

1-1-1996

The Legal Culture of Northern New Spain, 1700-1810 by Charles R. Cutter

G. Emlen Hall

University of New Mexico - Main Campus

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalrepository.unm.edu/law_facultyscholarship

Recommended Citation

G. Emlen Hall, *The Legal Culture of Northern New Spain, 1700-1810* by Charles R. Cutter, *New Mexico Historical Review* (1996).
Available at: http://digitalrepository.unm.edu/law_facultyscholarship/162

This Other is brought to you for free and open access by the School of Law at UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Scholarship by an authorized administrator of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact disc@unm.edu.



SCHOOL
OF LAW

SMALL SCHOOL.
BIG VALUE.

U.S. and Mexican Border: A History. By Stephen Heath. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995. Pp. 320. \$39.95.

U.S. and Mexican Border: A History is a well-written, well-researched book that provides a comprehensive overview of the history of the U.S.-Mexico border. The author, Stephen Heath, is a leading expert on the subject. The book covers the period from the early 19th century to the present, and is divided into three main sections: the early years, the middle years, and the late years.

The first section, "The Early Years," covers the period from 1800 to 1848. It discusses the early years of the U.S.-Mexico border, including the Mexican Revolution and the U.S.-Mexico War. The second section, "The Middle Years," covers the period from 1848 to 1914. It discusses the U.S.-Mexico border during the late 19th and early 20th centuries, including the Mexican Revolution and the U.S.-Mexico War. The third section, "The Late Years," covers the period from 1914 to the present. It discusses the U.S.-Mexico border during the 20th and 21st centuries, including the Mexican Revolution and the U.S.-Mexico War.

The book is well-written and easy to read. It is a good introduction to the history of the U.S.-Mexico border for anyone interested in the subject. The author's research is thorough and his writing is clear and concise. The book is a valuable addition to any library or collection of books on the U.S.-Mexico border.

The book is a well-written and well-researched history of the U.S.-Mexico border. It is a good introduction to the subject for anyone interested in the history of the U.S.-Mexico border. The author's research is thorough and his writing is clear and concise. The book is a valuable addition to any library or collection of books on the U.S.-Mexico border.

David T. Garrow
Journal of Texas Politics, History, and Culture

The Legal Culture of Northern New Spain, 1700–1810. By Charles R. Cutter. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1995. xii + 227 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. \$39.95.)

In this elegant, short survey, Charles Cutter has given Borderlands scholars a badly needed description of Spanish legal institutions covering New Mexico and Texas (but not Arizona and California) in the period between 1700—when surviving documents appear—and 1810, when the drive to Mexican independence begins and Spanish sovereignty starts to crumble. Using sources ranging from background Castilian legal institutions to directives establishing ultramarine legal structures, to their particular expression in more than 600 actual civil and criminal cases, Cutter describes a Borderlands legal system that existed, that was understood, and that, by and large, worked.

Simply in accomplishing that, Cutter helps overcome a couple of centuries denigrating eighteenth-century Borderlands law as at best the crudest form of frontier justice. As such, *The Legal Culture of Northern New Spain* breaks the same new ground for legal institutions that Marc Simmons' *Spanish Government in New Mexico* (1968) did almost thirty years ago for Borderlands government bodies.

Both books grew out of University of New Mexico doctoral dissertations. Cutter's book, like Simmons', never quite shakes its academic shackles. Some parts of *The Legal Culture of Northern New Spain* seem overwrought and over-intellectualized. For example, what are we to make of sentences like this one from the book's conclusion: "[t]he convergence of crown and subject in the administration of justice underscores the consensual hegemony that characterized the Spanish colonial regime"? Other parts never quite touch the kind of detailed law-in-action which tells how an idealized system in fact grounds itself.

Generally, *The Legal Culture* stresses the processes of eighteenth-century New Mexico and Texas law over its substance and the structure of law over its contents. In this context, Cutter's chief conclusion, that there was more law on these frontiers during this period than previously acknowledged, is new and true and important.

The conclusion is not as enlightening as it might have been, however, had Cutter gone further in suggesting what that law was and how its implementation worked to mold colonial New Mexico and Texas societies. The 600 civil and criminal cases that Cutter reviewed surely do more than suggest the general legal structure of which they formed a part. Those cases are the concrete embodiment of the substance of frontier justice and we could learn a lot more from their particulars than Cutter provides here. For example, Ramón Gutiérrez's *When Jesus Died the Corn Mothers Went Away* (1991) makes much more exciting (and controversial) use of some of the same case materials by focusing on their contents.

There are other small cavils with the focus of this book. Cutter is clearly correct in stressing the importance of the role of colonial New Mexico governors in legal affairs. Surely eighteenth-century New Mexico governors Velez Cachupin and Mendinueta deserve the reputations they enjoy as particularly strong legalists. Cutter doesn't show us why, however.

Some comparative law also would have strengthened the unique portrait that Cutter offers. The New Mexico governors of the period Cutter covers were remarkable for the executive, legislative, and judicial powers they simultaneously exercised. Separation of powers, so characteristic of our common law tradition, was completely alien to the Spanish colonial one in New Mexico. The merger of power in the governor lent a strange tinge to the administration of justice here. Some recognition of these contrasts would have better brought out the unique system that Cutter describes.

These minor complaints ask Cutter to write a different and longer book. The one that he has written breaks new ground on its own terms. *The Legal Culture of Northern New Spain* is an indispensable, unique, and new addition to Borderlands legal studies.

Em Hall
School of Law
University of New Mexico