

# New Mexico Historical Review

---

Volume 6 | Number 3

Article 7

---

7-1-1931

## Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

---

### Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 6, 3 (1931). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol6/iss3/7>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact [amywinter@unm.edu](mailto:amywinter@unm.edu), [lsloane@salud.unm.edu](mailto:lsloane@salud.unm.edu), [sarahrk@unm.edu](mailto:sarahrk@unm.edu).

## REVIEWS

*Nuevos Documentos Inéditos o muy Raros para la Historia de México*, publicados por Carlos E. Castañeda: *Historia de Todos Los Colegios de la Ciudad de México desde La Conquista hasta 1780*, por el Dr. Felix de Osores. Talleres Gráficos de la Nación Lic. Verdad Número 2. Mexico, D. F. 1929.

Don Genaro García published in his first series of thirty-six volumes a monumental edition of materials, *Documentos Inéditos o Muy Raros para la Historia de México*, undoubtedly the most important single collection in print on the history of Mexico. This distinguished editor and historian had just issued the first volume of a second series when death overtook him, and his magnificent library passed soon after to the University of Texas. Now, through the interest of the Secretaría de Educación Pública of Mexico and the University of Texas, Mr. Castañeda, librarian of the García collection, as it is now called, has resumed publication of the second series. For this reason, as well as the intrinsic value of the document itself, the publication of *Historia de Todos los Colegios de la Ciudad de Mexico desde la Conquista hasta 1780 por el Dr. Felix de Osores* marks a significant contribution to the history of Mexico.

The study of Dr. Osores falls into two parts. The historical summary (pp. 1-71) as the editor points out, epitomizes the foundation of all the *colegios* of Mexico City up to 1780. The second part (pp. 72-204) reviews special aspects of the Colegio de San Pedro, San Pablo y San Yldefonso, such as *Fundadores, Catedra, Constituciones, Privilegios y Premios, Ejercicios, Festividades, Plan de Estudios, Rectores y Gobernadores 1753-1828*, etc. These include, among other vital details, lists of names, with some biographical data, of missionaries and other officials who figured in colonial church history. An adequate index completes the volume.

The importance of a document such as this can hardly be overestimated; indeed, it adds materially to the Cuevas' volumes on the history of the church in Mexico. Moreover, the value of Dr. Osore's own work has been enhanced by the illuminating research notes of the present editor. For these, relying upon the García collection for his data, Mr. Castañeda has given us a glance at many rare items in that marvelous library. Thus to initiate the second series begun by his illustrious predecessor, Mr. Castañeda could hardly have selected a more appropriate document, and those who know the editor's past productions will doubt his statement that a more worthy hand could direct the undertaking.

ALFRED B. THOMAS.

*Francisco de Urdiñola y el Norte de la Nueva España.*  
By Vito Alessio Robles. (Imprenta Mundial, Miravalle 13, Mexico City. 1931. xxv-333 pp; maps and illustrations. \$3.00.)

Here is a book which will bring joy to students of the northern expansion of New Spain and of the beginnings of the American Southwest. Intriguing, dramatic, of absorbing interest is the account which the author unfolds of Francisco de Urdiñola and the large part which he played in the affairs of Nueva Galicia and Nueva Vizcaya in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries. The author aptly begins his preface with three quotations, of which the first is the familiar passage from the poet-historian, Villagrà. He then quotes the remark of Henry R. Wagner that "After [Francisco de] Ibarra, Urdiñola is the next outstanding figure in the border states" (*The Spanish Southwest*, p. 95); and the statement of Charles W. Hackett that "The services of none of the prominent characters of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries are so little known or appreciated, and none deserve to be as fully narrated and rightly appraised as those of Urdiñola the Younger." (*His-*

*torical Documents relating to New Mexico . . . to 1773,"* II, 35.)

From his first word the author catches the interest of the reader and holds his absorbed attention as he tells of the long search for documentary evidence, as he refutes the misinformation of earlier writers and as, bit by bit, he paints in its true colors the portrait of the real Urdiñola and his achievements.

This is a book of long gestation. For the last fifteen years I have dedicated myself with true ardor to the study and copying of documents related to the history of Coahuila and especially of those which directly or indirectly refer to don Francisco de Urdiñola, to whom has been attributed the founding of Saltillo.

Sr. Alessio Robles continues his preface, summarizing the facts which he has found as a result of his research :

In our sad history [of Coahuila], plagued with lies and their repetitions, there is not a figure more scoffed at and vilified than the valiant Basque, don Francisco de Urdiñola. Around him have been woven thousands of fantasies and deceptions; he has been painted in the blackest colors; he is made to appear as the somber and cruel protagonist of a tragedy of mounting horror and as a monster of wickedness and perfidy. Simple people repeat thoughtlessly the truculent tales of indiscriminating historians, and even in the schools of Coahuila the children are taught the infamous legend attributed to Urdiñola.

The figure of this *conquistador* is one of surpassing interest. A man of energy, of intelligence and of character, he knew how to raise himself from the most humble stations to those most elevated in the viceroyalty. His enemies, strong and powerful, heaped obstacles in his path but he knew how to surmount them and rise by his own efforts. He was a valiant and skilled soldier, a successful miner, cultivator, stockman and industrialist. In many ways the figure of don Francisco de Urdiñola stands in higher relief than does the figure of that other illustrious Basque, who was called don Francisco de Ibarra.

He was captain of Mazapil, founder of the towns of San Estéban de Nueva Tlaxcala (adjoining the villa of Santiago del Saltillo), of Concepción del Oro, of Parras and of Los

Patos; lieutenant to the governor and captain-general of Nueva Galicia, and for many years he was governor of Nueva Vizcaya.

He came to be proprietor of one of the most vast estates in the world which, almost a century later, was to constitute the *mayorazgo* of the marquisate of San Miguel de Aguayo through the marriage of the first marquis of this title with a great-granddaughter of Urdiñola, a *mayorazgo* which in the epoch of independent Mexico gave rise to stormy debates in the constituent congresses of 1822 and 1857.

In the various important reductions of native peoples which he effected, he was a peace-maker rather than a conqueror, under the conviction that an ill peace was preferable to a good war—a sentiment which might be commended to statesmen in this twentieth century!

Of greatest human interest, perhaps, is the way in which Ing. Alessio Robles, by the documentary evidence which he presents, proves that Urdiñola was not guilty of the crimes attributed to him—more especially that of having poisoned his wife.

The criminal charges which were brought against Urdiñola by the audiencia of Guadalajara and which were the direct cause of his losing the contract for the colonizing of New Mexico seem to have been instigated by “a rich and powerful neighbor, Juan Bautista de Lomas y Colmenares, considered to be the richest man in New Galicia . . . and for a long time a persistent applicant for the conquest of New Mexico.” (pp. 217-218). Lomas y Colmenares had powerful backing and unlimited social and political influence. One of his sons-in-law was president of the audiencia in Mexico City; another was a member of that of Guadalajara.

The bitter enmity of this man to Urdiñola dated back many years and was due to various disputes as to mines, boundaries, and cowboy difficulties which Lomas had had with Alonso López de Loys, father-in-law of Urdiñola. And it seems that two of his own cowboys had tried to kill a son of Lomas, named Andrés. (p. 224). At all events, while Urdiñola was actively engaged in perfecting his contract

with the viceroy for the conquest of New Mexico, an anonymous denunciation of him was brought before the audiencia of Guadalajara which, together with the "evidence" taken by that body, is shown by our author to have been instigated by Lomas and to have been a fabrication of gossip, rumors and purely hear-say testimony. Yet it served to hold him a prisoner for more than four years and effectually to eliminate him as a contractor for the New Mexico enterprise. In fact, he was not legally absolved of the death of his wife until the Inquisition had intervened; and historically the shadow has remained upon him to the present day.

Urdiñola was a familiar of the Holy Office and as such he claimed the benefit of the ecclesiastical *fuero*. By order of that body another familiar, Captain Juan de Morlete, conducted an independent investigation which showed the *proceso* of the audiencia to be an infamous intrigue.

At this point it may be said that Sr. Alessio Robles, while clearing the good name of Urdiñola, has accepted the aspersions which seem first to have been cast upon Captain Morlete by Don Alonso de León and to have been repeated without question by all later historians. De Leon pictures Morlete as a pugnacious and ill-natured man who held an old grudge against Castaño de Sosa, and when the latter left Almadén for New Mexico, through jealousy and to get revenge he reported the matter to the audiencia in Mexico and asked leave to go and arrest Castaño. (p. 165).

The reviewer is not yet prepared to say what proportions of truth and falsehood are blended in this portrayal, but there are other factors which should have recognition. In the frontier administration of New Spain from 1590 to 1603 there was a group of officials known as "Protectors of the Chichimeca Indians," and in a list of twenty-two appears the name of Captain Juan Morlete as protector of the Guachichiles from 1590 to 1598, and that of Captain Francisco de Urdiñola for "those of the Rio Grande" from 1592 to 1601. When, therefore, Morlete received reports that

Castaño was "slave-hunting," it is possible that the course he followed was a matter of official duty, at least primarily. And the similar post held by Urdiñola will doubtless throw added light on his dealings with the various Indian peoples which form an important part of this most interesting study.

In his closing chapter Sr. Alessio Robles tells us of Urdiñola's restoration to royal favor and of his government of the Province of Nueva Vizcaya from 1603 to his death in 1618. Perhaps it is idle to speculate on what might have been, and yet had his contract not been cancelled, Urdiñola, rather than Juan de Oñate, would have been the colonizer of New Mexico; and he rather than Pedro de Peralta would have built the old Palace of the Governors in Santa Fe, where this review is being written. Perhaps the lot of the Pueblo Indians and their relations with the Spaniards would have been happier in those first years. . . .

Ing. Vito Alessio Robles has made a notable addition to the history of the old Spanish conquistadores, and of not the least interest is the evidence in this case that scholars of Spain and Mexico and the United States can help each other in such work. It must be a cause of keen satisfaction to Dr. J. Lloyd Mecham and others at the University of Texas that they were able to put in the hands of the author such an important part of the documentary material which he has used.

The Imprenta Mundial of Mexico City is to be congratulated on its fine press work. The cover, by the artist Don Carlos Orozco Romero, represents Urdiñola, friars, and Tlascaltecanes at the founding of the pueblo of San Esteban de Neuva Tlaxcala, adjoining Saltillo; and on the back cover very appropriately is the author's book-plate, with oak trees and the motto "Fac et Spera." Among the illustrations are two portraits of Urdiñola, and his coat of arms in colors. There seem to be very few typographical errors; 1918 is an obvious slip for 1618 (p. 298), and at the beginning of chapter VIII the date should read 1593.—L. B. B.

*Wagons West, A Story of the Oregon Trail.* By Elizabeth Page. Illustrated with photographs. (Farrar and Rinehart, Inc., New York, 1930.)

*Overland with Kit Carson.* By Lieutenant George Douglas Brewerton, U. S. A., edited by Stallo Vinton, with many engravings by the author. (Coward-McCann, Inc., 1930.)

*Wagons West*, containing many letters from Henry Page, great-uncle of the author, to his wife, follows the life of this man from boyhood until his return to his Illinois farm after adventuring with the gold rush. The writer describes Page's character as a child, the atmosphere of his New England home; tells of the influence of tales told by his half-sister about knights in armor, to take the place of fairy stories which were taboo. In 1837, after finishing at Rutland college, Henry Page left almost immediately for Woodburn, Illinois, where he hoped to make his fortune as a merchant. There he met Mary Rider whom he married. The story of Mary's family coming from the East and settling in Illinois; the difficulties and set-backs with which they met, are described. Methods of travel on old stages and river boats are mentioned.

All this account preliminary to Henry Page's decision to seek a fortune in California's gold, is told by the author with a glow of the romantic spirit with which one dreams of this past period and of the life of one's ancestors.

Henry Page was robbed by his business partner of all their capital. Facing ruin, he started farming, which afforded no great incentive. It was not surprising that the gold discoveries lured him to follow this new adventure, offering a hope of solving the long-time family financial problems.

In his first letter he says: "Everybody and his brother is going to California." The letters do not make exciting

reading. They contain news of deaths along the way, of sickness and difficulties of chasing lost oxen. Their tone shows a marked contrast to that of the other book herewith reviewed, written after the perils were over, and for the purpose of publication. It is clear that Page's letters were not written with that intention. They are more definitely an account of an individual's experience rather than a dramatic study. One notation is interesting, statistically: at Fort Kearny, he wrote, they found from the record kept there that 1980 teams had passed the fort up to the night before.

The book contains fifty-five illustrations, mostly photographs. A few old prints are historically appealing: for instance, one of Sutter's Mill, where gold was first discovered in California, and one of an encampment of the trail, showing the circular wagon formation for protection from the Indians.

"This off-hand, but strictly veracious, narrative," as Mr. Brewerton describes his account, has been attractively edited by Stallo Vinton. The main article deals with Brewerton's journey from Los Angeles to Taos in the company of Kit Carson. The narrative first appeared in *Harper's New Monthly Magazine* in 1853, 1854, and 1862.

Stallo Vinton has made an interesting study of the route followed and has included an excellent map indicating this.

At the time of the journey described, the author was nineteen years old, a lieutenant in the Mexican war. His youth is reflected in his impressions, as, for example, his first comment concerning Carson: "The Kit Carson of my imagination was over six feet high, a sort of modern Hercules in his build, with an enormous beard, and a voice like a roused lion, whose talk was all of 'stirring incidents by flood and field.' The real Kit Carson I found to be a plain, simple, unostentatious man."

The account is exceedingly interesting, not only because of the side-lights on Carson in brief but graphic description, but also because it tells of a journey over a route of such previously limited travel. It includes details of observations concerning incidents and adventures about which we are glad to be able to read.

One significant feature of the journey described is that in the mail pouches carried was the first news to reach the East concerning gold in California.

The author's style is dramatic and enthusiastic, which fits the subject. He makes a good selection of what to describe. He recounts such episodes as drinking out of part of a skeleton when this was the only means of getting water from a spring; disciplining his mule-man by knocking him off his horse (once was enough); an encounter with Digger Indians during an early "jornada" (which came to mean a place where there was an absence of water on a route traveled); a meeting with the Eutaw Indians, very powerful and warlike; the sharing of food with Indians; horse trading; a mule's first experience walking in snow; a welcome feast of fish; swimming and pulling a raft across the Grand River; eating of horse meat, from which he abstained for forty-eight hours while starving, and afterwards coming to the point of trying to buy a dog for meat.

A few telling sentences express Carson's character: "Kit waited for nobody," sums it up. The following quotation shows his knowledge of Indian ways: "Look here, the Indians have passed across our road since sun-up, and they are a war party, too; no sign of lodge poles, and no colt tracks; they are no friends, neither; here's a feather that some of them has dropped. We'll have trouble yet, if we don't keep a bright outlook."

One senses that it is Carson's clever wariness that keeps his party from Indian fights. They move at midnight when things do not look right.

An attack near Taos is described. Carson ordered a mountain man to get the mules together in a patch of chaparral, while they followed with the Indian who had come with terms of war. Brewerton, by motion of Carson, was ordered to fall secretly behind the Indian and shoot at a moment's notice. Looking back, "I saw about a hundred and fifty warriors finely mounted and painted for war, with their long hair streaming in the wind, charging down upon us, shaking their lances and brandishing their spears as they came on." Among Carson's orders, was one to shoot down the mule with the mail bags on her pack, if they should try to stampede the animals. Just as everything was set for action, a runner on a speckled horse rushed in with a message and the Indians were ordered back. Their "miraculous escape" was discovered later to have been due to a party of two hundred American volunteers on their way to punish Indian outrages.

The people of Taos and of other villages are well characterized. Native homes and gatherings are described.

Special characters mentioned are: Father Ignacio, the jovial village priest; Ebeneser Spindle, called "Long Eben," proprietor of the "United States" Hotel; La Tules, known as Señora Doña Gertrudes Barcelo, famous Santa Fe monte dealer; and "Little Aubrey."

The author quotes Gregg instead of describing Santa Fe himself. But he says of it, "It may have bettered itself since but it did not suit me then." He also refers to it as a "pile of mud bricks."

Carson overtook Brewerton in Santa Fe after a short separation; but left him to add to his recruits and follow over a slower route.

Brewerton tells of organizing his caravan; describes the Pecos ruin, then recently abandoned; and suddenly bursts into eloquence over the possibilities of a railroad to the coast. One of the last adventures he describes is that of dodging Comanches by hiding under water.

The illustrations by the author are keenly expressive of local color, and his character studies have a definite appeal. There is an especially attractive one of Kit Carson. The one of Father Ignacio shows Brewerton's humor.

HESTER JONES.

*Adventures in the Santa Fe Trade 1844-1847.* James Josiah Webb. Edited by Ralph P. Bieber. Vol. I Southwest Historical Series. Arthur H. Clark Company. \$6.00.

American advance into the Southwest witnessed a conflict of cultures and an amalgamation not experienced in any other phases of our continental expansion. The procession of Anglo-American trappers, traders, soldiers, and settlers into the Hispanic Southwest is a fascinating tale. The lure of adventure and profit led countless thousands to make the long journey across the vast stretches of unbroken prairie and treacherous mountain passes, with every mile teeming with dangers of extreme heat or cold, hunger, thirst, and possible Indian attack. The glamour, romance, and daring of the movement into the Southwest were early seized upon and frequently distorted by the writers of fiction. The historians entered the field somewhat later, due, no doubt, to the inaccessibility of source materials. However, during the past decade and a half, students of the Southwest have brought to light much of interest upon the Mexican and American occupation of the land that was once a part of the northern provinces of New Spain. Strangely enough, the diaries, journals, correspondence, and private papers that have been collected tell a story that is far more interesting and colorful than the fiction which was for so long responsible for popular conceptions of the life and cultures of the Southwestern frontier.

Unfortunately these materials have been available only to the serious-minded students and scholars initiated into the mysteries and allurements of archives and dusty attics; and except for two or three desultory publications of some

fifty years' standing, the general library and reading public have been deprived of many of the most accurate, vivid, and interesting accounts of the conquest and settlement of the Southwest.

*The Southwest Historical Series* edited by Ralph P. Bieber, of Washington University, and of which volume one has recently appeared, will relieve in a large way many of empty spaces in the documentary history of the Southwest, making available hitherto unpublished or poorly documented accounts of prairie travel, Santa Fe trade, military occupation of the Southwest by Kearny and Doniphan, the "Forty-niners," the Pike's Peak rush, the Texas cattle trails, and sketches of the leading families and characters in the Southwest in the days before the coming of the railroad and the wire fence.

The introductory volume contains the journal of a Santa Fe trader, James J. Webb. In 1888, over forty years since he had been engaged actively in the Santa Fe and overland trade, James Josiah Webb, of near New Haven, Connecticut, began the story of his experiences in the Southwest. He had only finished three years of his adventures during his seventeen years residence in New Mexico when he died. However, these three years form a readable and splendid contribution to Southwestern history. Webb loved the prairie, and he wrote as a man of quickened memory who grew buoyant, and vigorous and young as he re-lived his youthful adventures. His story begins with 1844, where Gregg's *Commerce of the Prairies* ends. Unflinching Webb tells the tale of his first trip across the plains in '44, his second journey, and a winter trip to St. Louis for supplies, his early ventures in the mercantile business in Santa Fe, a trip to Mexico in advance of Kearny and Doniphan, and his experiences as a Mexican prisoner in Chihuahua. Unlike a day by day diary, Webb's account is not cluttered with petty details and non-essentials. For the most part the

narrative moves rapidly, and the enthusiasm and animation of the writer supply a freshness and interest akin to suspense and plot. One feels the uncertainty of journey across the plains, the torrid heat and thirst of the jornada, and the cold piercing blast of the Texas norther.

Webb gives an excellent description of trail equipment, the great creaking, canvas-covered wagons, and the ox and mule teams that were used to draw them over the rough trail and across the unbridged streams. St. Louis, Westport, Council Grove, and Independence are frontier towns once more, animated with the hustle and bustle of outfitting the wagon trains, the dickerings of traders, and the maneuvers of gamblers and teamsters. Webb was a fearless man himself but when he describes making camp for the night, one is ever aware of the danger of Indian attack, a stampede of the stock or depredations by the wolves.

Life on the trail is stripped of its romance as one reads of men wading waist-deep in icy water for hours in an attempt to get the wagons with their precious freight over a half-frozen stream.

Webb's dealings with the Mexican authorities in Santa Fe and Chihuahua give a good index to the character of Mexican officials and the corruption and fraud which permeated the civil structure of that new republic. His description of Don Manuel Armijo tallies with those given by others who wrote of their contacts with that unscrupulous governor.

Through his long association in the mercantile business in Santa Fe, Webb was acquainted with most of the first-families and leading characters in New Mexico. Across the pages of his book pass in engaging pageant the Oteros, the Armijos, the Pinos, the Ortiz family, Doniphan and Kearny, Albert Speyer, the Bent brothers, the Leitensdorfers, Lucien Maxwell, and Don Carlos Beaubien. Except for an occasional fandango or baile, Webb did not dwell greatly on the so-called social life of Santa Fe. Of food,

taverns, hotel accommodations, he gives a fair and interesting picture.

In reading Webb's journal, one is impressed by its freedom from cant and ego. Webb is an adventurer because he loves adventure; never because he wishes to pose as a hero. His affection for his spirited little mule, "Dolly Spanker," and his delightful and unobtrusive sense of humor are quite enough to endear Webb to his readers, and he commits none of the errors so common when men write adventures to be read by their grandchildren.

Dr. Bieber has chosen materials for his series wisely indeed, and volume one gives evidence of his careful scholarship. Spanish words, phrases, and expressions common in the vernacular of the trail days are carefully explained in footnotes. A number of rare and excellent cuts add value to the work. An adequate map gives new and old names of locations mentioned in the text. The documentation is such as to indicate an unusual acquaintance and familiarity with materials of historical import in the Southwest. The points of controversy, contemporary accounts, and numerous biographical sketches included in the footnotes prove quite as interesting reading as the text. Dr. Bieber has painstakingly verified dates, events, and descriptions in Webb's journal by references to contemporary newspapers, the day books and correspondence and family papers of the Webbs. To the student this enhances the value of the book, but to the lay reader to whom this book should have an appeal, as well as to the scholar, there is a fear that it is top-heavy with documentation.

*Adventures in the Santa Fe Trade* is both a delightful and a scholarly piece of work. It marks a propitious beginning for the *Southwest Historical Series*. Students and lovers of Southwestern history may joyously anticipate what the other eleven volumes will bring forth.

HELEN E. MARSHALL.

*New Found Letters of Josiah Gregg.* By John Thomas Lee. (Worcester, Mass., 1931. 24 pp. Reprint from Proceedings of the American Antiquarian Society, April, 1930).

In this paper Mr. Lee has gathered up and reviewed briefly the rather meager data hitherto known of this famous trader of the old Santa Fe trail, and then presents a group of nine letters, previously unpublished, from Gregg to John Bigelow. An addendum to the paper as first published in the *Proceedings* has been inserted in the reprint which calls attention to twelve other letters from Gregg to Dr. George Engelmann, partly on botanical subjects, and now preserved in the collections of the Missouri Botanical Garden, St. Louis, and to a letter in the *Alvarez Papers* of the Historical Society of New Mexico. Part of this insert gives an interesting side-light on Gregg:

Since this paper was submitted to the Society, I have received from Mr. T. J. Fitzpatrick, curator of the University of Nebraska herbarium, a list of twenty-three plants named for Josiah Gregg by Dr. Asa Gray, Dr. George Englemann, Sereno Watson, P. A. Rydberg, and J. G. Smith. Of these botanists only Gray and Englemann personally knew Gregg. Mr. Fitzpatrick does not by any means claim finality for his list; there may be other species associated with the trader's name.

As to Gregg having been a doctor, Mr. Lee states:

My research has brought me inevitably to the conclusion that it is extremely doubtful that the trader ever studied medicine for any considerable period, much less became a full-fledged physician . . . I have been unable to find any contemporary mention of the trader as *Doctor* Gregg. The earliest reference of the kind that I have encountered is in John Russell Bartlett's *Personal Narrative of Explorations*, etc., published in New York, 1854, four years after Gregg's death . . . Final solution of the enigma I leave to the future investigator.

*America Moves West.* By Robert E. Riegel. (Henry Holt and Co., New York, 1930, 566 pp. \$3.00.)

*Westward: The Romance of the American Frontier.*  
By E. Douglass Branch. (D. Appleton and Co., New York,  
1930, 627 pp. \$5.00.)

Professor Riegel has produced an excellent account of the westward movement. As a work of scholarship, *America Moves West* hardly measures up to the standard set by Paxson in his *History of the American Frontier*. And Riegel does not give as many facts about the settlement of the Middle West as Paxson. However, Riegel has evidently profited by the criticisms of the work of his predecessor. He tells more of frontier religion and cultural advance, and of the social and economic conditions of the people who settled the West. The book has a very readable style which will make it a popular text for courses on the American frontier.

A few errors are noted: The statement that four of the survivors from the Tonquin escaped and "eventually found their way back to civilization," (p. 180); and the confusion of the campaigns of 1896 and 1900, (p. 533). The publishers have announced that a number of minor corrections will be made in the second printing.

*Westward: The Romance of the American Frontier* is a popular account of the westward movement. Important topics such as the Ordinance of 1787, the treaties by which our national domain was extended, and the land laws of the United States are passed over lightly. Attention is centered largely on the more dramatic and human phases of western settlement. Thus, *Westward* is a series of fascinating pictures calculated to hold the attention of the casual reader who would be bored by a systematic history. The book may also serve to stimulate the interest of college students, who, it is hoped, will later turn to more systematic accounts.

Of special value to students are the "Supplementary Readings" listed at the back of both books. Riegel's list, arranged by chapters, contains some striking omissions, like Alvord, *The Mississippi Valley in British Politics*, and makes no attempt to cite articles. Branch cites some articles, and gives brief comments on the works cited. Together the two lists serve to supplement the *List of References on the History of the West*, by Turner and Merk.

MARION DARGAN.

## NOTES AND COMMENTS

**D**R. F. W. HODGE, Museum of the American Indian, and for many years a recognized authority in the ethnology and history of the Pueblo Indians, especially of the Zuñi region, sends the following helpful criticisms on the "Campaign against the Moqui Pueblos in 1716," which appeared in the April REVIEW:

1. By reading the document very carefully it seems to me that the references to San Juan and San Diego de los Jemez are merely reminiscent of the former missions and that really the present Jemez was the only pueblo at that time. This is shown by the reference to the distance of three leagues from Xémes to Cía, ("pueblo of Cía, distant three leagues from that of the Xémes"—as if there were only one Jemez pueblo then. See p. 169.)

Again, why should Cía and Santa Ana be named with San Juan de Xémes (p. 175) if more than one Jemez pueblo existed at the time?

2. And so with the pueblo of Alona, or Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe de Alona, of the Zuñi province. After the conquest of 1692, when the Zuñi were induced to come from the summit of Towayalane, or Corn Mountain, and to settle in the valley, they commenced to establish the present Zuñi pueblo at the site of the former village of Hálona (sometimes called Alona), hence it was natural that the name of Hálona (Alona) should have been given to the new pueblo, later to be changed to the name Zuñi by outsiders. Zuñi is the Keres name. Hálona, or Zuñi, was the only pueblo occupied by the tribe after the revolt of 1680. Later, in the 18th century, the mission name of the pueblo was N. S. de Guadalupe de Zuñi. (Domínguez and Escalante, 1776).

3. I have now little doubt that Kawaika was the Hopi pueblo destroyed by Coronado in 1540, according to Luxán in 1583. (See p. 187, note; also Quivira Soc. Pub., I.)

4. El Nacimiento was in all probability El Gallo, the great spring at the present San Rafael, where Fort Wingate (the first of that name) was established in 1862. This was on the road to El Morro and Zuñi, which was always taken on account of the lava flow. Five leagues from El Gallo would have taken the party into the Zuñi mountains, as mentioned, via the Guadalupe or Zuñi pass. (pp. 187-88.)

5. The "little spring" is the Ojo Pescado, where one of the three Zuñi farming villages now is. It was visited and mentioned by earlier Spaniards, including Espejo and Oñate. (p. 189.)

6. As to the Ácoma church (pp. 191-92), Twitchell was doubtless correct in his statement, following Vargas, that it survived the revolt. Years ago I was told by old Ácoma natives that the first church was situated a little to the north of the present one, and was smaller. Presumably this was the one built by Fray Juan Ramírez, who went to Ácoma in 1629.

7. Pages 199-200. I believe that the expression "*del tamaño de un Xeme*" has nothing to do with a "Xémes" or Jemes Indian, but means a *Zemi*, *Zeme*, or *Xeme*, an idol. The name was picked up in the West Indies by the Spaniards and by them was taken to the continent. Such idols varied in size and were made of both stone and wood. They probably were never very large. By no possibility could there have been such a difference in the stature of the Jemez compared with other Pueblo Indians to warrant such a reference to them as a standard of measurement as that given in the footnote.

In a subsequent letter Dr. Hodge comments on the identity of two characters who appear in the Hopi tale, "The Good-Bringing," in the same issue.

"If Loma-week-va-yah died in 1926 and had made a mark on the cliff each year for fifty-eight years from

the time of the event, then the latter must have taken place in 1868, when the bewhiskered Governor Robert B. Mitchell was in the chair at Santa Fe. Then too, we must look for a friendly white man who lived 24 hours or less away, reckoned by travel afoot from Oraibi. It is doubtful if any white man other than Thomas V. Keam, the trader at Keam's cañon, lived in the Hopi country at that time, hence it would seem that one would not have to look any farther to identify the kind individual who wrote to the governor."

If Dr. Hodge is correct in his deductions, then we must go farther and recognize that the men who perpetrated the outrage at Oraibi were not Spaniards or Mexicans, but were connected with the U. S. army force stationed at Fort Marcy, the army post in Santa Fe at that time. A difficulty in this interpretation is that Governor Mitchell did not enter upon his duties until August, 1866, and before that date officers' quarters and barracks for the soldiers and the parade ground had been established north and west of the old Palace. (See *N. M. Hist. Rev.*, vol. IV, at p. 203, an illustration reproducing a water-color view of Santa Fe in 1866.) The Hopi messenger was taken to eat "in a large hall with many men"; and one's first impression is that this was a part of the old Palace, although it is not so indicated definitely.

What is most difficult to believe is that any men connected with the United States army would have practically enslaved Pueblo Indians, and this immediately following the Civil War! It harks back rather to Spanish times, or to the Mexicans who inherited this penchant from their forefathers.

It is not easy to distinguish the historical basis in legendary and traditional matter, and, after all, the real value of this Hopi tale is the Indian point of view and attitude to the white man, whether Spaniard or Anglo-American.