

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 46 | Number 2

Article 4

4-1-1971

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 46, 2 (2021). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol46/iss2/4>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

- LANGE and RILEY, eds., *The Southwestern Journals of Adolph Bandelier, 1883-1884*, by Chavez 162
- STRATTON, *The Territorial Press of New Mexico 1834-1912*, by Cox 163
- MYRICK, *New Mexico's Railroads: An Historical Survey*, by Greever 164
- DENHARDT, *The King Ranch Quarter Horses*, by Simmons 165
- KRENKEL, ed., *The Life and Times of Joseph Fish, Mormon Pioneer*, by Smith 167
- SMITH, *Emilio Kosterlitsky: Eagle of Sonora and the Southwest Border*, by Meyer 168
- ELLIS, *General Pope and U. S. Indian Policy*, by Utley 169
- LIVINGSTON-LITTLE, ed., *The Mexican War Diary of Thomas D. Tennery*, by Hinton 171
- FONER, *The United States Soldier between Two Wars: Army Life and Reforms, 1865-1898*, by Reese 172
- HERNER, *The Arizona Rough Riders*, by Lyon 174

THE SOUTHWESTERN JOURNALS OF ADOLPH BANDELIER, 1883-1884. Edited and annotated by Charles H. Lange and Carroll L. Riley. Albuquerque: The University of New Mexico Press, 1970. Pp. xviii, 528. Photos, maps, drawings, bibliog., index. \$20.00.

SOME FEW YEARS AGO, the first volume of Bandelier's Journals (1880-1882) came forth from the same press, and this writer had the double pleasure of reviewing the book in this publication and thereby acquiring a copy. The story is repeated now, after constant editorial egging, not that a copy of this precious second volume was not greatly coveted, but chiefly because it is so difficult for a person to repeat himself. One is tempted to quote at great length from the previous review (NMHR, vol. 41 [Oct. 1966], pp. 328-29), a course which would rightly be judged pompous, to say the least. Suffice it to say now, at the start, that the same unstinted general praise and the same minor criticisms hold. The work entailed in deciphering grand old Bandelier's scribbling, and then of sifting the priceless ore, must have been as painstaking as the result is successful and most praiseworthy. For this is one of the few basically important contributions being made today to the fund of archaeological and historical knowledge about our region.

In this particular period, Bandelier wandered far away from the northern Rio Grande country into central and southwestern New Mexico, southern Arizona, and northern Mexico, but there is still plenty about this northern area. His investigations in those other places are no less valuable to the general investigator in archaeology and related sciences. A brief but excellent introduction by the authors prepares the reader for these excursions, while summarizing what is necessary of Bandelier's long biography given in the first volume. In their notes, which take up eighty-five pages, they render a most valuable service in identifying the scores of places and persons mentioned in passing by Bandelier; otherwise the Journals would have little meaning to many a reader. His was the day when many individuals, now pioneers of more or less importance, were "going West" or had been here for some time; not a few interested people will be grateful for the further research done in identifying such persons at some length. Yet here there are some omissions which could have been easily supplied; for example, Padre Ramón Ortiz gets one tiny reference from Defouri when the familiar NMHR carries a long biography of the man (vol. 25 [Oct. 1950], pp. 265-95). Then, the glossary of Spanish Southwestern terms is something awful, as in the first volume. This minor carping might be called picayune, but what is science of any kind for, if not to get at the truth even in small things. Anyway, this is a most valuable and welcome book both on account of the Journals themselves and the arduous labor of the editors.

Peña Blanca, N.M.

FRAY ANGELICO CHAVEZ

THE TERRITORIAL PRESS OF NEW MEXICO 1834-1912. By Porter A. Stratton. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1969. Map, bibliog., index. Pp. v, 305. \$15.00.

DR. STRATTON, in this recently published work, has attempted to place under one cover a complete bibliography of New Mexico's Territorial newspapers and also a description of the Territorial press. For the first time researchers can consult a single work and find some hint as to the location of both important and remote newspapers. The book jacket modestly states, "His investigations took him to two-thirds of the county courthouses in New Mexico to examine old files and more than 20,000 notes were gathered." Thus the bibliography is excellent and will aid tremendously anyone dealing in the Territorial history of New Mexico. Unfortunately the author did not consult sources outside of the state and therefore the bibliography is not complete. It will still be necessary for researchers to crisscross the country either by mail or in person in an effort to find the location of missing copies of various New Mexico newspapers.

The role of the newspaper in the history of New Mexico is well described in the text of Dr. Stratton's work. He has attempted to show the influence of newspapers and newspaper editors on the changing scene of Territorial New Mexico. The author sees the press involved in four different phases of life in New Mexico; political, social, economic, and law enforcement.

Using each of these themes, Stratton demonstrates how the news media and its editors helped to shape the end result. It is here that the author makes a large contribution to history. He uses material from editorials and feature articles which show the different positions taken by early journalists on each of the above themes.

The chapter dealing with the role of the press in New Mexico's conflicting cultures is interesting and shows the numerous biases held by Anglo newsmen. By using quotations the author is able to show the strong feelings of the new residents of New Mexico, but he fails to show the feelings of the older residents, the Hispano and the Indian. Only by using the Catholic press does Stratton attempt to demonstrate the biases of these two important groups. It is possible that better insight could have been gained if the author had made more extensive use of the Spanish language newspapers published before the American occupation such as *El Payo de Nuevo Mexico* and *La Verdad*. *La Voz del Pueblo*, perhaps the most important Spanish language paper and voice of the White Cap movement in New Mexico, is not discussed adequately. Failure to give credit to this important Hispano newspaper is one of the few shortcomings of Stratton's work.

Another weakness in *Territorial Newspapers* is what seems to me to be a rather weak interpretation of political events of the 1870's and 1880's, both locally and on the national scene. Stratton begins Chapter IV with the

following, "Politics, national or territorial, from 1870 to 1900 was rather meaningless, with little real difference in the policies of the two national parties." While there may have been little difference between the two major parties, the era of the Populists was certainly of great importance both nationally and at home in New Mexico. In fact citizens of the State of New Mexico are living today with many of the problems created by the politics of the 1870's and 1880's.

Another point which bothers this reader is the continual reference to New Mexico's lack of educational tradition during the Mexican and Territorial periods. There is ample evidence in the Mexican Archives of New Mexico to suggest that there were numerous public schools in the Santa Fe and Santa Cruz de La Cañada regions before 1835. After the United States occupied the territory, there was an increase of the number of schools in New Mexico. This is shown by the number of Midwesterners who came to New Mexico to teach, such as A. A. Jones who was first employed in the Las Vegas schools in 1889.

Apart from the author's tendency to be redundant, as on page forty, and the few typographical errors which mar the otherwise attractive layout, the book is well written and nicely put together. *The Territorial Press of New Mexico*, though expensive, is a must for every research library and for any historian attempting to research the history of Territorial New Mexico.

State of New Mexico Records Center

MICHAEL COX

NEW MEXICO'S RAILROADS: AN HISTORICAL SURVEY. By David F. Myrick. Golden, Colorado: Colorado Railroad Museum, 1970. Pp. 206. Illus., maps, index. Paper \$4.95. Cloth \$7.95.

THIS IS HALF a picture book and half a historical narrative. Mr. Myrick, well qualified for his task by his earlier two-volume *Railroads of Nevada and Eastern California*, has exhaustively searched numerous collections and found an excellent series of photographs to reproduce. These include engines, cars, trains, depots, yards, roundhouses, bridges and wrecks. In the background are mountains, forests, towns, lumber mills, mines and grazing land. From an artistic standpoint the most impressive is a two-page spread showing almost the entire village of Lake Valley, with a four-car train dwarfed in the background by the high butte. One of the best action shots shows the *Golden State* thundering out of Tucumcari in 1940 behind handsome engine SP 4386. There are other volumes of railroad pictures that are the equal of this book in variety, vividness and quality of reproduction, but it would be hard to name one that is better. The one main and four supplementary maps make in three pages the geography quite clear.

About four-sevenths of the text is devoted to the major railroads—the Santa Fe, Rock Island, Southern Pacific, Rio Grande and Colorado and Southern. The rest covers the independent coal lines, lumber spurs, mine haulers and even the street cars of Las Vegas, Albuquerque and El Paso. The text is well-organized, clearly expressed and thorough. After I had finished reading it, I would have been less human if I had not compared it with my article on "Railway Development in the Southwest" in the *New Mexico Historical Review* for April 1957 (pages 151-203). Naturally the basic facts are to be found in both and each covers some matters omitted in the other. It seems to me that the article gives more attention to placing the large railroads in their national setting and the book is more thorough in its coverage of the local independent lines.

Four-fifths of New Mexico's railroad mileage was built in two periods: 1878-1882 and 1898-1910. The main lines are still basic to handling of state and national traffic, but many of the industrial railroads have finished serving once-productive mineral and timber areas and been abandoned. These topics are well covered in the text and are adorned by a splendid selection of pictures.

University of Idaho

WILLIAM S. GREEVER

THE KING RANCH QUARTER HORSES. By Robert Moorman Denhardt. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1970. Pp. xiv, 256. Illus., map, apps., bibliog., index. \$9.95.

THE REMARKABLE KING RANCH stands as the largest enterprise of its kind in the world with divisions scattered across the United States, and in Australia, Brazil, Argentina, and Venezuela. Founded in 1854 on Santa Gertrudis Creek in South Texas by Captain Richard King, this ranch and its famous Running W brand loom large in the history of the range cattle industry. In the twentieth century under direction of King's descendants, the Klebergs, this ranch developed the first new breed of cattle in America, the Santa Gertrudis, and its own special strain of American Quarter Horses. It is the story of these horses which engages the attention of Robert Moorman Denhardt.

All King Ranch Quarter Horses now trace both their top and bottom lines back to a single foundation stallion, known simply as the Old Sorrel, foaled in 1915. This animal possessed the temperament, conformation, and cow sense desired by the ranch for its working stock and was sufficiently prepotent to pass on these characteristics to its offspring. By breeding the Old Sorrel to a superior band of Quarter mares, in which could be found

some thoroughbred blood, a firm base for the King Ranch strain of horses was established. Today there are some two thousand horses in the ranch's breeding program. Most are used to work cattle and only a few go to a yearly sale.

After fifty years of selective breeding in a single strain, the King Ranch Quarter Horses are now all very close-bred. One stallion, Wimpy, currently used, is a double grandson of the Old Sorrel and is mated to Old Sorrel mares. The author refers to this practice as "a fair amount of inbreeding," but assures the reader that occasional use of outcross mares provides a safety factor preventing defects. This reviewer is not convinced. Nowhere is there mention of the fact, well-known to South Texas horsemen, that an inordinately large number of King Ranch horses toe out on the left front foot. While a toe out doesn't necessarily render an animal unsound, it must be considered a defect in horses that bring several thousand dollars in the sale ring.

The book is divided into several sections. Part I presents a rather superficial history of the King Ranch, its people, and its horses. This is acceptable since Tom Lea covered the subject in his definitive *The King Ranch*, published in 1957. Part II examines the origin of the ranch's Quarter Horses and the operation of its controlled breeding program, while Part III describes some of the more famous horses in the line and tells of the men who trained and showed them. Lengthy appendices trace pedigrees and provide a variety of statistical charts related to the business side of horse raising.

What does emerge, if one reads between the lines, is a gray picture of the ranch owners breeding horses with the same grim seriousness that attends all their business activity. The impression created, unintentionally no doubt, is that to be a part of the King Ranch today, whether employee or member of the ruling Kleberg clan, means one must always sacrifice personal interest to the welfare of the ranch, since to do otherwise would represent disloyalty. No trace seems to remain of the spontaneity and sense of adventure which characterized the lives of Texas ranchmen a century ago. The inbred, "hot-house" Quarter Horses of the King Ranch may be among the best, as the author claims, but before this reviewer would concede that point, he would like to see them working cattle matched against the wiry, range-bred horses of the Four Sixes Ranch, another of the Texas giants.

Denhardt's style is pedestrian and his prose cliché-ridden. In spite of these faults and his lack of objectivity, he has performed a useful service in describing in detail the history and procedures of one of the oldest Quarter Horse breeding programs in the West.

Cerrillos, N.M.

MARC SIMMONS

THE LIFE AND TIMES OF JOSEPH FISH, MORMON PIONEER. Edited by John H. Krenkel. Danville, Illinois: The Interstate Printers & Publishers, Inc., 1970. Pp. x, 543. Illus., maps, and index. \$7.00.

MR. JOHN H. KRENKEL is to be commended for seeing that *The Life and Times of Joseph Fish, Mormon Pioneer* is now in print. This fascinating account by a minor official in the Mormon colonization mainstream in Utah and Arizona spans four generations (1840-1926) and serves as a kind of chronological time line against which a multitude of people and themes in western history bounced briefly. The reader is shown glimpses of life in Nauvoo, the migration to Utah, pioneering to Parowan, where Fish reached his maturity in a new colony faced with the uncertainties of isolation, Indian attacks, pioneer medicine, and Gentile opposition in nearby Beaver. Fish married his first two wives, Mary and Eliza, while there.

Having never recovered economically from the loss of a team and a few cattle to the Indians, Fish, in 1878, moved to the Little Colorado River in Arizona. Here he suffered famine, flood, pestilence and polygamy raids. Then husband of two wives, having married a third, Adelaide, after his first one died, Fish farmed his families out on scabble acres while he sought work elsewhere. Ironically, his limited cash income frequently was spent running from the "feds." Even so, Fish took a fourth wife, Julia. Subsequent harassment drove him into old Mexico, yet within a year he returned to Arizona and again re-established his transient family on the Little Colorado.

The economic distress of the 1890's deluded him into a second try in Mexico, but within months he returned first to the Gila River near Thatcher, then to the Little Colorado settlements a few years later. In 1916 Fish moved back to Utah, hoping to publish his "History of Arizona." At seventy-six he staked a claim on land in Delta, wintered near Beaver, before finally settling in Enterprise, Utah. At seventy-nine, Fish built his last home himself. He died December 10, 1926 in his eighty-seventh year, attended by his two wives, Eliza and Julia.

The life of Joseph Fish is unusual, because it spanned from pioneer oxcart to modern automobile, and because his record reviews so much history involving so many people in Utah and Arizona. His life demonstrates the economic determinism of transient, pioneer living. This man built irrigation ditches, surveyed townsites, and established the Arizona Co-operative Mercantile Association. Though hunted and arrested as a polygamist, still he served as a Territorial legislator, as Postmaster, and as a Justice of the Peace. Always active as a lesser church officer, he reports, with a kind of blunt honesty, both the church's problems and successes.

Fish is most of all a man of duty. Though dedicated to his several families, they often came second or later. His wife, Adelaide, finally divorced him. One's picture of his family life is limited and rarely intimate. His record tends to reflect his constant role as official record keeper. Nevertheless, one does not read this book without a haunting insight into the hardships he, his family, and people felt.

The book is important. Unfortunately, the editor lacked an intimate insight both into the geography of the area in which Fish lived his life, and of Mormon history and ideology. His brief footnoting adds little. He does not integrate the book's story into the themes of history that Fish encountered and lived. At times one wonders what has been edited "out" and why. Dates are difficult to determine. The mapping of the book is inadequate. Fortunately, the index is good. Fish's book will probably prove most useful to scholars familiar with Mormon history in Utah and Arizona. But reading it will be rewarding to anyone willing to wade through his rather wordy but fascinating life story.

Utah State Historical Society

MELVIN T. SMITH

EMILIO KOSTERLITZKY: *EAGLE OF SONORA AND THE SOUTHWEST BORDER.*

By Cornelius C. Smith, Jr. Glendale: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 1970. Pp. 344. Illus., maps, apps., bibliog., index. \$12.50.

EMILIO KOSTERLITZKY, born in Moscow in the middle of the nineteenth century and educated in St. Petersburg, became a cadet in the Imperial Russian Navy in 1872. Assigned to a world cruise on a training mission, he jumped ship in Puerto Cabello, Venezuela and gradually worked his way north to Mexico. He enlisted as a private in the Mexican army in the spring of 1873 and subsequently enjoyed a distinguished military career which spanned the entire Díaz period and the early Revolution.

Cornelius C. Smith has written an absorbing biography based largely on family papers made available to him by one of Kosterlitzky's sons. The professional historian will find those sections treating Kosterlitzky's career as chief of the rurales in Sonora to be of greatest interest. His campaigns against the Yaqui, the Mayo and the Apache, as well as his role in the famous Cananea strike of 1906, are illustrative of the system of enforced peace which has become synonymous with the Díaz regime. A loyal soldier, *par excellence*, Kosterlitzky's career evidences the type of rewards a talented, non-Indian soldier might expect if he cast his lot with the regime rather than opposed it.

The biography is not without flaws however. More annoying than important are his references to Manuel Gómez as the Mexican president between Díaz' first and second terms, Luis Cortines when he means Adolfo Ruiz Cortines, and *Liberación* instead of *Regeneración* to identify the newspaper published by the Flores Magón brothers. Of greater significance is the limitation imposed by the nature of the sources. Smith states correctly in his acknowledgments that the book could not have been written without access to the family papers. But reliance on these sources to the complete exclusion of pertinent documentation in public archives (most notably the Mexican Ministry of Foreign Relations and the United States Department of State Records Relating to Mexican Affairs) conditions a work which is a little too sympathetic in places and certainly short of definitive. Had Smith consulted the Foreign Ministry archive, for example, perhaps he would have been able to explain why the Mexican government issued an order for Kosterlitzky's arrest in 1908. They suspected him of revolutionary activity. Was the suspicion justified? The same archive would have revealed whether or not the protagonist was involved in Victoriano Huerta's attempted return to power in 1915. There is some reason to believe he was. Similarly the Department of State Records would have enabled Smith to present an even more graphic account of the internment of Mexican soldiers at Ft. Rosecrans, California.

These shortcomings notwithstanding, *Eagle of Sonora* is a good book and a worthwhile contribution to the historiography of the Revolution. As we have come to expect from Arthur H. Clark, the volume is handsomely produced and lavishly adorned with maps, pictures, and pen and ink sketches by the author. Students of modern Mexican history will not have to read this work, but if they do they will be amply rewarded for their effort.

University of Nebraska

MICHAEL C. MEYER

GENERAL POPE AND U. S. INDIAN POLICY. By Richard N. Ellis. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1970. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. Pp. x, 287. \$10.

JOHN POPE flashed briefly on the Civil War scene as author of the bombastic "headquarters in the saddle" order as well as of the mortifying defeat at Second Manassas that followed with retributive swiftness. Hurried off to Minnesota to fight Indians, he has since been remembered chiefly as but one of that dismal procession of generals tried and discarded by Lincoln

before he found Grant. Largely forgotten is the quarter century of creditable service Pope rendered as a military administrator on the western frontier. For the remaining war years, 1862-66, he managed sizable geographical commands with an efficiency that earned high praise from Grant. After the war, he presided with noisy competence over the important Department of the Missouri—the southern plains and New Mexico—from 1870 to 1883 and ended his career with three years at the head of the Division of the Pacific. Professor Ellis' volume rescues Pope's frontier career from undeserved obscurity and thereby bolsters a reputation that has rested too exclusively on the fiasco of Second Manassas.

The title implies a close connection between Pope and the evolution of U. S. Indian policy. Actually, he exerted little influence despite, or perhaps because of, the endless stream of wordy rhetoric that he disgorged on the subject. No really clear picture of Pope's concept of the proper policy emerges, probably because his extraordinary verbosity, freighted with superlatives and absolutes, inhibited precise definition in his own mind. He was against treaties and for transfer of the Indian Bureau to the War Department, and on occasion he advocated radical innovations, such as moving the tribes back east. At times his ideas made sense and expressed the frustrations and needs of the moment. At other times they were plain silly. At all times they had little impact on policy because he talked so much that people quit listening. Most officers, military and civil alike, came to regard Pope, in the realm of policy at least, as something of a gadfly.

Though presenting Pope's always colorful views of policy, Professor Ellis' book is really more a chronicle of Pope's years as a military administrator. And in this role, rather than as a shaper of policy, he made his principal contribution. Second Manassas failed to teach him humility, and he engaged in public quarrels with superiors, subordinates, and political figures; but he also managed his command with an informed judgment that usually produced results. Sibley and Sully are credited with the victories over the Sioux in 1863 and 1864, while Miles and Mackenzie take the honors for the conquest of the southern Plains tribes in the Red River War of 1874-75. But back at department headquarters labored Pope, planning strategy, organizing logistics, and providing a leadership that must also be weighed in evaluating the successes of the field commanders.

Professor Ellis has done his research widely and thoroughly in original sources, and has organized and presented his story in an able fashion. I detect a tendency to accept too uncritically the values and biases of the frontier army toward the Indian and the Indian Bureau—e.g. Indian raids are Indian "crimes." But this is a small criticism of a generally admirable contribution to the history of the Indian frontier.

National Park Service

ROBERT M. UTLEY

THE MEXICAN WAR DIARY OF THOMAS D. TENNERY. Edited and with an Introduction by D. E. Livingston-Little. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1970. Pp. xxxix, 117. Illus., map, index. \$4.95.

THE LIFE of the volunteer soldier during the Mexican War, 1846-48, was anything but glamorous. Most of his time was filled with routine camp duties, long, wearisome marches, and constant bouts with disease in bivouac and field. Yet, despite these conditions, the volunteer endured the toils of army life and fought bravely when sent into battle, winning decisive victories on foreign soil. In *The Mexican War Diary of Thomas D. Tennery*, edited by D. E. Livingston-Little, a professor of history of Los Angeles Valley College, the atmosphere and events of those bygone days again come to life. Tennery served in the Fourth Illinois Volunteers in the lower Rio Grande district and in Scott's invasion of Mexico. Although his observations lack detail and anecdote, he recorded faithfully his impressions of the country through which he marched, and commented with vividness on the siege of Vera Cruz and the battle of Cerro Gordo. The result is an interesting though sketchy account of campaigning in Mexico.

The book is divided into introduction, annotated diary, and epilogue. The introduction is well-written, but is principally a survey of the causes and campaigns of the war. Only one page (viii) concerns Tennery's background. Moreover, little is said about the setting for the diary, its highlights and coverage, and its significance as a commentary on soldiering in Mexico. Errors of fact occasionally appear. Tennery did not travel on the boat with General Wool to New Orleans; Wool already was in the Crescent City on July 23, the day Tennery sailed downriver (xxiii, 9). Colonel Harney, not Wool, led the advance from San Antonio on September 26. It is true that General Shields and a contingent of Illinois foot joined Wool at Presidio on October 12, but Shields came from Camargo and the soldiers from San Antonio (xxiv).

Tennery's diary spans his one-year enlistment—June 29, 1846, to July 1, 1847. In the first section he chronicles his enlistment and shipment to the Rio Grande, life in and about Camargo, and march south to Ciudad Victoria. Later, he writes of the overland move to Tampico, embarkation for Vera Cruz and capture of that citadel, the battle of Cerro Gordo, his convalescence at Jalapa, and return home to Illinois. The dairy annotations are both appropriate and informative, but the editor might have researched further. In several instances, persons (pp. 32, 67, etc.), places (pp. 4, 24, etc.), and things (pp. 18, 73, etc.) are not identified. In the epilogue, the editor comments on the postwar careers of officers mentioned in the diary, but gives the barest of information about the diarist's later life.

The volume also contains illustrations and end matter. A map showing

the American Southwest and northern Mexico is included (Kearny is misspelled and Wool's route is inaccurate), but one of the Matamoros—Tampico region also would have been valuable. Nineteen pictures (officers, battle scenes, Tennery family) appear, but several captions are inaccurate. The appendix contains a newspaper report on a riot near Tennery's camp, and is followed by a short bibliography. The index is helpful, but some names do not appear (*Warren*, 23), and others are cited incorrectly (*Vera-cruz*, on xxi?).

Although presumably a "new and different look" at the Mexican War, this volume actually presents little in-depth description of personalities and camp life and is at best a mediocre contribution to the history of the War with Mexico.

University of Arizona

HARWOOD P. HINTON

THE UNITED STATES SOLDIER BETWEEN TWO WARS: ARMY LIFE AND REFORMS, 1865-1898. By Jack D. Foner. New York: Humanities Press, 1970. Pp. iv, 229. Bibliog., app., index. \$7.50.

THIS is a thoroughly researched study of what Army life was really like for the typical enlisted man who served during the period 1865-1898. The Army had a myriad of problems and all of them affected the enlisted soldier.

Almost immediately following the Civil War the size of the Army was visibly reduced in an attempt to reduce federal expenditures in this particular area. Other reasons for this reduction in size were the old Jeffersonian anathema for large standing armies and also the fact that the military was viewed with hostility in some quarters as a result of its role in Military Reconstruction. This reduction in the expenditures for the Army had the net result of reducing its strength from 57,000 officers and men in 1866 to "low point" 25,000 enlisted men in 1874. This exceedingly small group of men was spread throughout the vast reaches of the country and stationed at some 255 posts which were in existence in 1869. By 1892 the number of posts had been reduced to 96. The Army was called upon to afford protection to settlers on the frontier, men who were engaged in the construction of the transcontinental railroads, and of course was expected to keep the peace among the various Indian tribes who resided on reservations or were otherwise situated.

The day to day problems which confronted the serviceman at this time placed him in a most unenviable position. The food was horrible and con-

sisted mostly of bread, salt pork and beef. The housing which was provided was shabby, unkempt, dirty, and did not afford the necessary protection against the inclement weather which was varied fair and hot to rain, snow and extreme cold. Drinking water was more often than not taken from a nearby creek and though soldiers were required to bathe at least once per week, facilities that would have made this possible were virtually nonexistent.

In a chapter entitled "The Enlisted Soldier and the Army's Legal System" (pp. 31-58), Professor Foner discusses the Army's archaic legal system. The Army made extensive use of the courts-martial in its attempt to maintain some semblance of discipline. In many instances the officers who served on these military tribunals, including those who represented the defendant and those who acted in the role of prosecutors had little understanding of what justice was all about.

The loneliness, low pay, ill-fitting and uncomfortable clothes, and sometimes the hard work resulted in drunkenness and perhaps contributed to the enormous number of desertions. The problem of desertion was studied time and time again but resisted explanation and solution. For instance, in 1867 there were 54,138 enlisted men in the Army and during that same year 14,068 soldiers deserted.

There were also problems which involved the enlisted man and his officers. Some officers were ill-tempered, vindictive, callous; on occasions some were, to say the least, unethical or their conduct bordered on being criminal. The Army administration contributed to this by granting commissions to men who were without previous military service instead of promoting or granting commissions to qualified enlisted men.

In two chapters entitled "The Army Reform Movement, 1880-1886" and "The Army Reform Movement, 1887-1892" (pp. 77-113) there is a scholarly and judicious discussion of the attempts made by Secretary of War Redfield Proctor and Adjutant General John C. Kelton. These two men put forth some genuine effort to rectify some of the more glaring wrongs which existed in the United States Army and which contributed to the inefficiency and bad morale. In June of 1892 Congress enacted a law which made it easier for qualified enlisted men to secure commissions. This new law was sometimes known as the Magna Charta for enlisted personnel. Needless to say, these attempts at reform were exacerbated by the criticisms which were leveled at the military by the civilian population. These criticisms continued in spite of these two periods during which there was appreciable improvement in certain facets of the Army program.

However, on the eve of the outbreak of the Spanish-American War it was brought home in very dramatic fashion that even though some improvement had taken place the Army was far from being prepared to fight a war. The

problem of securing adequate rations and suitable clothing still had not been worked out with any degree of improvement. The problem of the courts-martial also remained and in this area there had been no marked improvement. Consequently desertions continued at a steady pace.

The last chapter of the book is concerned with the lot of the black troopers who served in the four all-black regiments which were organized following the Civil War. These four regiments were the Ninth and Tenth Cavalry regiments and the 24th and 25th Infantry regiments. Even though they suffered from discrimination, which was meted out both by the military and civilians, these men served with distinction that gave credit to both themselves and the white officers who condescended to command them. The history of the Ninth and Tenth Cavalry units has been adequately treated by William Leckie in *The Buffalo Soldiers*.

Those laymen and professionals alike who have more than a cursory interest in this period of Army history would profit immeasurably from reading this book. It is scholarly and judicious and when examples are given they are not as a rule overdrawn.

Texas Southern University

CALVIN REESE

THE ARIZONA ROUGH RIDERS. By Charles Herner. Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 1970. Pp. xii, 275. Illus., apps., bibliog., index. \$7.50.

EVEN BEFORE the war with Spain began, officials in Arizona began the formation of the Rough Rider organization. Alexander Brodie, with the endorsement of Governor Myron McCord, requested permission of the War Department to recruit a regiment of cavalry as early as March 3, 1898. He found an eager lieutenant in Bucky O'Neill of Prescott, a man of charm and organizational ability, a born leader, who has become one of Arizona's folk heroes. Apparently less eager, but no less ambitious, was James H. McClintock of Phoenix. These two recruited volunteers in their respective sections of the Territory. Ten days after Congress declared war, their men had been mustered in and were off to San Antonio for training. There Lieutenant Colonel Roosevelt joined them, and also some eastern dudes with their valets. This unlikely combination of western outdoorsmen and eastern aristocrats worked well together, however, as both gained respect for each other. The New Mexico Rough Riders also trained in San Antonio, but their performance remains a mystery in this book, which concentrates on the Arizona story.

From San Antonio the group entrained for Tampa, and there after a seven-day wait in the torrid Florida swamps, most of them, but not all,

boarded ship to sail for Cuba. Roosevelt double-timed them to the transport ahead of the New York Volunteers, who were left standing on the wharf, mad and frustrated.

Alas, the cowboys left behind their mounts, and in Cuba they became foot soldiers. But it was a glorious fight—a “crowded hour,” at San Juan Hill. Roosevelt, who had gained the respect of his men, displayed his now famous reckless courage, but withal he does not come off so well as a militarist. O’Neill was shot and killed while unnecessarily exposing himself. McClintock was shot at Las Guasimas, before he got to San Juan Hill. (About all he could ever show for his moment of glory was a limp for the rest of his life.) Altogether, only nine were killed and nineteen wounded.

The soldiers returned from the field of glory to find an apathetic public. The people of San Antonio, where they had undergone their training, had been glad to see them leave, and Madam Alice May in Tampa had even called the police out against them. None of the Rough Riders, including Major Brodie, won elections on their return. Brodie ran for Congressional delegate and lost at the polls. Others likewise failed. Throughout his life McClintock felt he had never been adequately rewarded for his services.

The book does not attempt to explain the significance of the Rough Rider caper. Why did the men volunteer: to promote Cuban liberty? to improve their economic circumstances? to pursue a life of adventure? to satisfy the personal ambition of men like Brodie, O’Neill, and McClintock? Questions of personal and social motivations are not answered. And what did it all mean for Arizona? About this time Arizona’s struggle for statehood entered a new phase, but whether the Rough Rider episode influenced this movement or not is uncertain. Roosevelt, of course, later became President, but he was no particular friend of statehood. One is tempted to see no impact of the war on statehood.

It is not the author’s purpose to answer such questions. He has written an absorbing narrative, which many readers will enjoy.

Northern Arizona University

WILLIAM H. LYON

HISTORICAL PUBLICATIONS

NEW MEXICO HISTORICAL REVIEW. Back issues are priced at \$5 per volume or \$1.25 per issue, except for issues in short supply at \$3 each. At present, most volumes are in print, except for 1926-27 and 1946-48. Comprehensive indexes of Vols. 1-15 (1926-40) and Vols. 16-30 (1941-55) are available at \$3 each. Volumes out of print may be obtained from University Microfilms, Ann Arbor, Michigan.

OLD SANTA FE. Published quarterly, 1913-16. The following issues are available: Vol. I, Nos., 1, 2, 3, at \$1 each. Vol. III, No. 12, at \$3.

HISTORICAL SOCIETY OF NEW MEXICO PAPERS

Journal of New Mexico Convention Delegates to Recommend a Plan of Civil Government, September, 1849. 22 pp. No. 10, 1907. \$3.00

In Memory of L. Bradford Prince, President of the Society, by Frank W. Clancy. 15 pp. No. 25, 1923, \$1.00

Early Vaccination in New Mexico, by Lansing B. Bloom, 12 pp. No. 27, 1924. \$3.00

Colonel José Francisco Chaves 1833-1924, by Paul A. F. Walter, Frank W. Clancy, and M. A. Otero. 18 pp., illus. No. 31, 1926. English edition, \$2.00. Spanish edition (1927), \$2.00

HISTORICAL SOCIETY OF NEW MEXICO PUBLICATIONS IN HISTORY

Albert Franklin Banta: Arizona Pioneer, edited by Frank D. Reeve. 149 pp., illus., index. Vol. XIV, Sept. 1953. \$2.50

HISTORICAL SOCIETY OF NEW MEXICO MISCELLANEOUS PUBLICATIONS

St. Francis and Franciscans in New Mexico, by Theodosius Meyer. 40 pp., illus., 1926. \$2.50

New Mexico, Dancing-ground of the Sun: A Brief Introduction to the State. 38 pp., illus. 1954. \$0.50

REPRINTS FROM NEW MEXICO HISTORICAL REVIEW

"Music Teaching in New Mexico in the Seventeenth Century," by Lota M. Spell. 12 pp., Vol. 2 (1927). \$3.00

"Military Escorts on the Santa Fe Trail," by Fred S. Perrine (Conclusion only). 36 pp., Vol. 3 (1928). \$0.50

"Uses of Wood by the Spanish Colonists in New Mexico," by Hester Jones. 27 pp., Vol. 7 (1932). \$1.00

"Kin and Clan," by A. F. Bandelier, 11 pp., Vol. 8 (1933). \$1.00

"The Spanish Military Chapels in Santa Fe and the Reredos of Our Lady of Light," by A. von Wuthenau. 20 pp., Vol. 10 (1935). \$1.00

"Who Discovered New Mexico?" by Lansing B. Bloom, 32 pp., Vol. 15 (1940). \$2.00

"The Coronado-Bocanegra Family Alliance," by Lansing B. Bloom. 31 pp., Vol. 16 (1941). \$3.00

ADDRESS ORDERS TO

THE UNIVERSITY OF NEW MEXICO PRESS
ALBUQUERQUE, NEW MEXICO 87106