

New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 16 | Number 1

Article 7

1-1-1941

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 16, 1 (). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol16/iss1/7>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

BOOK REVIEWS

A Bibliography of the Navaho Indians. By Clyde Kluckhohn and Katherine Spencer. (J. J. Augustin, N. Y., 1940; 93 pp. \$1.50.)

A Bibliography of the Navaho by Clyde Kluckhohn and Katherine Spencer represents one of the most complete, conveniently useable, and indispensable reference works that has yet appeared for the Southwestern area. Its arrangement includes a much broader scope of interests than is usually encountered in works of this type. It is an inestimable boon to anthropologists, historians, sociologists, geologists, biologists, Indian administrators, librarians, and those interested in Southwestern literature.

The contents are arranged in six chapters, each with appropriate subdivisions. The first section includes bibliographies, reference works, catalogues and collections of documents pertaining to the Navaho. The next division is historical, and here, primary and secondary sources are segregated and placed in chronological order. Chapter three deals with environmental references. Sub-headings include items according to geological and biological interests. The fourth section includes references on anthropological subjects. The main sub-divisions here are archaeology and origins, physical anthropology, linguistics, and ethnology. In turn these major sub-divisions are broken down into as many categories as are justified by the literature existing. Chapter five contains references to Navaho relations with the whites. As in the case of anthropological works the primary headings of general and government documents have been sub-divided into more refined categories. The final chapter encompasses popular works on the Navaho. The principle sections under this heading are non-fiction, fiction, plays, poetry, songs, and juvenile works.

The above outline only partially indicates the efficiency of the bibliography. Other salient points include the cross

referencing and an author's index. Citations to reviews occur in conjunction with publication references. Excellent editorial comment on content and accurate and critical appraisals of the value of major sources add greatly to the utility and serve to guide the lay as well as the research reader. Scientific investigation is enriched by the inclusion of references to manuscript materials available in various institutions. The above invaluable features lift this effort far above the routine bibliography and class it as a distinct research contribution. Present and future investigators in the Southwest are under deep obligation to both Kluckhohn and Spencer.

W. W. HILL.

University of New Mexico.

Diego de Vargas and the Reconquest of New Mexico, 1692-1704. By Jessie B. Bailey, Ph.D. (Albuquerque, University of New Mexico Press, 1940. 290 pp., bibliog., index.)

It is a very unhappy task to review a book which falls below reasonable expectations, and we wish sincerely that the request that we review this book by Dr. Bailey had been made before, rather than after, publication.

As to press work, we notice incorrect line spacing on pages 34, 200, 201, 223; and on page 222 two missing lines are found at the top of the next page. Errors in proof reading have been noted on pages 12, 43, 51, 69, 71, 75, 86, 130, 131, 132, 139, 157, 171, 173, 203, 207, 217, 257, 269, 270.

But much more serious is the fact that the book seems to be replete with mistranslations and misinterpretations of the sources used, secondary as well as primary. The work was a doctoral dissertation at the University of Southern California, and Dr. Bailey expresses appreciation and gratitude to her faculty advisers for guidance given her throughout her project, yet one is forced to conclude that actually she was left almost wholly to work out her own salvation, that her preparation in the use of source material was definitely inadequate, and that she is quite unacquainted with the local

geographical data which are so essential to a study of this kind. All of this becomes apparent when one checks Dr. Bailey's text against the sources which she cites. A few of these will be indicated.

The Spanish fugitives of 1680 reached La Salineta on September 29, not the 13th (p. 3); and the "monastery of Guadalupe" and the place known as La Toma were not on opposite sides of the river. Nor in crossing the river had they "crossed into Nueva Vizcaya," (p. 4) although Dr. Bailey was here relying on Dr. Hackett's earlier study. The Paso del Norte district was then, and always had been, part of New Mexico. In note 6 (p. 7) both Twitchell and Anne Hughes are misquoted, and on page 26 a citation from Hackett (note 38) is badly garbled. Even worse is note 28 on page 262.

Beginning at page 10 we find a number of references to a document which the author seems to regard as a primary source, whereas its provenance (Mexico, A. G. N., Historia 2) at once identifies it as one of the Spanish transcripts in the Figueroa collection of 1792. A little examination shows that the transcript has serious defects, and even the original (written probably in 1717) was a decidedly secondary source, based in part on the Vargas "Restauración" records. It was a chronological digest rather than a "report" and what Dr. Bailey regards as a title was merely a comment endorsed on the old manuscript, probably long after 1717.

Errors in translation are numerous, unfortunately, but we shall mention only a few. "De Senecú" (p. 27, last line) is not in the original; and the *aguaje* de Perillo (p. 28) was not a stream. Surprised to read of snow in New Mexico on a day in August (p. 30), we found that the record said that the day was *nublado* (clouded). At pages 32-33, the Mejía hacienda is definitely stated to be both "five leagues below Isleta" and "in the vicinity of the present city of Albuquerque," and thirdly that it is "now identified with the site of Albuquerque." Puzzled by what could be meant by "Panolis" (p. 90), the source gave us "en el Pueblo

despañoles del Real de San Lorenzo." The following translation of the proclamation is unintelligible, as is the statement (p. 112) that desperate Apaches might take Vargas a prisoner to Mexico; or (below) the idea that Vargas would affectionately present the people of Tesuque "with three dead cattle." And something is definitely wrong (pp. 116-7) in the taking of five loads of flour from the same pueblos to which they had been given three days before. To the Spaniards those natives who were unChristianized were "Gentiles," but this term has been translated "the tamed" (p. 204). The quotation on the next page has "Santa Ana" instead of Santa Clara and has missed the meaning of the original in other ways.

We should recognize that Dr. Bailey has not had the opportunity to become acquainted personally with any of the places of which she is writing in this study. It is not surprising, therefore, but it is very unfortunate that so often she has not understood her sources—and where the picture has not been clear to her, it will be even less so to her readers. This is most evident perhaps in the lack of definiteness as to the various places of refuge: the Cía Indians on the Cerro Colorado; the Jémez and Santo Domingo Indians on the high portrero north of the old Jémez pueblo; the Cochití refuge on another portrero eight miles back in the mountains from their old pueblo; and the Tewa refuge on the Black Mesa of San Ildefonso. The first two seem to be confused; La Cienguilla de Cochití is mixed with the abandoned town on the Rio Santa Fé (e.g., p. 160); while there is nothing to suggest the long continued drama at the Black Mesa.

Dr. Bailey has shown a nicety in the observance of accents and other diacritical marks which is exceptional in work of this kind, and it is quite evident that she has put in a very creditable amount of labor upon her thesis. In spite of its numerous shortcomings, from which she might have been spared by a more effective supervision and by some acquaintance with the country in which Vargas campaigned, many readers will get from her pages a new conception of

the truly remarkable achievements of the Reconquistador whom she felicitously calls "the Napoleon of the Southwest."

L. B. B.

Pioneer Black Robes on the West Coast. By Peter Masten Dunne, S.J., Ph.D. (Berkeley, University of California Press, 1940. 286 pp., illustrated.)

The Society of Jesus in 1940 celebrated the four hundredth anniversary of its founding. To the Society is dedicated the second of a projected series of volumes setting forth the history of the Jesuits in western North America. The first volume was entitled *Educational Foundations of the Jesuits in Sixteenth Century New Spain* by Dr. Jerome V. Jacobson. The second volume, by Dr. Dunne of the University of San Francisco, covers the period from 1591 to 1632, contemporaneous with the early Franciscan missions in New Mexico. It was in the first mentioned year that the proto-martyr Gonzalo de Tapia began his missionary work on the Sinaloa river. In the words of Dr. Herbert E. Bolton: "Father Dunne has depicted an epic story of missionary adventure as it appeared to the actors and their contemporaries, and as interpreted by himself, a sympathetic twentieth-century confrere. It is a stirring drama of missionaries and soldiers (notably El Capitán Hurdaide) laboring harmoniously side by side in an effort to plant Christian civilization in heathen America. In these pages the author has brought forth from comparative obscurity a galaxy of notable pioneers, great figures in their time but neglected by modern historians. Tapia, Ribas, Méndez, Pascual and Martínez in New Spain, to mention only a few, deserve a place in North American history."

Father Dunne personally traveled over the rugged terrain that lies between the Sinaloa and Sonora rivers up to and beyond the high mountain divide to the east. This enhances the description of the land in which the Jesuits, according to their reports to the ecclesiastical authorities, baptized more than 150,000 Indians during these forty years.

In 1625, at least eighteen missionaries were serving the Indian pueblos of that region so far distant from centers of European civilization and culture. There is beauty in the story, there is interest, there is adventure. Father Dunne does not gloss over the improbability of some of the miraculous manifestations reported, the absurdity of the tales of witchcraft and supernatural phenomena, but which, considering the times, do not seem strange in the telling. He admits: "Christianity, in spite of Olinano's passing visit, had not sunk deep into the spirits of the Aibines, and their contacts with the Christian nations had not always been of a kind to make them eager for the gospel." There was much backsliding, for "the thin crust of their Christianity was broken through." Material selfishness, in numerous cases, prompted the zeal of those who came each day asking for baptism, "jealous to see their neighbors honored and enriched by the precious grace of the holy gospel."

Father Dunne's narrative is vivid. He commands a fascinating style which makes the volume read like a romance without departing in any way from the sources, both published and unpublished, which he had at his command. Incidentally, there may be found much of ethnological and geographical information in the volume. Statistical appendices, an essay on the sources consulted, translated and studied, annotations to the text of the twenty-one chapters, a bibliography of manuscripts, documents, treatises and secondary works, together with a detailed index, bear witness to the scholarliness and thoroughness of this excellent and graphic study of the missions on the West Coast.

P. A. F. W.

California. By John W. Caughey. (New York, Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1940. xiv+680 pp., numerous illustrations and maps, a "Commentary on Californiana," index.)

At last we have a one-volume history of California which is comprehensive and yet at the same time satisfyingly adequate for the general reader. It does not impress one as

a textbook, although it is doubtless a fruition of Dr. Caughey's university work and it would fit admirably to such use with its thirty-two chapters of about twenty pages each.

A little analysis shows that 117 pages are devoted to what may be called "background," since "California was discovered in the course of a broad investigation of New World geography which resulted in contemporaneous exploration of Florida and New Mexico." (p. 4.) This is nearly as much space as is given to Spanish and Mexican times in California, because actual occupation did not begin until 1769 and the year 1848 brought the transition to the United States. Indeed, the two chapters on "American Acquisition" and "Gold" bring the reader exactly to the middle of the book, since "practically the entire story of California's growth is crowded into the last ninety years." During the American period, as in her early history, "California development has been part and parcel of a larger movement," (p. 5) and it is interesting to note that California is regarded in this later movement both as "the leading representative of the West" and (apparently) as more important than the "other southwestern states." (pp. 4-5.)

Because of its calendared paper the book is somewhat heavy and bulky, yet as already indicated the chapters are short and their titles are intriguing. The Franciscan missions are the dominant theme of the chapters which deal with colonial times, although their titles do not so indicate; and among other titles which invite the reader to browse are: The Coming of the Traders, Mountain Men, Vigilantes and Filibusters, Land Titles, Stages and Steamers, Building the Pacific Railroad, The Boom of the Eighties, The Second Generation, The Contemporary Scene.

In our somewhat sketchy reading of the book there is only one matter of any importance in which we would question Dr. Caughey's interpretation of the records. He states (p. 5) that "it is a familiar fact that Spanish occupation [of California] came in direct response to reports of foreign activities farther north." This can refer only to the rumors

of Russian advance down the northwest coast, but the effect here credited to such a danger is not substantiated by the records—as Dr. Caughey himself shows later when he describes the occupying of upper California. (pp. 118-124.)

California is authoritative and delightfully written. One of its most attractive qualities is the author's correct use of Spanish terminology and his felicitous and discriminating use of English.

L. B. B.

NOTES AND COMMENT

The Index for Volumes I-XV—We ask the indulgence of those who have already subscribed for the Comprehensive Index of Volumes I-XV. Unexpected delay has developed which will prevent its appearance for several months. The preliminary work which was done last year needs much more editorial attention than was anticipated. However, progress has been made and as promptly as possible the copy will be turned over to the Press.

Our April Issue—It may result in an editorial headache, but in our next issue we should like to complete the studies of Dr. Scholes and Mr. Rely, and also offer the following: the first half of the Indian agent's diary, edited by Mrs. Anne Abel Henderson; a paper on the mountainman Antoine Leroux, by Grant Foreman; another on early forts of New Mexico, by A. B. Bender; and we have promised Dr. Carl Sauer space for another paper on Fray Marcos de Niza.