New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 28 | Number 2 Article 5

4-1-1953

Book Reviews

Book Reviews

Black Robes in Lower California. By Peter Masten Dunne, S.J. Berkeley, California: University of California Press, 1952. Pp. xiii, 540. $6.50.

The story of the Jesuit missionary adventure in Baja California has thus far been sadly neglected by modern historians, except for a few articles, the works of Bancroft, and a number of unpublished studies. Now this fascinating topic is presented in detailed, compact form, and based upon carefully balanced sources. It is easily the first important contribution to the subject since the English translation of Francisco Javier Clavigero's *History of (Lower) California* was published fifteen years ago. Incidentally, it is also the fourth study by Father Dunne concerning Jesuit mission enterprise in Mexico.

As in the author's previous volumes, the organization and procedure of this work are simple and straightforward. They carry the story of Baja California's Jesuit penetration directly and plainly from 1697 to the expulsion of 1768. Interpretations and conclusions are mostly based upon careful research, with a wealth of footnote references; and there is little evidence that the writer is unduly swayed by loyalty to his order. An improvement upon some of his earlier studies is a more thorough appreciation of missionary techniques and of geographical and economic factors, which certainly ought not to be neglected in dealing with such a formidable country as Lower California. Six of the thirty-two chapters (I, VI, XVII, XVIII, XXVI and XXVII), deal more or less with these phases of the subject, and still more of them are covered in the Appendix and footnotes.

Father Dunne shows considerable skill in delineating character, and in describing the fifty-six Jesuit padres and fifteen missions of Baja California he has ample opportunity to display it. Salvatierra, Ugarte, Pícolo, Bravo, Baegert, Sistiaga, Link, Guillén, Consag and Taraval are his favored heroes, and rightly so, along with the martyrs Tamaral and Carranco. They form a gallery of portraits and show a

range of character, mostly praiseworthy, seldom found in the annals of any frontier.

At the same time the author does not conceal or minimize the methods of persuasion used by the missionaries and their soldier aides upon the peninsular Indians—combinations of threats, benevolence and exhortation. It is quite evident that much of the padres' influence upon the hungry natives was based upon the practice of regularly feeding them, although the principle is certainly not unknown in other religious fields and faiths. What may be called the technique of interrupted punishment and eleventh-hour pardon for rebellious Indians was also very effective, as Father Dunne indicates. When all is said on this matter, though, the fact remains that we can never positively know what the Indians themselves actually thought of the mission system as a whole. There were of course examples of extreme devotion toward some padres as individual protectors and benefactors. But the extent to which the Indians were truly civilized or were loyal to white men or to the Christian faith in general, will probably always remain unknown. And as the author and many of his sources of authority freely admit, the gathering of the natives into close and well-clothed communities, exposed to a wide variety of new diseases, could be nothing less than catastrophic to them, individually and racially, whether they appreciated the fact or not.

Here and there the book might have been better balanced. For example, some of the space devoted in Chapter XXIV to the details of Jesuit travel from Europe to Baja California, might well have been spent in rounding out the whole peninsular mission story by briefly describing the post-Jesuit Dominican régime in Baja California in Chapter XXXII. If the Dominican story lies outside the province of a Jesuit historian, so does the Franciscan northward advance into Alta California, to which so much consideration is given in this final chapter.

A few small errors might be noted and a few questions raised. On most maps the low, sandy island at the mouth of the Rio Colorado is listed as Montague, not "Montabue" (p. 212). A ship is usually said to founder rather than

to "flounder" (p. 57). We are left in doubt as to whether Padre Miguel Barco was an Italian (p. 311), or a Spaniard (p. 452). Is not the island of "Angel Custodio" visited by Padre Link in 1765 (p. 383), the same as Angel de la Guardia, off the east coast of the peninsula? (Cf. Clavigero, pp. 20, 345). If so, it must surely have been discovered by an earlier Gulf navigator than Ugarte. And why cannot the first or eastern location of Todos Santos mission be more clearly indicated (p. 193)? The fold-in map which, together with some good photographic illustrations, accompanies the work, could have been made much more useful by the addition of a few more details such as peninsular river valleys, harbors, mountains and islands, as well as by a few routes of explorers.

In general, however, this is an excellent piece of historical literature. If at times the Jesuit peninsular mission system seems a little fatuous, and if the traces of its labors are few and rare today, it is still undeniable that the padres separately and collectively put forth a splendid effort. Their mistakes were largely the common mistakes of their cultural period in Europe as well as in America. Their achievements were mainly transitory and in the realm of the spirit, but some of them added to the world's geographical and scientific knowledge. Father Dunne has narrated the failures, mistakes and triumphs with a commendable degree of objectivity as well as understanding and kindly sympathy. His book is to be highly recommended.

Arizona State College. RUFUS KAY WYLLYS

The Comanches: Lords of the South Plains. By Ernest Wallace and E. Adamson Hoebel. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1952. Pp. xviii, 382. $5.00.

The latest volume of the University of Oklahoma's Civilization of the American Indian Series is a definitive account of the life of a tribe long needing such analysis. Successful in their purpose of writing a popular yet instructive description of the Comanches, the authors have combined their historical and anthropological knowledge in a

book presenting all the advantages and few apparent disadvantages of collaboration. The historian can regret that historical information seems rather hurried, scant, and generally indicative of further significant detail unrevealed. Yet the anthropologist, who will certainly welcome the wealth of facts depicting peculiar Comanche customs, may also be aroused to wish for more than this type of book can provide.

A tremendous amount of the material now so competently provided for public use, was gathered by a party of The Santa Fe Laboratory of Anthropology in 1933 under the direction of Professor Ralph Linton of Yale with Mr. Hoebel as one of its members. To New Mexicans, so compact yet thorough a coverage of the life of their northeastern neighbors will prove of much value. Historical details of the part played by the tribe in New Mexican development will need to be sought elsewhere; but how the Comanches lived and loved, hunted and rode, worked and played, and fought and worshipped will probably never be so clearly and fully described by others within such reasonable limits. The authors so completely distinguished the Comanches from their related neighbors of the Plains that no reader will ever again feel justified in over-generalizing regarding Indians. To any one primarily acquainted with Pueblo Indians, such a book will provide an excellent description of an antithetical yet not geographically distant type of life. While Texans and Mexicans will remember the Comanches only with keen disgust, New Mexicans peculiarly will have reason to regard them at times even as having been collaborators. The transition of the Comanches from mustang-mounted warriors to peyote-drugged cattle leasers is told without evident prejudice. A life now gone is recaptured as reminiscences of the last survivors enable verification of Comanche legends and traditions.

As one has learned to expect, the publishers have produced a beautiful book. Footnotes are at the bottom of the pages and a satisfactory bibliography and index are included. The reviewer noticed only one typographical error, as a Pennsylvanian being quite astounded to find a Co-

manche interpreter referred to as a "Carlyle" graduate (p. 160). His surprise at the moment is indicative of his admiration for a book he hopes New Mexicans and other Comanche neighbors will find most useful. His wish for more historical detail will some day be fulfilled and in the meantime the anthropological presentation will serve as a model for those writing about other tribes.

Lycoming College LORING B. PRIEST

History of the Americas. By John Francis Bannon. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, Inc., 1952. Vol. I, "The Colonial Americas," pp. xii, 582; Vol. II, "The American Nations," pp. xi, 568. Maps. Each volume $5.50.

The scholar who sets out to compress the history of all the Americas between the covers of two volumes of less than gigantic size is undertaking a task of no mean proportions. Nothing less than a brave man would approach the project, knowing that the Americas cover more than 15,000,000 square miles, give sustenance to more than 300,000,000 people, and comprise twenty-two nations, not to mention the numerous colonial segments here and there.

The nature of the task requires a combination of the topical and the chronological arrangements. The author pursues the story of the Anglo-American sections a certain distance, shifts to the Latin-American for a time, then back, thus covering the colonial period in the first volume. He concludes this volume, of course, with the story of the American Revolution—not neglecting the "Early Years of British Canada"—then sketches the revolutions in Spanish and Portuguese America. A very helpful chapter entitled "The Colonial Centuries in Retrospect" concludes the first volume.

The second, covering as it does the history of the period of independence of the twenty-two nations, presents problems which were perhaps more difficult of solution than those of the earlier period. But the student (these volumes are intended for use as textbooks) is piloted skilfully through the maze in such fashion that he should come out

with some very definite ideas and with some appreciation of the individuality of the score or more of nations. The first hundred pages relate United States history through the Civil War. The next section of a hundred pages takes the student through the history of the Latin Americas to about 1880. The Anglo-Americas then get their innings, the story carrying the United States and Canada down to about the First World War. Come next the World War and the Americas, and the final sections cover the later period of the 1900's.

Necessarily, the writer must compress. This entails a great deal of omission, but omissions have been made judiciously and the style in which the material is presented is such that the reader does not feel that he is reading merely a catalogue of facts and dates.

There are many helpful maps, though some are so inclusive as to be difficult to read. Other illustrations have not been used—which amounts, perhaps, to a gentle criticism.

The tone of the volumes is liberal; the presentation of controversial matter is objective and, the reviewer believes, fair. Altogether, one must conclude that Professor Bannon has performed a difficult task in an admirable fashion.

State University of New York,
College for Teachers, Albany. WATT STEWART

Thunder in the Southwest: Echoes from the Wild Frontier. By Oren Arnold. Norman: The University of Oklahoma Press. Pp. 237. $3.75.

As stated in the prologue this collection of sixteen tales is neither fiction nor history in the conventional sense.

The stories are interesting enough although some are shopworn and could do without retelling. Others, however, are comparatively unknown and stand up better. The author has not only used folklore freely but has at times reverted to the style of Ned Buntline or some contemporary of his. The guns go "Crack! Crack!" or "Bang! Bang!" or, on occasion, "Pow!" And after all that has a certain charm.

The illustrations by Eggenhoffer are good. Nick Eggenhoffer's illustrations are usually good.

All in all the book accomplishes what it set out to do. Again borrowing from the prologue, it is "a happy, hybrid combination of fact and folklore." Not an essential for the western shelf but a pleasant addition.

Albuquerque, N. M. BENNETT FOSTER

Man Without a Star. By Dee Linford. New York: William Morrow and Company, Inc. Pp. 312. $3.50.

Dee Linford's first novel is a "Western" with a difference. In situation, characters, and solution it is not much different from a thousand other examples of Wild West fiction. But Mr. Linford comes from an old Wyoming ranch family and has a feeling for the landscape and history of his country which only a native could have.

Jeff Jimson is an orphan boy when the story opens. He does slave labor for an old Scrooge of an uncle until he can't stand it any longer. Then he rides the rods to Wyoming. He falls in love with Abby Garrett, daughter of the owner of the great Man Head ranch, and begins a long campaign to become a man big enough to interest her.

This involves rearranging his system of ethics. In Wyoming in the eighties the big men had it all their own way. The little men had no chance at all. The only way to rise was to become the humble and useful servant of one of the "bullionaires." By nature Jeff was proud and loyal to his friends, but he schooled himself to subservience and double-dealing. He gained his reward when Wate Garrett approved his engagement to Abby. But by that time the feud between the big cattlemen and the settlers was reaching a climax and Jeff had to take the side of the little men.

Eventually his return to conscience paid off. Garrett had to turn to Jeff when the whole country rose against him and mob violence flared up. But the whole system had to be broken before the little men had a chance.

This conventional plot is based on situations which actually existed. The domination of the range country by a few big cattlemen who actually owned only a small part of

their dominions—the forcible discouragement of settlers—the tie-ups with officials in the state government—the baronial establishments of the rich and the hopelessness of the small operators—all these things are part of history, and Dee Linford knows about them.

In addition he knows how people in the range country talk, and how they feel about things. He knows about bone pickers and box socials and wild horses. He understands land hunger and men with Jehovah complexes and the strong ties which grow up between lonely human beings.

He has not freed himself from formula writing enough to have written a first-class novel, but he has the basic understanding and information to do more significant work in the future.

Texas Western College C. L. SONNICHSEN

The United States as Seen by Spanish American Writers, (1776-1890). By José de Onís. New York: Hispanic Institute in the United States, 1952. Pp. 226.

A question often asked of travelers returning from Spanish America is: "What do they think of the United States?" Dr. José de Onís has answered this and many other questions related to it in his systematic study of attitudes expressed south of the Rio Grande over two important periods in the history of Inter-American relations. The book is divided into four principal parts, aside from the conclusions, with a good although brief account of the origin of the relations between the two Americas, as a first part. Two others deal with the two periods (1776-1822 and 1823-1890), and the last one deals exclusively with the writings of Sarmiento. The project is not simple, in fact, it might be too ambitious considering the threefold task which the author has undertaken. He says:

> It is the purpose of this study to determine the attitude of the Spanish American authors toward the United States during two main periods, namely: the era of the Independence (1776-1822), and the era of the formation of the Spanish American nations (1823-1890). Its object is to analyze the available works pertaining to this subject written by Spanish Americans, to ascertain the attitude of the outstanding, rep-

> resentative authors, as well as the characteristics common to all writers of each period, and to trace the evolution of certain fundamental ideas in the literary and political thought of these two epochs.

The reader can see at a glance that the project is not limited to a study of attitudes, but it includes literary criticism and content evaluation. How to keep these three elements in focus and combine them into a well integrated whole constitutes a difficult problem which the author has solved very successfully. It is quite apparent that Onís had a considerable amount of material from which to select, and that in many instances he found it necessary to compress a great deal in order to be brief. He also tells us a great deal of what writers in the United States were saying about Spanish America, suggesting perhaps a future project to be undertaken as a counterpart to this study.

The author points out that there was some degree of coincidence between the two cultures and "a marked similarity between the psychology of the people of the two Americas" at the time of colonization, because of the similarity of circumstances. While this is a passing statement, it raises a question which is fundamental in differentiating between English and Spanish cultures. It was the difference in the "psychology" of colonization that produced such diametrically opposed results as we now see in Anglo-America and Spanish-America.

Professor Onís has made a very careful selection of authors in various fields in order to give a wide coverage to the opinions expressed, and at the same time he has selected these writers on the basis of their literary merit and serious ideas. He includes the works of outstanding political writers, travelers, statesmen, literary men and teachers.

Many readers will discover that the attitude of a good number of Spanish American writers was not one of rabid nationalism, and that many have gone so far as to advocate the annexation of their respective countries to the United States. This does not mean that Professor Onís has been one-sided or partial in presenting his finds. On the contrary,

he has avoided this pitfall by adhering to his original statement:

> We have tried to find out and present to the reader what the various authors thought about the United States and why they thought as they did, rather than to prove whether their opinions were right or wrong.

Anyone acquainted with the role of Domingo Faustino Sarmiento will readily see why his case had to be treated in a separate chapter. One would expect to find in this portion of the book, however, considerable material regarding Sarmiento's keen observations about American life. Professor Onís passed up a very good opportunity to add to the human interest of his story including the Argentinian's account of American family life, personal relations and other details in which he manifested a keen sense of humor and understanding. At this point, Onís seems a bit too scholarly.

The book does not end with the Conclusions as one would expect, for Professor Onís continues his discussion to the very last page. This seems to indicate that he had much more material than the extent of his study allowed him to use. For the actual summing up of his finds one must go back to the body of study and get the conclusions progressively.

Today, when we are advocating a more intelligent understanding and a closer working relationship between the United States and other nations, a book such as this one by José de Onís is indeed timely, informative, and useful. His study is not merely a collection of opinions by a miscellaneous group of Spanish American writers, but a careful selection of authors whom the Spanish Americans themselves consider their best spokesmen. Each writer is discussed within the framework of ideas which prevailed at the time both in Spanish America and in the United States. It is hoped that Dr. Onís will undertake what appears to be a sequel to his present work, namely, what writers in the United States think about Spanish America.

University of Denver ARTHUR L. CAMPA