of the brevity of *The Plains Indians*, the full complexity of Indian society is not presented to the reader. Some of the author's generalizations should be approached with caution. While the warrior societies, for example, did control the hunts, act as tribal police and protect their villages, they did not rule the tribes. Tribal chiefs, elder patriarchs, shamans and priests all played important roles in tribal decisions in times of war and peace.

The author frankly acknowledges his reliance upon the writings of John R. Swanton, Robert H. Lowie and George H. Hyde. From those scholars, Mr. Haines draws the bulk of his data and concepts. If there is little new information in this volume why should it have been written and published?—Because Mr. Haines has presented a much more readable synthesis of scholarship than is currently available. For the intelligent lay reader or student interested in acquiring an overview of the Indians of the Plains before their culture disintegrated after the Civil War, this volume is a fine place to begin.

Purdue University

DONALD J. BERTHRONG

PUEBLO: MOUNTAIN, VILLAGE, DANCE. By Vincent Scully. New York: The Viking Press, 1972. Pp. xviii, 398. Illus., maps, notes, index. \$19.95.

OVER THE YEARS many people have written about the native peoples of the American Southwest; the subject seems to draw all manner of writers—historians, anthropologists, philosophers, artists, Native Americans alike. Now we have a book by a well known art historian and architect, a professor at Yale, who attempts to relate holistically Pueblo religion and architecture to the natural landscape in which these cultural features are portrayed.

Let the reader not misunderstand at the outset. As Scully says in his preface, the book “is intended neither as a complete history of Pueblo buildings nor as a proper anthropological exploration of the mythology and ceremonials” It is “primarily” about Pueblo architecture and dances. Why? What is the functional cultural cohesiveness in this? Can these two facets of Pueblo life (with a little Navaho and Apache thrown in) be ripped from their cultural if not their natural context and really be under-

stood? Scully proposes "only a general analysis of the form of the existing pueblos . . . and of some of their dances . . ." Why? Because he believes that "the contemporary pueblos can be best seen and valued in this way and can, in fact, hardly be understood or sympathetically appreciated otherwise." Poppycock! What about economics, grubbing in the fields with a hoe, living in a trifurcated world with all sorts of Anglos and Spanish Americans, sex, intimate personal relations, alcohol, and a host of other activities, including their world view, that shape the lives of these oldest inhabitants of the Southwest? Shouldn't they be considered to gain proper understanding? Many before Scully have tried this partial, romanticized approach and left us with but dim perceptions. When Scully writes that the dances "call up a pity and terror," not at all what Pueblo ceremonialism is designed for, the author's unintended ethnocentrism is apparent. Scully is out of his field, and fails to recognize it.

Nonetheless, this book may have appeal to some and probably should not be dismissed because it is not so objective as this reviewer would prefer. Scully divides his subject into seven chapters, the first relating to "men and nature." Following that he discusses the northern Tiwa pueblos, the Tewa, and the Río Grande Keres towns. The southern Tiwa, the Towa, the western Keres, and Zuni are lumped in one chapter. The Hopi of Arizona are considered together with the Navajo in chapter six. Finally, with no transitions or concluding remarks, he writes an epilogue about the puberty ceremony of the Mescalero Apache.

All of this seems too disjointed, superficial, and romantic, a bit too mystical. The "savage horns of power" "of the Truchas open directly on the axis of San Juan's plaza." And in the same paragraph we are in Greece comparing the Tewa to Aegean sites such as Knossos. And so it goes throughout.

The maps are poorly drawn and the photographs, some of which are out of focus, disturb the viewer by being bifurcated with broad vertical white blank lines, an artistic touch, I suppose.

For the historian and anthropologist, as well as for other serious students of the Southwest, there is little here of substance. However, a look at the historic photographs contained herein might be worth a trip to the library

Grand Canyon National Park

ROBERT C. EULER