

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 53 | Number 3

Article 7

7-1-1978

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 53, 3 (2021). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol53/iss3/7>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

IN RED MAN'S LAND: A STUDY OF THE AMERICAN INDIAN. By Francis E. Leupp. Introduction by Theodore Frisbee. Glorieta: Rio Grande Press, 1976 (1914). Pp. xv, 161. Illus., bibliog.

In 1914, four years after writing *The Indian and His Problem*, former Commissioner of Indian Affairs Francis Ellington Leupp published this slender companion volume, which in content bears considerable similarity to the first. Despite this fact, however, this attractive reprint edition, produced as one of the Rio Grande Classics, is "timely in intent if not chronology." Initially written by Leupp as part of an interdenominational mission home study course, the reprint edition boasts a new preface and introduction. Photographic reproductions of western scenes painted by D. J. Mills add esthetic value to the book. Although there is duplication of material as Leupp himself admits, this volume and his previous book supplement each other—one presenting the civic, the other the human aspects of the Indian.

As Indian commissioner, Francis Ellington Leupp was a man ahead of the times, a reformer and bureaucrat who attempted to treat the Indian as a human being rather than as a barbarian who should be transformed into a white man. In the new introduction, Theodore Frisbee's analysis of Leupp's contributions agree with the findings of other historians concerning this farsightedness, namely, that the commissioner's ideas foreshadowed the Indian policy advocated as a result of the Merriam Commission investigation in 1928. Leupp's policies in dealing with the Indians, his emphasis on equality through health and education, and the preservation of their culture (all of which he touches upon in this book), were supported by the findings of the Merriam Commission.

Professor Frisbee could have added that many of Leupp's policies were implemented during the Collier era and earned for that individual much acclaim as a reformer and visionary—praise that more appropriately might have been shared by Francis E. Leupp; however, the public was not receptive to such ideas in the first decade of the twentieth century. The major difference, according to Frisbee, was that Leupp like others of the time believed that assimilation rather than cultural pluralism was the answer. Yet, there is room for doubt that Leupp believed in total assimilation, if one considers his efforts to allow the Indians to retain their true names, their traditional costumes, and their mobile homestyle,

which easily permitted them to move to cleaner living quarters and where ventilation provided less chance of disease such as tuberculosis. He also supported the preservation of Indian dancing and ritual as an integral part of their religion. Thus in action, if not in label, Leupp believed in cultural pluralism.

The Commissioner's reforming bent is particularly apparent in the second chapter dealing with the Indian and the government, the travesties of justice called "treaties" and after 1871, the "agreements" which took their place. He noted what he called "the absurd patchwork of law" which was in force long after the need for it had expired, and even then he urged revision of existing statutes pertaining to the American Indian. He classified the failure of the establishment of the Indian territory as a place for self-rule as an experience on the side of "excessive liberty," while the reservation he felt was one of "excessive paternalism."

Leupp's empathy for the situation of Indians as wards of the government is further apparent as he explains how in the guise of guardianship, the government took possession of their estate, cut off their wild game supply as a civilizing ploy, thereby forcing them to accept charity to survive. According to Leupp, none of the government's designs, however veiled with benevolence, was carried out without vigorous resistance on the part of the wards, and the expenditure of many lives and much money. He declared that the government, as if to salve its conscience, established a system of schools where coming generations of Indians could be taught to cope with "the master race which had overcome their fathers."

Leupp concludes with an interesting chapter on "aborigines who are not Red Men," the Eskimo, and finally awards kudos to various denominational mission groups for their contributions to the Indian which, more than likely, was a result of the fact that the book was published as part of a mission home study course rather than strong feeling, considering that he did not treat missionaries so kindly in his previous work.

By reprinting this volume containing the views of Commissioner Francis Ellington Leupp, the Rio Grande Press is to be commended for once again making available in handsome format information that will be of interest to scholars in the fields of anthropology, history, and ethnohistory.

The University of Texas at El Paso

NECAH STEWART FURMAN

MIMBRES PAINTED POTTERY. By J. J. Brody. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1977. Pp. xxiii, 253. Illus., notes, index. \$22.50.

IT IS NOT TO SAY that the author pulled a brodie in creating this fine first volume for the School of American Research, Southwestern Indian Art Series, by introducing his study with the following statement: "There is much here that I am not satisfied with. I am uncomfortable with the time frames, not at all confident about explanations of historical events and relationships, and I believe that I have only begun to explore iconography" (p. xxii). This self criticism reflects not only the author's express feelings toward his own work, but the actual state of

confused and contradictory data that appertain to the field of Mogollon-Mimbres archaeology.

The tome is beautifully illustrated, containing some 182 black-and-white halftones of Mimbres and related ceramic folk art, many of which have not been published before, as well as 16 color plates, 2 tables, and 2 maps. In these, there is some unfortunate mixing of captions and illustrations, as witness Plates 4 and 9, and the absence of a Basketmaker III period in his Anasazi temporal sequence (Fig. 8), wherein he correlates variously published chronologies of Mogollon "time plans" along with those of the Hohokam, Anasazi, and Casas Grandes cultures.

The author composes his very apt study of Mimbres folk art in the following manner: In his introduction (pp. 1-5), he lays the groundwork of purpose in presenting to his audience the meaning and worth of this ceramic art form. He does not exhaust the subject, but competently gives the reader a review of the archaeological activities that led to the modern commercial exploitative discovery of Mimbres art (pp. 5-23). With this "donor" value approach to the subject, he then describes the physical environment in the Mimbres archaeological zone as it may have existed during the time when these native Americans actually created their art form (pp. 25-35). Then, using the Swarts Ruin as an apex, he describes his view of the socio-economic history of these indigenous Mimbresños in both time and space (pp. 37-75) and presents current archaeological interpretation of indigenous development and various donor pottery art influences, from the time of its known beginnings to the time of its "classic" development (pp. 77-114).

The definition of various ceramic types in the archaeological literature is very confusing. For example, the vessel depicted as Three Circle Red-on-white in Plate 3, with its curvilinear design, could also be identified as Mangas Black-on-white from Haury's original description (1936:24). It is extremely important that curvilinear scrolls and wavy hatched designs one day be precisely placed in time in the Mogollon ceramic art sequence. At the moment, it remains a point of confusion, and as a consequence, such related art styles as those developed in the Dragoon, San Simon, and Casas Grandes areas cannot be temporally compared to those of the Mogollon-Mimbres sequence. Nor can these be properly compared with Anasazi, Hohokam, or Chupicuaro (Guanajuato, Mexico) art designs. Certainly, new archaeological data will be needed before one can answer the questions involving the complicated, but related, patterns of regional ceramic design exchange.

In describing the social situation in which the Mimbres potters worked (pp. 115-29), the author enters the field of highly individualized conjecture based on what these prehistoric native American artists consciously or unconsciously portrayed. Perhaps the author's most creditable contribution lies in his original analysis of Mimbres Black-on-white art (pp. 131-56) as indicators of the various artistic social constraints placed upon the Mimbresño artist. This approach is used in his study of both geometric and representational art patterns (pp. 157-210), but he commendably uses a great many hitherto unreported vessels which took considerable effort to gather into a single study.

The subject of religious iconography is broached, but not elaborated upon,

despite its intriguing potential. In his final chapter (pp. 211-27), the author addresses himself to this possibility of iconographic studies in terms of ethnoaesthetic considerations as revealed in Mimbres art, and appropriately warns students to beware of any temporal transposition of religious metaphors from one group to another without sound evidence.

All in all, Dr. Brody has brought together a great many details concerning a currently popular subject, in terms of the available archaeological data, and interprets these with his particular art historian's expertise, thus making the volume a fresh and worthwhile study meritorious of space on one's bookshelves.

The Amerind Foundation, Inc.

CHARLES C. DI PESO

THE ZUNIS OF CIBOLA. By C. Gregory Crampton. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1978. Pp. 201. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$15.00.

UTILIZING A TOPICAL FORMAT, C. Gregory Crampton's *The Zunis of Cibola* attempts a historical portrayal of these western New Mexico Pueblo Indians during the period from about 1300 to 1890. Crampton successively discusses, for example, the Zunis' pre-Columbian past, the Spanish *entrada*, their participation in the Pueblo Revolt, their life under Mexican rule, and later relations with the newly arrived Anglo. There is also a short examination of Zuni efforts to maintain their cultural integrity in the face of Anglo-American societal and technological value systems. All of these topics could have been expanded upon.

Readers, for example, will want to know far less about the geological setting of the region inhabited by the Zunis and far more about their origins and the inception of agriculture as discovered and practiced by these Indians and its subsequent development. A thorough consideration of meteorological cycles and their effect on such sedentary efforts, as well as social, religious, political and cultural evolution, is also needed. There is lacking a comprehensive survey of the archaeological setting wherein maps and additional photographs of the known ancient sites should have been provided. Furthermore, such matters as the Zuni system of alliances—with special attention focused upon their attempts at effecting an Anglo alliance against the Navajos—and these Indians' endeavors to ward off Anglo encroachments on their land and water rights should have received expanded coverage. Finally, considering his stature as an ethnologist, as well as the services he rendered to the Zuni people, the treatment accorded Frank Hamilton Cushing should have been more extensive.

As such, it is unfortunate that the title of Crampton's book promises more than what the work actually delivers. For one thing, the volume is both too brief and overly generalized. Yet the greatest difficulty with this piece is that not much which is new is learned about the Zunis. In this respect, a paramount defect is that not only are these Indians not depicted as active participants in the vital drama which is Zuni life as it unfolds upon the stage of history, but also the Zunis are not seen or understood through their own eyes as is ably done, for example, in Cushing's *Zuni Breadstuff*. Rather, the Zuni people are seen as passive and successively acted upon by Spanish, Mexican, and Anglo-American intruders. Even here the discussion is not as strong as it could be.

Such problems are magnified as a result of Crampton's research technique and utilization of sources. In actuality, *The Zunis of Cibola* is a succinct synthesis and summary of the available printed primary sources which are pertinent to the topic, as well as having a heavy reliance on secondary materials. Far greater use should have been made of Zuni oral tradition. With good effect, Crampton could have conducted on a large scale oral history interviews among the Zuni people. Although he makes several minor references to such in his footnotes, one wonders why Crampton did not make adequate use of the appropriate Bureau of Indian Affairs documentation available in the National Archives. Had Crampton incorporated these materials, as well as a plethora of extant manuscript sources, into his text he would not have had to attempt, for example, to condense Zuni history since 1890 into less than eight pages, which task is impossible in any event.

Fortunately, Crampton's style is both engaging and literate. His footnotes and bibliography are useful in that they enable the general reader to get at the specific literature in the field. Included are 28 photographs which illustrate both the pueblo and Zuni personages. Still, Crampton's work is less than what it could have been.

Albuquerque, New Mexico

JOHN ANTHONY TURCHENESKE, JR.

RULES AND PRECEPTS OF THE JESUIT MISSIONS OF NORTHWESTERN NEW SPAIN. By Charles Polzer. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1976. Pp. x, 141. Illus., maps, bibliog., index. \$8.50.

ACCORDING TO THE AUTHOR "the object of the present study is to review the inner workings of the missions as a system, to describe and evaluate the more important methods employed by the missionaries, and to demonstrate the evolving complexity of the institutional mission" (p. 3).

This small volume is divided into two parts: I Interpretation; II Rules and Precepts for the Mission Rectorate of San Francisco Borja, Sonora, Mexico. This part is a translation of regulations issued by various Jesuit superiors concerning the conduct of the Jesuit missions in northwest Mexico from 1610 to 1763. Part I (pp. 1-58) seems intended as a background for Part II (pp. 59-125) with its translation of the rules and precepts. It contains definitions of terms found in Part II: mission, partido, cabecera, rectorado, visitas as well as a discussion of perfect obedience, because "what the rules demanded was most probably what the men actually did" (p. 14). This wholly *a priori* judgment seems to be necessary to justify Part II: Rules and Precepts. Yet later on, the author admits that the rules were modified because the men either could not or would not obey them. Thus, "the missionaries had been complaining that the existing code (that of 1610) was *filled* (italics mine) with too many unattainable rules" (p. 17). So a new code was issued in 1662. But, "the missionaries only had more rules to follow after 1662, and many of them were even *less* (italics mine) attainable than some in the 1610 code" (p. 19).

Yet, the author (pp. 39-58) writes a chapter on Jesuit Mission Methodology based largely on such, more or less, unattainable rules. The effect is to cloak the

Jesuit effort in an aura of perfection engendered by the idealistic, unattainable, rules and precepts. To reinforce this impression the author selects the testimony (pp. 56, 57) of a newly arrived *Europeo cerrado* bishop less than six months in his new diocese, Pedro Tapiz (the author spells it Tapis but the bishop writes Tapiz). While in Mexico City, Tapiz had spurned the well-known skills of the Mexican iron workers and occasioned many raised eyebrows there by ordering all iron adornments of his new cathedral of Durango from Seville (José Ignacio Gallegos, *Historia de la iglesia en Durango* [Mexico City, 1969], pp. 221-24). So now, he praises the work of the largely European Jesuits and downgrades that of the Mexican Franciscans, especially their lack of language skills—a part of the pattern?

One wonders why the author relies so heavily on suspect sources such as the Rules and Precepts, the testimony of an apparently thoroughly *gachupín* bishop and does not use the reliable reports from the field of the Jesuit Visitors. I have some and I must presume that the author has access to more. They are factual, precise and informative. However, they tend to differ from the picture created by the Rules and Precepts and Bishop Tapiz. Thus, Jesús Manuel Aguirre, vice-provincial for the Sonora missions and himself an experienced missionary, in reporting on the native language skills of nineteen Jesuit missionaries, whom he had tested personally, reported to the Mexican Provincial, Francisco Ceballos (Bacadéhuachi, February 18, 1764) that twelve did not know the native language well enough to preach, he was doubtful about two, and only five, including himself, did know the language. He singles out Carlos Roxas, missionary at Arizpe. He had come to Arizpe when 25 years old, had now been there nearly 40 years, yet could not preach to his Opatas in their language. Is this a typical report? I do not know but the author should.

Finally, it is surprising that the author does not mention the royal decree of July 13, 1573, which outlawed the expansion of the frontier through the armed *conquista* and the granting of new *encomiendas*. Instead, the king substituted the *conquista pacífica*: priest, miner, rancher, trader and so on. In other words, in the very year in which the Jesuits began to work in Mexico after their unfortunate experience in Florida, 1573, the rules for the conversion of the frontier were changed. For the Jesuits, this was an opportunity. Newly arrived, with fresh perspectives, and, as yet, without substantial commitment of their personnel, the Jesuits were free to assess the new problems posed by the conversion of the rim of Christendom, as Bolton so aptly named this area (in 1662, there were only 45,129 Indians in all the Jesuit Mexican missions, [p. 18] compared to the many millions still cared for by the older religious orders [1523-1573] in the Mexican heartland).

It is to the glory of the Jesuits that they did find a method which enabled them to work effectively under the new rules of 1573. Later on, the Franciscans through their Mission Colleges would join them in this work. Certainly, the Jesuits pioneered the method. Unfortunately, this volume does not tell us how they did so.