

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 45 | Number 1

Article 5

1-1-1970

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 45, 1 (). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol45/iss1/5>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

- HUTCHINSON, *Frontier Settlement in Mexican California: The Hija-Padrés Colony, and its Origins, 1769-1835*, by Hammond 84
- NICHOLS, ed., *The Missouri Expedition 1818-1820: The Journal of Surgeon John Gale With Related Documents*, by Nasatir 86
- DILLON, *Wells, Fargo Detective: The Biography of James B. Hume*, by Jackson 87
- MOMADAY, *The Way to Rainy Mountain*, by Wynn 89
- FAULK, *The Geronimo Campaign*, by Wilson 90

FRONTIER SETTLEMENT IN MEXICAN CALIFORNIA: THE HÍJAR-PADRÉS COLONY, AND ITS ORIGINS, 1769-1835. By C. Alan Hutchinson. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1969. Pp. xv, 457. Maps, apps., bibliog., index. \$10.00.

SPAIN'S VAST COLONIAL EMPIRE, and the means by which it was established and maintained, is of perennial interest and has produced an extensive literature. The flood goes on, as students probe some part of this structure, or add new facts or interpretations. In this study the author limits his investigation basically to Alta California.

The background chapters offer a broad analysis of Russia's entry into the Pacific, and the effect on Spanish policy of her penetration of the Aleutian Islands, Alaska, and the Pacific Coast well down into California. Spain's chief rivals for the Pacific were Russia and England, in particular the former. Hutchinson analyzes the diplomatic maneuverings which preceded Gálvez's decision to inaugurate the occupation of California through the Portolá-Serra expedition in 1769, and concludes that it was indeed Russia that was to be feared at that time, rather than England or any other power.

Once the decision to advance into California had been made, it was done by the traditional method — establishment of missions for the Indians, with reliance on missionaries to develop an agricultural society, supported by towns and presidios, that would enable Spain to hold the territory against possible enemies, while at the same time bringing to the Indians the benefits of a Christian life and the most advanced culture of the age. This system brought with it many problems because of the very nature of the mission system and because the natives were unable to advance to the envisioned stage of independence and self-reliance.

While the author gives this general background, it is secularization of the missions that is the central theme of his book. Secularization, as empire policy, was adopted by Spain's Cortes on September 13, 1813. All missions were to be turned over to the secular clergy within ten years "without any excuse or pretext of any kind." The former missionaries were to be given new posts and their lands divided among the Indians and various settlers and officials. On the basis of this law, the author discusses the mission system in California, particularly after Mexico became independent in 1821. He deals at length with discussions in the Mexican Congress about the problem, the danger of foreign intrusion, and what the nation's policy ought to be. Secularization of the missions continued to be the ultimate official goal, although it was resisted in California — partly because the missionaries were Spanish and not in sympathy with the Mexican

revolutionary changes, and partly because they felt the Indians could not take care of themselves and that with the demise of the mission system all of its charitable work for the natives and for California would be lost.

This essential background occupies the first 141 pages of the book, followed by a chapter on the internal situation in California from Echeandía to Figueroa. The remainder of the study, pp. 181-402, details the story of the Híjar-Padrés colony, part of a project devised in Mexico to deal with the secularization problem by further Mexican colonization of California.

President Santa Anna, elected in 1833, had retired immediately to his ranch after the election, leaving his vice-president, Gómez Farías, and other liberals to assume the burden of government. One of their new laws, in 1833, provided for the Híjar-Padrés colony, called the Gómez Farías colony by the author. The old order in California was to be changed. Híjar was to replace Figueroa as governor, secularization of the missions and division of their lands was to proceed. This and other legislation enacted by the liberals, although badly needed, raised such a storm of protest that Santa Anna returned to the presidency to calm the troubled political waters. He immediately sent word, by special courier to California, that Híjar was to be removed as governor and Figueroa reinstated. This message, sent after the colonists had departed from Mexico, left the old order in power, continued protection of the missionaries in their posts, and virtually nullified the Gómez Farías legislation, leading to a protracted quarrel between the Híjar-Padrés group and Figueroa, and to the colony's eventual failure.

This is a fine study, especially comprehensive in its treatment of official policy and legislative enactments affecting the colony. With regard to the dissensions between the colonists and local officials it should be noted that no one in California — governor, missionaries, or settlers — favored the new order which threatened them, nor was there any special love in California for independent Mexico. Generally speaking, California remained loyal to Spain, leading to an acrimonious situation and the ultimate failure of the experiment. The author, apparently attached to the Gómez Farías colony and its program of colonization, gives a rather critical estimate of Figueroa and his administration, notably as described in his *Manifiesto* of 1835. Notwithstanding its thorough treatment of the subject, the book is not likely to be the final word on this topic.

The University of California, Berkeley

GEORGE P. HAMMOND

THE MISSOURI EXPEDITION 1818-1820: THE JOURNAL OF SURGEON JOHN GALE WITH RELATED DOCUMENTS. Ed. by Roger L. Nichols. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1969. Pp. xxvii, 145. Illus., maps, app., bibliog., index. \$5.95.

TO PROTECT THE AMERICANS in the fur trade of the Upper Missouri, and to control the Indians and prevent infiltration of British traders, military expeditions were planned by the War Department to establish forts on the Upper Missouri. This gave rise to the well known Yellowstone Expedition. The first of the expeditions which resulted from these plans went up the Missouri in 1818 and 1819 under Colonel Henry Atkinson. This resulted in the establishment of a fort at Council Bluffs. The journal and other documents in the volume under review deal with the military branch of the Yellowstone Expedition, more accurately called the Missouri Expedition, comprising a four-part troop movement in 1818 and 1819. Only two of those parts are included in this volume. The panic of 1819, plus Congress' failure to appropriate more money caused by mismanagement on the part of contractors and political opposition to Calhoun, led to the ending of the Yellowstone Expedition.

A few years ago the present reviewer, in editing his "Manuel Lisa," found the diary of Kavanaugh in the Beinecke Collection of rare books in the Yale University Library and with permission quoted excerpts from it relating to Lisa. He did not question the authorship of the diary and simply took the notation on it that it was written by Kavanaugh. However, Professor Nichols, who utilized the diary in full in his excellent *General Henry Atkinson: A Western Military Career*, published by the University of Oklahoma Press in 1965, questioned the authorship of the diary. By using internal historical evidence, he argues cogently that the diary was not written by Kavanaugh, but by the Surgeon, John Gale. In this reviewer's mind, although he accepts the historical judgment of Professor Nichols, there is still some internal evidence that does not support, or that could be used to argue against, that conclusion.

The narrative illustrates the use of keelboats and steamboating on the Missouri, conditions of river transportation, and includes a stark, rather unpleasant description of army life in the early nineteenth century. It describes the first sizable government-sponsored expedition up the Missouri River after Lewis and Clark. It gives good detail of the West, its settlement and conditions.

To supplement the narrative, and to fill in gaps, Professor Nichols has added a number of letters and orders of Col. Atkinson tracing the progress from Plattsburgh, N.Y., to Pittsburgh, and down the Ohio River to St. Louis. The manuscript begins with the starting point of the expedition from Fort Bellefontaine, the first date of major entry being August 31, 1818. It ends with the entry of March 19, 1820. There are some additional entries and letterbooks used by Dr. Gale for his medical correspondence, going as far as September 5, 1820. The original manuscript of Dr. Gale contains 58 pages, and the supplementary material 13 additional pages. Together with Professor Nichols' meticulous editorial notes, this constitutes pages 3-88 of the printed volume. The remainder of the rather slender volume (pp. 89-126) contains an appendix of 38 letters and documents dated from March 16, 1818, to April 7, 1820.

This volume is handsomely printed and contains a number of illustrations, including pictures of Atkinson, John O'Fallon, Benjamin O'Fallon, and Manuel Lisa, as well as a map of the Missouri bottom, sample page of the manuscript, sketches of cantonments, and the mouth of the Missouri River. It contains a full bibliography and an index plus an introduction giving the author's arguments for Dr. Gale being the author of the manuscript.

We are indebted to Professor Nichols for his work on Atkinson, and the beginnings of the Yellowstone Expedition.

San Diego State College

A. P. NASATIR

WELLS, FARGO DETECTIVE: THE BIOGRAPHY OF JAMES B. HUME. By Richard Dillon. New York: Coward-McCann, Inc., 1969. Pp. 320. Illus., sources, index. \$7.95.

JAMES B. HUME was one of the most famous detectives in the nation's history. His reputation and renown resulted from two factors: an extraordinary ability in the profession and the fame of his employer, Wells, Fargo & Co. Born on an Indiana farm, he migrated to California at the time of the Gold Rush. After an unrewarding career as a prospector, he turned to law enforcement. Immediately successful in tracking and arresting highwaymen disguised as Confederate agents who held up stages on the trans-Sierra route from Sacramento via Placerville to western Nevada, Hume was rewarded with election as sheriff of El Dorado county. Although an effective and popular public servant, he became embroiled in political factionalism and lost an election. Wells, Fargo & Co., whose cause he had repeatedly served as a lawman by recovering treasure taken from stages, immediately employed him as Chief Special Officer.

In the more than thirty years that Hume worked for Wells, Fargo, he was fiercely loyal to his employer, tireless in his work, and demonstrated a passion for duty. Naturally his trail crossed those of ruthless killers like the Dalton brothers, clever thieves as Black Bart who held up close to thirty stages, the railroad robbers, John Sontag and Chris Evans, and embezzlers including the notorious Charles W. Banks. Protecting the treasure in stagecoaches was big business. In 1885, Hume reported there had been 313 stage robberies since 1872; \$415,312 had been stolen from the company, and the war on the road agents to protect Wells, Fargo & Co.'s reputation had cost \$917,726. As he traveled hither and yon wherever Wells, Fargo had offices or made shipments by stage and rail, operating like a modern-day agent of the Federal Bureau of Investigation assisting local law enforcement officials, Hume had little opportunity for a personal life and remained a bachelor until fifty-seven. Then, after a five-year courtship, he was married in the home of the warden of San Quentin, and became a devoted husband and father. Hume lived in a man's world, full of action, conflict, and excitement, and the factual details of his career, as delineated by Dillon, rival the most exciting detective fiction. The book is a must for those who like to read about cops and robbers.

Dillon's publishers bill him as "one of the country's foremost writers-historians." Writer, *par excellence*, he is; historian he is not. As usual, he refuses to take the time to document the sources of the material he quotes throughout the volume. Without these extensive excerpts from Hume's letters to his family, his longtime sweetheart and wife, and to his employers, the story of his career and the delineation of his personality would have been impossible. In a brief, one-sentence paragraph, next to the last in an essay on "sources," Dillon reveals that hundreds of letters, telegrams, newspaper clippings, and photographs are available in the History Room, Wells, Fargo Bank, San Francisco. Any future researcher interested in a single facet or event of Hume's career will find it necessary to work through all these same extensive materials with the same diligence to obtain what he needs. As in his earlier books, Dillon makes no contribution to the collective ongoing historical scholarship of the many students of western America. Few men have as great an ability to assess the public's interest in a subject, to ferret out the source materials and to exploit them to the fullest, but the finished product is ephemeral. It is a case of great talent wasted.

University of California, Davis

W. TURRENTINE JACKSON

THE WAY TO RAINY MOUNTAIN. By N. Scott Momaday. Albuquerque: The University of New Mexico Press, 1969. Pp. 88. Illus. \$4.95.

N. SCOTT MOMADAY, Kiowa Indian, grew up in Jemez Pueblo, New Mexico, but he has nostalgia for the Medicine Mound country, the country of Rainy Mountain in Oklahoma, where his people ended their long migration from the Northwest (Montana, Wyoming, Colorado). Like his grandmother, he has a kind of racial memory, not only of this land but of all that land which his people moved through in some three hundred years. "Although my grandmother lived out her long life in the shadow of Rainy Mountain, the immense landscape of the continental interior lay like memory in her blood. She could tell of the Crows, whom she had never seen, and of the Black Hills, where she had never been." So Momaday took a pilgrimage back over all this land. "I wanted to see in reality what she had seen more perfectly in the mind's eye." The mind's eye, with him, is perceptive, acute, sensitive, and highly imaginative. It evokes the feel of the land and of the people and adds also the search for, and almost certainly the discovery of, the self — the self through the whole people, and the people against the background of the land. "From the beginning the migration of the Kiowas was an expression of the human spirit, and that expression is most truly made in terms of wonder and delight: "There were many people, and oh, it was beautiful. That was the beginning of the Sun Dance. It was all for Tai-me, and it was a long time ago.'"

So there is first the land, and then the legends and the history of the people, and a few vivid memories and remembrances to place the self. This is the logic of the organization of this very brief book: land subtly evoked all through, with some twenty-four sections divided into three parts each, the legend, then the history, then the self. Throughout, these three parts of each section are set apart typographically, with design by Bruce Gentry, which is superb, and illustrations by Al Momaday, the author's father, which are also superb.

You can get the beautifully nostalgic, poetic quality of the whole from one section about as well as from another; also the clue to the structure of the book. Section XXIV will do as well as any. First the legend about the woman buried in a beautiful dress, "east of my grandmother's house," but now nobody knows exactly where. ". . . her grave is unmarked. She was buried in a cabinet, and she wore a beautiful dress. How beautiful it was! It was one of those fine buckskin dresses, and it was decorated with elk's teeth and beadwork. That dress is still there, under the ground." Second, the actual high mocassins of the actual grandmother, Aho, "made of softest, cream-colored skins," with "a bright disc of beadwork — an eight-pointed star, red and pale blue on a white field." Third and finally, Scott

Momaday the person, a very real and a very profound person, stating plainly and clearly how he thinks one finds himself, what it is one ought to have feelings about, back through the person to the people to the land:

East of my grandmother's house the sun rises out of the plain. Once in his life a man ought to concentrate his mind upon the remembered earth, I believe. He ought to give himself up to a particular landscape in his experience, to look at it from as many angles as he can, to wonder about it, to dwell upon it. He ought to imagine that he touches it with his hands at every season and listens to the sounds that are made upon it. He ought to imagine the creatures there and all the faintest motions of the wind. He ought to recollect the glare of noon and all the colors of the dawn and dusk.

Scott Momaday is a fine artist and so he does not overtly moralize; he has no invidious comparisons, stated or implied. But doesn't the passage just quoted make one wish to moralize? How does the person find oneself except through the people and in relation to the land? The stance, the attitudes of reverence and joy, the poetry are what are important, not the noise or the things or the fake prosperity or the power. Raping the land and forgetting the people is not the way. And so what sometimes appears today to be a terrible discontinuity between the generations of our people—couldn't it perhaps have in it something of a rediscovery, like Momaday's, of what is real and enduring and beautiful?

The University of New Mexico

DUDLEY WYNN

THE GERONIMO CAMPAIGN. By Odie B. Faulk. New York: Oxford University Press, 1969. Pp. ix, 245. Illus., notes, bibliog., index. \$6.00.

LIKE ROBIN HOOD AND BILLY THE KID, Geronimo has achieved an immortality of sorts. The dramatic story of the Geronimo campaign of 1885-86 aroused public interest at the time and still has great popular appeal. It is to suit this popular taste that Professor Faulk has written his colorful account of the campaign. The lively style and numerous photographs as well as the familiar topic make it seem likely that the book will be much in demand as a Christmas gift for youngsters.

The serious student of history may question the heavy dependence on secondary material, especially since immense amounts of primary material are readily available. The book contains some interesting bits from the Sonoran archives but the Gatewood collection seems to have been used mainly for its copies of official records. No new evidence of any significance has been presented.

The author has made some startling, though perhaps trivial, errors such as the statement that Carl Schurz was Secretary of Interior in the Arthur administration. There are also misleading phrases. The Apache, for ex-

ample, are credited with "concerted rebellion" against Mexico even though one of the most notable features of Indian warfare was the lack of concerted effort and there is no evidence that it existed in this instance. Neither can the word "rebellion" be considered appropriate in this context. In another passage the Delaware "tribe" is accused of bounty hunting for Apache scalps. Individual Delaware were a familiar sight on the frontier, but one might just as well speak of a "tribe" of mountain men.

A few pages on the Powder River war and a chapter on army life, while interesting in themselves, are distracting side excursions. Most strenuous objection must be made to the persistent use of the epithets "squaw" and "buck," terms which Indians find particularly offensive.

Professor Faulk has, quite rightly, not been content to end the tale with the capture of Geronimo. The sad exile of the peaceful Chiricahua and the fate and fortunes of the principal participants are very much a part of the story. It may be questioned, however, whether General Miles needs to be quite so thoroughly castigated even though the perusal of his correspondence seldom fails to arouse the greatest indignation in the researcher.

The student of Indian history may feel that the final chapter, "Geronimo's Triumph," is excessively eulogistic. All will agree that Geronimo, like numerous other Apache, was a highly successful guerrilla leader. Few would describe him as "a great American," or would even admit that he possessed that nobility of character which could be seen in some of his contemporaries, as for example, Chief Joseph of the Nez Percé. University libraries are not likely to regard *The Geronimo Campaign* as a necessary addition to their already well-filled shelves on the Apache wars.

Tempe, Arizona

MARJORIE H. WILSON