

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 37 | Number 3

Article 5

7-1-1962

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 37, 3 (1962). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol37/iss3/5>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

Guide to Materials on Latin America in the National Archives. By John P. Harrison. Washington: The National Archives, 1961. Vol. I, Pp. 246.

"The purpose of the guide," states Dr. Harrison, "is to describe and assist the investigator in locating the materials in the National Archives concerned with Latin America." This is a comprehensive regional supplement, the first such issued to the general *Guide to the Records in the National Archives* (1948). It is the first of two volumes to be issued on Latin America and covers the "general" records of the Government and of the Departments of State, Treasury, War, and Navy.

This is an impressive, detailed survey; it is the fruit of Mr. Harrison's half-dozen years of employment as Latin American specialist for the National Archives. The guide makes intelligible the complex organizational breakdown of the archives and describes the magnitude, nature, general substance, and possible research value of Latin American materials extant in the numerous record groups. The technique used is to describe representative documents in each record group in sufficient detail to suggest the possible value and interest the individual collection might have for the researcher.

Described under the section "General Records of United States Government" are the reports of the claims commissions, of the boundary commissions, and of United States participation in all the Inter-American Conferences and Commissions since 1826.

In the State Department section, to which about 40 per cent of the guide is devoted, Mr. Harrison places the descriptive emphasis upon little known and seldom used collections. Definitely not in the latter category are the Diplomatic Instructions and Diplomatic Dispatches, both of which are now available on microfilm. But for the person who wishes to dig

deeply this guide will suggest to him the mine of untapped information hidden in the voluminous consular materials and post records. There is also a section on the Territorial Papers.

The Treasury Department section deals mainly with the problem of customs collections at various Gulf Coast ports. This includes the activities of the Coast Guard. In the general report of treasury agents, there is a special section (pp. 145-146) dealing with smuggling and other activities along the Rio Grande.

Of main interest to Southwest historians, however, will be the War Department section, for the records described herein relate mainly to the Mexican border area. Main categories include the Mexican War, the subsequent border troubles (both Mexican and Indian) in the latter part of the nineteenth century, and the Mexican Revolution (1910-1921). Also listed herein are fairly complete records of the activities of the United States Army in Cuba and the Canal Zone.

The final section, that dealing with the Navy Department, is the best organized. The reports from ship captains have a special importance, says Mr. Harrison, for "after 1830, whenever there was a revolution of national importance or a local political disturbance in Latin America that threatened the lives or investments of United States citizens, a United States naval vessel was likely to be on the spot." There is also a detailed account of the records available on the extensive Marine Corps activity in the Caribbean and Central America during the years 1915-1932.

This guide is an indispensable research tool both for historians dealing with Latin America, and with Latin America and the United States. In addition, it should be of special interest to scholars doing research on the southwest since 1830 because of the large amount of North Mexican and borderland materials described. Use of this first volume of the guide will be greatly facilitated by the publication of Volume 2, which is to contain the index for both.

University of New Mexico

EDWIN LIEUWEN

The Cattle Kings. By Lewis Atherton. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1961. Pp. xii, 308. Ills., maps, index. \$6.95.

Richard Trimble, a recent Harvard graduate turned cattleman, wrote home to his parents in New York City on February 22, 1883,

I am sorry thee has so little confidence in my ability to judge whether it is for my advantage to stay on the ranch or in Cheyenne. There are two sides to the cattle business, the theory and the practice, one of which is better learned in Cheyenne where men congregate and the other on the ranch.

(Trimble Collection, Western History Research Center, University of Wyoming)

These two sentences summed up in graphic manner the dilemma, theoretically speaking, which faced many eastern would-be cattlemen. A quick perusal of their annual reports is all the evidence that is necessary to discover that most cattlemen were not troubled by alternatives of theory and practice. As for Trimble, more conscientious than many of his friends, he alternated between the two cultures for three years before returning to Wall Street where he eventually became the first secretary of the U. S. Steel Corporation.

Lewis Atherton has written a socio-cultural study of the cattlemen with an added dash of economic analysis. Who was this figure of a cattleman? He came from a diverse and cosmopolitan eastern background. The motivations for leaving the East were as varied as the backgrounds; health, excitement, visions of economic rewards, or just plain wanderlust resulted in the easterner appearing on the frontier.

Once in the West he developed a way of life which was noted for both stability and paradoxes. A pragmatist, the cattleman had a live and let live philosophy. Yet when he was pressed by economic circumstances his laissez-faire approach could easily vanish. A firm believer in discipline, he, on occasion would succumb to lawlessness, as the studies of Wayne Gard and John Caughey have shown. Hard in his per-

sonal business dealings, he was often generous with his family and philanthropies (though the latter was frequently left to his wife). In that overworked phrase, he was a rugged individualist, who would co-operate with other cattlemen in forming stock growers associations for the purpose of solving problems of mutual concern. Yet his allegiance to these organizations was so tenuous that he would readily resign his membership (after the disastrous winter of 1886-1887, the cattlemen resigned wholesale from the Wyoming Stock Growers Association, a study in futility as well as economics). There was a more finely balanced mixture of individualism and co-operation than has been generally admitted.

The author offers his most viable contribution in revealing the common denominators between the Western cattlemen and the Eastern businessman. Was there as much of a clash of culture as has been assumed? An Eastern culture often did thrive when transplanted to the West. However the reverse process of the Western facade being grafted onto the East could be as artificial as false fronted architecture.

What seems to disturb the author most is why the central figure of the range economy has been neglected, when the cowboy has been transformed into a folk hero. The author suggests several reasons: there was a general distrust of business in the late nineteenth century, the cowboy was a more generally identifiable species than the individualistic cattleman, and the cowboy was good copy for writers—action rather than character subtleties were conducive to a complicated plot. What Atherton has left unanswered is why so much of this western range fiction is so inferior in literary quality. Little historical imagination is necessary to note that the cattleman may well have had a better fate in being neglected than the cowboy has received by being embalmed by hordes of pulp writers.

Atherton's announced aim of placing the cattleman in American culture has been achieved successfully with an ease of literary style that many historians might well envy.

University of Wyoming

GENE M. GRESSLEY

An Affair of Honor. Woodrow Wilson and the Occupation of Veracruz. By Robert E. Quirk. Lexington: University of Kentucky Press, 1962. Pp. vi, 184. \$5.00.

Since the United States has been reaping in Latin America an unhappy harvest sown in an age of exuberant adolescence, the historian of diplomacy has virtually a mandate to berate the shapers and misshapers of an abortive foreign policy with the irreverence and zeal for exposé which characterized the muckrakers of the Progressive Era. Alas, poor Wilson! Once revered as a towering idealist, he has been steadily reduced in stature until one suspects he may subsequently appear in history—until resurrected by neo-idealists—as merely the first in a line of golfplaying presidents. Indeed, when the golf scores of chief executives are compared—a research task not yet accomplished—it is probable we shall learn that Wilson was as impervious to advice on the links as he was in the White House, thereby accruing shamefully high scores and falling into innumerable sandtraps, while insisting on using his old No. 3 iron despite the would-be peer group's advice to use a putter. Such is the inevitable fate, as David Riesman might say, of an inner-directed man in a society moving toward the other-directedness typified by Warren G. Harding.

Robert E. Quirk is unquestionably one of the most able and talented of those presently engaged in exposing the fables and foibles of United States foreign policy in the interventionist period in Latin America. The present work, awarded \$1,000 by the Mississippi Valley Historical Association, was preceded by the author's *The Mexican Revolution, 1914-1915* (Indiana University Press, 1960), which received the Bolton prize of the American Historical Association.

Since Professor Quirk seems unable, or at least unwilling, to write anything less than a prize winner, one may wonder as to the secrets of his success. In the opinion of this reviewer, the excellence of *An Affair of Honor* rests on two qualities. One is thoroughness of research. The author has carefully

examined an impressive quantity of sources—Navy logbooks, newspapers, diaries, private papers, and appropriate files in the National Archives, the Departments of the Army, Navy, and Interior, and the Mexican archives. Like Justin Smith before him, who walked the routes of the United States army in the war with Mexico, Professor Quirk has viewed at first hand the site of the Tampico incident and has absorbed by observation, interviews with old residents, and intensive reading, the atmosphere of Veracruz in 1914, scene of the seven months' occupation by United States military forces.

Secondly, the author sketches his characters and scenes convincingly and with frequent evidence of artistry. One does not soon forget, even if one does not entirely agree with, Quirk's Wilson—so convinced of his own rightness that it was a standing joke at the White House that complete ignorance of Mexico was an indispensable qualification for talking to Wilson about it. About Wilson, Quirk observed that "nothing bolsters a man's confidence in his own rectitude more than scanty information."

Equally vivid are portrayals of Nelson J. O'Shaughnessy, the charge d'affaires in Mexico and his wife, for whom diplomatic life was a "mad whirl of entertainment." They are glimpsed most often in proximity with Victoriano Huerta—the Mexican president whom Wilson was trying to eject from power. O'Shaughnessy is pictured exchanging "abrazos" and jokes with Huerta; his wife, on many occasions, is seen "looking almost regal" when entering salons on the arm of the Mexican president. Rear Admiral Henry T. Mayo, "firm-jawed with a scraggly mustache," is unforgettable as the commander off Tampico who demanded official apologies for the arrest of some American sailors, while Secretary of State Bryan is portrayed as cheerfully misreading and misinterpreting dispatches from Mexico.

Nor will readers soon forget Quirk's description of Veracruz in 1914 where "sea and sky strive to match or surpass each other with azure blue for emerald green, filmy cloud for whitecap and spume." One may almost smell the city where

vultures reeked of carrion as they hopped about in the meat market feeding on waste scraps tossed on the floor. The occupation of Veracruz by some 7,000 troops is excellently presented—the massive cleaning up of garbage, of venereal disease, and of the vile prison of San Juan de Ulúa. Quirk is candid in his revelation of United States' soldiers abroad—lining up by the scores for their favorite prostitute. One almost suspects that humor won out over verity in the sources to read that American and other foreign prostitutes, barred from operating in Veracruz out of respect for Mexico's national feelings, protested that such restriction was in violation of freedom of trade.

An *Affair of Honor* does not so much reinterpret the events in United States relations with Mexico between April and November, 1914, as it demonstrates that American representatives abroad, whether of the military or diplomatic corps, distorted facts in their reporting of incidents which inflamed the nationalism of which Mayo, Wilson and others were, in their various ways, an expression. One does learn that the munitions cargo of the German ship, *Ypiranga*, originated with Remington in New York rather than in Germany as scholars familiar with only the documents in the *Foreign Relations of the United States* have supposed. But in general the main outline of developments, which have to do with Wilson's efforts to extricate himself from the sandtrap of upholding United States' honor, remains unchanged.

There are a few statements which tend to be misleading. In the preface, p. v, to point out that military occupation suppressed civil rights is to assume that such rights previously existed in practice. It is also only a partial explanation to say that Mexican resentment in 1914 was due to Wilson's injection of a moral issue into his non-recognition policy. It would appear that rising Mexican nationalism, rather than Wilson's moralism, was responsible for the reaction in Mexico which was so different than that displayed in 1847-48. The author also is inconsistent in saying that Wilson would sacrifice American property owners in Tampico to his policy of oust-

ing Huerta (p. 48), when on p. 18 he had stated it was Wilson's general policy (Huerta or no Huerta) not to protect property owners abroad. The author also yields rather too much to effect in saying the Americans "killed hundreds of Mexicans to take Veracruz" (p. 154) when he had earlier stated the figure was about 200, or possibly somewhat more. "Hundreds" imply many more than 200 as a descriptive statement of quantity. Lastly, those nurtured on Ray Stannard Baker's *Woodrow Wilson*, 6 vols. (New York, 1946) will find it difficult wholly to replace the favorable if biased image of Wilson in that work with the crochety, egotistical, golfplayer reflected in Quirk's book.

The virtues of *An Affair of Honor*, however, vastly outweigh any defects. For a picture of how individuals shape foreign policy, of conduct and misconduct abroad, and of the motivations and manners of leading figures in American diplomacy, this work achieves a high standard. The historiography of United States diplomacy has been greatly enriched by this contribution.

University of New Mexico

TROY S. FLOYD

El Morro: Inscription Rock, New Mexico. By John M. Slater. Los Angeles: The Plantin Press, 1961. Pp. xiv, 157. Illustrations, maps, bibliography and index. \$30.00.

El Morro is introduced to the reader by Lawrence Clark Powell with his usual poetic sensitivity to the Southwestern scene. He is followed by a brief historical sketch for the Spanish-Mexican period, beginning with Cabeza de Baca, that discusses the various travelers who passed by the rock and presents a translation of their inscriptions (pp. 1-25). The American Period (p. 27-50) includes selective inscriptions, largely before 1875, and an account of the establishment of El Morro as a National Monument.

A list of the inscriptions with a reference system to a map whereby the reader can locate the site of a particular item on the rock fills pp. 53-72, followed by pictures of the rock,

pueblo ruins, and inscriptions (pp. 74-133). These are photographs with a few reprints of sketches from older publications. The artistry is of the highest quality.

The book is an invaluable reproduction of an historical record that will be destroyed eventually by nature with its dedicated purpose of changing the face of the earth. El Morro is a monument of sandstone and cannot endure forever, least of all the recordings of travelers who *pasaron por aquí*.

F. D. R.

The United States and Pancho Villa: a Study in Unconventional Diplomacy. By Clarence C. Clendenen. Ithaca: Cornell University Press. 1961. Pp. xiv. 352. \$5.75.

Whether as an object of wild adulation or bitter hatred, or as a leading character in a Broadway musical, Pancho Villa has always evoked strong emotions. A winner of the American Historical Association's Beveridge Award for 1961, this scholarly book subjects one phase of Villa's colorful career to objective scrutiny. Its author is a retired colonel who began his army service on the Mexican border soon after World War I. Focussing primarily on the diplomatic relations between the Mexican leader and American officials during the Wilson era, Clendenen seeks to explain why, despite a half century of border clashes before 1914, a diplomatic crisis then developed. A large portion of the book traces the reverberations of the Mexican revolution in American foreign policy. Patiently the author fills in details to indicate Wilson's shifting attitudes towards Villa and Carranza. Clendenen feels that once the complicated patchwork of Mexican politics during the revolution is laid bare Wilson's policies are fully vindicated.

This volume makes at least two contributions towards a better understanding of United States-Mexican relations. As a student of diplomacy, Clendenen is able to ignore many of Villa's barbarities which are only incidental in this account, and to paint a more favorable portrait of the Revolutionary

leader. Until Wilson's recognition of Carranza in 1916, Villa was consistently friendly towards the United States. Among the political figures in Mexico there was none who was more favorably inclined towards the *big neighbor in the north*. In contrast, Carranza is pictured here not as a benign democrat, but as an implacable and obstinate foe of American policies, good or bad. Perhaps the greatest contribution of the book is to place the Mexican troubles into their proper context within American diplomacy. The author shows that these difficulties were of much greater concern to Wilson than has been realized by historians who have concentrated on his relations with German and European statesmen. The bandit raids of Villa had ramifications that were global. German military leaders, especially Ludendorff and Bernstorff, were convinced by Wilson's "watchful waiting" that the United States was weak, incompetent and indecisive and would not resort to war even under extreme provocation. This impression contributed heavily towards the decision to renew unrestricted submarine warfare in January, 1917, and to the ill-fated Zimmerman Telegram. If the skirmishes along the Texas border were sometimes of small magnitude, their implications were of world-wide significance.

Scholars will welcome Clendenen's book. In many parts the style is clear and the documentation adequate. Dr. Clendenen has relied primarily on American sources including State Department publications, Army records in the National Archives, and personal manuscripts like those of Pershing. Unfortunately he has not used Mexican sources. In Mexico City the personal archives of General Roque Gonzales Garza, president of the Convention in 1914, contain much pertinent correspondence with Villa. There are no references to materials in the *Ejército Nacional* or the *Relaciones Exteriores*. The absence of citations to Mexican or Southwestern newspapers indicates that the author has not extensively used vast and fruitful collections in the *Hemeroteca Nacional* and the *Biblioteca de Mexico*, or in the Library of Congress and the Universities of Texas, Arizona and New Mexico. Neverthe-

less, this is a useful account which can be read with profit not only by students of the Southwest, and of American diplomacy, but also by specialists in Latin-American studies. It illuminates the complicated web of domestic politics and diplomacy on both sides of the border in a period when both nations were in the throes of crisis.

University of New Mexico

GERALD D. NASH

The Historical Society of New Mexico

Organized December 26, 1859

PAST PRESIDENTS

- 1859 — COL. JOHN B. GRAYSON, U. S. A.
1861 — MAJ. JAMES L. DONALDSON, U. S. A.
1863 — HON. KIRBY BENEDICT

adjourned sine die, Sept. 23, 1863

re-established Dec. 27, 1880

- 1881 — HON. WILLIAM G. RITCH
1883 — HON. L. BRADFORD PRINCE
1923 — HON. FRANK W. CLANCY
1925 — COL. RALPH E. TWITCHELL
1926 — PAUL A. F. WALTER
1959 — CALVIN HORN

OFFICERS FOR 1961-1962

President, VICTOR WESTPHALL, Albuquerque
Vice-President, BETTY ARMSTRONG, Mesilla
Treasurer, THOMAS B. CATRON III, Santa Fe
Recording Secretary, LORRAINE LAVENDER, Santa Fe
Corresponding Secretary, GEORGE FITZPATRICK, Santa Fe

FELLOWS

PERCY M. BALDWIN	J. LLOYD MECHAM
RALPH P. BIEBER.	THEODOSIUS MEYER, O.F.M.
HERBERT O. BRAYER	FRANK D. REEVE
FRAY ANGELICO CHAVEZ	FRANCE V. SCHOLLES
REV. STANLEY CROCCHIOLA	ALFRED V. THOMAS
CHARLES E. DIBBLE	THEODORE TREUTHLEIN
AURELIO M. ESPINOSA	PAUL A. F. WALTER
GEORGE P. HAMMOND	

PUBLICATIONS FOR SALE

OLD SANTA FÉ. The predecessor of the Review. Published quarterly 1913-1916. The file contains a number of articles of interest and importance; significant material for the historical section of any library of Americana. Nine issues are still available, although two of these soon will be exhausted. The nine: Vol. I, Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4; Vol. II, Nos. 4, 5, 6; Vol. III, Nos. 11, 12. The available file \$9.00

NEW MEXICO HISTORICAL REVIEW. Published quarterly, 1926 to date. Files very nearly complete are available, at \$4.00 per volume, or \$1.00 per issue. There are a few exceptions: several issues in short supply are priced at \$2.00 and \$3.00, and are sold only in sets. Out of print are the following: Vol. I Nos. 1, 4; Vol. XXIII Nos. 1, 2, 3. Write for a complete listing.

Society will pay \$3 each for out of print numbers in good condition.

COMPREHENSIVE INDEX for Vols. I—XV \$2.00

COMPREHENSIVE INDEX for Vols. XVI—XXX \$2.50

PUBLICATIONS IN HISTORY

Vol. I—Fray Marcos de Niza's *Relación*, Span. and Eng., ed. by Percy M. Baldwin, 59 pp. (1926) \$1.00

Vol. III—New Mexico and the Great War, ed. by L. B. Bloom, 166 pp., index (1927) \$1.50

Vol. V—Barreiro's *Ojeada sobre Nuevo Mexico* (1832), ed. by L. B. Bloom, 60 pp., ill. (1928) \$5.00

Vol. XIV—Albert Franklin Banta: Arizona Pioneer, ed. by Frank D. Reeve, 143 pp., ill., index (1953) \$2.25

Vol. XV—Bishop Tamarón's Visitation of New Mexico, 1760, ed. by Eleanor B. Adams, 112 pp., ill., index (1954) \$2.50

Address orders to

Historical Society of New Mexico

P. O. Box 1727

Santa Fe, New Mexico