

# New Mexico Historical Review

---

Volume 49 | Number 3

Article 5

---

7-1-1974

## Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

---

### Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 49, 3 (2021). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol49/iss3/5>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in New Mexico Historical Review by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact [amywinter@unm.edu](mailto:amywinter@unm.edu), [lsloane@salud.unm.edu](mailto:lsloane@salud.unm.edu), [sarahrk@unm.edu](mailto:sarahrk@unm.edu).

# Book Reviews

McDERMOTT, ed., <i>The Spanish in the Mississippi Valley, 1762-1804</i> , by Caughey	254
HILL, <i>Emissaries to a Revolution: Woodrow Wilson's Executive Agents in Mexico</i> , by Meyer	255
MEYER, <i>Huerta, A Political Portrait</i> , by Secrest	256
CLEAVELAND with FITZPATRICK, <i>The Morleys—Young Upstarts on the Southwest Frontier</i> , by Murphy	258
GOFF, <i>George W. P. Hunt and His Arizona</i> , by Lyon	260
FAULK, <i>Destiny Road: The Gila Trail and the Opening of the Southwest</i> , by Ellis	261
OPLER, ed., <i>Grenville Goodwin Among the Western Apache: Letters from the Field</i> , by Schroeder	262
MARQUIS, comp., and LIMBAUGH, ed., <i>Cheyenne and Sioux, The Reminiscences of Four Indians and a White Soldier</i> , by Ellis	263
GLASER, <i>Indians or Jews? An Introduction by Lynn Glaser to a Reprint of Manasseh Ben Israel's The Hope of Israel</i> , by Greenleaf	264

**THE SPANISH IN THE MISSISSIPPI VALLEY, 1762-1804.** Edited by John Francis McDermott. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1974. Pp. xiii, 421. Illus., index. \$15.00.

FOR ALMOST two hundred years New Mexico was a lonesome Spanish salient thrust far to the north. Then in the 1760's Spain took over the western two-thirds of French Louisiana and on the west coast sent a small task force to open a new frontier in California. Now on the map it appeared that New Mexico had two sister provinces, though in fact contacts with them were minimal.

Excursionists from the upper Rio Grande Valley to California in the 1770's or 1780's might have felt they were seeing their "contemporary ancestors" pioneering on that new frontier. The same excursionists to Missouri or New Orleans would have found a substantially different life style, economy, Indian policy, and function in the empire. The differences are ascribable to the legacy of people and practices from the French regime and to the defensive rôle against the British and then against the much more aggressive American nation and frontiersmen.

This volume, edited by John Francis McDermott, was generated by a conference on Spanish Louisiana. It opens with an introductory overview and three essays describing the resources in print and in the Louisiana and Mexican archives. Then follow a dozen papers on freely chosen and scattered topics, four or five of them substantially expanded beyond the versions read. Inevitably the book is a miscellany rather than a comprehensive history of Spanish Louisiana. Elements slighted include the war years, Indian relations eastward, and American penetration.

John Preston Moore writes on the gentility of Anglo-Spanish rivalry on the Florida-Louisiana border in the 1760's and Robert L. Gold on Spanish espionage in Pensacola in 1777. McDermott comes to the rescue of Fernando de Leyba, whom historians have handled roughly for his rôle in the defense of St. Louis in 1780. C. Richard Arena describes land settlement policies, which William S. Coker further elaborates in connection with the work of the Bryan Bruins, father and son, in 1787-1788. Insulated as it was from imperial rivals, New Mexico, at least at the time, had no such experiences.

Carl H. Chapman's "The Indomitable Osage" and John C. Ewer's "Symbols of Chiefly Authority" illuminate adaptations from French Indian policy, some of which came into use in New Mexican dealings with the Plains Indians. A. P. Nasatir's paper on Pedro Vial should be of interest at both ends of the Santa Fe Trail. Writing on Philip Nolan's entry into Texas in 1800, Noel M. Loomis chronicles Spanish concern not unlike that when Zebulon Montgomery Pike made his unauthorized entry into New Mexico.

John G. Clark's "The Cabildo in the Economic Development of New Orleans," Jack D. L. Holmes' "Regulation of Taverns and the Liquor Trade," and Samuel Wilson, Jr.'s "Almonester: Philanthropist and Builder," provide graphic detail on the economic and social history of the provincial capital and its vicinity.

*University of California at Los Angeles*

JOHN CAUGHEY

EMISSARIES TO A REVOLUTION: WOODROW WILSON'S EXECUTIVE AGENTS IN MEXICO. By Larry D. Hill. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1974. Pp. xii, 394. Illus., bibliog., index. \$12.95.

WOODROW WILSON's policy toward Mexico scarcely constitutes a virgin field for historical research. Arthur Link, Robert Quirk, Kenneth J. Grieb, William Teitelbaum, Peter Calvert, and Berta Ulloa have all written books developing the various aspects of the American President's Mexican policy. The periodical literature on the topic is also rich. But in spite of the respectable corpus of published literature, Larry Hill has written a valuable and original work which chronicles the activities of Wilson's series of special agents in Revolutionary Mexico.

In one sense the study is corrective as the author challenges the assumptions previously posited by other Mexican and United States diplomatic historians. Hill indicates, for example, that Grieb (*The United States and Huerta*) was in error when he argued that William Bayard Hale spoke only to enemies of Huerta and that he made policy recommendations prior to conducting his investigation. He also takes issue with Grieb on the preparedness of Californian Reginald del Valle to conduct a special mission for the President. While Grieb contends that del Valle was thoroughly familiar with Mexican politics, Hill argues that although the special agent at least spoke Spanish, he was not conversant with the nature of the Revolutionary struggle.

The major contribution of *Emissaries to a Revolution* is not, however, its occasional revisionism but rather the careful narrative exposition of the work of the special agents themselves and the impact of their reports on the formulation of the so often misguided State Department and White House policy. In addition to tracing the activities of the well-known emissaries such as Hale, del Valle, John Lind, and George Carothers, Hill also brings to light the fact-finding missions and diplomatic initiatives of some of the lesser-known agents such as Duval West, John R. Silliman, Leon Canova, and John W. Belt.

The research for this study is impressive. In addition to extensive use of the Records of the Department of State Relating to the Internal Affairs of Mexico, the author has worked the Bryan, Lansing, Pershing, Lind, and Fall Papers and, unlike many United States diplomatic historians with Mexican interests, was patient enough to gain access to Mexico's Archivo General de la Secretaría de Relaciones Exteriores. The major published documents and secondary works have been consulted as well. The narrative is well written and tightly constructed and should find a favorable audience among both United States and Mexican historians. *Emissaries to a Revolution* is diplomatic history as it should be written.

University of Arizona

MICHAEL C. MEYER

HUERTA, A POLITICAL PORTRAIT. By Michael C. Meyer. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1972. Pp. xvi, 272. Maps, app., bibliog., index. \$9.50.

BIOGRAPHIES are often written either to vilify or to glorify an individual. The interest which an author has in his subject, and certainly the time and care needed to write a good biography, entail a certain fascination with either the man and his quest—or his infamy. With *Huerta*, the intention is to better understand a man who has perhaps been overvilified.

In his treatment of Victoriano Huerta, Professor Meyer has produced a very readable account of one of the more unsavory characters in Mexican history, a man cursed and reviled by generations of his countrymen as a usurper and as the murderer of Francisco Madero. As president, (February 1913 to July 1914) Huerta lasted less than eighteen months, yet he occupies a unique, and certainly unenviable, spot in Mexican history.

The popular niche which Huerta fills would have to be compared with that of Caligula, Robespierre, or some other such personality whose brutal career reeked of treachery, cynicism, and a callous disregard for the welfare of his countrymen.

It was this popular attitude which partially prompted the book, a study which seeks to explore the man in more depth than had been undertaken in a brief but thought-provoking study published in 1960 by Richard E. Greenleaf and William L. Sherman. Meyer's book focuses on Huerta's politics and methods and this it does very well. Perhaps the most revealing chapter is the one on "The Man and the Dictatorship," though the emphasis is far more on the dictatorship than on the man himself, and this is one of the few criticisms which might be made. The author, as he clearly states, had no personal papers with which to work, but there is a dearth of analysis on the dictator himself. Even without any personal papers, a better portrait of the man might have been attempted, using contemporary sources. History, first of all, is people, and no man considers himself a villain. One thirsts for a better understanding of this very complex being. Was he indeed an amoral Borgia with a brain pickled by alcohol, or was he a hardfisted, rational schemer who really felt that his methods and leadership could best serve a nation which stood at a crossroads?

In his attempt to explain Huerta's political record the author has avoided any real criticism of either Madero or his administration. Perhaps this is to avoid a biography of Huerta at the expense of Madero, but the book fails to convey the atmosphere, the uncertainties and the rising tide of criticism against the Madero regime. Madero tried hard to be a spiritual and moral saint, but, politically, many of his notions and attributes were hardly an asset, above all in post-Díaz Mexico. And contrasting the two regimes, Meyer stresses that Huerta's government proposed more advanced and farsighted reforms than did that of Madero. But it is most likely, as the author acknowledges, that it was the prevailing current of reform which carried the regime into social legislation. It was a current which had been activated, verbally at least, during the latter years of the Díaz era. How else can one account for President Porfirio Díaz' detested vice-president, Ramón Corral, addressing a Mexico City *Indigenista* congress on the necessity of improving the lot of the poor, downtrodden Indian? Or the aging Díaz himself voicing elaborate plans for buying hacienda lands and selling parcels to the landless during the last months of the Porfiriato? These two stalwarts of the old order had

become increasingly aware of the strong undercurrent which demanded change and which gathered strength despite changing regimes and sometimes chaotic conditions.

Perhaps the book will induce some Americans to look at Huerta and his record with a more charitable attitude, but it is doubtful that Mexicans will ever see the man and his government as anything but a national tragedy. Victoriano Huerta must bear the responsibility for presiding over the murder of a political messiah. Madero's tragic death insured his martyrdom, enshrined his ideals, at least in rhetoric, and perhaps permanently blackened the reputation of the man who succeeded him in power.

Fresno, California

JAMES SECREST

THE MORLEYS—YOUNG UPSTARTS ON THE SOUTHWEST FRONTIER. By Norman Cleaveland with George Fitzpatrick. Albuquerque: Calvin Horn Publisher, Inc., 1971. Pp. xii, 270. Illus., bibliog., index. \$7.50.

FEW TOPICS in New Mexico history have received the attention devoted to land grant controversies in Colfax County during the 1870's and 1880's. Historians, both scholarly and popular, have produced a vast array of articles and books. Yet, as Norman Cleaveland demonstrates in his recent volume, controversies, inconsistencies, gaps in our knowledge of what occurred, and uncertainties of interpretation persist. Indeed, with each new book, they seem to grow.

Cleaveland's book, written with the assistance of long-time *New Mexico Magazine* editor George Fitzpatrick, focuses on his grandparents, William R. and Ada McPherson Morley. It also includes an autobiographical reminiscence describing ranch life near Magdalena at the turn of the century and a chapter on "Uncle Ray." In many ways the book updates and elaborates on material included in Agnes Morley Cleaveland's *Satan's Paradise* and *No Life for a Lady*. She was Norman Cleaveland's mother, and both volumes are quoted at length.

Morley's stay in New Mexico was brief, his importance fairly limited. He arrived in Cimarron in 1871 as an engineer and surveyor for the English Maxwell Land Grant and Railway Company. His youthful vigor and professional capacity apparently impressed the company's officials, for he eventually came to manage its local operations. Five years later, "tiring of

inactivity," Morley resigned. As an engineer for the Denver and Rio Grande Western, he participated in the dramatic battle for control of the Royal Gorge, then moved south to engineer a railway line in the Mexican state of Sonora. January 3, 1883, he died of an accidental gunshot wound near Santa Rosalía, southeast of Chihuahua City.

The bulk of this book concentrates on the five-year period during which Morley worked in Cimarron. As Cleaveland portrays it, this was an era dominated by conspiracy, deceit, and violence. As an editor of the *Cimarron News*, later the *News and Press*, Morley had his life threatened and his printing office destroyed. The highest political officials in the Territory plotted against him, his wife, even his mother-in-law. Clay Allison, described as a "jovial, hard-riding, hard-drinking, gun-toting cowman," played an important although somewhat confused rôle in these events. Governor S. B. Axtell, Stephen B. Elkins, Thomas B. Catron, O. P. McMains, Frank Springer, and other well-known New Mexicans took part either as villains or heroes.

Cleaveland's own judgments about the land grant controversy seem to be mixed. On the one hand, he sympathizes with the farmers and miners expelled from their homes or forced to pay rent for property they considered their own. The "native New Mexicans," he explains, had been "as completely enslaved as the thralls of ancient Norsemen." On the other hand, as an employee of the English company, Morley "with the enthusiasm and optimism of youth, sought to . . . collect from the squatters and miners or eject them." Instead of blaming Colfax County combatants for the injustices which occurred, Cleaveland argues that the *real* enemy was the Santa Fe Ring. He accepts without question Ralph Emerson Twitchell's conclusion that "this group found themselves the leaders in all public affairs, and were, indeed, in control of thought and sentiment throughout the entire territory." It is unfortunate that Cleaveland failed to use more recent studies or examine the Ring, its leaders, or its activities. He merely assumes that it existed and blames it for every malevolent action, thus exonerating his grandfather and other land grant employees. Such an explanation, while refreshingly simple, fails to explain the complexities of New Mexico politics and the exceedingly complicated land grant controversy.

In other respects, too, readers may be disappointed in this book. The author relies heavily on secondary sources, quoting works by Jim Berry Pearson and William Keleher, as well as Agnes Morley Cleaveland, at great length. Obscure references in quotations are seldom explained. An astonishingly large number of quotes include no citation, so the reader



cannot know the source of the material. The few Morley letters are sadly uninformative, concentrating on the weather or the scenery more than anything else. The bibliography lists a number of important manuscript collections, including the Maxwell Land Grant Company papers, but none seem to have been used. The book also depends on family tradition. References such as "Granny often told us" or "according to family tradition" occur regularly.

As usual Calvin Horn has produced a handsome book, including an excellent end-paper map, a selection of photographs, and a name index. The definitive history of the Colfax County War has yet to be written, but future historians dealing with this subject will undoubtedly give appropriate attention to the activities of William R. Morley. Their task will be somewhat facilitated by Norman Cleaveland's affectionate study of his grandparents.

*Western Illinois University*

LAWRENCE R. MURPHY

GEORGE W. P. HUNT AND HIS ARIZONA. By John S. Goff. Pasadena, Calif.: Socio Technical Publications, 1973. Pp. viii, 286. Illus., bibliog., index. \$10.00.

FOR THOSE who know the present political climate of Arizona, it is difficult to believe that the state once possessed a politician as radical as George W. P. Hunt, and a successful one at that. Hunt was elected to the governor's office more often than any other candidate in the United States, and served longer than any other statesman except Orval Faubus of Arkansas. There has long been a need for a biography of Hunt. Little has been done on twentieth-century Arizona, and certainly Hunt is a major historical character in this century. Hunt has left a considerable body of resource materials in various Arizona depositories, so he has been accessible to historians, who, however, have tended to neglect him.

The author, John Goff, is the first to publish a biography of Hunt, after a long and continuing interest in him dating from 1961 when he began organizing materials on his life. Immediately the question is raised, what does Goff make of Hunt? It is a perennial question, much discussed by the commentators on Hunt's career. Was he really radical, or conservative? Did he sell out to his enemies in the 1920's? Was he pro-labor and anti-incorporation? Was he for democracy or for G. W. P. Hunt?

The question of Hunt's consistency or opportunism is the more interesting because of his appearance: his handlebar mustache, bald pate, white suits, *and his size!* On Arizona's fiftieth anniversary of statehood, someone, also with girth, and a false handlebar, dressed up like Hunt and re-enacted the whole inaugural ceremony from the walk down the boulevard to his repetition of the inaugural address. Not many state politicians are re-created for us these days.

What was Hunt really like? He was really a combination Jeffersonian-Jacksonian. He believed fervently in states rights (from which vantage he stubbornly attacked the Boulder Canyon project) and in the people (which led him to turn the highway department into a spoils system). If you were not one hundred per cent for Hunt, then you did not deserve a state job. Hunt's problem was that he was so humanitarian, especially in the area of prison reform and abolition of the death penalty, that he was far ahead of the people. He never got along with the legislature, and his only excuse for the abuse of the patronage was to wait for the people to catch up with him. They never did, and probably never have.

Goff's book is narrative, except for a chapter on the Colorado River fight. It concentrates myopically on the Hunt sources, and lacks perspective and at times explanation of cryptic facts. Its prose is often inelegant. While this biography is certainly not magisterial, it does bring us new information and will help us to clarify the true significance of Hunt. About such a controversial figure, Goff has maintained a proper balance. Hunt did have his foibles, but Goff makes him believable, and the reader becomes sympathetic if not a partisan.

*Northern Arizona University*

WILLIAM H. LYON

**DESTINY ROAD: THE GILA TRAIL AND THE OPENING OF THE SOUTHWEST.**

By Odie B. Faulk. New York: Oxford University Press, 1973. Pp. ix, 232. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$7.50.

**DURING** the nineteenth century the Gila Trail from Texas to California was an important route that linked the Golden State to the rest of the nation. Units of the American army under Philip St. George Cooke pioneered the road while en route to California in 1846. It was a route for cattle drives to the gold fields in the 1850's and became famous during that decade as a portion of the Butterfield Overland Trail which provided mail

service and stagecoach travel between the Mississippi Valley and the Pacific coast. During the Civil War troops from California marching to the relief of New Mexico used the road which subsequently became the route for the Southern Pacific Railroad and ultimately an Interstate highway.

With some background on Indian and Spanish activity in the area, Odie Faulk narrates the story of the Gila Trail between the march of Cooke's Mormon Battalion in 1846 to the arrival of the railroad in the 1870's and 1880's. It is a somewhat loose and episodic account that is based largely upon published material. At least the manuscript sources listed do not appear to have been utilized to any great extent. Odie Faulk, who has written, co-authored or edited more than a book a year for the past five years, has written a general account of the trail in his typically readable style, but unfortunately he adds little to the history of the Southwest. This is an overview rather than a thorough and analytical history of the trail. Those familiar with the history of the region will find little that is new.

*University of New Mexico*

RICHARD N. ELLIS

GRENVILLE GOODWIN AMONG THE WESTERN APACHE: LETTERS FROM THE FIELD. Edited by Morris E. Opler. Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 1973. Pp. 103. Illus., bibliog., index. \$4.50.

THIS is a nice tribute to Grenville Goodwin in which the editor reproduces Goodwin's letters to him during the 1930's while working among the Apaches. Though Opler does not include his replies to Goodwin's letters, which would have made this volume more interesting, footnotes help to explain what led to certain exchanges on a variety of subjects.

Goodwin's published work on *The Social Organization of the Western Apache* (1942) contains considerable detail resulting from his study, including practically everything mentioned in his letters. However, the correspondence reproduced by Opler helps to portray the status of Southwestern ethnological research in the early 1930's, as well as some of the thinking that eventually was incorporated into Goodwin's posthumous publication.

*National Park Service  
Santa Fe, New Mexico*

ALBERT H. SCHROEDER

CHEYENNE AND SIOUX. THE REMINISCENCES OF FOUR INDIANS AND A WHITE SOLDIER. Compiled by Thomas B. Marquis. Edited by Ronald H. Limbaugh. Stockton, California: Pacific Center for Western Historical Studies, 1973. Pp. iv, 79. Illus., bibliog., index. \$5.50.

IN THE 1920's Thomas B. Marquis, newspaperman, doctor, and lawyer, was a government physician at the Northern Cheyenne Reservation in Montana. Intensely interested in the Plains Indians, he began to record autobiographical accounts of elderly Indian friends, publishing several in *Century Magazine* and one major account in *Wooden Leg, A Warrior Who Fought Custer*, a book that has been widely read by historians. The six narratives presented here, three by Cheyennes, one by a white soldier with the Cheyenne scouts, and one by an Oglala Sioux, were preserved by Marquis' daughters and recently made available for publication. Two of the selections were published in condensed form by Marquis in *Century Magazine*.

These narratives provide useful information on a wide variety of topics ranging from Cheyenne culture to the flight of Dull Knife's band from Indian Territory in 1879, service in the Cheyenne Scouts, the battle at Wounded Knee, and the death of Sitting Bull. Other subjects include conflicts with other tribes, reservation life, and reactions to white pressure for acculturation.

The value of these narratives is obvious at first glance because Marquis was an excellent practitioner of oral history and his informants, especially Iron Teeth, a ninety-five-year-old Northern Cheyenne woman, were competent, but they are especially valuable because of the dearth of such firsthand material. As with all source material, these accounts must be used with care and tested against other information. Because of their reliance on oral traditions Indian people have given us remarkably accurate accounts of their history, but memories do get cloudy and the sequence of events often becomes confused. Therefore it is unfortunate that the editor has not tested the reliability of these narratives and provided more elaborate annotation.

Interested readers might find it useful to compare these accounts with those collected by George Bent in *Life of George Bent Written From His Letters* or even Apache narratives that Grenville Goodwin collected in the Southwest at approximately the same time that Marquis was with the Northern Cheyennes, which were recently published in *Western Apache Raiding and Warfare*.

University of New Mexico

RICHARD N. ELLIS

INDIANS OR JEWS? AN INTRODUCTION BY LYNN GLASER TO A REPRINT OF MANASSEH BEN ISRAEL'S *THE HOPE OF ISRAEL*. Gilroy, Calif.: Roy V. Boswell, Publisher, 1973. Pp. xii, 74, pp. iv, 86. Illus., notes. \$17.50.

THIS HANDSOME volume is one of a large number of works which seek to trace the notion that the American Indians were descended from the ten lost tribes of Israel. The book is divided into two parts: an essay by Lynn Glaser tracing the origins of the legend and recounting some of the bizarre ideas and "evidence" of its veracity from the sixteenth century to the 1800's. Part Two is a reprint of a famous seventeenth-century treatise on the subject. The essay includes a survey treatment of "American Eschatology and the Mormons" which delineates some of Joseph Smith's ideas on the "Indian Jews." While Glaser's essay, some seventy-four pages, is generally interesting and informative it provides no new information to the scholar. Nor does it reflect scholarly acquaintance with the professional bibliography. A summary of Professor Seymour B. Liebman's writings on the "Indian Jews" or "Mestizo Jews" in Mexico might have enhanced the volume and if Glaser had been aware of Liebman's many writings, he might have been able to bring more professional bibliography to his task.

The main attraction of *Indians or Jews?* is Part Two, a reprint of *The Hope of Israel*. Written by Manasseh Ben Israel, a Hebrew Divine and Philosopher, an English translation published in London in 1652. Manasseh presents a seventeenth-century version of the legend that the American Indian was descended from the lost ten tribes. Ben Israel, rabbi and author, was probably born in Lisbon in 1604 and he died in Middleburg, Holland, in 1657. Though he was a learned man, his writings show that he embraced many of the superstitions of the age. Manasseh established the first Hebrew print shop in Amsterdam and corresponded widely with Jewish and non-Jewish scholars of the time before he wrote *The Hope of Israel* in 1650.

This is an attractive volume that might be of interest to buffs and to devotees of "odd ball" theories of history. The scholar will be more interested in studying the mentality of Manasseh Ben Israel.

Tulane University

RICHARD E. GREENLEAF

## NEW MEXICO HISTORICAL REVIEW

A quarterly journal for the publication of legitimate historical material of New Mexican and regional interest, including scholarly articles, documents, bibliographies, and book reviews. Geographically, the region comprises the area of the Spanish Colonial Viceroyalty of New Spain north from Mexico City. This does not exclude the publication of material deemed relevant to the general background and understanding of this region even though not dealing specifically with it.

The NEW MEXICO-HISTORICAL REVIEW is owned and published by The University of New Mexico. Manuscripts, editorial correspondence, and books for review should be addressed to The Editor, New Mexico Historical Review, The University of New Mexico, Albuquerque, New Mexico 87131.