

# New Mexico Historical Review

---

Volume 17 | Number 3

Article 4

---

7-1-1942

## Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

---

### Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 17, 3 (). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol17/iss3/4>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact [amywinter@unm.edu](mailto:amywinter@unm.edu), [lsloane@salud.unm.edu](mailto:lsloane@salud.unm.edu), [sarahrk@unm.edu](mailto:sarahrk@unm.edu).

## BOOK REVIEWS

*Crusaders of the Rio Grande.* By J. Manuel Espinosa. (Chicago, Institute of Jesuit History, 1942. Pp. 410; frontispiece, bibliog., index. \$4.00.)

The final word on the tempestuous life of Don Diego de Vargas, reconqueror, recolonizer, ruler of New Mexico, appears to have been written. It is more than a biography, it is an exciting chronicle of a momentous period in the early history of the Spanish Southwest. The story is well told, and is presented in attractive typography and binding.

It is one of the curious facts of historical research, that it is unlikely that the biography of any other important figure in New Mexico history could be presented in such satisfactory detail as that of the hero of the reconquest. The reason, according to the author is this:

It was the rule during the period of Spanish domination in America to have every document of official importance executed in triplicate, one copy remaining at the seat of local government, another going to the viceregal authorities, and the third to the royal administrators in the mother country. Consequently copies of the most important official New Mexican records were filed in the government archives of Santa Fé, Mexico City, and Madrid and Seville, Spain. These original documents, most of which have survived, are now preserved in the State Museum and in the office of the Surveyor General in Santa Fé, the Archivo General y Público de la Nación in Mexico City, the Archive of the Indies in Seville, and the Biblioteca Nacional and Biblioteca de la Real Academia de la Historia in Madrid. Since New Mexico was a Franciscan mission field, the Franciscan records of New Mexico and New Spain constitute another group of important materials for the period.

The thousands of pages of archive material filmed by Professor Lansing Bloom during his research in the Archive

of the Indies at Seville, Spain, and elsewhere, on behalf of the Historical Society of New Mexico, the Museum of New Mexico, the School of American Research and the University of New Mexico, are now housed in the Coronado Library at the University, and were available to the author, as was the abundant material in the Archivo General in Mexico City uncovered by Professor Herbert E. Bolton of the University of California, an honored Fellow of our Society.

Dr. Espinosa sifts original and secondary sources as well as published material, correlating the facts and weaving them into an authentic and fascinating narrative. New Mexico's hero, "Don Diego José López de Zárate Vargas Pimentel Zapata y Luján Ponce de León Cepeda Alvarez Contreras y Salinas, Marqués de Villanueva de la Sagra y de la Nava de Bracinas," emerges from the book a great military genius, a resourceful colonizer and an accomplished statesman well deserving of the posthumous honors paid him annually in the Santa Fé Fiesta.

Before introducing Don Diego de Vargas to his readers, the author treats briefly of the events and circumstances which set the stage for the Reconquest. "The Spanish policy looked to the civilizing of the Indian as well as to the holding of the frontier \* \* \* it saw in the mission the best possible agency for bringing this about," concludes Espinosa. Therefore "the spiritual welfare of the natives was the dominant interest of the Spanish Crown in New Mexico in the seventeenth century. \* \* \* Missionary success was also paid for with the blood of forty-nine martyrs. \* \* \* The indecent manner in which the missionaries were murdered gave evidence of the contempt which many of the Indians had toward the Christian religion and the degree of paganism into which they had relapsed. At Jémez, for instance, the natives entered the room of Father Juan de Jesús in the night, seized him, stripped him of his garments, and in the light of burning candles they forced him to ride a pig through the cemetery, in the course of which he was beaten cruelly amid scoffing and ridicule. They then re-

moved him from the pig, made him get down on his hands and knees, and took turns riding on his back, beating him mercilessly to prod him on." The Franciscan was finally clubbed to death and his body thrown into the woods in the rear of the pueblo. His bones were found and identified in later years and taken to Santa Fé where they now repose in an adobe wall in the rear of the present Cathedral.

Chapter I opens with a brief review of the family background and the life of Vargas from his baptism in 1643, and his marriage in 1664 to the wealthy Doña Beatriz Pimentel de Prado of Torrelaguna, to June, 1688, when at the age of 45, he received his royal appointment as governor and captain general of New Mexico. The struggle to prepare for the reconquest which he offered to effect at his own expense, the bickering with the ecclesiastical authorities, the difficulties to gather the former settlers to accompany the expedition, are reviewed in detail.

In the chapters that follow are related vivid details of the reconquest, including the two entradas into Santa Fé and all that happened in between. It is an exciting story including incidents of treachery, fifth columnists, Quislings, propaganda, cruelty, hardship, suffering, reprisals, such as even at this day mar human history. In a four months campaign Vargas had restored "twenty-three pueblos of ten Indian tribes to Spain's empire in America and to Christianity." But it was merely a temporary conquest for the Indians soon reverted to their former state of rebellion.

The colonists who accompanied the second expedition to Santa Fé suffered greatly from continued snows and icy winds. Vargas himself was ill most of the time with chills and fever. Earlier in the year he had been thrown by his horse and lay prostrate with a wrenched knee and two hard kicks in the abdomen. Nevertheless he rode on for six leagues "where a doctor twisted his knee back into its proper position and where he spent three days convalescing." He then continued riding though in constant pain and had himself bled and purged. Of the seventy families in the expedi-

tion, twenty-seven were negroes and mestizos. The cost of outfitting was 7000 pesos and it started out with 900 head of livestock, over 2000 horses and 1000 mules. The food supply ran desperately low by the time the colonists reached Luís López, "so low that the people began to sell arms, jewelry, and horses to the Indians in exchange for grain and vegetables." It was a sorrowful picture that the conquistadores presented but for the indomitable faith and will of Vargas.

When they reached La Bajada "the faint of heart became panicky" and a number planned to desert. The ring leaders were Francisco de Ayala, Diego Grimaldos and Manuel Vargas. Food boxes were broken into and garlic and chocolate, the latter indispensable to the seventeenth century Spaniard, were stolen as well as several head of livestock, a great number of the stoutest horses, all the loose clothing handy and an extra arquebus. Besides those mentioned the deserters included Felix Aragón, Gregorio Ramírez, Francisco de la Mora, Nicolás de Espinosa, Pedro López, Pedro de Leyba, Miguel Durán, María de la Cruz, Andrés de Arteaga, Bernardo, Miguel and José Manuel Rodríguez and several others. Three were recaptured, the others made their way to Sonora and Casas Grandes. This is but a modicum of one of the most interesting and thrilling stories ever told.

Chapter headings such as "The Battle of Santa Fé," "Continued Hostilities," "Meeting the Economic Problem," "Pacification of the Pueblos," "Rebuilding Missions and Settlements," "The Struggle for Existence," "The Pueblo Revolt of 1696," "Indian Warfare," "The Road to Final Victory," "Border Politics," "The Return of Vargas," indicate the flow of events graphically delineated.

An "Epilogue" sums up the author's conclusions as to the changes in social, economic and political conditions during the years of the reconquest. He writes: "Many commentators fail to recognize the change which came over the land; generalizations which apply to the earlier era do not hold true in the same sense in the later period. \* \* \* Hence-

forth the military phase of viceregal and provincial policy, \* \* \* accompanied by greater emphasis upon permanent and self-supporting civilian settlements, took precedence over missionary enterprise." Further: "Eloquent testimony of Vargas' good judgment as a town founder, or refounder, was the growth of the villa of Santa Cruz commonly known as La Cañada. \* \* \* Clear evidence that upper New Mexico was 'the bulwark of New Spain' and its advancing frontier of settlement, was the remarkable growth of the El Paso district." Finally:

"Always it must be emphasized, New Mexico was an isolated frontier community, its people living simple village and rural life. \* \* \* In general the life of the province was the usual provincial Spanish life of far removed frontiers. Through long isolation, Spanish folk tradition became fixed." The bibliography cites the ten principal archives as well as manuscript sources together with a long list of printed works consulted as secondary sources. The index while not exhaustive is helpful. Altogether, *Crusaders of the Rio Grande* is a volume that should have a place not only in every historical library but also in every school room and home in which New Mexico traditions are cherished.

P. A. F. W.

*Pichardo's Treatise on the Limits of Louisiana and Texas*, III. Edited by Charles W. Hackett. (Austin, University of Texas Press, 1941. Pp. xxii + 623; bibliography, index. \$6.50.)

With this volume, three-fourths of the monumental "argumentative treatise" of Father Pichardo are now available in English translation. The work will conclude with a fourth and final volume to appear later.

The first two volumes were reviewed in an earlier issue (THE NEW MEXICO HISTORICAL REVIEW, X, 54-57) and our criticisms then stated, both adverse and favorable, do not need to be repeated.

As Dr. Hackett explains in his preface, Volume III now

before us opens with a concluding chapter of Pichardo's Part II (which began in Vol. I and continued through all of Vol. II)—which is an exhaustive, and at times labored, dissertation on the "Plains of Cíbola" and which marshals the arguments and quoted authorities of Father Pichardo to prove that Soto as well as Coronado visited those plains. As to Soto's route, Pichardo depended wholly on secondary sources,—the works of Garcilaso de la Vega and Antonio de Herrera. Unfortunately he seems not to have had access to the account of the "Gentleman of Elvas" which is the nearest to a primary source which we have. This, with the data from Ranjel (gotten and used by Oviedo), was the basis of the Soto story as given by T. H. Lewis in *Spanish Explorers*. It is hardly fair of our editor to give the impression (p. xi) that Lewis did not pay due attention to Garcilaso's work; Lewis did, but he found Garcilaso's work too full of mistakes to be reliable. Yet surprisingly Dr. Hackett seems to regard Pichardo's work as definitive: he avers (p. xxii) that the "conclusions of the erudite cleric will . . . stand the test of time and historical investigation."

Perhaps a simple test of the relative value of the authorities above cited is to ask the question: did any of the Soto expedition see buffalo? It is a remarkable and significant fact that the Elvas account makes absolutely no mention, direct or even allusive, to this prolific animal of the plains; but notice (p. 88) how the Inca is quoted:

In all their wanderings through Florida, these Spaniards saw no cattle, and although it is true that in some parts they found fresh beef (*sic*), they never saw cows, nor could they get the Indians, either by threats or friendly advances, to tell them where they were.

Had Garcilaso stopped with a period after "cattle," he would have been correct. The rest of this quotation may be regarded as pure embroidery. Nor is Pichardo's explanation convincing, that the Spaniards failed to see them because of their migrations. He would have us believe that they were

on the plains of Cíbola all through the winter of 1541-42 and yet didn't see buffalo!

Again, in a work which depends wholly, as does the Pichardo treatise, on the copying and argumentative interpreting of source material, there are countless ways in which a factor of error may creep into the text. We call attention to a single example (p. 100) where Vetancurt is quoted as saying that to Father Escobar Don Juan de Oñate "gave possession from the Rio del Norte to the Port of Buena Esperanza, 200 leagues to the east." Apparently Vetancurt was none too clear as to where Oñate and Escobar were when that "possession" was given; Pichardo's comments make it worse; and to cap it off, some copyist or translator gives us "to the east" where Vetancurt said "to the south" (*al austro*). Certainly the editor, Dr. Hackett, knows that, when Oñate in 1601 hoped to find a harbor in the Quivira country from which to send ships direct to Spain, he headed for the great plains *northeast* from San Gabriel. Quivira definitely was not in what later became eastern Texas, in spite of Pichardo's clever handling of his sources.

Perhaps the reader will find in the entire treatise no better example of Pichardo's tortuous reasoning than in his "Part III" which takes up most of this volume and will be concluded in the next and final volume. He begins (p. 111) with the remarkable assertion that "God himself, Creator of heaven and earth, decreed (*sic*) that rivers, whenever possible (*sic*), should be the boundaries of kingdoms, provinces, and properties." But the French, "going against that decree of God," had from the seventeenth century insisted on the conflicting principle that frontiers should follow the dividing lines between watersheds; and to avoid the spilling of blood, the Spanish monarch had, "though with grief in his heart," suffered the French encroachments which had resulted. This principle having thus been established, it should of course be observed in fixing the frontier between French Louisiana and New Spain, and Pichardo therefore accepts and warmly endorses the dividing line proposed by d'Anville,

—shrewdly ignoring the fact that this line conforms to neither the one principle nor the other. As shown by the Pichardo map of "New Mexico and Adjacent Regions" the d'Anville line as it ran northwest cut directly across the Red and Arkansas Rivers to 41° north latitude—and was extended by Pichardo due north across the Missouri River! Not only had the French been "unjust" repeatedly in trespassing beyond that line; so also was the Lewis and Clark expedition in going up the Missouri River—although supposedly that river was in the very heart of our Louisiana Purchase. It is somewhat ironic that the boundary finally agreed upon under the Adams-Onís Treaty of 1819 conformed more nearly to both the above principles than did Pichardo himself: it followed the Sabine River and long stretches of both the Red and Arkansas Rivers, and it conceded to the United States the entire watershed of the Missouri.

The fact is, as we get a more comprehensive view of the entire verbose disquisition, that Pichardo seems throughout to have had this d'Anville line as his objective. His queer ideas as to the "plains of Cibola" and the location of Quivira are essential parts of the "build up." And there is certainly significance in the relative location of the d'Anville line and the hypothetical route by which Pichardo took Coronado far south (when he was said to be going north) into the woodland region (but still the "plains of Cibola") of eastern Texas—without being sure that he could get him back to the Tiguex pueblos before winter set in. To Pichardo that seems to have an inconsequential detail, and his map ignores it.

Dr. Hackett has done a tremendous lot of work, excellent work, in making the Pichardo treatise available in these fine volumes for students of the Southwest. But in endorsing Pichardo's findings as "conclusive," Dr. Hackett seems to have put himself on the spot. We shall look forward with much interest to the next and final volume of his work.—  
L. B. B.

## NOTES AND COMMENTS

*Hugh Stephenson and the Brazito Grant.*—Since our editorial note in the April issue regarding Don Martín Amador, his daughter Mrs. Clotilde Terrazas has supplied some further details. As to Hugh Stephenson and the Brazito Grant she writes:

It did not cost him a cent, for my great-great-grandfather, Don Francisco García de Noriega, was the owner and he made him a present of that share. Don Francisco was a multi-millionaire. He had a son named Antonio, and several other sons and daughters, one of whom was Guadalupe García de Noriega who married a Spaniard Don Agapito Albo. These were my great-grandparents.

So you see, Stephenson did not buy that land. As I understand, my mother said that he was Don Francisco's Godchild—that is why he made him a present of that land.

It may be interesting to add that Don Agapito Albo of El Paso del Norte was one of the seven deputies chosen early in 1822 to constitute the first legislature of New Mexico (*Old Santa Fe*, I, 146, 164.) The El Paso district continued to be a part of New Mexico until the summer of 1824, when it was transferred to the State of Chihuahua.—L. B. B.

The Historical Society of New Mexico  
(INCORPORATED)

*Organized December 26, 1859*

PAST PRESIDENTS

1859 — COL. JOHN B. GRAYSON, U. S. A.

1861 — MAJ. JAMES L. DONALDSON, U. S. A.

1863 — HON. KIRBY BENEDICT

*adjourned sine die, Sept. 23, 1863*

*re-established Dec. 27, 1880*

1881 — HON. WILLIAM G. RITCH

1883 — HON. L. BRADFORD PRINCE

1923 — HON. FRANK W. CLANCY

1925 — COL. RALPH E. TWITCHELL

1926 — PAUL A. F. WALTER

OFFICERS FOR 1942-1943

PAUL A. F. WALTER, *President*

PEARCE C. RODEY, *Vice-President*

LANSING B. BLOOM, *Corresponding Secretary*

WAYNE L. MAUZY, *Treasurer*

MISS HESTER JONES, *Recording Secretary*

FELLOWS

PERCY M. BALDWIN

RALPH P. BIEBER

LANSING B. BLOOM

HERBERT E. BOLTON

MARION DARGAN

AURELIO M. ESPINOSA

CHARLES W. HACKETT

GEORGE P. HAMMOND

EDGAR L. HEWETT

FREDERICK W. HODGE

J. LLOYD MECHAM

THEODOSIUS MEYER, O. F. M.

FRANK D. REEVE

FRANCE V. SCHOLES

ALFRED B. THOMAS

PAUL A. F. WALTER