New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 8 | Number 1 Article 5

1-1-1933

# Book Reviews

## BOOK REVIEWS

*A History of Ancient Mexico,* Vol. I, by Fray Bernardino de Sahagún. Translated by Fanny R. Bandelier from the Spanish version of Carlos María de Bustamante. viii and 315 pp.; portrait. Fiske University Social Science Series, Fiske University Press, Nashville, Tennessee, 1932.

Mrs. Bandelier has begun a most meritorious task in translating into English the first four books of Sahagún's *History of Ancient Mexico.* Fiske University, moreover, deserves the greatest praise for assuming the patronage of her useful undertaking. It is of paramount importance that the succeeding volumes containing the remaining eight books of Sahagún's history also appear.

Fray Bernardino Sahagún (1499-1590) came to Mexico about 1529. Taking great interest in the religion and customs of the recently conquered Aztecs, he set to work systematically to amass all information relating to them. His procedure was to interrogate the learned Indians of one community (Teopopulco near Calhuacan) and then to check these statements against those of other well informed Aztecs from two other towns (Tlaltelolco and Mexico). This research took place between 1547-1577, so that the learned friar had plenty of time to amass and digest a considerable body of first-hand information. The scientific spirit shown by him in comparing and criticizing his sources is almost unique in the literature of the Conquest.

Although several manuscript copies of the History were in existence and were frequently used by historians of a later period, this magnificent study did not find its way into print until 1830 when the Mexican edition of Bustamante appeared, followed shortly by another edition in Kingsborough's *Antiquities of Mexico.* In 1880 an edition in French was published, translated by D. Jourdanet. But none of these editions, because of language, rarity, and price, is readily accessible to the American student.

Mrs. Bandelier in making her translation, and Fiske University in bringing it out, have done a great service to all students of anthropology. The translation is clear and careful, the type and size of the volume are convenient, the index is complete, and the price is low. The content produces the largest and most critical body of data on the customs and religious beliefs of the Aztecs in any single first-hand source. To have this information, unblurred by the commentaries of abstractors, will aid ethnologists and historians alike. The translation will be extremely useful in deciphering the *Codex Florentino,* a picture manuscript edited by Sahagún and published in 1906 by the Mexican Government. The sole defect is that all the books of Sahagún were not published at once, but after such a solid and propitious beginning, let us hope that the full series eventually will appear. Hearty congratulations are in order for both the translator and the publishers of this major source book for Aztec ethnology.

GEORGE C. VAILLANT.
American Museum of Natural History,
New York City.

*Pedro de Alvarado, Conquistador.* By John Eoghan Kelly. (Princeton University Press, 1932. viii-279 pp., with maps and plates. $3.50.)

To the superficial reader the picture of Alvarado and his achievements will be a marvelous tale, which under the skillful handling of the author is glamorous and fascinating. To the thoughtful reader the book will be provocative in many ways.

From first to last, the author seems to advocate the principle that "might makes right." Frequently he reveals an animus of intolerance towards those who view the historical records differently. To him Las Casas was "a prototype of certain modern Dissenter clerics," "hysterical, untruthful, intolerant", and the circumstantial charges made by this Dominican friar against the conquerors were based

on "alleged outrages" (pp. 204-205). In fact anyone who pictures the facts at variance from Mr. Kelly is liable to the epithet "sentimentalist" (p. 118). The historian H. H. Bancroft is "pro-Aztec", "bigoted", a "partisan of Moctezuma" (91-92). When he uses the phrases "inhuman cruelty practised in the name of religion" and "bloodthirsty traits", he is speaking of the Aztecs—not of the Spaniards. Yet in many a well-substantiated instance such terms fitted the conquerors equally as well,—and near the top of the list would stand Pedro de Alvarado. They were ruthless invaders of every right, individual and ethnic, of the conquered peoples. When the latter fought back (and they did resist desperately at times), they were seized as slaves and branded like cattle. Who today, looking back upon both sides of the picture, will argue that the conquistadores manifested a very high grade of humanity, or of Christianity? They and their religion were the product of their past and of the times in which they lived; and the same was true of the native peoples in America. Any acceptable history of the conquest must show impartially what happened; a biography, as in this case, is usually *ex parte* in presenting the facts.

Mr. Kelly has made a thorough study of his subject and, despite the fact that he is such an advocate of his hero, he has made a valuable addition to the literature on Spanish American history. He is a decade off as to the marriage of Isabella (p. 3), and necessary accents are frequently omitted. The presswork and illustrations are excellent. L. B. B.

*Flaming Arrow's People.* By James Paytiamo (an Acoma Indian). (Duffield and Green, 1932. 158 pp.; illustrated in colors by the author. $2.50.)

The authorship of *Flaming Arrow's People* is credited to James Paytiamo, as are also the illustrations. The latter are of mask dancers, and shards of pottery on which are Acoma designs of both ancient and modern times. In fact, the book is a mixture of both ancient and modern. One

wishes that the author had adhered to but one, and that a reader might have had a more unified concept of the Acoma Indian of one time or the other. In the main, the book is an authentic work on customs, superstitions, habits, and ceremonies of Acoma Indians of yesterday—and today. Those who are acquainted with the Indians of today and with their history long past are able to separate details and clarify the material used in the book. The Acoma words which are used are well used, authentic, and are so well indicated by syllables and spelling that the reader has little difficulty in pronouncing or studying them.

The author missed an opportunity of giving the reader a very exciting chapter on the Spanish siege of Acoma. He barely alludes to this historically important event when he mentions the young men of the village slipping out and returning with water-weeds which they throw down upon the Spaniards the next morning.

Bread making and baking, making paper bread, drying squash, melons, and other foods are recited very truly, and in detail that makes the book a very interesting and useful one for accurate information on these topics. The making and use of prayer sticks are very interestingly told, as is the hunting ceremony. The author says, however: "each one goes off by himself to pray to strange gods. We pray to mountain lions, eagles, hawks, wolves, and other wild beasts." The gods of the Indian are not "strange" in any sense of the word from his standpoint. His gods are more real, more near, and more common to him than the God of his white brother is to the white man.

Such discrepancies as the above show that the author was not given a free hand at his manuscript, but that some editor retold the story in too many instances, doing away with much of the Indian flavor and often obscuring the meaning or giving a wrong impression of the Indian. Mr. Paytiamo would never have said, on a visit to Zuñi, that the attire of the men "made them look like a prehistoric Captain Kidd and his pirate crew." Nor would he say: "Now

bees' nests out here in New Mexico are very hard to find," any more than he would say: "then I pray to strange gods."

A beautiful passage in the book closes Chapter X. One feels that it is too bad that this is not the final chapter on this account, and he reads on through six more chapters feeling that he has said goodby to the Pueblo boy who is telling the story and has again entered the realm of the white man.

The book is a real contribution in that its material in most instances is authentic. Subsequent editions, carefully revised, would be an educational asset to schools. The dedication notice should correct the name of Superintendent "H. B. Peairs" of Haskell Institute.

ISIS L. HARRINGTON.

U. S. Indian School,
Albuquerque.

*Indian Excerpts from the Memorias for the History of the Province of Texas by Father Morfi.* By Frederick C. Chabot, translator and editor. (Privately printed. The Naylor Printing Company, San Antonio, Texas, 1932. pp. xxii, 85. Illustrations.)

Perhaps the best single source of information concerning the Texas Indians is Father Juan Agustín Morfi's *Memorias.* The illustrious Franciscan, professor of theology at the College of Santiago Tlalteloco, accompanied Don Teodoro de Croix, commandant general of the *Provincias Internas,* on his tour of inspection into Texas in 1778. It was this visit to Texas which stimulated the Father's interest in the history and the natives of that region. His *Memorias,* written by 1783, and for long regarded as the standard authority for Texas history, although unpublished to the present day, was not intended as a finished historical narrative, but rather as a detailed assemblage of facts from which a concise historical sketch was to be drawn. That this history was ever written only recently became known when Dr. Carlos E. Castañeda, librarian of the Latin-Amer-

ican Collection in the University of Texas library, discovered Morfi's *Historia de la Provincia de Texas, 1673-1779* in the old Convento Grande de San Francisco in Mexico City. The *Historia* does not supplant the *Memoria* as a veritable mine of information on aboriginal culture in Texas.

Mr. Chabot, who has made many contributions to the early history of San Antonio, presents in translation those parts of the *Memorias* "which particularly concern the various Indians of the Province of Texas; their tribal divisions, characteristics, customs, traditions, superstitions, and all else of interest concerning them." The annotations to the excerpts are adequate, and reveal the scholarly care with which the editor studied his documents. The thoroughness of this study is further revealed in a well prepared and quite extensive bibliography. In an introduction, called a "Prolog", Mr. Chabot briefly recounts how the fund of information concerning the Tejas Indians was gradually expanded until Father Morfi made his greatest contribution. The translation of the excerpts, supplemented by Mr. Chabot's notes and introduction, make this work an invaluable handbook on the Texas Indians.

The format of the volume is to say the least, *de luxe*. The binding is leather, with a flap and leather thongs for tying in the manner of old Spanish books. The same idea is carried out with double columns, marginal notes, and beautiful capital letters. The book is illustrated with several old prints and maps.

J. LLOYD MECHAM.

The University of Texas,
Austin.

*Pioneer Days in Arizona*. By Frank C. Lockwood. (The Macmillan Company, New York, 1932, 387 pp. Illustrated. $4.00.)

Rather loosely joined and sketchy and yet most interesting and informative, *Pioneer Days in Arizona*, by Dr. Francis Cumming Lockwood of the University of Arizona,

adds little to what is known of Southwestern history but does furnish an attractively printed and readable compilation of widely scattered facts which reflect the modes of life from the Spanish Occupation to Statehood in the wide domain now known as Arizona. Dr. Lockwood relies for his data in the Introduction which he headlines "Catching Archaeology Alive" (using the oft quoted Lummis phrase) upon the discoveries of Hewett, Cummings, Judd, Harrington, Fewkes, Kidder, Guthe, all at one time or other connected more or less with the School of American Research at Santa Fé, as well as others who have of late years added mightily to the story of prehistoric life in the Southwest; putting especial stress upon the dating of Arizona Pueblo ruins by the astronomer Dr. Douglass, with his epochmaking tree-ring chronology.

The author inaugurates his story of the pioneers with a vivid sketch of Estévan, to whom he refers as "A gigantic Arabian black man" (although by what authority is not clear) "the first man to come into view * * not a white soldier or priest" "as the curtain rises to introduce the European actors in the Arizona drama." Adopting the opinions of Bandelier, Hodge, and other historians, he presents Fray Marcos de Niza as "an honest, brave, but zealous priest" saying that "surely the monk quite as much as the devil deserves his due." Discussing the route taken by Coronado he leans to the theory that Coronado came marching down the Santa Cruz past the present site of Tucson, a theory that has but a slim basis of fact. Anyway, the author feels "that every certified hoof-beat of a Spanish charger made in what is now an Arizona town, is worth much gold and many silver dollars to the present inhabitants of such a town." It is in this free and easy manner with picturesque and romantic side-remarks that Dr. Lockwood introduces the many characters who tramp, trot, and gallop across his pages. It is a motley array of savages, priests, missionaries, soldiers, trappers, prospectors, outlaws, politicians, and merchants who pass review, not so much in detail as with meteoric

flashes of apt phrase and high lights of diction. Never dull, the author who writes well, makes vivid the many thrilling episodes and events which form part of the history of Arizona. It becomes evident, however, that up to the days of the Civil War, these occurrences had their motivation outside of present Arizona borders. As part of New Mexico, with its capital of Santa Fé too remote and feeble either to protect or to develop the region beyond Zuñi, Arizona's destiny was woven by the men who came from the south, the west, and the east, so that it had but little in common with what is now its neighbor and for centuries was its ruling power, New Mexico.

The first part of the second chapter devoted to "The Mission Fathers in Arizona" belongs in reality to New Mexico annals for it is not until Father Kino established his mission stations, some years after the Indian rebellion of 1680, that Arizona history begins. The story of Kino and Garcés, a Franciscan who followed him half a century later, is fascinating. The tale of the missions ends with 1781, when "a veil of obscurity settles down over the missions of Arizona. The heroic and germinal period had come to an end."

It was not until 1824 that the trappers, as the first path finders, reached Arizona. According to Dr. Lockwood, between 1824 and 1832, there were hundreds of them who "touched upon Arizona soil, and in passing left more or less enduring records in geography, literature and patriotic achievement." Those to whom reference is made with picturesque anecdote and occasional biographical reference, include the saintly Jedediah Smith, Kit Carson, Miguel Rubidoux, Sylvester and James Pattie, Ewing Young, Peg-leg Smith, Old Bill Williams, David E. Jackson, Milton Sublette and Pauline Weaver, few of whom really belong to Arizona.

Army operations, less than ninety years ago, unlocked Arizona wilds to the rest of the United States. The Mormon Battalion under Lt. Col. P. St. George Cooke, made its slow and painful march from Santa Fé to the Gila and

thence across southern Arizona by way of Tucson to Warner's Ranch, its California goal. The wars with the Navajos, partly waged in present northeastern Arizona, and the trek of the California column, the skirmish at Picacho, are the outstanding events of the days between the war with Mexico and the separation of Arizona from New Mexico during the Civil War. The establishment of army posts, the scientific expeditions of the Fifties, and the conflicts with the Apaches close the pioneer period.

No doubt the days that have followed the Civil War, held as much of romance and daring as the earlier periods of Arizona history, but they are too near to the present to be nimbused by the glamour which time alone can give. Nevertheless, the chapters which deal with mining, schools, agriculture, newspapers, books and libraries, crimes and the courts, roads and trails, towns and cities, and finally "The Achievement of Statehood" will hold the attention of the reader and round out a kaleidoscopic design of historic and literary merit. Without pretending to be a complete history or a series of detailed biographical studies, the book is one that might well be read with profit not only by every one interested in American history but that should be supplemental reading in every Arizona school house.

Opportunity to create something original and noteworthy in typography and binding which such a volume presents, was not seized by the publishers although the book is up to the high standard of the Macmillan Company, with due regard to accepted rules as to margins, spacing, display, presswork and illustrations. Here and there, the accenting of Spanish words is neglected and there is lack of verification of historic detail and proper names, but these are minor defects easily remedied in future editions. Taken all in all, Dr. Lockwood has achieved a well worth-while task which he set himself and which will give him a place among Southwestern historians and writers. His earlier works are *Emerson as a Philosopher, Robert Browning, Freshman and his College, Public Speaking Today, The Freshman*

*Girl,* and it was not until he had reached his 64th year that he turned to historical writing in a lighter vein when he published *Arizona Characters* to be followed by a *Life of Edward Everett Ayer.*—P. A. F. W.

*Zebulon Pike's Arkansas Journal: In Search of the Southern Louisiana Purchase Boundary Line.* Edited by Stephen Harding Hart and Archer Butler Hulbert. Denver, Colorado, 1932.

*Pike's Arkansas Journal* is volume one of *"Overland to the Pacific,"* a narrative-documentary history of the great epochs of the far west, being published by the Stewart Commission of Colorado College. In addition to the journal itself, the present volume contains three papers, as follows:

1. An introduction to the series in which the general editor, Dr. Hulbert, points out some of the major geographical considerations which affected overland migration. Among these are the fact that the highest of the Rocky Mountains and the Continental Divide rarely coincide; the fact that the greater streams—the Missouri and the Arkansas, followed by the first explorers—did not afford the most feasible routes across the Rockies; and the fact that, while the great mass of the Rockies blocked migration, "they had the salutary influence of diverting the flow of population around the arid Utah-Nevada-Arizona basin which lay directly west of them." Dr. Hulbert then describes the way in which the actual paths of the Oregon and California trails became known through a study of the township plats in the General Land Office, and the origin of the series from the complaints of a group of students of the inaccessibility of the sources of western history. In *Overland to the Pacific* the editor proposes to include the best representative material for the major epochs of far western history: "the occupation of Oregon, the Mormon hegira, the 'Conquest' of the Southwest and California, the gold rush to California, the road-and-railway survey era of the fifties, the Civil War experiences of those new western states or territories, min-

ing in the west outside of California, the building of the Pacific railways, Indian wars of the sixties and the beginning of the invasion of the West by cattle king and pioneer agriculturist." (p. xxv.) Dr. Hulbert then describes "the state of the American mind relative to the Far West in the first ten years" of the nineteenth century, concluding that, at the time of the publication of Pike's *An Account of Expeditions in 1810,* the reading public was much in the dark concerning the Trans-Mississippi West.

2. A sketch by Stephen H. Hart of the life of Pike from his birth in New Jersey in 1779 to his death as a brigadier-general during the War of 1812. This is followed by a detailed account of Pike's papers and of the various editions of his works. Mr. Hart then describes the discovery in Mexico by Dr. Herbert E. Bolton of the manuscripts taken from Pike by the Spaniards in 1807 and their return by the Mexican Republic to our government.

3. What may prove a definite contribution by Dr. Hulbert to the much discussed question of the purpose of Pike's expedition. Dr. Hulbert defends Pike by a bold attack on "low grade literary fortune hunters" and others who have accused this ambitious young lieutenant of acting as a spy upon Spanish territory in connection with the Burr-Wilkinson conspiracy. Contrary to the custom of those who have read their own suspicions into the records, Dr. Hulbert allows Pike to speak for himself and builds up strong cumulative evidence that the expedition of 1806 was merely an ordinary routine investigation of the Spanish-American boundary. Highly indignant at the treatment given Pike by previous writers, the editor is rather bellicose in tone, and handy with his epithets. However, he is not without justification. One is impressed by his fairness in interpretating the evidence, and overwhelmed by the cumulative weight of his arguments.

*Pike's Journal* comprises about two thirds of the volume. In it we have day-by-day entries from the time Pike and his men set out from Belle Fontaine near St. Louis until

their capture by the Spaniards on the upper Rio Grande. The Journal and Pike's maps—recently recovered from Mexico—correct some errors in Capt. Coues' *The Expeditions of Zebulon M. Pike,* and give strong support to Dr. Hulbert's conclusions regarding the purpose of Pike's expedition.

The volume is a noteworthy contribution to western history. It and the volumes to follow are not intended for experts, but for the wider reading public—a fact made obvious by phrases from the jacket: "His Search for the Boundary Napoleon Forgot", referring to Pike himself; and "Stolen by the Ladies of Santa Fe!", referring to a man whom Pike could not locate in Santa Fé, but who saved Pike's journal from capture by the Spaniards.

Few errors were noted. In quoting from Bolton's Papers of Zebulon M. Pike, 1806-1807 *(American Historical Review,* vol. xiii, page 798-99) the editors have omitted the word "boundary" and changed "archive" to "Archives." William Morrison is correctly described on page 170 as a resident of Kaskaskia, Ill., while on p. xciii he is identified as a St. Louis merchant. Several errors result from the fact that the editors have followed Pike's spelling of French and Spanish proper names. Thus we have "Lelande" (pp. xciii., 170) for "Lalande," "Malgares," (pp. 59, 79, &c.) for "Melgares," "Valasco" (p. li) for "Velasco," and "Nimesio" *(ibid.)* for "Nemesio." These slight errors, however, detract little from the book, which is of the greatest value, both for what it promises and for what it performs.

MARION DARGAN.

University of New Mexico.