

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 50 | Number 4

Article 7

10-1-1975

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 50, 4 (2021). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol50/iss4/7>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

- McKEE, *The Last West: A History of the Great Plains of North America*, by Richard N. Ellis. 354
- TRENNERT, JR., *Alternative to Extinction: Federal Indian Policy and the Beginnings of the Reserve System, 1845-51*, by John P. Wilson. 355
- CHAPUT, François X. *Aubry: Trader, Trailmaker and Voyageur in the Southwest, 1846-1854*, by Jack D. Rittenhouse. 357
- NICHOLSON, ed., *The Arizona of Joseph Pratt Allyn: Letters from a Pioneer Judge, Observations and travels, 1863-1866*, by Odie B. Faulk. 358
- ACUÑA, *Sonoran Strongman: Ignacio Pesqueira and His Times*, by Félix D. Almaraz, Jr. 359
- JENKINS AND SCHROEDER, *A Brief History of New Mexico*, by Ed Perkins. 360

A NOTE FROM THE BOOK REVIEW EDITOR

I have just been appointed by the editorial board to serve as book review editor, and I wish to thank Miss Eleanor Adams for arranging for the current reviews. I would like to update our list of reviewers and ask that those interested in reviewing for the NEW MEXICO HISTORICAL REVIEW submit a 4 x 6 card listing their publications and areas of interest.

RICHARD N. ELLIS

THE LAST WEST: A HISTORY OF THE GREAT PLAINS OF NORTH AMERICA.
By Russell McKee. New York: Thomas Y. Crowell Company, 1974. Pp.
viii, 312. Illus., maps, app., bibliog., index. \$8.95.

THE LAST WEST, which purports to be a history of the Great Plains region, is a popular history of that area which places greatest emphasis on the romantic and exciting aspects of the development of the Great Plains. Topics such as Spanish exploration, fur traders, Indian campaigns, and cattle trails receive adequate though selective coverage; but little attention is given to the actual settlement of the plains, and events of the twentieth century are barely mentioned. While this imbalance is one weakness, there are others of a more serious nature. The author has not attempted a piece of original research and has drawn upon the work of others, which is certainly justified in light of his purpose, but in so doing he has committed many errors. Factual mistakes are most noticeable, but there are also typographical errors as well. Material not directly related to the history of the region is too frequently included. More serious is the failure to consult key books such as Gene Gressley's *Bankers and Cattlemen*, William Goetzmann's *Exploration and Empire*, or David Emmons' *Garden in the Grassland*.

This reviewer is left with the impression that the author is not intimately familiar with either the region or its history. Those interested in the history of the Great Plains should select other general accounts of the region and might start with Walter Webb's classic, *The Great Plains*, which is still informative and provocative.

University of New Mexico

RICHARD N. ELLIS

ALTERNATIVE TO EXTINCTION: FEDERAL INDIAN POLICY AND THE BEGINNINGS OF THE RESERVE SYSTEM, 1846-51. By Robert A. Trennert, Jr. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1975. Pp. xii, 263. Notes, bibliog., index. \$15.00.

FROM the late 1820s to the Mexican War this nation tried to solve its Indian problems through removal, which simply meant a relocation of eastern tribes to west of Missouri and Arkansas. There, behind a permanent barrier to further white advances, distant and aloof from whiskey peddlers and other civilized vices, the tribesmen would assimilate civilization's virtues and eventually become integrated into American society. To achieve this end the Indian Office was reorganized in 1834 and new laws promulgated to regulate intercourse with Indians. The whiskey sellers, traders, and frontiersmen put their own interpretations to the laws, but it was the westward expansion after 1845 that reduced this removal-barrier policy to a shambles.

A new approach—Indian reservations—developed over the next six years. By concentrating the Indians into smaller areas they would not be in the way of advancing whites; so the theory ran. More importantly, through education and by teaching the former rovers to become farmers, the Indian office could promote Anglo-American values and hope for their adoption. The author sets himself to explore the roots and growth of the reservation concept and carries this off in a masterful fashion.

The logic of the times saw the Indian as the ultimate beneficiary of a reservation system, which would be his means for both surviving the encounter with civilized society and adapting to it. Within the few years from 1848 to 1851 this policy first emerged in Commissioner Medill's annual report and grew to become a basic attitude among government officials responsible for Indian affairs. The innumerable factors which influenced decisions—the debilitating effects of Indian traders and the whiskey traffic, problems of access through Indian lands, illegal white squatters on Indian lands, intertribal warfare, organizational shortcomings within the Indian department, lack of economic support—are weighed for the sake of showing why it was so difficult to achieve a workable policy. By 1851 the reservation idea remained premature with local factors dictating whether reservations would be attempted and what success they might achieve. Once the reservation philosophy did take root, the government remained committed to it until the last tribe was so confined.

One of this book's strong points is a spelling out of the values held by key groups, mostly non-Indians, in order to understand their behavior. Thus government officials viewed reservations and acculturation as the means for Indian survival. The corollary notion that Indians would willingly lay aside their old lifeways and adopt the white man's way after it had been shown to them was held by mountain man and congressman alike. This theory, almost 100 percent wrong, might lead to a great waste of effort but not to the outright raiding and warfare caused by the Texan refusal to recognize any Indian rights in land. Within New Mexico, Anglo-American confidence in the superiority of their government was thought to be so evident that the Indians would recognize it and rush in to make peace. The tribes themselves could see no reason to give up traditional life styles without being forced to do so. Indian endurance in the face of behavior so often against their interests is the more remarkable in the author's wide perspective. The consequence of conflicting values was approximately thirty-five years of Indian wars.

The first third of the book traces the growth of a reservation policy through Democratic and Whig administrations to 1851. A study of four frontier areas in detail then illustrates what problems existed and why the new program met little initial success. The situation in Texas was clouded from the start by a lack of any federal lands and by Washington's hesitation in asserting federal rights to control Indian affairs there. In the end there were no reservations in Texas. Indian policy in New Mexico remained very much in military hands, even after the Office of Indian Affairs achieved a role with the granting of territorial status in 1851. Establishment of forts in Indian lands during 1851 may mark a turning point, but Agent James S. Calhoun's early plea for confining the powerful tribes onto reservations fell on deaf ears until General Carleton made it work with the Mescalero Apache and the Navajo, in 1863-64. The Lower Missouri River tribes suffered heavily from disease and raids by more northern Indians as well as by white influences, while the 1851 Treaty of Fort Laramie at least put the horse-riding Central Plains tribes on notice as to the government's reservation mentality.

The author's fine control of source material, his great breadth of view and skill in tracing out the main course in Indian policy formation, make his book at once an intellectual treat and a key to understanding later developments that grew from the basic decision to establish Indians on reservations.

New Mexico State University

JOHN P. WILSON

FRANÇOIS X. AUBRY: TRADER, TRAILMAKER AND VOYAGEUR IN THE SOUTHWEST, 1846-1854. By Donald Chaput. Glendale, Calif.: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 1975. Pp. 249. Illus., maps, apps., bibliog., index. \$15.50.

THIS is the first book-length biography of François-Xavier Aubry dit Francouer, who was born in Quebec Province in 1824, went to Saint Louis in 1843, began in 1846 the first of many trips over the Santa Fe Trail, and took great flocks of sheep to California overland in 1852 and again in 1853. Returning to Santa Fe, he was killed in 1854 by a rising politician, Richard Hanson Weightman, during an argument. Aubry was about four months short of being thirty years old when he died, and he had spent only eight years in the Far West.

Donald Chaput, the biographer, is senior curator of history in the Natural History Museum at Los Angeles. Until now the principal information on Aubry has been the journals in Ralph P. Bieber's *Exploring Southwestern Trails* and a chapter in Joseph Tassé's hard-to-find *Les Canadiens de l'Ouest* (1878). A dozen other writers including Bundschu, Dobie, Fugate, Lockwood, Myers, Oliva, Riordan, Settle, Sulte, Taylor, Walker, and Wyman have written briefly on Aubry.

In 1848 Aubry rode a relay of horses from Santa Fe to Independence, 780 miles in five days and sixteen hours. J. Frank Dobie later wrote, "I without hesitation rank Aubry as the supreme rider in the great riding tradition of the West." Also Aubry in 1848 became rich from three trading trips; he was only twenty-four.

Chaput has done commendable research, in California at the great libraries, in the important collections at both ends of the Santa Fe Trail, and in Quebec. Thin as they are, the records left by Aubry are richer than those left by most of his associates, for he wrote a dozen brief journals that were published, wrote regularly to his mother and brothers, and was the darling of the Missouri and New Mexico press. He had boundless energy which he poured into his enterprises; there was no time for politics, feuds, women, or marriage. The only cause he espoused was his conviction that along the 35th parallel lay a feasible railroad route to the Pacific coast, a route later surveyed by Whipple. If he had any weakness, it was the defensible one that made him enjoy the publicity that followed each new record he set.

Chaput has avoided the trap that snares so many biographers: he has not aligned his own opinions according to the friends and foes of his subject. At the time of Aubry's death, writers took sides violently, but Chaput concludes impartially that "a hero was killed, by another hero. If Weightman had been killed, the same sense, if not degree, of sadness would have

followed." Richard Hanson Weightman, who had marched west with Kearny in 1846 and died in 1861 as a Confederate artillery officer at Wilson's Creek, has yet to receive an adequate biography. But that biography would be intertwined with the politics of his time and place, an aspect that would not have applied equally to Aubry.

In his eight years of adventure and enterprise, Aubry made substantial contributions: he lessened the discomforts on the Santa Fe Trail by finding the Aubry Cut-off that left the Arkansas west of Chouteau's Island; he demonstrated the feasibility of taking large flocks of sheep overland to California, although others had done it earlier on a smaller scale; he verified the possibility of a railroad route along the 35th parallel; his famous ride was a model for the Pony Express, admitted as such by the founders of that relay; and his skill as a business organizer demonstrated techniques that improved the efficiency of wagon freighting in the West.

This is a study of the man and his activities, rather than a study of his account books—if indeed such records exist. More works are needed on the economics of the Santa Fe trade, as separate studies. Meanwhile, Chaput has done a thorough work that should encourage others to write similarly on the many figures who really built the West through imagination, enterprise, and courage rather than by the gun.

University of New Mexico

JACK D. RITTENHOUSE

THE ARIZONA OF JOSEPH PRATT ALLYN: LETTERS FROM A PIONEER JUDGE, OBSERVATIONS AND TRAVELS, 1863-1866. Edited by John Nicholson. Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 1974. Pp. xviii, 284. Illus., maps, bibliog., index. \$8.50.

JOSEPH PRATT ALLYN—sickly, undereducated but traveled, barely thirty years old, wealthy, supercilious, opinionated, pompous, and politically ambitious—was a young Yankee from Connecticut who never had practiced law, but who late in 1863 came to Arizona as one of the original territorial justices of the supreme court. He secured this post through family friends and connections, making him a political carpetbagger in the truest sense; once in Arizona he wrote home about the "galoots" of the West under his pretentious pseudonym "Putnam." Editor Nicholson refers to Allyn as a "refined New England judge," but the only evidence of refinement Allyn had was his willingness to look down his nose at the people he supposedly had come to serve.

As a federal district judge, Allyn heard some cases of small importance, but unaccountably he was not present during meetings of the supreme

court while in Arizona. Thus his impact on early territorial government there was minimal, although prior to his arrival he had bragged that he would be the "brains" among these officials. During his two years in Arizona, Allyn seemed interested mainly in promoting his own political advancement, but in the fall of 1864 he was defeated in the race for territorial delegate to Congress. Later he pulled every string at his command to be named governor of Arizona; failing that, he departed Arizona for the East, his health again in delicate condition.

What remains, therefore, are his comments as a traveler in Arizona, written for the *Hartford Evening Press* and previously unavailable to researchers. These are the superficial jottings of a young Easterner who held himself above the common man on the frontier, but who gave graphic descriptions of his travels: his overland trek to Arizona in company with the first territorial officials, Prescott and vicinity, the fear of Indians in Arizona and their habits and customs, the desert country, mining in Arizona, steamboating on the Colorado, and natural wonders such as the Grand Canyon. These letters do not rank with the writings of Martha Summerhayes or of J. Ross Browne, but they do constitute a valuable source of early Arizona history. Editor Nicholson has performed his task with skill and scholarship, enhancing the value of Allyn's jottings with copious footnotes and judicious introductory paragraphs. Maps and photographs are included, making this a worthwhile addition to the literature of the territorial Southwest.

Oklahoma State University

ODIE B. FAULK

SONORAN STRONGMAN: IGNACIO PESQUEIRA AND HIS TIMES. By Rodolfo F. Acuña. Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 1974. Pp. xii, 179. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. Cloth \$10.50, Paper \$4.50.

IGNACIO PESQUEIRA dominated the ebb and flow of Sonoran history for nearly twenty years in the second half of the nineteenth century. When he assumed the gubernatorial office in 1857, after months of civil turmoil with centralist opponents, Pesqueira embodied the hopes and aspirations of his fellow citizens. In Sonora, as in other areas of the borderlands, the ideological conflict between federalists and centralists was one of method rather than goal. Unlike the southern regions, where the struggle erupted in the initial decades of Mexican nationhood, in Sonora it did not become a divisive issue until midpoint in the century.

Given the confused state of affairs in Mexico following the Texan Revolution and the War with the United States, it is understandable how

Sonorans looked for a strong leader who could safeguard territorial integrity, maintain internal security, and promote regional prosperity. As a reform leader and federalist, Don Ignacio readily accepted the difficult challenge. The degree to which he succeeded or failed, influenced by both domestic and foreign developments, is the prevailing theme in Rodolfo F. Acuña's study.

Beginning with an excellent discussion of the geographic setting, the author reconstructed the principal events in Pesqueira's stormy career from the available records in Sonora, Arizona, and California. Regrettably, owing to the destruction of the Pesqueira family papers in 1915, the governor of Sonora emerges as a nebulous personality. As reference points in the narrative, Acuña frequently compared Pesqueira to Luis Terrazas of Chihuahua and Santiago Vidaurri of Nuevo León and Coahuila. The result is that beyond describing and analyzing Ignacio's relationship with the leading power brokers in Sonora (miners, merchants, ranchers, landowners, and foreign entrepreneurs), the portrait of the caudillo remains obscure. Not by design but by the paucity of personal documents, Acuña cast the strongest light on the times and allowed heavy shadows to fall on Governor Pesqueira. The few photographs of Don Ignacio and his contemporaries partly offset this shortcoming.

On balance, *Sonoran Strongman* is an important contribution to modern borderlands history.

University of Texas at San Antonio

FELIX D. ALMARAZ, JR.

A BRIEF HISTORY OF NEW MEXICO. By Myra Ellen Jenkins and Albert H. Schroeder. Albuquerque: The University of New Mexico Press, 1974. Pp. vi, 89. Illus., maps, bibliog., index. \$1.95.

THIS brief account of the history of New Mexico is reprinted from part of Volume I of the two-volume *The Historic Preservation Program for New Mexico*, published in 1973 by the State Planning Office, and includes various illustrations originally featured in Volume II of that study.

The first section of the book is devoted to a brief discussion of the pre-history of New Mexico and includes the evolving of the varied Indian cultures up to the first coming of the Spanish in 1540. Exploration, conquest, and colonization through the period from 1540 until 1680 is briefly but accurately recounted, and some attention is devoted to the incessant quarrels and intrigues among the newcomers which contributed in large degree to the Pueblo Revolt of 1680. The increased tempo of raiding by

the nomadic Apaches as well as the Franciscan suppression of the native Pueblo mysteries are also cited as causes of revolt.

There is a brief resume of the Pueblo Revolt and the Spanish exodus from the land. The re-establishment of Spanish control and resettlement, under Vargas, introduces the period of eighteenth-century developments, traumas, and compromises. These are illustrated by the granting of haciendas and villa sites, the coping with epidemics, and the resettlement of Pueblos because of increasing raiding activities of Apaches, Navajos, and Comanches. Eighteenth-century affairs also include various ecclesiastical attention paid to New Mexico—redevelopment of missions, episcopal visitations, inspection of churches, and efforts to communicate easily with the newly founded California missions.

From 1821 to 1846, New Mexico was part of the independent country of Mexico. Changing status respecting governmental dispositions is briefly explained. The influence of the new Santa Fe Trail, linking the region by trade with the westward-looking United States of America, especially paved the way for the inevitable arrival of "Manifest Destiny." Turbulence in politics is discussed, particularly in the situations of the 1837 revolt against Governor Albino Pérez and the Departmental Plan, and the "take-over" by former Governor Manuel Armijo.

The invasion of New Mexico by Brigadier General Stephen Watts Kearny ended the period of Mexican government and resulted in New Mexico's becoming a territory of the United States. The expeditions of Colonel Alexander W. Doniphan, both among the Navajos and southward to Chihuahua, are mentioned, and somewhat more space is given to the so-called Taos Revolt of January 19, 1847, in which Governor Charles Bent was killed, along with other Anglo-Americans.

The 1850s are briefly recounted. This section mostly involves new settlers and forts built in a somewhat vain attempt to control the raiding Indians.

Secession of the Southern states brought the invasion of Confederate troops (Texans!). Discussed are the battle at Valverde and Glorieta, as well as the battle at Peralta. The arrival, in August 1862, of General James H. Carleton laid the foundation for the general roundup of the Navajo, as well as some of the Apaches, and their incarceration from 1864 until 1868 at the Bosque Redondo, near Fort Sumner on the Pecos River.

By the 1880s, the vastly lucrative livestock industry brought both newcomers and new capital into the region, especially to the eastern plains. Mines were being exploited and railroads were expanding. Agricultural experiments, made possible by artesian water basins and reclamation projects, added to the growth of the territory.

A brief but well-explained section on the exploitation of the public domain covers the philosophies of both the Spanish and the United States cultures respecting land ownership. The growth of mining areas as well as the increase in commerce continued to add to the economic growth of the area.

The latter section of the book involves the changing scene as New Mexico passed from territorial status into statehood on January 6, 1912. Discussions cover such diverse influences as the arrival of various new groups of settlers, educational development, architectural influences, the contributions of tourism, varied politics, changes in county boundaries, and the traumas created by World Wars I and II.

There is an excellent selected bibliography and a well-developed index.

The entire book is well and logically developed and demonstrates the fine scholarship for which both Dr. Jenkins and Dr. Schroeder are so well known and esteemed. All in all, it is a most useful account.

Highland High School
Albuquerque, New Mexico

ED PERKINS