

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 36 | Number 1

Article 6

1-1-1961

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 36, 1 (1961). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol36/iss1/6>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

The Mexican Revolution: 1914-1915. By Robert F. Quirk. Bloomington: University of Indiana Press, 1960. Pp. 325, index. \$6.75.

Here is an account of a most critical year in the history of Mexico, from the time of the collapse of the regime of Victoriano Huerta in mid-1914 to the triumph of the Constitutionalist forces of Venustiano Carranza and Alvaro Obregón over the Conventionist forces of Pancho Villa and Emiliano Zapata in mid-1915. It was a most significant year, one in which the Mexican nation was caught up in a titanic struggle between competing revolutionary personalities and ideologies. There was a plethora of parliamentary debate and revolutionary proclamation but the outcome was determined, of course, on the field of battle.

Professor Robert Quirk has made a substantial contribution to our knowledge of the great revolution in Mexico. This book is solidly based upon primary material. It is a product of prolonged research in depth. The style is lively, witty, and lucid.

For the first time, in English, we have a truly penetrating analysis of the regional, ideological, and personality clashes that provoked such turmoil in this year. In addition to bringing into sharper relief the Villa-Carranza feud, the author explores in detail the more subtle differences within each major camp, such as factors which prevented full cooperation between Villa and Zapata and the often unpredictable nature of Obregón's relationship with Carranza. In addition, there is brought to light the important supporting roles played by such Constitutionalist generals as Lucio Blanco, Francisco Coss, Pablo González, Eulalio González, and *villista* officers as Felipe Angeles and Roque González Garza. Most vivid of all are his descriptions of *zapatistas* like Antonio Díaz Soto y Gama, Manuel Palafox and Antonio Barona.

If the author is partial to one side or the other he certainly conceals it well in his exposition. The only slightly subjective treatment of an individual that this reviewer can

detect is that of González Garza. Perhaps this is because the author drew quite heavily on his private papers and was in such close contact with him prior to writing this book.

To the mountain of criticism already heaped upon Woodrow Wilson's diplomacy in this period, Mr. Quirk piles on still more. In particular, he portrays the near idiocy of a policy of backing a leader such as Villa, even after his cause was hopelessly lost.

In sum, this volume fills a real gap, but it makes even more apparent another gap in the early history of the revolution. The books by Stanley Ross and Charles Cumberland have dealt competently with the Madero Period 1910-February 1913. What is badly needed now to fill the remaining gap is a treatment, as fine as this book of Mr. Quirk's on the mid-1914-1915 period, of the Huerta regime during the period February 1913-July 1914.

University of New Mexico

EDWIN LIEUWEN

Texas Indian Papers 1825-1843. Edited by Dorman H. Winfrey et al. Austin: Texas State Library, 1959. Pp. 298. \$5.25.

The Texas archives are an invaluable source of information for students of both state and national affairs. The Indian papers are now made more readily available to them. Subsequent volumes will present additional documents for the period from 1844 to annexation and into the statehood period.

The story of the red man in the United States has been explained in scholarly publications, in others of a trivial nature, in drama, music and the novel. For sheer understanding of a most complex story, if attainable, documents offer for the interested mind the most promising avenue toward achieving it. They deal with war and peace, trade and friendship, the way of life for Indian and white in bygone days, and sidelights on human behavior that reveal at least one constant in an ever changing world. It is unfortunate for history that Indians did not record their thoughts more often, so we

must picture them through the white man's words and documents offer the only front row seat for the viewer.

The Texas State Archive staff transcribed the documents literally and without omissions. They are to be congratulated. Despite maximum care, one wonders whether an error did creep into the text on line 1, page 3 and line 19.

Notes on General Ashley the Overland Trail and South Pass.

By Donald McKay Frost. Barre, Massachusetts: Barre Gazette, 1960. Pp. xii, 149. Index and pocket map. \$5.00.

This publication is a reprint from the Proceedings of The American Antiquarian Society. Chapter 1 presents a brief sketch of the Rocky Mountain fur trade, and chapters 2-8 deal with activities of General Ashley. Building on Hiram Chittenden's pioneer work, the author uses the letters of Daniel T. Potts, published in Appendix A, the narrative of James Clyman, the journal of Jedediah Smith, and newspaper accounts (Appendix B) for the years 1822-1830. The excellent discussion of the fur trade and the printing of source material in the Appendix (nearly two-thirds of the book) make this study of prime interest to students of western history.

Forty Years Among the Indians: A true yet thrilling narrative of the Author's experiences among the Natives. By Daniel W. Jones. Los Angeles: Westernlore Press, 1960. Pp. xvi, 378. \$8.50.

Dan Jones was a rolling stone, but a rolling stone bent on business. He participated in the founding of Utah by the Mormons, preached their Gospel in Mexico and worked among the Indians in the Salt River valley of Arizona with both religious and economic aims. His long rambling history was written late in life and allowance must be made for an occasional lapse of memory, not to mention inaccuracy of information. The original publication has long been a collector's item, so this reprint will be welcome to readers interested in westernlore.

Sibley's New Mexico Campaign. By Martin Hardwick Hall. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1960. Pp. xv, 366. Illustrations, bibliography and index.

This is the most intensive treatment of the Confederate invasion of New Mexico during the Civil War that has yet been published, but it is not the definitive account. The bibliography is good, but a few more items of information covering moot points might have been unearthed if other Federal archives relating to New Mexico had been consulted. The author did not find a satisfactory answer to the question why the Federal troops stationed at Fort Fillmore failed to make the march to San Agustín springs as a fighting force. The answer has been offered by other writers that the troops had filled their canteens with whiskey rather than water and thirst caused their defeat. Soldiers have marched long distances under trying circumstances, so it is reasonable to assume that the above march need not have ended so disastrously. Nor does the author explain satisfactorily the reason for Chivington's march over the mountain to attack the Confederate supply train. Was it so planned or was there another reason or reasons?

There is an occasional minor point that might be questioned, but it is not essential to do so. The book is well written and a useful addition to southwestern historical literature. The author has included the muster rolls of the confederate troops that fill over a fourth of the total pages.

It has long been acceptable practice to drop the accent on Río and Santa Fé.

Narrative of the Surrender Of a Command of U.S. Forces At Fort Fillmore New Mexico In July, A.D., 1861. By Major James Cooper McKee. Houston: Stagecoach Press, 1960. Pp. viii, 64. Maps and index. \$4.75.

"One of the rarest Civil War items of Texas-New Mexico action, now reprinted with added Confederate reports," so reads, and correctly, the jacket blurb. Major McKee, army surgeon, left for posterity this account of the surrender of

Fort Fillmore which historians are still belaboring in search of the truth. The limited edition of 550 copies of the reprint is a credit in appearance to the Press: "Type used for the text is Excelsior, composed on the Linotype, with handset accessories. The paper is Hamilton's Kilmory."

A Guide to the Microfilm of Papers relating to New Mexico Land Grants. By Albert James Diaz. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1960. Pp. vii, 102. \$1.75.

This is a guide to the original records of the Federal Land Office, Santa Fe, New Mexico, and the microfilm copy at the University of New Mexico and other libraries. It provides a brief description of each of the twenty-three archival sections. The land grant cases are then listed by title in alphabetical order, listed by report number, by file number and case, and finally by microfilm reel number. The Archives are important for southwestern history and allied subjects, and the guide should encourage scholarly exploitation of their wealth.

F. D. R.

The Cahuilla Indians. By Harry C. James. Los Angeles: Westernlore Press, 1960. Pp. 185. \$7.50.

Historians and writers in general have long been guilty of ignoring the Indians of California—or writing them off as stupid, backward savages. All one has to do to realize the truth of this is to examine the major works dealing with California history or with phases of that history and one will notice the absence of material on the native Californian. When he is mentioned it is almost always with the same attitude as was held by the Spanish and Anglo-American invaders of the Far West: the California Indians are fit only to be conquered and "civilized."

It is very refreshing indeed to find a work of the quality of *The Cahuilla Indians*, written well and written, I think, accurately. Harry C. James has known the Cahuilla for many years; in fact he has come to be a part of this outstanding group of Indians. Thus he has had many first-person contacts

which enrich his narrative and make the book one which should be on the shelf of every southwestern historian and armchair anthropologist. In particular, his accounts of Cahuilla folklore and of leading Indians such as Ramona, Juan Antonio, and Fig Tree John, are very interesting and informative. The Cahuilla creation story is a very beautiful one, certainly ranking in poetic imagery with the best of mankind's creation myths.

Most writers who deal with the Indian write from the "outside" so to speak; they cannot give to the reader the "feel" of the particular Indian culture which they are describing. Mr. James overcomes this difficulty to a great extent—one comes away from his book with a feeling of having been direct contact with the Cahuilla.

Technically speaking, *The Cahuilla Indians* is not a history, although it does bring to light some aspects of the Indian past. It is more than anything else an introduction to a people, in this case, the Cahuilla. The author seeks to have the reader understand something of the Indians' way of life, of their importance in history, of their folk imagery, of their adjustment to the European invasion, and of their promise for the future. General readers will appreciate Mr. James' careful location of Cahuilla village-sites and his discussion of the differences between the Western, Mountain and Desert Cahuilla subdivisions. His story of the backgrounds for Helen Hunt Jackson's novel *Ramona* is very interesting as well.

The Cahuilla Indians is a small but beautifully prepared book. It is undoubtedly one of the nicest volumes published by Westernlore Press, partly because of the excellent art work of Don Louis Perceval. The illustrations are either taken from Cahuilla motifs or are depictions of the Indians' way of life. The book is also enhanced by over two dozen fine photographs, including a picture of the real Ramona.

The publisher indicates that *The Cahuilla Indians* "... is certain to remain the definitive work ..." on this tribe. I hope that this will not be true, for even though Mr. James' book is excellent indeed, it does not tell the complete story of the Cahuilla in either historical or anthropological dimensions.

It is to be hoped that one day a trained historian will consult the Spanish, Mexican and Anglo-American manuscript material and will re-create in detail the exciting past of this important tribe. Until then, and even after that event, Harry C. James' work will remain one of the best introductions to an Indian group that has been written.

San Fernando Valley State College

JACK D. FORBES

Our Spanish Southwest. By Lynn I. Perrigo. Dallas: Banks Upshaw and Company, 1960. Bibliography. Index. Pp. iv, 498.

Our Spanish Southwest is designed as a textbook and general reference work on southwest history. It is a formidable undertaking for its 498 pages. There is a set of good maps depicting Indian cultures, Spanish and foreign explorers, developing transportation and communication facilities, and national parks and monuments. The work is enhanced by sixty-nine pages of bibliography and an adequate index. Dr. Perrigo has successfully attempted to fill the urgent need for a text in southwest and borderlands history with this publication. Until a more detailed synthesis appears the present work will certainly be used.

A survey of such a vast area as Texas, New Mexico, Arizona, California and environs from prehistoric times to the present is bound to have some shortcomings. Those interested in colonial times will be disappointed with the scant one hundred and twenty pages devoted to the time area to 1821. The colonial section suffers from compressing too much data into too few pages. There are a number of factual errors, nebulous definitions of Spanish terms, and frequent typographical errors. The nineteenth and twentieth centuries are emphasized, and as a consequence, fare much better, even though the style often fails to present the information in the most interesting light. The reader interested in Indian affairs would wish for a deeper treatment and one expanded beyond the Navaho and their problems.

Many of the errors in print are obviously the fault of the

editor and his proofreaders. Pages 47, 22, 28, and the Bibliography are cases in point.

Mexico City College

RICHARD E. GREENLEAF

Frémont's Fourth Expedition. Edited by LeRoy R. Hafen and Ann W. Hafen, Glendale, California: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 1960. Pp. 319. Illustrations, maps, and index.

John Charles Frémont is one of the most controversial figures associated with the pioneer history of the American West, as this collection of documents once again verifies. Between 1842 and 1846 he conducted three highly successful and well-publicized topographical expeditions through the Rocky Mountains and along the Pacific Coast. Then his career seemed to fall apart. The historic feud with General Kearny during the conquest of California forced the once glamorous pathfinder to "resign" from the army. Backed by his powerful father-in-law, Senator Thomas Hart Benton, and ample private funds, he set out from St. Louis in the fall of 1848 determined to find a practical railroad route to the Pacific along the thirty-eighth parallel.

The expedition consisted of thirty-three men, most of whom were veterans of Frémont's earlier ventures. In addition, there were one hundred and thirty mules, and the best equipment, instruments, and arms that money could buy. Old Bill Williams, the famous mountain man, served as official guide. Frémont subsequently attempted to cross the Sangre de Cristo and San Juan Mountains during one of the most severe winters on record, perhaps as much to remove the stigma of his recent court-martial as to prove the feasibility of a railroad route across the Central Rockies.

But the fourth expedition proved a resounding failure, and for that reason it is less well-known than the previous ones. The Frémont party got lost in the mountains and before it could extricate itself, ten men and all the mules were dead. In the resulting controversy, various participants and interested parties tried to fix the blame on someone other than themselves. Frémont claimed that his guide was incompetent

and that his men were cowardly and easily discouraged by misfortune—charges not supported by evidence.

In 1955 William Brandon published an excellent narrative of Frémont's ill-fated expedition (THE MEN AND THE MOUNTAIN) based largely upon original documents relating to the episode. He fixed most of the blame upon the leader himself, plus a combination of severe weather and just plain bad luck. The documents used by Brandon, with additional miscellaneous newspaper stories, letters, and reports, have now been brought together by one of the most careful documentarians of Rocky Mountain history.

Professor Hafen has the good judgment not to clutter the various accounts of the expedition with too many footnotes. By bringing all of the available primary materials together, he has made a contribution to a very important facet of western explorations. The reader will not only be gripped by the stark drama that unfolds, though some of the narratives are repetitious, he also will have the opportunity to draw his own conclusions as to direct responsibility for the tragedy.

University of Oklahoma

W. EUGENE HOLLON

The Life of John Wesley Hardin as Written by Himself. Introduction by Robert G. McCubbin. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1961. Pp. xxi, 152. \$2.00.

Originally published in Seguin, Texas, in 1896, a year after Hardin's death at the hands of John Selman, in El Paso, Texas, the book now republished has long since been a scarce and expensive item, eagerly sought after by rare book dealers and collectors. Assuming that he told the truth in his book, John Wesley Hardin killed many men, some with no justification whatever, others under circumstances which might have caused a lenient jury, in a favorable atmosphere, to bring in a verdict that he either killed in self defense or under sufficient provocation. Born in Fannin County, Texas, in 1853, reared in the backwash of the Civil War years, Hardin was peculiar as boy and man, even in an era when much was accepted, tolerated and forgiven in a frontier country. According to his own story, Hardin was a wayward boy, a head-

strong, unruly young man, a gambler and hard drinker as an adult, fond of owning and racing horses for high stakes, determined to have his own way in everything, regardless of the results to parents, wife, children, or society in general. Belatedly for his own good, Hardin wound up in the penitentiary at Huntsville and was confined there, still unruly and unrepentant, for many years, being finally pardoned. Apparently Hardin never suffered remorse as the result of any killing for which he was responsible. He appears to have been obsessed with the idea that he was always right, the other fellow to the encounter always wrong. Throughout the book it is made to appear that he nearly always emerged the victor in any fight, the hero of almost every incident. Consequently the book has a decided Walter Mitty flavor. Hardin grew up in a period when thousands of fellow Texans, with much less to go on in the way of education and opportunity, became respected, successful citizens. Hardin's attempt to justify his wayward conduct does not seem to measure up. No doubt a "kill or be killed" character, it is difficult to find a category for him in the southwestern album. Apparently he had no nerves and was a man of great physical strength and endurance. Was he a brave, courageous man? Reckless, daring, a swashbuckler, yes. Brave, chivalrous, no. In 1927, the McMillan Company, New York, published a reprint of the 1882 Pat F. Garrett's *Authentic Life of Billy the Kid*, with a foreword and extensive editorial notes by the late Maurice Garland Fulton, of Roswell, New Mexico. It is to be regretted that the Oklahoma U. Press and Mr. McCubbin did not collaborate in a like project. Inquiry at the Huntsville, Texas, penitentiary, where Hardin was confined for many years, might have yielded much record information, which in turn would have indicated worth while avenues of research, resulting in a harvest of interesting explanatory notes. Notwithstanding this lack, the Hardin book is a very worth while contribution, one that will be welcomed by a host of readers and collectors. Bob McCubbin and the publisher deserve the gratitude of all lovers of Southwestern history for their enterprise in publishing a valuable book at a reasonable price.

Albuquerque

WILLIAM A. KELEHER