New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 43 | Number 3 Article 6

7-1-1968

Book Reviews

Book Reviews

THE NAVAJO INDIANS AND FEDERAL INDIAN POLICY, 1900-1935. By Lawrence C. Kelly. Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 1968. Pp. x, 222. Maps, tables, bibliog., index. $7.50.

A CONTINUING interest in the American Indian is one of the distinguishing characteristics of American history. Bibliographies abound and library shelves sag under the weight of the many books, articles and reports that attempt to interpret the role of the Indian in American historical development. Warfare and violence, involving both red and white men, have been especially fashionable, while studies of removal, missionary activity, tribal economy, civil rights and the machinations of treaty making are available in considerable quantity. More recently, with the rediscovery of the Indian by the ethnologist, the emphasis has shifted to culture and social change.

By contrast, few scholarly accounts of national Indian policy and administration are available, and those that are deal mainly with developments in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. The surprising lack of a general, comprehensive study of federal Indian policy is matched by a near void of published, interpretive material for the twentieth century. It is this "dark age" of Indian policy historiography that Professor Kelly seeks, in part, to illuminate.

The Navajos are a good choice for studying Indian policy in this century. They are the most populous tribe and the object of the Indian Bureau's greatest attention in recent years. Utilizing the appropriate government letter files and documents, and selected private collections (e.g., the Dietrich-Hagerman Collection and the Hugh L. Scott Papers) the author has carefully described the mostly abortive attempts to expand the Navajo domain, the impact of the discovery of oil on their reservation and repeated attempts to implement a workable policy of scientific range management. In so doing he has put into print for the first time a meaningful account of a complex but significant era of Indian policy and administration.

Of necessity Professor Kelly deals with an array of legislative maneuvers that in the aggregate portray the contending policies of the Harding-Fall-Burke as opposed to Roosevelt-Ickes-Collier administrations. Especially suggestive is his sympathetic treatment of Herbert J. Hagerman, who was appointed Special Commissioner by Secretary Fall in 1923. Like Burke, Hagerman was generally suspicious of the radical reforms of men like John Collier, who, explains the author, "got no more land for the Navajos than Hagerman had anticipated and [who] stirred up a great deal of ill-will against them." However, the author's attempt to detach Hagerman from the Fall-Hayden-Bursum camp on the Navajo land question is not much more convincing than his attempt to characterize Hagerman as a pioneer in the Tribal Council movement.

It is one thing to accuse Collier of allowing "his zeal for reform to get the best of his judgment," but quite another to support such an assertion. This appears evident in what the author calls the "myth" of the Navajo Tribal Council as a "yes-man's" organization, a concept allegedly worked out by Collier and seized upon by unsuspecting anthropologists.

Collier's rather vocal criticism of his predecessors is a matter of historical record. Indeed, his flamboyant asides and testimony during the Wheeler-Howard hearings might be considered as politically astute as Hagerman's realism, but in any case, more evidence is needed to support the case for a viable Navajo Council prior to its reorganization by Collier. In the absence of conclusive evidence that Hagerman could justify his watchdog role with the Council on grounds that "Collier would proceed to stir up the Navajos as he had the Pueblos," and the author's admission that minutes for at least the first (and perhaps most important) meeting of the Council under Hagerman are "extremely short [and] no doubt omit at least as much as they include," it is perhaps wise to view the whole matter with caution. Moreover, it should be remembered that to judge a tribal council's leadership qualities involves, in addition to incipient intra-tribal factionalism and the directives of men like Hagerman or Collier, a consideration of its relationship to the rank and file tribal majority. Finally, the vested interests within the council and their relationship to government officials may be difficult to document, but certainly they are crucial to any general revision of the so-called "yes-man" thesis.

Professor Kelly has written a challenging and important book, one that will do much to free Indian policy research and writing from the shackles of overemphasizing the nineteenth century. It is hoped that he and others will continue the work on the basis of the ground rules now established.

Wichita State University WILLIAM E. UNRAU

FIREARMS, TRAPS, & TOOLS OF THE MOUNTAIN MEN. By Carl P. Russell. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc., 1967. Pp. xviii, 448, x. Illus., apps., bibliog., index. $12.50.

I KNOW of no person or author more qualified than Dr. Carl P. Russell to write this book on the equipment used by the Mountain Men. He joined the National Park Service in 1923, and his work introduced him to the fabulous world of the early fur trade. In 1931 Dr. Russell began serious research in this field. By 1946 he was able to persuade the Jefferson National Expansion Memorial to employ Mr. James Mulcahy, New York artist, and

to assign staff artist, William Macy, to draw the illustrations for a proposed set of books on fur trade history.

To further the interest in this project, Dr. Russell wrote an article entitled, "Picture Books of the Fur Trade History," which was published in the *Bulletin* of the Missouri Historical Society in April 1948. This article revealed Dr. Russell's plan to publish three books in this series: Volume I to feature trade goods and personal equipment and supplies of the trappers; Volume II, significant events and typical procedures of the western fur trade from 1804 to 1843; and Volume III, distinguished people related to the trade. Some time between 1948 and 1957 Dr. Russell apparently revised his plans when he published his first book of the series, *Guns on the Early Frontiers* (University of California Press, 1957). This was a history of firearms from colonial times through the years of the western fur trade.

In letters to the reviewer in early 1961, Dr. Russell told of his problems in locating material, especially additional illustrations. Later letters reveal that he had again changed the context of the series, for he wrote of his search for matériel and hardware of the trappers. It would seem that he now planned at least three volumes to cover the material originally scheduled for Volume I. The third volume would necessarily deal with the personal equipment of the trappers not covered in the first two volumes of the new series. Our correspondence did not reveal his intentions with regard to the last two volumes of the original series. Dr. Russell's untimely death in 1967, just before the release of this book, has precluded the fulfillment of his dreams and plans. It is the hope of the reviewer that the rest of his long research will not have been made in vain and that some other qualified author will make use of this material and conclude the series.

Divided into seven chapters, the book gives an excellent description of the Mountain Men in American history, the firearms of the beaver hunters, beaver traps and trapping, knives of the frontiersmen, the ax on America's frontiers, miscellaneous iron tools, and early blacksmiths. In the appendices are articles on history-archaeology, an inventory of tools at a trading post on the Columbia River in 1812, the markings on axes and tomahawks, and a Fur Return of the American Fur Company in 1839.

Firearms, Traps, & Tools of the Mountain Men will long be a standard reference book for museums and libraries as well as for the many fans of the early fur trade period. With over four hundred illustrations, pieces of equipment will no longer be confusing words, but tangible objects. The many notes used by Dr. Russell are appropriately placed at the bottom of the pages, handy for the reader's use. The few mistakes in this well-written book are too insignificant to list, or to bother the reader. That the book is well documented is manifested by 22 pages of bibliography, which will be of great assistance to future researchers in this field.

Alfred A. Knopf has again, as usual, printed a handsome volume, though priced at $12.50—a cost which may limit its sales—and the reviewer highly recommends it.

Kit Carson Home and Museum JACK K. BOYER
Taos, N. M.

THE ROCKY MOUNTAIN JOURNALS OF WILLIAM MARSHALL ANDERSON: THE WEST IN 1834. Ed. by Dale L. Morgan and Eleanor Towles Harris. San Marino, Calif.: The Huntington Library, 1967. Pp. viii, 432. Illus., map, bibliog., index. $12.50.

ON MARCH 13, 1834, twenty-seven-year old William Marshall Anderson left his native Kentucky to begin an adventure that took him into the heart of the Rocky Mountain West and the domain of the redoubtable Mountain Man. Seeking to regain his strength following a bout with yellow fever, Anderson joined the fur trade caravan of William Sublette as it left Missouri for the Green River in what is now southwestern Wyoming. On September 30, he returned to St. Louis a full fifty pounds heavier, carrying two slim volumes in which he had recorded his impressions of the journey.

After his return to Kentucky, Anderson expanded the diary into what is termed his journal, and in 1871 he wrote a third version of the trip, more lengthy than either of its predecessors but dealing only with the period from March 3 to June 30. The last account originally appeared in four issues of the Circleville, Ohio, *Democrat and Watchman* and has since been reprinted in part a number of times, most recently in 1962 in *Frontier Omnibus,* edited by John W. Hakola. The recently discovered diary, the 1871 narrative, and parts of the journal are reproduced in the present volume.

The Anderson account is of great interest to students of the fur trade. It is the only known record of the Sublette expedition, and it is the first to provide a day-by-day description of a fur trade rendezvous. Anderson was an eyewitness to the founding of the first Fort Laramie, and he was the sole chronicler present when Fitzpatrick, Sublette & Bridger merged with Fontenelle, Drips & Co. on August 3, 1834. Trail historians will also welcome the appearance of the volume. The route followed by Sublette was that which became the Oregon Trail, and Anderson gives one of the earlier descriptions of its great landmarks.

The scholarship of the editors is a bonus and perhaps of as much value as the documents themselves. Dale Morgan, long one of the outstanding historians of the fur trade, and Eleanor Harris, formerly editor in charge of publications for the Huntington Library, have combined their talents to produce an amazing amount of explanatory and supplementary material. The introduction to the volume turns out to be a very concise and informative history of the fur trade in the Rocky Mountain area prior to the Sublette expedition and a review and analysis of other travel accounts of a similar nature written before 1834. The introduction is followed by a twenty-one page biography of Anderson, the diary, the narrative, parts of the journal, and what the editors entitle a "Galaxy of Mountain Men:" forty-five extended biographical sketches of the principal personalities in the drama. For the first time such major figures as Lucien Fontenelle and Andrew Drips are given adequate biographical coverage, and even the sketches of such often written about mountain men as Jim Bridger and Kit Carson contain new facts and correct old errors. In this regard—as a reference work— the volume belongs in the library of every fur trade specialist.

The general reader will find this book tough going. For example, the diary and the narrative (supplemented and finally replaced by the journal) are printed on facing pages throughout, the diary on the left and the expanded version on the right. Both accounts are copiously footnoted. This permits careful comparison and explication, but it hardly makes for smooth reading.

National Park Service JOHN D. MCDERMOTT
Washington, D.C.

SONGS OF THE AMERICAN WEST. Comp. and ed. by Richard E. Lingenfelter, Richard A. Dwyer, and David Cohen. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1968. Pp. xii, 596. Illus., bibliog., chord chart, index. $17.50.

THIS LARGE BOOK, with almost three hundred song texts and one hundred sixty different printed tunes, presents a special kind of inside view of various movements and attitudes of the American West from the 1840's to 1929. The editors believe this special vision of history, coming from the songs of the period, may be more succinct, more personal, more spontaneous than that "articulated in weightier volumes." They are addressing the readers who ". . . would understand those huddled pioneers through the

kind of gists and piths that only their songs provide, and of any who would probe those songs themselves to learn what subjects came to replace the good things of home" as well as those who "would sing a good song and be fined or not. . . ."

It is a great convenience to have so many tunes and texts from and about the West gathered together in one volume. The bibliography, listing all the known printings of each song, is useful. The printing is clear, with remarkably few errors in texts and tunes. The drawings by Steven M. Johnson add to the visual excellence of this book.

The thirty-four sections are organized, generally, as to occupations of those who came to the West, and in the order in which these various groups came to some kind of dominance. The editors of the song texts, Mr. Lingenfelter, a research geophysicist at the Institute of Geophysics and Planetary Physics at the University of California, and Mr. Dwyer, Assistant Professor of English at the University of Florida, introduce each section with brief commentaries, using passages from the song texts to illustrate various historical events. These commentaries, like the song texts themselves, are written in a lively, personal style.

There is a brief "musical afterword" by the music editor, Mr. Cohen, Director of the Ash Grove School of Traditional Folk Music in Los Angeles, in which he discusses some of the problems encountered, and his solution of them. His hope is that the majority of readers will use the collection for singing, thus his criterion for choosing the tunes was "singability." From that standpoint the collection of tunes is superior. For the reader who would "probe those songs" as well as sing them, more information would be helpful, such as tempo marks for the twenty transcriptions Mr. Cohen made from tape recordings and records, knowing whether the harmonies in these transcriptions are as found in the recordings or supplied by Mr. Cohen, and indeed, more information about the harmony of all the tunes. Mr. Cohen suspects the melodies were sung without accompaniment, but he has added guitar chords for almost all of them. He is justified in doing this, as most of the melodies grew out of simple traditional European harmony and the implications for harmony are quite clear. The chords Mr. Cohen has supplied, however, are very frequently different from what the melody implies they should be. If Mr. Cohen, who is familiar with the idiom of folk harmony, had discussed in some detail why he chose particular harmonies, a valuable dimension would have been added to the book. It would also be interesting to know whether any songs from the Spanish Southwest affected the thought and music of the immigrants of this period.

The book is conceived imaginatively and a great amount of careful work has gone into the editing. The premise that a special view of history may

be gained through working with texts and tunes and commentary might well be realized by the imaginative reader. And those who "would sing a good song and be fined or not" will likewise find it rewarding.

Museum of New Mexico RICHARD B. STARK
Santa Fe, N.M.

WILL JAMES, THE GILT-EDGED COWBOY. By Anthony Amaral. Los Angeles: Westernlore Press, 1967. Pp. xvi, 207. Illus., bibliog., index. $7.50.

WILL JAMES, the very convincing author-illustrator of cowboy life, beguiled legions of admirers of the western horseman by his authentic characterizations. Romantic, nostalgic, and charmed, as many were early in this century by the cowboy, James struggled "to keep alive what is passing" through tales, stories, sketches, and paintings. In so doing he perpetuated one of the most astounding myths to come from the sagebrush country.

When author Anthony Amaral subjects James' own experiences, as told in *The Lone Cowboy: My Life Story,* to the searching light of truth he uncovers more myth than reality. The latter points to a Quebec-French parentage, a strangely foreign-sounding name, an improbable pathetic childhood, a restless somewhat shiftless adulthood leading to a prison term, many heroic dreams, a stint of riding with the "wild bunch" of rodeo and motion pictures, a successful literary and artistic career, and long boozy bouts which took him to an early grave in 1942.

The title of his autobiography, *The Lone Cowboy,* is suspect and might well be a clue to the mystery of his life. J. Frank Dobie, an eminent stickler for facts and also a connoisseur of legend wrote in his priceless volume, *Life and Literature of the Southwest,* that James' life story "is without a date or a geographical location less generalized than the space between Canada and Mexico."

In light of Amaral's sleuthing, hindsight now betrays that much of James' artistic and literary output is concerned with a traditional objective approach to subject matter; too often it has the tendency to lull the viewer and reader to be content and pleasantly reassured by its "rightness." *The Gilt-Edged Cowboy* may not satisfy the artistic or literary admirers of Will James, but it is a reasonable satisfying explanation of why he rode his personal range as he did. James was a cowboy but only briefly and certainly not born to saddle leather and sweat. It is difficult to determine the reasons for the dust he stirred to obscure his trail. Regardless of his intentions he succeeded in establishing a myth, living the role, and riding into the sunset as the image of the hero he honored and loved.

In revealing the hidden Will James, the author does it with dignity and respect, and always with appreciation of the complexities of his discovery if not with complete understanding.

Photographs of family and friends, and scenes of the country bolster a rather typical selection of James' own work. For the collector of "cowboy-ana" this book will be a noteworthy addition.

University of Colorado CLIFFORD P. WESTERMEIER

MY ADVENTURES IN ZUÑI. By Frank H. Cushing. Introduction by Oakah L. Jones, Jr. Facsimile reprint. Palmer Lake, Colo.: Filter Press, 1967. Pp. x, 50. Illus. $2.00.

THIS resurrection of Cushing's 1882-83 *Century Magazine* articles brings under one cover the observations of an astute student among the Zuñi. His "adventures" among these people provide a word picture of an old way of life, some scenes of which are preserved in a variety of contemporary illustrations.

The introduction provides a background on the history of the Pueblo of Zuñi for the purpose of this reprint, though Jones erroneously derives the prehistoric Zuñi out of The Four Corners country rather than from an earlier development in the Zuñi locale. He further suggests that present Zuñi, the one and only Halona of historic times, was founded as a new community after the Pueblo Rebellion of 1680-92. This village represents a consolidation during those trying times of four pueblos into the previously existing village of Halona.

These articles originally appeared in three sections. The first covers the period of Cushing's departure from the Smithsonian Institution in Washington and his arrival and first few months in residence at Zuñi. His reactions and detailed descriptions reflect the fabric of this dedicated and tireless worker as well as the suspicions held by the Zuñi toward this stranger in their midst.

The second article spans the period during which Cushing continually pries into the ways of the Zuñi. The Zuñi, somewhat perturbed by his actions, in turn slowly convert Cushing to some of their routine and daily customs and bring about his adoption among the Corn people. By this move they convert his status from that of a stranger to a member of the tribe, thus reducing the adverse effect of Cushing's growing knowledge of Zuñi ritual.

The final article finds Cushing becoming more deeply involved in Zuñi ceremonials, their language, and the well-regulated life of those people. He

closes his observations by reflecting on the Zuñi spiritualistic attitude toward their future in the other world.

The reviewer's copy was poorly inked, the text being noticeably faint on a number of pages, but it can be hoped that most of this printing produced better impressions. This in no way detracts from Cushing's interesting "adventures."

National Park Service ALBERT H. SCHROEDER
Santa Fe, N. M.

ERRATA: Mr. Price R. Cross of Rome, Georgia, has pointed out two misrenderings of names in "Dennis Chavez and Roosevelt's 'Court-Packing' Plan," by Barry A. Crouch, NMHR, vol. 42, no. 4 (October 1967). On page 262, "Senator *Anson* A. Jones" should read "*Andrieus* A. Jones," and on page 264, "Judge *Manuel* A. Otero, Jr." should read "Judge *Miguel* A. Otero, Jr."