

11-11-2011

Inquisitive Objects: Material Culture and Conversos in Early Modern Ciudad Real

Jessica Weiss

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/laii_research

Recommended Citation

Weiss, Jessica. "Inquisitive Objects: Material Culture and Conversos in Early Modern Ciudad Real." (2011).
https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/laii_research/50

This Working Paper is brought to you for free and open access by the Latin American and Iberian Institute at UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Research Papers by an authorized administrator of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact disc@unm.edu.

LAII Research Paper Series

October 2011
No. 55

Anthropology, Art
History, Economics,
Education, Gender,
Cultural Studies,
Geography, Health
Sciences, History,
Journalism,
Linguistics,
Literature, Music,
Natural Sciences,
Political Science,
Sociology |
Antropología,
Historia del Arte, Economía,
Educación, Género,
Estudios Culturales,
Geografía, C
Geografía,
Ciencias de la
Periodismo, Salud,
Música, Ciencias Naturales, Ciencias Políticas,
Historia,
Lingüística, Literatura,
Sociología | Antropología, História da
Arte, Economía, Educação, Género, Estudos
Culturais, Geografia, Ciências da Saúde,
História, Jornalismo, Lingüística, Literatura, Música,
Ciências Naturais, Ciências Políticas, Sociologia | Anthropology, Art History, Economics, Education, Gender, Cultural
Studies, Geography, Health Sciences, History, Journalism, Linguistics, Literature, Music, Natural
Sciences, Political Science, Sociology | Antropología, Historia del Arte, Economía, Educación, Género,
Estudios Culturales, Geografía, Ciencias de la Salud, Historia, Periodismo, Lingüística, Literatura,
Música, Ciencias Naturales, Ciencias Políticas, Sociologia | Antropologia, História da Arte,
Economia, Educação, Género, Estudos Culturais, Geografia, Ciências da Saúde, História,
Jornalismo, Lingüística, Literatura, Música, Ciências Naturais, Ciências Políticas,
Sociologia | Anthropology, Art History, Economics, Education, Gender, Cultural
Studies, Geography, Health Sciences, History, Journalism, Linguistics, Literature,
Music, Natural Sciences, Political Science, Sociology | Antropología, Historia del
Arte, Economía, Educación, Género, Estudios Culturales, Geografía, Ciencias
de la Salud, Historia, Periodismo, Lingüística, Literatura, Música,
Ciencias Naturales, Ciencias Políticas, Sociologia | Antropologia,
História da Arte, Economía, Educação, Género, Estudos Culturais,
Geografia, Ciências da Saúde, História, Jornalismo, Lingüística,
Literatura, Música, Ciências Naturais, Ciências Políticas,
Sociologia | Anthropology, Art History, Economics, Education,
Gender, Cultural Studies, Geography, Health Sciences,
History, Journalism, Linguistics, Literature, Music,
Natural Sciences, Political Science, Sociology |
Antropología, Historia del Arte, Economía,
Educación, Género, Estudios Culturales,
Geografía, Ciencias de la Salud, Historia,
Periodismo, Lingüística, Literatura, Música,
Ciencias Naturales, Ciencias Políticas,
Sociologia | Antropologia, História da Arte,
Economia, Educação, Género, Estudos
Culturais, Geografia, Ciências da
Saúde, História, Jornalismo,
Lingüística, Literatura,
Música, Ciências Naturais,
Ciências Políticas, Sociologia |
Anthropology, Art History,
Economics, Education,
Gender, Cultural
Studies,
Geography,
Health
Sciences,
History,
Journalism,
Linguistics,
Literature,
Music,
Natural
Sci-

*Inquisitive Objects: Material Culture and Conversos
in Early Modern Ciudad Real*

Jessica Weiss
Department of Art and Art History
The University of Texas, Austin

Research Paper Series No. 55 November 2011

**Inquisitive Objects:
Material Culture and *Conversos* in Early Modern Ciudad Real**

Jessica Weiss
Department of Art and Art History
The University of Texas, Austin

The Latin American and Iberian Institute (LAI) at The University of New Mexico (UNM) is one of the nation's leading foreign language and area studies centers. More than 130 UNM faculty specializing in Latin American research and teaching are members of the Faculty Concilium on Latin America and Iberia and are the primary constituency of the LAI.

The LAI's Research Paper Series and Occasional Paper Series provide refereed forums for the timely dissemination of research on Latin American topics. Authors also gain the benefits of comment and criticism from the larger research community if they intend to later submit their work to other publications.

Abstract

Between 1483 and 1526, one-hundred and twenty-four trials were conducted by the Spanish Inquisition against *conversos* in Ciudad Real. The notarial records from these trials contain a multitude of references to material culture, including sculpted artworks, candles, and effigies. This essay analyzes the references to materiality utilized in arraignments, witness testimonies, and verdicts, and then correlates them to broader constructions of cultural identity. These references reveal a pre-modern animistic world view in which objects both shape and are shaped by their participation as active agents in religious ritual.

In March of 1473, a religious confraternity in Córdoba held a procession in honor of the Virgin Mary during which a sculpture of the Virgin was carried through the streets of the city.¹ Suddenly, the procession skidded to a halt as the contents of a chamber pot splashed over the statue.² This insult was believed to have been perpetuated by a young *converso* girl emptying the pot from a second story window. The members of the confraternity became immediately outraged and vowed to avenge this horrendous act against the local *converso* community. The city became embroiled in riots for three days. These events were cited five years later as evidence of the horrendous actions committed by Jews and crypto Jews on the Iberian Peninsula when Isabella and Ferdinand applied to the Holy See for the establishment of an Inquisition in Castile.

The inclusion of this narrative during the establishment of the Inquisition exemplifies the indispensable role played by material culture in Early Modern Castilian society. As the investigation of heretical actions of *conversos* gained momentum, physical objects continued through their material qualities and manipulation to provide a vital avenue for demonstrating in concrete terms conceptions of orthodoxy, heresy, and deviance. Reference to materiality became incorporated into the surviving notary records through references made in witness testimonies as well as the institutional actions of the Inquisition itself. The weight given to such testimony within the written record implicates material culture as essential for the very functionality of the Inquisition. And yet, these references have remained largely unmentioned within the current

¹ This paper originated in a seminar conducted by Dr. Julie Hardwick in the spring semester of 2009 entitled “Making the Early Modern World” in the department of History at the University of Texas, Austin. My research benefited greatly from the guidance of Dr. Hardwick as well as the queries posed by my fellow classmates. I am also grateful to Dr. Pamela Patton of Southern Methodist University, Dallas, whose comments on an early draft of this project were extremely insightful. Thanks are also due to Rachel Spaulding for her in-depth review.

² Diego de Valera, *Epistolas*, (Madrid: Sociedad de Bibliófilos Españoles, 1878) 78.

historiographical conversation.³ However, an analysis of these textual references to physical objects reveals a world view in which material culture is closely associated with active agency. Physical objects shaped and were shaped by their participation in ritual actions, and material things acted as statements of personhood and group identity.⁴ As such these descriptions of material culture located within the Inquisitorial record reveal a world view in which physicality is closely allied with spirituality, one that is shifting from pre-modern animism to modern cartesianism.

Since its inception, Christianity has struggled with the place of images in religious life. Various positions were debated by the sharpest of minds, including St. Gregory the Great, Theodulf of Orleans, and Bernard Clairvaux.⁵ Much of this discourse focused on the role of images as “books of the illiterate” and inciters of emotion. In each case, material culture was viewed as separate from the agency of being. However, popular religious practices did not always reflect the complex theological discourse and subtle argumentation of Pseudo-Dionysus and St. Augustine. Miraculous material objects, such as the Madonna of Rocamadour, move,

³ Critical responses to the Inquisition appeared shortly after Isabella the Catholic instituted the court in 1478, such as Andrés Bernáldez, *Memorias de los Reyes Católicos*. Manuel Gómez-Moreno and Juan de Mata Carriazo, eds. Madrid: CSIC, 1962. In 1914 the Spanish government transferred the Inquisition records and documents to the Archivo Histórico Nacional in Madrid, allowing for a further re-appraisal of the institution through direct archival evidence, including: Henry Charles Lea *History of the Inquisition of Spain*, 4 vols. London and New York: Macmillan, 1922; Haim Beinart, *Conversos on Trial: The Inquisition in Ciudad Real*, Jerusalem: The Magnes Press, 1981; and Benzion Netanyahu, *The Origins of the Inquisition*, New York: Random House, 1995. More recently, historical revisionists have argued that the Inquisition was not a continuous stable entity but constantly renegotiated relationships between individuals and institutional life. See: Henry Kamen, *Spanish Inquisition: An Historical Revision*, New Haven: Yale University Press, 1997; and Jaime Contreras and Gustav Henningsen, *The Inquisition in Early Modern Europe: Studies in Sources and Methods*, Dekalb, IL: Northern Illinois University Press, 1985. Recent works include Yirmiyaha Yovel, *The Other Within: The Marranos: Split Identity and Emerging Modernity*, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2009; David Graizbord, *Soals in Dispute: Converso Identities in Iberia and the Jewish Diaspora: 1500-1700*, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004; Francisco Bethencourt and Jean Birrell, *The Inquisition: A Global History, 1478-1834*, Cambridge University Press, 2009.

⁴ Copy note 86

⁵ For an analysis of Gregory the Great, see Celia Chazelle, “Pictures, Books, and the Illiterate,” *Word and Image* 6 (1990): 138-153, and Herbert Kessler, “Gregory the Great and Image Theory in Northern Europe during the Twelfth and Fifteenth Centuries,” *Companion to Medieval Art: Romanesque and Gothic in Northern Europe*, Conrad Rudolph, ed., (Oxford: Willey-Blackwell, 2007): 151-169.

speak, and even bleed if harmed.⁶ The theory of images presented by objects is not congruent with the proper use of images articulated by theologians. The difficulty in accommodating both world views is articulated by a novice monk speaking on the miraculous image at Floreffe stating: “I am overcome by amazement when I hear a voice speaking in the wood, a hand raised to strike, the body bending over, raising itself, sitting down, with the other vital movements. I am more astonished by this than the ass’s speech to Balaam- for that was a living and moving being, but in wood, stone, and metal there is not a living spirit.”⁷ Medieval images not only function as mnemonic aids and pedagogical tools, but as powerful forces, outside theological discourse.⁸ Images are called upon to intercede on the sinner’s behalf, to prove the strength of one’s belief, and to assist in times of extreme need. Images reveal themselves as active agents in moments where life, either worldly or eternal, hangs in the balance. As Jeffrey Hamburger describes in his discussion of the *Liber Miraculorum* of Unterlinden, legends of miracle working images were able to “confirm the ‘reality’ that the viewer wished to find in the image.”⁹

Medieval material culture suggests that some objects were understood as equivalent beings that interacted with humans as complete and independent entities. In his 1913 work *Totem and Taboo*, Sigmund Freud attempted to explain the tendency of those, whom he understood as primitive and neurotic, to attribute life to inanimate objects.¹⁰ He described what he observed as the predisposition of humanity to envision the physical world as an extension of

⁶ Freedbird, 283-316.

⁷ Caesarius of Heisterback, *Dialogus miraculorum*, J. Strange, ed., 2 vols. (Cologne, Bonn, and Brussels: 1851): dist. 7, cap. 24. Trans: David Freedberg, *The Power of Images: Studies in the History and Theory of Response*, (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1989): 285.

⁸ A corpus of images, the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* reference images that function in a multitude of contexts. For a discussion of the imagery, see Deirdre Jackson, *Saint and simulacra: Images of the Virgin in the Cantigas de Santa Maria of Alfonso X of Castile*. Ph.D.diss, University of London, 2002.

⁹ Jeffrey Hamburger, “The *Liber Miraculorum* of Unterlinden: An Icon in TIs Convent Setting,” *The Sacred Image East and West*, Robert Ousterhout and Leslie Brubaker, eds., (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1994): 170.

¹⁰ Sigmund Freud, *Totem and Taboo: Some Points of Agreement between the Mental Life of Savages and Neurotics*, James Strachey, trans., London: Routledge Classics, 2001. The issue of animism is specifically addressed in Chapter 3 “Animism, Magic, and the Omnipotence of Thought.” See also A. Hornborg, “Animism, Fetishism and Objectivism as Strategies for Knowing (or not Knowing) the World,” *Ethnos* 71 (2006): 21-32.

itself, which in more advanced societies is overruled first by religion, and then by science.¹¹ Nurit Bird-David has argued that this traditional derogatory view of animism should be revised.¹² Instead, animism should be understood as a system of relatedness between both human and non-human entities. When a situation allows for interaction between a human person and an active object, the joint experience forms a relational bond between the two entities, akin to shared experiences between humans. Bird-David describes this system as a network of individuals, defined as entities constituted of relationships and the opposite of enclosed and separate individuals. In his response to Bird-David, anthropologist Tim Ingold suggests that the transition from medieval animistic society to modern Cartesian society is a definitive moment for Western conceptions of reality.¹³ In contrast to non-moderns such as medievals, moderns define personhood as a construction of individualistic encapsulation only possible for human beings.¹⁴ Modern reliance on the symbolic over the participatory reveals an adherence to the Cartesian conceptualization of “I think, therefore I am” and the inversed “if I do not think, then I am not.” The early modern period, then, stands at a moment of translation between these two constructs. The use of inquisition documents to articulate the functions of images is particularly poignant in that it institutionalizes the theory of images more often associated with popular belief.

A microcosm of attitudes toward materiality as demonstrated through the filter of the Inquisitional process is provided by the trials conducted in Ciudad Real at the turn of the sixteenth century. Between 1483 and 1526, one-hundred twenty-four trials were conducted

¹¹ Ibid., 90.

¹² Nurit Bird-David, “Animism Revisited: Personhood, environment, and relational epistemology,” *Current Anthropology* (1991): 67-91.

¹³ Ibid, 87.

¹⁴ Bruno Latour, *We Have Never Been Modern*, Catherine Porter, trans, Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1993.

against suspected *conversos*.¹⁵ The notarial records for these trials are similar to others from across Castile, reflecting the consistency of Castilian attitudes toward materiality.¹⁶ A close analysis of these trial records provides a corpus of specific references to physical objects that can be correlated to broader cultural phenomena. In this way, the trials of the Ciudad Real *conversos* provide a lens through which to understand the function of material culture in Early Modern Western Europe.

Materiality and the Trials of Juan Díaz, María González, and Juan de Teva

References to physical objects and states of materiality are extremely common within the notarial records of the Inquisition. They appear in almost every portion of the case files, including the specific accusations of the arraignments, the recorded witness testimonies, the confessions of the accused, and the sentencing for the guilty. For example, on September 6, 1484, Fernán Rodríguez de Barco presented before the Inquisition court of Ciudad Real a posthumous arraignment against Juan Díaz, the draper. In the arraignment, Juan Díaz was accused of being a “judaizer, heretic, and apostate, who guards the Laws of Moses and its rites and ceremonies.”¹⁷ The specifics of these rituals included “honoring the Sabbath and guarding the Law of Moses with the lighting of candles on Friday and the wearing of clean festival

¹⁵ These documents consist of fifty-seven files transferred from the cathedral of Toledo to the Archivo Histórico Nacional, Madrid, in 1914. These records were then published by Haim Beinart in *Records of the Trials of Spanish Inquisition in Ciudad Real, 1483-1527*, 4 vols. Jerusalem: Israel National Academy of Science and Humanities, 1974. Beinart organized, transcribed, and annotated the documents to identify one-hundred twenty-four individual cases. The discrepancy between the number of files and the number of cases is due to the inclusion of several cases within a single file, such as those against a husband and wife or other related kinship groups. Sixty-seven trials are reconstructed based upon references within the existing files, even though the original material is no longer existent.

¹⁶ The consistency of the Inquisition was due to the strong centralization in the person of the Inquisitor General, who established clear guidelines for standards of heresy and regularized procedures. Helen Rawlings, *The Spanish Inquisition*, (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2006): 24+.

¹⁷ “*jundayso, heretico e apostate, guardando la Ley de Muysen e sus rictos e cerimonias*” Haim Beinart, *Records of the Trials of the Spanish Inquisition in Ciudad Real, 1483-1527*, 4 vols. (Jerusalem: Israel National Academy of Science and Humanities, 1974) vol. 1, 570.

clothes,” and “celebrating Passover with the eating of unleavened bread.”¹⁸ In addition to these charges, de Barco also described how Juan Díaz ritualistically attacked a sculpted image of Christ every Friday afternoon. These accusations were corroborated by Juan Díaz’s close familial ties to other known *conversos*, specifically his sister Constanza Díaz, her husband Juan Falcón the Elder, and his brothers Fernando Díaz, and Rey Díaz.¹⁹ The evidence against Juan Díaz resulted in a guilty verdict; his bones were exhumed and burned publicly on March 15, 1485.

In many ways, the trial of Juan Díaz was typical of late fifteenth and early sixteenth-century Inquisition cases against Castilian *conversos*. María González, wife of Pedro de Villarreal, was brought before the Inquisition on June 2, 1511. In her arraignment, María González was accused of celebrating the Sabbath with the lighting of candles and the wearing of clean clothes, eating Kosher meat, and receiving the Jewish blessing.²⁰ Moreover, the arraignment stated that María González threw an image of the Virgin Mary into a sewage ditch.²¹ As part of her lengthy confession, María González admitted to all charges. She was found guilty and sentenced to life imprisonment until her defense attorney, Alonso de Baena, had her case reopened eleven months later. The second appearance before the Inquisition court resulted in her being burned at the stake on September 7, 1512.

¹⁸ “*ençendiendo e consyntiendo ençender candiles los viernes en la noche por honra del sabado e guarda de la dicha Ley. . . e guardo los sabados e uystio en ellos ropas inpias e de fiesta. . . Guardaua las pascuas de la dicha ley, e comia el pan çençeño*” Ibid.

¹⁹ Juan Falcón the Elder was also indicted on September 6, 1484 and burned posthumously on March 15, 1485. See Beinart, vol. 1, 551-567. The case for Fernando Díaz is no longer extant and does not appear in Beinart’s compendium. However, his nephew Fernán Falcón witnessed on behalf of the prosecution stating that the charges against his father and uncles, including Fernán were true in all aspects. See Beinart vol. 1, 566 and 568. Rey Díaz was burned in effigy on February 24, 1484. See Beinart, vol. 1, 355.

²⁰ “*II Iten, que la dicha Mari Gonsales, los viernes en las noches. . . hazia ençender y ençendia çiertos candiles linios. . . III Iten, que la dicha Mari Gonsales, por honrar el dicho dia del sabado, los dichos viernes en las noches aparejaua la camisa linpia. . . IIII Iten, que la dicha Mari Gonsales purgaua e purgo la carne a la manera quo los judios la purgauan por guarda e obserucançia de su Ley. . . VI Iten, que la dicha Mari Gonsales daua e dio muchas vezes la benediction a la manera judayca a çiertas personas*” Ibid, 247-248.

²¹ “*V Iten, que la dicha Mari Gonsales. . . dandole vna table en que estaua pintada la ymagen de Nuestra Señora. . . la arrojo en un albañar muy suzio*” Ibid.

In her lengthy confession María González named many other Ciudad Real New Christians as crypto-judaizers, including Juan de Teva, a draper from Ciudad Real who had recently fled to Portugal. His trial, conducted *in absentia*, was almost completely composed of testimony given in other *converso* trials.²² In the arraignment, the prosecutor Martín Jiménez enumerated the judaizing activities of Juan de Teva, such as keeping the Sabbath, associating and even teaching practices to other *conversos*, and speaking out against Christian tenants of the faith.²³ Juan de Teva was found guilty, and he was burned in effigy on September 7, 1513.

These three cases, typical of the one hundred twenty-four trials, mention material culture in several ways. First, references are made to the misuse of specifically Christian images by malicious Jews. Both Juan Díaz and María González were accused of abusing Christian religious art objects within their arraignments. While this type of accusation is the least prevalent, it was extremely distressing for the Christian community.²⁴ Witness testimony within the trial of Juan Díaz reveals that the Christians were outraged by the very rumor that a Jewish man accosted an image of Christ.²⁵ The accusation against María González is similar to that of the *converso* girl of Córdoba, whose actions led to three days of violent and bloody rioting. A more common type of reference to physical objects within the notarial records occurs in regards to identifying heretical Jewish ritual. Juan Díaz, María González, and Juan de Teva were all accused of celebrating the Jewish Sabbath through interactions with the physical world,

²² See Beinart, vol. 2, 466-538.

²³ “*guardava e guardo los dias de los sabados . . . inponia e inpuso a otras personas a que guardasen la Ley de Moysen e hiziesen sus çerimonias, e platicava con otras personas de como aquella era la buena ley . . . con el odio e enemistad que tenia a la Religion Christiana e a nustr Santa Fe Catholica e burlando della e de loque la Santa Madre Yglesia crehe e predica e manda.*” Beinart, vol. 3, 319-320.

²⁴ While popular devotional practices varied from region to region in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, Spanish society had a theologically consistent Christian dogma. I have chosen to use the term “Christian Community” within this context. For a recent discussion on religious nomenclature, see Jerrilynn Dodds, Maria Menocal, and Abigail Balbale, *The Arts of Intimacy: Christians, Jews, and Muslims in the Making of Castilian Culture*, New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008.

²⁵ This inclusion within the testimonial record is particularly striking due to the sterile and regularized nature of most legal discourse. Nearly all of the testimony included in the Ciudad Real trials is presented as unemotional recollection in the third person, striped of all but the most important details.

specifically the lighting of candles and the donning of clean clothing.²⁶ This type of accusation differs from the first in that it emphasizes the interconnectivity of material culture and ritual behavior. The third type of reference to materiality is in the distribution of punishment. These cases exemplify the ability of the Inquisition to perpetuate retribution against both persons and material objects linked to personhood, corpses and effigies. When compiled together, these three types of references to material culture within the Ciudad Real inquisitional documents create a complex interdependent web of activeness and agency between living persons and nonliving things.

Accusations of Abuse toward Material Objects

The actions which seem to garner the greatest emotional response in the notarial record are the accusations of abuse against specifically Christian objects. The arraignment of Juan Díaz stated he “kept a crucifix in his house and accosted it every Friday afternoon.”²⁷ Item V of the arraignment against María Gonzalez stated: “it is said that María González, as an infidel and non-believer who shames our Sacred Catholic Faith, one time, harmed a picture on which was painted an image of Our Mother the Virgin Mary, she seized it, and like a great wind, with joking and scoffing, threw it into a sewer-ditch that ran alongside the kitchen.”²⁸ While it is certainly possible that Juan Díaz and María González performed these actions, care should be taken in assuming that the accusations are “true.” Instead, the inclusion of these statements

²⁶ It is worth noting that a number of conversos were also accused of participating in deviant speech acts and behaviors, such as the recitation of prayers in Hebrew. However, because of its tacitility, material objects were more often referenced as indicators of heresy.

²⁷ “*Tenia vn crucifix en su casa e lo a çotaua los viernes en las tardes*” Ibid.

²⁸ “*Iten, que la dicha Mari Gonsales, como infiel e non creyendo nuestra Santa Fe Catholica e en vituperio della, vna vez, dandole vna tabla en que estaua pintada la ymagen de Nuestra Señora la Virgen Maria, ella la tomo, e como la ovo tornado, con burla y escarnio que della hizo, la arrajo en vn albañar muy suzio que estaua cabe la cozina, e despues de asi echada la dicha ymagen la escopio.*” Beinart, vol. 2, 248.

within the written record reveals Christian anxieties over mistreatment of sacred objects by non-believers.²⁹

The accusations are also extremely interesting in that they coincide with popular stories found across Europe throughout the middle ages. The inclusion of similar stories within the late-thirteenth century *Cantigas de Santa Maria* suggests the availability and popularity of comparable stories within medieval Castile.³⁰ The *Cantigas de Santa Maria* is a collection of songs celebrating the miracles of the Virgin compiled by Alfonso X, King of Castile y León. The text and coordinating illustrations provides a compendium of High Medieval religious legends from across Europe.³¹ As such, the stories contained within the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* reveal ways in which medieval persons understood and interacted with material culture as a component of their religious beliefs. Stories including non-Christians are extremely prevalent and reveal Christian perceptions of Jewish otherness in relation to Christian religious practices.³²

In *cantiga* thirty-four, entitled “How Holy Mary got even with the Jew for the dishonor he did to Her image,” a Jew in Constantinople stole an image of the Virgin. After taking it home “he threw it into the privy, then he sat down there and desecrated it shamefully.”³³ The image is then rescued by a good Christian who washed it and “put it in a proper place and made offerings

²⁹ For a description of the texts, see J. Trachtenberg, *The Devil and the Jews: The Medieval Conception of the Jew and Its Relation to Modern Antisemitism* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1943): 109-117. For related imagery see Michael Camille, *The Gothic Idol: Ideology and Image-making in Medieval Art* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1989): 186-189.

³⁰ The *Cantigas de Santa Maria* survives in four thirteenth century manuscripts, all of which are associated with the patronage of Alfonso X. The most richly decorated is the Escorial Manuscript T.I.1, which includes 195 cantigas, each followed by either single folio or double-folio multi-paneled illuminations.

³¹ See Joseph O’Callaghan, *Alfonso X and the Cantigas de Santa Maria*, Leiden: Brill, 1998, and Martin Cunningham, *Alfonso X El Saio: Cantigas de Loor*, Dublin: University College Dublin Press, 2000.

³² Pamela Patton, “Constructing the Inimical Jew in the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*: Theophilus’ Magician in Text and Image” *Beyond the Yellow Badge: Anti-Judaism, Anti-Semitism and Europe before 1800* (Leiden: Brill, 2008): 233-256.

³³ “*en ssa cas’a foi deitar na camara privida / des I assentous’ss’ aly e fez gran faliment*” translation by Kathleen Kulp-Hill, *Songs of Holy Mary of Alfonso X: A Translation of the Cantigas de Santa Maria*, (Tempe, AZ: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 2000): 45.

to it for his salvation.”³⁴ The Virgin rewarded the Christian for properly attending to her in depicted form by “performing a great miracle there. A substance like oil issued from that image in great abundance.”³⁵ Both María González and the unnamed Jew of Constantinople mistreated with the most base of materials, objects that depict the Mother of God, and both received severe punishment for their actions. Similarly, the accusation against Juan Díaz also correlates to a miracle story within the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*. In *cantiga* twelve the Christians of Toledo discovered in the Jewish quarter “an image of Jesus Christ, which the Jews were striking and spitting upon. . . the Jews had made a cross upon which they intended to hang the image.”³⁶ Unlike the accusation against Juan Díaz, it is the entire Jewish ghetto which has come together to do harm to an image of Christ. Again, punishment of the offender holds a prominent position within the narrative.

The similarities between the accusations against fifteenth and sixteenth-century *conversos* in Ciudad Real and miracle stories recorded in the thirteenth-century *Cantigas de Santa Maria* suggest that anxieties over the abuse of religious objects by non-Christians was an ongoing concern for the Christian community. The accusations also converge with traditional understandings of the Jews as explicit enemies of Christ. Since the earliest days of Christianity, scholars and theologians have understood the very existence of Jews as validating the New Testament narrative.³⁷ By the twelfth century, writers such as Bernard of Clairveaux, recast the Jews as complicit in the murder of Christ.³⁸ The threat posed to images of Mary and Christ was

³⁴ “*en bon logar a pos e fez-lle comprimento, / de quant’ ouve de fazer por ayer salvamento*” trans: *ibid.*, 46.

³⁵ “*mui gran demostraça / fez y a Madre de Deus, que d’ oyo semellança / correu daquela omage grand’ avondamento, / que ficasse deste feito por renenbramento*” Trans: *Ibid.*

³⁶ “*omagen de Jeso-Crist’, a que ferir / yan os judeus e cospir-lle na faz. . . E sen aquest’, os judeus / fezeran a cruz fazer / en que aquela omagen*” trans: *Ibid.*, 19.

³⁷ See Joshua Trachtenberg, *The Devil and the Jews: The Medieval Conception of the Jew and Its Relation to Modern Antisemitism*, New Haven: Yale University Press, 1943.

³⁸ Jeremy Cohan, *Living Letters of the Law: Ideas of the Jew in Medieval Christianity*, University of California Press, 1999.

particularly vexing due to medieval and early modern conceptions of the relationship between likeness and presence. Painted and sculpted images were believed to provide location for divine interaction in the material world.³⁹ This equation of spirit and substance is predicated on complex theological discourse of the incarnation and transubstantiation. Because Christ encapsulated himself in a material form reflective of God's image, depictions of Jesus reveal both his physical as well as godly nature.⁴⁰ Images of Christ were also closely associated with the Eucharist, the material object which most directly reveals his spiritual presence within pre-reformation Christianity.⁴¹ The relationship between material and spiritual is then conflated visually in images of the Mystical Mass of St. Gregory. According to legend, during a mass held by Pope Gregory the Great, Christ miraculously appeared during the raising of the host, revealing himself as truly present in the Eucharist via visual display. The ability of images of Christ, Mary, and the Saints to serve as potential loci for interaction between human and divine indicated by shifts in materiality is further suggested by *cantiga* 34. The exuding of oil by the painted image, a substance closely associated with the relics of saints, reveals the physical object of the painted image as bodily matter through which the Virgin is spiritually present.

Therefore, accusations of image abuse are particularly poignant as they suggest attacks upon Christ and Mary themselves through their material figuration. For medieval and early modern Christians, Jews were the direct enemies of Christ and would therefore always make attempts to harm him, ever since their primary role in the crucifixion narrative.⁴² The

³⁹ Freedberg, especially pages 283-316.

⁴⁰ Belting, 152. This relationship between image and spirit is epitomized by the relic of Veronica's Veil, see Herbert Kessler, "Configuring the Invisible by Copying the Holy Face," *The Holy Face and the Paradox of Representation: Papers from a Colloquium held at the Bibliotheca Heriziana, Rome and the Villa Spelman, Florence, 1996*, eds., Herbert Kessler and Gerhard Wolf, eds., (Bologna: Nuova Alfa Editoriale, 1998): 129-151.

⁴¹ S. Gerstel, "Mandylion and Eucharist," *Abstract of Papers. Nineteenth Annual Byzantine Studies Conference*, (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993): 27.

⁴² See Trachtenberg, especially 109-123, and Gavin Langmuir, "The Tortures of the Body of Christ" *Christendom and Its Discontents: Exclusion, Persecution, and Rebellion, 1000-1500* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press,

appearance of accusations of Jewish abuse against images of Christ and Mary within the Ciudad Real Inquisition trials reveals the continuation of such pejorative conceptions of Jews as well as the Christian understanding of images as loci for divine presence. These accusations are also theologically related to the most popular of all accusations against Jews, attacks by Jews on the consecrated host.⁴³

The inclusion of such references within the Ciudad Real Inquisition trials reveals the continuation of these anxieties for Early Modern Christians. Central was the belief that Jews are the malicious enemies of Christ. Such stories then reaffirm stereotypes by reinserting the narrative into the lived present. In the same way, the accusations reassert Christian attitudes toward their own religious objects. The perceived desires of Juan Díaz and María González to desecrate material objects conversely provides evidence of the power of these objects themselves as capable of inciting such desire.

Ritualized Objects and Objectified Ritual

In the arraignments of Juan Díaz and María González, an accusation of abuse to Christian images is only one of many enumerated heretical activities. Both were also accused of observing the Sabbath with the lighting of candles and the donning of clean festival clothes as well as observing dietary restrictions. These actions and interactions with materiality serve to prove heretical Jewish practices through their direct association with Jewish ritual.

1996): 287-309. For the representation in visual culture, see Debra Strickland, *Saracens, Demons, and Jews: Making Monsters in Medieval Art*, (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003): 107-118 and Vivian Mann and Thomas Glick, *Uneasy Communion: Jews, Christians, and the Altarpieces of Medieval Spain*, New York: Museum of Biblical Art, 2010.

⁴³ See Miri Ruben, "Imagining the Jew: the Late Medieval Eucharistic Discourse" *In and Out of the Ghetto: Jewish-Gentile Relations in Late Medieval and Early Modern Germany* (Washington D. C.: Cambridge University Press, 1995): 177-208 and Robert Stacey, "From Ritual Crucifixion to Host Desecrations: Jews and the Body of Christ," *Jewish History* (1998): 11-28.

While the evidence presented against Ciudad Real *conversos* existed in the form of witness testimonies, the proof of crypto-Judaism was firmly planted in the material world.⁴⁴ For example, the lighting of candles indicated observance of the Jewish Sabbath in fifty-two of the on-hundred twenty-four existent case files. In contrast, only fourteen include accusations of celebrating Passover. As candles were the predominate form of interior lighting, it is not clear based specifically on the wording of many of the arrangements how witnesses were able to differentiate between candles lit for illumination from candles lit for ritual. Therefore, it must be assumed that other contextual clues alerted the witness to the specific intent of an almost universal activity.

In the arraignment of María Gonzalez, the lighting of candles is described in explicit detail providing an example of the ways in which context clues concerning both the material form of ritualized objects and the specifics of use indicated judaizing behavior. The full description reads:

II Item, that the said María González, on Friday nights, with prayers, did light and would light certain candles and oil lamps with new wicks earlier than the other nights of the week, and that she put these candles in a certain part of her house and placed them on a false pagan altar, and placed one grain of salt in the candle for the duration of the ritual, and on Friday nights, María González did not nor does not have other [lights], except for in front of this idolatrous statue, and as soon as it burned out they eat a meal unlike those had on the other nights of the week.⁴⁵

⁴⁴ The use of ritualized objects is dependent upon creation and consumption of such objects. See Jonathan Alexander, "The Butcher, The Baker, the Candlestick Maker: Images of Urban Labor, Manufacturing, and Shopkeeping from the Middle Ages," *Material Culture and Cultural materialism in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance*, (Turnhout: Brepols, 2001): 89-110 and Mary Douglas and Baron Isherwood, *The World of Goods: toward an anthropology of consumption*, New York: Routledge, 1979.

⁴⁵ "II Iten, que la dicha Mari Gonsales, los viernes en las noches, de Buena ora, hazia ençender y ençendia çiertos candiles linpios con mechas nuevas mas tenprano que las otras noches de entre semana, e que aquelloscandiles la dicha noche los ponía en çierta parte de su casa e no los amataua fasta que ellos mismos se amatauan e apagauan de suyo; e hazia echar vn grano de sal en el candil por que durase mas el azeyte; e que los dichos dias de veirnes en la noche la dicha Mari Gonsales no hazia hazienda ninguna, anges se estaua holgando, e desque avia çendo se yva luego a <a>costar, lo que otras noches de entre semana no hazia." Beinart, vol. 2, 247.

This case reveals how it is not the lighting of candles or lamps per se that was indicative of heretical practice, but the lighting of specific candles (newly wicked with salt added) at a specific time (earlier than other days of the week) on a specific day (Fridays) in a specific place (in a special room before a non-Christian object).

The preparation of the candles occasionally caused difficulties for *converso* women. In her confession, María González stated that “on the said Friday nights, soon after sunset, this confessant lit two clean lamps with new cotton wicks, and at other times the said slave Catalina lit them as commanded by this confessant. . . most often this confessant cleaned them and lit them, putting in new wicks so that the said maidservants and slave would not notice.”⁴⁶ This statement implies that not only was María González aware of her actions as contrary to the Edict of Faith, but also that she recognized the danger in having her actions observed by those in her household.⁴⁷ If the servant was responsible for replacing the wicks, but only when they burned out naturally, the material form of the candle would not adhere to the requirements of the ritual. If María González requested that the wicks be changed every Friday, Catalina would notice that the wicks were not always completely burned out. If María González took over the care of the lamps entirely, Catalina might wonder why the mistress was performing a servant’s tasks. Therefore, María González continuously altered her behavior in order to balance the material needs of her Judaic ritual and the possible suspicions of her servant. In her confession, María González does not address the placing of salt within the oil, nor the utilization of a special ritualistic space.

⁴⁶ “*E que los dichos viernes en las noches, tenprano despues de pusetto el sol, ençendia este confesante dos candiles limpios con mechas nuevas de algoden, e otras vezes los ençendia la dicha Catalina, esclaua, por mandado deste confessant. . . e que los mas vezes los alinpiaua este confesante e los ençendia poniendoles sus mechas nuevas, porque las dichas moças y esclaua non los syntiensen.*” Beinart, vol. 2, 250. Trans, Renée Melammed, *Heretics or Daughters of Israel? The Crypto-Jewish Women of Castile* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1999): 78.

⁴⁷ Melammed, 78-9. The need to hide non-Christian practices was also an issue for moriscos. See Mary Elizabeth Perry, *The Handless Maiden: Moriscos and the Politics of Religion in Early Modern Spain*, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2005, especially pages 65-87.

The clarification of these context clues within the specific example of María González indicates the ways in which Christian accusers understood object use within Judaic faith. The aspects of the accused activity which do not correspond with historical understandings of Judaic ritual, such as the placement of lights before an idolatrous image, indicate the early modern Christians translated Jewish practices into a Christian vocabulary. As has already been suggested, objects with figurations of Christ and Mary were important components in Christian lived religion. Therefore, it is assumed that Jewish ritual also includes a figurative image placed upon an altar, but by necessity this image is assumed to be idolatrous.

Candles and lamps also played an important role in Christian ritual. Donations of wax to be burnt before holy images, often made in the weight of the person making the donation, was an important form of votive reciprocity between human and divine agents through material objects.⁴⁸ Candles and candle sticks are an essential component of the Christian altar.⁴⁹ The Christian conception of Judaic ritual, exemplified by the arraignment of María González, assumes that Jews utilize candles and lights in a similar manner to Christian practices. The supposed witnessing of these context clues, such as the trimming of the wicks or the adding of salt, allowed the prosecution to implicate María González in heretical practice. It is probable that similar context clues were used but not recorded in the trial of Juan Díaz, who is accused of “honoring the Sabbath and guarding the Law of Moses with the lighting of candles on Friday.”⁵⁰ Therefore, it is not the lighting of the candles, nor even the lighting of candles within ritual that is problematic, but the lighting of candles in a ritualized manner outside explicitly Christianized

⁴⁸ Hugo van der Velden, *The Donor's Image: Gerard Loyet and the Votive Portraits of Charles the Bold*, (Turnhout: Brepols, 2000): 253-254.

⁴⁹ G. Dix, *The Shape of the Liturgy*, (London: Biddles, Ltd., 1945): 419-21 and V. Reinburg, “Liturgy and the Laity in Late Medieval and Reformation France,” *Sixteenth-Century Journal* (1992): 33.

⁵⁰ “*ençendiendo e consyntiendo ençender candiles los viernes en la noche por honra del sabado e guarda de la dicha Ley*” Beinart, vol. 1, 570.

practice. The assumption becomes, anything that deviates from standard Christian worship is by necessity heretical. Therefore, like the accusations of abuse toward Christian objects, accusations of Judaic ritual serve to re-affirm Christian practices by clearly articulating an acceptable norm from which all other actions can be assessed based upon their assimilation to conventional practice.

Another possibility is that the material form of the candles or requisite candle holders immediately revealed their ritualistic purpose. Such ritual-specific objects were produced in a variety of materials for differing socio-economic levels, ranging from complex golden forms to simple earthenware objects such as the fragment in the Museo de Teruel.⁵¹ Close connections between ritualized use and material form led to the specialization of other objects, such as illuminated Haggadot and Passover Plates used in the celebration of Passover.⁵² The development of ritualized forms also developed with regard to Christian objects. This is clearly exemplified by the standardization of the implements of the mass, such as the monstrance and chalice. This connection between the object, the material form, and the ritual use of objects was often underscored by accompanying visual decoration of inscriptions.⁵³ The conceptual inversion of this phenomenon of ritualized material objects is that the form of these objects reveals enacted ritual. Thus the witnessing of the existence and use of such ritual-specific objects would clearly and immediately reveal the beliefs and practices of one's neighbors. This

⁵¹ This object is discussed in *Convivencia: Jews, Muslims, and Christians in Medieval Spain*, edited by Vivian Mann, Thomas Glick, and Jerrilynn Dodds, (New York: George Braziller, 2007): fig. 65.

⁵² On the Passover Plate, see Leila Avrin "The Spanish Passover Plate in the Israel Museum" *Sefarad* 39 (1979): 27-46. For a discussion of Illuminated Haggadot see Katrin Kogman-Appel, *Illuminated Haggadot from Medieval Spain: Biblical Imagery and the Passover Holiday*, University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 2006, and Julie Harris, "Good Jew, Bad Jew, and no Jew at All: Ritual Imagery and Social Standards in the Catalan Haggadot," *Church, State, Vellum, Stone: Essays on Medieval Spain in Honor of John Williams* (New York: Brill, 2005): 275-296.

⁵³ See Patricia DeLeeuw, "Fragments of Ritual: The Liturgical Use of Objects in the Collection of Alexander Schnütgen," *Fragmented Devotion: Medieval Objects from the Schnütgen Museum Cologne*, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000): 31-39.

provides a second possibility in interpreting these accusations within the Ciudad Real Inquisitorial record, such as those made against Juan Díaz of simply “lighting candles.” The Christian understanding of Jewish objectified ritual as a recognition of perceived “sameness” within the distinction of “otherness” furthers the suggestion that the Inquisitorial court records reveal Christian perspectives via Christianized perception.⁵⁴ The close association between material objects and ritualized practice in Early Modern Christianity also explains the iconoclastic attacks by Northern European Protestants against catholic material culture in addition to figural devotional images.⁵⁵

Punishment and Material Presence

Once the accused had been granted a verdict, usually guilty, the sentence was carried out either independently or in a large public spectacle of mass punishment known as the *Auto de Fé*.⁵⁶ The accused processed through the streets, were each individually addressed by the Inquisitors, and released to their punishments.⁵⁷ Overtime, the *Auto de Fé* became a grandiose event held in the main plaza that drew large crowds from the surrounding countryside. The spectacle of the *Auto de Fé* required the production of material objects, including the scaffolding for the seating of Inquisitors and other important persons, the particular garments of the *San*

⁵⁴ This interpretation is in contrast to the studies by Haim Beinart and Renée Malmmed who attempt to reconstruct Spanish Judaic practices on the basis of Inquisition accusations and testimony. See Beinart, 1981 and Melammed, 1999.

⁵⁵ In Strasbourg, iconoclasts focused upon the items associated with the altar and the ritual of the mass, possibly because local preachers had re-defined the Catholic ritual as idolatrous and blasphemous. Lee Palmer Wandel, *Voracious idols and violent hands: Iconoclasm in Reformation Zurich, Strasbourg, and Basel*, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995, especially 103-148. In Germany, acts of iconoclasm are closely allied with Catholic ritual, especially localized popular devotional practices. Robert Scriener. “Ritual and Reformation.” *Popular Culture and Popular Movements in Reformation Germany*. (London: The Hambledon Press, 1987): 103-122

⁵⁶ It should be noted that recent scholarship has emphasized the Inquisition’s use of other forms of punishment, particularly for cases of minor heresy. For example, see Kamen, 1992, 198-213. However, as the population discussed here were all tried for major heresy during the first fifty years of Inquisitorial activity, the proportion of crime and punishment should be understood as reflective of this specific moment rather than to a more general conception of Inquisitorial activity.

⁵⁷ Kamen, 207-208.

Benito, a specific garment composed of a tunic emblazoned with the symbols of the Inquisition and a large conical head piece, this ensemble was worn during the procession of the accused, and candles to be carried in procession. The pinnacle of this ritualistic spectacle was capital punishment by fire for those condemned to burn at the stake.

Between 1483 and 1527, one-hundred twenty-seven verdicts were read against Ciudad Real *conversos*.⁵⁸ Of these, seven were absolved of their charges, twenty received reconciliation, that is harsh punishment followed by cultural isolation but still able to participate in the Catholic Faith, and one-hundred were condemned to burn at the stake. For those sentenced to capital punishment by fire, the material composition of the physical body varied between three possible states.

The majority of convicted Ciudad Real *conversos* were burned at the stake in bodily form. The case of María González records that “the prosecuting attorney has fully proven his intention, and the said María González is found to be a heretic. . . it is declared that the said María González for impenitent false and erroneous beliefs is relaxed and will be relaxed to the secular arm.”⁵⁹ On September 4, 1513 in the Plaza de Zocodóver of Toledo “the tribunal was above on the scaffold, and the said María González on another wooden platform, was read and announced the said sentence.”⁶⁰ The description of the proceedings, though brief, indicates that María González was burned alive. She presumably participated in the procession, listened to the

⁵⁸ The difference in number between number of cases and the number of verdicts is due to two factors. Firstly, some cases reference two separate individuals. For example, the Trial of Beatriz González, Wife of Juan de la Sierra, also includes her daughter Leonor and her sister-in-law Isabel González, Wife of Rodrigo (Beinart, vol. 2, 156-188). These women were tried as a group by the Inquisition but they were each subjected to punishment in the *Auto de Fé*. Other cases, such as the trial of María González, were conducted in multiple phases with multiple sentences passed.

⁵⁹ “*Fallamos el dicho promotor fiscal aver provado enteramente su intencion, e la dicha Maria Gonsales aver seydo y ser hereja. . . que devemos declarar e declaramos a la dicha Maria Gonçales por ficta e symulada confitente e inpenitente, y que la devemos relaxer e relaxamos a la justia e braço seglar.*” Ibid, vol. 2, 316.

⁶⁰ “*ençima de vn cadahalso, pro tribunal sedendo, e estando la dicha Mari Gonçales en otro tabado de Madera, fue leyda e publicada esta dicha sentençia a alta bos yntelegible*” Ibid, vol. 2, 317.

sermons, and was observed by the witnesses in bodily form. Forty-three other convicted *conversos* were burned alive at the stake.

Conversos whose trials were conducted post mortem or who died during the trial process were not excused from punishment in the *Auto de Fé*. Isabel de los Olivos y López, wife of Diego Sánchez de Madrid, died while in custody.⁶¹ The trial process, however, continued for several weeks while additional testimony was collected. On July 13, 1513, the *Consulta de Fe* handed out a guilty verdict and sentenced Isabel de los Olivos y López “to major excommunication and the other penalties and censures against apostate heretics. . . and instead of her person her statue will be relaxed to the secular arm.”⁶² Much like María González, a statue of Isabel de los Olivos y López was placed on a wooden structure in the plaza of Toledo before the Inquisitional tribunal.⁶³ While Isabel de los Olivos y López was not physically present as a living corporal being, her presence was made possible through the transportation of her remains. The sentencing document describes how “because of the serious crime, her body and bones will be unearthed from where they are and the said things taken to the secular arm, so that justice can be made of them.”⁶⁴ That is to say, the bodily remains of Isabel de los Olivos y López were exhumed and sent to Toledo to be burned. Thus the condemned participated corporally in the *Auto de Fé* via both bodily matter and sculpted likeness. Seventeen other Ciudad Real *conversos* were burned post mortem through their body and bones.

Even when the bodily remains are not available, as for persons who were living in exile, the Inquisition tribunal continued to dispense punishment. Almost a quarter of those condemned

⁶¹ Ibid, vol. 2, 540.

⁶² “*en setençia dexcommunion mayor e en las otras penas e çensuras contra los tales hereges apostates. . e en lugar de su persona relaxamos su estatua a la justiçia e braço seglar.*” Ibid, vol. 2, 589.

⁶³ Ibid., vol. 2, 590.

⁶⁴ “*Y en detestaçion de tan grave crimen, mandamus que su cuerpo y huesos sean desenterrados de qualquier lugar donde estoviesen enterrados, y que aquellos sean entregados a la dicha justice seglar, para que haga dellos lo que sea justiçia*” Ibid., vol. 2, 298.

to the flames, thirty-seven of all accounts of corporal punishment, were conducted through effigies. It is difficult to assess the visual form of these effigies, referred to in the notarial records as *estatua*, due to their imminent destruction. The effigies were most likely stuffed cloth in a humanoid shape.⁶⁵ Painting may have been used to create a representational likeness of the individual visage. It is unlikely, however, that the effigies were completely individualized in accordance with modern conceptions of portraiture. The effigies would also be dressed in the *San Benito* just as the living persons who participated in the *Auto de Fé*. The effigies were then carried by surrogates within the procession who assisted in manipulating the effigy through the individualized ceremony, such as the reading of the sentence. Juan de Teva, a draper from Ciudad Real, fled to Portugal when his family began to be questioned by the Inquisition.⁶⁶ The language of the sentencing and documentation of punishment is remarkably similar to that of María González and Isabel de los Olivos y López. Juan de Teva was sentenced to be “relaxed to the justice of the secular arm, and it is commanded that a statue of the said Juan de Teva be sent in place of his person.”⁶⁷ However, unlike Isabel de los Olivos y López, Juan de Teva is not bodily present at the *Auto de Fé* in any manner besides the sculpted likeness. It is the visual and material object which constitutes his participation in the ritualized action of the spectacle.

The similarity in language and vocabulary between the three examples indicates on the one hand the formulaic nature of the court record. At the same time, no distinction is made between the three forms of physicality. All three are sentenced to being “relaxed by the secular arm.” This suggests that all three forms of punishment were regarded as more or less equivalent with regards to efficacy.

⁶⁵ This analysis is based upon images of the *Auto de Fé*, such as the panel painting by Pedro Berruete from 1475, located in the Prado Museum.

⁶⁶ *Ibid*, vol. 3, 311.

⁶⁷ “*que le deueos relaxer e relaxamos a la justiçia e braço seglar, e mandamus que su estatua del dicho Juan de Teba sea entregada en lugar de su persona.*” *Ibid*.

The creation and burning of these effigies, material stand-ins for corporal existence, complicates the presentation of the body and spirit within the *Auto de Fé* and by extension Early Modern Spanish society. The ability of the institution of the Inquisition to inflict punishment across these states of physicality indicates an independent ability to define personhood. This power, however, is only available if the supporting community utilizes a world view in which spiritual essence and physical container are transient. Therefore, the translation of punishment across living tissues, dead tissues, and objectified tissues, suggests fluidity between person and body not dependent on specific material form. Instead, personhood is connected to physicality via likeness or relatedness.⁶⁸ A witness to the *Auto de Fé* in Cordoba on May 3, 1655, states that the effigies to be burned “bore such a resemblance to the flesh and blood sinner that no one in the crowd had doubts as to who was being condemned.”⁶⁹ Unfortunately, it is not clear how this individualization was accomplished. It is possible that the creators of the effigies utilized visual representation or by some other means such as equivocal weight or the inscribing of a name. No matter the type of individualization, the documents clearly state that a specific object was created as a substitution for the presence of a specific individual. This language creates a singular relationship between material form and spiritual person. The relationship can then be reversed, with the punishment inflicted upon the physical container directly effecting and altering the spiritual.⁷⁰

The Functions of Material Culture

The combined references to material culture within the one-hundred twenty-four Inquisition records from Ciudad Real, abuses to Christian objects, references to Jewish ritual

⁶⁸ On the issue of likeness in late medieval imagery, see Stephen Perkinson, *The Likeness of the King: A Prehistory of Portraiture in Late Medieval France*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009.

⁶⁹ Maureen Flynn, “Mimesis of the Last Judgment: The Spanish Auto de Fé,” *The Sixteenth-Century Journal* (1991): 284.

⁷⁰ Flynn, 290.

objects, and the burning of effigies, reveal a world in which materiality is closely associated with active agency.⁷¹ These references demonstrate that the flexible attitudes toward physical substance within Early Modern Spain were essential to the very functionality of the Inquisition. The analysis of references to the fluidity between objective states at the *Auto de Fé* allowed the institution of the Inquisition to construct a communal identity even as large numbers of *conversos* fled to other locations, be it Portugal or the afterlife. The reference to ritualized Judaic practices, such as the use of candles, further reveals the ability of the Inquisition to regulate systems of behavior by clearly delineating the line between acceptable and unacceptable practice. Testimony, such as that against María González, clarifies the specific ways in which actions deviate from the communal norm. One's heresy is highlighted through implicit comparison with conventional modes of behavior, filtered through a Christianized conception of ritual. In the same way, the references to attacks on Christian religious objects also strengthen the identity of the Christian majority. By presenting the crypto-Jew as an attacker of Christ, contemporary Christians re-experienced the historical passion narrative within the present, validating their own belief system as a current shared experience, including the persons of Christ and Mary within the active members of the lived community.

The analysis of references to material culture within the Inquisition trial records from Ciudad Real suggests a world in which the material object and constructions of personhood were still fluid.⁷² However, the situations in which material objects assert themselves as entities were becoming encapsulated. The accusation of abuse directed toward Christian visual culture reflect

⁷¹ Material culture also played an important role in the development of Christianized civic identity in newly conquered Granada. See David Coleman, *Creating Christian Granada: Society and Religious Culture in an Old-World Frontier City*, Ithica, NY: Cornell University Press, 2003, and Katie Harris, *From Muslim to Christian Granada: Inventing a City's Past in Early Modern Spain*, Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2008.

⁷² Perhaps it is this fluidity of material agency that allowed Castilian missionaries to incorporate Christian conceptions into their new environments across the empire. See Stuart Schwartz, *All Can Be Saved: Religious Tolerance and Salvation in the Iberian Atlantic World*, New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008, and Bauvin Bailly, *Art on the Jesuit Missions in Asia and Latin America 1542-1773*, Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2003.

medieval conceptions of likeness, identity, and agency predicated upon legend and miracle.⁷³

The utilization of objects within Jewish ritual, the most prevalent reference to materiality within the court records, supposes a symbolic relationship which then becomes dominant in the modern world view. The lighting of candles functions as a sign of ritualistic activity due to its close association with the ritual, but the candle itself is not an active participant. In between these two concepts lies the use of effigies in the *Auto de Fé*. While this function of material culture utilized conceptions of likeness and spiritual essence similar to medieval animism, these connections were controlled by the governing institution itself. The Inquisitional body, through the articulation of its tribunal members, dictated which objects were active agents in which place and at what time.⁷⁴ Perhaps this institutional appropriation of the power to define the power of material culture reveals one vehicle through which early modern society negotiated the complex socio-cultural shift from non-modern to modern.

⁷³ Ernst Kitzinger, in his foundational article on pre-iconoclastic byzantine image theory, argues that theologians perceived material objects as dangerous precisely because they operated outside ecclesiastic control. Ernst Kitzinger, "The Cult of Images in the Age before Iconoclasm," *Dumbarton Oaks Papers*, vol. 8 (1954): 83-150.

⁷⁴ As the Inquisition standardized and codify religious beliefs and practices, even the actions of pious Christians became re-defined as problematic. See Gretchen Starr-LeBea, *In the Shadow of the Virgin: Inquisitors, Friars, and Converso in Guadalupe, Spain*, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003.

UNIVERSITY OF NEW MEXICO
LATIN AMERICAN AND IBERIAN INSTITUTE
RESEARCH PAPER SERIES

1. Guess, George M. "Bureaucracy and the Unmanaged Forest Commons in Costa Rica." December 1979.
2. Lupsha, Peter A., and Kip Schlegel. "The Political Economy of Drug Trafficking: The Herrera Organization (Mexico and the United States)." November 1980.
3. Gregory, Peter. "Employment, Unemployment, and Underemployment in Latin America." March 1981.
4. Levy, James, and Nick Mills, Jr. "The Challenge to Democratic Reformism in Ecuador." June 1981.
5. Gregory, Peter. "Legal Minimum Wages as an Instrument of Social Policy in Less Developed Countries, with Special Reference to Costa Rica." July 1981.
6. Díez-Canedo, Juan. "Undocumented Migration to the United States: A New Perspective." August 1981.
7. Sabloff, Paula L. W. "*Caciquismo* in Post-Revolutionary Mexican *Ejido*-Grant Communities." September 1981.
8. Gregory, Peter. "Economic Development and the Labor Market in Mexico." November 1981.
9. Earley, Stephen. "Arms and Politics in Costa Rica and Nicaragua, 1948-1981." May 1982.
10. Wessman, James W. "Peasants, Capitalists, and the State: Mexico's Changing Agricultural Policies and the 'Hungarian Project'." May 1982.
11. Conniff, Michael L. "Black Labor on a White Canal: West Indians in Panama, 1904-1980." May 1983.
12. Froehlich, Jeffery W., and Karl H. Schwerin. "Conservation and Indigenous Human Land Use in the Río Plátano Watershed, Northeast Honduras." June 1983.
13. Bales, Fred V. "Comparing Media Use and Political Orientation among Squatter Settlers of Two Latin American Countries." June 1983.
14. Sabloff, Jeremy A., Patricia A. McAnany, Bernd Fahmel Beyer, Tomás Gallareta N., Signa L. Larralde, and LuAnn Wandsnider. "Ancient Maya Settlement Patterns at

- the Site of Sayil, Puuc Region, Yucatán, Mexico: Initial Reconnaissance (1983)." January 1984.
15. Santley, Robert S., Ponciano Ortiz Ceballos, Thomas W. Killion, Philip J. Arnold, and Janet M. Kerley. "Final Field Report of the Maticapan Archaeological Project: The 1982 Season." June 1984.
 16. Morris, Nancy E. "*Canto porque es necesario cantar: The New Song Movement in Chile, 1973-1983.*" July 1984.
 17. Sabloff, Jeremy A., Gair Tourtellot, Bernd Fahmel Beyer, Patricia A. McAnany, Diana Christensen, Sylviane Boucher, and Thomas R. Killion. "Settlement and Community Patterns at Sayil, Yucatán, Mexico: The 1984 Season." April 1985.
 18. Brajer, Victor. "An Analysis of Inflation in the Small, Open Economy of Costa Rica." June 1986.
 19. Ashley, John M. "The Social and Environmental Effects of the Palm-Oil Industry in the *Oriente* of Ecuador." October 1987.
 20. Hidalgo, Margarita. "Perceptions of Spanish-English Code-Switching in Juárez, Mexico." March 1988.
 21. Arnold, Philip J III. "Ceramic Production and Consumption in the Sierra de los Tuxtlas, Veracruz, Mexico." June 1988.
 22. Gregory, Peter. "Undocumented Migration to the United States: Can the Flow Be Stemmed?" May 1989.
 23. White, Thomas U. "Mexican Immigrant Labor: An Alternative Analysis and Policy Proposal." November 1989.
 24. Lipski, John M. "On the Non-Creole Basis for Afro-Caribbean Spanish." February 1993.
 25. Lamadrid, Enrique R. "Treasures of the *Mama Huaca*: Oral Tradition and Ecological Consciousness in Chinchaysuyu." May 1993.
 26. Lipski, John M. "New Perspective on Afro-Dominican Spanish: the Haitian Contribution." May 1994.
 27. Tarver, Gina McDaniel. "Issues of Otherness and Identity in the Works of Izquierdo, Kahlo, Artaud, and Breton." April 1996.
 28. Craib, Raymond B., III. "Chinese Immigrants in Porfirian Mexico: A Preliminary Study of Settlement, Economic Activity, and Anti-Chinese Sentiment." May 1996.

29. Bannister, Geoffrey J. "The Economic Context of the Mexican Crisis." September 1996.
30. Elinore M. Barrett. "The Geography of Rio Grande Pueblos Revealed by Spanish Explorers, 1540-1598." May 1997.
31. Clark, Charles. "The Delegitimation of Land Tenure in Tropical Petén, Guatemala." May 1998.
32. Black, Chad T. "The Making of an Indigenous Movement: Culture, Ethnicity, and Post-Marxist Social Praxis in Ecuador." May 1999.
33. Howe, Alyssa Cymene. "Re-Engendering Revolution: Nicaraguan Gay and Lesbian Rights and the Sex of Post-Sandinismo." May 1999.
34. Medrano, Feliza. "*Ni chicha ni limonada*: Depictions of the Mulatto Woman in Cuban Tobacco Art." May 1999.
35. Stocker, Karen. "*No somos nada*: Ethnicity and Three Dominant and Contradictory Indigenist Discourses in Costa Rica." June 2000.
36. Eckmann, Teresa. "Chicano Artists and Neo-Mexicanists: (De) Constructions of National Identity." July 2000.
37. Archer, Rachel Elaine. "Society, Culture, and Heroes: Depictions of Cuban Heroine Mariana Grajales Cuello, 1893-2000." July 2001.
38. Burke, Nancy J. "Pre-Paid Phone Cards, *Cosas*, and Photos of the Saints: Transnational *Santería* Practices in a Southwest City." July 2002.
39. Fiala, Robert and Susan Tiano. "Maquila Employment and Fertility in Mexicali, Mexico: A Study of the Dynamics of Productive and Reproductive Relations." June 2003.
40. Rice, Roberta. "Channeling Discontent: The Impact of Political Institutions on Patterns of Social Protest in Contemporary Latin America." June 2003.
41. Santley, Robert S. "Ranchoapán: The 'New Obsidian' City of the Tuxtlas?" June 2004.
42. Ingram, Matthew. "Political Justice: Sub-national Determinants of Judicial Efficiency in Mexico, 1993-2000." June 2004.
43. Kerevel, Yann. "Re-examining the Politics of U.S. Intervention in Early 20th Century Nicaragua: José Madriz and the Conservative Restoration." November 2006.

44. Avila, Theresa. "Emiliano Zapata: Figure, Image, Symbol." July 2007.
45. Cárdenas-Rotunno, Anthony J. "Fray Alonso de Benavides's *Memoriales* of 1630 and 1634: Preliminary Observations." July 2007.
46. Gascón, Margarita. "The Defense of the Spanish Empire and the Agency of Nature. Araucanía, Patagonia and Pampas during the Seventeenth Century." August 2008.
47. Cárdenas-Rotunno, Anthony J. "The 1525 Cromberger Crónica del Cid: From Press to Lap." November 2008.
48. Ribeiro, Ludmila. "*Impunidade no sistema de justiça criminal brasileiro: Uma revisão dos estudos produzidos sobre o tema.*" August 2009.
49. Benavides Vanegas, Farid Samir. "Criminal Law as a Constitutive Strategy: The Colombian Case." August 2009.
50. Cárdenas-Rotunno, Anthony J. "Alfonso X, St. James, and the Virgin." September 2009.
51. Tompkins, Cynthia. "A Deleuzian Approach to Carlos Reygadas's *Stellet Licht* [Silent Light] (2008)." November 2010.
52. Byrd, Steven. "The lexicon of Calunga and a Lexical Comparison with other Forms of Afro-Brazilian Speech from Minas Gerais, São Paulo, and Bahia." November 2010.
53. García Otero, Maria José. "*Negociación de 'mestizaje' e identidad nacional nicaragüense en la obra teatral El Güegüense o Macho Ratón.*" November 2010.
54. Massholder, Alexia. "*El pensamiento intelectual comunista en Argentina: Una relectura de Héctor P. Agosti y su introducción al pensamiento de Gramsci.*" October 2011.
55. Weiss, Jessica Weiss. "Inquisitive Objects: Material Culture and *Conversos* in Early Modern Ciudad Real." November 2011

NAFTA/MERCOSUR WORKING PAPER SERIES

1. Alejandro Frigerio. "*La expansión de religiones afro-brasileñas en el Cono Sur: Representaciones conflictivas de cultura, raza y nación en un contexto de integración regional.*" July 2000.
2. B. Paglieri and P. Sanguinetti. "Institutional Issues and the Results of the Tariff and Non-Tariff Liberalization in Mercosur." July 2000.
3. Randall R. Parish, Jr. "Stability without Hegemony: Brazil, Argentina, and Southern Cone Integration." July 2000.

OCCASIONAL PAPER SERIES

1. Remmer, Karen L. "The Chilean Military under Authoritarian Rule, 1973-1987." March 1988.
2. Davidson, Russ. "A Description of Rare and Important Medina Imprints in the University of New Mexico Library." May 1988.
3. Martz, John D. "The Military in Ecuador: Policies and Politics of Authoritarian Rule." June 1988.
4. Torres, Victor F. "The Canudos War Collection." May 1990.
5. Claire-Lise Bénaud and Oscar E. Delepiani. "OAXACA: A Critical Bibliography of Rare and Specialized Materials in the University of New Mexico's General Library." March 1992.

SPECIAL PUBLICATIONS

1. Davidson, Russ and Joiner, Carol. "Mexico in the UNM Libraries: A Guide To Special Materials and Older Works." Spring 1986.
2. Kjeldgaard, Linda, editor. "Encuentro: A Columbian Quincentenary Quarterly". 1985 - 1989.
3. Kjeldgaard, Linda, editor. "Encounters: A Quincentenary Review." 1989.
4. Landmann, Robert S., editor. "The Problem of the Undocumented Worker." Spring 1980.