New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 85 | Number 4 Article 5

10-1-2010

Book Reviews

Book Reviews

Shadows at Dawn: A Borderlands Massacre and the Violence of History. By Karl Jacoby, foreword by Patricia Nelson Limerick. (New York: Penguin Press, 2008. xix + 358 pp. 46 halftones, line drawings, maps, glossary, notes, bibliography, index. $32.95 cloth, ISBN 978-1-59420-193-6, $17.00 paper, ISBN 978-0-14311-621-9.)

At dawn on 30 April 1871, an armed force of Mexican Americans, Anglo Americans, and Tohono O'odham Indians attacked a peaceful camp of San Carlos Apaches on a military reservation at Camp Grant, a fort established within the Apache homeland. Nearly 150 Apache men, women, and children were killed, and some Apache children were taken to Tucson as captives. The Apaches were under the supervision of the U.S. Army so the attack was an act of war against the United States. The perpetrators of the attack were quickly tried for murder but found not guilty. In *Shadows at Dawn*, Karl Jacoby draws upon the voluminous documentary record of this event to write four beautifully written and moving narratives that eloquently illustrate how violence simultaneously creates and destroys history. By providing a separate narrative for each of the groups involved in the massacre, Jacoby requires the reader to actively participate in making sense of the history recounted in the book, a history that reveals the complicated racial and political relations of the American frontier.

The book is organized into three sections. The first section reviews the long history of violence that characterized political and military relations between the four ethnic groups that occupied southern Arizona. The author

then provides a short section on justice that reviews the brief trial that followed the massacre, a proceeding at which none of the surviving Apaches were present because they were hiding out in the mountains to avoid further attacks. The final section on memory reviews how the massacre is variously recollected by the different groups of people who coped with the aftermath. Jacoby recognizes that historical understanding of the past is malleable, and that written records can fail to represent accurately the past as it was actually lived. He thus tacks between history and storytelling, creating a book that both educates and captivates the reader. The liberal use of Apache, Spanish, and Tohono O'odham words to refer to people, geography, and concepts adds verisimilitude to the narrative. A glossary of these terms helps the reader keep track of them, and copious footnotes and a serviceable index facilitate scholarly use of the book.

Patricia Nelson Limerick contributes a foreword in which she frames Jacoby's book as a validation of her prediction twenty years ago that the discipline of American history was not fading away but on the verge of a renaissance. This high praise of Jacoby's book is justly deserved.

Shadows at Dawn is one of three recent histories of the Camp Grant Massacre, joining Chip Colwell-Chanthaphonh's *Massacre at Camp Grant: Forgetting and Remembering Apache History* (2007) and Ian Record's *Big Sycamore Stands Alone: The Western Apaches, Aravaipa, and the Struggle for Place* (2008). These three books should be read together because they complement one another, each contributing a unique perspective from history, anthropology, and American Indian studies. Jacoby's book is highly recommended for anyone interested in learning about the history of the Camp Grant Massacre and politics and violence in the Borderlands.

T. J. Ferguson
University of Arizona

The American Military Frontiers: The United States Army in the West, 1783–1900. By Robert Wooster. Histories of the American Frontier series. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2009. xvi + 361 pp. 64 halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $39.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-3843-3.)

Robert Wooster, the author of several books on western military history, has undertaken a formidable task in his most recent effort: summarizing in fewer than three hundred pages of text the U.S. Army's entire experience on the frontiers, from the occupation of the Ohio Valley after the American Revolution to the final subjugation of the Native Americans at the end of

the nineteenth century. For the most part, he succeeds admirably. Wooster provides a comprehensive, balanced, and gracefully written synthesis of the vast historical literature on the army's frontier role.

The central focus of Wooster's study is the army's relationship with Indians, and he includes concise accounts of virtually all the significant frontier conflicts: Anthony Wayne's defeat of the Ohio tribes in the 1790s; the often neglected frontier phases of the War of 1812; the wars arising from Indian removal, including the seemingly interminable Second Seminole War of 1835–1842; the effort to assert control over the Far West and Great Plains after the U.S.-Mexico War; the frontier campaigns of the Civil War; and the final suppression of the western tribes in the 1870s and 1880s, climaxing with the Ghost Dance uprising and the massacre of Big Foot's Lakota band at Wounded Knee in 1890. While emphasizing frontier operations, Wooster by no means neglects the broader political and institutional context, and he interweaves much material on civil-military relations, the formulation of western military policy, and congressional debates on the army's size and organization, as well as the social characteristics and mentality of army personnel and garrison life.

Several themes run through the book, the most basic of which is the instrumentality of the army—and the federal government generally—in promoting the relatively orderly advance of white settlement through the breaking of Native American resistance, the enforcement of federal laws, exploration, the development of transportation, and the economic stimulus of military spending in frontier communities. A second thread is the tension between the army's constabulary and preparedness missions. Because the officer corps held frontier duty and Indian fighting in low esteem, it focused throughout the nineteenth century on preparation for a conventional war with a European power. Thus the army never developed a systematic body of doctrine for its most important practical responsibilities—peacekeeping operations and low-intensity warfare. Throughout the book, Wooster also stresses the multiple roles played by regulars in the Borderlands, who served as policemen, administrators, explorers, road builders, diplomats, scientists, conservation advocates, and business agents, as well as combat leaders. Despite the ethnocentrism and cultural myopia often demonstrated by the officer corps and the brutality that often accompanied frontier operations, Wooster seems to find the army's overall performance positive, preventing the extreme dispersion, chaos, and violence that would surely have resulted from the absence of military restraint on white expansion.

The American Military Frontiers is a work of historical synthesis, and the author draws heavily on the research of a host of frontier and military

scholars, including Francis Paul Prucha, Robert M. Utley, Durwood Ball, Edward M. Coffman, Samuel J. Watson, Alvin M. Josephy Jr., and Michael L. Tate. He supplements these sources with his own extensive research in officers' personal papers, congressional documents, and especially the official records of the War Department. Inevitably a book of this scope will generate minor quibbles. Wooster incorrectly states that Congress rejected John C. Calhoun's famous expansible army plan in 1821. Actually, a diluted version of the plan passed, and it became a centerpiece of American defense policy. In his attempt at comprehensiveness, the author covers some of the army's myriad campaigns and constabulary operations rather hastily and superficially. Occasionally, he cites a source out of context, as when he uses the account of U.S.-Mexico War veteran George Ballentine to illustrate soldier motivation during Pres. Thomas Jefferson's administration. Nevertheless, Wooster has produced a concise, reliable, and well-written account of the army's Borderlands experience, and the book deserves the attention of academic specialists, students, general readers, and military professionals engaged in the army's latest constabulary mission.

William B. Skelton
University of Wisconsin-Stevens Point

Soldiers West: Biographies from the Military Frontier. Edited by Paul Andrew Hutton and Durwood Ball, 2d ed. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2009. xii + 404 pp. Maps, notes, index. $34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-3997-5.)

Long before the History Channel, Americans enjoyed getting their history through the biographies of those who made it. The second edition of *Soldiers West*—the University of Nebraska Press published the first edition in 1987—illustrates this point well. The first edition followed major syntheses of American frontier military history by scholars such as Francis Paul Prucha and Robert M. Utley; this edition incorporates broad looks by historians Robert Wooster, Michael L. Tate, and others. Like the first edition, this book's brief but generally encompassing and well-written biographies show how individual army officers influenced western settlement, Native peoples, political and economic development, science and technology, and American society and culture in general during the nineteenth century.

This edition, like the first, focuses chiefly on the Trans-Mississippi West, with the heaviest emphasis on the post–Civil War era. Its subjects represent a spectrum of officer contributions from exploration and scientific and literary endeavors to fort building and Indian fighting. Peacemaking and peacekeeping

are also themes. Gone from the first volume are Utley's introduction and biographies of William Clark, William B. Hazen, and Frank D. Baldwin. New to this edition are the introduction by historian Durwood Ball and articles on Stephen Watts Kearney, Phillip St. George Cooke, John M. Chivington, and Oliver Otis Howard. James H. Carleton, who also appeared in the first edition, has a different biographer. The piece on John M. Chivington—never an army regular—is included, the editors write, because it enables exploration of "the often troubling relationship of volunteers" with regular army officers "particularly on the frontier" (p. xi). The authors of the biographies include leading academics, rising doctoral students, and experienced National Park Service and other public historians, many of whom have written extensively about their subjects elsewhere. Most writers whose articles appeared in the first edition have updated their documentation.

The breadth of officer contributions the authors depict is impressive and defies brief summation. For example Roger L. Nichols describes the scientific expeditions and navigational engineering feats of Stephen H. Long, who coined the term "Great American Desert"; Ball characterizes Stephen Watts Kearney as "the army's principal frontier troubleshooter" in the antebellum period; and J'Nell L. Pate ascribes a similar role to Ranald S. MacKenzie in the postbellum era (p. 54). Scott L. Stabler and Jerome A. Greene treat Howard's and George Crook's humanitarian impulses toward Native populations; Joseph C. Porter admirably presents the anthropological and folkloristic research of John B. Bourke; and Paul L. Hedren tells how the voluminous writings of Charles King, both fiction and nonfiction, "helped fashion America's image of the Old Army and its national role . . . in the American West" (p. 377). Especially noteworthy are articles by Utley on Nelson A. Miles, Paul Hutton on Philip Sheridan, and Brian W. Dippie on George A. Custer. William S. Harney and Benjamin H. Geierson are also treated.

The eight maps are too few and mostly too small in scale, but the illustrations of each officer are helpful. In sum *Soldiers West* merits a place on every frontier military history bookshelf.

George Rollie Adams
Strong National Museum of Play

Where a Hundred Soldiers Were Killed: The Struggle for the Powder River Country in 1866 and the Making of the Fetterman Myth. By John H. Monnett. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2008. xxxiv + 316 pp. 32 halftones, 10 maps, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-4503-5.)

John H. Monnett challenges long-accepted perceptions concerning the Battle of One Hundred Slain, or the Fetterman Fight, as it is more popularly known. His primary goal is to provide a more accurate accounting of who was at "fault" for the U.S. Army's defeat by fifteen hundred Lakota, Cheyenne, and Arapaho warriors on 21 December 1866. Monnett resurrects the career of Capt. William J. Fetterman, long the scapegoat for the defeat, and shifts the blame to Lt. George Washington Grummond. In this effort, Monnett is singularly successful. He astutely examines the complex political, environmental, and economic history of the highly contested Powder River country. He also reveals pertinent professional and personal histories for many of the individuals involved, both Anglo and Indian. In doing so, he offers a broader and richer understanding of the forces that led to this seminal event in western history.

Monnett first examines the origins of the Fetterman Myth, which previously laid the eighty-one American dead at the feet of Captain Fetterman because of his brashness, overeagerness, and inability to follow orders. Here the author finds that Margaret Carrington, the wife of the post commander Henry B. Carrington, built upon her husband's testimony to the Sanborn Commission, which investigated the "disaster." She first cast doubts upon Carrington in her book, *Ab-sa-ra-ka, Home of the Crows: Being the Experience of an Officer's Wife on the Plains*, published in 1868. Many of her contemporaries, and later authors such as Dee Brown, solidified the idea of Carrington's culpability. Monnett then explores the environmental and Native history of the region to provide a solid understanding of why the Lakotas and their allies resisted American presence in this area so determinedly. He then takes the reader on a detailed journey from the building of Fort Phil Kearny through its destruction. During this trip, Monnett provides invaluable maps of the region, the fort, and the battle itself. He also clearly demonstrates that if any officer on this expedition was brash, overeager, and incapable of following orders, it was Lieutenant Grummond. Overall, Monnett provides an important and well-written study of a long misunderstood battle. Any instructor or student of cultural encounters would do well to add this to their reading list.

This book is not without its flaws. Monnett hoped to reinvigorate the relevancy of military history within the broader fields of western and Ameri-

can history. He does so by tying these events to the theme of indigenous peoples resisting invaders within a military context, such as in Vietnam. He fails, however, to bring his story of the Fetterman Fight within a broader discussion of colonialism and colonization, thus missing a better chance for arguing the relevance of military history within today's historical contexts. Moreover, Monnett's theoretical concept of ultimately blaming an American for the military defeat fails to fully impart the role Native Americans played. Whether or not Lieutenant Grummond raced ahead of the infantry, the entire force would still have been destroyed once it entered the ambush. Lakotas, Cheyennes, and Arapahos won the battle, period.

Jeff Means
University of Wyoming

¡Viva Elfego! The Case for Elfego Baca, Hispanic Hero. By Stan Sager. (Santa Fe, N.Mex.: Sunstone Press, 2008. 279 pp. 13 halftones, notes. $24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-86534-608-6.)

Elfego Baca occupies a unique place in New Mexico history. He was one of the first members of the Hispanic community to successfully challenge the assertion of the American conquerors that the local inhabitants were second-class citizens. Baca was born in Socorro, New Mexico, in 1865, but raised in Topeka, Kansas. After receiving an elementary school education there, Baca spoke English better than his native Spanish. Upon returning to Socorro in the early 1880s, Baca was outraged at reports of atrocities inflicted by Texas cowhands on the inhabitants of San Francisco Plaza (present-day Reserve, New Mexico). In 1884 Baca obtained a deputy sheriff's commission and, in an act of extreme foolhardiness, single-handedly confronted these tough cowhands. Two cowboys died in the shootout. As a result of the notoriety he received for this show of courage, Baca embarked upon a long, and sometimes controversial, career as an attorney, politician, public servant, lawman, gunfighter, partisan in the Mexican Revolution, and all-around character. As New Mexico prepared for statehood, he narrowly missed winning a seat in the U.S. House of Representatives in the election of 1911. Although Baca was a frequent candidate for the governorship and other public offices late in life, his career went into rather abject decline. He died in 1945 at the age of eighty. Stan Sager, the author of this volume, is a longtime Albuquerque attorney and adjunct professor in the University of New Mexico's School of Architecture.

The author's purpose is to determine the reasons for Baca's failure to maintain the heroic reputation that he created in the encounter with the

Texas cowboys in 1884. Somehow, Sager asserts, Baca was "denied the honor he deserves" (p. 10). In the 1960s and 1970s, the leaders of the Chicano civil rights movement ignored him as an inspirational figure. Sager decided to become his "advocate" and uses James N. Muir's memorial sculpture of Baca as an illustration for the cover of this volume.

In consultation with professional psychiatrists, the author concludes that Baca suffered from post-traumatic stress disorder, or "shell shock," as a consequence of his stressful experience with the Texas cowhands. In the absence of proper medical care, Baca had "to tough it out" during the course of his long life (p. 12). One way he attempted to cope was by resorting to alcohol. Another was through outbursts of temper and belligerent behavior, sometimes involving the use of his six-shooter. Sager believes that, adding to Baca's difficulties, he suffered from an inferiority complex arising from the dislocations in his childhood, which contributed to the development of a "savior complex." Unfortunately, Baca was unable to deal sufficiently with his problems, and his public career suffered. While he held many county-level positions, he failed to win higher offices.

While Sager rightly believes Baca deserves more recognition than he has received, some readers might question the author's assertion that a psychiatric condition explains Baca's failure to maintain a heroic image in New Mexico. In the absence of a living Baca to diagnose, such an analysis can only be speculative. Baca's bad decisions that harmed his public career might be attributed to poor judgment and desperate self-promotion. The disappointment arising from his narrow defeat in the race for the U.S. House of Representatives in 1911 may have been a turning point in his conduct. However, Baca's questionable involvement in the Mexican Revolution and "over-the-top" efforts to shape his public image also turned off many potential supporters. As Howard Bryan pointed out in *Incredible Elfego Baca: Good Man, Bad Man of the Old West* (1993), only Anglos—no Hispanics—served as pallbearers at his funeral. These remarks aside, Sager is to be complimented for adding much new factual material to the Baca story. While the author's section of endnotes is helpful, the absence of a bibliography and index renders the book less useful to readers.

Larry D. Ball
Arkansas State University, emeritus

From Guns to Gavels: How Justice Grew Up in the Outlaw West. By Bill Neal. (Lubbock: Texas Tech University Press, 2008. xx + 364 pp. 59 halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-89672-637-6.)

In *From Guns to Gavels*, Bill Neal provides a lively written and informative collection of crimes and trials during the late nineteenth century that center on West Texas, New Mexico Territory, and Oklahoma Territory. The first story, a deadly feud between two lawmen, begins in 1890. Although by then this region of the Southwest contained a coherent justice system and was no longer a "frontier" in the traditional sense, this story conveys at the start that legitimate criminal justice still competed with earlier notions of self-redress and mob law.

While the stories themselves are entertaining and well documented, the beauty of this book is the way in which each story is linked together by various protagonists from earlier incidents. The end result is a string of tales that extends from 1890 to 1929. These items demonstrate that societal changes during this time period created a justice system where the rule of law eventually took precedent.

Neal argues that regional culture, together with the competence of law officers, determined whether the justice system operated properly. As Neal notes, the areas where these incidents took place had plenty of laws and, for the most part, officials to enforce them. Moreover, legislatures were often responsive and enacted statutes to firm up the justice system. In 1897, for example, the Texas legislature passed anti-lynching reforms in the aftermath of a number of sensational lynchings.

The irony in these lynchings, as was often the case in other areas of the United States, is that most victims were taken by mobs from jails where they were awaiting prosecution. A lack of law was not the problem. Citizens simply did not trust that the law would produce justice in the form of a speedy conviction (and, in most cases, execution). That skepticism, coupled with the collective community support for mob justice, led to lynchings. As one contemporary Texas judge noted, anti-lynching laws needed the support of the community, which in turn would require a substantial change in public mores and beliefs. The same could be said for the instances Neal documents when individuals took the law into their own hands by killing a rival and then successfully claiming self-defense, regardless of the incident's outrageousness.

Neal makes a compelling argument. Yet, the strength of the study—the use of sensational anecdotes—is also one of its weaknesses. Can we really judge a justice system on the basis of sensational incidents, occasions when the system is arguably at its most vulnerable and prone to break down? An

analysis of a broader range of prosecutions and their outcomes would help strengthen the author's argument.

That said this book is compelling and informative. Neal's prior experience as both a prosecutor and defense attorney serves him well, and provides an interpretation of events beyond the reach of scholars who have never plied their trade in a courtroom.

Paul T. Hietter
Mesa Community College

Jedediah Smith: No Ordinary Mountain Man. By Barton H. Barbour. Oklahoma Western Biography series, vol. 23. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2009. xiv + 290 pp. 15 halftones, maps, appendixes, bibliography, index. $26.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4011-7.)

Barton H. Barbour's biography of Jedediah Smith is volume twenty-three of the Oklahoma Western Biography series offered by the University of Oklahoma Press. This series is designed to "provide readable life stories of significant westerners and to show how their lives illuminate a notable topic" (p. xi). For new fur trade inductees and old hands alike, Barbour offers a balanced view of the preeminent mountain man from the class of 1822—Jedediah Strong Smith. In a career that spanned less than a decade, Smith emerged as a natural leader who earned the trust of his hunting companions and at the same time cemented his place as a mover and shaker in the American fur trade.

Although attempting to avoid the trap of hero worship, Barbour does seem to fall under the spell that surrounds Smith. Given the nature of Smith's life and his accomplishments, it is hard to fault Barbour for the subtle veneration that emerges during the course of the biography. Referring to Smith as a "supernova in the galaxy of mountain men who roamed the Rockies," Barbour begins the biography with a fictionalized account of Smith's mysterious death on the Santa Fe Trail in 1831 (p. 6). From there, he presents Smith's numerous accomplishments. Barbour touches on Smith's recognition of the value of South Pass to western expansion; the establishment of the fur-trading firm Smith, Jackson, and Sublette; the Southwest Expedition; and the trail to California, to name a few.

At first glance, Barbour's biography appears as a rehash of the golden era of the American fur trade. However, given that Smith's career takes place within the framework of this period, Barbour has no other choice than to lead us down that well-worn path. Barbour's use of recently discovered documentary

sources that he calls "archival bonanzas" salvages the narrative (p. 9). What emerges is a glimpse at the character flaws and machinations of a man who was a product of his times. Smith was consumed by ambition and zealous for the title of preeminent explorer on par with Meriwether Lewis and William Clark, Alexander McKenzie, George Vancouver, and David Thompson. He promoted the expansion of the United States from sea to shining sea while condemning the Native Americans, Mexicans, and British who stood opposed to this vision. Barbour delivers a Jedediah Smith who put his breeches on one leg at a time.

Barbour's only stumble, in this reviewer's opinion, is his rather confusing geographic monologue regarding Smith's return to the rendezvous of 1829 (p. 241). In all fairness, fault for this issue may reside with the University of Oklahoma Press's decision to omit footnotes from the series. As a student of history, this reviewer laments the lack of footnotes that serve as guideposts to any good historical inquiry.

Rich Aarstad
Montana Historical Society

Zeckendorfs and Steinfelds: Merchant Princes of the American Southwest. By Bettina O'Neil Lyons. (Tucson: Arizona Historical Society, 2008. xii + 401 pp. 49 halftones, table, notes, bibliography, index. $24.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-910037-49-5.)

The Zeckendorf brothers (Aaron, Louis, and William) began their merchant careers in New Mexico during the 1850s under the sponsorship of their highly successful German Jewish Spiegelberg cousins. Seeing less competition and more opportunities in the new Arizona Territory, the brothers ventured to Tucson, Arizona, in 1866. Overcoming dangers, disorder, and some losses, the Zeckendorfs planted themselves in Tucson under a variety of store names, enterprises, and partnerships. Soon they expanded into real estate, banking, and mining. The Zeckendorfs were at the core of the pioneer businessmen of southeastern Arizona, and they and their descendants were hailed as "merchant princes."

After Aaron died and William went his separate way, L. Zeckendorf and Co. generally prospered, thanks largely to the hard work and talent of their nephew Albert Steinfeld. Like other German Jewish merchant families, one member moved to New York to serve as the buyer, in this case Louis Zeckendorf, while another, Albert Steinfeld, managed the local enterprise. Steinfeld was very ambitious. Using the company's name and assets, he plunged into

copper mining without the full consent and knowledge of his uncle Louis. That venture led to a bitter lawsuit that reached the Supreme Court. Prior to Louis's victory, Albert bought out his uncle and established Albert Steinfeld and Co. as a mainstay in Tucson's "new" downtown.

"The Store," as the family referred to it, gained a reputation for selling high-quality goods and offering excellent service. Meanwhile, Albert and his son Harold, who succeeded him as president, jealously guarded their control. Steinfeld's survived the Great Depression, but failed to adjust to new trends in the postwar years and folded in 1984.

Bettina O'Neil Lyons, the author of the current volume, is the granddaughter of Albert and Bettina Steinfeld and the great granddaughter of Lena Zeckendorf and Levi Steinfeld. She has done extensive research in the archives, has mined family papers in her possession, and drawn on family lore. She honestly confronts the family warts (William Zeckendorf's gambling habits and irresponsibility), conflicts (notably the Louis Zeckendorf–Albert Steinfeld lawsuits), mistakes (Harold Steinfeld's slow response to the shift in merchandising to regional shopping centers), and Harold's reluctance to sell the store and its valuable real estate in a timely fashion.

The resulting work is part business history and part family memoir. Lyons maintains that the Steinfelds were innovative, but fails to explain and analyze what they really did. She burdens the text with very long quotes from family correspondence and newspaper stories and unnecessary detail on the family's social life and habits. Historians of Western American Jewish history will find little to draw on. Albert helped found Tucson's first synagogue, but apparently was not very committed to his faith; his wife converted to Christian Science and most of the family intermarried. Their story echoes that of the Goldwaters of Arizona and the Spiegelbergs of New Mexico.

Lyons does not draw new conclusions about early Jewish merchants in the West and offers little in comparative analysis. She does, however, add another chapter to the history of merchandising and Jewish entrepreneurship, provides colorful material on Tucson's development, and reveals much about the lives of the prominent Zeckendorf and Steinfeld families.

Noel H. Pugach
University of New Mexico

Manifest Destinies: The Making of the Mexican American Race. By Laura E. Gómez. (New York: New York University Press, 2007. xii + 243 pp. Notes, bibliography, index. $35.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8147-3174-1.)

The question of whether Mexican Americans constitute a separate race might at first seem to be an internal debate within the group. Laura E. Gómez's groundbreaking examination of racial dynamics in New Mexico makes the strong case that understanding this question reveals a pivotal chapter in the history of race and racial difference for Americans. In *Manifest Destinies*, Gómez interrogates the meaning and power of whiteness, particularly as it enabled the colonization of the newly acquired northern Mexico territory. As a result, the book produces a novel interpretation of the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo of 1848, and makes the case for its elevated significance for understanding race relations in American history. As Gómez points out, this analysis is made more difficult by the almost absolute attention the Civil War and Reconstruction have held on the narrative of race in the nineteenth century.

To locate Mexican Americans within American racial politics, Gómez employs the concept of "off-white" to capture the paradoxical and contradictory nature of whiteness as it applies to Mexican people in the context of American imperial expansion. Focusing on New Mexican elites, Gómez outlines a social landscape where Mexican people are considered white in the eyes of the law, but treated as less than white otherwise. While it might appear to be a nuanced position, that racial dynamic created a situation in which northern Mexican people participate in their own colonization by claiming whiteness. Or as Gómez writes, "Intentionally or not, they [elite Mexican Americans] became agents in the reproduction of racial subordination and contributed to the consolidation of a new version of white supremacy in the Southwest" (p. 115). Gómez argues that this new racial logic established a new social framework after 1848 that facilitated territorial acquisition and the incorporation of new populations in the modern era.

The strength of *Manifest Destinies* lies in Gómez's elegantly written narrative that combines legal analysis with social and historical detail. The book destabilizes myths and preconceived attitudes about American expansion and colonization into the Mexican north. The first chapter delves into the illegitimate prosecution and execution of Mexicans and Indians for the assassination of American civil governor Charles Bent in 1847. For much of the book, Gómez carefully situates Mexican Americans in the complex racial landscape of an area that included multiple indigenous groups. Americans were able to exploit conflicts and differences between Mexicans and Indians to

come across as protectors of order while maintaining a racial structure where they remained on top. As Gómez notes, in the process of claiming whiteness, Mexican Americans lost their communal lands while Pueblo Indians secured their lands by being nonwhite. Gómez returns to the point that the price of *de jure* whiteness resulted in something less than equality, and cemented an inferior racial position for Mexican Americans for decades after.

Manifest Destinies provides a critical perspective as part of several projects that are both reinterpreting the significance of the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo and redefining the trajectory of race in American history. The book makes a significant contribution to how we analyze race, taking a leap forward from the work of David Montejano, Neil Foley, Ian Haney-Lopez, and Pablo Mitchell. Taken together with recent work on the American Southwest by Brian DeLay and Karl Jacoby, Gómez's examination of late-nineteenth-century New Mexico has reshaped the narrative of American westward expansion to account for the impact of the colonial state and multiple and sometimes competing racial and social contexts. *Manifest Destinies* accomplishes the rare feat of combining disparate historical narratives and engaging several debates while making a meaningful impact on all of them.

Raúl A. Ramos
University of Houston

The Los Angeles Plaza: Sacred and Contested Space. By William David Estrada, foreword by Devra Weber. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2008. xv + 357 pp. 56 halftones, maps, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $60.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-292-71754-1, $24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-292-71755-8.)

This book on the historic heart of Los Angeles, its plaza, is a welcome extension of the two standard works on the subject: W. W. Robinson's *Los Angeles From the Days of the Pueblo* (1981) and Jean Bruce Poole and Tevvy Ball's *El Pueblo: The Historic Heart of Los Angeles* (2002). William David Estrada treads familiar ground in chapters 1, 2, and 3, dealing with the Indian, Spanish, Mexican, and American periods, although with misspellings of several names, imprecise dates, and some significant omissions.

Beginning with chapter 4, firsthand observations enrich our understanding of the history of the Plaza's place and people. Chapter 5, covering the Plaza as a forum for radical oratory, makes marginal martyrs of revolutionaries such as Homer Lea and the Magón brothers. Publisher Harrison Gray Otis and investor Harry Chandler serve as recurrent villains, symbolizing all greedy Anglo profiteers. The identification of victimized minorities, unlikable vil-

lains, and sympathetic outcasts would risk the charge of polemics if these perspectives were not our current "common wisdom." Oral interviews with two communist organizers from the 1920s and 1930s contribute valuable insights and a new perspective.

Chapters 6, 7, and 8 develop a major theme: the willful erasure of minorities, especially the Italians (discrimination claimed but not conclusively shown), the Chinese (displaced from the Plaza for Union Station, 1933–1939, but without full development of the impact of American laws on demographic imbalance, generation gaps, or property rights), and Mexicans (given the most empathetic treatment). These tales of racial displacement echo the erasure from historic memory (prior to a 1981 plaque) of the racial composition of the eighteenth-century Plaza's original forty-four settlers. The pattern of obliterating racial memory was turned inside out by socialite Christine Sterling and her elite backers when she created ethnic theme parks of Olvera Street (opened in 1930) and China City (opened in 1938). China City was soon eclipsed by the Chinese community's own rival tourist spot, New Chinatown.

The accounts of manufactured ethnic myths, a confined free-speech zone, and violent confrontations are part of the author's larger project of bringing to life the geographic space of the Plaza. In the early chapters, the author identifies some of the residences, businesses, and daily life around the Plaza. In chapters 4 through 8, through events and recorded memories, the Plaza emerges from the static histories of earlier chroniclers and myth-makers as a vibrant multi-ethnic community.

Estrada succeeds in explaining how that community was formed over time. The assaults of progressive era and interwar reformers on the Plaza area, in the guise of "cleansing" a "problem" zone, lead Estrada to conclude that redevelopment/gentrification of nearby poor and ethnic spaces, especially Bunker Hill (as of the 1950s) and Broadway (currently in the spotlight), pose a threat similar to the Plaza story.

Altogether, anyone interested in the Plaza or in ethnic community formation and destruction must read *The Los Angeles Plaza*.

Merry Ovnick
California State University, Northridge

White but Not Equal: Mexican Americans, Jury Discrimination, and the Supreme Court. By Ignacio M. Garcia. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2009. xii + 239 pp. Halftones, notes, bibliography, index. $55.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-2750-2, $24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8165-2751-9.)

White but Not Equal is dedicated to four attorneys, Gustavo Garcia, Carlos Cadena, John J. Herrera, and James De Anda, who fought Texas all the way to the Supreme Court on behalf of Pete Hernandez. In 1951 Hernandez killed Joe Espinoza outside a Jackson County bar; three years later, the Supreme Court ruled that Texas had discriminated against him by excluding Mexican Americans from the jury pool.

The story of this case holds great promise as a vehicle for discussing some of the most important themes in Mexican American and Southwest history. Among these themes are where Mexicans fit as a group that was neither white nor black in the U.S. racial order at mid-twentieth century; the rise of a civil rights consciousness among Mexican American veterans and others after World War II; the demise of Jim Crow in Texas, where Mexicans felt it most severely; the connection between the postwar civil rights era and the later Chicano Movement; the emergence of the Mexican American middle class (represented by the lawyers); the nature of second-class citizenship for Mexican Americans, which included wholesale discrimination from jury service in many parts of the Southwest; and the evolution of constitutional law to include protection of Mexican Americans as a distinct class (if not race).

White but Not Equal touches on all these topics, but it falls short. First, Ignacio M. Garcia is wont to make broad generalizations without adequate citation and contextualization. For example, he writes, "The Chicano Movement was also a result of the ruling" (p. 9). Second, Garcia does not adequately engage the relevant literatures. He fails to cite recent work on the case, such as the essay "Jim Crow, Mexican Americans, and the Anti-Subordination Constitution: The Story of *Hernandez v. Texas*" (2008) by legal scholars Ian Haney Lopez and Michael A. Olivas. Garcia lists the anthology *"Colored Men and Hombres Aqui"*: Hernandez v. Texas *and the Emergence of Mexican-American Lawyering* (2006) in the bibliography but never cites it in the endnotes. Moreover, he fails to grapple with the larger intellectual debates about Mexican Americans and whiteness, class divisions among Mexicans, and the stages of the Mexican American civil rights movement.

Yet *White but Not Equal*, like the PBS documentary "A Class Apart: A Mexican American Civil Rights Story" (2009), makes an important contribution by shedding more light on a deserving topic. Garcia's book provides a great deal more information about the homicide that led to this case; the life

stories of the killer, the victim, and the social context of cotton-belt Texas in which they lived; and all facets of the litigation effort. Drawing effectively on newspaper accounts, Garcia also provides a sense of the drama—and humor—of oral arguments before the Supreme Court, including lead attorney Gus Garcia's reference to Sam Houston as the "wetback" from Tennessee and his response to Chief Justice Earl Warren's question about whether Mexican Americans would assimilate: "We hope so . . . but two or three places in Texas are giving us plenty of trouble," answered Garcia (p. 143).

Laura E. Gómez
University of New Mexico

Reclaiming Diné History: The Legacies of Navajo Chief Manuelito and Juanita. By Jennifer Nez Denetdale. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2007. xiv + 241 pp. Halftones, notes, appendix, selected bibliography, index. $45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-2420-4, $19.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8165-2660-4.)

In this work, Jennifer Nez Denetdale uses her personal genealogical narrative to attempt a reexamination of the way histories about the Navajo people have been, and continue to be, cloaked by the language and assumptions of a colonialist record. In this text, Denetdale aims to re-view the lives of two important figures in Navajo history—Chief Manuelito and his wife Juanita (from whom Denetdale is descended)—from an insider Diné perspective. What Denetdale offers is an auto-ethnography that shares family stories about Manuelito and Juanita, replete with genealogical data that may be useful to others. Using interviews with family members and reflections on trips to various archives, Denetdale chronicles her personal journey to recover Juanita and Manuelito and their Navajo-ness from the colonial record.

Denetdale divides her book into six parts. Chapter 2, the first of the five substantive sections of the text, examines Navajo studies as a discipline. Here, she explores the relationship between history and oral traditions, and asserts that oral traditions have consistently been misunderstood, or disregarded entirely, by those writing Navajo histories. While not proffering a new argument, Denetdale makes clear that this problem is one she aims to rectify. Thus, for the remainder of this chapter, she uses Navajo origin stories and personal interviews to highlight the disservice done by scholarship that dismisses Diné people as cultural borrowers who were newcomers to the Southwest. Chapter 3 then examines archival materials and secondary sources that have chronicled the life of Manuelito and compares them to histories told in Navajo communities. Although Denetdale's goal clearly is to argue

that such histories reproduce colonial thinking, justify conquest, and erase the attendant violence, the reader is left to infer such connections, however true they may be.

Chapter 4 uses twelve photographs to illustrate how Navajo gender roles, after 1868, were influenced by American cultural values. The fifth chapter employs stories about Juanita's life passed down through the matrilineal clan system coupled with Navajo origin stories to reveal, "Navajo women have struggled to retain positions of autonomy and authority in their society" (p. 158). In the sixth and final chapter, Denetdale elaborates on the stories about Juanita from the previous chapter to exhibit how they have been employed contemporarily to structure Navajo understandings of the past.

Although the analysis Denetdale promises in her introduction (chapter 1) will surely entice readers, in the end the reader is left wanting more details and critical exploration. While she explains to the reader that archival records have always been filtered through the documenter's colonialist perspective, informing her audience that these portrayals mirror American national thinking about Native peoples' level of "development" (from savage to defeated and civilizable) does not make the case nor does it provide readers with the tools to embark on such projects themselves. Yet, the fact that the book leaves the reader wanting more may very well pave the way for other scholars to continue what Denetdale has begun: adding to the body of Navajo and Southwest studies scholarship.

Danika Medak-Saltzman
University of Colorado, Boulder

The Indian Craze: Primitivism, Modernism, and Transculturation in American Art, 1890–1915. By Elizabeth Hutchinson. (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 2009. xv + 277 pp. 8 color plates, 80 halftones, notes, bibliography, index. $89.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8223-4390-5, $24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8223-4408-7.)

In *The Indian Craze*, Elizabeth Hutchinson examines the flourishing interest in collecting and exhibiting Native American art at the turn of the twentieth century. While such art was widely admired as a counterpoint to rapid urban industrialization, Hutchinson points to the modern means by which it was produced, promoted, and disseminated. Indian-made objects appeared in department stores, world's fairs, museum exhibitions, and settlement houses, and were displayed in American homes. The Indian craze, Hutchinson writes, was a "transcultural phenomenon that brought Indians

and non-Indians together" (p. 5). By emphasizing the display of Native and non-Native pottery, basketry, beadwork, and weaving alongside painting and sculpture in early-twentieth-century art institutions, Hutchinson challenges the traditional segregation of Native American and mainstream art history. Further, Hutchinson suggests that the hierarchy between art and craft, made popular by mid-twentieth-century theorists, obscured the influence that Native American art had on "the emergence of modernist aesthetic ideals" (p. 7). Hutchinson's focus on the years from 1890 to 1915, before distinctions between art and craft were solidified, allows for the recognition of modernity in a broader variety of Native American material culture.

Hutchinson's first chapter deals with the creation of "Indian Corners" in urban middle-class American homes, and demonstrates how Native American art entered commodity culture. Her second chapter considers how the Indian craze impacted Indian school curriculums and was incorporated into efforts for social reform. In her third chapter, Hutchinson shows how Americans began to view Indian art aesthetically at the beginning of the twentieth century. Hutchinson's fourth chapter focuses on Gertrude Käsebier's work, "Some Indian Portraits," to explore how the famed photographer negotiated tensions between the primitive and the modern as a female artist. In her last chapter, Hutchinson addresses the political and modern aesthetic goals of Winnebago artist and teacher Angel DeCora.

To address this range of subject matter, Hutchinson employs a broad variety of source materials, including art journals and popular magazines, museum exhibits, paintings, drawings, and historic photographs. The book's eighty-eight illustrations, eight of which are in color, serve as a foundation for her analysis. Throughout *The Indian Craze*, Hutchinson carefully positions her work in relationship to other scholarship, and reiterates her interventions to her readers. As a result of Hutchinson's methodology, the rise of modernism is re-cast and boundaries of traditional Native American art history are questioned. Hutchinson's transcultural approach and intensive visual analysis will be particularly instructive for scholars in the fields of art history, American studies, and Native American studies.

Alison Fields
University of Oklahoma

Indian-Made: Navajo Culture in the Marketplace, 1868–1940. By Erika Marie Bsumek. (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2008. x + 292 pp. 30 halftones, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-7006-1595-7.)

Erika Bsumek opens her excellent new study of Navajo arts and crafts and the origins of "Indian-made" products in the marketplace with a discussion of an alluring invitation to a "Navaho Indian Fiesta" at the home of Mr. and Mrs. Frederick Goodwin of New York City in 1901. The invitation promised partygoers a talk by a medicine man, a "Navaho Wedding," and a performance of an Indian lullaby. Chief Wets It, whose photograph graces the invitation's cover, was meant to pique the curiosity of the viewer with his painted face, elaborate headdress, and boldly striped chief's blanket. But as Bsumek notes, Chief Wets It, although Indian, was not a Navajo; none of the performers at the party were Navajo. All the entertainers were whites "playing" Indian, and as part of their performances, they incorporated southwestern Indian artifacts, including Navajo blankets, to represent a particular kind of product rather than a specific Native group.

That market-oriented product, as Bsumek argues, came to be constructed by a complex array of groups in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. This body included consumers, anthropologists, government officials, traders, retailers, and cultural impresarios. Through the various racializing practices of these groups, Navajo artisans and their products were imagined and represented as primitive and preindustrial, referred to by the anglicized "Navaho." As Bsumek expertly demonstrates, however, the artisans did not passively submit to this stereotype. Whenever possible they resisted the images that had been constructed for them and became active participants in the marketplace. Bsumek's analysis of this dynamic interplay, and the many layers of meaning attached to "Navaho" and "Indian-made" that emerged from it, contributes in significant ways to scholars' understanding of the connections between the consumer-oriented marketplace and productions of race in late-nineteenth- and early-twentieth-century America.

The author organized *Indian-Made* around the groups involved in imagining and representing the "Navaho." Drawing on extensive archival research, Bsumek considers the role of the southwestern tourist industry in forging a picturesque, primitive image of Navajos; the contributions of traders and trading posts to the marketing of that image; the layers of meaning that informed consumption of "Navaho" products by whites, particularly well-to-do women seeking to incorporate Indian-made goods into their modern households; and dealers who played a central role in promoting this form of domestic imperialism. Bsumek also acknowledges the importance of museum

professionals whose exhibits helped authenticate the "Navaho" while also reinforcing vanishing-race theory.

One of the stronger chapters considers the codifying of "Navaho" through the "Indian-made" controversy of the 1930s. The issue centered on Maisel's Indian Trading Post in Albuquerque surreptitiously using modern machinery, operated by non-Navajo Indians, in the production of Indian jewelry, thereby complicating the meaning of "Indian-made" for consumers. This problem ultimately led to a federal definition of the "Indian-made" label to bolster consumer confidence that Indian products were strictly handmade by Indians. Although a victory for consumers, this policy also reinforced the primitive, preindustrial stereotype against which Native artisans chafed, thereby underscoring the impact of the marketplace on productions of race in America.

Carter Jones Meyer
Ramapo College of New Jersey

Kenneth Chapman's Santa Fe: Artists and Archaeologists, 1907–1931. Edited by Marit K. Munson. (Santa Fe, N.Mex.: School for Advanced Research Press, 2007. vii + 189 pp. 29 halftones, map, notes, references, index. $29.95 paper, ISBN 978-1-930618-92-3.)

Kenneth Milton Chapman was a figure integral to the fields of art and archaeology in the Southwest during the early twentieth century. Through his work for the major institutions in Santa Fe, including the Museum of New Mexico, the School of American Research, the Indian Arts Fund, and the Santa Fe Indian Fair, Chapman affected how Native arts were studied and produced throughout the twentieth century. Despite his importance, his influence has only recently been addressed by scholars, in part because he was hard to find. His publications were limited to a handful of articles that consist mainly of his drawings. His letters and unpublished writings, especially the unfinished memoirs he started in the 1950s, were archived at the School of American Research and the Laboratory of Anthropology where they were only loosely organized and accessible only to those with scholarly credentials. In *Kenneth Chapman's Santa Fe*, Marit K. Munson has edited and annotated a number of Chapman's published and unpublished works, including his memoirs. With the publication of his writings in this anthology, scholars now have a selection of his articles, private letters, and the fragmentary memoirs in one volume.

Munson did a thorough job researching her topic. Although I have spent years searching for and reading all things related to Chapman's life,

I was pleased to find several entries in Munson's book that I had not previously found. Her decision to organize the writings thematically rather than chronologically gives readers a fuller sense of the narratives through his life and work, especially his complicated relationship with the Museum of New Mexico's first director, Edgar Lee Hewett, and his long fight to establish the Indian Arts Fund. The book's organization also gives readers an appreciation for the different challenges Chapman undertook. Munson's introductions to each section synopsize Chapman's writings and place them in their historic contexts. By consolidating her comments to one section, Munson never interrupts the flow of the text, but given their uncertain veracity, perhaps more commentary would have been desirable. Chapman recounted events that occurred decades earlier and were often biased since his memoirs were an attempt to tell his side of the story. He feared what others (mainly Hewett) would write.

By publishing Chapman's memoirs in this annotated format, Munson and the School for Advanced Research have given us an intimate portrait of life in Santa Fe during these turbulent and formative years. For scholars these primary documents allow greater study of an important figure and the beginnings of these influential institutions. For non-scholars, the book offers a fascinating vision of life in New Mexico during this important time. For all readers, *Kenneth Chapman's Santa Fe* offers a personal account of life in everyone's favorite "City Different."

Suzanne Newman Fricke
University of New Mexico

Born of Fire: The Life and Pottery of Margaret Tafoya. By Charles S. King. (Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, 2008. 160 pp. 78 color plates, 39 halftones, appendix, references, index. $45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-89013-509-9.)

Evidence of pottery making appears in the American Southwest as early as 300 BC and as late as AD 600. Ancestors of Pueblo Indian potters dug and ground clay and shaped, slipped, painted, and fired their vessels. These traditional technologies have been passed from generation to generation down to the present day. Potters of all Pueblos in New Mexico and Arizona are aware of this extensive heritage and now think of this tradition as a sacred charge to continue with great respect. For Pueblo potters, clay is the most important part of the process on technological and metaphorical levels. The clay connects each potter with generations who have passed on their knowledge as well as with those generations of the future waiting to learn these skills.

This connection is true whether the pottery is made for a family's own use, for market, or for religious observances. Charles S. King quite appropriately emphasizes Margaret Tafoya's and her family's concerns and focus on the clay at the beginning of the book.

In a similar fashion to artist and ceramics scholar Rick Dillingham, King includes conversations and thoughts from children and grandchildren regarding Tafoya's life and work. The reader is able to gain an intimate view of Tafoya's work, thoughts, insistence on perfection, and wisdom through the voices of her family, giving portions of the volume personal and insightful touches. The title refers to a philosophical view Pueblo potters hold about the relationship among the potter, the work, and the clay. In this volume, Tafoya's life is divided by decade and includes a study of her signatures on the bottom of the vessels in various collections and museums. This study of signature changes should be a scholarly contribution to those curating Tafoya's pottery. The last chapter considers Tafoya's and her husband Alcario Tafoya's influences on each child or grandchild who continues the tradition.

The details of the text hold some disappointments. I differ with King on some historic details. Spanish cultural influence on Pueblo pottery was greater than King presents. Pueblo potters did not stop making traditional shapes; rather, they added new shapes to accommodate new European customs. The loss of pottery-making technology was more influenced by American culture and the arrival of the railroad than the opening of the Santa Fe Trail. Although, we might ask whether this technology was truly "lost" or just dormant.

The first chapters on Tafoya's life are redundant, leaning heavily on Mary Ellen and Lawrence Blair's *Margaret Tafoya: A Tewa Potter's Heritage and Legacy* (1986), and some references were not accurately called out. As King gets closer to the present, he uses more quotes from family, which improves the text in the remaining chapters of the volume.

As I pondered this difficulty, I thought back to my own experiences with potters and remembered that for Pueblo people as well as many others, family is everything. Tafoya's children and grandchildren were pleased to honor her, which makes this volume a tribute to the solidarity of the Tafoya family members.

Nancy H. Olsen
De Anza College

Redrawing Boundaries: Perspectives on Western American Art. By Peter Hassrick, et al., foreword by Peter Hassrick. Western Passages Series. (Seattle: University of Washington Press, in association with the Institute of Western American Art, Denver Art Museum, 2007. 80 pp. 58 color plates, 22 halftones, selected bibliography. $22.50 paper, ISBN 978-0-9147-3855-8.)

American western art has been the subject of numerous books and articles for decades, ranging from surveys of a wide variety of western imagery to more focused explorations of individual artists, their careers, and subjects. Despite this persistent attention, and even as the discipline of art history has become increasingly self-conscious about theory and methodological approach, scholars have rarely examined the development of western art history as a field of study, considering its challenges from a disciplinary perspective. *Redrawing Boundaries* helps redress this deficiency with seven essays that add significantly to the historiography of this important arena of American visual culture, and offers valuable considerations for contemporary scholarship about this paradoxical and sometimes controversial subject.

Written by some of the most prominent, perceptive, and prolific historians of western art, the essays explore a remarkable array of issues for a volume so slim. Each considers the inherent challenges of the field, regarding what Brian Dippie calls "western art's uneasy status" as an opportunity for investigation into both the subject's appeal and its problematic nature (p. 14). Peter Hassrick's introduction sets the tone by confronting western art's marginal position in art history and the art world more generally. This long-standing relegation is based on scorn for its aesthetics ("more kitsch than *kunst*"); contradictory standards for authenticity (alternately regarded as "mere illustration" of history or as misleading representations of history); and perceptions that western art is almost entirely a relic of an obsolete and perhaps best forgotten era, irrelevant to the larger development of modern art and culture (p. 10). In his chapter on western art's uneasy status, Dippie notes the irony of the art market's insatiable appetite for western work even as many individuals and museums who have traditionally embraced western art have become uncomfortable with the art's tendency to celebrate white imperialism over indigenous cultures and environments, its masculine emphasis, myth-making tendencies, clichéd styles, and popular appeal.

In her chapter, "Western American Art: Celebrating the Burden of Popularity," Patricia Limerick cites the firestorm of controversy prompted by the Smithsonian's landmark exhibition in 1991, *The West As America*, that erupted from its challenge to the prevailing triumphalist interpretations of the West and its representations. Limerick calls the clash of passions for and against

western art a "battlefield" but regards this as an "enviable problem" since it makes for a debate both of intensity and consequence (p. 12). The subject, she argues, is a matter of national importance, requiring Americans to confront their perceptions not just about art, but also their collective identity, origins, ethnic relationships, and cultural mythologies. The exhibition's curator, William Truettner, elaborates on this as well, but takes a different approach in his essay. He carefully traces the history of collecting and exhibiting western art, and the development of scholarship in the field, as a way of explaining both the subject's unique characteristics and its ideological implications. Although painstaking, Truettner's chapter is one of the most important in this book. Such informed, detailed, and revealing genealogy of the field has been largely absent from the scholarship on western art.

The West has always been a region of boundaries, even as we like to imagine it as a place of wide open spaces. *Redrawing Boundaries* considers the barriers that have kept western art from taking a more elevated place within the hierarchical art world. More importantly it challenges the constraints that have kept us from regarding this art as a critical means to confront and better understand ourselves and our past. This study deserves a prominent place in any library of thoughtful books about America. As Limerick notes, a "direct nerve" connects western art and its status to our national and personal identity (p. 12). Like it or not, western art is a mirror of our collective self and we would benefit by examining it accordingly.

Joni L. Kinsey
University of Iowa

Indian Conquistadors: Indigenous Allies in the Conquest of Mesoamerica. Edited by Laura E. Matthew and Michel R. Oudijk. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2007. xiv + 349 pp. 37 halftones, 12 maps, tables, notes, glossary, bibliography. $45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-3854-1.)

This collection of provocative essays shifts attention from the usual protagonists of conquest history toward indigenous groups who denied defeat and claimed to have conquered other Indians alongside Spaniards. Susan Schroeder proposes four genres of conquest history in her eloquent opening essay, and Matthew Restall and Michel R. Oudijk follow with a concise overview of the general themes that appear in the eight substantive chapters that follow.

Florine Asselberg compares the Lienzo de Quauhquechollan with other sixteenth-century pictorial representations of conquest, especially the Lienzo of Tlaxcala. In Guatemala City, Laura E. Matthew encounters multi-ethnic

groups from central Mexico and Oaxaca who waged a prolonged campaign to win privileges from the crown in return for fighting local Maya groups. Robinson Herrera considers indigenous women in Guatemala as valuable mediators who made strategic marriage alliances with conquistadors. Moving north to Nueva Galicia, Ida Altman compares the use of indigenous men in Nuño de Guzmán's entrada with their participation in don Antonio Mendoza's campaign in the Mixton War of the 1540s. John Chuchiak remembers the "forgotten allies" in the Conquest of Yucatan who were so valuable to Montejo's success and yet so unjustly ignored by Spanish officials and historians. Yanna Yannakakis examines the Sierra Norte of Oaxaca, where Nahuas established a satellite settlement among Zapotec speakers in the wake of a violent conquest and emerged in the late seventeenth-century record to advance familiar claims to conquest and loyal service. Stephanie Wood analyzes the Mapa de Cuauhtlantzinco from Cholula, a series of post-1650 paintings that highlight the accomplishments of local Native nobles in the conquest. Finally, Bret Blosser demonstrates the importance of *flecheros* on the Nueva Galicia frontier throughout the colonial period and the rewards that they obtained for their martial prowess.

A brief conclusion returns to the issues raised in the introductory chapters. Some matters, however, remain to be considered. The authors complicate the idea of the "Indian conquistador" and assign more agency to indigenous actors, but the volume does not analyze the term *ally*, used so often throughout the work. In fact Cortés and other Spaniards in this period and beyond rarely used that word in reference to Indians. As Charles Gibson observed for Tlaxcala, fighting for the king's men after becoming his vassal was not optional. "Allies" who refused to fight, like Xicotencatl of Tlaxcala, for example, became enemies to be punished. The volume does not ignore the question of coercion, but it does not resolve it. There is also the question of context. It is not surprising that most conquest narratives, written to achieve concrete objectives, often in response to grievances, emphasized service and loyalty to the crown over defeats and defects. This colonial discourse was standard, practiced by Spaniards and indigenous writers alike. To ask "who conquered whom?" risks pushing indigenous agency to a paradoxical extreme. After all, the "conquest" was a process, not an event.

Despite these concerns, this volume is a solid contribution to the history of early Mexico and Guatemala and to the literature on conquest and colonialism in Latin America.

Kevin Terraciano
University of California, Los Angeles