New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 39 | Number 2 Article 5

4-1-1964

Book Reviews

Book Reviews

The Cerro Colorado Site and Pithouse Architecture in the Southwestern United States Prior to A.D. 900. By William R. Bullard Jr. Paper of the Peabody Museum of Archaeology and Ethnology, Harvard University. Vol. 44, No. 2, 1962. Pp. 205, 8 tables, 44 plates. $6.50.

This volume is the second major publication from the Upper Gila Expedition of the Peabody Museum and includes three somewhat separate sections: (1) a report on the excavations of the Cerro Colorado site near Quemado in west central New Mexico, (2) a review and critique of Anasazi, Mogollón and Hohokam chronology prior to A.D. 900, and (3) a comparative survey of pithouse architecture in the Southwest for the same period. The details will be mainly of interest to specialists in Southwestern archeology, but historians will be interested in the bases for chronology and in the general picture of cultural development which emerges.

The Cerro Colorado village site was a relatively large community situated in the upper little Colorado drainage, a few miles west of the continental divide and just north of the divide between the upper Gila and Little Colorado drainages. This village of some 50 pithouses was occupied from some time in the sixth century to about A.D. 750, and was followed by a period (Pueblo I) of scattered small pueblos which gradually increased in size to around 20 rooms on the average during Pueblo III. After 1300, only a few large sites remained, and the area was later abandoned, the survivors probably moving north to the Zuñi region. There is now evidence from pollen studies that these variations are probably ecological adjustments to environmental changes in the character and amount of rainfall, as well as the result of increasing interaction between Anasazi and Mogollón communities in this transition area.

Dr. Bullard's review of Southwestern chronologies is

important, since a number of alternative interpretations have been offered. The Anasazi sequences, based on Tree-ring studies and pottery correlations, is accepted, but the Mogollón periods are questioned and the author proposes a "nuclear" and "peripheral" Mogollón area with somewhat different characteristics and development. The Hohokam, with at least four differing chronologies, is shown to be in need of future excavation to resolve the contradictions. His major conclusion with regard to chronology is that there is no clear evidence that any of the Hohokam or Mogollón cultures are demonstrably older than Basketmaker III. But this conclusion is achieved by doubting the radio carbon dates which take the place of dendrochronology in the Mogollón areas, and questioning the stratigraphy of Tularosa Cave.

The third section contains a detailed comparative study of pithouse structures prior to A. D. 900 with reference to settlement pattern, orientation, shape, size, and details of construction. Pithouses are assumed to be an ancient trait in both the Old and New Worlds, and therefore are presumed to be in the Southwest through diffusion from a common source. The variations found, however, suggest a number of independent developments in the Anasazi and Mogollón regions. Bullard concludes (p. 189): "By and large, the picture that emerges from the architectural study corresponds closely with that which can be obtained from ceramics, in regard to both chronology and the relationships between areas and their subdivisions. Discrepancies are surprisingly few. The most outstanding is the similarity between early Hohokam and early Mogollón ceramics and the dissimilarity of their architecture. Another, of less importance, is the architectural unity but ceramic diversity during Pueblo I within the Northern San Juan Region."

In the post war period there has been a reluctance on the part of archeologists concerned with the Anasazi region to recognize the parallel developments to the South. Dr. Bullard's "map of regions and areas" stops at the border, which

cuts off roughly half of the Mogollón area, and limits the Hohokam area to the Phoenix-Tucson region. The recent delineation of the "Desert Culture" as ancestral to much of the specialized developments in the Southwest, and the recognition that ecological factors may be responsible for certain of the similarities and differences, will put these tentative conclusions in broader perspective. The need for more excavation is apparent, and Emil Haury's plans for future work at Snaketown on the earlier sequences of Hohokam will be of crucial importance. But equally important, as Dr. Bullard notes, "is the need for continual reappraisals of older concepts in the light of new data." His view of the early Southwest through the medium of architecture has given us new insights and has presented new problems.

We await the next reappraisal and have suggested one or two of the factors which might be considered.

University of Chicago Fred Eggan

Jew and Mormon: Historic Group Relations and Religious Outlook. By Dr. Rudolf Glanz. Published with the help of the Lucius N. Littauer Foundation. New York: Waldon Press, Inc. 1963. Pp. ix, 379.

Dr. Rudolf Glanz has been responsible for several studies that treat the relationship of the Jews with various segments of our American communities: His *Jew and Yankee* appeared in 1944; *Jews in Relation to the Cultural Milieu of the Germans in America up to the Eighteen Eighties,* in 1947; *The Jews in American Alaska, 1867-1880,* was published in 1953; *The "Bayer" and the "Pollack" in America,* in 1955; *The Jews of California from the Discovery of Gold Until 1880,* New York, 1960; and the *Jew in the Old American Folklore,* New York, 1961.

Earlier studies of the Jews in Utah and their relationship with the Mormons have been done by the Daughters of the Utah Pioneers and by Leon L. Watters. The place of the Jews, or the Children of Israel, in Mormon concepts is an

interesting one since Mormons doctrinally are either in actuality or by adoption themselves of Israel. The American Indians as descendants of Book of Mormon peoples are also held to be—not specifically of Jewish descent—but of the House of Israel.

The author gives attention to the various aspects of the peculiar relationships between Jew and Mormon. The following chapter headings are indicative of the variety of interests he deals with: "Indian-Israel in Mormonism," the "Mormon Bible," "Zion in America," the "Gentile, and the Jew as a Gentile," "Ephraim: Mixed Among the Nations," the Mormon concept of the "Restoration of the Jews," the "School of Prophets and Bible Language," "The Resident Jewish Merchant Class and the Rise of a Gentile Front, Religious Life and Social Contact with the Mormons," "Jews and Jewish Matters in the Mormon Press," and "The Jewish Press on Mormons and Mormonism." It is pointed out that by and large the Mormons and Jews got along famously together, but that there were some sources of conflict or embarrassment such as the idea held not only by Mormons but by many other early students of the American Indian that the Indians were descendants of the Jews, or of Israel.

Since its justification of the belief in polygamy was found in the Old Testament (which of course is the Jewish Bible) and since the Jews themselves were a monogamous people, Mormon belief in polygamy became a source of difficulty for Jews as they immigrated to America which called for continual explanation by them of their position in relation to this question.

One of the reasons the leaders of the Mormons had selected the Salt Lake Valley for a place of settlement was because they wished to find a place where their followers could develop away from the pressures they had found at Kirtland, in Missouri and at Nauvoo, Illinois. However, Salt Lake City became a stopping place on the route to the gold fields and, as the west developed, many enterprising merchants saw this Zion in the wilderness as a place of

economic opportunity. Soon every traveler who crossed America by the central route tended to spend a few days in Salt Lake City and its environs, and many of them wrote a book describing their travels in which a few pages or a chapter were devoted to Utah and the Mormons. Brigham Young soon found that the "Gentile" merchants were too much competition for his idea of an independent commonwealth. The cooperative movement among the Mormons was his answer to the problem. It became improper to trade with Gentile merchants. In this case the Jews tended to be classed with the Gentiles, although there was a difference, and most of the Jewish merchants weathered the storm and were able to stay on in Utah.

Dr. Glanz's quotations pertaining to the Jews from the Mormon press are most interesting, and it was surprising to me to learn the extent to which Mormons were mentioned in the Jewish press, not only in the eastern part of the United States, but in Europe as well. The author has done a thorough job of combing the sources for information and has in most cases competently analyzed the position of the Jew in Mormon thought during the various periods.

In his chapter treating Biblicism and Mormonism, it is suggested that there is little use of Biblical names in Utah. In order to make a fair analysis it would have been necessary for the author to extend his survey to the geographical area originally taken in by the suggested State of Deseret, and that he also consider the names of stakes and wards which are as basic a part of Mormon geography as names of towns. Actually, there is a Goshen Street in Salt Lake City and a Sharon Stake in the Provo area, and at least a dozen other Biblical names are found in the greater area of Mormon settlement included in the original State of Deseret. Also Mormon scriptures include the *Book of Mormon,* the *Doctrine and Covenants,* and the *Pearl of Great Price* as well as the *Bible;* and *Book of Mormon* names particularly are scattered geographically throughout Mormondom and are used liberally for given names in Mormon families.

Although reading this book will be a rewarding experience for both Jew and Mormon as well as others interested in Americana, the work would have been improved if the copy had been more closely checked for spelling errors prior to publication, if a complete bibliography in addition to the footnotes had been included, and if an index could have been provided to assist the serious reader in ferreting out details from the work. All in all, however, the author is to be complimented for the labor that has gone into this publication and for the wealth of detailed information it contains. This is a worthy addition to his previous works pertaining to the Jew in America.

Brigham Young University S. Lyman Tylor

A Guide to the Manuscript Collections of the Bancroft Library. Edited by Dale L. Morgan and George P. Hammond. University of California Press, Berkeley and Los Angeles, 1963. Pp. vii, 379. Index. $15.00 (Bancroft Library Publications, Bibliographical Series, vol. I. *Pacific and Western Manuscripts*—except California).

The library of H. H. Bancroft was purchased in 1905 by the University of California. The footnotes in the 39 volumes of Bancroft's *Works* were the only guide to the collection except that as additions were made to the library the memory of the oldest employee became increasingly important in finding a particular document. In order to remedy this unsatisfactory "catalogue" a comprehensive revision of the system was started in 1947. This publication is the first fruit of a planned three volume guide.

Volume I contains all the materials that relate to the West from Alaska to Arizona and Texas to Hawaii with the exception of California materials which will be published in a separate volume. The documents are grouped by states except that the last group is entitled the *West and Misc.* The documents are arranged according to the alphabet within each group.

A valuable feature of the Guide is the Index which provides cross references between the groups. For instance, the documents for New Mexico are listed on pages 81 to 96, but the Index provides 27 references to New Mexico items in other groups.

Despite the fifteen years involved in preparing this guide, the results more than justify the time devoted to its preparation. The book will be a boon to every scholar who uses the Bancroft Library because it supersedes the older system that had the earmarks of the old proverb, "hunting for a needle in a haystack." The Director and his associates can be justifiably proud of their accomplishment. I wonder, however, whether A. Peterson was discharged from the army at Fort Sumner in *1861* (p. 227).

F. D. R.

The A. B. Gray Report and . . . reminiscences of Peter R. Brady. . . . Edited by L. R. Bailey. Los Angeles 41: Westernlore Press, 1963. Pp. xix, 240. Illus., map. $5.95.

The promoters of the Texas Western Railroad employed A. B. Gray, an experienced surveyor who was acquainted with the western country, to survey a route for a railroad along the thirty second parallel in 1854. This he did in his usual competant fashion; but in preparing a report for his employers, he left a reference book that is useful in more ways than one for specialists in the region from Texas to California. It is rich in the description of the country: the natural resources, geography, and settlements.

Gray's Report, a business-like document, is accompanied by the more humanistic memoirs of Brady that complement the Report very well, and also present a picture of the leader that could not be drawn from his own account. The whole is rendered more pleasing, if not more valuable as a source, by the numerous well-drawn illustrations of Charles Shuchard, an artist who accompanied the expedition.

Gray is not always correct in details, but those who use the Report for reference can be critical and others read it for

pleasure. A few of the editorial notes are inaccurate: Footnote 10 does not give the correct date for the founding of Fort Belknap. Cf. A. B. Bender in NEW MEXICO HISTORICAL REVIEW, 16:129 (April, 1941); the information in footnote 12 has no relation to the textual passage that it is supposed to clarify; the information in Note 28 is contradicted, and rightfully so, by Gray in the text (p. 43); Note 31 is wrong because Bartlett was writing about the old presidio of Fronteras in Sonora, not the site of Frontera north of El Paso; in Note 46 the word *vista* should read *visita*—a typographical error; in Note 57, *ajo* does mean "garlic" as Barnes writes, but it also means rouge and color which fit Gray's statement.

The slips in annotating the report do not detract from its usefulness for students of the Southwest. It is volume 24 of the Great West and Indian Series. Since only 900 copies are for sale, it might become a collector's item as the first printing of Gray's Report in 1856. Brady's Reminiscences first appeared serially in the *Arizona Citizen*, 1898.

F. D. R.

Indian Art in America. By Frederick J. Dockstader. Greenwich, Connecticut: New York Graphic Society, 1961. Pp. 224. Illustrations (part colored), map, bibliography. $25.00.

From the early pre-Columbian era to the present day, art in many forms has been an integral and important part of American Indian life. Ranging from the strictly utilitarian to the purely aesthetic, its styles of expression are as varied as the many indigenous cultures which produced it. Environmental factors, strong regionalism, religious associations, tribal traditions, functionalism, outside influences, and the close relationship between form and available materials all had a definite bearing upon the art manifestations of the native population of America in pre-historic as well as in historic times. From the bone and ivory craft of the northern Eskimo through the quill and beadwork of the Great Plains

tribes to the masterly stonecarving of the Southeast, this art of the North American Indian forms a significant facet of our own cultural heritage, worthy to be ranked, for sheer beauty and strength, with the best from comparable periods anywhere else in the world.

The author has purposely limited his subject to the work of the Indian groups living north of Mexico, dividing their vast territory into nine major areas, each with its own distinctive cultural characteristics and artistic expressions. A scholarly introduction concerning the general background and nature of Indian art, prehistoric as well as modern, provides the reader with a thorough appreciation and understanding of the objects presented through the medium of superb color plates and a wealth of black and white illustrations, together with a short commentary concerning each article depicted. Many of these illustrations, here published for the first time, are of items from the fabulous collections of the Museum of the American Indian, Heye Foundation, New York, of which Dr. Dockstader is the director. A three-page bibliography covering major culture areas and techniques, as well as general works on Indian art, adds greatly to the usefulness of the publication.

An outgrowth of the Carnegie Study of the Arts of the United States, this magnificent volume is one for which there has long been a great need. Textwise, it is a worthy successor to *Indian Arts in North America,* by George C. Vaillant (N. Y., Harper, 1939) and *Indian Art of the United States* (N. Y. Museum of Modern Art, 1941), by Frederic H. Douglas and Rene d'Harnoncourt, which did so much during past decades to stimulate interest in the native art of this country's first inhabitants. Pictorially, Frederick Dockstader's book far surpasses earlier works in the same field. *Indian Art in America* should be widely used as a source of reference by anthropologists, teachers, students, and laymen.

Arizona State University GERTRUDE HILL