

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 40 | Number 4

Article 6

10-1-1965

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 40, 4 (1965). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol40/iss4/6>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

- FORBES, *Warriors of the Colorado: The Yumas of the Quechan Nation and their Neighbors*, by Schroeder 341
- DILLON, *Meriwether Lewis*, by Deutsch 343
- HAFEN, ed., *The Mountain Men and the Fur Trade of the Far West*, by Porter 345
- SCHAEFER, *Heroes Without Glory: Some Goodmen of the Old West*, by Bayard 346
- ERWIN, *The Southwest of John Horton Slaughter*, by Keleher 348

WARRIORS OF THE COLORADO: THE YUMAS OF THE QUECHAN NATION AND THEIR NEIGHBORS. By Jack D. Forbes. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1965. Pp. xxii, 378. Index, bibliog., maps, illus. \$5.95.

THIS WORK is difficult to assess. Forbes's attempt to portray the history of the lower Colorado River region is commendable, though many will disagree with his interpretation of the part played by the Yumas in affecting the course of events prior to the late 1700's. Other readers either will be confused by the extreme detail (often irrelevant), concerned by the lack of reference to a number of pertinent sources, or confounded by Forbes's attempts to correlate hypotheses upon which archeologists and historians cannot agree. The book is too detailed for the lay reader and contains too many contradictions for the specialist. On the other hand, Forbes does present new material from documentary sources.

One gets the impression that the manuscript was prepared from a mass of annotated notes, including technical jargon, that were not fully digested by the author. If the University of Oklahoma Press referred the manuscript to a reader, who might have caught many of the weaknesses that mar this publication, the results do not show it.

The opening chapter attempts to present the prehistoric background of the Yuman-speaking groups along and on either side of the lower Colorado River. Forbes employs an archeological term (Ootam), which DiPeso coined to apply to prehistoric developments of southeastern Arizona, and uses it to refer to Piman-speakers of southern Arizona and Sonora in later chapters. In addition, not being familiar with the fallacy of DiPeso's dating of the appearance of the prehistoric Hohokam in southern Arizona, Forbes's attempt to reconcile DiPeso's dates with others generally accepted, as they relate to Yuman prehistory, fails miserably. His discussions and bibliography lack any reference to pertinent data from excavations at Snaketown and Willow Beach, the description and distribution of Lower Colorado Buff Ware on the Colorado, and the survey of the Painted Rocks area near Gila Bend. It is unfortunate that Forbes did not present the way of life of the prehistoric Yuman-speaking ancestors as known from archeology rather than involve himself in the details of controversial hypotheses. As the

presentation stands, it contains much archeological misinformation and tradition and practically nothing on the way of life in prehistoric times. The second chapter supposedly deals with the Yuma way of life in historic times, based primarily on documentary evidence. However, Forbes's wide use of the term Quechan (Yuma) masks the names of the ethnic group or groups involved and destroys the value of the descriptions based on documentary material. In his preface Forbes states that his use of the term Quechan refers to the Yumas (an ethnic group), yet he glibly uses this term to refer to all of the Yuman-speakers, including those on the Gila River. As a result, the distinction between the Yuma way of life and other Yuman groups is bound in a fog. The writing in this chapter is erratic, contains many Yuman terms, and exhibits several questionable statements such as Apaches, who were at the very least over 240 miles to the east of the Colorado River, being allied with the "Quechan League" on the river and implying that the Quechans frustrated Spanish expansion west for 300 years.

The third chapter, concerned with early Spanish expeditions into the area of interest, resurrects the old myth of a friar's entry into the Southwest in 1538 as though it were fact, uses the Spanish term for interpreter as a tribal name, fails to mention basic sources that worked out many of the historical details (such as Ives's 1959 study of Díaz' 1540 route west of the lower Colorado which is more acceptable than Forbes's reconstruction), makes use of documentary sources written many years after the fact upon which Forbes develops new themes and ideas opposed to the statements of contemporary sources, places the Yumas on the Colorado River prior to 1700, and even suggests that one group of Spaniards going up the Colorado turned back for fear of getting lost following this stream.

Spanish relations with Piman-speaking peoples of Sonora are covered in the next chapter, but ethnic identities are hidden under the term Ootam. Contacts with Yumans also are discussed. Statements here contradict others in chapter seven as well as within this chapter. Forbes translates "casas de terrados" (flat-roofed houses) of the Pimans of Sonora into "terraced houses." He also infers that the Spaniards were not able to conquer the Quechans, but fails to point out that by the time involved, the late 1600's, the Spaniards had only visited the Yumans briefly in 1540 and 1604-05.

The fifth and sixth chapters stand out in contrast to the preceding. Spanish-Yuman contacts of the 1770's and the Yuma revolt of 1781 are well-presented, and Forbes draws heavily on Bolton and other well-known sources. Chapter seven deals with the period after the revolt to the late Mexican period and is marred by several inaccurate statements. Forbes suggests

that the Yumas began unremitting warfare against tribes on the Gila River after the revolt. Father Kino, however, pointed out this situation existed at least as early as about 1700. Forbes also suggests that Apaches attacked in the Gila Bend area and erroneously gives the date of the 1826 American trapping party on the Colorado as 1827.

The next chapter details the many trips made in and about the lower Colorado during the Mexican period, some of which are space fillers. The dates of the Pattie episodes again are confused; and Forbes accepts the presence of Fraeb and Gervais and their trapping party on the Bill Williams Fork even though Favour in 1936 pointed out that this group was recorded on the Green River far to the north at this same time. Many pages are devoted to the missions of southern California in the 1830's and 1840's, apparently as a filler due to a lack of documentation on affairs of this period on the Colorado.

The last chapter deals with Forty-niner contacts with Yumans, army scouts in the region, and the establishment of Camp Yuma in the early 1850's, derived mostly from published journals, bringing to a close the history of Hispano-Mexican contacts with the Yumans of the lower Colorado River and neighboring areas.

Though Forbes brings out new data, one will have to continue to refer to Bolton and other works for the major trends in this region. "Thematic Changes in Yuman Warfare" by Dobyms, Ezell, Jones, and Ezell (1957), Treutlein's translation (1949) of Pfefferkorn's description of Sonora (which included the region north to the Gila River), and Ezell's "Hispanic Acculturation of the Gila River Pimas" (1961) are some of the pertinent works that Forbes did not consult.

National Park Service

ALBERT H. SCHROEDER

Santa Fe, N.M.

MERIWETHER LEWIS. By Richard Dillon. New York: Coward-McCann, Inc., 1965. Pp. xx, 364. Index, photographs. \$6.95.

IN VIEW of the insatiable interest in exploration and kindred subjects which deal with new vistas, this definitive biography of Meriwether Lewis is most welcome. More than a career study, it focuses attention on the central figure without losing touch with others on the scene.

Because of a most unfortunate dearth of material, the chapter on Lewis's family and youth is very short. Piecing together the fragments, the author is convincing in explaining how Lewis acquired the attributes which made him, if not "the ideal man" to lead the expedition, at least "the closest thing to the ideal person" and Jefferson's "unqualified choice." Pardonably,

there is only a faint clue as to how this national hero developed the traits of the perennial bachelor which may have had some bearing upon his later misfortune.

On the whole, the description of Jefferson's "Grand Design" from the first faint flashes of his brain or first scratches from his pen to its acceptance by Congress is adequate. There is mention of the misconception as to a narrow continent but no explanation, a point which, though negative, was by no means negligible in its import. Nor is there a casual reference as to whether the apocryphal accounts of earlier explorations may or may not have influenced the third President. Less pardonable is the oversight of which this author is by no means alone guilty, the failure to respond to the challenge which Frederick J. Teggart over a half century ago posed to subsequent researchers on Lewis and Clark. In his prospectus he urged scholars to ferret out the possible connection between the projects of the Missouri traders between 1792 and 1796 and the designs for American ventures. Truteau, Evans, and Mackay are all casually mentioned by Dillon but only the first is cited in the index.

Keeping the spotlight on Lewis, the expedition is presented interestingly and effectively from the blueprint stages, through its outfitting and organization, and from its departure from St. Louis in April 1804 to its return in September 1806. His capable leadership, his skill as negotiator with Indians, his conscientious researches, his faithfulness as a chronicler stand out prominently in the narrative.

Technically the suggestion that Jefferson's letter of credit to be used by Lewis read like a blank check is correct, but the possibility that it could have unplugged a horn of plenty in the wilderness or at the mouth of the Columbia was very remote. Despite the fact that one scholar and several writers have thoroughly discredited the assumption that Sacajawea ever acted as a guide to the expedition, one might still get that impression from this book. The element of false image is not nearly so serious as the fact that such miscasting obscures the true role of this humble Indian girl—that of the "Gentle Tamer"—which function, inconspicuous as it may seem, was by no means inconsequential or insignificant, particularly not on the frontier.

The appraisal of the expedition as given in the introduction and the summation which appears in a later chapter are sound but cursory and inadequate. The degree to which Lewis and Clark contributed to the myth of the "Great American Desert," the importance of the journals to taxonomy, the new vistas which were opened not only to Americans but peoples of the world and the impact these had upon culture and diplomacy can be surmised but are not clearly delineated.

Primary sources were exploited more extensively than the monographic literature. Assistance given by a large number of competent scholars is graciously acknowledged, but there is no evidence of any communication with Yale University under whose auspices Ernest S. Osgood published *The Field Notes of Captain William Clark* in 1964.

The last three chapters are good descriptions of the adulation, with a little disparagement mixed in, which the hero received on his return, of his frustrating experiences as governor of Upper Louisiana, and of the circumstances which attended his death on the Natchez Trace. These were as mysterious and unsolved as those in the assassinations of Abraham Lincoln and John F. Kennedy.

Washington State University

HERMAN J. DEUTSCH

THE MOUNTAIN MEN AND THE FUR TRADE OF THE FAR WEST. Edited by LeRoy R. Hafen. Glendale: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 1965. Pp. 397. Illus., map. \$14.50.

EVALUATION of this volume is difficult, inasmuch as it is announced as merely the first of a series of volumes, all under the same general title. Each is to consist of an "appropriate introductory monograph" on the fur trade or some related subject and from twenty to fifty biographies of "some 400 individual Mountain Men," each by a recognized authority. The term "Mountain Men" will be applied broadly, to include not merely trappers in the mountains but also fur traders in general "in the Upper Missouri Region, in the Southwest, and in the Oregon country." Since the "introductory monograph" occupies nearly half the volume and only twenty biographies are included, a total of at least nine volumes will be necessary to present the announced number of biographies. These volumes will be issued at intervals of approximately six months and the final volume will include an index to the entire series.

The volume under consideration appropriately begins with a well-documented "Brief History of the Fur Trade of the Far West." No such appropriateness, however, can be detected in the score of biographical sketches which follow and which have in common only the relative unimportance of their subjects. They include none of the top figures either among the organizers and managers of the principal fur companies or among the free trappers — no William H. Ashley, Jedediah Smith, Kenneth McKenzie, Jim Bridger, Kit Carson, or Ewing Young, not a single Chouteau, but two exceedingly obscure Sublettes. Several of the biographical subjects are included primarily or entirely because of their as-

sociations with important figures outside the fur trade, such as William Clark's protégé Jean-Baptiste Charbonneau and Francis Parkman's guide Henry Chatillon. Gabriel Franchere's title as "mountain man" was achieved, apparently, through his authorship of the first published volume on the Astoria enterprise. The two *Sublettes*' principal or only importance was that they were brothers of the two really important *Sublettes*: Jimmy Daugherty's claim to distinction is that he was believed to have been murdered by a Mexican helper. It could, of course, be argued that the more obscure mountain men are the very ones who should be included in such a biographical collection but a large part of those treated herein, such as James Clyman, Charles Larpenteur, Joseph L. Meek, and George Nidever, either left their reminiscences or have already been the subject of biographical treatment. One would think that such an introductory volume should include at least a few really important fur trade figures. The biographies which come closest to justifying themselves, for one reason or another, are those of Manuel Alvarez, New Mexican merchant and politician, the fabulous free trapper Mark Head, who was killed in the Taos insurrection, and Charles Town, trader with the Utes and victim of the Apache. An inconsistency in the documentation might also be noted; some sketches are fully footnoted while others are equipped only with a bibliography.

One cannot but wonder what monographs will preface the other volumes and whether any attempt will be made to coordinate them with the subsequent biographical sketches.

A biographical dictionary of the Western fur trade could be useful, but that its usefulness will be sufficient to justify the projected series of nine or more volumes at \$14.50 per volume is open to question. The larger libraries, particularly those which emphasize Western history, will probably feel it necessary to invest in the series, but smaller libraries and individuals may well hesitate. Students of Western history and particularly of the fur trade will await subsequent volumes with interest.

University of Oregon

KENNETH WIGGINS PORTER

HEROES WITHOUT GLORY: SOME GOODMEN OF THE OLD WEST. By Jack Schaefer. New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1965. Pp. xxii, 323. \$5.95.

WITH THE APPARENT love of the convert, Jack Schaefer has partially abandoned the surroundings of novelist and journalist familiar to him to write in the field of western history. He has set out to contribute to the

restoration of realism in western romance which has been, he feels, distorted and discredited by "gilders — sentimentalizers, glamorizers . . .," the University of Oklahoma Press through its Western Frontier Library, and others. He is not interested in correcting the historical errors introduced by the Ash Upsons and *The Police Gazette* type journals. Nor is he interested in analyzing these accounts in an effort to understand the early image of the West, the mind of the people of the early twentieth century, or any other similar academic pursuit. His intention is to direct the readers' attention to several of the West's men who had firm ethical standards, maintained their peculiar identities, and warrant recognition. They were "goodmen"; the fused adjective and the noun conveys much of the author's thesis.

The book includes short biographies of ten men who the author felt may be less known than they deserve. His selection included George Ruxton, Washakie, Portugee Phillips, Snowshoe Thompson, and other characters familiar to, but perhaps slighted by, western historians. Genealogical data is minimized. Moments of crisis and courage are recounted in vivid detail and other relevant fragments are appended to each biography, serving to give the reader broader perspective that might not otherwise be available. For example, Valentine McGillicuddy—who appears to be Mr. Schaefer's favorite subject among those "goodmen"—rises out of the text as an amazing character who did about all there was to do in the northern Great Plains of the late nineteenth century and met most of the contemporary first magnitude figures. He met George Custer, John Wesley Powell, Richard Irving Dodge, Red Cloud, George Crook, Bill Cody, Bill Hickok, Marcus Reno, Crazy Horse, Carl Schurz, and apparently many others. He was a doctor, surveyor, Indian agent, banker, organizer of a hydroelectric power company, college president, and performed in other capacities. In so doing he clearly contributed to the change which occurred in the West. In some ways McGillicuddy personified this changing West whereas the over-romanticized badguy made the transition only in the inaccurate relations exemplified by Hollywood's products. Clearly McGillicuddy perceived right, fought for it, and almost always succeeded. The same pattern prevails, perhaps to a lesser degree, from the biography of Grizzly Adams at the beginning of the book to that of Elfego Baca at the end. On the surface all of these individuals appear to be as casual, warm, and distinct as the author must feel the West itself to be.

The style of the book is informal. The major subdivisions within the essays, each essay, and the progression of essays are all clearly formalized so that the author's ideas and theses are not obscured in unnecessary ways. The informality occurs within the paragraphs. Too frequently for this

historian's taste the style appears to be a sort of a combination of eastern idea transfers and imprecise western terminology. "Tough hombres," "waddies," and characters who were a "mite peculiär" salt the text with regularity. Also phrases and clauses are employed as sentences, and expletives three or four times per page in an effort to add flavor and emphasis. The author has not taken similar liberties with historical information. Although most historians would be hard pressed to know intimately the figures within this diverse group, the facts seem to be correct and scrupulously observed by Mr. Schaefer.

All things considered the book is interesting and amusing. Jack Schaefer has successfully demonstrated that romance and reality fused in the lives of at least ten westerners; there was and is no need to fabricate romantic figurines. Most noteworthy is the fact that the author has a great sense of humor and a gift of transmitting this humor. Historians interested in locating some lively and true items can do so. Index, footnotes, and bibliography have been omitted, however.

Colorado State University

CHARLES J. BAYARD

THE SOUTHWEST OF JOHN HORTON SLAUGHTER, 1841-1922. By Allen A. Erwin. Glendale: Arthur H. Clark Co., 1965. Pp. 368. Illus., maps, bibliog., index. \$11.00.

DISPLAYING the sagacity and tenacity of Charles Siringo, author of *The Cowboy Detective*, in ferreting out the misdeeds of cattle and ore thieves, Allen A. Erwin has done a superb job of researching and a splendid bit of writing in *The Southwest of John H. Slaughter, 1841-1922*. Volume X of *Western Frontiersman Series*, and dedicated to Captain Burton C. Mossman, "of the Arizona Rangers," who was for many years a resident of Roswell, New Mexico, whose life story is told in *Cap Mossman, Last of the Great Cowmen*, by Frazier Hunt, the Slaughter book contains an interesting foreword about the volume itself, written by the late William McLeod Raine, perhaps his last bit of writing, and a foreword about the author, written by Ramon F. Adams, famed in southwestern literature for several books, among them, *Six Guns and Saddle Leather*, *The Rampaging Herd*, and *Burrs Under the Blanket*.

Taking up the scent of the trail in Texas, where John Horton Slaughter was born in 1841, Erwin traces Slaughter's footsteps through Texas, through the Seven Rivers country, then in Lincoln County, New Mexico, and finally to the Arizona-Mexican border where Slaughter established the San Bernardino Ranch, ran cattle for forty years, and achieved much

as a law enforcement officer. In a country infested by outlaws, it was inevitable that a reluctant John Slaughter would be persuaded to become a candidate for sheriff of Cochise County. He was elected to that office on a law and order platform in 1886, and reelected in 1888. While sheriff it was not surprising, although somewhat unfortunate, that Slaughter, as was the custom of the day, availed himself of the opportunity to pin deputy sheriffs' badges on Burt Alvord, Billy Stiles, and other men handy with a gun, notwithstanding the fact that they were well known in the community to have reputations described as being a "cross between a deputy sheriff and an outlaw."

Weighing all of the many facts recited concerning his private life and official career, Slaughter does not emerge from Erwin's book as a particularly attractive character with a definite claim to distinction as an outstanding law enforcement officer with an assured place in the Southwest's Hall of Fame. The author covers extensive territory in his book, and ties Slaughter in with the mainstream of events over a long period of time. Slaughter, according to Erwin, in dealing with outlaws and hunting them down, relied to some extent on intuition, a rather dangerous ingredient in a tight place. A frontier sheriff endowed with extrasensory perception is a novelty in the lore of law officers in the southwest, and in this particular area the author strikes an entirely new and interesting note.

All in all Erwin has written a book which will prove of much value as a historical summation of an important era in the southwest.

Albuquerque, N.M.

W. A. KELEHER

HISTORICAL SOCIETY OF NEW MEXICO

MEMBERSHIP INFORMATION

Memberships in the Historical Society of New Mexico include a subscription to **NEW MEXICO HISTORICAL REVIEW**

Individual Active Member
\$6 annually

Contributing Member
\$10 or more annually

Institutional Member
\$6 annually

Life Member
\$100 or more in one payment

Advisory Council Member
\$1000 or more

Amounts of more than \$1000 may be pledged and paid at the discretion of the donor. Advisory Council members serve for life, and they select, each odd-numbered year, two members of the Board of Directors of the Historical Society of New Mexico.

Payments for membership should be sent to The University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque, New Mexico 87106.

The Historical Society of New Mexico is a nonprofit corporation under the laws of the State of New Mexico, and donations to it are income-tax deductible.