

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 25 | Number 3

Article 5

7-1-1950

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 25, 3 (1950). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol25/iss3/5>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

Hopi Kachina Dolls. Harold S. Colton. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1949. Pp. xv, 144.

This very attractive volume, which takes Hopi Kachina dolls as its point of departure, is actually a more comprehensive study than the modest disclaimer of the author indicates. Dr. Colton in this volume has collated all of the material on the Kachina cult among the Hopi villages represented by the publications of Fewkes, Dorsey and Voth, Stephen, Earle and Kennard, and Mrs. Stephenson's and Ruth Bunzel's accounts of the Zuñi, in order to give the uninformed a clear picture as to the nature and function of Kachina dolls and their relationship to the colorful ceremonies of the Kachinas as they occur in the Hopi villages. In addition to published sources, Dr. Colton has amplified and extended a description of the characteristics of both the Kachinas and their miniature counterparts by some 30 years of personal observation and additional checking and verification by Hopi informants.

While the book is not addressed primarily to the scientific specialist, it would still be an extremely useful book for Southwestern ethnologists who would like a rather complete compendium of the distribution of various features of Kachina masks and dancing throughout the Southwest.

The nature of the cult, the beliefs surrounding them, the variety of masks, body decorations and appurtenances, and the conventional manner in which these are represented by the Hopi who is carving and painting a doll, are all described with sufficient detail so that the unwary need not be led astray by some of the tall tales of the Southwest.

The volume is illustrated by nineteen photographic illustrations of Kachina dolls, half of them in color and half in black and white. In addition to the photographic illustrations by Jack Breed, there is a complete set of line drawings of Kachina masks classified according to common features of the mask, its forms or a significant aspect of its decoration which enables the observer to group them into systematic

categories. In the description and cross reference of some 250 Kachinas which have either been reported in the literature or mentioned by his informants, black and white line drawings are included wherever possible.

This reviewer feels certain that this volume will be very welcome as an addition to the ethnological literature of the Southwest and a valuable *vade mecum* for the perceptive but unwary tourist who is interested in collecting Indian souvenirs in the Southwest.

Arlington, Virginia.

EDWARD A. KENNARD

The Journey of Fray Marcos de Niza. Cleve Hallenbeck. Illustrated by José Cisneros. Dallas: University Press in Dallas, 1949. Pp. 115. \$10.00.

This masterpiece of the printer's art begins with a brief treatise on certain ancient legends which in the sixteenth century found their supposed locale in the unknown country north of New Spain. After mentioning Cabeza de Vaca's adventures the author leads up to Viceroy Mendoza's plan to send Fray Marcos de Niza to discover the legendary Seven Cities of Cibola. Then follow the author's own translations from the Pacheco printed narratives of the Viceroy's instructions, of Fray Marcos' Narrative, and of the two official certifications of this Narrative. The last main portion of the book consists of Hallenbeck's Analysis of the Narrative and his Notes, followed by the expected bibliography and index as well as a brief biography of the author, who died before the completed manuscript saw print.

Hallenbeck apodictically concludes that Fray Marcos never reached Hawikuh, pictures him as a sensual fellow primarily interested in his meals and his siestas, and vitriolically labels him an unmitigated liar—"The Lying Monk." The publisher, endorsing the work as "the first really serious study testing the accuracy of the Narrative of Fray Marcos de Niza," blazons the theme of "Lying Monk" on the jacket-blurb with undisguised gusto.

The serious student of New World history knows that the Narrative of Fray Marcos de Niza presents many problems,

problems that have divided historians into two camps regarding the matter. The proponents of both sides have been able men who have stated the arguments with convincing force if not entirely conclusive validity. For the controversy centers on a man who lived four centuries ago and on a single document of his which leaves plenty of room for speculation. It would require a book to review all these arguments, and the result would be another Niza volume, but not an end to the controversy. Apparently, no mere speculation on this single document will settle the question; future documentary discoveries might, one way or the other.

Hallenbeck's general argument, and that of his predecessors *contra* Niza, seem to run as follows: Fray Marcos made a journey to Cibola in which he minutely jotted down every single league and day of travel, and when he got back to New Spain he wrote down a complete and detailed account of that journey; *but*, my own study of the terrain as it is today, of the Indian villages and Spanish towns as I think they were located then, and the time element needed for traveling between certain points, do not jibe in many instances with that journal; *therefore*, Niza's Narrative is in great part a fabrication and Niza himself is a liar. The conclusion flows from the premises. However, who of us expects this pioneer sixteenth-century friar to have measured the miles exactly and kept a diary while he trekked over immense stretches of unknown territory, beset by real or imagined dangers on every side? And when back in New Spain he sat down to pen his account, how can he possibly have set down every adventure in precise logical order, especially since the only thing required of him was a general statement of what he had seen and heard? I myself have an average memory, but I recall that, on being asked to write about my experiences shortly after my return from the Pacific War Theater, I could not place the many interesting happenings in their right sequence, or guess how many days or weeks I had spent at a certain spot or in traveling from one point to another. Even after I established some general dates by running through my military orders, I still could not marshal these facts in the exact time-and-space order in which they oc-

curred. And I don't think that my own experiences were more confusing, surrounded as I was by my American fellow-soldiers, than those of poor Marcos all alone in an unmapped wilderness among strange savages whose language he could not understand. The second premise speaks for itself. Despite the author's admirable exploration, the exact location of some place-names mentioned by Niza and others has not been settled definitely. Nor can we say that the weather cycle in a locality was the same four centuries ago as it is today. And yet Hallenbeck, for instance, says that Fray Marcos could not have traveled fast across a certain territory because, on the *ipse dixit* of Sauer, the many arroyos and streams of this area are swollen torrents at this time of year today. This is an example of several minor proofs offered to bolster up the premise. They are good arguments, coming from one who personally studied the terrain as the professional weatherman that Hallenbeck was, but they are by no means conclusive enough to warrant his all-sweeping conclusion. Nor does it seem that he ever read the arguments on this score put forth in April, 1947, by a pro-Marcos historian who writes ably and coolly and more convincingly than Hallenbeck, yet humbly admits that he has not solved the Niza problem because of a lack of further necessary data.¹

Another Hallenbeck proposition that colors his analysis, though not expressed in so many words, can be stated something like this: There are many lies in the Niza Narrative (which everybody admits); *but*, the Indians who informed Niza did not tell him any lies, and the slave Estéban, who was not really a Negro, was a truthful and jolly fellow; *ergo*, all the lies in Niza's Narrative are Niza's own. The author's idea of the Indians' moral character seems to be the Cooper-Longfellow fantasy coupled with Rousseau's noble savage. Actually, the Indian as such is neither more of a liar nor a paragon of truth than the white man or any other race; but there are several instances in New World history that show him telling the eager white explorer what the latter wants to know. One can see how Estéban, far ahead, asked the

1. George J. Undreiner, "Fray Marcos de Niza and His Journey to Cibola," *The Americas*, Vol. III, No. 4, pp. 415-486.

tribesmen about the seven golden cities, and they obliged by turning his very words into an answer; and when days later the friar arrived asking the same questions, these Indians were already well-primed to give him the same answer with further details. And Niza, no different from his contemporaries, was gullible enough to believe them because he firmly believed the fables of his times to be true. As for Estéban, Dorantes' Morocco-born slave, Hallenbeck insists that he was an Arab and not a Negro, as he did in a previous work on Cabeza de Vaca, contrary to the testimony in many contemporary documents where he is repeatedly called a Negro and regarded as such. Why he does so, since this fact has nothing to do with the Niza problem, is hard to figure out—unless Estéban is a sort of hero to him, and he does not want his hero and discoverer of New Mexico to be a Negro. The fact that the slave is euphemistically called a *moreno* once does not change the color of his skin.² Was Hallenbeck anti-Negro as well as anti-friar?

This brings us to the almost pathological hate which Hallenbeck harbored against a friar four hundred years dead, and which makes it hard for the reviewer who feels that he must criticize the work of a man who also has passed away. Had Niza's supposed lies hurt the reputation of some other historical person, and were Hallenbeck trying to defend that person, one could understand his animosity. But this is not the case as he goes tooth and nail after the person of Fray Marcos. And so there comes the repeated epithet of "Lying Monk" as the name given to Niza (so he states) by his contemporaries, and for which he avoids giving a reference. Niza was a friar, not a monk, and there were no monks in Spanish America at the time; maybe this is why he cannot give a reference. The word "monk," though still a highly respected term in Catholic and well-informed circles for members of the ancient Monastic Orders, has gathered a simian connotation among other people, and hence Hallenbeck's deliberate and unscientific use of it points to a decided bias. Space does not allow for even a cursory criticism of his many

2. Cf. "De Vargas' Negro Drummer," *El Palacio*, Vol. 56, No. 5, p. 136, where a Negro of the African jungle is referred to as "*de Nacion Moreno*."

misinterpretations of old Spanish terms in his Analysis, and Notes particularly, the result of using a modern Spanish dictionary without a thorough background of sixteenth-century semantics.

Fray Marcos de Niza is not a candidate for canonization. He could have been a liar, or worse, or at least he could have lied with regard to his discovery of Cibola. But that remains to be demonstrated by a sober historian well-versed in all the known documentary sources of sixteenth-century Spanish America plus as yet undiscovered documents that might clarify the matter. The late Mr. Hallenbeck lacked these qualifications, not to mention the undiscovered sources.

The material book of paper and type, designed and produced by Carl Hertzog and wonderfully illustrated by José Cisneros, is worth the price asked for it. Any author of history, poetry, or fiction, would be justly proud to see his works in such an artistic format. If Cisneros makes Fray Marcos look like a sensual brigand, and Estéban like a nattily dressed Spanish soldier with Semitic features (instead of the Negro with bright feathers on wrists and ankles as he actually wore them), he is but being faithful to the author's descriptions. What his medium is, whether genuine engraving or ink-drawing to simulate engraving, even some seasoned artists cannot tell for sure—the title-page (with a kind of negative deception?) merely introduces them as "Illustrations and Decorations." They are beautiful nevertheless, and match the type perfectly. This book is indeed a fine piece of jewelry made to display a beautiful pearl that unfortunately turns out to be a bitter pill.

Peña Blanca, New Mexico

FRAY ANGELICO CHAVEZ

Grassland Historical Studies: Natural Resources Utilization in a Background of Science and Technology. Volume I, Geography and Geology. James C. Malin. Lawrence, Kansas. Printed by the author, 1541 University Drive, 1950. Pp. xii, 377. \$2.50. (Lithoprint from typescript, paper cover)

In this, the first of three volumes in a series, there are

two loosely integrated studies: first, an essay on geological factors in the settlement of the grasslands region between the great bend of the Missouri River and the Rocky Mountains, and, second, a fragmentary history of Kansas City culled mostly from the columns of a local newspaper of the 1850's decade.

The study of historical geology occupies the first seventy-five pages, and was prepared simultaneously with the author's earlier work, *The Grassland of North America: Prolegomena of Its History* (1947). Briefly, the thesis here is that the grasslands required increasing dependence upon minerals in the development of those areas. That fact, rather than Frederick Jackson Turner's concept of geographical movement or the closing of the frontier has made for significant changes in twentieth century society. Utilization of minerals has interacted with mechanical invention to bring about an interdependent civilization.

After tracing with scholarly detail the various geological surveys that uncovered knowledge of mineral wealth from the Alleghenies to the Rockies, the author demonstrates with numerous quotations the interest of some immigrants in these resources of the grasslands. It was not until later, however, or outside the scope of this volume, that the use of minerals became a decisive factor in the region.

The remaining eighteen chapters of this work illustrate how well a single newspaper can be used to develop the history of a town. From the columns of the *Kansas City Enterprise* (later published as the *Western Journal of Commerce*) there emerges a many-sided account of five years in the life of a thriving river-valley entrepot. The reader can follow the jealous conflict for supremacy between Kansas City and nearby towns, and read an ecological explanation of the outcome. Especially interesting to southwesterners are new details of the Santa Fe trade in the late 1850's. The commerce was then largely carried on by New Mexicans (not eastern merchants), and wool was increasingly significant in eastward bound trains. There is also a valuable description of early marketing of Texas cattle in Kansas City (Texas fever was a hindrance even then), and the historically ne-

glected overland droving from the Missouri River to Colorado and California. All aspects of Kansas City's trade for the period find presentation in statistical summaries from the newspaper's annual reviews of commerce. Although the analysis is complete enough, much could have been gained here by a better organization of the facts. Never is it possible to escape an admission made in the preface that these studies "are frankly fragments put together with the minimum of organization." Long and undigested quotations are a disadvantage to the narrative.

Other aspect of early town development: levees, streets, building materials and kindred subjects have more interest for the antiquarian and less for the historian than do chapters given to river communication, manufacturing, the Panic of 1857, railroads, and a summary of conditions after the Civil War. Views of the Kansas City editors on political aspects of sectional controversy and the Civil War are hardly adequate explanations of major events in spite of Professor Malin's attempts to find in these biased views a significant relationship to larger trends. Indeed, the political aspects of the study underline the limitations inevitable in too complete reliance upon a single source.

This reviewer cannot agree with the statement (preface, v) that this is the "first time that geology and the expansion of geological knowledge has (sic) been made an integral part of a major historical study," or that (p. 59n) "in most fields of both the sciences and the humanities Americans of the middle and late nineteenth century were European trained." Various homilies on hindsight in history and other *obiter dicta* are strewn gratuitously through the chapters. There is also unnecessary jargon acquired from the social sciences. But Professor Malin has gleaned significant ideas on trade, manufacturing, and transportation from the yellowed files of a western newspaper, and his synthesis of geological exploration and social development is important.

This volume has neither index nor bibliography; footnotes are placed at the end of each chapter. A brief history of Kansas City (William H. Miller, "Kansas City, Its History From the Earliest Times," first published in the *West-*

ern Journal of Commerce, January 14, 1877) is reprinted as an appendix. There are a number of interesting illustrations taken from early prints or engravings of Kansas City. The lithoprint text is quite legible.

University of New Mexico

GEORGE WINSTON SMITH

The Lost Pathfinder: Zebulon Montgomery Pike. W. Eugene Hollon. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1949. Pp. xv, 240. Illustrations, map, bibliography and index. \$3.75.

Pike is numbered among those to whom the Louisiana Purchase brought lasting fame. For this reason, too, he stands high on the local honor roll. In fact he placed his name there with triple honors: as explorer, author of a bizarre book of travels, and as a brave and resourceful army officer. In Colorado his name is attached to an imperishable monument and in New Mexico one traces the first stages of his trail that reverses the course of the early Spanish conquistadores.

Despite such memorable connections Pike has received far less local attention than his stirring career deserves. Hence the appearance of an attractive volume from an Oklahoman press affords welcome evidence that the Far Southwest is not unmindful of its own. This hero, like its earlier explorers, came in alien garb and his course has apparently inspired more pens outside this area than within it. The present author, like most of the previous biographers, is a recent arrival in the region; but to his task has brought much of the energy and resourcefulness that marked the explorer's own career. Dr. Hollon, with the aid of a substantial grant, was able to add a meager store of personal data, without changing greatly the earlier conclusions of such critical scholars as Coues, Quafe, Hart and Hulbert, with whom his work will bear close comparison.

Pike's family affairs as well as his major activities were closely connected with many of the leaders of the Ohio Valley. Born in New Jersey his father, like himself an army officer, early moved his family to the Old Northwest. Here the

future explorer-author found the frontier and the army his chief teachers, but he proved no tyro in self-instruction and in guiding the younger members of the family. It is unfortunate that fire and other destructive elements have deprived us of most illustrative materials of this initial activity from which Pike himself derived the major reward. In spite of these handicaps, Dr. Hollon has presented us with a readable narrative that provides a substantial foundation for the young officer's adult years.

Among those who supplemented Nature's efforts in training him was General James Wilkinson. Such a connection, it later appeared, was to prove a handicap, but the younger man owed much to the General and he never let the latter's double dealing affect either personal devotion to his patron or his loyalty to the nation he served. It was a difficult course for a subordinate to pursue; but Pike, as our author shows, kept it up with honor. In this and in other mooted points, Prof. Hollon preserves both good temper and critical judgment, but cannot wholly relieve Pike of the charge of plagiarism from Humboldt's narrative and map of Mexico. Much of this charge may be explained from Pike's inexperience and the loose copyright laws of the day. In his behalf it may be stated that Pike was the first of the leading explorers of the Louisiana Purchase to bring his results before the public. In this sense the young officer performed a meritorious national service.

While Pike's reputation rests primarily on his work as an explorer, his author does not neglect his hero's course as an officer. His career in a few years raised the young lieutenant to a brigadier. Most criticisms of the work will deal with interpretation rather than fact. The reviewer notes one minor slip (p. 50) but congratulates the author on the high level of his performance and his interesting style.

Aside from the general merits of the book the reviewer, for one, hopes to note a wider interest in its subject. "Pike's Peak" forms a fitting memorial to his wanderings in the vicinity during the trying winter of 1806-07. Little effort is necessary to call public attention to both the natural memorial and its hero. New Mexico, on its part, needs to pay

more attention to Pike's route to the border, or to Chihuahua, or even back to Natchitoches on the Louisiana-Texas frontier. "Pike's Pilgrimage" thus defined may well supplement "Pike's Peak" as an object of well-deserved patriotic attention.

University of New Mexico

ISAAC JOSLIN COX

The Historical Society of New Mexico

Organized December 26, 1859

PAST PRESIDENTS

1859 — COL. JOHN B. GRAYSON, U. S. A.

1861 — MAJ. JAMES L. DONALDSON, U. S. A.

1863 — HON. KIRBY BENEDICT

adjourned sine die, Sept. 23, 1863

re-established Dec. 27, 1880

1881 — HON. WILLIAM G. RITCH

1883 — HON. L. BRADFORD PRINCE

1923 — HON. FRANK W. CLANCY

1925 — COL. RALPH E. TWITCHELL

1926 — PAUL A. F. WALTER

OFFICERS FOR 1948-1949

PAUL A. F. WALTER, *President*

PEARCE C. RODEY, *Vice-President*

WAYNE L. MAUZY, *Corresponding Secretary*

ALBERT G. ELY, *Treasurer*

MISS HESTER JONES, *Recording Secretary*

FELLOWS

PERCY M. BALDWIN

RALPH P. BIEBER

HERBERT E. BOLTON

HERBERT O. BRAYER

FRAY ANGELICO CHAVEZ

REV. STANLEY CROCCHIOLA

MARION DARGAN

CHARLES E. DIBBLE

AURELIO M. ESPINOSA

CHARLES W. HACKETT

GEORGE P. HAMMOND

FREDERICK W. HODGE

J. LLOYD MECHAM

THEODOSIUS MEYER, O. F. M.

FRANK D. REEVE

FRANCE V. SCHOLES

ALFRED B. THOMAS

THEODORE TREUTHLEIN

PAUL A. F. WALTER

PUBLICATIONS FOR SALE

- OLD SANTA FÉ (the quarterly published in 1913-16), 3 volumes unbound. A complete set may still be had at \$20.00. The seventh issue is not sold separately; the tenth issue, \$5.00; the others, \$1.00 each. The Society will pay \$5.00 for reasonably clean copies of Vol. II, no. 3.
- NEW MEXICO HISTORICAL REVIEW (quarterly, from January 1926)
- | | |
|---|--------|
| Vol. I, no. 1, out of print. Nos. 2, 3, 4, each | \$2.00 |
| Vol. II, no. 1 (sold only in sets) | \$3.00 |
| Vol. II, Nos. 2, 3, 4, each | \$1.00 |
| Vols. III to current year, per volume | \$4.00 |
| By subscription, during current year | \$3.00 |
| COMPREHENSIVE INDEX, Vols. I-XV | \$2.00 |
- Papers, Nos. 1 to 38 (1888 to 1935) List of titles sent on request.
- ST. FRANCIS AND THE FRANCISCANS IN NEW MEXICO, 44 pp., ill. \$1.50
- REPRINTS from the HISTORICAL REVIEW, each \$0.25
Titles sent on request. Some studies which appeared serially may be had as:
- PUBLICATIONS IN HISTORY
- | | |
|---|--------|
| Vol. I—Fray Marcos de Niza's <i>Relación</i> , Span. and Eng. ed. by Percy M. Baldwin. 59 pp. (1926) | \$1.00 |
| Vol. II—Juan de Oñate and the Founding of New Mexico. Geo. P. Hammond. 228 pp., maps, bibliog., index. (1927). Out of Print. | |
| Vol. III—New Mexico in the Great War, ed. by L. B. Bloom. 166 pp., index. (1927) | \$1.50 |
| Vol. IV—The Gallegos Relation of the Rodríguez Expedition to New Mexico, ed. by G. P. Hammond and Agapito Rey. 69 pp., maps, index. (1927). Out of print. | |
| Vol. V—Barreiro's <i>Ojeada sobre Nuevo Mexico</i> (1832), ed. by L. B. Bloom. 60 pp., ill. (1928) | \$5.00 |
| Vol. VI—Indian Labor in the Spanish Colonies. Ruth Kerns Barber. 135 pp., bibliog., index. (1932) | \$1.50 |
| Vol. VII—Church and State in New Mexico, 1610-1650, France V. Scholes. 206 pp., bibliog., index. (1937). *Out of Print. | |
| Vol. VIII—The American Occupation of New Mexico, 1821-52. Sister Mary Loyola. 166 pp., bibliog., index. (1939). *Out of Print. | |
| Vol. IX—Federal Control of the Western Apaches, 1848-1886. R. H. Ogle. 259 pp., bibliog., index. (1940). *Out of Print. | |
| Vol. X—Franciscan Missions of New Mexico, 1740-1760. Henry W. Kelly. 94 pp., bibliog., maps. (1941). *Out of Print. | |
| Vol. XI—Troublous Times in New Mexico, 1659-1670. F. V. Scholes. 276 pp., bibliog., index. (1942). *Out of Print. | |
| Vol. XII—New Mexico and the Sectional Controversy, 1846-1861. L. M. Ganaway. 140 pp., illus., bibliog., index. (1944). \$2.00; in cloth | \$2.50 |
| Vol. XIII—Black-Robed Justice. Arie W. Poldervaart. 234 pp., bibliog., index. (1948). Cloth. | \$3.50 |
- * Available in serial issues. Price on request.

Address orders to

NEW MEXICO HISTORICAL REVIEW,
Box 1727, Santa Fe, New Mexico