

# Colonial Latin American Historical Review

---

Volume 15

Issue 3 *Volume 15, Issue 3 (Summer 2006)*

Article 9

---

6-1-2006

## William B. Carter, Indian Alliances and the Spanish in the Southwest, 1750-1750

David M. Brugge

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/clahr>

---

### Recommended Citation

Brugge, David M.. "William B. Carter, Indian Alliances and the Spanish in the Southwest, 1750-1750." *Colonial Latin American Historical Review* 15, 3 (2006): 330. <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/clahr/vol15/iss3/9>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Colonial Latin American Historical Review by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact [amywinter@unm.edu](mailto:amywinter@unm.edu).

conclusions about the use of severed heads in Chiriguana rituals. As an inevitable consequence of this ambitious comparison, the author fails to engage with the major scholarship on some of these ethnic groups. Thus, this book is recommended for those concerned with an analysis of captive slavery rather than for experts on any one of the ethnic groups under examination.

Erick D. Langer  
*Department of History*  
*Georgetown University*

*Indian Alliances and the Spanish in the Southwest, 750-1750.* By William B. Carter. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2009. xx + 308 pp. Maps, bibliography, index. \$34.95 cloth.)

In his latest work, William Carter rightly recognizes the importance of alliance among tribes in the United States' Southwest region, both among the Pueblo groups and between the Pueblos and the Apache. His detailed presentation of evidence in the historical record demonstrates the role of trade in such relationships and supports the significance of intertribal marriage in the formation of cross-cultural amity.

Carter has brought together a great deal of information concerning the period beginning with the first penetration of the Southwest by Spanish exploration to about 1705. He places his book in the necessary context by exploring events that took place during those tumultuous times. It was an era of major upheavals, revolts, and wars, and efforts to make peace following hostilities where such that alliances were most dramatically revealed.

Carter provides new insights into the context in which the narrative of events takes place through excellent background information on such issues as the Little Ice Age and the spread of Old World epidemic disease following contact. He also discusses Spanish thought and policy regarding Native Americans and cultural change brought about by Spanish rule and the role of missionization.

As an interdisciplinary field, ethnohistory requires anthropologists and historians to understand each other's work to a degree well beyond that of a lay person. In this work, the handling of archeological data is not as well done as is that of the historical data. The author tends to over interpret the evidence, leading to factual errors that should serve as a warning to readers to check the accuracy in such matters as the correlation between projectile point styles and bow technology (pp. 22-23). The steady increase in northern traits among the ancient Puebloans, culminating in the Pueblo IV period when kiva murals expand our knowledge of many cultural details, must at some point coincide with close contact with the Athabaskan peoples from the boreal forest. That being said, there is still insufficient data to pinpoint such events with a specific moment in time.

On the basis of tree ring chronology, it is known that by the time of Francisco Coronado, the Navajos were already well established on the San Juan River, practicing some agriculture and producing distinctive ceramics. Coronado was intent on reaching Quivira and, lured by the bison-covered high plains, he ignored any hint of an equally mysterious land to the northwest. This eastward focus limits our view of the early Navajos and Utes. Coronado did encounter the Apachean Querechos of the plains, superb hunters of bison who dressed in northern styles and traveled with the aid of dogs as beasts of burden, also a known northern complex.

While the author's suggestion that the Teyas, who shared several of these northern traits, were speakers of Caddoan language appears accurate, the degree to which they had adopted traits from the Subarctic indicates a long period of close contact with northerners. Going back into prehistory, Carter fails to recognize archeology's limitations. Trade and intermarriage, although suggestive, are not necessarily evidence of alliance. Women taken in war often became wives and in some cultures men who were captured might marry as well. In the midst of hostilities, clandestine trade occurred even in tribal societies.

Human affairs are exceedingly, if not infinitely, complex, and far too often archeological evidence must be interpreted based upon logic, not the tenuous knowledge of long lost ways. Many conclusions made by scholars must be recognized as subject to change when confronted with new data. When scholars deal across that hazy, protohistoric divide, they all need to read deeply and consult widely across that still too-sharp disciplinary boundary.

David M. Brugge  
National Park Service, retired  
Albuquerque, New Mexico

*Domination without Dominance: Inca-Spanish Encounters in Early Colonial Peru.* By Gonzalo Lamana. (Durham: Duke University Press, 2008. xiii + 287 pp. Map, table, notes, glossary, index. \$79.95 cloth, \$22.95 paper.)

*Domination without Dominance* is a remarkable and revealing analysis of Inca-Spanish relations in the Andes. In this work, Gonzalo Lamana unites the finest of discursive analysis with bold historical research in an argument that may fundamentally alter the way the first twenty years of Inca-Spanish relations are understood. Lamana takes on historical narratives that are imprinted with colonial meaning, whether they recognize exclusively Spanish agency or also that of native Andeans. He argues that this colonial imprint projects Spanish dominance onto a period before it was achieved, a period in which radical uncertainty existed regarding the relative strength of Spanish versus Inca political and cultural projects. Historical narratives place undue attention on military battles, he argues, and too little on the vital