

1-1-1945

## Reviews and Notes

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

---

### Recommended Citation

. "Reviews and Notes." *New Mexico Historical Review* 20, 1 (1945). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol20/iss1/5>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact [amywinter@unm.edu](mailto:amywinter@unm.edu), [lsloane@salud.unm.edu](mailto:lsloane@salud.unm.edu), [sarahrk@unm.edu](mailto:sarahrk@unm.edu).

## REVIEWS AND NOTES

*A Tentative Guide to Historical Materials on the Spanish Borderlands.* By Francis Borgia Steck, O.F.M. (Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia, 1943; 106 pp. \$3.00.)

Dr. Steck has himself long been interested in the history of the "Spanish Borderlands"—those parts of the present United States from Florida to California which were for so long under the Spanish crown; and of recent years he has been aware of the manifold and growing interest in this field on the part of "teachers, students, writers, lecturers, and librarians." A guide to the widely scattered materials seemed called for, especially in our periodical literature, and this modest volume is the result.

The list of periodicals from which he has drawn the materials for this guide (pp. 7-9) includes not only all of those in our own country which we should expect to find, but it includes also periodicals from Italy, Germany, Spain, Canada, Mexico, and Argentina. The titles listed are grouped in seven sections: general and comprehensive; discovery and exploration (1513-61); Florida (1561-1819); Louisiana (1763-1803); Texas (1689-1836); New Mexico and Arizona (1581-1846); and California (1769-1846).

Most, but not all, of the titles are accompanied by informative comments in fine print, usually authoritative and excellent but some of them need revision.

In some cases an important title which seemed to be omitted from the *Guide* has been found in a different section. The "break-down" of the *Guide* into sections is helpful, but it would seem to call for an indexing of the *Guide* as a whole. Possibly Dr. Steck will add this in a later revised edition.—L. B. B.

*A Guide to Materials Bearing on Cultural Relations in New Mexico.* Compiled by Lyle Saunders. (University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque, 1944; xvi + 528 pp.; author and subject indices. \$4.00.)

Here is one of those books which place the reviewer in a dilemma. Shall he dismiss it with a few discreet plati-

tudes, or shall he go into some of the adverse criticism which seems called for? For the benefit of those readers who want a real review, we feel that it is necessary to include some of the latter.

The original idea for such a guide, credited to Prof. Paul Walter, Jr., of the University of New Mexico, was certainly admirable; and the analysis of benefits which might derive from such a project—as portrayed in the Introduction by Dr. Joaquin Ortega, head of the School of Inter-American Affairs—is intriguing and stimulating. The compilation itself, running to a total of 5,335 titles, is impressive, indeed rather overwhelming; and in our own case we are glad to say that we have already noted various leads which it will doubtless be well worth while to follow up. An excellent feature of the *Guide* is the provision of two indices (by author and by subject), a feature which is usually missing in books of this kind.

Our adverse, or may we say constructive, criticisms are three in number. In the first place, as we scanned through the book an immediate impression was one of being appalled at the complete absence of necessary accents. Turning back to Mr. Saunders' Preface (p. xv), we find his explanation offered that, in the "interest of simplicity" accents on "foreign" words, with the single exception of the tilde, have been uniformly omitted. As to the tilde, the names "Doña Ana" and "Zuñi" appear throughout the *Guide* some thousands of times and in no single case is there a tilde. As to the accent, it would be interesting to know what Mr. Saunders means by "foreign." If he so indicates, as he must, words of Spanish origin, he has unconsciously revealed an Anglo bias which is unfortunate. English has been the official language in New Mexico for less than a hundred years; Spanish has been here for over four hundred years—and, of course, the Indian languages still longer. To think of them as "foreign" is absurd, and it is a real disservice to anyone turning to this *Guide* not to have necessary accents properly shown. Such omissions run into the thousands.

Again, the compiler states (p. xi) that "This is not a

complete bibliography of New Mexico." Well, it is scarcely a bibliography at all, except in the most elementary sense of being a listing of materials; certainly it is not such a "critical bibliography" as that visualized by Dr. Ortega (p. v), furnishing "authoritative knowledge of the work that has been done before." There has been no evaluating whatever of any of these more than 5,000 titles—unless we so regard the work which has been done on the section of "Selected Titles" (pp. 97-123) with the accompanying "Dictionary-Guide" (pp. 1-96). But even here, the comments supplied with each of the 263 titles selected are purely descriptive and in few cases do they have the semblance of critical estimates. In all the supplementary lists, the great majority of the titles lack even such descriptive comments. With commendable and engaging frankness Mr. Saunders acknowledges (p. xv) the assistance he has received from numerous individuals and institutions, and confesses that he has "pilfered freely" from the lists of other bibliographers.

It would be utterly unreasonable to expect Mr. Saunders himself to supply a critical appraisal of any large part of such an enormous mass of material; indeed, he seems to be personally unacquainted with most of it except by title. Apparently he has included in his list everything—good, bad, and indifferent—which has been card-indexed during his years of research on this project. Countless numbers of these titles have been the subject of critical review by students who have been qualified to appraise them, but in not a single case have we noted such an authority quoted or even cited. Book reviews seem to have been wholly ignored by the compiler and his assistants. An example in point is title No. 2433. This book, replete with errors and mistranslations, was the subject of at least three adverse reviews; also Miss Bailey stands charged with having appropriated without credit the written work of another student in the same field. (J. M. Espinosa, *Crusaders of the Rio Grande*, p. xix, note). Perhaps it is best to include in the *Guide* even a book of this kind, but if so, the reader has a right to be informed of its character. Formal book reviews constitute

an important part of Southwestern bibliography, but it seems to have been entirely disregarded by Mr. Saunders and his assistants.

Wholly disregarded also in this *Guide* is the bibliographical material which appears in the form of editorial discussions, notes, communications,—in scientific periodicals, but sometimes also in popular magazines and newspapers. Often important historical facts are presented in what we might call such “informal reviews.” For example, Dr. Carl O. Sauer (title 2624) argues that Fray Marcos de Niza could not possibly have made his journey to Cíbola and back within the time limits alleged. In the same issue of this quarterly, in the pages *immediately following* Dr. Sauer’s paper, we pointed out in an editorial that Dr. Sauer’s conclusion was invalid because it rested on erroneous premises which he and others had drawn from the basic source materials. The editorial was shown in the “Contents,” it was indexed,—but it nowhere appears in the *Guide*.

Disregarded in at least one case also have been those who, anyone would suppose, might have given helpful information in an intelligent listing of materials in the *Guide*. The Coronado Library at the University of New Mexico has on its shelves some hundreds of volumes of photostat material, gathered chiefly from the archives in Spain, Mexico, and at Santa Fé. There is no more important body of source material in the whole field of Southwestern Americana; most of the facsimiles have been on the shelves for the last four years; and the three men chiefly responsible for placing them there (Dr. France V. Scholes, Dean George P. Hammond, and the writer) have all been Mr. Saunders’ colleagues on the campus. At no time during these years has anyone of us been consulted by Mr. Saunders; nor is it apparent that he has even looked inside one of the volumes—otherwise, he would have found explanatory forewords, some made when the documents were being photographed and others when they were being arranged for binding. Instead, he seems to have depended solely on the library accession records and the result may be seen in the *Guide* on pages 448-450. *Qué barbaridad!*

Our third criticism is of much less importance. A serial numbering of titles, consecutive throughout the entire *Guide*, doubtless seemed to Mr. Saunders imperative—especially to make brief references possible in the two indices. Unfortunately, this makes the *Guide* inflexible, and as one result we have nearly 500 titles under *Addenda* (pp. 437-470), assembled during the last three years and which could not be distributed in their proper sections because of the numbering,—and because “the first parts of the manuscript were [already] printed” (p. xiv)! Will future additions necessitate still more *addenda*?

Too many students think, as does the compiler (p. xv), that “complete bibliographical information” consists of the name of author, title, date and place of publication. A work so constituted is nothing more than a “list of sources.” That is exactly what this book is and, intentionally or otherwise, it is well expressed in the title which Mr. Saunders selected for his compilation. There are many and serious omissions, especially in the field of historical sources; and we are left in some doubt as to how complete the listing has been even in those sources which have been used. Yet Mr. Saunders’ compilation is impressive in amount, and doubtless many students will get real help from it.—L. B. B.

*Racial Prehistory in the Southwest and the Hawikúh Zuñis.* By Carl C. Seltzer. (Papers of the Peabody Museum of American Archaeology and Ethnology, Harvard University, Volume XXIII, No. 1, 1944; vii+37 pp. \$0.75.)

This paper is something of a landmark in our understanding of the prehistory of the Southwest.

The remains from Hawikúh (the first of the Zuñi pueblos reached by Coronado), as one of the largest skeletal collections from the Southwest, provide an excellent basis for analysis of racial relations. The remains date from the earliest Spanish period but can be presumed to be free of Caucasian elements. The impressive circumstance is that Seltzer shows the early Zuñi skull and face form to be identical, in all essential respects, not only with other Pueblo

skulls from over the whole Southwestern plateau—remains dating variously from the 10th to 16th centuries—but with those from still earlier type-sites of Basket Maker culture levels in southern Utah and northeastern Arizona. On these grounds he justifiably views all the material as representative of a single sub-racial type, "Southwestern Plateau Indians," which occupied the area continuously from earliest times to the present, presenting only minor variations from group to group. The only groups standing apart are those of the upper Rio Grande. While the majority of skulls from Pecos burials, e.g., are of "Southwestern Plateau" type, there are some differences here, attributable perhaps to influences from the Plains or non-Pueblo tribes of the Southwest.

The importance of Seltzer's conclusion lies in the correction of a traditional error regarding the peopling of the Southwestern plateau. It has been traditional that the early Basket Makers were a long, narrow skulled (dolicocephalic) people, supplanted by round-headed (brachycephalic) invaders with Pueblo culture. The justification for this antithesis lay in two points: the first finds of Basket Makers were indeed notably long-headed and later finds of more broad-headed Basket Makers were ignored; again, as T. D. Stewart long ago pointed out, the commonly occurring flattening of backs of Pueblo skulls gave a specious appearance of relative breadth which they did not actually have. The fact is that the norm for both groups is moderate breadth of head (mesocephaly), with perhaps a slight shift toward greater round-headedness in the later population; but what should be underscored is that all other morphological characteristics of face and skull are alike in the two groups.

The view that there was a sharp break between Basket Maker and Pueblo cultures was abandoned some decades ago: we know, rather, that the latter developed out of the former by gradual transition. As a result of Seltzer's investigation we can now phrase the prehistoric picture as one of continued occupation of the area by a single relatively stable sub-racial type who gradually developed cultures

from simple Basket Maker beginnings to complex Pueblo forms.

LESLIE SPIER

*Navaho Witchcraft.* By Clyde Kluckhohn. (Papers of the Peabody Museum of American Archaeology, Harvard University, vol. XXII, no. 2, Cambridge, 1944; pp. x+149. \$2.25.)

This monograph represents many years of work by Mr. Kluckhohn in collecting field notes on Navaho folk belief in witchcraft current during the past twenty years. Part I and the Appendices contain the data, and in Part II he makes "certain inferences and interpretations as to the dynamics of Navaho social organization."

The Navaho belief in witchcraft affords an outlet for certain emotions in the individual and thereby serves a useful social function; on the other hand it has a reverse effect of inhibiting normal social activities through fear and so is bad.

Mr. Kluckhohn does not publish this study as being definitive, but it is an excellent and important piece of work. If scientific studies had been the basis of the white man's management of Indians, the story of the redman might have run a different and better course.

FRANK D. REEVE

*Plateau*, the interesting little quarterly published by the Northern Arizona Society of Science and Art, at Flagstaff, often carries articles which are related in one way or another to Southwestern history. In volume 17, no. 2 (Oct., 1944), pp. 27-40, is a study by the well known ethnologist of the Smithsonian Institution, John P. Harrington (who, we might say, cut his eye-teeth at the Museum of New Mexico) on the subject "Indian words in Southwest Spanish, exclusive of proper nouns." Which reminds us (and possibly him) that some ten years ago he promised a paper to this quarterly on words of *Arabic* origin in Southwestern Spanish—which has never materialized.

In the current issue of *Plateau* (January, 1945), at page 54 is a short contribution by Erik K. Reed on "The

Dinetxa tradition and pre-Spanish Navajo distribution." He suggests that this long-accepted tradition may actually trace to the "numerous Pueblo refugees [who] joined the Navajo at the end of the seventeenth century." If this should be true, then he concludes that the question "of Navajo entrance into the Southwest and pre-Spanish Navajo distribution in the Southwest is left wide open."—L.B.B.

"Bibliografía de historia de America (1941-1944)," in *Revista de historia de America*, No. 17 (junio de 1944), pp. 161-266.

Although it is wholly in Spanish, we feel constrained to call the attention of our readers to this publication of the Instituto Panamericano de Geografía e Historia (Mexico, D. F.) Under the very able direction of Dr. Silvio Zavala, the *Revista* holds high rank among publications of this kind. Not least in value and importance is the bibliographical section which, in each issue, keeps its readers informed as to current historical publications in all parts of America—from Canada to Argentina and Chile; and (in this country) from Maine to California. And occasionally citations are from Spain and other European countries. The Instituto has built up a remarkable range of exchanges (pp. 261-6), and evidently is on the regular mailing-list of all important publishers also. The bibliographical notes, prepared and initialed by Dr. Zavala and his colleagues, will compare most favorably with those in any similar publication.

This issue carries also three notable articles: one by José Miranda on "Notas sobre la introducción de la Mesta en la Nueva España," one by Pablo González Casanova on "Aspectos políticos de [Juan de] Palafox y Mendoza," and a third by Millares Carlo and Mantecón on "El archivo de notarías del Departamento del Distrito Federal (Mexico, D. F.)." There is also an appreciative obituary on the late Dr. Herbert I. Priestley of Berkeley; and there are forty pages of excellent book reviews—a section which supplements admirably the similar sections which we have in our publications in the United States.—L.B.B.

*The Americas*, "a quarterly review of inter-American cultural history," was inaugurated last year by the new Academy of American Franciscan History—which itself was formally opened in Washington last April. The first two issues (July and October, 1944) have carried a total of 257 pages, comprising a total of fourteen contributed articles, a number of early documents edited (three by France V. Scholes), an interesting section called "Inter-American Notes," and a considerable number of book reviews. A number of the articles are more or less directly connected with the history of our Southwest, and its Spanish and Mexican background: "Spain's investment in New Mexico under the Hapsburgs" (L.B.B.); "Our debt to the Franciscan missionaries of New Mexico" (J. Manuel Espinosa); "The Franciscan provinces of Spanish North America" (Marion Habig); "A reconsideration of Spanish colonial culture" (John T. Lanning). Altogether, the new quarterly has gotten off to an auspicious start and the managing editor, Dr. Roderick Wheeler, and his immediate associates are to be congratulated.—L.B.B.

#### SOUTHWEST JOURNAL OF ANTHROPOLOGY

A new periodical devoted to general anthropology, the *Southwestern Journal of Anthropology*, is soon to be issued by the University of New Mexico and the Laboratory of Anthropology as a joint publication. While designed primarily to provide another outlet for anthropological papers in the field at large, some specialization on the Southwest is contemplated. An effort is being made to secure papers on the native cultures of the area (Indian and Hispanic) which should be of some interest to historians. Historians are invited to participate with papers having some anthropological bearing. Contributions should be addressed to the editor, Dr. Leslie Spier, University of New Mexico.

The *Southwestern Journal of Anthropology* will appear as an annual volume of 400-600 pages, in quarterly issues. The first number is planned for early 1945. Subscriptions, at \$4.00 a year, should be addressed to the University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque.