

# New Mexico Historical Review

---

Volume 86 | Number 3

Article 9

---

7-1-2011

## Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr>

---

### Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 86, 3 (2011). <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol86/iss3/9>

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in *New Mexico Historical Review* by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact [amywinter@unm.edu](mailto:amywinter@unm.edu), [lsloane@salud.unm.edu](mailto:lsloane@salud.unm.edu), [sarahrk@unm.edu](mailto:sarahrk@unm.edu).

## Book Reviews

*Telling New Mexico: A New History*. Edited by Marta Weigle, Frances Levine, and Louise Stiver. (Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, 2009. 483 pp. 56 halftones, notes, index. \$45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-89013-552-5, \$29.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-89013-556-3.)

The history of New Mexico is stitched together by its stories: of its prehistoric sequences to its European settlement; of emergence, industrialization, tourism, and the development of the atomic bomb; and of immigration, revolution, and identity. Though no book can ever tell the entire story of any state or satisfy every student, scholar, or history buff, *Telling New Mexico: A New History* comes close. The work includes narratives of places, people, and events, as well as personal reflections. The book achieves a standard of excellence in the preservation and interpretation of state and local history that makes the past more meaningful to all people.

The scholarship represented in this work is hard to fault. The editors are first rate in their respective fields. Lead editor Marta Weigle, a folklorist/ethnologist, has framed this book in a way that situates New Mexico history in the landscape and through time by combining scholarly essays and personal reflections, both new and previously published. *Telling New Mexico* invites casual readers of New Mexico history and scholars alike to partake in the enchantment and the conflict, the sublime and the slightly off-kilter. The New Mexico that is represented here in fifty-two essays by forty-seven authors is more than a pastiche; it is like a hologram—an image of New Mexico as seen from different reference points.

Contributor Haniel Long, who died in 1956, is still remembered as a literary visionary for his poetry and his work *Interlinear to Cabeza de Vaca: His Relation of the Journey from Florida to the Pacific, 1528–1536* (1936). Long loved New Mexico and “the piñon-studded Southwest,” and his piece on Carlsbad Caverns in this volume is a sterling example of the types of appealing narrative and accessible prose that fill *Telling New Mexico*. Other contributors include John Kessell, widely hailed as a great storyteller and scholar of New Mexico history; Malcolm Ebright, historian, lawyer, director of the Center for Land Grant Studies, and generally acknowledged as the expert on New Mexico land grants; and Rick Hendricks, New Mexico’s new state historian. Native American scholars Joe Sando, Herman Agoyo, Rina Swentzell, and the much loved Alfonso Ortiz, as well as other Native contributors offer a perspective to New Mexico history that is often missing in other collections. Sylvia Rodríguez, Peter Iverson, Maria Montoya, Ferenc Szasz, and the full array of scholars included in this book bring name recognition, quality of research, and well-crafted writing that is a significant contribution to the field of state and local history. Taken together their essays represent a landmark in the annals of historical writing about New Mexico.

*Telling New Mexico* is an excellent collection of well-told stories. The editors and authors have overcome the challenge of piecing together the ever-changing and multilayered puzzle that is New Mexico in a way that is entertaining, illuminating, and persuasive. I highly recommend *Telling New Mexico: A New History* for both the casual reader and the scholar of New Mexico history and culture.

Dennis P. Trujillo  
Albuquerque, New Mexico

*Santa Fe Nativa: A Collection of Nuevomexicano Writing*. Edited by Rosalie C. Otero, A. Gabriel Meléndez, and Enrique R. Lamadrid, photographs by Miguel A. Gandert. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2009. xxix + 214 pp. 14 color plates, 31 halftones, maps. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-4818-0.)

In the preface to *Santa Fe Nativa*, co-editor A. Gabriel Meléndez writes, “Even those who were not born and raised in Santa Fe express special regard for the place” (p. xv). As a southern New Mexican, I fondly remember childhood trips to Santa Fe: the rotunda, the plaza, the staircase. It was a special place. Only later did I discover that its histories of conflict and conquest also made it a complicated place. This book expresses the spirit of Santa Fe—both

in its wonder and its complexity—not by articulating the grand themes of Santa Fe’s history but by letting those who have lived, worked, laughed, and mourned in the city tell their stories.

*Santa Fe Nativa* is divided into nine sections: “Homenajes: Praise for our Villa”; “Querencia: The Root of Belonging”; “Historias: Subjects of Two Empires”; “Nuestra Cornucopia: Place, Water, and Food”; “Los Barrios: Home Spaces”; “Los Cambios: Legacy of Change”; “Aquel Entonces: Selected Memoirs”; “Cuentos: Story Telling”; and “Arte y Tradición: Expressive Culture.” The text is organized into thematic sections that contain an appropriate combination of poetry, fiction, and nonfiction, some written as early as 1630, and others as recently as 2009. Many of the chapters either express a deep appreciation and connection to the landscape, or articulate an intense and lasting bond to the social and cultural elements of Santa Fe. Other chapters, in distinct contrast, reveal the more complicated nature of the city.

There are two photo essays by Miguel Gandert: “Santa Fe del Alma Mía” and “Murallas de lumbre.” The images of the first photo essay—black and white, ordinary and profound—are thoughtfully placed throughout the book. The images of the second photo essay, in beautiful color plates, are situated in the middle.

Initially, I struggled with this collection. I worried that it would cater to our more nostalgic or romantic notions of Santa Fe. And it did. But as I read further into the book, I came to realize that the editors were also committed to describing the greater complexities of Santa Fe, a city that is the result of centuries of conflict and conquest. They do this by crafting a reading experience that includes both individual perspectives and collective experiences. Poems, stories, and essays provide particularized accounts of Santa Fe, the stories of individual human beings whose lives intertwined with the landscapes and cultures of the city. These individual perspectives coalesce to form something more than the day-to-day texture of Santa Fe. As a collection, these accounts provide some understanding of Santa Fe’s historical and cultural archaeology—human beings across times, cultures, and interests occupying the same geography. The readers who will benefit most from this collection are those who will attend to and appreciate both the literary and historical particularities of these poems, stories, and essays while allowing these texts to amass and offer a broader, more complex understanding of this contested territory.

*Mónica F. Torres*

*New Mexico State University*

*Fort Selden, 1865–1891: The Birth, Life, and Death of a Frontier Fort in New Mexico.* By Allan J. Holmes. New Mexico Centennial History Series. (Santa Fe, N.Mex.: Sunstone Press, 2010. 155 pp. Halftones, line drawings, maps, notes, appendix, bibliography. \$19.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-86534-737-3.)

Established in May 1865, Fort Selden guarded the Mesilla Valley of southern New Mexico (with a brief exception during the height of the campaigns against Victorio) until 1891. No more than two companies ever garrisoned the site, which witnessed more fights between soldiers and civilians than against American Indians. Although hardly the stuff of legend, the Fort Selden experience in many ways typified the simple dignity of life in the nineteenth-century American West. Garrison members, their dependents, and local civilians carved out a small community amid the adobe buildings they constructed on a small bluff about a half mile from the Rio Grande. As Allan J. Holmes recognizes, the frontier army's chief role in local development came not on the battlefield, but on the security and the government markets it offered to the surrounding region. His chapters, focusing respectively on the fort's birth, daily life, military operations, logistics, civilian relationships, and death, deftly describe the realities of garrison life in post-bellum New Mexico. As was the case in so many frontier forts, pressing demands to cut costs, combined with the coming of the railroad, led to the army's decision to abandon Fort Selden. Specialists will be somewhat surprised by Holmes's revelation that in contrast to the norm, in which desertion from white regiments was normally much higher than among black troops, Fort Selden court-martial records reveal few racial disparities.

An expansion of a master's thesis, this is a gem of a little book. Although the work suffers some of the problems often associated with small, independent presses (inconsistent copy editing, lack of an index, etc.), as well as the author's somewhat narrow research outlook (particularly in secondary materials), the text serves as an encouraging reminder that history, and the writing of history, remains approachable to a general literate public. The work is grounded on solid primary research materials, especially microfilmed military records in the National Archives, documents assembled by the Fort Selden State Monument staff, and state and regional newspapers. Holmes also applies the real-world insights gleaned by his twenty-nine years of service as an infantryman to his subjects, whom he treats with empathy without ever attempting to excuse the inexcusable. As he points out, the army's frequent rotations of troops in and out of western posts often produced unintended consequences, as commands lacked the knowledge of the local terrain necessary to make their operations more efficient. Only a veteran could capture

so well the stark realities of the regular army's dilemma: "too many missions, too few troops, too much alcohol, and too little pay" (p. 34).

Robert Wooster

Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi

*To Hell on a Fast Horse: Billy the Kid, Pat Garrett, and the Epic Chase to Justice in the Old West.* By Mark Lee Gardner. (New York: William Morrow, 2010. 325 pp. 24 halftones, line drawings, notes, resources, index. \$26.99 cloth, ISBN 978-0-06-136827-1.)

At the end of *To Hell on a Fast Horse*, the author includes thirty-five pages of notes citing secondary sources, newspapers, and manuscripts. The notes may be the hell this author gallops toward. Mark Lee Gardner's publisher describes him as a historian, a consultant, and a former visiting professor at Colorado College. Gardner, though, has no intention of writing an academic book. We know this is the case because *To Hell on a Fast Horse* lacks the superscript numbers that scholars use to cite their sources and that publishers see as the kiss of death when marketing for general audiences.

The author's goal is not to advance an argument but rather to tell a good story. In a two-page introduction entitled "Ghost Stories," Gardner invokes "the long, lonely roads of eastern New Mexico" (p. 1). Feeling the ghosts on those roads—Billy the Kid and Pat Garrett—Gardner aims to make those long-dead legends "give up a few more of their secrets" (p. 1). Gardner begins his story the day after Christmas, 1880, when Pat Garrett brings Billy the Kid into Las Vegas, New Mexico Territory. By the end of the chapter, Billy the Kid, though a prisoner in shackles, under guard, and sentenced to hang, believes he can escape, "and that belief was a very dangerous thing" (p. 25). The next chapter flashes back and begins a seven-chapter dual biography of Pat Garrett and Billy the Kid. Gardner has command of a detailed mass of information, provides dialogue when he can, and speculates at his characters' thoughts. In short he is the omniscient narrator, but one that knows how to have fun.

Gardner writes fluently and vividly. His writing can entertainingly take the style of his characters. Gardner asks, "Was he scared? Garrett considered that a damn fool question" (p. 183). Gardner constructs this sentence based on Garrett's *The Authentic Life of Billy the Kid* (1882); a work that Gardner even admits is a dubious source for the sheriff's thinking. Ash Upson, a drunken journalist, claimed he wrote Garrett's entire book and Gardner agrees that Upson probably did. The original idea for that book may even have come

from Upson rather than Garrett. Much of Garrett's biography resembles the sensational nickel (not dime) novels Garrett claimed to find annoying. Gardner writes that the second half of Garrett's book, though, shifts to first person and tells a gripping tale. At that point it becomes a reliable source, in Gardner's estimation, not only for Garrett's thinking but for his voice as well.

This entertaining and well-written book is not for scholars but joins legions of Billy the Kid books aimed at the general public.

*Christopher Waldrep*

*San Francisco State University*

*Cady Wells and Southwestern Modernism*. Edited by Lois P. Rudnick, preface by E. Luanne McKinnon. (Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, 2009. 159 pp. 74 color plates, 15 halftones. \$39.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-89013-558-7.)

Kierkegaard, the Danish founder of modern existentialism, is not typically associated with the bright, light-filled landscape of New Mexico. Yet, the brooding paintings of Cady Wells (1904–1954) inadvertently link a sobering angst about war-torn Europe, along with the spiritual crisis it left as a legacy, to nocturnal New Mexico's "dark night of the soul" (to quote Wells himself, p. 8). Such is the case with Cady Wells's small but compelling watercolors like *New Mexico Landscape* (1940), with its low-intensity palette of somber grays and apocalyptic yellows that evoke the fading twilight of a state otherwise known for crystal clear skies at high noon.

Lois P. Rudnick and the two scholars who worked with her, Robin Gavin and Sharyn Udall, seek to reassert Wells's mature work into the broader national debate about mid-twentieth century U.S. art, an art understandably dominated by the visual languages of the New York School. The ethos of existentialism was central to metropolitan New York art, but much less so to the art of rural New Mexico. In this sense, there is an elective affinity between the dark paintings of Cady Wells and the black paintings from the 1940s of abstract expressionist Willem de Kooning. De Kooning, however, signified mostly the dislocations triggered by urban sprawl.

How does this relate to New Mexico, where the luminous art of Georgia O'Keeffe and the transcendental works of Raymond Jonson remain the most symptomatic modernist paintings of its landscape and culture? Expansive images of the "sublime" are actually antithetical to the inward-looking watercolors/gouaches by Cady Wells. In fact this monograph shows that the art of Wells both did and did not manifest a sensibility peculiar to New Mexican culture and its various modernisms. Indeed, the name of the book under

review, *Cady Wells and Southwestern Modernism*, would be more accurate were it re-entitled *Cady Wells and the Diverse Modernisms from the Southwest*.

As E. Luanne McKinnon rightly notes in her perceptive preface to the book, there is an “abiding pathos” in Wells’s mature paintings that is “in some respects more European than American” (p. 7). Even Rudnick concedes that “Wells’s war-inflected paintings bear striking parallels to the late 1930s and 40s paintings of the Northwest School [of Tobey and Graves]” (p. 67). Densely transregional the art of Wells was really a type of “cosmopolitan modernism” along the lines defined by cultural critic Kobena Mercer. This point is made convincingly by Udall, when she discusses the links between Wells and the oeuvre of iconic New York dancer and choreographer Martha Graham. It is now clear that Graham, in the company of Wells, expanded the New York aesthetic to embrace indigenous aspects of Pueblo performances and Latino santos from New Mexico within her cross-cultural dances (as did Jackson Pollock when he used Navajo sand painting as a point d’appui for painting). Far from being a southwestern modernist, Cady Wells was a multiregional cosmopolitan modernist who brought southwestern culture from New Mexico into intimate, even paradoxical, dialogue with other visual traditions.

David Craven

University of New Mexico

*Mary Austin and the American West*. By Susan Goodman and Carl Dawson. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2008. xviii + 323 pp. 30 halftones, notes, index. \$29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-520-24635-5.)

Mary Austin was a western writer. Statements of fact rarely make satisfactory arguments, but in this biography Susan Goodman and Carl Dawson argue that they do, and with considerable success. Beginning with the premise that regional writing does not mean parochial writing, Goodman and Dawson follow Austin throughout her life, from her birth in Illinois in 1868, through her family’s move to California in 1888, to her emergence as a western writer with the publication of *The Land of Little Rain* in 1903. Other biographies of Austin exist, but Goodman and Dawson’s focus on Austin’s western identity is fresh.

Even a summary list of those whose lives intersected with Austin’s suggests how deeply invested she was in the West. She lobbied against the diversion of water from the Owens River Valley to Los Angeles beginning in 1903. Shortly before the publication of *The Land of Little Rain*, she became a member of the circle of friends surrounding western booster Charles Lummis. By 1906



she had settled in the western artists' colony of Carmel, California, where she met writers Ambrose Bierce, Jack London, and, much later, Robinson Jeffers. While living in London, Austin formed a lifelong friendship with Lou Hoover and her husband, future president Herbert Hoover, both westerners and Stanford graduates.

In the 1910s, she was a part of the community of Greenwich Village artists and writers that included Willa Cather and salon hostess Mabel Dodge Luhan, who ultimately found their inspiration in the desert Southwest. Austin would later help Luhan and future commissioner of Indian affairs John Collier to defend Pueblo Indian landholdings. She and the folklorist Arthur Campa partnered to collect plays and songs from the Hispanic Southwest, and she cooperated with photographer Ansel Adams for a book on Taos Pueblo. After living on the East Coast, she renewed her commitment to western writing through a close relationship with desert naturalist Daniel MacDougal. By the time of her death in Santa Fe in 1933, Austin had also formed friendships with collector Frank Applegate, writer Witter Bynner, and journalist Carey McWilliams.

Like all biographers, Goodman and Dawson struggle to fit the complications of a real life into the elegance of a single argument. Austin spent an extended period of time in Europe—where she traveled after she received a terminal diagnosis of breast cancer—and on the East Coast. For much of her life, she refused to call herself a western writer, insisting instead that she was a writer of the American scene. She had a fraught marriage that ended in divorce and a disabled daughter who was institutionalized for most of Austin's career and preceded Austin in death. Goodman and Dawson cover the traumas of Austin's life and treat them respectfully, but these events do not always dovetail smoothly with Austin's overall emergence as a western writer. Highly readable and sophisticated, this book ultimately presents a rich portrait of a woman and a region.

*Flannery Burke*

*St. Louis University*

*A Dolores Huerta Reader.* By Mario T. García. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2008. xxx + 350 pp. 18 halftones, notes, bibliography. \$27.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8263-4513-4.)

An elementary school in Stockton, California, was recently named after Dolores Huerta—farm worker activist, feminist, and civil rights leader—who reminded students to finish school, pursue a college degree, and defend the

Latino community from nativist and racist attacks. Now that six schools across the nation have been named in her honor, an entire volume dedicated to the co-founder of the United Farm Workers Union (UFW) seems very well timed.

Huerta has been overshadowed by Cesar Chávez in the literature on the farm workers' union and the Chicano movement. Mario T. García has corrected this omission by assembling an impressive array of documents that shed light on Huerta's multiple identities and multifaceted work. In the introduction, García is the first to admit that this volume is not a critical biography of Huerta. Rather, the work is an attempt to "fill a large void and lay the inspiration for the kind of historical treatment that this great American and Chicana/Latina so rightfully deserves" (p. xxviii).

*A Dolores Huerta Reader* is divided into two parts. The first part includes three published articles by historian Margaret Rose and a book chapter by Chicano studies scholar Richard Griswold del Castillo and historian Richard A. Garcia. These well-known studies were the first to correct the historical record about the Chicana labor leader. She represented "the nuts and bolts" of the UFW as an effective bilingual organizer, nontraditional labor union leader, picket captain, contract negotiator, and political lobbyist, director of several boycotts, public spokeswoman, and a frequent collaborator with Chávez. Part 1 also includes thirteen journalistic articles published in Chicano movement newspapers, progressive magazines, mainstream newspapers, feminist magazines, college newspapers, and a weekly Catholic newspaper. These reprints, organized chronologically from the 1970s to 2003, present different portraits of Huerta: the outspoken child, raised by a strong single mother from New Mexico who taught her to be resourceful, independent, and civic minded; the leader of the Stockton chapter of the Community Service Organization; the vice president of the UFW, nicknamed "La Pasionaria" by farmworkers and the "Dragon Lady" by growers; the woman who adopted her second husband's last name, "Huerta," which means "sorrowful orchard," and then raised eleven children on her own while "married" to the union; and the "born-again feminist" that struggled against male leaders inside and outside the union.

The second part of the book is titled "Dolores Huerta Speaks" and includes public speeches, debates with Teamster officials, correspondence with Chávez found in the UFW archives at Wayne State University, testimony to senate subcommittees, and published and unpublished interviews. This section reveals more of the private life of Huerta, such as growing up in an integrated neighborhood in Stockton while facing racial discrimination from her high school teachers. Letters to Chávez written during the early 1960s

provide insight into their close relationship. In one of the most interesting interviews, conducted by the editor, Huerta reveals intimate details about the role of spirituality and religion in her personal life and in the farm workers' movement.

Not included in the book are the stories of the lost campaigns, tension between leadership and rank-and-file members, internal purges, and reasons for the decline in UFW membership. We do, however, hear from one critic who accused Huerta of acting "as an amplifier of the union's paranoia" (p. 150). Despite these omissions and some repetition, the volume is a major contribution and will change the way readers look at Huerta. This work should be a welcome addition to undergraduate and graduate courses in U.S. history, labor history, Chicano history, and women's studies.

*José M. Alamillo*

*California State University, Channel Islands*

*Searching for My Destiny.* By George Blue Spruce Jr., as told to Deanne Durrett. American Indian Lives series. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2009. xv + 294 pp. 32 halftones, index. \$45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8032-1373-9.)

George Blue Spruce Jr., born in 1931 at Santa Fe Indian School Hospital in New Mexico, became the first American Indian dentist and, through a long career, rose to assistant surgeon general of the United States. His autobiography, *Searching for My Destiny*, illustrates the challenges and opportunities faced by a generation of American Indians coming of age after World War II and beginning their professional lives during the era of self-determination. Blue Spruce also writes consciously as a role model for Native people. He encourages them to follow him by pursuing educational degrees, especially in the health professions, and to use their training to improve conditions in Indian Country.

Several themes run through Blue Spruce's narrative, including the influence of his family, American Indian identity, and a determination that his life and work be spent in the service of Indian people. Growing up at Santa Fe Indian School, where his parents were Bureau of Indian Affairs employees, Blue Spruce often visited relatives at San Juan Pueblo and Laguna Pueblo. Perhaps the most influential figure for Blue Spruce was his father, who drove him to succeed, especially in his studies. In 1949 Blue Spruce entered Creighton University as the only student of Native descent and graduated with his dental degree in 1956, the first American Indian to earn such a distinction. For eleven years he worked as a clinician (the vivid descriptions will interest

dentists as much as scholars) serving in the U.S. Navy, Indian Health Service, U.S. Public Health Service, U.S. Merchant Marines, and U.S. Bureau of Medical Services. He then returned to school to pursue a Masters in Public Health. Upon completion Blue Spruce worked in administrative capacities for the Pan American Health Organization, National Institutes of Health, Office of Native American Programs, Intra-departmental Council of Native American Affairs, and Indian Health Service. In 1979 he was named assistant surgeon general. After retiring in 1986, Blue Spruce became assistant dean at the Arizona School of Dentistry and Oral Health and founded the Society of American Indian Dentists. In addition he maintains an active schedule of speaking engagements and volunteers for Indian people.

This remarkable story, told engagingly by Blue Spruce, provides scholars and students alike with the details of how self-determination played out through the work of American Indian professionals. *Searching for My Destiny* documents the bureaucratic restructuring, shifts to Native administration, and behind-the-scenes work that redefined U.S.-Indian relations and so impacted Indian Country. At the same time, *Searching for My Destiny* fits very well into the publisher's American Indian Lives series. At age seventy, Blue Spruce, despite never having lived at Ohkay Owingeh (formerly San Juan Pueblo) was designated a senior elder, allowing him to contribute "wisdom from a different perspective to the . . . circle of elders" (p. 280). Such a distinction encapsulates Blue Spruce's life and serves to illustrate the complex ways that American Indians have adapted to twentieth-century American society, maintained a sense of themselves as peoples, and negotiated their places in the modern world.

Nicolas G. Rosenthal

Loyola Marymount University

*How Did Davy Die? And Why Do We Care So Much?* By Dan Kilgore and James E. Crisp. Commemorative edition. Emma Dill Russell Spencer Series in the West and Southwest. (College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 2010. 120 pp. Line drawings, notes. \$18.95 cloth, ISBN 978-1-60344-194-0.)

The first part of this little book caused quite a stir when it first appeared in 1978. The book originated from a valedictory lecture Dan Kilgore gave as president of the Texas State Historical Association in March 1977. Frank Wardlaw, director of the then-recently established Texas A&M University Press, asked Kilgore for an expanded publishable version of his lecture. Wardlaw probably believed it would compliment *With Santa Anna in Texas:*

*A Personal Narrative of the Revolution* (1975), the diary of José Enrique de la Peña, an officer in the Mexican army who happened to include about a page's worth of material describing the capture and execution of Crockett at the end of the battle. In fact *How Did Davy Die?* has become a companion to de la Peña's work, and Texas A&M Press recently published a new edition of de la Peña's diary with an introduction by James E. Crisp, who is a central figure in the cottage industry that Crockett's death has become.

In the original essay, Kilgore reviewed the available evidence on the Tennessean's demise. Over the years, the legend of Crockett's heroic end has grown. The American public came to see Crockett as the quintessential frontier American hero after watching Fess Parker's version for Disney in 1955 and John Wayne's version for the big screen in 1960. But a growing body of evidence, most of it from Mexican sources that came to the surface after the middle of the twentieth century, told another story. Kilgore came to the conclusion that Crockett had probably been captured and executed. He did not belittle the Tennessean's heroism; he merely concluded that the evidence made the heroic death of popular culture untenable.

Crisp's essay fills in both background and aftermath. He provides a considerable amount of information on the publication of Carmen Perry's translation of de la Peña, which helped ignite the furor. Crisp then relates the grief that Kilgore endured—the emergence of experts on the subject, including New York City fire department investigator Bill Groneman and University of New Mexico professor Paul Hutton—and his own analysis of the whole affair.

Crisp's insightful review of Kilgore's work, indicating where the avocational historian overreached and where he was dead on, is a model of concise and accessible scholarship. As part of the captured-and-executed camp, Crisp is nevertheless respectful of the went-down-fighting camp led by Groneman. The lack of a bibliography and an index is unfortunate, but the ample footnotes in Crisp's essay will help steer those wishing to go over the evidence for themselves to all the necessary sources. This book will not be the last word on the controversy, but it does Dan Kilgore justice and serves as the best summary of the debate on Davy's demise.

*Jesús F. de la Teja*

*Texas State University-San Marcos*

*History Ahead: Stories beyond the Texas Roadside Markers.* By Dan K. Utley and Cynthia J. Beeman. (College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 2010. xvi + 317 pp. 53 color plates, 26 halftones, notes, index. \$23.00 paper, ISBN 978-1-60344-151-3.)

With more than thirteen thousand markers, Texas surpasses all other states in highlighting its past. Initiated in 1932 in preparation for the state's centennial celebration of 1936, the historical marker process received new life in 1953 with the creation of the Texas State Historical Survey Committee. Beginning in 1962, the state authorized the committee to erect historical markers. Former state attorney general Ben Sheppard took this request as a challenge and called for the erection of five thousand markers in five years, essentially three markers a day. As a result, local county historical commissions began a renewed study of their counties' histories. Once the Texas State Historical Survey Committee agreed to the request for a marker, the county could then erect the pink granite stone with the small plaque atop that memorialized a place, event, or person. Dan K. Utley and Cynthia J. Beeman's approach this project with the belief that an important interpretation of Texas history can be read in its markers. Since it would be impossible to discuss every marker in all 254 counties of Texas, the authors focus on their favorites.

Organized into three themes, "A Texas Sense of Place," "Passing through Texas,"

and "Texans on the National Stage," the book's nineteen chapters highlight persons, places, and events that reflect the multicultural past of the state. Twenty-five sidebars expand the stories contained in each chapter, placing them in broader historical contexts that further define Texas. Among the sidebars are profiles of novelist George Sessions Perry; inventor Robert S. Munger; feminist Minnie Fisher Cunningham; and Bessie Coleman, the first African American woman pilot. The authors also remind the reader of forgotten places, such as the "Nat" in Amarillo. Originally a natatorium, new owners refurbished the indoor pool as a nightclub in 1926. For the next forty years, the Nat was a venue for national acts ranging from Texas artist Buddy Holly to jazz greats Count Basie and Benny Goodman.

These stories are supplemented by photographs that further enhance the narrative. In fact, during a time when university presses are trimming budgets drastically or even disappearing altogether, Texas A&M University Press should be complimented on the book design, layout, and photographs for *History Ahead*.

David O'Donald Cullen  
Collin College

*Whispering Smith: His Life and Misadventures*. By Allen P. Bristow. (Santa Fe, N.Mex.: Sunstone Press, 2007. 173 pp. Notes, bibliography, index. \$24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-86534-551-5.)

In this brief work, retired law enforcement officer, and now writer, Allen P. Bristow attempts to sort out the life and legend of James L. Smith, known to western history as Whispering Smith. With its ring of mystery and intrigue, the name Whispering Smith has been used by many fiction writers, from dime novelists to Hollywood scriptwriters. Armed with only scant and often contradictory evidence, fed by generations of tale tellers, these writers have shrouded the facts of his life in fiction.

While he had a reputation for being a soft-spoken man of few words with a southern accent, Smith was not known as Whispering Smith in his early years. Smith's forty-year career as a lawman and as a railroad and cattle detective began in New Orleans, where he worked for the Metropolitan Police in 1874. There he and a fellow officer shot gang member Munson Alexander in a gunfight, an event that "resulted in accusations of murder with the suggestion of perjury and departmental political intrigue" (p. 39). The Union Pacific Railroad then employed Smith as a detective and he cross deputized in Wyoming and Nebraska. In 1881 Smith had a stint as chief of police for the Mescalero Apache Reservation in New Mexico. He later moved back to Wyoming and worked as a livestock inspector and range detective. Some evidence suggests that he arrested the Sundance Kid during this time.

The Great Die-Up of 1886–1887 saw the death of hundreds of thousands of cattle and brought about the end of open-range ranching. Looking for new employment, Smith went to Utah and became a detective for the Denver and Rio Grande Railroad. There he investigated the payroll robbery at Castle Gate by Butch Cassidy and the Wild Bunch, and tried to drive Bat Masterson from the city in 1902. Over the next twelve years, Smith drifted from job to job. Aging and ailing from alcoholism, Smith committed suicide by swallowing lye in 1914.

Throughout the short book, Bristow mixes facts with florid prose expressing what the characters in his story may have thought or said at particular moments—statements and thoughts for which Bristow offers no evidence. Then with little transition, Bristow presents lists of facts followed by speculation about the varied and sometimes controversial historical documents he uses. The narrative of the story is often hard to follow with an awkward flow of sequenced events that the author interrupts with stories or details that should be in footnotes, not in the text.

This book, though not without merit, is a difficult read. It is recommended with reservations to outlaw/lawmen enthusiasts and as a reference to those researching them.

*John D. Barton*

*Utah State University, Uintah Basin Regional Campus*

*Prehistory, Personality, and Place: Emil W. Haury and the Mogollon Controversy.* By Jefferson Reid and Stephanie Whittlesey. (Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 2010. x + 182 pp. 13 halftones, map, appendix, bibliography, index. \$19.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8165-2863-9.)

This book artfully meshes the life of noted Southwest archaeologist Emil W. Haury with the history of research on the mountain-based Mogollon culture that he conceived, nurtured, and defended throughout much of his career. In the 1930s, Haury conceived of the Mogollon culture as distinct. Since then the Mogollons have been plagued by controversy as they have struggled for legitimacy beside the more accepted Puebloan and Hohokam cultures. Many archaeologists have asked what material culture is uniquely Mogollon. Why are there so many variants? How long did this culture last, and who lived in the pueblos that replaced the Mogollon pithouse villages? Jefferson Reid and Stephanie Whittlesey answer these questions as they chronicle the vigorous debate that pitted Haury and the emerging University of Arizona against the East Coast establishment led by Harvard University.

The debate emerges as a young Haury defines a singular Mogollon culture based on his wide-ranging work at Gila Pueblo. Archaeologists Paul Martin and Erik Reed support Haury while the venerable Alfred Kidder and John Otis Brew are skeptical. The contest to prove or disprove the cultural distinctiveness of the Mogollons plays out in the field. Readers will be intrigued by the research agendas behind the famous projects at Forestdale Valley, Pine Lawn Valley, Alkali Ridge, and Awat'ovi. In the 1950s the debate climaxed with Joe Ben Wheat's excavations at Crooked Ridge in the Point of Pines region of Arizona where, the authors argue, excavation results convincingly won the debate for the Mogollonistas. The book concludes with the onslaught of the "New Archaeology" in the 1960s that interrupted the last attempts by Harvard archaeologists to present the anti-Mogollon side of the debate.

The lessons from the Mogollon controversy are valuable for contemporary archaeologists. First, vigorous academic debate is healthy if egos can be managed and both sides present constructive criticism. In this case, the Pecos Conference provided an informal forum to hash out intellectual differences,



and dissent was tempered with respect. Each criticism was addressed head-on by new excavation data rather than side-stepped by rhetoric.

Second, the power of place in shaping both archaeologists and archaeological cultures is a recurrent theme. What would have become of both Haury and the Mogollons if the former had not spent seven incredibly productive years at the unconventional Gila Pueblo? Would archaeologists have debated a distinct Mogollon culture if Haury and Russell Hastings had never embarked on their fateful trip through the mountains of east-central Arizona and west-central New Mexico in 1931? Haury's forceful personality and his creation of an independent power base at the University of Arizona gave him the credentials, resources, and students to skillfully argue the case for the Mogollons for more than two decades.

The authors are among a dwindling group that is uniquely positioned to provide insight on Haury's private thoughts as well as the thoughts of many other important players during this defining period in Southwest archaeology. The authors focus on Haury and the history is told from the perspective of the victors. More detailed insight into the personality and final thoughts of John Otis Brew would have yielded a more balanced work. Regardless, I highly recommend this book to both amateur and professional archaeologists who want to understand the social and intellectual climate in which some of the most interesting archaeological research in the Southwest was conducted. The book can be considered a prequel to *Grasshopper Pueblo: A Story of Archaeology and Ancient Life* (1999) by the same authors. Together, these works provide a sweeping, yet concise, overview of five decades of Mogollon research by the University of Arizona.

*Jeffery J. Clark*

*Center for Desert Archaeology*

*Tucson, Arizona*

*Traces of Fremont: Society and Rock Art in Ancient Utah.* By Steven R. Simms, photographs by François Gohier. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press and the College of Eastern Utah Prehistoric Museum, 2010. x + 132 pp. 120 color plates, notes, references. \$24.95, paper, ISBN 978-1-60781-011-7.)

This book explores the social and religious worlds of the Fremont culture through the archaeology of their settlements, economic routines, and rock art. Stephen R. Simms commendably presents complex debates in contemporary archaeology about Fremont society, far exceeding the usual descriptive and simple theorizing fare that characterizes much popular

archaeological literature. The book is beautifully illustrated with stunning photography of Fremont material culture and rock art, complemented by text that lucidly outlines a model of Fremont society and origins that Simms has been developing over the years, making the book also relevant to professional archaeologists.

Early chapters describe settlement and economy, partly through vignettes of daily life in a Fremont village, and theorize the social practices and ideology that structured lived experience. Simms suggests that the Fremont people have origins in Archaic hunter-forager and Basketmaker II systems of the Southwest. He proposes a mechanism of colonist-farmer::hunter-forager interaction to account for the blending of Archaic and southwestern elements seen in Fremont archaeology. Simms's speculative constructions of Fremont social organizations and worldviews are conceptualized in terms of "heterarchy," i.e., contingent structures of authority and leadership reminiscent of anthropologist Marshall Sahlins's Big-Man system.

The latter sections of the book reflect on Fremont rock art viewed through the model of Fremont society inferred from settlement and economic archaeology. This approach contributes to a growing trend that situates rock art through its landscape and archaeological contexts, not relying simply on approaches and theories specific to rock art studies. Simms intelligently notes that rock art's enduring use-life implies that meanings and functions changed, making archaeological explanations necessarily generalized. This speculative style of narrative will not suit every reader's taste. This approach, however, does provide a vivid and engaging way to express what, in formal academic prose, could be a dry and colorless account that strips the Fremont people of their distinctiveness. For Simms the Fremont people are not just another anonymous case study to illustrate a particular explanatory approach.

A drawback to the work is that, at times, rather than being explained through the model of Fremont society, rock art instead illustrates that model's themes. The problem is that rock art is the product of culturally meaningful choices of what to depict and what not to depict. What the Fremont people represented through their rock art is an ideological presentation of their society and theories of being. The lack of referents in Fremont rock art for much of the routines of social life described in the book's photography and text is not an "incomplete representation" of Fremont worldview (p. 16). Instead, through their art, the Fremont people presented an imagined, idealized worldview that served their contemporary societal needs.

This book leaves one with a better understanding of the possible social worlds experienced by the Fremont people, but not a better understanding of rock art's role in shaping that world. What this book achieves is a

reconstruction of Fremont worldview and practice from the archaeology of Fremont lived experience. Overall, this is an enjoyable book. My criticisms are symptomatic not of a flawed effort, but a thought-provoking project that should help stimulate thinking and discussion about Fremont society.

Angus R. Quinlan

Nevada Rock Art Foundation

Las Vegas, Nevada

*Spanish Mustangs in the Great American West: Return of the Horse to America.* By John S. Hockensmith. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2009. 271 pp. 275 color plates, bibliography, index. \$49.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-9975-7.)

*Spanish Mustangs in the Great American West* is a visual tribute and historical journey into the fate of Spanish colonial horses in North America, from prehistory through the present. The author, a photographer and poet, embarks on his personal quest to capture the historical significance and mythic drama of these horses in image and word, producing a book that is part popular history, part visual reportage, and part personal memoir.

Overall, the book is eye-catching, and splendid to read. Each page is elaborately designed and glistens with stunning images of horses in various forms of activity set amid their natural surroundings, whether private ranch preserves or government-controlled herd management areas in the West. There are also several maps to orient the reader to the placement and dispersal of Spanish and European colonial horses on the vast prairies of the American frontier.

John S. Hockensmith organizes the book into six chapters and also includes a prologue describing the prehistoric emergence of *equus caballus* in North America more than ten thousand years ago. Hockensmith then focuses specifically on the re-entry of the domesticated horse to this continent, a cultural turning point initiated by early Spanish explorers and settlements of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Moving forward in time, each chapter describes the social conventions and cultural use of the horse according to a particular epoch. The final eighty pages are taken up by a portfolio of equine portraiture accompanied by several poems dedicated to the spirit and mythic splendor of the horse in general. A very brief bibliography follows.

Hockensmith draws most of his historical detail from older, classic studies, namely those works by J. Frank Dobie, Robert Denhart, and Frank Ewers, as well as Hope Ryden's more recent *America's Last Wild Horses* (1970), which

focus on wild horses and the horse in general. The current book serves as a synthesis and competent retelling of those earlier works. The final chapter, "The 20th Century Horse," adds a new twist by outlining the efforts of a few horsemen and women, along with several Native American tribes (primarily the Blackfeet of Northeast Montana), to create independent, formally recognized horse registries for Spanish mustangs as a breed unique to the landscape and tribal heritage of the American West.

Unfortunately, there are a few areas where the narrative content falls short. For instance although the final chapter tells the story of the establishment of equine registries for the Spanish mustang, a few additional paragraphs on the *process* of raising, breeding, and managing Spanish mustangs as a private enterprise would have been insightful for a general reader. Hockensmith's use of the label Spanish mustang is also problematic. As has been pointed out by other writers, "mustang" is a slang term originating from the Spanish *mesteño* (stray), which over time morphed into a label loosely applied to all free-running horses in the West. Although the author mentions that the American Spanish mustang is a type of horse, not all free-roaming horses in America are of Spanish origin, nor did all Spanish colonial horses that journeyed across the Atlantic originate from one breed.

Overall, this book is yet another of many recent attempts to celebrate a romanticized version of the saga of wild, free-roaming horses on the American landscape. Yet one cannot help but wonder if the American mustang, through these repeated glamorized tributes, is simultaneously being jeopardized by the rising popularity of its own mythology. Perhaps a less glamorous and more modest approach is required to convey the nuanced perspective necessary for understanding both the past history and the present-day reality and needs of the Spanish mustang.

*Paula Morin*

*Missoula, Montana*

