

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 85 | Number 2

Article 4

4-1-2010

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 85, 2 (2010). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol85/iss2/4>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

No Settlement, No Conquest: A History of the Coronado Entrada. By Richard Flint. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2008. xviii + 358 pp. Maps, glossary, notes, bibliography, index. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-4362-8.)

Archival research is time consuming and often unproductive. So it is no wonder that in our “publish or perish” world, many of us look for an easier way—a “sophisticated” theoretical argument short on empirical specificity. Richard Flint’s book, *No Settlement, No Conquest*, is a delightful reminder of the rewards of painstaking research. Flint’s two previous books on the Coronado expedition, *Documents of the Coronado Expedition, 1539–1542: “They Were Not Familiar with His Majesty, nor Did They Wish to Be His Subjects”* (2005), and *Great Cruelties Have Been Reported: The 1544 Investigation of the Coronado Expedition* (2002) also exemplify the benefits of diligent research.

In *No Settlement, No Conquest*, Flint draws from a vast array of primary sources to detail the events of the Coronado expedition and its aftermath. Along the way, Flint overturns a number of significant misperceptions about the participants and what motivated them. Not the least of these misconceptions is the idea that Coronado and the 287 Spaniards and other “free men” who accompanied him were primarily after gold or other material riches. Often in the past we have contrasted Iberian and English colonialism, emphasizing how the latter was more of a long-term, corporate enterprise. But

the Coronado expedition was financed by the participants (rather than the Spanish Crown), who were intent on realizing profits, not primarily from treasure troves of plundered gold, but by conquering and settling imagined Indian provinces with large populations that could be put to work generating goods and services for a Hapsburg global economy.

Another myth overturned by Flint is that European guns and armor were critical to the Spaniards' successful invasion and conquest of the Americas. Coronado's force had all of twelve metal helmets and twenty-one arquebuses. As Flint shows, the conquest of Native peoples was undertaken by Native peoples themselves. Some thirteen hundred well-armed, well-trained *indios amigos* from central and west Mexico were recruited by Coronado to do much of the expedition's heavy lifting, be it as burden carriers or shock troops leading the assault on Cíbola, the Hopis, the Tiguex pueblos, and other Native communities. The invaders also followed Indian roads and trails and made use of Indian translators and guides. Significantly, the invaders took advantage of Indian reciprocity and generosity.

In detailing the Coronado expedition, Flint reminds us that the term *explorers* in the context of Coronado and other invaders is a euphemism. Coronado would have preferred not to kill Indians, but he and his fellow Europeans understood themselves to be on a mission from God and civilization. So the history of the Coronado expedition is mostly a history of Native peoples who were slaughtered in the name of a just war.

No Settlement, No Conquest is an enjoyable read for the clarity of the prose and the many fascinating details that Flint offers with respect to the participants in the Coronado expedition and how the expedition unfolded, leaving mostly a trail of destruction in its wake.

Daniel T. Reff
Ohio State University

Pueblos, Spaniards, and the Kingdom of New Mexico. By John L. Kessell. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2008. xii + 225 pp. 14 halftones, 19 line drawings, map, notes, bibliography, index. \$24.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-3969-2.)

For some time now, John L. Kessell has been interested in restoring some sense of balance to our understanding of the early history of the American Southwest. For one thing, he has attempted to fuse more recent analytical trends to the grand narrative tradition. He also has worked to point out

that Indians and Spaniards could be collaborators as well as antagonists. *Pueblos, Spaniards, and the Kingdom of New Mexico* is the highly readable elaboration of the equally engaging middle chapters of Kessell's *Spain in the Southwest: A Narrative History of Colonial New Mexico, Arizona, Texas, and California* (2002).

Seventeenth-century New Mexico was a land of limited resources and harsh climate. Although various Pueblo groups had worked out a means of coexisting, both among themselves and with neighboring nonsedentary peoples, conflict still existed. The arrival of Spaniards at the end of the sixteenth century merely added one more group to the mix. In fact Kessell might easily have framed his story of Juan de Oñate's arrival in the region in terms of Hernán Cortés's arrival in Mexico eighty years earlier. In both cases, the Spaniards were able to exploit rivalries among Native peoples, establish themselves as tribute-collecting overlords, and begin a process of religious conversion that met with mixed success. Some Pueblos adopted Spanish technologies and practices more readily than others, as was the case in central Mexico with the Nahuatls. The Spanish settlers adapted to the climate and the geography, began to intermarry with the Pueblos, and, according to Kessell, became children of the land.

Nevertheless, as Kessell narrates with a fine eye for detail, tensions grew between the new arrivals and the aboriginal population. The exploitive nature of the relationship between Spaniards—both civil and religious—and Pueblos led to periodic minor upheavals and insurrection plots. The Pueblo Revolt of 1680 was, however, more a result of a deepening drought than any single misdeed by the Spaniards. Spanish demands on Pueblo farmers and increasing violence with Plains hunter-gatherers finally gave the upper hand to those Pueblos who resented the loss of religious and cultural practices. While they had success against the Spanish, the Pueblos experienced internal strife. Gov. Diego de Vargas exploited that dissent when he restored Spanish rule in the province a decade later. Nevertheless, compromises, ranging from Hopi independence to the Pecos resuming their role as entrepôt between New Mexicans and Plains Indians, were required to allow the Spanish restoration.

The moral of Kessell's brief recounting of seventeenth-century New Mexico life is that before and after the Pueblo Revolt, Pueblos and Spaniards figured out how to coexist, indeed, how to interact while maintaining distinct identities. This point is something that both Hispanic and Pueblo New Mexicans of today should appreciate and build upon.

Jesús F. de la Teja

Texas State University-San Marcos

New Mexico Territory during the Civil War: Wallen and Evans Inspection Reports, 1862–1863. Edited and with an introduction by Jerry D. Thompson. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2008. vii + 304 pp. Halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. \$34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-4479-3.)

Once again Jerry D. Thompson provides more insight into the Civil War in the Southwest. Most studies of this region focus almost exclusively on Gen. Henry Hastings Sibley's expedition to conquer New Mexico, ignoring the aftermath. Thompson coaxes the rest of the story from Henry Davies Wallen's and Andrew Wallace Evans's inspection reports of the Union fortifications and posts in the region. Since both Wallen and Evans were southern born, their loyalty was suspect in the North. Not willing to put them in an active field command, the Union assigned them the difficult task of inspecting the army in New Mexico Territory. Without any formal training and little guidance from the military, these men visited Fort Garland (Colorado), Fort Marcy, Fort Union, Fort Sumner, Fort McRae, Fort West, and Fort Stanton. They also inspected posts at Mesilla, Franklin (Texas), Los Pinos, and Albuquerque.

Their detailed reports examined the strengths and weaknesses of the various places. Reports ranged from excellent (Fort Union) to less than stellar. Some reports include problems such as troops' lack of marksmanship and the most common complaint, the lack of supplies, mainly food. Although these reports focus on military concerns, they shed light on the political and social issues key to the Union's ability to maintain control of the region. Two aims were most important to the Union's control: working with Mexican officials to secure the region and subduing the local population, especially Native Americans.

Enriching these reports are Thompson's introduction and epilogue. In the introduction, Thompson provides a detailed history of the region and of each fort and post, giving perspective and context to the reports. Additionally, his epilogue ties the entire book together by completing the narrative of the fortifications and the men, including the inspectors and influential commanders. Throughout the work, the author provides essential endnotes to elaborate on the people, places, and concepts instrumental to the reports. Although the work is excellent, Thompson misses an opportunity to examine the quirks and personalities of Wallen and Evans, which could have added a greater human element to the reports.

This book is most helpful to scholars studying New Mexico, military posts on the frontier, conditions of Civil War soldiers, and social interactions between multiple races. It will appeal also to the casual reader of the Civil War looking to read about something other than battles in Virginia and prominent officers. Overall, Thompson furthers our understanding of the Southwest by providing the story of New Mexico after the Texans left.

Charles D. Grear
Prairie View A&M University

Court-Martial of Apache Kid, Renegade of Renegades. By Clare V. McKanna, foreword by Sidney L. Harring. (Lubbock: Texas Tech University Press, 2009. xxv + 192 pp. Halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-89672-652-9.)

In the spring of 1887, Apache Kid, a scout in the U.S. Army, killed Rip, another Apache. In 1889, after a court martial, incarceration at Alcatraz Federal Penitentiary, and an arrest by Arizona law officers, Apache Kid escaped the Gila County sheriff and fled across the Mexico border. He would forever be described as a dangerous renegade. Historian Clare V. McKanna reconstructs the events that led to Kid's murder of Rip, the subsequent court martial, and the aftermath of Kid's trial. McKanna argues that Kid was a man caught between worlds: between Apache custom and U.S. military discipline and between moderate and conservative military judges who were redefining the military's legal code.

Kid enlisted in the U.S. Army to escape the "deprivation of reservation life" (p. 27). In 1886 SA band member Rip encouraged another Apache to kill Kid's grandfather, Togodechuz, the leader of the SI band. Apache band justice demanded retaliation, and in May 1887, Kid left his post at San Carlos and killed Rip. The following month, Kid surrendered to military officers at San Carlos for desertion. Upon Kid's surrender, an interpreter informed him that the military was sending him to Florida, which caused Kid and other Apaches to fire on soldiers and flee. Kid later surrendered and faced a court martial for mutiny and desertion.

In the late nineteenth century, U.S. military law was undergoing changes. Moderates wanted to offer more protections for defendants but conservatives demanded swift and severe punishment for soldiers who committed crimes. After dissecting the minutiae of Kid's court martial, McKanna concludes that

Kid faced a racially biased and conservative tribunal and that witnesses provided contradictory testimony. Moreover, it was unlikely that Kid, or many other Indian soldiers, would have known the fine details of the 128 Articles of War. Yet the court found Kid guilty of desertion and mutiny. The punishment was death.

While the case went through the customary military appeals process, Kid served time in Alcatraz. Upon hearing the recommendations of Gen. Nelson A. Miles and the judge advocate general, the secretary of war freed Kid. When he returned to San Carlos, county officials arrested him for murder. In November 1889, Kid escaped from the sheriff and fled to Mexico. For the remainder of his life, Kid was a fugitive from the law and often raided the San Carlos reservation, abducted women, and stole livestock.

Court-Martial of Apache Kid continues McKanna's fine work in examining American Indians, homicide, and the law in the American Southwest. It is worth considering how American Indians encountered different legal systems in the United States and how military law superseded Apache clan conduct. However, because of the lack of primary documents, we are left with an unsatisfactory description of Kid. McKanna neglects to analyze much of his "renegade" life, especially the possible reasons Kid raided San Carlos for Apache women and livestock. Furthermore, McKanna perhaps interprets cultural change and conflict too rigidly. McKanna concludes, "Kid's words reveal that he had returned to his Apache mode of thinking" (p. 105). Did Kid shift between two mutually exclusive cultures or had he found a way to blend these cultures? The scholarship of David Rich Lewis and Brian Hosmer suggests that rather than being stuck between two worlds, men like Apache Kid served as "cultural brokers" or "cultural middlemen" who successfully navigated both Indigenous and American culture and society. These criticisms aside, McKanna has produced a readable and helpful book on American Indian law.

William J. Bauer Jr.

University of Nevada, Las Vegas

Killing for Coal: America's Deadliest Labor War. By Thomas G. Andrews. (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2008. x + 386 pp. 29 halftones, maps, notes, index. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-674-03101-2.)

The deadliest labor war to which Thomas G. Andrews refers in his title began on the morning of 20 April 1914. On that day, near Ludlow, Colorado,

a simmering conflict exploded into a gun battle between striking coal miners and the Colorado militia. Amid the chaos, a firestorm erupted and swept through the strikers' camp, killing two women and eleven children. The Ludlow Massacre, as the event came to be called, radicalized workers and elevated the dead to martyr status.

In this well-written and meticulously researched book, Andrews treads familiar territory—labor conflict in America's coalfields—through an unconventional narrative approach. He rejects Ludlow-as-massacre narratives or Ludlow-as-battle retellings as partisan histories that “prevent us from understanding the larger contexts of imagination, power, and violence that caused the Colorado coalfield wars” (p. 9). Instead, the book expands the story from a localized conflict between labor and capital to a broader examination of the environmental and social contradictions of fossil fuel extraction.

Andrews weaves together the politics, ecology, and labor practices of coal extraction to demonstrate how coal came to burrow into every area of human activity and transform American life. The practical effect of such a narrative style is that while Andrews first presents Ludlow in the introduction, he does not return to the story until the final chapter. This story is not so much about America's deadliest labor conflict as it is an examination of the ecological and social conditions that made it possible.

Chapters 1 and 2 trace the origins of Colorado's coal industry through a biography of William Jackson Palmer, the founder of the Denver and Rio Grande Western Railroad, and an examination of the social and environmental consequences of fossil fuel extraction. In chapter 3, Andrews describes the migrations that brought foreign workers to Colorado as a way to understand how the mobility, migration, and difference among the coalfield workforce coalesced into the common cause of the massive coalfield strikes.

In chapter 4, Andrews constructs a convincing answer to the apparent paradox of worker solidarity. He argues that the dangerous mining workscape served as a cauldron that forged a collective identity and helped workers overcome the differences that, up on the surface, separated them: “hidden histories,” Andrews calls them, “made deep underground” (p. 123). In chapter 5, Andrews examines the strike of 1894 and the lessons capital learned in successfully organizing against striking workers. Chapter 6 takes a circuitous, often confusing, narrative path to illustrate the spatial and social practices of strike breaking—a set of practices that ultimately exacerbated labor conflict and contributed to the violence of Ludlow, the topic of the seventh and final chapter.

The historical depth and complexity of the narrative is the book's strength but, at times, also a weakness. In his effort to complicate Ludlow through an environmental history of coal-fired economic development in the American West, Andrews makes the story occasionally unruly and unnecessarily confusing. It reads as two books stitched together—one an incomplete environmental history of our fossil fuel economy, the other a familiar labor history of Colorado's coalfield war.

David Correia
University of New Mexico

The West from a Car-Window. By Richard Harding Davis, edited by Char Miller. Library of Texas series, no. 10. (Dallas, Tex.: DeGolyer Library and William P. Clements Center for Southwest Studies, Southern Methodist University, 2006. xxv + 123 pp. Halftones, line drawings, notes, index. \$55.00 cloth, ISBN 978-1-9295-3112-7.)

This handsome volume departs from the bulk of the works in the Library of Texas series in that its coverage stretches well beyond the geography of Texas and Mexico. Richard Harding Davis's famous travelogue, first published in 1892, includes chapters on reservation life in the Oklahoma Territory; the boosting and development of Oklahoma City; mining in Creede, Colorado; and cultural developments in Denver and Colorado Springs. The work also includes chapters on army posts in Oklahoma and Texas, ranch life in Texas, cultural life in San Antonio and Corpus Christi, and U.S. troops on the border with Mexico in southwest Texas. Still, the coverage of Texas is extensive and the book is a superb addition to this excellent series. This republication benefits from attractive typeface and superb reproduction of more than fifty illustrations from *Harper's Weekly*, where they originally appeared in large format. Most importantly the volume is accompanied by Char Miller's excellent introduction that places this western travelogue within the larger context of Davis's writings, including his correspondence on the Boer War in 1899–1900.

Miller hits on a theme that scholarship on American western travel writing has been slow to take up. Writers such as Davis were not envisioning the West as a place unlike any other on earth, but rather were considering it within larger world contexts; a re-examination of *The West from a Car-Window* underscores this global consciousness. The very title of the

book, Miller notes, was a parody of British traveler Matthew Arnold's *Civilization in the United States: First and Last Impressions of America* (1888), which offered scathing criticism of the United States drawn from the merely cursory level of observation that accompanies rail travel. But Davis's book, based on a mere three months of travel in the West, was much more than a defensive response to the critique of a representative of the former mother country. Indeed, one of the most memorable aspects of *The West from a Car-Window* is its author's balance in addressing the complexities and consequences of American empire in the West.

Davis's account begins with his comparison of the Texas Rangers with "the mounted police of the gold days in the Australian bush, and the mounted constabulary of the Canadian border" (p. 10). The graffiti that tarnishes the missions of San Antonio reminded him of the public's proclivity for tarnishing "the pyramids of Egypt or Blarney Castle" (p. 12). The book, like most nineteenth-century western travelogues, is sprinkled with such global comparisons. More significantly, his account takes on the complications that accompany territorial acquisition and settlement: the haphazard procedures through which the newly opened lands in the Oklahoma Territory were made available for settlement, the equally mismanaged processes by which beef rations were provided to Indians on reservations, and the shortcomings of Indian agents. In the end, what Davis offers is less a celebration than a cautionary tale: not a simple defense of America, but, rather, a gentle reminder to Americans to consider the complexities that constituted the fruits of Manifest Destiny. Thus, *The West from a Car-Window* can be seen as a prelude to Davis's *With Both Armies in South Africa* (1900), which critiqued the British Empire.

David Wrobel

University of Nevada, Las Vegas

Beyond the Alamo: Forging Mexican Ethnicity in San Antonio, 1821–1861. By Raúl A. Ramos. (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2008. xiii + 297 pp. 16 halftones, tables, figures, map, notes, index. \$35.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8078-3207-3, \$22.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8078-7124-9.)

Beyond the Alamo examines identity formation among Bexareños (Mexicans living in San Antonio de Béxar) over a forty-year period during which the city experienced significant demographic changes and various jurisdictional

transitions. Bexareños began as the city's dominant political elite, became cultural brokers between Anglo Americans and Mexican government officials, and eventually emerged as an American ethnic minority with limited political capital. The first three chapters explore the regional identity developed as a result of Bexareños' relations with indigenous nations, reactions to Mexico's independence, and interdependence with Anglo American immigrants. The next four chapters trace changes in the residents' social and political position in response to continued Anglo American colonization, the secession of Texas, and American annexation. Raúl A. Ramos argues that residents of San Antonio de Béxar initially developed a Bexareño identity centered on regional culture but ultimately embraced a Tejano identity based on ethnicity.

Influenced by recent scholarship on Texas, Chicano, and Borderlands history, *Beyond the Alamo* makes a significant contribution to each field. As a native of San Antonio, the author acknowledges growing up with questions about his hometown that were unanswered in traditional interpretations of Texas history that characterized Anglo Texans as forward-thinking protagonists while depicting Tejanos as tradition-bound. *Beyond the Alamo* revises the state's history by highlighting Bexareños' significant role in the founding of Texas. It also contributes to recent scholarship in Chicano history that explores how Mexican concepts of honor and masculinity initially determined social status but were eventually displaced by American notions of race. This refreshing reinterpretation also contributes to recasting Tejanos as transnational actors involved in the seemingly contradictory roles of establishing Mexico's northern colonies and facilitating American westward expansion.

Ramos uses a wide variety of Spanish- and English-language sources from Mexican and American archives. His research involves municipal and state archives in Coahuila and Texas, personal memoirs, national government correspondence, court documents, and newspapers. Informed by the historiography on Mexico and the United States, this study embraces a transnational approach. Ramos adds to recent scholarship on the nineteenth-century Mexican experience by Andrés Reséndez and Miroslava Chávez-García. Combining the methodologies used by these scholars, Ramos skillfully describes elite views and nonelite actions. This approach enables him to explore Bexareños' involvement in Mexico's political disagreements over federalism and centralism as well as Tejano workers' reactions to Anglo American vigilante violence during the Cart War of the 1850s.

Beyond the Alamo is a well-written and expertly argued book. While drawing from theories on identity, honor, and cultural studies, Ramos avoids jargon and clearly explains his terminology. The author's point of view is evident, yet his analysis is fair and sympathetic to the various actors in this story. General readers and specialists alike will discover fresh insights in this study, which includes excellent illustrations, photos, and tables. The book's greatest strength is the author's careful analysis of identity formation as a dynamic process influenced by region, ethnicity, and nationalism. His interpretation explains the nineteenth-century Tejano experience shaped by the persistence of Mexican cultural practices, contradictions in political beliefs, and struggles over American citizenship that continue today.

Omar Valerio-Jiménez

University of Iowa

Savage Frontier: Rangers, Riflemen, and Indian Wars in Texas, Volume III, 1840–1841. By Stephen L. Moore. (Denton: University of North Texas Press, 2007. xii + 436 pp. Halftones, maps, tables, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. \$34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-1-57441-228-5, \$19.95 paper, ISBN 978-1-57441-229-1.)

Stephen L. Moore's *Savage Frontier* is the continuation of a series of carefully researched books on the famous (infamous to a few) Texas Rangers. It picks up the story after the inauguration of Mirabeau Lamar as president of the Texas Republic in 1838, a time of expanding violence in Texas when the ethnic cleansing of both Indians and Tejanos reached extreme levels. Lamar sanctioned such a policy with vitriolic language and what money he could borrow, putting Texas deep into debt. Moore, however, does not set out to follow the overall policy of these events, but to carefully outline the various ranger organizations that emerged to execute this policy. He has complete lists of companies and their commanders, and action reports regarding their various engagements between 1840 and 1841.

This book is "buff" history, perhaps at its best, but buff history nonetheless. It comes complete with the constant, indeed, overuse of what historian Patricia Limerick called the "F word," *frontier*. It portrays the rangers as heroes and the Indians as "savages" who fought a desperate war along that so-called frontier. And while Moore does briefly acknowledge that what happened in Texas was ethnic cleansing, a phrase he surprisingly uses on one occasion, his evaluation of various battles follows the common mythical assessment so

well established in Texas history. When, for example, “Captain” John Moore led a raid of ninety rangers on a peaceful Comanche village, literally two hundred miles northwest of Austin in 1840—a place that was clearly in the Comanche heartland—the action is called simply a “raid.” In reality Moore’s men killed 140 Comanches, many of whom were women and children, and the ranger force suffered just two slightly wounded men. This attack was not a raid; it was a massacre of the first order and needs to be identified as such.

Rangers were involved in other massacres that need to be identified. It is no longer acceptable for any Texas historian, buff or not, to perpetuate the mythical history that such actions were heroic and honorable. Mostly rangers were interested in one thing, plunder, and they killed to get it. Many more Indians died from ranger pistols than Texans were ever killed by Indians. The figures that do exist for Texas casualties are grossly exaggerated.

Moore’s work will be appreciated among history buffs in Texas who often identify with the Texas Rangers. Some are searching for relatives and wish to commemorate their service. A particular group of them hopes to be able to place a star, designating ranger service, on the tombstones of such relatives. It is sad, however, that some, after reading Moore’s book, will somehow never know the pain and anguish that rangers perpetuated on Native peoples. Native voice simply does not exist in this book.

This lapse is perhaps explained by the fact that the book is part of a University of North Texas Press series called simply “Savage Frontier Series.” I doubt that Professor Limerick would be surprised to discover that the “F word” is alive and well in Texas, but should not the editors at a university press be more sensitive to the nuances of history? Perhaps whoever is running the press should read more books and fewer labels in the infamous Texas Ranger Hall of Fame and Museum in Waco.

Gary Clayton Anderson
University of Oklahoma

Oklahoma Rough Rider: Billy McGinty’s Own Story. Edited with commentary and notes by Jim Fulbright and Albert Stehno. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2008. xiii + 218 pp. 26 halftones, map, notes, bibliography, index. \$75.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8706-2356-1, \$19.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8061-3935-7.)

At first glance, this nicely edited and annotated memoir would appear to be merely the personal narrative of a U.S.-Mexico War veteran about his

experiences in the fabled Battle of San Juan Hill. While the book does contain a detailed description of the four-month Cuban campaign of Theodore Roosevelt's Rough Riders, it is much more. Billy McGinty began his career as a cowboy and bronc rider, although those experiences are only briefly noted in his own words. McGinty thoroughly describes the four months in Cuba and his three-year stint as a rider with William F. "Buffalo Bill" Cody's Wild West show—where he participated in a popular reenactment of the Battle of San Juan Hill and later performed rodeo-riding stunts. He traveled with Cody's show on the East Coast and in the Midwest before retiring and returning to marry and buy a ranch in Oklahoma.

McGinty's career took another turn twenty years later, when the "cowboy band" he helped organize became a mainstay on the new medium of radio. The group's numerous broadcast performances led to tour engagements throughout the country. As the editors note, McGinty's group is regarded as the originator of today's country-western music. After three years traveling with the band, McGinty retired once again to his ranch.

McGinty's memoirs are matter-of-fact and written in the plain, direct language of a cowboy. The adventures he describes are riveting, but among the most interesting aspects of the memoir are the frequent references to McGinty's friends and heroes, including Theodore Roosevelt. After reading McGinty's accounts of Roosevelt's relationships with his troops, during and after San Juan Hill, one can understand why Roosevelt was one of the most celebrated Americans of his age. Similarly, McGinty reflects on another friend and American icon, Cody. Through his words, he provides clear unvarnished evidence of why both men engendered such a universal following.

The commentary, primarily contained in the final chapters, puts McGinty into historical perspective, but also provides the necessary details about his life and career that bring the rest of the story into greater focus. While the annotations are useful within the text, this minibiography is essential to understanding McGinty's unique proximity to the important men and events of his age. Considering the dangers of the war, disease, accidents, and assaults that he wrote about, it is a surprise that he lived to the ripe old age of 90. He died in 1961, one of the few remaining U.S.-Mexico War veterans and "president-for-life" of the veterans' group organized by Rough Riders a half century earlier.

The memoir is a rare eyewitness account of both a famous battle and the life of a bronc rider for the Wild West show. But it is also an engagingly written story of adventures and descriptions of colorful frontier characters

by someone who had first-hand knowledge of three epochs in the nation's history, ranging from service at San Juan Hill in the "splendid little war" to singing on the widely popular new medium of radio. This well-edited and annotated volume would be enjoyable reading for the Old West aficionado as well as the specialist interested in details about the daily life of the turn-of-the-century Rough Riders and the internal personal dynamics of the Wild West show. The editors deserve credit for bringing the previously unpublished personal memoir to a wider audience.

Phil Roberts

University of Wyoming

Oklahoma: A History. By W. David Baird and Danney Goble. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2008. 352 pp. 31 halftones, 11 maps, appendix, recommended readings, index. \$24.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-3910-4.)

What is now the state of Oklahoma was originally intended by the federal government to be the home of all Indians in the United States, so it is fitting that a history of the state starts with its original inhabitants. Archaeologists date human occupation of the state back some eleven thousand years, if not more. European explorers encountered early Wichita and Caddo inhabitants of the region, and members of Zebulon Pike's party visited Osages in northeastern Oklahoma.

Federal policy moved the Five Civilized Tribes—Cherokees, Choctaws, Chickasaws, Creeks, and Seminoles—from east of the Mississippi River. The arrival of these southeastern tribes set the stage for the development of Indian Territory by the mid-nineteenth century. These tribes already had governments similar to that of the United States, a significant factor in the ultimate development of the Oklahoma state government. Northeastern tribes—Potawatomies, Shawnees, Miamis, Peorias, among others—also migrated to Indian Territory, although their history is often overshadowed by the story of the Cherokee Trail of Tears.

The Civil War caused deep political splits within the five tribes, and their postwar treaties with the Union created the problematic relationship between Indian people and black freedmen that resulted from requirements that the tribes grant citizenship to their freed slaves. After the war, the natural resources of Indian Territory, including timber and coal, and the rapid development of railroads, along with human greed, led to the destruction of

tribal governments in the face of a massive influx of white Americans. They fueled the demands for the opening of lands ceded to the United States by the Creeks and Seminoles after the war and increased the pressure for allotment. This federal policy of allotting communally held reservation land to individual Indians was the ultimate tragedy for all tribes in Indian Territory in the late nineteenth century.

Although the land run of 22 April 1889 is widely celebrated as a seminal event in the history of the state, W. David Baird and Danney Gobel point out that for the Indian tribes, it was the beginning of the end of their governments. The authors explain the status of Oklahoma's tribes under the Indian Reorganization Act of 1934 and the Oklahoma Indian Welfare Act of 1936, but they make no mention of the resurgence of Indian political identity in the 1960s, when Oklahomans for Indian Opportunity was founded under the auspices of Pres. Lyndon B. Johnson's War on Poverty, or when the Five Tribes reasserted rights to elect tribal chiefs rather than having them appointed by the president of the United States.

On the whole, Baird and Goble do an admirable job of presenting a balanced view of history that gives due attention to the Indian tribes and people who have shaped the history of the state of Oklahoma. The book is intended for a broad, general audience, and it is a clear and engagingly written narrative history. The final assessment of the state melds the problematic treatment of Indians into a clear-eyed analysis of historical forces such as the oil boom, the dust bowl, and the Great Depression that have shaped the unique ethos of the state, its history of political corruption, the conflict between its strong religiosity and espousal of family values and its dismal record of support for education and social services, and its mania for football.

Clara Sue Kidwell

University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

World War II and Mexican American Civil Rights. Edited by Richard Griswold del Castillo. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2008. 245 pp. 26 halftones, appendixes, notes, selected bibliography, index. \$55.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-292-71738-1, \$24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-292-71739-8.)

Civil rights activism is a major theme in Mexican American history, and the World War II years represent a period of increased consciousness about

racism in the United States and accelerated efforts to eliminate discrimination against people of Mexican origin. Mexican Americans in the military greatly resented the second-class treatment they received in civilian life. Members of the dominant society routinely denied these GIs basic rights despite their obvious service to the country. Other Mexican Americans, such as workers, community volunteers, and activists who helped in the war effort, joined with servicemen and servicewomen to pressure governmental and private institutions to bring about needed changes in race relations. The efforts of Mexican Americans certainly led to some changes and improvements during the 1940s. More importantly, however, the activism of that era set the stage for the Chicano/a civil rights movements of the 1950s and 1960s, which resulted in far greater positive breakthroughs.

In this excellent reader, Richard Griswold del Castillo, in collaboration with the late Richard Steele, brings together essays and primary materials that illuminate major themes pertaining to the Mexican American struggle for equality during a pivotal phase of U.S. history. The principal topics addressed in the book are European American discriminatory practices, Mexican American community activism, responses by the federal government, and policies and actions at the state level as exemplified by developments in Texas. Griswold del Castillo is the author of the introduction and two chapters, and the coauthor of the epilogue with Steele. Griswold del Castillo's two chapters survey the personal experiences of GIs and the activities of leaders and organizations. Steele contributed three chapters that delineate general conditions among Mexican Americans during the early 1940s, relate how the U.S. government "discovered" this minority group, and chronicle the violence in Los Angeles stemming from the infamous Sleepy Lagoon Case and the Zoot-Suit Riots. The five essays by Griswold del Castillo and Steele do an outstanding job of highlighting the most important issues and events that make the World War II era a critical period of transition in the evolution of people of Mexican descent in the United States.

The second part of the book includes well-chosen selections from a variety of sources, including contemporary books, government reports, and periodicals. A chapter from Ruth Tuck's *Not with the Fist: Mexican-Americans in a Southwest City* (1946) relies on ethnographic interviews to expose discrimination against Mexican Americans in Southern California. Sections of Raul Morin's *Among the Valiant: Mexican Americans in WWII and Korea* (1963) provide first-hand accounts of the experiences of GIs both in Asia and Europe. Testimonies extracted from Alonso S. Perales's *En defensa de*

mi raza (1936–1937) and *Are We Good Neighbors?* (1948) relate instances of biased treatment against Mexican Americans in Texas restaurants, barber-shops, theatres, and housing. Other documents include official testimony by Carlos E. Castañeda before the U.S. Senate arguing for the need to create a government fair employment agency, a resolution in the Texas legislature supporting nondiscriminatory treatment for all “Caucasian races,” and an article by Manuel Ruiz pertaining to juvenile delinquency in Los Angeles.

This reader is a welcome addition to the rather sparse literature on the Mexican American community during the World War II period. The editors/authors succeed in providing just the kind of information that has been needed to make that crucial era come alive, especially for students. The book is ideal for use not only in Chicano/a studies courses, but in Borderlands and Southwest studies classes as well.

Oscar J. Martínez
University of Arizona

“I Choose Life”: Contemporary Medical and Religious Practices in the Navajo World. By Maureen Trudelle Schwarz. New Directions in Native American Studies series. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2008. xi + 380 pp. Glossary, notes, bibliography, index. \$50.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-3941-8, \$24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8061-3961-6.)

In this detailed study of Navajo (Diné) health and healing concepts, Maureen Trudelle Schwarz focuses on Navajo attempts to accommodate certain biomedical procedures, including amputation, blood transfusions, CPR, organ transplants, and surgery. She demonstrates that many Diné patients base their health care decisions on the concepts of synecdoche, predetermined life spans, the need to maintain body integrity, prohibitions against cutting or altering the body, and the differentiation of Navajo and non-Navajo bodies. Schwarz further argues that by stressing the difference between Navajo and non-Navajo bodies, Navajos assert a collective identity and resist the colonial forces that have assaulted both their tribal sovereignty and their physical health.

Schwarz relies heavily on interviews with Diné patients, physicians, spiritual leaders, and elders, which she effectively couples with secondary source material. The result is a good synthesis of the large body of scholarship dealing with Navajo spirituality and health care that also draws attention to

important concepts understated by previous writers. For example it is widely recognized that Navajos traditionally avoid contact with the dead and understand that body parts are permanently connected to an individual, even after death or physical removal. Schwarz notes, however, that most non-Navajo academics have failed to understand or emphasize the Navajo taboo against contact with living non-Navajo surgeons or organs, blood, or “wind” received from a living non-Navajo donor.

Schwarz also considers how Navajo oral history and healing ceremonies influence Navajo efforts to accommodate biomedicine. Oral history teaches the Diné to be open to new forms of healing power while also strengthening their view of themselves as a chosen people. Ceremonies, including the Evil Way and Enemy Way, are means to address the ill effects of being contaminated by the dead and/or non-Navajos. These ceremonies allow Navajo patients to take part in alien medical procedures. Combining these worlds is nevertheless viewed as dangerous and requires patients to make difficult decisions.

Schwarz makes a point of looking for diverse Navajo viewpoints and changing attitudes over time, in part because she is also concerned with the ways colonization and Christianization have influenced Navajo health behaviors. She includes interviews with Navajos who are members of the Native American Church (NAC), evangelical Protestants, Catholics, and those who combine Christian and traditional faiths. While there are certain commonalities among their views and those of other Navajos, especially in the NAC and Catholic cases, Christian concepts, such as a transcendent god and redemptive suffering, have changed Navajo views on health and healing.

By including extensive interview transcripts throughout the book, Schwarz enables Navajos to speak for themselves. Their voices, together with her insightful analysis, make this work a valuable resource for outside researchers and members of the Navajo Nation alike.

Wade Davies

The University of Montana

Recollections of the War with Mexico. By Major John Corey Henshaw, edited with an introduction by Gary F. Kurutz. (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 2008. xii + 253 pp. 17 halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. \$44.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8262-1799-8.)

John Corey Henshaw entered the U.S.-Mexico War as a lieutenant in the 7th U.S. Infantry in 1846 and exited Mexico as a captain with a brevet to major in 1848. He was not, however, a typical army officer. Born in 1815, he soon showed a streak of independence and had a troubled career in youth and early adulthood, obtaining an army lieutenant's commission from civil life in 1839. His service in the Second Seminole War was characterized by a seemingly charmed ability to escape personal injury, and an inclination to enter into disputations with fellow officers. This habit was true for his service in Mexico as well.

Lieutenant Henshaw joined his command at Corpus Christi in February 1846, served under Gen. Zachary Taylor through the Battle of Monterrey, marched to Tampico on the Gulf of Mexico, and proceeded by sea to Veracruz, Mexico. He participated in all major actions under Gen. Winfield Scott in the campaign to the Valley of Mexico, where he remained with the U.S. Army of Occupation in Mexico City until the summer of 1848.

The main primary document included in this book is the "Recollections" probably written during occupation duty in Mexico City. In his introduction, Gary F. Kurutz describes this document well as "a mixture of memoir, daily journal entries, narrative descriptions of scenery, and reflections on the strategy employed by the leadership of both Mexico and the United States" (p. 3). Excerpts are included from several detailed letters written to Henshaw's wife and from other papers. In a lengthy introduction, Kurutz sets out the provenance of the documents, used and referenced in the book, from the California State Library, Massachusetts Historical Society, University of Virginia Library, and John Hay Library of Brown University (pp. 28-33). He also researched in microfilmed letters of the Office of the Adjutant General housed at the National Archives as well as in published government documents and four contemporary newspapers.

Readers familiar with other soldier accounts of the U.S.-Mexico War will value especially Henshaw's account as a survivor of the siege of Fort Brown. Few accounts of the march from Monterrey to Tampico exist, but Henshaw has little to add. Many published accounts are available for the siege of Veracruz and battles on the march to and in the Valley of Mexico, to which

this writing adds some details. Henshaw was much taken with Puebla, as shown by his writing discursively about it; but conversely, where much of interest might be described, he adds little to the story of Mexico City's rather lengthy occupation by the U.S. Army.

Kurutz has produced a welcome, worthwhile addition to the recently growing literature on the U.S.-Mexico War. As curator of special collections at the California State Library, he is representative of archivists and collectors who in recent years have vastly enriched our understanding of this oft-neglected but important conflict. Six documentary, book-length soldier accounts published since 1980 are listed in Kurutz's bibliography, and many briefer writings can be found in journals not cited here. This wealth of newly available sources has supported many interesting general and specialized secondary accounts.

Kurutz cites several knowledgeable scholars of the period as helpful in preparing this book, but perhaps he consulted them only on particular points, and the press staff let him down on other matters. Historian Harwood P. Hinton's first name is mistaken (p. xi). General Scott, not President Polk, is credited with making the decision to invade central Mexico (p. 15). The Mexican leader Santa Anna's name is mistakenly given (by Kurutz, not Henshaw) with a hyphen. The Battle of Cerro Gordo map errs in showing the main escape route of Mexican troops (pp. 127, 134). The "Chihuahua Expedition" of Gen. John E. Wool and the Army of the West is mentioned enigmatically, not described (pp. 105, 211 nn. 25, 26). Hundreds of endnotes giving biographical data on officers and others mentioned in the text became tiresome to this reviewer. Editorial insertions intended to clarify Henshaw's writing are often superfluous, but others were needed elsewhere. And there were a number of transcription errors, e.g., "spaced" when "spared" is intended, "quite" for "quiet," and "escape" for "expose" (pp. 51, 103, 140). Such minor matters do not detract significantly, however, from this generally excellent publication.

John Porter Bloom
Las Cruces, New Mexico

A Place of Refuge: Maynard Dixon's Arizona. By Thomas Brent Smith, Donald J. Hagerty, and Maynard Dixon. (Tucson, Ariz.: Tucson Museum of Art, 2008. 148 pp. 99 color plates, 68 halftones, bibliography. \$40.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-911611-36-6.)

Maynard Dixon has been the focus of many books, exhibitions, and documentary films within the last several years. Dixon's stunning paintings and colorful biography are enough to attract interest. *A Place of Refuge: Maynard Dixon's Arizona* singles out one aspect of the artist's life and work: Arizona.

In the essay "Sky and Sandstone: Maynard Dixon's Arizona Years," Donald J. Hagerty (Dixon's biographer) argues that Dixon's experiences in Arizona played a prominent role in the artist's life and provided "challenge, inspiration, and, ultimately, refuge" (p. 12). Hagerty claims that Dixon developed his most enduring artistic themes and matured as a painter in Arizona. Although focused on the Arizona years, Hagerty provides enough contextual information for the reader to gain an adequate knowledge of Dixon's biography, which is especially helpful when viewing the catalogue of sketches, drawings, and paintings later in the book.

Thomas Brent Smith's essay, "Evading Conflict: Interpreting Maynard Dixon's Arizona Subjects," examines Dixon within an art historical context by comparing Dixon with his predecessors. Smith's primary thesis addresses how Dixon's artwork diverged from the established visual vocabulary of conflict-filled, stereotyped, and largely mythic representations of the West, and instead portrayed the real people and land that he so admired. Smith uses Frederic Remington to illustrate the chasm between Dixon and his predecessors because Remington "was not only representative of turn-of-the-century artists of western subject matter, but also the prime originator of the vocabulary of Old West imagery" (p. 42). Remington and Dixon had vastly differing approaches to their western subjects. Remington heightened conflict and warfare in the West, while Dixon focused on the quiet, spiritual, and introspective qualities of the land and people. Where Remington's negative views of Native Americans are apparent, Dixon's sympathy toward the plight of Native Americans comes to the forefront. The close comparison of the two artists and their different methodologies provides a fresh context for reading Dixon's work. It also sets the stage for the remainder of the essay in which Smith shows how Dixon manipulated established western stereotypes and visual vocabulary of cowboys and Native Americans to build deeper meaning into his paintings.

Smith employs Remington as representative for artists who regularly utilized the stereotypical imagery of the West. However, it could be argued that Remington approached his subjects very differently from other artists mentioned in the essay—Charles M. Russell and William R. Leigh, for example. In this case, it would have been useful to further examine Dixon in more detail within a broader context that included additional artists. While the comparison with Remington certainly gets the point across, there is room for Smith to probe deeper into his thesis.

Overall, *A Place of Refuge* is a noteworthy addition to the body of work about Maynard Dixon. The insightful essays, combined with a beautiful book design and high-quality reproductions, provide a focus on an important part of Dixon's life and work.

Mindy A. Besaw
Buffalo Bill Historical Center

Magnificent Failure: A Portrait of the Western Homestead Era. By John Martin Campbell, with an introduction by Kenneth W. Karsmizki. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2008. xiv + 183 pp. 71 halftones, maps, appendix, notes, references. \$19.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-9964-1, \$14.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8061-9965-8.)

The photographs and text of *Magnificent Failure* offer a compelling approach to the historical representation of the homestead era in the western United States. This publication, by John Martin Campbell, is primarily a book of contemporary photography with accompanying text regarding general homestead history. The photographs were taken by the author and do not simply illustrate the text. Rather, the text seems intended to elucidate the images by describing the history that gave rise to the circumstances presented in the photographs.

Instead of a systematic survey of homestead remnants in the western region, the images have more artistic than historical value. The photographs are high-quality images that display Campbell's aesthetic skill and focus on some of the remnants that are left from the era. Campbell included images of abandoned homes and barns, as well as icons of the era's communal presence, such as churches, school buildings, and depots. More than just images of abandoned buildings, however, the images and information also address old farm implements and even pure landscape as viable subjects in

this photo-essay of the homesteading region. The images are romantic, to be sure, but with brief solid historical information to accompany them, they are not cloying.

The text of *Magnificent Failure*, with an introduction by Kenneth W. Karmizki, is solidly informative but does not engage the “niggling little details of the history of public land laws” (p. 1). The first-person content is not scholarly and does not advance an original thesis or idea, but does assert a still prevalent network of cultural and personal knowledge about homesteading in the western places where the expansion programs took place. Campbell relies on contemporary narratives to recall personal histories in the region, a method that mimics his photographic approach.

This book’s most valuable contribution is providing a physical and visual record of an era that most people would assume has no continuing presence in the West. The contemporary photographs are a visual insistence that we see the present West as a transparent layer through which we can still access past successes and failures in the region. The book will be appreciated by those readers looking for a history of homesteading in broad strokes. Likewise, the audiences who will most value this book are those with some prior affection for western photography, and those who maintain a fascination not only with the bygone era, but with its contemporary legacy.

Rachel Sailor
University of Texas at Tyler

