1-1-2005

Wet Water Law: New Mexico Style

G. Emlen Hall

University of New Mexico - Main Campus

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalrepository.unm.edu/law_facultyscholarship

Recommended Citation

Available at: http://digitalrepository.unm.edu/law_facultyscholarship/254

This Other is brought to you for free and open access by the School of Law at UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Scholarship by an authorized administrator of UNM Digital Repository.
For more information, please contact disc@unm.edu.
Wet Water Law
New Mexico Style

Second Edition
Volume I

By G. Emlen Hall

Professor of Law
Editor-in-Chief Natural Resources Journal

University of New Mexico School of Law
Spring 2005
CHAPTER 1  THE NATURE OF A NEW MEXICO PRIOR APPROPRIATION WATER RIGHT

SECTION A. BASIC DEFINITIONS ................................................................. 1

1. G. EMLEN HALL, WATER – NEW MEXICO’S DELICATE BALANCE .................. 1
2. G. EMLEN HALL, ON WATER WORKS ...................................................... 6
3. THE SPANISH DEFINITION ........................................................................ 14
4. THE STATE CONSTITUTIONAL DEFINITION ............................................. 14
5. THE STATUTORY DEFINITION .................................................................... 15
6. THE ECONOMIC DEFINITION ..................................................................... 16
7. THE JUDICIAL DEFINITION ......................................................................... 25
   a. State v. Miranda ......................................................................................... 25
   b. State v. Morros ......................................................................................... 27
   c. Concerning the Application for Water Rights of the Town of Breckenridge in Summit County ........................................................... 33
8. THE CURRENT NEW MEXICO POLITICAL CRISIS OF DEFINITION ............ 42
   a. Tim DeYoung, New Approach Same Result: New Mexico’s Instream Flow Protection Act of 1989 ................................................................. 42
   b. Attorney General Opinion 98-01 ............................................................ 54
   c. State Engineers Opinion on Instream Flow ............................................. 63

___ NOTES ............................................................................................................ 70

9. PROBLEM: HONEY BOY MEETS HIS MAKER ........................................... 70

SECTION B. OTHER FUNDAMENTAL CHARACTERISTICS .......................... 72

1. APPURtenANCY .......................................................................................... 72
   a. New Mexico Statutes Annotated§ 72-5-23 ............................................... 72
   b. Murphy v. Kerr ......................................................................................... 72
   c. Twin Forks Ranch, Inc. v. Brooks ........................................................... 90
2. NON-RIPARIAN ......................................................................................... 96
   a. New Mexico Statutes Annotated§ 72-1-5 ................................................. 96
3. CONTINUOUS BENEFICIAL USE ............................................................. 106
   State of New Mexico ex rel. Erickson, v. McLean .................................... 106
4. STATUTORY PROVISIONS CONCERNING FORFEITURE AND ABANDONMENT .......... 111
   a. New Mexico Statutes Annotated 72-5-28 .............................................. 111
   b. State of New Mexico ex rel. Reynolds, v. South Springs Co. ................. 113

CHAPTER 2  THE ATTRIBUTES OF NEW MEXICO WATER RIGHTS

SECTION A. ELEMENTS ................................................................................... 120

1. Statutes ....................................................................................................... 120
   a. New Mexico Statutes Annotated§ 72-4-19 ............................................. 120
   b. New Mexico Statutes Annotated§ 72-12-3 ............................................. 120
   c. New Mexico Statutes Annotated§ 72-5-13 ............................................. 122
### SECTION B. QUANTITY

1. New Mexico Statutes Annotated §§ 72-5-18, 19 & 73-1-27 .......... 123
2. USDA Conservation Research Report 29 May 1982 ................. 124
3. Consumptive Water Use In Artificial Snowmaking ................ 144
4. State of New Mexico, ex rel. S. E. Reynolds, v. Lewis .......... 152
6. Problem - Spreading Beneficial Uses ................................ 162

### SECTION C. PRIORITY

1. Worley v. United States Borax and Chemical Corp. ................. 163
2. New Mexico Products Co. v. New Mexico Power Co. .............. 165
3. State of New Mexico v. Pecos Valley Artesian Conservancy District 177
4. La Madera Community Ditch Association v. Sandia Peak Ski Co. .... 179

### CHAPTER 3 SURFACE WATER AND GROUNDWATER IN NEW MEXICO

#### SECTION A. SURFACE WATER

1. New Mexico Statutes Annotated § 72-5-1 ................................ 186
2. New Mexico Statutes Annotated § 72-5-7 ................................ 187
3. New Mexico Statutes Annotated § 72-5-29 ......................... 187
4. New Mexico Statutes Annotated § 72-5-32 ......................... 187

#### SECTION B. GROUND WATER

1. New Mexico Statutes Annotated § 72-1-1 ................................ 189
2. New Mexico Statutes Annotated § 72-1-3 ................................ 189
3. New Mexico Statutes Annotated § 72-12-1 ......................... 189
4. Definitions of Selected Ground-Water Terms- Revisions and Conceptual Refinements .............................................. 190
5. Yeo v. Tweedy .................................................................. 204
6. Mathers v. Texaco Inc. .................................................. 215
7. Mimbres Basin Administrative Criteria August 4, 1982 ........... 220
8. Middle Rio Grande Administrative Area Guidelines for Review of Water Right Applications ............................................. 225

#### SECTION C FROM SURFACE WATER TO GROUNDWATER

1. New Mexico Statutes Annotated § 72-12-24 .......................... 236
2. Templeton v. Pecos Valley Artesian Conservancy District .......... 236
3. Brantley v. Carlsbad Irrigation District ................................. 243

#### SECTION D FROM GROUND WATER TO SURFACE WATER

1. In the Matter of the Application of the City of Albuquerque .... 247
2. City of Albuquerque v. Reynolds ....................................... 257
3. In the Matter of the Application of the City of Rio Rancho ...... 268
CHAPTER 4 THE STATE ENGINEER: AN ADMINISTERED SYSTEM

SECTION A. JURISDICTION ................................................................. 315
1. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-2-1 ................................................. 315
2. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-2-9 ................................................. 316
3. STATE OF NEW MEXICO EX REL., REYNOLDS v. MENENHALL ......................... 316
4. STATE OF NEW MEXICO, EX REL., REYNOLDS v. RIO RANCHO ESTATES INC. ...... 322
5. PROBLEM IN DECLARED BASIN RIGHTS .................................................. 327
6. GROUNDWATER BASINS DECLARED IN NEW MEXICO DECLARED BY THE STATE ENGINEER AS OF JULY 19, 2004 .......................................................... 328

SECTION B. SUPERVISORY CONTROL AND SANCTIONS .................................. 329
1. HONEY BOY HAVEN, INC. v. ROYBAL ..................................................... 329
2. STATE OF NEW MEXICO, EX REL., REYNOLDS v. FANNING ............................. 331

SECTION C. THE STATE ENGINEER AND THE COURTS .................................. 334
1. CONSTITUTION OF THE STATE OF NEW MEXICO ........................................... 334
2. IN RE CARLSBAD IRRIGATION DISTRICT ................................................. 334
3. ANGEL FIRE CORP. v. C.S. CATTLE .................................................. 338
4. ANTHONY WATER AND SANITATION DISTRICT v. TURNLEY ......................... 340

CHAPTER 5 STATUTORY ADJUDICATIONS

SECTION A. THE HYDROGRAPHIC SURVEY .................................................. 346
1. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-4-13 ............................................. 346
2. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-4-15 ............................................. 347
3. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-4-16 ............................................. 347
4. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-4-13 ............................................. 347
5. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-4-13 ............................................. 348
6. HYDROGRAPHIC SURVEYS AND THE GIS .................................................. 349

SECTION B. ADJUDICATION SUITS: THE SCOPE ........................................... 357
1. ELEPHANT BUTTE IRRIGATION DISTRICT v. REGENTS OF NEW MEXICO STATE UNIVERSITY ................................................................. 357

SECTION C. ADJUDICATION SUITS: PROCEDURE .......................................... 364
1. NEW MEXICO, EX REL., REYNOLDS v. ALLMAN ............................................ 364
2. NEW MEXICO, EX REL., STATE ENGINEER v. CRIDER .................................. 368
3. NEW MEXICO, EX REL., REYNOLDS v. LEWIS .............................................. 373
4. NEW MEXICO, EX REL., STATE ENGINEER v. PARKER TOWNSEND RANCH. Co. 380
5. RIO PUEBLO DE TAOS AND RIO HONDO CONSOLIDATED ADJUDICATIONS .... 383
6. NEW MEXICO, EX REL., STATE ENGINEER v. EBID ...................................... 387
CHAPTER 6  NEW APPROPRIATIONS, TRANSFERS AND SALES OF A NEW MEXICO WATER RIGHT

SECTION A. SURFACE WATER: DETRIMENT ................................. 399
1. PEG ROGERS, WATER RIGHTS TRANSFERS: A PRACTICAL GUIDE TO WATER REALLOCATION IN NEW MEXICO ................................................. 399
2. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ON SURFACE WATER CHANGES IN POINT OF DIVERSION 412
3. W.S. RANCH CO. v. KAISER STEEL CORP. ........................................ 415
4. PROBLEM IN CHANGE OF POINT OF DIVERSION .................... 419

SECTION B. SURFACE WATER: PUBLIC WELFARE ....................... 420
1. IN RE SLEEPER: REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE STATE ENGINEER .... 420
2. IN RE SLEEPER: DISTRICT COURT, APRIL 16, 1985 ........................ 423
3. ENSENADA LAND & WATER ASSOCIATION v. SLEEPER AND REYNOLDS, STATE ENGINEER .......................................................... 429
4. PUBLIC WELFARE CONSIDERATIONS IN OTHER WESTERN STATES, ALASKA STATUTES .............................................................. 435

SECTION C. GROUND WATER: IMPAIRMENT ................................ 435
1. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-12-1 TO 1.3(2004) .............. 435
2. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-12-3(2004) .................. 436
3. HEINE v. REYNOLDS ...................................................................... 438
4. CITY OF ROSWELL v. BERRY .......................................................... 441
5. CITY OF ROSWELL v. S.E. REYNOLD, STATE ENGINEER ............. 446
6. DOUGLAS L. GRANT, REASONABLE GROUNDWATER PUMPING LEVELS UNDER THE APPROPRIATION DOCTRINE: THE LAW UNDERLYING ECONOMIC GOALS 452

CHAPTER 7  EMERGING ISSUES

SECTION A. MUNICIPAL RIGHTS IN NEW MEXICO WATER HISTORY ... 484
1. DAN TYLER, INTRODUCTION TO "THE MYTH OF THE PUEBLO RIGHTS DOCTRINE IN HISPANIC NEW MEXICO ........................................... 484
2. G. EMLEN HALL, TULAROSA AND THE DISMANTLING OF NEW MEXICO COMMUNITY DITCHES ...................................................... 486
3. CARTWRIGHT, v. PUBLIC SERVICE CO. OF NEW MEXICO ........... 506
4. MUNICIPAL WATER RIGHTS AND THE STATE CONSTITUTION ........... 552

CHAPTER 8  WATER PLANNING IN NEW MEXICO
1. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-1-9 .................................. 554
2. LAWS 1987, CHAPTER 182, SECTIONS 1-3 ................................. 554
CHAPTER 9  CONSTRAINTS ON THE STATE LAW OF PRIOR APPROPRIATION

SECTION A. FEDERAL WATER RIGHTS IN THE STATE SYSTEM .......... 557
1. FEDERAL RESERVED AND NON-RESERVED WATER RIGHTS .................... 557
   a. United States v. Rio Grande Dam and Irrigation .................. 557
   b. California Oregon v. Beaver Portland Cement .................... 569
   c. Arizona v. California et al. ...................................... 571
   d. Cappaert v. United States ........................................ 626
   e. United States v. New Mexico ...................................... 636
   f. Sierra Club v. Lyng ............................................... 655
2. FEDERAL REGULATORY WATER RIGHTS ........................................ 671
   a. Charles T. Dumas, Endangered Species that Eat Prior Appropriation:
      Integrating the Endangered Species Act into State Water Law .......... 671
      of Reclamation .................................................... 716
   d. Letty Belin, Water Management in the Middle Rio Grande ............ 766

SECTION B. NATIVE AMERICAN WATER RIGHTS ................................. 771
1. NATIVE AMERICAN RESERVED WATER RIGHTS .................................. 771
   a. Winters v. United States ........................................... 771
   b. State of New Mexico v. Lewis v. United States of America, Mescalero Apache
      Tribe .............................................................. 776
   c. In Re the General Adjudication of All Rights to Use Water in the Gila River
      System and Source ................................................. 797
2. PUEBLO INDIAN WATER RIGHTS ................................................. 811
   b. State of New Mexico v. Aamodt (1985) ................................ 827

SECTION C. INTERSTATE WATER RIGHTS ........................................... 851
1. EQUITABLE APPORTIONMENT .................................................. 851
   a. Colorado v. New Mexico I .......................................... 851
   b. Colorado v. New Mexico II ........................................ 863
   c. Ainn Macon McCrossen, Is There a Future for Proposed Water Uses in
      Equitable Apportionment Suits? .................................... 880
2. INTERSTATE COMPACTS .......................................................... 899
   a. Hinderlinder v. La Plata River and Cherry Creek Irrigation Co. ...... 899
   b. The Pecos River Compact ............................................ 909
   c. Texas v. New Mexico Breitenstein Report ........................... 916
   d. Texas v. New Mexico 1983 .......................................... 941
   e. Rio Grande Compact ................................................ 957
Wet Water Law
New Mexico Style

Second Edition
Volume II

By G. Emlen Hall

Professor of Law
Editor-in-Chief Natural Resources Journal

University of New Mexico School of Law
Spring 2005
CHAPTER 10  INTERSTATE WATER RIGHTS

SECTION A. EQUITABLE APPORTIONMENT

1. COLORADO v. NEW MEXICO I ................................................................. 890
2. COLORADO v. NEW MEXICO II ............................................................ 902
3. ANN MACON MCCROSSEN, IS THERE A FUTURE FOR PROPOSED WATER USES IN EQUITABLE APPORTIONMENT SUITS? .................................................. 917

SECTION B. INTERSTATE COMPACTS

1. HINDERLIDER v. LA PLATA RIVER AND CHERRY CREEK IRRIGATION CO .................................................. 935
2. THE PECOS RIVER COMPACT .............................................................. 944
   A. TEXAS v. NEW MEXICO, REPORT OF SPECIAL MASTER ON OBLIGATION OF NEW MEXICO TO TEXAS UNDER THE PECOS RIVER COMPACT ........................................ 951
   B. TEXAS v. NEW MEXICO 1983 ............................................................ 977
   C. NEW MEXICO STATUTES ANNOTATED § 72-1-2 .................................. 991
   D. SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT .............................................................. 993
   E. NEW MEXICO INTERSTATE STREAM COMMISSION, HYDROLOGIC EVALUATION 2003 .... 1014
   F. FINAL DECREES 2004 ....................................................................... 1033
3. RIO GRANDE COMPACT .................................................................... 1044