New Mexico Historical Review

Volume 86 | Number 2 Article 6

4-1-2011

Book Reviews

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr

Recommended Citation

. "Book Reviews." *New Mexico Historical Review* 86, 2 (2011). https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/nmhr/vol86/iss2/6

This Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in New Mexico Historical Review by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu, lsloane@salud.unm.edu, sarahrk@unm.edu.

Book Reviews

Roundup! Western Writers of America Presents Great Stories of the West from Today's Leading Western Writers. Edited by Paul Andrew Hutton. (Cheyenne, Wyo: La Frontera Publishing, distributed by University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque, 2010. vi + 314 pp. 28 halftones. $23.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-9785634-7-9.)

Perhaps you *can* judge a book by its cover. In this instance, western artist Thom Ross's emblematic horsemen gallop against a starry backdrop, across a felt-green field, on their "Moonlight Vendetta." No one will confuse Ross's impressionistic vision with the romantic literalism of Charlie Russell, but their inspiration springs from a common source. In the same spirit, the twenty-seven writers represented in this anthology compiled by the Western Writers of America (WWA) draw on what editor Paul Andrew Hutton calls the "rich and varied literary history—fiction and nonfiction—that is central to an understanding of the distinct American character" (p. 2).

To illustrate his point, Hutton has arranged these emblematic selections into four broad thematic categories. A novella (actually an extended short story), "The Big Guns: or, Whose Little Lily is She?" by Andrew J. Fenady, concludes the volume. Readers may comfortably test the waters in the opening section, "Traditional West," where veteran storytellers Elmer Kelton (who passed away while the book was in press and to whom this volume is dedicated), Dusty Richards, Cotton Smith, and C. K. Crigger join historian Robert M. Utley and poet John Dunklee in exploring themes of character and place. In "Native West," a trio of Native American writers examines the

flipside of westward expansion, while Rod Miller contributes a poetic meditation on the Bear River Massacre of 1863. "The Frontier West" includes a fictional take on the Spanish cession of the Louisiana Purchase; biographical sketches of fur-trade legend Kenneth McKenzie and Plains scout William Averill "Medicine Bill" Comstock; and a poem, "Priest's Lodge," by Vernon Schmid. In "Wild West," the ghosts of Billy the Kid and Arizona outlaw Andy Cooper haunt their killers; William F. "Buffalo Bill" Cody takes the "First Scalp for Custer" in Paul Hedren's award-winning nonfiction essay; and poet Red Shuttleworth ruminates on George Armstrong Custer's legacy. In the final section, "Contemporary West," a half dozen talented writers, from Johnny D. Boggs to Richard Wheeler, reflect on the ironies of a twentieth-century frontier shaped by casinos, nursing homes, motion pictures, migrant camps, and border fences.

For WWA newcomers such as myself (although the late C. L. Sonnichsen introduced me to the organization in the 1980s), these diverse voices not only illuminate the best the organization has to offer, but also underscore the enduring importance of storytelling in the American literary tradition. They entertain and educate, while holding up a mirror to the changing tastes of the reading public. The world of WWA founders Harry Sinclair Drago and Nelson Nye a half century ago is not the world of Elmer Kelton and Richard Wheeler, no matter how similar their subject matter. In this sense, *Roundup!* is both a measure of where the western story stands today, and a tribute to where it has been.

Bruce J. Dinges
Arizona Historical Society

The Santa Fe Fiesta, Reinvented: Staking Ethno-Nationalist Claims to a Disappearing Homeland. By Sarah Bronwen Horton. (Santa Fe, N.Mex.: School for Advanced Research Press, 2010. viii + 240 pp. 16 color plates, appendixes, notes, references, index. $24.95 paper, ISBN 978-1-934691-19-9.)

Sarah Bronwen Horton's text is an examination of the Santa Fe Fiesta as a symbol of identity for Hispanos in New Mexico's capital city. She views the Fiesta as an "invented tradition" built around an origin myth that redefines history in order to provide support for ethno-nationalistic claims in the face of cultural and economic pressures from the surrounding dominant culture. Horton confronts Fiesta assertions of a "peaceful resettlement" of Santa Fe in 1692 that ignore the bloodshed of 1693. She also refutes the long-standing Santa Fe Chamber of Commerce claim that the city's past reflects a history of "tri-cultural harmony."

The book explores how the Fiesta helps Santa Fe Hispanos preserve identity (language, traditions, art, etc.) despite increasing enculturation from other aspects of life. According to Horton, the Fiesta offers a claim to an ethnic homeland and a place of equality and a struggle against marginalization. It is a public declaration of pride if not dominance. Horton combines seventy interviews with Fiesta participants along with historical research to provide the content for her analysis. She uses a sociopolitical approach that emphasizes symbolism as a key factor in transmitting cultural messages. One of the specific areas that Horton examines is the ethnoreligious significance of the Fiesta and, in particular, the role of La Conquistadora, the twenty-eight-inch bulto carving that acts as a focal point for what she terms "inspired nationalism" and "mythic power."

Horton also addresses the unity and sense of community that participation in Fiesta engenders in its Nuevomexicano participants. Fiesta organizations play a pivotal role in this process, which provide Hispanos an opportunity to reclaim control of a local event that was almost appropriated by Anglo sensibilities.

The Tertio-Millenial Exposition of 1883 became the prototype for future Fiesta celebrations by transforming the event into more of a civic celebration, less absorbed in religious and cultural emphasis. The Fiesta of 1919 was organized by Anglo outsiders and was redefined by institutions like the Museum of New Mexico. The addition of events like parades, a melodrama, and the burning of "Zozobra" further eroded the Hispano influence on the commemoration that they had originally envisioned as a religious observance. The effort to reclaim the Santa Fe Fiesta is a dramatic example of cultural preservation.

This study will take its place beside a growing number of recent offerings that focus on the Hispano experience in New Mexico and the Southwest, an area that was virtually ignored during much of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

Andrew Leo Lovato
Santa Fe Community College

Gila Country Legend: The Life and Times of Quentin Hulse. By Nancy Coggeshall. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2009. xiii + 280 pp. 29 halftones, map, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-4824-1.)

I wish I had known Quentin Hulse. The marker on the plaque mounted on a cross made of rebar, standing on a hill overlooking Canyon Creek near

the Gila Wilderness, identifies him as a "Houndman Cowman Hunter-Cowboy." For those who knew him, this simple epitaph captures his essence. Fully at home in the rugged country of southwestern New Mexico, Hulse was in many ways a modern incarnation of the mountain men who first entered this region. Yet he is not easily typecast. Although he was perfectly content to go long stretches by himself, he was not a misanthropic loner. He enjoyed people, was a great story teller, and had great stories told about him. His formal education may have ended with high school, but he was an omnivorous reader and an authority on regional history.

Hulse's exploits and abilities as a hunter and hunting guide, as a hand with horses and mules, as a hard-drinking hell-raiser, as an authority-averse wartime sailor in the South Pacific, and as a truly rugged individual are not unique. I have known some old-time cowboys from Idaho to Kansas whose life stories would have made a book every bit as interesting and as good as this one. As English poet Thomas Gray told us centuries ago, the graveyards are filled with men and women whose stories are buried with them. But Hulse was lucky: he has a biographer who writes well. This book is well researched and documented, yet neither aspect obtrudes on the narrative of this remarkable life. My chief complaint is that the index is not as thorough as I would like it to be.

Many biographers become deeply attached to, even fall in love with, their subjects. That literally happened with Nancy Coggeshall and Hulse. In a sense this book is both a biography and a love story. Coggeshall, whose family roots go back to colonial America, left Rhode Island to attend the University of Chicago, married, divorced, lived in Europe and Canada, and in 1988, moved to New Mexico. Her story and her relationship with Hulse serve as bookends to the center of the book, which recounts Hulse's exploits and adventures.

Coggeshall first met Hulse three years after her move west. At the fiesta in the small town of Winston where the meeting occurred, he not only ignored her but did not even look at her when they were introduced. By 1998, however, they were living together in Reserve, the town Hulse had moved to when a mildly debilitating stroke had forced him off the ranch at Canyon Creek. The couple spent four years together, happy ones despite some minor incidents such as Hulse using Coggeshall's pastry brush to apply linseed oil to his favorite rocking chair. He died in April 2002, just a few weeks shy of his seventy-sixth birthday.

I enjoyed this book and learned much from it, both about Hulse and the country in which he lived. It is a great tribute to a great life.

James Hoy
Emporia State University

Josephine Foard and the Glazed Pottery of Laguna Pueblo. By Dwight P. Lanmon, Lorraine Welling Lanmon, and Dominique Coulet du Gard. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2007. xx + 246 pp. 15 color plates, 23 halftones, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. $39.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-4307-9.)

If you have never heard of Josephine Foard or the glazed pottery of Laguna Pueblo, you are not alone. Foard, a woman of tremendous energy and tenacity, set out from her Delaware home in 1899, at the age of fifty-six, to "improve" Pueblo pottery. By teaching potters to glaze their pots, Foard aimed to make Pueblo pottery stronger, water tight, and, she believed, more useful in non-Indian homes. She knew no Spanish and almost nothing about Pueblo people or their pottery, but that did not stop her from setting up house in Laguna Pueblo, where she lived off and on for ten years. During this time, her efforts to reform Pueblo pottery and thereby "build up self-supporting industries in Indian communities" were unremitting and failed completely (p. 1). Ironically, this failure and the unremarkable character of Foard are the main strengths of this book.

The lives and adventures of Anglo artists, writers, seekers, and adventurers in the American Southwest are well known and rediscovered by each new generation of scholars, collectors, and artists. Foard represents a type written out of most histories of the region. She was a woman of her time: a white Protestant of the middling classes who wished to help reform and civilize the Indians. Her mission represented just the kind of cultural influence Mary Austin fought to keep out of Santa Fe. Rather than preserve an indigenous art form, Foard figured she could make the Pueblos better potters or at least help them make a more American pot.

The first third of the book gives an account of Foard, her life at Laguna and after, and a brief history of Laguna and its pottery traditions. In this narrative, the authors draw primarily on the small number of surviving glazed pots made at Laguna and Foard's detailed and numerous letters; there is enough secondary research to contextualize her story, but the authors avoid making a strong argument or interpretation.

The core of the book is the collection of Foard's letters from her Laguna years, which have been annotated with helpful, detailed footnotes. The letters are for the most part completely unremarkable. Foard wrote about her daily life, the people she met and worked with, her travels in the region, and efforts to fund her enterprise. The early letters reveal a shocking ignorance and naïve insensitivity about the region and its people, but over the years, her travel writing gives way to the logistical and financial details of her enterprise.

Eventually, she received a small salary as a field matron for the Bureau of Indian Affairs. Her letters negotiating the duties of this job and trying to establish markets back East for the glazed pottery would be of interest to anyone concerned with the history of producing, marketing, and selling Southwest Indian arts and crafts. For the rest of us, there is the fascination of Foard's immunity to the region's enchantment.

Leah Dilworth
Long Island University, Brooklyn Campus

New Mexico's Crypto-Jews: Image and Memory. Photographs by Cary Herz, essays by Ori Z. Soltes and Mona Hernandez. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2007. xx + 154 pp. 132 halftones, map, notes, glossary, bibliography. $39.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-4289-8, $29.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8263-4290-4.)

Before her untimely passing in 2008, photojournalist Cary Herz published *New Mexico's Crypto-Jews: Image and Memory*. The book's penetrating images eloquently depict descendants of secret Jews in the Southwest, as well as the cemeteries where some of their ancestors are buried and the ritual objects that symbolize their Jewish identity. Herz worked diligently to gain the trust of her subjects; indeed only after doing so did they permit her, in some cases, to photograph them, and in others, direct her to remote cemeteries where crypto-Jewish relatives are buried. Spanning nearly two decades, the photographs and interviews in the book lead viewers and readers along the back roads of New Mexico and to the border region between Spain and Portugal, from where ancestors of many individuals shown in the work originally hailed.

These evocative photographs, the spare descriptive text, and the invited introduction and afterword speak to the hybrid nature of Jewish identity among descendants of crypto-Jewish settlers in the Southwest. In one image, Rev. William E. Sanchez, a Catholic priest whose ancestry stretches to the Carvajal family prosecuted in Mexico for Jewish heresy during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, stands at the altar of his church with a shofar, a ram's horn that Jews blow at certain times of the year (pp. 48–49). In another photograph, Gerald González sits on the steps of a former Inquisition jail in Portugal, while on the facing page he comments, "I identify myself as a Hispanic New Mexican who is culturally Catholic but who also has a deep awareness of and sensitivity to my Jewish roots" (p. 45). Subsequent photographs reveal headstones engraved with crosses, Stars of David, six-pointed lilies, and even candelabras. Perhaps the most telling image shows

two headstones at the grave of Alex M. Padilla, one with his Americanized name, Alex M., and the other with his Spanish and biblical name, Alisandro Moises (p. 91). Padilla had served in the U.S. Navy, and upon his death, the Veterans Administration made both headstones at the request of two siblings.

While Herz explains that her book is not a work of history, it helps readers visualize the survival and evolution of Judaism among a remnant population whose ancestors were forcibly converted to Catholicism and subsequently prosecuted by the Inquisitions of Spain and Portugal for being hidden Jews. The book also contributes to the growing recent body of work by authors such as Stanley Hordes, Janet Liebman Jacobs, and Seth Kunin, which address the history and cultural practices of crypto-Judaism in the American Southwest. Herz strove "to put a face on the invisible ones, the *Anusim* [a Hebrew word describing Iberian Jews forcibly converted to Catholicism], to open a small window into their world, to show their pride and diversity" (p. xvi).

Through its respectful, careful treatment of the individuals whose images and stories fill its pages, her book more than achieves this goal, while at the same time prompting readers to ponder the complexities of a religious and cultural identity that had remained hidden for centuries.

Matthew Warshawsky
University of Portland

Sex, Murder, and the Unwritten Law: Courting Judicial Mayhem, Texas Style. By Bill Neal, foreword by Gordon Morris Bakken. (Lubbock: Texas Tech University Press, 2009. xvi + 280 pp. 48 halftones, map, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-89672-662-8.)

Sex, Murder, and the Unwritten Law tells the story of the "unwritten law" that permitted Texans to kill "almost anyone" who offended their "notion of female virtue and male honor" (pp. 9–10). The "unwritten law" excused not only crimes of passion, but also premeditated murders, as long as jurors could be persuaded that the murder had been committed to avenge sexual dishonor. Texas jurors excused John Hollom, who ambushed his wife's lover at the train station in Texarkana; Verna White, who walked into the county court house in Gatesville and killed the young man who had seduced her; and Floyd Holmes, who shot fellow oilman Warren Wagner because Wagner had threatened to kill him for being too friendly with Mrs. Wagner.

There were limits to what the public would tolerate. The jury would not let Mayor Frank Collier of Wichita Falls get away with killing his son-in-law just because the boy was not good enough for young Mary Frances Collier. And castrating a man for sleeping with one's wife went way too far. But in the

main, Texans condoned and even celebrated murders in defense of home, family, and sexual honor.

Author Bill Neal, an accomplished defense attorney, finds humor as well as pathos in the cases he studies. But he does more than entertain; he enlightens by revealing the inner workings of the legal process and showing readers how the guilty got away with murder. The "unwritten law" gave murderers an advantage, but it was bolstered by perjured testimony, mistakes by judges and prosecutors, and the wizardry (and unscrupulousness) of defense attorneys. Neal has little patience with lawyers like Racehorse Haines, who appears to have concocted his witnesses' testimony in the Cullen Davis trial and to have sanctioned payments to the prosecution's criminal investigator in return for reports on prosecution strategy. He admires defense lawyers, on the other hand, for their "imaginative and Herculean struggles . . . to extricate their obviously guilty clients from the gallows, when there appeared to be no legal basis upon which to peg a defense" (p. 17). Success came down to eloquence, a deep understanding of Texas jurors, and the belief, as one lawyer put it, that "human life is not the highest consideration of our law, being less regarded by the law than domestic relations. . . .Every time a home is broken up, there ought to be a killing of all who assisted in it" (p. 168).

Neal condemns Texas's "unwritten law" as "jury-made lawlessness" that subverted respect for the written law, the truth, and human life (p. 14). Fortunately, however, he says, the "unwritten law" no longer appeals to Texans as it did from the mid-nineteenth century through the 1920s. Why it lost favor is not clear. Neal cites "changes in American culture" (p. 231) and the repeal in 1955 of the law that barred women from juries, but he does not describe those cultural changes or explain why they undermined the "unwritten law." Still, *Sex, Murder, and the Unwritten Law* is a wonderful introduction to the unique tradition of jurisprudence in the Southwest.

Randolph Roth
Ohio State University

The Secret War in El Paso: Mexican Revolutionary Intrigue, 1906–1920. By Charles H. Harris III and Louis R. Sadler. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2009. xv + 488 pp. 29 halftones, notes, bibliography, index. $37.50 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-4652-0.)

Disreputable and mercenary actors earn historical respect in Charles H. Harris III and Louis R. Sadler's close examination of espionage and arms dealing in early twentieth-century El Paso, Texas. The city became the hub for intrigues as government and insurgent agents waged a "secret war." The

soldiers of fortune, assassins, snitches, civil servants, bankers, and oilmen, mentioned by the authors, smuggled, stole, skulked, and shot their way through Mexico's revolutionary years on both sides of the border. In volatile El Paso, most of the byzantine maneuvering revolved around the sale and movement of arms and munitions—and the selective application of U.S. neutrality laws. Chapters run chronologically, tackling different factions and their fate in El Paso. Clear examples, ranging from Magonistas to Villistas, support the authors' contention that without tacit approval from the American government, revolution was impossible. The authors persuasively demonstrate that those groups best able to obtain weapons and finances at this border-crossing prospered while others failed.

Harris and Sadler faced a daunting task in unraveling the complexity and secrets of this history. They encountered a mother lode of sources in twenty-four rolls of previously unexamined microfilm from the Bureau of Investigations (precursor to the FBI) that they further supplemented with archival documents and local newspapers. The authors bring many years of expertise to the analysis. The result is an impeccably detailed account of the mechanics of revolution in the premier city for cross-border trade and spying. They delve deeply to explore a true rogues' gallery in what they describe at one point as "a sordid little soap opera."

The work has a few limitations. For instance more discussion around the implications of the mutable nature of the border and of Borderland identities would engage with a broader scholarship, such as works by historians Elliott Young or Andrés Reséndez. These and other issues may appear in the authors' numerous collaborations since 1975, as is true for the motives behind Villa's raid of Columbus, New Mexico, or the eventual fate of his severed head. Additionally, some readers will find it difficult to follow the stories of such a disparate cast. There is no easy solution to this problem and the authors have done admirably well, but the audience will likely recall only the most colorful or famous personages. It is nonetheless a pleasure to encounter a book so lovingly detailed. For both information and craft, the book is worth our attention.

The Secret War is an invaluable contribution to our understanding of the clandestine arms trade, revolutionaries' limits, and the significance of El Paso to the Mexican Revolution. Harris and Sadler offer specialist knowledge while adeptly spinning anecdotes and challenging myths. Academics will find new and intriguing elements of the border, while less specialized readers will be pulled along by the fascinating characters and their often nefarious misadventures.

Stephen Neufeld
California State University, Fullerton

Captive Arizona, 1851–1900. By Victoria Smith. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2009. xxxiii + 255 pp. 15 halftones, map, notes, bibliography, index. $40.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8032-1090-5.)

Captive Arizona speaks to an important absence in the new generation of captive-taking scholarship. To date much of the literature on captive-taking has focused on how New Mexicans captured Indians for use as domestic servants. Recently, however, books have also begun to document the reciprocal transnational dimension of the trade: U.S.-based Indians capturing individuals on Mexican soil and bringing them back across the international border into U.S. jurisdictions. Victoria Smith's work on captive-taking practices is a welcome supplement that helps illuminate how these types of adversarial practices operated in the Arizona Territory.

Professor Smith organizes her book in a linear fashion, parsing out interesting anecdotal stories along the way. Her book's principal goal is to examine "the social spaces where captivity frayed the fabric of social relations in Arizona across racial lines" (p. xvi). Smith does an admirable job in identifying important historical figures and relevant issues, but she never fully unpacks these enticing ideas in ways that move much beyond the naked parameters of the captivity narratives themselves. Conversely, some discussions, like Olive Oatman's divorce proceedings, could have been discussed in a more abbreviated manner. In fact Smith's treatment of Olive Oatman's five-year captivity illustrates how Smith could have begun important lines of discussion but did not.

While Smith's description of the abduction and captivity of Oatman are compelling, her critical observations about what they mean relative to more expansive issues like the evolution of asymmetrical relations of power in the West are too often attenuated or seem oddly disjointed at times. For instance, in detailing with Oatman's captivity experience, Smith might have discussed what Oatman's sometimes harsh treatment at the hands of American Indian women signified (e.g., horizontal violence, cultural resistance, etc.).

Moreover, in deliberating on Oatman's post-captivity life, Smith might have examined more sharply the racial politics that typically accompanied the reintroduction of former Indian captives into white society. If Oatman had mothered mixed-blood children, would this have created serious obstacles to her finding a suitable white husband? If so why? Would her return to white civilization be compromised in other ways? If so how? How did notions of Indian savagery threaten white male control over white female bodies, sexuality, and reproduction? Interestingly, Smith might have even bookmarked such an analysis by more fully exploring why the urgency that oftentimes

punctuated the abduction of white female captives did not also accompany the abduction of non-white female captives. Perhaps Arizona lacked the manpower and resources at the time to aggressively pursue all such captive-taking incidents. More likely the limits of operational enforcement became an issue only when dealing with non-white captives. All in all, Smith's observations end up being rather blunt assessments without more nuanced explanations of what these probative ideas mean relative to captivity incidents in Arizona.

Robert F. Castro
California State University, Fullerton

John Mackay: Silver King in the Gilded Age. By Michael J. Makley. (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 2009. xi + 270 pp. 21 halftones, notes, bibliography, index. $34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-87417-770-1.)

This book is a traditional, favorable, and affecting biography of John Mackay. Mackay, James Flood, James Fair, and William O'Brien were the partners behind the Comstock's Big Bonanza of 1875, which made Virginia City, Nevada, the nation's preeminent mining town and these four men extremely wealthy. Reacting against the New Western History—which denies the centrality of white male empire builders in the narrative of the West—Michael J. Makley insists on Mackay's importance, not just in mining, but in overcoming two powerful monopolies: William Sharon's California Bank Ring and Jay Gould's Western Union cartel. Defeating Sharon led directly to the Big Bonanza, which saved Virginia City economically. The Bonanza Firm was able to provide the town with cheaper and more efficient public and mining services and insure high wages for the miners. Laying a trans-Atlantic cable and creating competition for Gould's telegraph lowered prices for the public and headed off federal regulation or even nationalization. And through it all, Mackay remained honest, generous, and self-effacing, in stark contrast to his wealthy contemporaries.

But is this relentlessly rosy view of Mackay convincing? Certainly he is a more attractive figure than Sharon, Gould, or his own partner, widely known as "Slippery Jim" Fair. In fact Makley positions Mackay as the most important member of the Bonanza Firm. Although Fair seems to have made most of the important mining decisions and Flood handled the finances, Mackay served as business manager. Makley credits him with holding the group together, and ascribes the questionable practices and motives to Fair and Flood. This story is also stereotypical of the Gilded Age, featuring mansions in London and Paris, wildly expensive entertainments, parasitical in-laws, and (unsuc-

cessful) marriage into European aristocracy. Mackay, who bankrolls all this, is depicted as merely indulging Louise, his desperately socially ambitious wife.

The contemporary sources, especially in Nevada, favor Mackay over Fair and Louise. Makley is aware of Big Bonanza mythology, and uses contemporary sources carefully. Still, the book is rooted deeply in collections made by Mackay's admirer Grant H. Smith for a proposed biography. Sometimes Makley's adulatory and Nevada reading of Mackay is carried too far; it seems unlikely that in the 1890s Congress would have federalized the telegraph system. In his conclusion, Makley argues that Mackay exemplifies Andrew Carnegie's "Gospel of Wealth," in which competition benefits the public, the homes of the wealthy illustrate the highest levels of civilization, and great wealth is not to be inherited but used to benefit the community. Mackay certainly competed, but it is not so clear that Louise's conspicuous consumption equaled the highest levels of civilization. Mackay, while personally generous, did not create an organization to structure his philanthropy. Still, anyone who made as much money as Mackay during the Gilded Age and maintained the persona of "the honest miner" was a remarkable individual.

Ralph Mann
University of Colorado, Boulder

California Odyssey: An Overland Journey on the Southern Trails, 1849. By William R. Goulding, edited by Patricia A. Etter, foreword by Howard R. Lamar. American Trails series, vol. 21. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, Arthur H. Clark Company, 2009. 356 pp. 29 halftones, maps, appendixes, bibliography, index. $45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-87062-373-8.)

In his elegant foreword, Howard R. Lamar notes that during his professional career, he has read five hundred overland diaries and journals. The reader may ask what is distinctive about this volume that justifies its publication in such a crowded field. The answer is that *California Odyssey* has many unique features that make it an important addition to the literature of overland journals.

These virtues begin with its author. William R. Goulding, born in Britain but a long-time resident of New York, was a successful inventor and manufacturer of medical instruments. At the age of forty-two, this established professional and devoted family man with a wife and five children joined the Knickerbocker Exploring Company of New York City on an overland expedition to the celebrated gold fields in California. The company took the trail's least-traveled southern route. The blending of some sixty independent

personalities and ambitions led to constant internal dissensions. Indeed, Goulding's account is a useful corrective to the idea that drafting a constitution by overland groups ushered in unity and harmony.

The hard overland journey began with rainy days in Arkansas and moved to the sun-baked deserts of Indian Territory and present-day New Mexico. Goulding wrote detailed observations without pedantry. He left excellent descriptions of several military posts; games and ceremonies of Indian peoples, such as lacrosse and the Creeks' Green Corn Dance; feasts and fandangos of Mexican peoples; and California's large rancheros during the last years of their grazing glory. On 18 September 1849, Goulding and the last vestiges of his company reached the San Francisco Bay where his detailed journal abruptly ends.

With Goulding's virtues acknowledged, the most astonishing feature of this volume is the editorial work of Patricia A. Etter. Etter's work ranks first among the many edited volumes concerning the overland trails, and should be placed in a category by itself. Indeed, her introductory comments to each of Goulding's chapters and her footnoted editorial apparatus may be read as a second and parallel volume to the original. She has tracked down every individual Goulding met (and there were many), every Indian group he observed, as well as the geographic places and landmarks the company passed through. She also traveled the trail herself, following Goulding's route as precisely as possible. Her careful work makes this volume a model for authors and editors alike. She is to be congratulated for giving Goulding's account the detailed context that elevates his text to one of significance in overland trail literature.

The Arthur H. Clark Company is to be commended for an important volume in its continuing American Trails series, and the University of Oklahoma Press should be congratulated on its excellent book production. The maps and illustrations, including several by Etter, are clear and sharp.

Malcolm Rohrbough
University of Iowa

J. Robert Oppenheimer, the Cold War, and the Atomic West. By Jon Hunner. Oklahoma Western Biographies Series, vol. 24(Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2009. xvi + 248 pp. 28 halftones, bibliographic essay, index. $24.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4046-9.)

Book-length, scholarly biographies of J. Robert Oppenheimer (1904–1966) were scarce until five or six years ago. This dearth of literature may have

been because Oppenheimer and his colleagues provided their own collective oral history during the Atomic Energy Commission Personnel Security Board hearings in 1954. Since the transcripts of those proceedings have been published, the challenge for would-be Oppenheimer biographers is to say something that Oppenheimer and his contemporaries have not already said. A clutch of books, which appeared around the hearings' fiftieth anniversary, placed Oppenheimer's life in political, ethical, and intellectual contexts. The title of Jon Hunner's book suggests a study on the interrelated contexts of the Cold War and the U.S. West. Neither of these themes is genuinely prominent in the book, and otherwise, there is little new here.

While Hunner devotes some attention to Oppenheimer's schoolboy sojourns in New Mexico, the book does not depart much from the conventional story of his life. This traditional account typically begins with his New York childhood and his education through postgraduate training in theoretical physics at the University of Göttingen. Taking up a joint appointment at the University of California, Berkeley, and the California Institute of Technology, Oppenheimer established a partnership of sorts with experimenter E. O. Lawrence, who developed the cyclotron. Lawrence introduced Oppenheimer to the American nuclear weapons effort. Oppenheimer eventually became director of the Manhattan Project's design and development center at Los Alamos, New Mexico. After the successful detonation of three explosives based on nuclear fission and the end of World War II, Oppenheimer left the West and spent the postwar years as director of the Institute for Advanced Study at Princeton University. The university was relatively close to Washington, D.C, where he held a large slate of advisory positions. Oppenheimer offered advice in favor of developing weapons that differed from the devices favored by the leaders of the U.S. Air Force. This difference of opinion, as well as his relationship to communist causes prior to the war and to Soviet agents during it, led to a review and revocation of his security clearance. During the decade following the decision against him, many regarded Oppenheimer as a scientific martyr to Cold War politics. He cast himself as someone who could explain and help develop relationships between science and culture during the nuclear age.

Hunner's book includes a bibliographic essay, but not specific citations to the sources on which the work is based. In tone and argument, the book seems aimed at younger students who are new to the subject. This work is much more a first word on Oppenheimer than a last one. Many of the work's interpretive ideas, which include Oppenheimer as representative of an American century, the metaphor of complementarity, and the Atomic West, have been developed at greater length elsewhere, as has much of the

narrative material. The author presents little to allay reflexive skeptical reactions to assertions such as Oppenheimer introduced modern physics to the West, his work at Los Alamos led to the development of nuclear power, and he brought the Manhattan Project to the West.

Bruce Hevly
University of Washington

Lyndon B. Johnson and Modern America. By Kevin J. Fernlund. Oklahoma Western Biographies Series, vol. 25. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2009. xii + 175 pp. 17 halftones, notes, index. $24.95 cloth, isbn 978-0-8061-4077-3.)

In his biography of Lyndon Johnson, Kevin J. Fernlund paints a portrait of this larger-than-life figure using a western brush with colors suitable for capturing a sunset reflecting off the Sandias. *Lyndon B. Johnson and Modern America*, part of the University of Oklahoma Press's Western Biography Series, is a brief and engaging examination into the life of Johnson. Well written and often witty, the work reflects Fernlund's primary interest in the relationship between his subject and the American West. In crucial ways, Fernlund offers a nice corrective to those (too many) treatments of Johnson that overemphasize his southernness. Fernlund demonstrates how Johnson, from the Texas Hill Country, was a product not only of a distinctive state within the United States, but also of a unique part of the state itself. In addition to being influenced by the trappings of mythology of the Lost Cause South, Johnson was equally inspired by the romance of the mythic West—of cowboys and of cattle drives. But, as Fernlund also explains, Johnson was more than simply influenced by this environment; he was also highly capable of exploiting each set of myths for his own political advantage.

Fernlund historicizes Johnson within the remarkable transformation of the West and South during the first six decades of the twentieth century. When Johnson was born, his hometown was not on a railroad line, Texas schools were only beginning to segregate pupils by race, and most people in Texas still made a living by farming or ranching. Johnson came of age both personally and politically in an age characterized by sudden and massive change, and Fernlund reveals how Johnson both represented and served as a catalyst for this change. Approaching Johnson as a western figure first and a national politician second, Fernlund explores those crucial relationships between national power and western development. As Fernlund shows, Johnson's bring-the-bacon-back-home political approach was the key to the remarkable

economic and later social and cultural transformation of the American West. He successfully narrates the effective use of Johnson's power in the Senate and even argues that it was a mistake for Johnson to accept Kennedy's offer of the vice-presidency.

Once Fernlund reaches the Johnson presidency, the broad interpretive strokes that paint the western LBJ in the first two-thirds of the book simply do not work as well in capturing *President* Johnson. Consequently, the penultimate chapter of less than thirty-three pages carries the weight of narrating and interpreting Johnson's conduct of the Vietnam War, his herculean efforts to redress institutional racism, the philosophy and incorporation of a Great Society, the declaration of War on Poverty, and his responses to the legion of historical transformations we call the Sixties. In this chapter, Fernlund's assertions and interpretations cry out for greater explanation.

These shortcomings are perhaps the price to pay for a brief, very readable, and highly interpretive biography on one of the central figures of the twentieth century.

Jeff Roche
The College of Wooster

Class and Race in the Frontier Army: Military Life in the West, 1870–1890. By Kevin Adams. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2009. xvi + 276 pp. 11 halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-3981-4.)

In this engaging work, Kevin Adams argues that an inquiry into daily life in the U.S. Army during the Gilded Age (1865–1890) will provide important insights into the larger world of the late nineteenth-century United States. He does not examine the rare moments of battle, but instead analyzes the sociocultural milieu of the more representative experiences of garrison duty. He discovers an environment starkly divided along class lines drawn between officers and the ranks. In building his case, the author first establishes the demographic make-up and class consciousness of the army. He then adeptly demonstrates how the activities surrounding labor, leisure, and consumption reinforced the divisions between officers and common soldiers, while strengthening ethnic solidarity within the ranks. Furthermore, Adams contends that the contrast between the treatment of African American and immigrant enlistees illustrates that racism within the army fell largely along a black-versus-white divide and not a native-versus-European divide. The author convincingly makes these arguments with

research grounded in the words and experiences of the soldiers who served in the Gilded Age army.

Adams clearly demonstrates that the processes officers used to defend their upper-class status and the efforts of the ranks to improve their working-class conditions served to temper ethnic schisms between native- and foreign-born whites. He further asserts that this military experience is analogous to a larger American experience, contending that the lack of racialized ethnic differences within the ranks of the army mirrors a similar lack of racialized ethnicity within American laboring classes. This counters the works of historians like David Roediger and Matthew Jacobson, who have argued that native-born white workers categorized European immigrants as non-white or a separate race. Adams, however, provides few specific examples from civilian contexts for comparison. Some readers may wonder if the relative lack of competition within military ranks contributed to the ethnic solidarity that Adams finds. Did the Gilded Age bourgeoisie wield the same degree of coercive power over the laboring class that military officers possessed over the ranks? Indeed, the U.S. Army seemed exceptionally suited to recategorizing identity in a way not possible in civilian life.

Adams also disputes well-established interpretations within military history. For example, he questions the widely accepted view that during the last half of the nineteenth century, the U.S. Army implemented a variety of reforms that led to the professionalization and modernization of the institution. The author persuasively argues that, as a result of their efforts to preserve their genteel Victorian lifestyles, army officers stymied these reforms, frustrating military professionalization well into the 1890s.

Class and Race in the Frontier Army is an important work. Adams's conclusions will challenge scholars to reassess their previous understandings about class, race, ethnicity, and labor in the Gilded Age. Although some readers may question his assertion that "American history is synonymous with military history," they will nonetheless come away with a greater understanding of the processes of class preservation as well as a greater appreciation for the significance of the military experience during the last half of the nineteenth century (p. 30).

Jimmy L. Bryan Jr.
Lamar University

Black Officer in a Buffalo Soldier Regiment: The Military Career of Charles Young. By Brian G. Shellum. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2010. xxi + 360 pp. 34 halftones, line drawings, notes, bibliography, index. $19.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8032-1385-2.)

Brian G. Shellum's biography of Charles Young, the third African American to graduate from West Point, has good and bad points. The author seeks to describe the life of this black officer working in a white institution, where his abilities were circumscribed by racism and his assignments determined by his race. Shellum only partially achieves this goal.

Picking up where his previous biography ended, *Black Cadet in a White Bastion: Charles Young at West Point* (2006), Shellum begins with Young's first assignment as a second lieutenant in the Ninth Cavalry, showing how Young's social circle was limited by racial conventions. Shellum then traces Young's career through the ensuing decades, during which time Young worked his way up the promotion ladder. Throughout those years, Young served for limited periods with the cavalry, but spent much of his time on detached duty. These assignments included serving as an instructor at Wilberforce University, a small black school in Ohio, and as military attaché to Liberia and Haiti. During the Spanish American War, Young commanded the Ninth Ohio Battalion, a unit that saw no combat. He led a battalion of the Tenth Cavalry during the Mexican Punitive Expedition, but in early 1917, he was forced to retire because army doctors ruled that he was not physically fit. At the end of World War I, he was called back to duty to command a training camp for African American recruits. Subsequently, he returned to Liberia as a military diplomat and, while there, died of a tropical fever.

Writing a biography of Young may have been a difficult undertaking, but Shellum falls short nonetheless. Young's army personnel file was destroyed by fire in the 1970s and few of his personal letters survive. Shellum tries a number of approaches to overcome these handicaps. He often changed his focus from Young to the activities of Young's command. At other times, he suggests actions that Young probably took. Even with these methods, the reader is still left with questions about aspects of Young's life. Unfortunately, there are other problems. The text is marred by errors that call into question other parts of the work. For example the author indicates on one page that Young died in 1922 (the correct year) and on the next page that he died in 1916. More significantly Shellum does not place Young in the context of African American affairs. A description of the disputes between W. E. B. Dubois and Booker T. Washington over the proper response to discrimination would have made the account of Young's career more meaningful. In addition readers would never know that the forced

retirement of Young on the eve of World War I caused a number of protests among African Americans, who viewed this event in the context of a series of discriminatory actions by Woodrow Wilson's administration. African Americans then questioned whether they should support the war effort.

The career of Charles Young, a black man operating in a hierarchical white institution in an era of intense racism, is quite interesting. Shellum has provided some insight into that career but his errors and omissions limit the value of this biography.

Marvin Fletcher
Ohio University

Barbed Wire: The Fence that Changed the West. By Joanne S. Liu. (Missoula, Mont.: Mountain Press Publishing Company, 2009. viii + 141 pp. 26 halftones, 14 line drawings, maps, diagram, glossary, appendixes, chronology, bibliography, index. $14.00 paper, ISBN 978-0-87842-557-0.)

The existing literature on barbed wire is beyond vast. What can a modest book recapping the need for barbed wire, its history, evolution, and larger implications add to the current information base? The answer is plenty. Joanne S. Liu, a Texas-based freelance writer with a wide body of articles in print, has generated a handsome and useful study, one copiously illustrated with spectacularly reproduced photographs under the aegis of the Missoula-based Mountain Press. This volume is for those readers interested in barbed wire, or curious about the development of fencing in the American West (from the Great Plains to the Pacific Slope), rather than for specialists in the intricacies of technological innovation or the history of stock raising on the North American scene. Despite those limited aims, I read and enjoyed the book because it recaps themes and discusses traditional debates over the origins and imperatives associated with barbed wire development.

In a nutshell, this story is the familiar saga of wide open ranges, at first treated as public commons but gradually claimed and legally obtained through titles by a variety of new owners, including many female descendants of European and East Coast gentry. In time tension built over control of the range. Landowners who claimed a legal right to fence their lands and exclude "tramp" herds from accessing grasslands confronted livestock owners who freely grazed their sheep and cattle. The question then became, what source material could be used to enclose the land on the Great Plains? Suitable stone and wood were in chronically short supply. Since forests and rocks were scarce, the split-post, worm, and rock fences readily built in the East

could not be reproduced on the Plains, and innovations were required with movement westward. Fence posts were sold at a premium. What material could stretch between the fence posts? Smooth wire would not hold cattle in, but barbs twisted into the wire at regular intervals would do just fine. By the 1860s, hundreds of designs were under consideration at the U.S. Patent Office. In 1874, Joseph F. Glidden of DeKalb, Illinois, won out with "the first practical and mass-produced barbed wire design" (p. 38). Both fact and the stuff of western legend, range wars, fence-cutting, the Big Die-up, plenty of patent violations, and the slow domestication of western rangeland ensued. Barbed wire also facilitated railroad fencing and the sequestration of Native Americans on fenced reservations, not far in conception from concentration camps. The faces of modernity—both ugly and orderly—were turned skyward, and to paraphrase the author's subtitle, fencing transformed the West.

In 1931 geographical historian Walter Prescott Webb cited barbed wire as a crucial technological innovation that shaped the Great Plains (along with the six-shooter and the windmill). No doubt the existence of barbed wire made possible countless changes in the West, and Liu does a fine job in laying those transformations out. Barbed wire, however, has a much larger and decidedly more sinister set of uses. It can be used to enclose and exclude. And, let us not forget, barbed wire, like concertina wire, can be, and has been, employed for harsh uses, as historian Reviel Netz writes in his own study of "the devil's rope," *Barbed Wire: An Ecology of Modernity* (2004).

Two of the book's many delights merit mention. The photographs and maps are reproduced with wonderful clarity. Images that I have seen published before, reproduced with smudges and murk, are absolutely pristine here. Bravo to Mountain Press. Finally, the appendixes include "Sites of Interest" and "Resources for Collectors," a chronology, a glossary, and an efficient bibliography and index. How pleasant and useful.

Paul F. Starrs
University of Nevada, Reno

On the Western Trails: The Overland Diaries of Washington Peck. Edited with a biographical commentary by Susan M. Erb. American Trails series, vol. 22 (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, Arthur H. Clark Company, 2009. 296 pp. 25 halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-87062-379-0.)

Historian Dale L. Morgan wrote in "The Significance and Value of the Overland Journal" (1961) that each overland emigrant journal "is a reflection

of a folk experience and a time spirit. . . . Each journal that is found alters some detail, and gives fresh play to our imagination as well as our understanding" (pp. 33–34). As such these journals merit appreciation; together they create a collective national self-portrait.

Susan M. Erb's wonderful edition of her great-great-great grandfather Washington Peck's reports of crossing the plains in 1850 and 1858 validates Morgan's insight. A chronic wanderer, Peck was an overland Odysseus with his family in tow, and his engaging, beautifully crafted trail diaries describe seldom-traveled and notably arduous routes. Peck tried two of the worst ways to get to California. His journal from 1850, the only contemporary account of wagon travel from Salt Lake to Los Angeles, is full of invaluable information available nowhere else. (We have few emigrant Santa Fe Trail journals from the late 1850s.) Peck's rare report describes his aborted attempt to cross Edward Beale's brand-new camel road in 1858, which might have been fine for camels but proved disastrous for wagons. Before turning back, Peck's party struggled for 352 miles west of Albuquerque to the "Colorado Chiquito," trading for blankets and deer skins at Zuni and finding wild walnuts, grapes, and turkeys in the San Francisco Mountains.

Peck is an insightful and wry wordsmith. Above the Sweetwater River, Prospect Hill overlooks "hills on hills and mountains on mountains piled up in the wildest confusion" with so little vegetation "it would starve a grasshopper" (p. 86). Salt Lake Valley was where "the anchor of the Mormon hope is cast for this world" (p. 98). And near Bents Old Fort, "an ox came up and very politely asked to accompany us," Peck wrote, "(as plainly as an ox can speak)" (p. 200).

An indefatigable researcher, Erb provides a lively biography of her adventurous ancestor, apparently having tracked down every relevant scrap of paper. She integrates her insightful comments among the diary entries, a seldom-used but effective technique employed in another trail classic, Bruce L. McKinstry's *California Gold Rush Overland Diary of Byron N. McKinstry, 1850–1852* (1975). With an impressive command of the best secondary sources, Erb has mastered a complicated subject with only a handful of missteps.

Many historians discount the value of family chronicles, but this magnificent telling of the Peck family's western sojourns reveals the treasures family narratives offer those who practice the craft of history. Former Congressman Tip O'Neil observed, "All politics is local," and so too all history is family history. We are, after all, members of one human family.

Will Bagley
Salt Lake City, Utah

Amasa Mason Lyman, Mormon Apostle and Apostate: A Study in Dedication. By Edward Leo Lyman. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2009. xvi + 646 pp. 39 halftones, maps, notes, bibliographic essay, bibliography, index. $39.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-87480-940-4.)

In *Amasa Mason Lyman*, historian Edward Leo Lyman traces the geographical and spiritual odyssey of his great grandfather, an early Mormon convert who rose to church leadership, directed the settlement of Latter-day Saints in southern Utah and southern California, and then turned away from organized Christianity to spiritualism. Edward Leo Lyman reveals the great influence of his ancestor in early Mormonism and in the Godbeite schism, the rebellion led by William Godbe and others in the early 1870s against the Mormon program of economic solidarity.

The biography occasionally swerves into the realms of hagiography and even filial piety. The author makes no apology for his admiration of his great grandfather, which is evident in the book's subtitle and is openly expressed in the epigraph. Claiming that Amasa Mason Lyman's "contribution as one of the leading pioneers of the region has never received its just due," his biographer sets out "to redress a century and a half of diminished attention to his signal accomplishments" (p. 297). Edward Leo Lyman offers the counterfactual possibility that had Joseph Smith made Amasa Mason Lyman a more prominent leader, he may have saved Smith's life and altered the course of Mormon history (p. 81). He also speculates that Amasa Mason Lyman's colony in San Bernardino "might have attained regional dominance religiously and in other ways within a generation" had Brigham Young "been more patient and supportive" (p. 242). Edward Leo Lyman expresses admiration for Amasa Mason Lyman's courage for rebelling against Young's religious authority (p. 469). He finds it "amazing" that Amasa Mason Lyman is not more recognized as a leader of the Godbeite movement and believes that his disengagement from the movement accounts for its decline (pp. 410–11, 461).

A consequence of the author's vindication of his great grandfather is an attack on Brigham Young. Edward Leo Lyman offers up several one-sided speculations regarding the rift that opened up between Young and Amasa Mason Lyman and finds several reasons to blame Young for his grandfather's separation from the church. In fact the tendency to view Young in the worst possible light pervades the biography. Although Amasa Mason Lyman clearly departed from Smith's Mormonism in his embrace of spiritualism, his rejection of the efficacy of the church ordinances, his rejection of the doctrine of Jesus Christ's redeeming sacrifice, and his eventual rejection of organized religion, Edward Leo Lyman partly buys into his great grandfather's

insistence that he was carrying on the true teachings of Smith, which Young had perverted.

The massive *Amasa Mason Lyman* is an old-school work of bread and butter history. Based on Amasa Mason Lyman's thirty-nine-volume diary and Edward Leo Lyman's monumental research, the biography provides a thorough and often a day-by-day account of Amasa Mason Lyman's life. In its length and attention to detail, the book is clearly written by a Mormon historian for the community of Mormon historians. Other passages seem to be written by a member of the Lyman family for members of the Lyman family, sketching out the lives of Amasa Mason Lyman's children and grandchildren and relating personal family stories. In addition the treatment of Amasa Mason Lyman's life before the Utah period, in which the biographer specializes, contains a number of inaccuracies and anachronisms.

Despite these weaknesses, the book holds a wealth of information on early Mormon and early Utah history. Amasa Mason Lyman's life sheds much light on the establishment of the Mormon enclave in Utah, as well as the psychological and social challenge of following one's own conscience away from orthodoxy in that environment.

Mark Ashurst-McGee
Joseph Smith Papers

The Archaeology of Meaningful Places. Edited by Brenda J. Bowser and María Nieves Zedeño. Foundations of Archaeological Inquiry series. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2009. x + 222 pp. 24 halftones, 20 line drawings, 20 maps, tables, bibliography, index. $30.00 paper, ISBN 978-0-87480-882-7.)

The importance of place is well established in fiction and nature writing. The editors of this volume introduce this compendium of ten chapters with a review of archaeology's engagement with cognized concepts of place. The paradigm is humanist and recognizable to archaeologists as post-processual. Agency theory underpins most of the chapters, hence a concern with local knowledge and particularism. Nevertheless, the editors set a tone that is maturely pluralistic. There is a sense, that to know the local, one must know the regional and the continental—a vision that may be one benefit of archaeology's continuing engagement with the notion of place. The chapters echo the call to take up place to the point of verging on the evangelical, but each contribution offers its own take on place and meaning.

Wendy Ashmore writes of life history, the multiple meanings of place to different users and caretakers, thus signaling the importance of archaeology's

time-transgressive nature. Arthur Joyce picks up the life history thread and employs the Main Plaza at Monte Albán to advocate not a study of social change per se, but a history of the meaning of places that *informs* the many faces of social change.

Rosemary Joyce, Julia Hendon, and Jeanne Lopiparo expand on an emphasis that runs through the volume—place, rather than site. In their essay "Being in Place: Intersections of Identity and Experience on the Honduran Landscape," late classical Honduras illustrates the shift from *settlement pattern studies* to an agent-based interpretation of *landscapes*. In chapter 4, Stephanie Whittlesey interprets Hohokam cultural landscapes, but a battle with perceived demons obscures consummation. The pluralism of the editors is abandoned in favor of straw men; I can think of reasons why the archaeology of the U.S. Southwest has not engaged a cultural landscape approach other than by appeal to science-bashing. "Hopitutskwa and Ang Kuktota: The Role of Archaeological Sites in Defining Hopi Cultural Landscapes," by Leigh Kuwanwisiwma and T. J. Ferguson ensnares the outsider in the cross-cultural nature of landscape and reminds us that the interpretative paradigm blurs reality. In chapter 6, Christopher Garraty and Michael Ohnersorgen study the geopolitical landscape of the Aztec Empire's influence on outlying regions. Their engagement with the methods of correlating the material record with place and meaning makes it the most archaeological contribution in the volume.

In Michael Heilen and J. Jefferson Reid's "A Landscape of Gambles and Guts: Commodification of Land on the Arizona Frontier," the Arizona ranching frontier of the late nineteenth century illustrates place as commodity driven by American capitalist structures. A tract on Ndee sense of place by John Welch preaches to the choir, but his critique against the "understanding of behavior responsible for material remains" and his call for "attention to the overall feeling" will surely leave many archaeologists muttering expletives (p. 150). The final chapter by Stephen Lekson compares three examples to illustrate some different forms and flavors of interpretation. His is a mindful synthesis to the volume.

Steven R. Simms
Utah State University