

1994

Constructing the Penitent Brothers: Charles F. Lummis and the Orientalization of New Mexico

Charles F. Lummis

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/shri_publications

Recommended Citation

Lummis, Charles F.. "Constructing the Penitent Brothers: Charles F. Lummis and the Orientalization of New Mexico." (1994).
https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/shri_publications/46

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Southwest Hispanic Research Institute at UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in SHRI Publications by an authorized administrator of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact disc@unm.edu.



UNIVERSITY OF NEW MEXICO, ALBUQUERQUE, NEW MEXICO 87131

**CONSTRUCTING THE PENITENT BROTHERS:
CHARLES F. LUMMIS AND
THE ORIENTALIZATION OF NEW MEXICO**

By
Ramón Gutierrez, Ph.D.
University of California, San Diego



**Southwest
Hispanic
Research
Institute**

NOTE: Do Not Copy or Quote Without Permission of Author.

**CONSTRUCTING THE PENITENT BROTHERS:
CHARLES F. LUMMIS AND
THE ORIENTALIZATION OF NEW MEXICO**

By
Ramón Gutiérrez, Ph.D.
University of California, San Diego

1994

A Seminar Paper Presented At:

Summer 1994 Seminar
"Hispanic Expressive Culture and Contemporary Public Discourse"

Hosted By:
Southwest Hispanic Research Institute
The University of New Mexico
1829 Sigma Chi Rd., NE
Albuquerque, NM 87131-1036

(505)277-2965

Funded by a grant from:
Humanities Fellowship Program
Division for the Arts & Humanities
The Rockefeller Foundation

SHRI Seminar Papers*
Summer 1994 Seminar
"Hispanic Expressive Culture and Contemporary
Public Discourse"

* * * * *

Michael Candelaria, "Images in Penitent Ritual and Santo Art, A Philosophical Inquiry Into the Problem of Meaning"

Ramón Gutiérrez, "Constructing the Penitent Brothers: Charles F. Lummis and the Orientalization of New Mexico"

Sylvia Rodríguez, "The Taos Fiesta: Invented Tradition and the Infrapolitics of Symbolic Reclamation"

Miguel Gandert, "*Retratos Mestizaje*: A Photographic Survey of Indo-Hispano Traditions of the *Río Grande* Corridor"

Enrique Lamadrid, "La Indita De San Luis Gonzaga": History, Faith, and Inter-Cultural Relations in the Evolution of a New Mexican Sacred Ballad

Olivia Arrieta, "*La Alianza Hispano Americana*, 1894-1965: An Analysis of Organizational Development and Maintenance"

Helen Lucero, "Hispanic Weavers of Northern New Mexico: Three Families"

Victor Alejandro Sorell, "Her Presence in Her Absence: New Mexican Images of *La Guadalupana*"

Genaro Padilla, "Autobiography: Reading and Hearing the Voices of My *Antepasados*"**

Mónica Espinosa, "A View from Within: Aurelio Macedonio Espinosa (1880-1958)"

Tey Diana Rebolledo, "Subverting the (Dis)course: *Mexicana/India* Voices in Southwestern Narratives"

Ana Perches, "*Ni de aquí ni de allá*: The Emergence of the Mexicano/Chicano Conflict"

Francisco Lomelí, "Background of New Mexico Hispanic Literature: Self-Referentiality as a Literary-Historical Discourse"

Gabriel Meléndez, "Contesting Social and Historical Erasure: Membership in *La Prensa Asociada Hispano-Americana*"

* Requests for copies must be made directly to each author.

** Available from publisher: My History, Not Yours: The Formation of Mexican American Autobiography, University of Wisconsin Press, 1993.

Constructing the Penitent

Brothers:

Charles F. Lummis

and the Orientalization of New

Mexico

by

Ramón A. Gutiérrez

Ethnic Studies Dept.

University of California, San Diego

La Jolla, California 92093-0414

Please do not cite or quote without the author's permission.

Standing before the members of the American Historical Association gathered in Chicago for their annual meeting, on July 12, 1893, Frederick Jackson Turner emphatically declared that the American frontier was no more. “[F]our centuries from the discovery of America, at the end of a hundred years of life under the Constitution, the frontier has gone, and with its going has closed the first period of American history.”¹ In the rest of Turner’s speech on “The Significance of the Frontier in American History,” he described the stages of frontier advance, the movement first to the Eastern Seaboard to escape English tyranny, then across the Allegheny Mountains, the Plains, the Rockies, and finally to the Pacific shore. Led by Indian traders, who cut a swath between barbarism and civilization, merchants, ranchers, farmers, military men and industrialists had followed.

Turner explained that American nationalism and American identity had been created through the process of westward expansion. “Nothing works for nationalism like intercourse within the nation. Mobility of population is death to localism, and the western frontier worked irresistibly in unsettling population. The effects reached back from the frontier and affected profoundly the Atlantic coast . . . In the crucible of the frontier the immigrants were Americanized, liberated and fused into a

mixed race, English in neither nationality or characteristics.”² On the frontier American individualism, democracy and American had been forged. Indeed, as Turner opined, the character of the American intellect had been born on the frontier.

“That coarseness and strength combined with acuteness and inquisitiveness, that practical, inventive turn of mind, quick to find expedients, that masterful grasp of material things, lacking in the artistic but powerful to effect great ends, that restless, nervous energy, that dominant individualism, working for good and for evil, and withal that buoyancy and exuberance which comes with freedom -- these are traits of the frontier, or traits called out elsewhere because of the existence of the frontier.”³

Frederick Jackson Turner closed his talk with an ominous, almost jingoistic note, reminding his audience that the American character had been built on imperial expansion: “Movement has been its dominant fact, and unless this training has no effect upon a people, the American intellect will continually demand a wider field for its exercise.”⁴

What does Frederick Jackson Turner and the closing of the frontier have to do with New Mexico and the Hermanos “Penitentes,” the topic of this essay? Bear with me for a moment. What I would like to do here is to examine the publications of one writer, Charles F. Lummis, and to show how his depictions of New Mexico must be read as part of a larger cultural project at the end of the nineteenth- and early twentieth century that the

closing of the frontier signified -- the construction of American national identity. Lest I lose you along the way, in brief, let me rehearse the various steps of my argument, before returning to each of them seriatim and more systematically.

The closing of the frontier, as Turner noted, was made possible by an integrated national market criss-crossed by railway links and highways, and interpolated by print journalism in the form of dailies and weeklies. For the first time it was possible to imagine the nation on a continental scale and to travel rather rapidly from coast to coast. With the closing of the frontier attention turned inward, to the strange corners of the republic, to the odd customs of its exotics, to the most picturesque scenes imaginable, thereby producing and feeding both the production and consumption of travel literature, and leading to the touristic marketing of New Mexico as the Land of Enchantment. It was in this period that the marketing of New Mexico as a tourist destination was first initiated by a capitalist class of financiers, philanthropists, journalists, writers, artists, and others, who saw in New Mexico a refuge from the machine age and modernity which they believed was producing faceless drowns, the obliteration of cultural differences and the standardization of mass-marketed commodities. In the quaint villages of New Mexico and in its

prehistoric sites was a preindustrial America, a vestige from that past that offered mystical and romantic repose. Here was "Our America," an America uncontaminated by the values of Europe, with aesthetic sensibilities quite independent of historic centers of fashion, and with cultures of creative genius that had constructed splendid edifices while Europe was still in the dark ages.

The individual who had the most important legacy in the marketing and promotion of New Mexico's cultures, and who claims to have coined the slogan "See America First," was Charles Fletcher Lummis. He, more than any other individual created the most enduring representations of New Mexico and of the Southwest. It was Lummis who constructed the Confraternity of Our Lord Jesus of Nazareth as the savage and fanatic "Penitent Brothers" for the Anglo touristic gaze. He too largely fixed the Anglo image of the Pueblo Indians, the Navajo, the Apache, and especially of the terrain. The Penitente discourse Lummis framed has been the frame of reference that has delimited and forged most outsider⁵ descriptions of the Confraternity ever since. Most important to this argument still is that the construction of Hispano spirituality, which we now think of as authentic and rooted in centuries of practice, was in fact, an orchestration, a fabrication of New Mexico's cultural entrepreneurs who

saw in such myth making the miracle of the dollar signs, as the work of Marta Weigle on the New Mexico tourist trade so excellently demonstrates.⁶

Charles F. Lummis: The Man

Charles Fletcher Lummis was born in Lynn, Massachusetts on March 1, 1859, to Harriet Waterman Fowler and Henry Lummis, a Methodist minister.⁷ Raised in Bristol and educated at the female seminary at which at father taught, young Charles was trained in the classics in preparation for a career at Harvard.⁸ In 1881, just days before his Harvard commencement, Charles Lummis suffered a "brain fever." To recuperate he moved to a farm in the Scioto Valley of Ohio and from there, in 1884, moved on to Los Angeles to accept the city editorship at the *Times*. Fashioning himself an avid athlete and outdoorsman, Lummis embarked on a 112 day walk from Ohio to Los Angeles, passing through St. Louis, Denver, Santa Fe, and Albuquerque, finally arriving on February 1, 1885. His trek across the Southwest, recorded in regular dispatches to the *Times*, became the substance of his book, *A Tramp Across the Continent* (published in 1892), and testament to his quasi-conversion from the values of a decadent, corrupt, Anglo-Saxon New England, to the vigor and salubrity of the multi-ethnic West.

Lummis thought of himself as a poet, an explorer, an adventurer, a folklorist, an archaeologist, an historian, and an editor. He was immoderate in his use of alcohol and tobacco and addicted to his work. In 1888, having ignored early symptoms of deteriorating health, Lummis suffered a stroke; his left side left paralyzed. Early in February of that year he traveled to San Mateo, New Mexico to recuperate, taking up residence at the hacienda of Amado Chaves and there creating a physical regime to regain his health. In the years that followed Charles Lummis suffered two more strokes and eventually moved to Isleta Pueblo. By early 1890 his health had been regained and it was in this decade that Lummis emerged as a popular writer on the Southwest, with articles in *Harper's*, *Youth's Companion*, *St. Nicolas*, *Century*, and *Scribner's*. His first book appeared in 1891, *A New Mexico David*, followed shortly by *Pueblo Indian Folk Tales* (later editions bore the title *The Man Who Married the Moon*). Other books followed in rapid succession: *A Tramp Across the Continent* (1892), *Some Strange Corners of Our Country* (1892), *The Land of Poco Tiempo* (1893), *The Spanish Pioneers* (1893), *The Gold Fish of Gran Chimu* (1896), *The Enchanted Burro* (1897), and *The King of the Broncos* (1897). These were all extremely popular books, writes literary historian Martin Padgett⁹, that cognitively mapped and narrated for his American

reading public "Our Wonderland of the Southwest -- Its Marvels of Nature -- Its Pageant of the Earth Building -- Its Strange People -- Its Centuried Romance."¹⁰

Late in 1893 Charles Lummis returned to Los Angeles, where he spent the rest of his life as a promoter of Indian causes, working tirelessly to restore the deteriorating California missions, and establishing the parameters of taste and authenticity in Indian crafts, particularly those of the Pueblo Indians. But his impact was profoundly felt in New Mexico even after his death in 1928, and ever more so to this day in 1994 as Santa Fe finally elected Patsy Trujillo, its first mayor who won on a "Control Tourism" campaign.

Charles Fletcher Lummis' written corpus on New Mexico is immense. Here we will focus only on the tome that contains his most extensive description of the Penitent Brothers, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*. The book was written in 1893, the very year Frederick Jackson Turner declared the frontier closed and aptly described the restless manhood that the frontier had engendered in men such as Lummis.

The Land of Poco Tiempo

The Land of Poco Tiempo consists of eleven chapters that are of two sorts. Beginning with a chapter also entitled "The Land of Poco Tiempo,"

the reader is asked to relax and escape into another world, a world not ruled by the grind of industrial pace. "Here is the land of poco tiempo -- the home of 'Pretty Soon.' Why hurry with the hurrying world? The 'Pretty Soon' of New Spain is better than the 'Now! Now!' of the haggard States. The opiate sun soothes to rest, the adobe is made to lean against, the hush of day-long noon would not be broken. Let us not hasten -- mañana will do. Better still, pasado mañana."¹¹ In the chapter that follows, "Lo' Who Is Not Poor," Lummis introduced his readers to the history and nobility of the Pueblo Indians. "For the Pueblo, the most striking ethnologic figure in our America to-day is emphatically an Indian who is not poor from any point of view. Physically, mentally, morally, socially, politically, he need not shun comparison with the average of his lately acquired countrymen; and he even affords luxuries to which the superior race has not yet risen."¹²

Once the Pueblo Indians were inscribed as a permanent feature in the landscape, the remaining chapters of the book are rapid linear tours to the remote corners of New Mexico. Written as if the reader is sitting in a railroad car or auto gazing out the window. Strange customs and exotic peoples rapidly pass one by, appearing and then quickly disappearing. Situated atop Acoma Pueblo, in Chapter 3, "The City In The Sky," Lummis

attests that here "one feels as in a strange, sweet, unearthly dream -- as among scenes and being more than human, whose very rocks are genii, and whose people swart conjurors . . . in its midst lies a shadowy world of crags so unearthly beautiful, so weird, so unique, that it is hard for the onlooker to believe himself in America, or upon this dull planet at all."¹³

Should one dare to see such unearthly weirdness, Lummis informs that Acoma is quite easy to reach, only a few miles south of the Atlantic & Pacific Railroad stations at Laguna and McCarty from "which places an Indian may be procured to transport the visitor by farm-wagon."¹⁴ The reader then learns about Acoma's history under Spanish rule, the town's physical organization, its people, its church, its waterworks, its architecture, and the surrounding landscape. The tour of "The City In The Sky" ends with Lummis telling his readers: "And as the rumbling farm-wagon jolts you back from your enchanted dream to the prosy wide-awake civilization, you shall go to be forever haunted by that unearthly cliff, that weird city, and their unguessed dwellers."¹⁵

After reading about the established sites of sedentary population in the first three chapters of *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, the remainder of the book, save a chapter on folk songs of romance and another on ancient ruins, is modeled as a set of tours that describe events in action, that

move forward in space in a linear, historical fashion. The chapter on "The Penitent Brothers" recounts a processional Way of the Cross, "The Chase of the Chongo," describes a foot race at Isleta Pueblo, "The Wanderings of Cochití," turns to the historic migrations of these people, "The Apache Warrior," on the peripatetic lifeways of this group, and "On the Trail of the Renegades," the pursuit of nomadic Indian raiders. These are all chapters in which the subjects of the narrative are in rapid movement over a linear (progressive) space that jettisons them forward in time and history to the 1893 present of Charles Lummis.¹⁶ In Lummis' rhetorical strategy, the static, motionless Pueblo Indians are described as picturesque and incredible relics of an America the readers really do not know, but should. The Mexicans and Navajo are deficient peoples, in the flux of history and in motion headed toward the improvement that intervention by Anglos will make possible. Lummis' Mexicans were "inbred and isolation-shrunken descendants of the Castilian world-finders . . . ignorant as slaves, and more courteous than kings; poor as Lazarus, and more hospitable than Croesus; Catholics from A to Izzard, except when they take occasion to be Penitentes . . ."¹⁷ The Navajo likewise were "sullen, nomad, horse-loving, horse-stealing, horse-living vagrants of the saddle; pagans, first, last, and all the time . . ."¹⁸ Curiously, the

unmarked ethnic category is Anglo, the position of power from which humans are estheticized by Lummis' particular design.

Egypt, the Orientalism, and New Mexico

Charles Lummis, in taking his readers to New Mexico, to *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, also explicitly took them on an Orientalist adventure to fantasies and hallucinations of Egypt, Bablyon, Assyria, and deepest, darkest Africa.

The brown or gray adobe hamlets [of New Mexico] . . . the strange terraced towns . . . the abrupt mountains, the echoing, rock-walled cañons, the sunburnt mesas, the streams bankrupt by their own shylock sands, the gaunt, brown, treeless plains, the ardent sky, all harmonize with unearthly unanimity. 'Picturesque' is a tame word for it. It is a picture, a romance, a dream, all in one. It is our one corner that is the sun's very own. Here he has had his way, and no discrepancy mars his work. It is a land of quaint, swart faces, of Oriental dress and unspelled speech; a land where distance is lost, and eye is a liar; a land of ineffable lights and sudden shadows; of polytheism and superstition, where the rattlesnake is a demigod, and the cigarette a means of grace, and where Christians mangle and crucify themselves -- the heart of Africa beating against the ribs of the Rockies.¹⁹

In chapter after chapter, in description after description, New Mexico was made knowable only through comparisons to exotic places of the literary imagination. The comparison that was most constant and most prominent was of New Mexico as the Orient, and more specifically, of New Mexico as Egypt. Describing the unique light on New Mexico,

Lummis wrote: "Under that ineffable alchemy of the sky, mud turns ethereal, and the desert is a revelation. It is Egypt, with every rock a sphinx, every peak a pyramid."²⁰ The residents of Acoma Pueblo were quaint, their "simplicity breathes an atmosphere of the mysterious. Tangibly they are plain, industrious farmers, strongly Egyptian in their methods . . ."²¹ The Indian pueblos at Taos, Zuni and Acoma, were, according to Lummis, built in the shape of "pyramid" blocks.²² Pueblo girls cloaked themselves in "modest, artistic Oriental dress . . ."²³ The Indian chongo was "The Egyptian queue in which both sexes dress their hair."²⁴ In the wind-eroded sand sculpture of the desert, Lummis saw an "insistent suggestion of Assyrian sculpture in its rocks. One might fancy it a giant Babylon . . ."²⁵ Pueblo political life formed "oases of approximate civilization in a continental desert of savagery. The Pueblo social organization is essentially . . . a military democracy, guided by a democratic theocracy . . . Moses the captain, and Aaron the high-priest, are here Siamese twins . . ."²⁶

That most of these descriptions were of the Pueblo Indians should not lead one to conclude that they were the only objects of Charles Lummis' Orientalism. Other social groups were also packaged as exotic Others. Writing about the Penitent Brothers, Lummis informed his readers

that the use of the whip as a means to grace was quite old, for "Herodotus tells us that the ancient Egyptians flogged themselves in honor of Isis. The boys of Sparta were whipped before the altar of Artemis Orthia."²⁷ The Apache were the "Bedouin of the New World," and the land they inhabited, a "Sahara, thirsty as death on the battlefield . . ."²⁸

When Lummis described New Mexico as Egypt and the Orient, he was harking back to an older theme that had long been inscribed in travel writing. The early Spanish settlers of New Mexico referred to the Pueblo Indians as Moors. The Indians carried "Moorish bows" (bows and arrows), they were said to worship in "mosques" (kivas), and according to Santa Fe's resident, Joseph de Armijo, who suffered from insomnia, his sleeplessness in 1749 was due to a fear that "the Moors might attack unexpectedly."²⁹ Similar Orientalist tropes were standard fare in Anglo-American travel writing of the eighteenth century forward, employed to give readers unfamiliar with a particular place some readily identifiable imaginary markers drawn from their own colonial histories, from travels to the Holy Land by their compatriots, and from their own readings of the Bible.³⁰ But equally important, writes Mary Louise Pratt, Egypt offered "one powerful model for the archeological rediscovery of America. There, too, Europeans were reconstructing a lost history through, and as,

‘rediscovered’ monuments and ruins.” By reviving indigenous history and culture as archaeology they were being revived as dead.³¹

Undoubtedly the presence of extensive archaeological zones, the visible presence of pyramids akin in size to those in Egypt, notes historian William B. Taylor, ignited orientalist images of Mexico as Egypt starting in the mid-eighteenth century. First among them was the Boston Scottish dame, Frances Calderón de la Barca. In the early 1840s she likened Mexico City’s dry season to “a perfect Egyptian desert.” Sullivan McColleston, a native of New Hampshire, in 1897 marveled that in Mexico “the surface of the land and the works of man wore the aspect of Syria and Mesopotamia. It struck us with amazement to find how the orient had fixed its seal upon this land.”³² Such comparisons were heightened by the fact that some of the travelers to Mexico, had previously written about their treks across Egypt. John Lloyd Stephens, for example, wrote *Incidents of Travel in Egypt, Arabia, Petraera, and the Holy Land* in 1837, before penning *Incidents of Travel in Yucatán* in 1843. The Mexico-Egypt link was made even more explicit in Channing Arnold and Frederick Forst’s 1909 book, *The American Egypt: A Record of Travel in Yucatan*.

In the mind of Charles Lummis what evoked the sights, sounds and smells of Egypt in New Mexico were the women who carried clay water

jars on their heads, the cool mud (adobe) houses that dotted the landscape, the donkey beasts of burden, the two-wheeled carretas or carts that were used in transportation, the desert sun, light, and heat, and the presence of sedentary and nomadic "primitives" amidst the ruins and abandoned architectural vestiges of former grand civilizations.

The political subtexts that these picturesque scenes comparable to Egypt were meant to evoke among Lummis' readers were critiques of New Mexican despotism, of religious fanaticism that had no place in a republic governed by Anglo Protestants, and a lament over the industrial age of American modernity and mass consumption. Like the Israelites that were led out of the darkness and idolatry of their Egyptian captivity, so too the peoples of New Mexico had to be freed from their "paganism" (read Roman Catholicism) and brought into the modern era. How this should be done differed for the three peoples Lummis recognized as existing in New Mexico -- the Pueblo Indians, the Navajo and the Mexicans. The sooner the later two disappeared the better. For only the Pueblo Indians were a true romance. Only they were picturesque. They were the true America that had to be preserved for Easterners.

Lummis expressed the greatest disdain in *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, about of the despotism that had developed under the rule of New Mexico's

Mexicans. For while the Pueblos had nurtured and sustained a communitarian democracy, the Mexican legacy was the slavery of peonage. The sheep herding economy was to blame.

[Sheep] rendered the Territory possible for three centuries, in the face of the most savage and interminable Indian wars that any part of our country ever knew. He fed and clothed New Spain, and made its customs, if not its laws. He reorganized society, led the fashions, caused the only machinery that was in New Mexico in three hundred years, made of a race of nomad savages the foremost of blanket-weavers, and invented a slavery which is unto this day in despite of the Emancipation Proclamation . . . Society gradually fell apart into two classes -- sheep-owners and sheep-tenders. One man at the beginning of this century had two million head of sheep, and kept twenty-seven hundred peons always in the field with them, besides the thousands more who were directly dependent . . . The social effects of such a system, wherein four-fifths of the Caucasian male population were servants to five to eight dollars a month to a handful of mighty amos, are not far to trace. The most conscientious of these frontier czars had perforce a power beside which the government was a nonentity; and the unscrupulous swelled their authority to an unparalleled extent. It was easy to get a few hundred poor shepherds into one's debt; and once in, the amo, with the aid of complaisant laws, took care that they should never get out. He was thenceforth entitled to the labor of their bodies -- even to the labor of their children. They were his peons--slaves without the expense of purchase. And peonage in disguise is still effective in New Mexico.³³

The fact that Charles Lummis was raised in a strict Methodist household and was associated with Presbyterian missionaries working among the Mexicans in New Mexico helps us understand why Lummis chose

biblical tropes for his construction of Spanish Catholic rituals in *The Land of Poco Tiempo*.³⁴ By taking his reader to a New Mexican Egypt to see the horrendous savagery of the Penitentes, he was by analogy using the Old Testament focus on Egypt as a land of non-believers as well as the captivity narrative of believers being led out of the darkness of paganism and into the light, to focus the horror he felt on seeing Mexican religious rites. New Mexico was, according to Lummis, "a land of ineffable lights and sudden shadows; of polytheism and superstition, where . . . Christians mangle and crucify themselves . . ." ³⁵ Here was a place of "violent antithese of light and shade."³⁶

Lummis introduced the Penitent Brothers in *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, noting:

[S]o late as 1891 a procession of flagellants took place within the limits of the United States. A procession in which voters of this Republic shredded their naked backs with savage whips, staggered beneath huge crosses, and hugged the maddening needles of the cactus; a procession which culminated in the flesh-and-blood crucifixion of an unworthy representative of the Redeemer. Nor was this an isolated horror. Every Good Friday, for many generations, it has been a staple custom to hold these barbarous rites in parts of New Mexico.³⁷

Lummis asserted that modification of the flesh, long outlawed in Europe, was still common both among Indians and Mexicans in the Southwest. The crucial difference was that Indians engaged almost

exclusively in fasts for communal spiritual ends. But Mexicans were individualistic. "These fanatics do penance for themselves only, and in Lent achieve their sin-washing for the year"³⁸ The evidence Lummis cited for his thesis that Penitentes were thieves, was the following New Mexican *dicho* or folk saying.

Penitente pecador,
Porque te andas azotando?
Por una vaca que robé
Y aqui la ando disquitando.³⁹

Lummis maintained that some of Penitentes were "good but deluded men." The majority, though, were "petty larcenists, horse-thieves, and assassins."⁴⁰ The brotherhood was widely feared because it controlled political power in Northern New Mexico. "No one likes -- and few dare -- to offend them; and there have been men of liberal education who have joined them to gain political influence. In fact it is unquestionable that the outlawed order is kept alive . . . by the connivance of wealthy men, who find it convenient to maintain these secret bands for their own ends."⁴¹ Here Lummis had in mind the so-called "Santa Fe Ring."

The Penitente discourse that Charles Lummis invented has been perpetuated by almost every Anglo writer on the brotherhood ever since. Lummis constructed what is now the well-worn theory of the

Confraternity's genealogy; it was a corruption of Third Order Franciscanism first performed by Don Juan de Oñate when he entered New Mexico in 1598 (Lummis mistakenly claims it was 1594). The gaze he focused on the flagellation, on the blood letting, on the use of cacti for mortification, on the shrill of the pito, and on the nature and extent of crucifixion, has not deviated much in those textual descriptions that have followed. Lummis' eye-witness descriptions are the starting place for every author on the topic, and his legacy is that he has profoundly shaped what has long been seeable.

Part of the reason for this, I suspect, is that Lummis created a set of photographs of a Penitente procession and crucifixion he observed in San Mateo, New Mexico in 1888. In his chapter of *The Land of Poco Tiempo* in which he textually transforms the Confraternity of Our Lord Jesus of Nazareth into the Penitent Brotherhood, Lummis' recounts the process by which he photographed the penitential practice as if out on a safari hunting large game animals. "Woe to him if in seeing he shall be seen . . . But let him stalk his game, and with safety to his own hide he may see havoc to the hides of others."⁴² Lummis waited feverishly for Holy Week to arrive, he reports, hoping to photograph the impossible -- the Penitentes. "No photographer has ever caught the Penitentes with his sun-

lasso, and I was assured of death in various unattractive forms at the first hint of an attempt.”⁴³ But as soon as he heard the shrill of the pito, his prudence gave way to his enthusiasm. He set up his camera and waited for what he called a “shot.” Though the crowd protested the presence of his camera, “well-armed friends . . . held back the evil-faced mob, with the instantaneous plates were being snapped at the strange scene below.”⁴⁴ Photographs of this barbaric rite were necessary, said Lummis, because Mexicans were “fast losing their pictorial possibilities . . .”⁴⁵

The depravities of modernity were quickly demoralizing America, and it was necessary to return to an older time, to a pre-industrial America. In New Mexico, in the land of no rush, one could find “the National Rip Van Winkle . . . the United States which was *not* United States.”⁴⁶ Lummis implicitly did plenty of preaching about the decadence of industrial capitalism in the East, by elaborating on the healthy values of New Mexico’s peoples. They worked hard to sustain themselves, but not with “unseemly haste, no self-tripping race for wealth.”⁴⁷ Lummis loved New Mexico because it was not troubled “with the unrest of civilization.” In New Mexico, “The old ways are still the best ways.” Society was still patriarchal, children were still obedient, well-mannered and not quarrelsome. Age was respected, a father here was still the master of his

brood, and hospitality was greatly valued and extremely generous.⁴⁸

The gospel Lummis preached was undoubtedly of great appeal to a class of alienated Anglo-American intellectuals, writers, artist and financiers who packed their belonging and headed to northern New Mexico at the end of the nineteenth century and in increasing numbers after World War I. They came rejecting the tastes, aspirations and pretensions of the “Blue Bloods” who mimicked European aristocracy. And by so doing started to imagine a national culture that was rooted not in Europe, but on this continent in the cultures of New Mexico. As Molly Mullin, Warren Susman and others have argued, the discovery of cultures, both by academics and the larger public, was an attempt to deflect attention from the class conflict that plagued the Eastern centers of industrial capital, and to create a new metaphor for American nationalism.⁴⁹

The preservation of the simple authentic cultures these Easterners found in New Mexico, and their implicit critique of the industrial age was localized in Pueblo and Hispano “colonial” art. In these products created largely for touristic consumption, Anglos imagined the possibility and romance of non-alienating labor. Such artistic production was not massified and appeared to stand frozen in isolation, defying the principles of global capitalism.⁵⁰ The accelerated rate of circulation in global

capital, David Harvey explains in *The Condition of Postmodernity*, by necessity created a strong nostalgia for place-specific identity. Mabel Dodge Luhan captured this flight from modernity and to the cultural pluralism (read classless) society of New Mexico well when she instructed her son, "Remember, it is ugly in America . . .we have left everything worthwhile behind us. America is all machinery and money-making and factories . . . ugly, ugly, ugly . . ."51

Charles Fletcher Lummis was the pied-piper who lured a whole generation of Anglo-American to New Mexico, hoping here to resist industrial capital, to preserve the quaint picturesque cultures they found, and to market Pueblo and Hispano handicrafts as an authentic American art that offered a solution to national alienation. The Pueblo Indians and Hispanos embraced their Orientalization and in a self-orientalizing mode are now deeply imbricated into what became the mystique of Santa Fe and the enchantment of the Southwest.

Notes

1. Frederick Jackson Turner, "The Significance of the Frontier in American History," in Martin Ridge, ed., *History, Frontier, and Section: Three Essays by Frederick Jackson Turner* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1993), p. 88.
2. Turner, pp. 81-82, 76.
3. Turner, pp. 87-88.
4. Turner, p. 88.
5. The distinction between "insiders" and "outsiders" is used here to mean those representations of the Confraternity of Our Lord Jesus of Nazareth created by members themselves, what I call insiders. Outsiders are those non-members of the Confraternity that have written as non-members and as curious ethnographers.
6. Marta Weigle, "From Desert to Disney World: The Santa Fe Railway and

the Fred Harvey Company Display the Indian Southwest,” *Journal of Anthropological Research*, 45, no. 1 (1989), pp. 115-137.

7. Lummis writes in *The Land of Poco Tiempo* of “our Presbyterian mission” in New Mexico. See: Charles Fletcher Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo* (New York: Charles Scribner’s Sons, 1893), p. 95.

8. This biographic sketch of Charles F. Lummis comes largely from Edwin R. Bingham, *Charles F. Lummis: Editor of the Southwest* (San Marino, Ca.: Huntington Library, 1955), Turbese Fiske and Keith Lummis, *Charles F. Lummis: The Man and His West* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 19-
-).

9. Martin Padget, “Travel, Exoticism, and the Writing of Region: Charles Fletcher Lummis and the ‘Creation’ of the Southwest,” (unpublished paper), p. 2.

10. This quotation is the subtitle of Lummis’ book, *Mesa, Cañon, Pueblo* (New York: The Century Co., 1925).

11. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 3.
12. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 29.
13. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 58.
14. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 63.
15. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 76.
16. Curtis M. Hinsley, in his essay on the Chicago Columbian Exposition of 1893 notes that persons who attended the fair and walked through its midway, were being treated to the tourist experience “a linear, kaleidoscopic passing of scenes, appearing quickly and discouraging valuation or judgment.” He notes that movement, traffic and exchange were at the heart of the fair and at the ideological center of ideas about human progress. See “The World as Marketplace: Commodification of the Exotic at the World’s Columbian Exposition, Chicago, 1893,” in Ivan Karp and Steven D. Lavine, eds., *Exhibiting Cultures: The Poetics and Politics of Museum Display* (Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1990),

pp. 344-65, quote from p. 352.

17. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, pp. 5-6.

18. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 5.

19. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, pp. 4-5.

20. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 9.

21. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 69.

22. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, pp. 51-52.

23. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 53.

24. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 111.

25. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 61.

26. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 40.
27. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 80.
28. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, pp. 175-75.
29. Ramón A. Gutiérrez, *When Jesus Came, the Corn Mothers Went Away: Marriage, Sexuality and Power in New Mexico, 1500-1846* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1991), p. 194-95.
30. William B. Taylor, "Mexico as Oriental: Early Thoughts on a History of American and British Representations since 1821," (unpublished paper).
31. Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (New York: Routledge, 1992), p. 134.
32. Frances Calderón de la Barca, *Life in Mexico During a Residence of Two Years in That Country* (Boston, 1843) and Sullivan McColleston, *Mexico Old and New, a Wonderland* (Boston, 1897) both quotes from William B. Taylor, "Mexico as Oriental: Early Thoughts on a History of American and

British Representations since 1821,” (unpublished paper), p. 6.

33. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, pp. 19-20.

34. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 53.

35. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 5.

36. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 8-9.

37. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 79.

38. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 24.

39. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 108. Translation: “Penitente sinner, why do you go whipping yourself? For a cow that I stole, and here I go paying for her.”

40. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 106.

41. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 106.
42. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 85.
43. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 87.
44. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 91.
45. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 8-9.
46. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 4.
47. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, p. 10.
48. Lummis, *The Land of Poco Tiempo*, pp. 16-17.
49. Warren Susman, *Culture and Commitment, 1929-1945* (New York: George Braziller, 1973), pp. 2-8, and *Culture as History: The Transformation of American Society in the Twentieth Century* (New York: Pantheon, 1984), pp. 153-54; Molly H. Mullin "The Patronage of Difference:

Making Indian Art 'Art,' Not Ethnology," *Cultural Anthropology*, 7, no. 4
(November 1992), pp. 395-424.

50. Mullin, p. 100.

51. Lujan as quoted in Mullin, p. 412.