

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 25 | Number 4

Article 5

10-1-1950

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 25, 4 (1950). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol25/iss4/5>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

Sun in the Sky. Walter Collins O'Kane. Norman, Oklahoma: University of Oklahoma Press, 1950. Pp. xvii, 261. Illustrated. \$4.00.

This volume comprises number thirty in *The Civilization of the American Indian Series*, which the University of Oklahoma Press began to publish in 1932. As its contribution it presents a well-rounded picture of the life of the Hopi Indians who reside in a dozen settlements in northeastern Arizona. The book is of particular interest because the Hopi are a large tribe who have managed to retain much of their aboriginal culture right down to our own day.

A reader's reaction to *Sun in the Sky* will be greatly influenced by the point of view from which he judges the work. If he is an anthropologist who hopes to find information beyond what is already available in technical journals, he is apt to be disappointed. If, on the other hand, the reader is a layman who is curious to learn something about Hopi customs, he is likely to be well-satisfied. Since the author does not claim to be writing for a professional audience, it is only proper that his book should be evaluated from the standpoint of a lay reader.

Sun in the Sky affords an overall view of contemporary Hopi Indian life, but historical or background material is supplied wherever necessary. Most of the volume is based upon the author's personal experiences and observations. These extend over a number of years and range over the full extent of Hopi territory, but the main emphasis appears to fall on Moenkopi and other progressive or acculturated villages, rather than on the old, conservative pueblos on the mesa tops. Clever use of the first person creates an atmosphere in which the reader feels himself accompanying the author on his various journeys about the reservation. In this way one comes to be familiar with the harsh but colorful environment in which the Hopi live, and gradually acquires an understanding of their daily habits, working pursuits, religious beliefs, and contacts with other Indians and Whites.

The author is at his best when dealing with native arts and crafts, but his grasp of the complicated socio-religious system is rather weak.

The entire work is suffused with Professor O'Kane's warm sympathy and affection for his Hopi friends. Indeed, his enthusiasm is so great that occasionally it betrays him into dealing idealistically rather than realistically with his material. There is a tendency to omit or gloss over anything unpleasant or improper according to White American standards. Among other things, one is given the impression that the Hopi are clean and tidy, which is not the case; and the neat living room that is pictured on page 112 is anything but typical of the general run of residences.

In spite of occasional flaws, Professor O'Kane's book gives ample evidence that he is a keen observer and a good reporter. His text is clear and readable, and its value is enhanced by a large number of original photographs and a useful index. When one realizes that by profession the author is an entomologist, the wonder is not that he has committed an anthropological error here and there, but that he has produced so sound a portrayal of one of the most complex Indian cultures still functioning within the borders of the United States.

University of Michigan

MISCHA TITIEV

Albert N. Williams. *Rocky Mountain Country*. American Folkways, no. 20. General editor, Erskine Caldwell. New York: Duell, Sloan and Pearce, 1950. Pp. xxv, 289. \$3.50.

Albert Williams, a fourth generation Coloradoan, says that "Rocky Mountain Country is mostly the mountains in Colorado, plus the fringe along the southern border of Wyoming and the few fingers that jut down into New Mexico." (xvi) Herein are six great ranges, the Front or Rampart, Sangre de Cristo, San Juan, Sawatch, Park, and Medicine Bow, as well as a number of lesser ones. Here also are more than fifty of the eighty peaks in the United States which attain or exceed an elevation of fourteen thousand feet.

Between the ranges lie the Colorado, Platte, Arkansas,

and Rio Grande river valleys, fruit and vegetable gardens of today. Within this region are the great mineral fields: Clear Creek, Cripple Creek, Blue River Canyon, Aspen, Leadville, Silver Cliff, and Silverton (see five maps, following p. xxv).

The author has examined the evolution of this Rocky Mountain Country in a series of chapters dealing with explorers (Spaniards and Anglo-Americans), fur traders, Pacific trails, early gold rushes, and the Civil War. This much of the volume seems to the reviewer to constitute a Part One of the book. Then follow two chapters, one on mining in the Leadville area, devoted mainly to the fantastic career of Horace Tabor, the other on mining in the Cripple Creek area, woven about the career of Winfield Scott Stratton.

What might be a third part of the book is comprised in the "sociological" chapters on labor (Ch. IX, "Men with Grievances") and agriculture (Ch. X, "Men with Hoes"), and a final chapter as an evaluation of a regional type, "The Rocky Mountain Man of Today."

Mr. Williams has written a book that will hold the interest of most readers. His style is vivid, sprightly, and earthy, by turns, according to the needs of his material, and he has amply justified the thesis that there is a Rocky Mountain Country which may be studied as a region. Or, to put the matter differently, he shows that there is as much justification for applying a regional study technique to the Rocky Mountain Country as there is for any other "region" which may be singled out.

It seemed to this reviewer that a regional technique is weakest when used with reference to such subject as "Labor Troubles." Here greater insight into the problem may be gained by studying the labor question across the board, as it were, than as an aspect of the development of a region. True, there were (and are) unique situations which would develop in the field of labor relations in a mining frontier, but the study of unique features loses much of its meaning if such study obscures the general, common features of a subject. For instance, an appreciation of the economic structure of the United States in April 1914 would not permit one to interpret the "Ludlow massacre" as a time when "For a few

horrible days the United States tottered on the brink of revolution in the bolshevik manner." (p. 237). Colorado is not the only locality in the United States wherein struggles between labor and management have been violent.

Finally, are there traits which define a Rocky Mountain type man? Mr. Williams believes there are, or at least that such traits are developing (he states, p. 272, that . . . "Rocky Mountain Country is just coming into its own regionalism." . . .). It is certainly true that a unique region should produce a unique type (or vice versa), or that the very concept of a regional study rests upon the existence of a unique type. To date, the author believes that the Rocky Mountain type is one who ". . . prefers to lay away the cares of the work-a-day world and seek the other values that lie beneath the surface of a man's personality." (*loc. cit.*).

How such a type would have emerged out of some three or four generations of fur seekers, ore seekers, and land seekers, the reviewer would not know, though he would acknowledge that some differences would have to develop between people who live in the vivid consciousness of natural grandeurs as opposed to those who, for example, are surrounded by man-made grandeurs of a strictly urban life.

THEODORE E. TREUTLEIN

San Francisco State College, California

Records and Maps of the Old Santa Fe Trail. Kenyon Riddle.
Pp. 104. [1949] Privately printed by the Author. Raton,
New Mexico.

The genesis of this book lies in Mr. Riddle's boyhood interest in the Santa Fe trail. A civil engineer by profession, he has devoted his spare hours throughout a life time to a study of this subject.

The best part of the book, and the real contribution by the author, are five pocket folding maps which present a detailed historical picture of the trail. They are based on intensive study, including much field work, and are probably the best to be found. A stiff card ruler accompanies the

maps for the convenience of readers who wish to measure distances.

The author states that the trail has been marked in the past in relation to the route of the Santa Fe railroad. His maps link the trail to the modern highways for the convenience of motorists. Pages 36-37 constitute an index to the map. Each numbered historical place on the map has a corresponding number in the text followed by a description.

Mr. Riddle makes a plea for the placing of correctly located highway historical marks. Some of them now in place, he contends, are inaccurate and ought to be changed.

The material in this book is not well organized. There are numerous excerpts from primary and secondary histories of the trail. The story could have been told more in the author's own words. However, it will be of interest to many people, and the maps will be especially useful.—F.D.R.

The Valley Below. Alice Marriott. Norman, Oklahoma: University of Oklahoma Press, 1949. Pp. 243. \$3.00.

In *Maria: The Potter of San Ildefonso*, Alice Marriott wrote sensitively and often beautifully of the life of a people alien to her. In order to be near her work at the pueblo, she set up housekeeping with Margaret Lefranc, artist and creator of fine illustrations for *Maria* and this present book, in a Spanish-American valley community nearby. *The Valley Below* is an account of their life in that community, the humorous approach dominant, the serious present too, to make an interesting blend. To say all this so solemnly is a little foolish and foolhardy, for Miss Marriott, in having a thoroughly witty time, has thrust now and then at the solemnities, even those of her profession, ethnography.

In the first part of the book she takes us humorously, even hilariously at times, through the discomforts and misadventures of refurbishing an old 'dobe house, dealing with an earnest but inept handyman, controlling a houseful of irrational Siamese cats, getting water out of a perverse well and equally perverse well experts, battling the eccentricities of a coal and wood stove, negotiating the intricacies and doubts

of house-buying, getting peace and sleep during the nocturnal debates of rights to irrigation water, the purse-emptying, house-crowding mania for pottery, the trials of building an addition to the house. There has been some method in this approach. Chapter XIII begins: "Now I seem to have reached the point, according to ethnological custom, where I must go beyond the household and its dwelling, and define and describe the surrounding community in relation to the specific unit." So the latter half of the book, maintaining the humorous approach, though with less dominance, deals with the social life of Indians and Spanish-Americans, ending in a series of well-told little stories of the neighboring Maclovio Salazars, and a sensitively felt story of the Penitentes. Thus the book that began "with the idea of an orderly description of a society" became one "about a house and its being lived in, and about some of the people who came and went there." It traced also a change in the two women. "The impersonality of being moderately successful, urban, professional women was gone from us. We were women, and our neighbors came to us for help because they knew we would understand and would give it."

There are some things one regrets about this book, regrets them because Alice Marriott writes so well. Despite her own denials of success in portraying a society, a good deal of understanding does come through, but it has to make its way through the convention that controls the book. The convention goes something like this. An urbanite, feeling decay in the city, indeed in his own culture in general, turns to "the simple life." He does not do it with the whole-hearted romanticism of, say, a St. John de Crèvecoeur. He sees some of the lighter ironies and laughs at his discomfiture. The *Atlantic* used to run sketches of this sort for its urban readers, and still does occasionally. And *slick* humor uses the idea. The convention has many extensions. Sometimes the adventurer not only finds the natives inept, costly, but lovable, but is himself a competent, self-reliant person who may with ingenuity control the situation. As long as this happens, we get more of the narrator than of the native. Miss Marriott's first chapter starts off so thoughtfully, in such finely-

woven prose, that one expects more objectivity than he gets. The humor, as I said, is lively, and understanding comes through. But the enigmas of alien ways, that we would like to solve rather carefully, remain incompletely penetrated. One would like to see Miss Marriott try a serious approach in fiction, something like that of Katherine Anne Porter.

University of New Mexico

E. W. TEDLOCK, JR.

Western Land and Water Use. Mont H. Saunderson, Denver, Colorado: University of Oklahoma Press, 1950. Pp. xi, 217. \$3.75

Americans living east of, say, the 100th meridian, have long been apathetic toward the problems of Western land and water. Call it provincialism, political immaturity or ordinary ignorance. That's the way it is, or has been.

The Easterner whose view of the West hitherto has been bounded by Pike's Peak and Yellowstone Park on one side and Hollywood, in Technicolor, on the other, is due an awakening. Western resources were never the exclusive concern of the West, and they are less so today. In fact, if one were collecting specimens of public policy issues of gravest importance to the nation, he might concentrate on the subject of this volume without missing much. It appears that it is high time for national comprehension of a national problem. Historical developments are forcing it.

Not all the lack of a Western consciousness is the fault of the inhabitants of other regions. Until now, nobody has come forward with a very striking analysis of the great array of policy questions confronting the West. Except in isolated spectra, the picture simply has not been painted for the layman's eye to see. Generally, the literature has appeared in one of two forms—the gaudy metaphor of the novelist and scenario writer and the soggy jargon of the researcher. In short, the curious few have had a choice between a literary hot foot or a sleeping pill.

Mont Saunderson attempts in *Western Land and Water Use* to tell the story accurately without stifling the reader. It's a good try, the best to date, even though the book does

not quite fulfill the somewhat lavish promise of its dust jacket: the author "... spares no interests, either private or governmental..." and he "proposes stringent measures..." For those who are familiar with the subject, the treatment here provides little that is new or surprising. Its merit lies in the scope and comparative palatability which Saunderson manages to attain in a field of study that usually lacks both.

Western Land and Water Use contains a factual account of public ownership in the West, of taxation and its effects upon land values, of such federal legislation as the Taylor Act, of reclamation and forestry, of river-basin development. To that extent, it is a reference manual. Of far greater significance is its omnipresent backdrop of public vs. private control of Western land and water. This volume moves into bitterly controversial areas, and if it fails to come up with the solid answers, who has? Certainly not the Hoover Commission, which became slightly unhinged when it tackled some of the same questions from the standpoint of public administration.

The problem begins with the protection of water reserves in the upland watershed lands and reaches a climax in the multi-purpose valley developments. Along the way are the clashing interests of ranch operators, state and local governmental units, and such federal agencies as the Bureau of Reclamation, Department of Agriculture, Army Engineers, Federal Power Commission, Forest Service and the National Park Service. For variety, there is the relatively new creation, the valley authority. An integrated policy aimed at reconciling these diverse interests presents about as many alternatives as there are general theories of government.

To stop the deterioration of watershed lands and consequent sedimentation, Saunderson warns that "corrective action must come through public programs for land and water use, in recognition of the public interest in a resource-conservation problem that is now beyond the scope and means of the farms and ranches that use the land." Permanent federal public ownership is probably a closed question "for the lands that have important watershed, forestry, and recreation values." Hydroelectric power is the key to federal reclama-

tion development, and "we should have much more public interest, debate, and participation in the planning of programs and projects."

Saunderson was on leave from the U. S. Forest Service during the preparation of this book, but he did not leave behind the remarkable esprit de corps of that organization. The Forest Service receives gentle treatment, and the flexibility of its management program draws special praise. It is upon privately owned holdings, estimated to contain about 90 percent of the total forest-land growth capacity, that interest must center, he argues, if an acute timber shortage is to be avoided.

River engineering has been overemphasized, in the author's view. "There appear to be important but as yet undeveloped interrelationships between the drainage reclamation of wet lands and other drainage, and the work of flood control downstream. Thus it seems more and more apparent that the control, development, and use of water resources of a major drainage basin should be accomplished through basin-wide plans and programs." For carrying out river-basin planning and development, Saunderson proposes the establishment of a federal-state commission and a program supported by parallel legislation by the states.

As for those who scoff at joint federal-state action, he adds: "Can they propose a more workable plan?" Short of a unified, all-enveloping federal program, can they indeed?

Texas A&M College

JOE R. MOTHERAL

The Epic of the Chaco: Marshal Estigarribia's Memoirs of The Chaco War 1932-1935. Edited and annotated by Pablo Max Ynsfran. The University of Texas, Institute of Latin-American Studies, Latin-American Studies, VIII. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1950. Pp. xv, 221. Illustrated and maps.

The Epic of the Chaco, the story of Paraguay's border war against Bolivia in 1932-1935, is a familiar story in the chronicles of war: that of the valiant fight by a weaker nation against the aggressions of a more powerful neighbor

seeking expansion and aggrandizement under the guise of protecting its own national interests.

Marshal Jose Felix Estigarribia, General of the Army, entered the military services of Paraguay as a second lieutenant in 1910. His later successes in the Chaco War indicate that he possessed that natural insight and ability of the successful military leader of knowing not only how but when to apply his knowledge of the military sciences. In 1927 he was offered and accepted the post of Assistant Chief of Staff of the Paraguayan Army and later, the post of Chief.

The area under dispute in the Chaco War was that section of northwest Paraguay in the triangle formed by the junction of the Paraguay and Pilcomayo Rivers. It is contiguous to Argentina on the south, Brazil on the north, and Bolivia. It is primarily a vast waterless plain, covered mostly by bushes of hardwoods and cactus. The acquisition of this wasteland would provide for Bolivia an outlet on the Paraguay River leading to the open sea, a commercial convenience not enjoyed by that South American nation since the loss of her Pacific seaboard to Chile in 1879. The loss of this vast territory would be for Paraguay an amputation of over a third of her national territory and a serious blow to her national pride.

Bolivia commenced inroads into the Chaco as early as 1927 along the Pilcomayo River in the south and later, as motor transportation became available, into the interior of the Chaco itself. Paraguay's Chief of Staff attempted to counter these moves by the establishment of Paraguayan centers of resistance in the areas of the greatest Bolivian menace and by the development of lines of communication into the interior by the construction of telegraph lines and roads. Estigarribia was dismissed from his post as Chief of Staff in 1928 as the result of a dispute over his policies, and his counter-offensive preparations were abandoned. Paraguayan military policy, as well as their troops, withdrew to the inner boundary of the Chaco along the Paraguay River.

Bolivia, however, was not blessed with a pacifistic policy and, aided by the renouncement of Estigarribia's defensive policies, continued her advancement into the Chaco as fast

as the weather and construction of roads would permit. When another tour as Chief of Staff in 1930 ended in dismissal for the same reasons as before, Estigarribia decided to concentrate his efforts in a smaller field and offered to organize, in the threatened Chaco itself, a Division of troops, a major military sub-division not yet reached by the small Paraguayan Army. His offer was accepted. It was Estigarribia's division that was first involved in an outpost skirmish on July 15, 1932, that brought into actuality the "hot war" with Bolivia. Estigarribia occupied the unique position in this war of being not only the planner but also the executor of the Paraguayan military strategy.

In his Memoirs he portrays the fortunes and failures, most particularly the fortunes, of the Paraguayan Army in the War of the Chaco, in three major subdivisions, namely: The Initial Offensive, The Defensive and, part three, The Offensive to the End. In Estigarribia's chronicle of the war, the layman will find an interesting narrative of battles fought against discouraging combinations of superior forces and an unfriendly terrain. The student of military science will recognize a brilliant application of basic military principles. Faced with a Bolivian penetration into the Chaco from all quarters, the Paraguayans under Estigarribia's direction employed the defensive tactics of a strong offense. Limited in the number of troops and supplies available, an economy of force was employed by relying on minimum strength in the north and central sectors to contain the Bolivian forces there, while the major portion of the Paraguayan Army launched an offensive in the south in September of 1932, with good results.

Unfortunately an overextension of lines of communication in the south, plus the spectre that haunts all aggressively successful military commanders, lack of sufficient supplies and materiel when and where needed, proved too much for the straining new Paraguayan Army. Part Two of the Memoirs records a "strategic withdrawal" along the southern front and the assumption of the defensive in the Chaco. The arrival of replacements for the combat units and a gratifying effort by the Asuncion Government in the matter of war

materiels, placed the Paraguayans in a position to resume the offensive by September, 1933, with the Battle of Pampa Grande. From that point on, the Paraguayans fought not only a numerically superior and better equipped army but a despairing lack of supplies, particularly in the line of motor transport, so vital to any sustained movement and supply over the Chaco Desert. Although occupying the strategically advantageous position of operating on interior lines of communication along the inner arc of the perimeter instead of the outer, Paraguay was handicapped throughout the war by this lack of motor transport. Repeated requests for more trucks and gasoline to the home government were lost in the depth of a rapidly emptying national purse. The Paraguayan forces nevertheless continued a series of effective tactical moves to overcome local reverses and to roll back sufficient Bolivian outposts to gain the banks of the Pilcomayo to the south and even the Parapiti River, marking the west central limits of the Chaco.

Ultimately, negotiations initiated jointly by Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Peru and the United States were successful in bringing the belligerents to agree on terms of an armistice and at noon on June 14th, 1935, the cease fire was ordered on all fronts in the Chaco, with the national boundaries back where they were before three years of war, with thousands of dead to show for the effort expended.

A familiar story in the annals of war and one that will be repeated—correction, that is being repeated. Korea, 1950.

University of New Mexico

MAJOR D. A. VAN EVERA

ERRATA

Vol. 25, p. 41, note no. 8 should state that Fort Leavenworth was located on the Missouri river, not on the Arkansas.

CONSTITUTION

OF THE
HISTORICAL SOCIETY OF NEW MEXICO

(As amended Nov. 25, 1941)

Article 1. *Name.* This Society shall be called the Historical Society of New Mexico.

Article 2. *Objects and Operation.* The objects of the Society shall be, in general, the promotion of historical studies; and in particular, the discovery, collection, preservation, and publication of historical material especially such as relates to New Mexico.

Article 3. *Membership.* The Society shall consist of Members, Fellows, Life Members and Honorary Life Members.

(a) *Members.* Persons recommended by the Executive Council and elected by the Society may become members.

(b) *Fellows.* Members who show, by published work, special aptitude for historical investigation may become Fellows. Immediately following the adoption of this Constitution, the Executive Council shall elect five Fellows, and the body thus created may thereafter elect additional Fellows on the nomination of the Executive Council. The number of Fellows shall never exceed twenty-five.

(c) *Life Members.* In addition to life members of the Historical Society of New Mexico at the date of the adoption hereof, such other benefactors of the Society as shall pay into its treasury at one time the sum of fifty dollars, or shall present to the Society an equivalent in books, manuscripts, portraits, or other acceptable material of an historic nature, may upon recommendation by the Executive Council and election by the Society, be classed as Life Members.

(d) *Honorary Life Members.* Persons who have rendered eminent service to New Mexico and others who have, by published work, contributed to the historical literature of New Mexico or the Southwest, may become Honorary Life Members upon being recommended by the Executive Council and elected by the Society.

Article 4. *Officers.* The elective officers of the Society shall be a president, a vice-president, a corresponding secretary, a treasurer, and a recording secretary; and these five officers shall constitute the *Executive Council* with full administrative powers.

Officers shall qualify on January 1st following their election, and shall hold office for the term of two years and until their successors shall have been elected and qualified.

Article 5. *Elections.* At the October meeting of each odd-numbered year, a nominating committee shall be named by the president of the Society and such committee shall make its report to the Society at the November meeting. Nominations may be made from the floor and the Society shall, in open meeting, proceed to elect its officers by ballot, those nominees receiving a majority of the votes cast for the respective offices to be declared elected.

Article 6. *Dues.* Dues shall be \$3.00 for each calendar year, and shall entitle members to receive bulletins as published and also the *Historical Review*.

Article 7. *Publications.* All publications of the Society and the selection and editing of matter for publication shall be under the direction and control of the Executive Council.

Article 8. *Meetings.* Monthly meetings of the Society shall be held at the rooms of the Society on the third Tuesday of each month at eight P. M. The Executive Council shall meet at any time upon call of the President or of three of its members.

Article 9. *Quorums.* Seven members of the Society and three members of the Executive Council, shall constitute quorums.

Article 10. *Amendments.* Amendments to this constitution shall become operative after being recommended by the Executive Council and approved by two-thirds of the members present and voting at any regular monthly meeting; provided, that notice of the proposed amendments shall have been given at a regular meeting of the Society, at least four weeks prior to the meeting when such proposed amendment is passed upon by the Society.